

East Tennessee State University Digital Commons @ East Tennessee State University

Electronic Theses and Dissertations

Student Works

5-2014

Neogene Climate Change in Eastern North America: A Quantitative Reconstruction

Kyrie A. Baumgartner *East Tennessee State University*

Follow this and additional works at: https://dc.etsu.edu/etd Part of the Biology Commons

Recommended Citation

Baumgartner, Kyrie A., "Neogene Climate Change in Eastern North America: A Quantitative Reconstruction" (2014). *Electronic Theses and Dissertations*. Paper 2348. https://dc.etsu.edu/etd/2348

This Thesis - Open Access is brought to you for free and open access by the Student Works at Digital Commons @ East Tennessee State University. It has been accepted for inclusion in Electronic Theses and Dissertations by an authorized administrator of Digital Commons @ East Tennessee State University. For more information, please contact digilib@etsu.edu.

Neogene Climate Change in Eastern North America: A Quantitative Reconstruction

A thesis

presented to

the faculty of the Department of Biological Sciences

East Tennessee State University

In partial fulfillment

of the requirements for the degree

Master of Science in Biology

by

Kyrie A. Baumgartner

May 2014

Christopher Liu, Chair

Istvan Karsai

Catherine Chen

Jim I. Mead

Keywords: Neogene, paleoclimate, eastern North America, coexistence approach

ABSTRACT

Neogene Climate Change in Eastern North America: A Quantitative Reconstruction

by

Kyrie A. Baumgartner

Though much is known of the global paleoclimate during the Neogene, little is understood about eastern North America at that time. During the Neogene the global paleoclimate was transitioning from the warm temperatures and higher levels of precipitation of the Paleogene to the cooler temperatures and lower levels of precipitation during the Pleistocene. Eleven fossil sites from Neogene eastern North America were analyzed using the Coexistence Approach: Pollack Farm, Brandon Lignite, Legler Lignite, Alum Bluff, Bryn Mawr, Big Creek on Sicily Island, Brandywine, Gray Fossil Site, Citronelle, Peace Creek, and Ohoopee River Dune Field. Analyses showed a general trend that early and middle Miocene sites were warmer than the area today, while middle and late Miocene sites were comparable to the area today, and Pliocene sites were comparable to or cooler than the area today. However, there is no clear trend of increased precipitation during the Neogene.

DEDICATION

This thesis is dedicated to my friends and family, who supported me throughout this endeavor. It is also dedicated to Dr. K.C. Lohmann at the University of Michigan for renewing my passion for paleontology.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Thanks to the different sources of financial support that was provided by NSF grant awarded to Dr. Chris Liu and the Biological Sciences Department.

I thank my advisor Dr. Liu for allowing me to join his lab and introducing me to the field of paleoclimate. I thank my committee for all of their help, advice and expertise. I thank Dr. Catherine Chen for her understanding of ArcGIS and Dr. Istvan Karsai for his insight into my paleoclimate modeling. I also thank Dr. Jim I. Mead, who as Chair of the Geosciences Department was a constant source of help and inspiration, and was always available to answer my questions.

I must also thank Dr. Blaine Schubert and Dr. Stephen Wallace for their paleontological insight and advice. I thank Dr. Eileen Ernenwein and Dr. Andrew Joyner for their help with my ArcGIS mapping. I thank Dr. Yongjiang (Mike) Huang for help with coexistence approach analyses. I also thank Dr. Ron Blakey for allowing me to use his paleogeographic maps and Andy Simpson, Garret Brown, and Fernanda Castano for helping me to expand the scope of my research.

I must also thank my officemates in the Geosciences Department for always being there to answer my paleontological questions and discuss aspects of my research. I cannot thank them enough. Finally, thank you to my family for supporting me throughout this experience. I greatly appreciate your help.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT
DEDICATION
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS
LIST OF TABLES
LIST OF FIGURES
Chapter
1. INTRODUCTION
Neogene Global Climate10
2. MATERIALS AND METHODS
Fossil Material16
Fossil Sites17
Pollack Farm18
Brandon Lignite19
Legler Lignite21
Alum Bluff22
Bryn Mawr23
Big Creek on Sicily Island24
Brandywine26
Gray Fossil Site27
Citronelle
Peace Creek

Ohoopee River Dune Field	
Analytical Procedures	31
Coexistence Approach	31
GIS Reconstruction	
3. RESULTS.	
Fossil Sites	
Pollack Farm	34
Brandon Lignite	
Legler Lignite	35
Alum Bluff	
Bryn Mawr	
Big Creek on Sicily Island	
Brandywine	
Gray Fossil Site	37
Citronelle	
Peace Creek	
Ohoopee River Dune Field	
Overall Patterns	
4. DISCUSSION	41
Comparison of Methodologies	41
Neogene Climate Patterns	46
Future Work	48
5. CONCLUSION	50

REFERENCES	51
APPENDICES	
Appendix A: Alum Bluff Raw Resul	ts and Climate Intervals60
Appendix B: Big Creek on Sicily Isla	and Raw Results and Climate Intervals64
Appendix C: Brandon Lignite Raw R	Results and Climate Intervals69
Appendix D: Brandywine Raw Resu	Its and Climate Intervals75
Appendix E: Bryn Mawr Raw Result	ts and Climate Intervals81
Appendix F: Citronelle Raw Results	and Climate Intervals86
Appendix G: Gray Fossil Site Raw R	Results and Climate Intervals92
Appendix H: Legler Lignite Raw Res	sults and Climate Intervals98
Appendix I: Ohoopee River Dune Fig	eld Raw Results and Climate Intervals103
Appendix J: Peace Creek Raw Resul	ts and Climate Intervals109
Appendix K: Pollack Farm Raw Res	ults and Climate Intervals114
VITA	

LIST OF TABLES

Table	Page
1. Neogene fossil sites, their ages, and possible paleoclimate reconstruction methods	17
 Paleoclimate climatic intervals using the coexistence approach (CA) for 11 Neogene fossil sites for mean annual temperature (MAT), cold month mean temperature (CMMT), warm month mean temperature (WMMT), mean annual precipitation (MAP), monthly maximum precipitation (MMaP), monthly minimum precipitation (MMiP), and warm month mean precipitation (WMMP) 	on 34

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure	Page
1. Paleogeographic map of Early Miocene North America, courtesy of Ron Blakey, Colorado Plateau Geosystems, Arizona USA	12
2. Paleogeographic map of Early Pliocene North America, courtesy of Ron Blakey, Colorado Plateau Geosystems, Arizona USA	13
3. Location of Neogene floral fossil sites across eastern North America	18
4. Comparison of the modern MAT (green dots) and the paleo MAT interval (whiskers) for 11 fossil sites.	or 35
5. Comparison of the modern MAP (green dots) and the paleo MAP interval (whiskers) for 11 fossil sites.	or 36
6. Comparison of modern MAT (base map) to estimated MAT (colored shapes) of Neoge floral fossil sites in eastern North America	ne 39
7. Comparison of modern MAP (base map) to estimated MAP (colored shapes) of Neogen floral fossil sites in eastern North America	ne 40
8. Ages of Neogene floral fossil sites in eastern North America used in this analysis	47

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

Unlike many other parts of the world from the time, Neogene eastern North America is still in the process of being understood. The discovery of fossil sites in recent years has helped expand existing knowledge of the region, but analysis has been limited to individual fossil sites. Though limited comparisons have been made between sites with respect to the presence or absence of fossil taxa, comparisons of paleoclimate across time and space have not been published.

Neogene Global Climate

The Neogene was a time of great climatic, floral, and faunal changes across the globe. Stable isotope analyses of benthic foraminifera indicate that the early Cenozoic was the beginning of a transitional period of global cooling that was evident throughout the Paleogene and Neogene (Zachos et al. 2008). In central Europe the mean annual temperature dropped between 15°-20° C from the Paleocene to the Pleistocene and continued to drop approximately another 10° C during the Pleistocene (Anderson and Borns 1997). During the Neogene (Miocene and Pliocene) mean global temperatures were higher (Zachos et al. 2001) and the global climate was wetter than today (Retallack 2007). Ice sheets covered some, if not all, of Antarctica and were beginning to appear in the northernmost regions of North America (Steppuhn et al. 2006). Across the globe the meridional temperature gradient was much weaker than it is today due to higher polar temperatures (Micheels et al. 2010) and CO₂ levels of approximately 360-440 ppm (Raymo et al. 1996). Studies of fossil leaf stomata have suggested that late Neogene CO₂ levels fluctuated between about 280-370 ppm (Van Der Burgh et al. 1993).

In North America C₄ grasslands expanded across the continent, typically at the expense of the existing woodlands (Retallack 2001; McInerney et al. 2011). In eastern North America there is paleontological evidence of forest refugia of relict populations from these grasslands (Wallace and Wang 2004). This grassland expansion occurred between 8-5 Ma, during the driest part of the Miocene-Pliocene transition, and was accompanied by drastic faunal turnover (Graham 1993; Cerling et al. 1997, 1998). Numerous modern faunal orders originated during the Neogene, as well as many with a strong Eurasian connection (DeSantis and Wallace 2008). Tiffney (1985b) asserted that the Miocene was one of 5 periods of floristic exchange between eastern North America and eastern Asia. Plant elements from North America and Eurasia were exchanged via the North Atlantic Land Bridge into the Miocene and via the Bering Strait into the late Miocene and Pliocene (Raven and Axelrod 1974; Tiffney 1985a, 1985b; Xiang et al. 2000). During the Paleogene and early Neogene a continuous mixed mesophytic forest occurred across the Northern Hemisphere but was subsequently extirpated in western Europe and western North America due to climatic and geological changes during the late Neogene and Quaternary (Graham 1993; Manchester 1999). The paleogeomorphology of North America was very similar to today, including the position of continents and ocean bathymetry (Crowley 1996). However, the presence of Bering Land Bridge and the North Atlantic Land Bridge are in stark contrast to modern coastlines (Figs. 1, 2).



Figure 1: Paleogeographic map of Early Miocene North America, courtesy of Ron Blakey, Colorado Plateau Geosystems, Arizona USA.



Figure 2: Paleogeographic map of Early Pliocene North America, courtesy of Ron Blakey, Colorado Plateau Geosystems, Arizona USA.

In North America the Neogene fossil record is biased toward the mid-latitudes of the western half of the continent (Wallace and Wang 2004). In eastern North America there are few fossil sites of that age, particularly in the interior of the continent. Of the presently known

Neogene fossil sites in eastern North America, many are predominately floral, with relatively high proportions consisting solely of pollen.

Scientists may be able to use an understanding of the global climate during the Neogene to predict the future trajectory of anthropogenic climate change (Salzmann et al. 2009). A study by Haywood et al. (2001) indicated that the late Pliocene in North America was probably 2°- 4° C warmer annually than today, with increased precipitation and less seasonality, and some regions, such as the current Great Plains, did not experience winter freezes. If global temperatures continue to rise at the current rate, the future global climate might resemble that of the middle Pliocene. However, due to the relative scarcity of Neogene fossil sites in eastern North America, this model is likely not representative of all of the continent. Neogene paleoclimate data from eastern North America would be a beneficial addition to the geological history of the continent.

Fossil paleoclimate data come from 2 primary sources: terrestrial data and marine data. Fossil data from marine invertebrates are relatively consistent: marine invertebrate remains are constantly being deposited on the ocean floor, which means that there are continuous climate data throughout geologic time (Zachos et al. 2001). However, these data are best used as a global average. They are not as sensitive to minute fluctuations in temperature and instead show broad trends. In addition, marine invertebrate fossil data can only give information about global temperature patterns; the bottom of the ocean is minimally impacted by changes in precipitation.

The terrestrial climate can be reconstructed in a variety of ways, such as the study of floral and faunal fossils, the study of geochemistry, or the study of sedimentology (Hickson et al 2010; Utescher et al. 2011). Paleosols are abundant and can reconstruct both temperature and precipitation as well as give an idea of the paleoenvironment (Sheldon et al. 2002; Retallack,

2004, 2005). Stable isotope analyses can provide a variety of paleoclimatic and

paleoenvironmental information; carbon isotope variation can reconstruct the vegetation and the atmospheric CO₂, oxygen isotope variation can tentatively reconstruct temperature, and nitrogen isotope variation can be used as a proxy for rainfall abundance (Koch 1998; Kohn and Cerling 2002). With respect to terrestrial fossils, floral fossils are among the most widely used climatic and environmental indicators (Uhl et al. 2006). In general, floral data are restricted to terrestrial regions and are limited to the availability of fossil sites. However, where fossils are present, the climate information from floral data is relatively precise because it only pertains to a particular region and can give data on temperature as well as precipitation (Mosbrugger and Utescher 1997). Comparing fossil data, isotopic analyses or paleosols data with marine invertebrate data demonstrate how regional climate variation fits into global climate trends.

CHAPTER 2

MATERIALS AND METHODS

The Neogene is relatively unknown period in the history of eastern North America, but it is well-studied throughout the rest of the continent and the world. The fossil sites of eastern North America are remarkably important for reconstructing the paleoclimate across the region throughout the Neogene. I intend to (1) use floral fossils to reconstruct the climate of eastern North America during the Neogene, (2) describe general paleoclimate trends across eastern North America during the Neogene, and (3) compare the reconstructions to those estimated with different paleoclimate reconstructions, such as Zachos et al. (2001, 2008).

Fossil Material

There are few Neogene fossil sites in eastern North America and even fewer with enough data to perform a quantitative paleoclimate analyses. Therefore, only fossil sites with at least 15 fossil taxa were considered. This analysis included 11 Neogene fossil sites: the Alum Bluff site in Florida (Corbett 2004; Jarzen et al. 2010), the Big Creek on Sicily Island site in Louisiana (Wrenn et al. 2003), the Brandon Lignite in Vermont (Tiffney 1994; Traverse 1994), the Brandywine Formation in Maryland (McCartan et al. 1990), the Bryn Mawr Formation in Maryland (Pazzaglia et al. 1997), the Citronelle Formation in Alabama (Stults 2003; Stults and Axsmith 2009; Stults et al. 2010; Stults and Axsmith 2011b), the Gray Fossil Site in Tennessee (Wallace and Wang 2004; Gong et al. 2010; Liu and Jacques 2010; Ochoa et al. 2012), the Legler Lignite in New Jersey (Rachele 1976), the Ohoopee River Dune Field in Georgia (Rich et al. 2002), the Peace Creek Formation in Florida (Hansen et al. 2001), and the Pollack Farm Site in Delaware (Groot 1992). These fossil sites vary in age, location, and primary fossil composition (Table 1).

Fossil Site	Location	Age	Reconstruction Method
Pollack Farm	Delaware	Early Miocene	CA
Brandon Lignite	Vermont	Early Miocene	CA
Legler Lignite	New Jersey	Middle Miocene	CA
Alum Bluff	Florida	Middle Miocene	CA
Bryn Mawr Formation	Maryland	Middle/Late Miocene	CA
Big Creek on Sicily Island	Louisiana	Late Miocene	CA
Brandywine Formation	Maryland	Late Miocene	CA
Gray Fossil Site	Tennessee	Late Miocene/Early Pliocene	CA
Citronelle Formation	Alabama	Middle Pliocene	CA and LMA
Peace Creek Formation	Florida	Late Pliocene	CA
Ohoopee River Dune Field	Georgia	Middle Miocene/Late Pliocene	CA

Table 1. Neogene fossil sites, their ages, and possible paleoclimate reconstruction methods

Fossil Sites

In North America the Neogene fossil record is biased toward the mid-latitudes of western half of the continent (Wallace and Wang 2004) (Fig. 3). In eastern North America, there are few fossil sites of that age, particularly in the interior of the continent.



Figure 3. Location of Neogene floral fossil sites across eastern North America.

Pollack Farm. The Pollack Farm Site is an Early Miocene fossil site (19.2-17.3 Ma) in central Delaware, near Cheswold, and is currently the oldest known Neogene site in eastern North America (Groot 1998). Excavation took place on an exposed portion of the lower Miocene Cheswold Sands of the Calvert Formation from shallow sea deposits of the Late Oligocene to Early to Middle Miocene. The site was dated using siliceous microfossils (Benson et al. 1985). The pollen at this site does not appear extensively reworked; however, individual grains of *Casuarinidites* and *Thomsonipollis* were probably reworked from Upper Cretaceous or Paleogene deposits (Groot 1992). From the palynological assemblage, over 50 different taxa have been identified. *Quercus, Carya*, and *Pinus* dominated the vegetation, but many exotic species were also present, including *Momipites* (*Engelhardia* type), *Manilkara, Planera*, and palms that are now native to tropical and subtropical, moist environments such as eastern Asia, Florida and Central America (Groot 1992). The presence of *Momipites* is complicated: it possibly represents *Engelhardia*, which today lives mainly in the mountains of the tropics and subtropics. However, during the Paleocene it spread throughout lowland peat swamps of Europe as well as North and Central America. Groot (1992) suggested that *Momipites* at this site represented upland vegetation.

The majority of the palynomorphs found from this site were produced by taxa that grow in the coastal plain of Delaware today. According to Groot (1992), the presence of *Quercus*, *Pinus*, and *Carya* in eastern North American during the Late Oligocene and Miocene as well as at present indicated the persistence of the taxa, with the exception of disruptions during Pleistocene glaciations. The presence of subtropical and tropical taxa and the relative absence of cold-climate indicator taxa suggest that the paleoclimate of the modern coastal plain of Delaware was likely warm-temperate to subtropical and moist, similar to present day coastal Georgia and northern Florida. The abundance of pollen from trees and shrubs coupled with the relative absence of pollen from herbaceous plants indicates that a thick forest dominated by *Quercus*, *Pinus*, and *Carya* grew all the way to the east coast (Groot 1998). Today, the mean annual temperature (MAT) for the area is 12.2° C and the mean annual precipitation (MAP) is 1106 mm (NOAA-NCDC 2014).

<u>Brandon Lignite.</u> The Brandon Lignite in west-central Vermont is Early Miocene in age (Traverse 1994) and is the northernmost Neogene fossil site in this study. It is located about 7 km east of Brandon in the Green Mountains near Forestdale, Vermont (latitude 43° 50' N, longitude 73° 03' W) (Tiffney 1994). The deposit was discovered in 1848 while mining for iron and was rediscovered in 1901 while mining for clay (Barghoorn and Spackman, Jr. 1949). The Brandon Lignite deposit is composed of fossiliferous lignite and organic-rich clays and is difficult to date

for 2 primary reasons (Tiffney 1994). Firstly, it is underlain by Cambrian formations and overlain by Pleistocene drift. The internal stratigraphy has been deformed by the passage of Pleistocene ice sheets, which limits paleomagnetic assessment. Secondly, there are no available radiometric indicators or vertebrate fossils. Therefore, the age can only be determined by floral fossils. Its relative isolation from other fossil sites of the same age makes dating even more difficult.

The fossil assemblage consisted of 98 taxa, including both micro-fossils and megafossils. Many of these fossils were from extinct species known primarily from the Eurasian fossil record (Tiffney 1994). Twenty-two of the remaining genera currently survive in warm-temperate and temperate regions of North America: 14 genera survive in eastern North America today primarily along the Gulf of Mexico, and 7 genera are still present in Vermont. The fossil taxa present in the Brandon Lignite suggest that it was a closed forest environment and conservative estimates suggest that the floral composition was half evergreen and half deciduous (Tiffney 1994). The phenology was determined by comparing that of the nearest living relatives; however, the phenology of modern cognates does not necessarily reflect that of the fossil taxa. Global paleoclimate estimates indicate that the Miocene was warmer, wetter, and less seasonal than the modern climate. Therefore, it is probable that the flora of the Brandon Lignite consisted of a higher proportion of evergreen taxa than predicted by observing modern cognates. Tiffney (1994) argued that the flora was predominately every every every a warm-temperate or subtropical climate with infrequent freezes. Some evergreen taxa included Nyssa, Quercus, and Magnolia.

Comparisons to the modern climate of the North American Gulf Coast, the highlands of Veracruz, Mexico, and middle elevations of Taiwan and the Sichuan Province of China

estimated that the Brandon flora had a MAT of 17.1° C and a mean annual range of temperatures (MART) of 17° C. The MAP was about 1600 mm and fluctuated throughout the year with a summer high and a winter low (Tiffney 1994). The deciduous composition of the forest was likely in response to the seasonal fluctuation in temperature, not changes in precipitation. Today, the MAT of the area is 6.8° C and the MAP is 987 mm (NOAA-NCDC 2014).

Legler Lignite. The Legler Lignite is a Middle Miocene site (approximately 11 Ma) in central New Jersey (Rachele 1976; Greller and Rachele 1983). The site is an open pit ilmenite mine of the Glidden-Durkee Division of SCM Corporation located about 3.2 km north of Lakehurst, near Legler, New Jersey (latitude 40° 2' 3" N, 74° 20' 00" W) (Rachele 1976). The pit is a section of lignite in the Cohansey Formation and was the first palynological study of the formation. The age of the site was determined by the Cohansey Formation's stratigraphic relationship to other geologic formations of known ages. The Cohansey Formation overlies the Kirkwood Formation, which Owens and Minard (1979) considered equivalent to the upper part of the Calvert Formation of Maryland. Ward and Blackwelder (1980) dated the upper Calvert at 13.3 Ma. Owens and Minard (1979) also observed that Cohansey Formation is overlain by the Bridgeton Formation, which is overlain by the Pensauken Formation. They considered the Pensauken Formation to be greater than 5 Ma. Greller and Rachele (1983) used this stratigraphy to date the Legler Lignite at approximately 11 Ma.

To date only fossil pollen has been recovered at this site (Groot et al. 1990). Many of the fossil taxa found at the site are still found in coastal New Jersey today, with some marked exceptions. Today, *Cyathea* and *Podocarpus* are native to the mountains of Mexico and the Antilles, *Engelhardia* is native to the mountains of tropical Mexico and Central America, and *Pterocarya* is native to eastern Asia (Greller and Rachele 1983). The dominance of *Quercus*,

Pinus, *Carya*, and other warm-temperate genera suggested that the paleoclimate was warmer and wetter than in the region today (Rachele 1976). The paleoclimate was likely similar to, or slightly warmer than, that of modern southeastern North America due to the presence of taxa that are restricted to subtropical and tropical regions today. The paleoenvironment was mostly composed of marshes and swamp forests. Rachele (1976) predicted that the MAP of the Legler Lignite was about 1270 mm, with an average January temperature of 6° C and average July temperature of 24° C. Today, the MAT in the area is 12° C and the MAP is 1074 mm (NOAA-NCDC 2014).

<u>Alum Bluff.</u> Alum Bluff is a Middle Miocene site in the western panhandle of Florida (18-15 Ma) (Corbett 2004; Jarzen et al. 2010). The site is located about 3.2 km north of the town of Bristol, Florida (latitude 30° 28' 08" N, longitude 84° 59' 10" W). The Alum Bluff site is a steep river cut bluff exposure along the Apalachicola River on property owned by the Nature Conservancy known as Apalachicola Bluffs and Ravines Preserve (Corbett 2004).

The Alum Bluff group is found throughout the western and central regions of the Florida panhandle and include the Miocene Chipola Formation, the Miocene Oak Grove Sand, the Miocene Shoal River Formation, the Miocene Choctawhatchee Formation, and the Pliocene Jackson Bluff Formation (Scott 2002). The floral fossils were found in the upper levels of the group in unnamed beds underlain by the Early Miocene Chipola Formation and overlain by the Pliocene Jackson Bluff Formation and are estimated to be Middle Miocene in age based on the presence of Late Hemingfordian or Early Barstovian mammal fossils (Bryant et al. 1992; Scott 1997). The fossil bearing beds are gray to yellow and white clayey sands (Schmidt 1986). These clayey sands, coupled with some cross bedding, could indicate deltaic or prodeltaic sediments (Schmidt 1986; Means 2002). According to Jarzen et al. (2010), the sandy matrix and the

presence of *Sabalites* trunks suggested a high energy riverine depositional environment, as does the lack of megaspores from heterosporous ferns.

Berry (1916a) first studied the Alum Bluff site and used 12 plant species and 1 fungal species to determine that the flora was tropical to subtropical. However, Manchester (1999) identified the temperate Eurasian genus *Paliurus* that is extinct in North America today, which suggested a cooler paleoclimate. Fossil ferns recovered from the site were comparable to a number of extant genera; Azolla, Lygodium, and Acrostichum are commonly found in mangrove backwaters, *Ceratopteris* is found in slow moving still waters in the tropics, and *Pityrogramma* is found in warm and tropical regions (Jarzen et al. 2010). Floral remains from this site also included temperate taxa such as Carya, Quercus, Ulmus, Ilex, Juglans, and Liquidambar (Corbett 2004; Jarzen et al. 2010). A cursory leaf margin analysis by Corbett (2004) observed that the leaves from the Alum Bluff site were small and serrated, as would be expected from a temperate paleoclimate. Corbett (2004) interpreted the paleoclimate as warm-temperate similar to the modern Florida Gulf Coast, with elm-hickory-palmetto forest near an oak and pine dominated landscape. The paleoenvironment was likely an upland forest flanking a river in a floodplain (Jarzen et al. 2010). Today the MAT of the area is 19.6° C and the MAP is 1512 mm (NOAA-NCDC 2014).

<u>Bryn Mawr.</u> The Bryn Mawr Formation palynoflora is a Middle to Late Miocene fossil site in northeastern Maryland near the Chesapeake Bay (Pazzaglia et al. 1997). The site is located in Cecil County, Maryland at the York Building Products Belvidere gravel pit about 8.5 km northeast of Perryville, Maryland (latitude 39° 37' N, longitude 76° 1' W). The Bryn Mawr Formation is composed of quartzose, sandy gravel braided alluvial plain deposit, and is the thickest and most extensive at the head of the Chesapeake Bay, Maryland. The Bryn Mawr

Formation represents deposition from the Late Oligocene to Late Miocene. This age is based on the plant assemblages and factors such as the presence of extinct or exotic taxa and the relative abundance of certain modern taxa. The pollen does not appear to have been reworked (Pazzaglia et al. 1997).

The floral fossil assemblage included approximately 40 taxa and was dominated by *Quercus, Alnus, Carya, Taxodium, Liquidambar, Juglans, Pterocarya*-type, and *Pinus* (Pazzaglia et al. 1997). Many of the taxa found at the site are still present in the region today including *Quercus, Carya, Pinus, Ilex,* and *Betula*; however, exotic taxa were also present. The presence of *Sciadopitys, Engelhardia,* and *Pterocarya* indicated that the site must be older than Pleistocene. The prevalence of *Quercus, Carya, Engelhardia, Symplocos,* and *Cyrilla* indicated a warm-temperate to subtropical climate without extended annual cool periods. However, the presence of temperate gymnosperm pollen, such as *Tsuga* and *Picea,* suggested a cooler climate with more seasonality. Pazzaglia et al. (1997) suggested that the Middle to Late Miocene brought about a shift from thermophilic species and *Quercus-Carya* dominance to the more cold-adapted *Pinus* and *Picea.* Today the MAT of the area is 12.7° C and the MAP is 1095 mm (NOAA-NCDC 2014).

<u>Big Creek on Sicily Island.</u> Big Creek on Sicily Island is a Late Miocene fossil site (8.68 Ma) in eastern Louisiana (Wrenn et al. 2003). The site is an exposure of lignitic shale on the western side of Sicily Island, Louisiana and is part of the Catahoula Formation, which was originally considered part of the Grand Gulf Sandstone but it was later renamed to mitigate confusion. Geologic formations along the Gulf Coast use the biostratigraphy of marine mollusks and microfossils for dating, but the Catahoula Formation lacks marine fossils, which makes the age of this formation up for interpretation. Attempts to date the formation using terrestrial floral

remains or freshwater mollusks have been largely disregarded because they cannot be correlated to Gulf Coast marine markers and zonations. The Catahoula Formation was subsequently dated using its stratigraphic position, which resulted in 2 differing interpretations. Matson (1917) and Berry (1917) concluded that the Catahoula Formation is Oligocene in age because it interfingers with the Vicksburg Group. On the other hand, Howe (1933), Chawner (1936), and Murray (1961) concluded that the Catahoula Formation is Miocene in age because it unconformably overlies the Vicksburg Group. Howe (1933) went on to correlate the Catahoula Formation with the freshwater Chattahoochee Formation and the marine Tampa Limestone in Florida, both of which are Miocene in age.

Wrenn et al. (2003) used palynomorph assemblages in the lignite to date the formation. The Louisiana Geological Survey demonstrated that palynomorphs could be used as the terrestrial equivalents of marine calcareous oozes with regard to fossil abundance (Wrenn et al. 2003). These palynomorphs included pteridophyte spores, pollen, and freshwater algal remains, as well as fungal debris. The assemblage was assigned to the Paly24 marker horizon of the Shell Offshore Inc. Cenozoic pollen zonation, indicating a Late Miocene age (Wrenn et al. 2003). The presence of rare specimens including ambrosid and helianthid pollen distinguished that the Catahoula Formation is Miocene rather than Oligocene. The absence of *Artemisia* pollen as well as the paucity and lack of diversity of ambrosid pollen precluded a younger late Miocene or Pliocene age, while the absence of Eocene and Oligocene marker taxa precluded a pre-Miocene age (Wrenn et al. 2003).

More than half of the pollen from Big Creek on Sicily Island came from ferns, many of which came from freshwater floating and climbing ferns (Wrenn et al. 2003). The presence of pollen from warm climate seed plants including palm and mangrove, coupled with the fern

spores, indicated that the paleoclimate of the Catahoula Formation at Big Creek on Sicily Island was tropical to subtropical. According to Wrenn et al. (2003), the site was most likely a bayou, a quiet fluvial backwater, or the uppermost reaches of a tidal channel or estuary. Today the MAT of the area is 19.3 °C and the MAP is 1539 mm (NOAA-NCDC 2014).

Brandywine. Brandywine is a Late Miocene fossil site (11.2-6.5 Ma) in southern Maryland (McCartan et al. 1990) The site is near Brandywine, Maryland and is about 20 km southeast of Washington D.C. The Brandywine site was found in a clay lens (about 30 m wide, 90 m long, and 6 m thick) that occupied an irregular channel remnant in an alluvial plain composed of quartzose sand and gravel. The fossiliferous clay was found in the deepest part of the channel and did not appear to have evidence of deformation (McCartan et al. 1990). McCartan et al. (1990) dated the site as late Miocene based on the diverse flora.

Approximately 49 fossil taxa were unearthed from the site (McCartan et al. 1990). The fossils included pollen, seeds, fruit, and leaves, as well as wood from *Taxodium*. The vegetation was dominated by vines and deciduous trees. Of the identified fossil taxa found at this site, only one (*Mneme*) is now extinct. Only 4 of the taxa are no longer native to North America but still survive in a temperate climate elsewhere. Of the remaining 44 genera, all but 2 still grow in Maryland: *Sophora* now grows west of the Appalachian Mountains and *Larix* only grows as far south as New Jersey.

The scarcity of terrestrial herbaceous plants and absence of grass pollen indicated a lack of open space near the site (McCartan et al. 1990). Groot (1991) suggested that the presence of *Taxodium*, *Pterocarya*, *Liquidambar*, and *Cyrilla* from this site indicated a warm-temperate or subtropical climate, while McCartan et al. (1990) suggested that the abundance of deciduous taxa and presence of taxa with high cold tolerance such as *Pinus*, *Smilax*, *Myrica*, and *Comptonia*

indicated a temperate climate. Conservatively, the paleoclimate of the Brandywine formation was likely similar to that of present-day coastal North and South Carolina, with hot summers, mild winters without much frost, and consistent seasonal rainfall. The presence of *Taxodium distichum* and absence of drought-tolerant taxa suggested a high water table and adequate rainfall (McCartan et al. 1990). Today the MAT of the area is 13.4° C and the MAP is 1134 mm (NOAA-NCDC 2014).

Gray Fossil Site. The Gray Fossil Site in northeastern Tennessee is Late Miocene to Early Pliocene (7.0-4.5 Ma) in age (Wallace and Wang 2004; Shunk et al. 2006). The site is located in Johnson City, Tennessee (latitude 36° 22' 13" N, longitude 82° 29' 49" W). The Gray Fossil Site was a sinkhole lake that was up to 39 m deep and approximately 2 ha in size (Wallace and Wang 2004; Shunk et al. 2006). This sinkhole lake was likely composed of 11 different sinkholes within the oxidized subaerial chert-rich gravels, muds, and sands of the Knox Group carbonates that disconformably overlays the lacustrine sequence (Clark et al. 2005; Shunk et al. 2006; Whitelaw et al. 2008). This resulted in a deposit of finely laminated clays, silts, and fine sands intermixed with gravel lenses. Zobaa et al. (2011) suggested that the Gray Fossil Site basins consisted of a younger Late Miocene/Early Pliocene subbasin and an older Paleocene to Eocene subbasin. The age of the site was constrained biostratigraphically by using the temporal range of the short-faced bear *Plionarctos* and the rhinoceros *Teleoceras* (Parmalee et al. 2002; Wallace and Wang 2004).

Both floral and faunal fossils have been found at the Gray Fossil Site that indicate the site rarely experienced freezing temperatures and had limited seasonality (DeSantis and Wallace 2008; Liu and Jacques 2010). The faunal fossils present a unique combination of influence. Taxa such as *Alligator, Heloderma*, and *Tapirus* indicate a warm adapted southern influence, while

taxa such as the badger *Arctomeles* and the red panda *Pristinailurus* indicate a cool adapted northern component (Wallace and Wang 2004; Mead et al. 2012). The presence of crocodilian fossils suggested that the Gray Fossil Site had a cold month mean temperature (CMMT) of warmer than 5.5° C (Shunk et al. 2006). A study by DeSantis and Wallace (2008) showed that stable isotope analyses of carbon and oxygen varied insignificantly and indicated that there were only minor differences in monthly temperature and precipitation between the modern climate of eastern Tennessee and the paleoclimate of the Gray Fossil Site in the Neogene, but the paleoclimate had less seasonality.

Both micro- and megafloral fossils have been found at the Gray Fossil Site, including wood, leaves, fruits, and seeds (Gong et al. 2010; Liu and Jacques 2010; Zobaa et al. 2011; Ochoa et al. 2012). The floral taxa were predominately genera native to North America such as *Quercus, Carya,* and *Pinus* but also from taxa with a strong east Asian correlation including *Pterocarya, Vitis,* and *Sinomenium* (Gong et al. 2010; Liu and Jacques 2010; Ochoa et al. 2012). The presence of *Sinomenium* suggests a CMMT of -7.3°-21°C (Liu and Jacques 2010). The paleoenvironment of the site closely resemble the modern North American mesophytic forest region and likely acted as a refugium for forest species from the expansion of grasslands across the continent (Ochoa et al. 2012). Fossil tapirs indicate a nearby forested paleoenvironment (DeSantis and Wallace 2008). The fossil data combined with the presence of charcoal suggests that the paleoclimate was warm and dry with periodic fire events (Zobaa et al. 2011). Today the MAT of the area is 13.9° C and the MAP is 1263 mm (NOAA-NCDC 2014).

<u>Citronelle.</u> The Citronelle Formation fossil sites in southwestern Alabama are Late Pliocene (3.4-2.7 Ma) in age (Stults et al. 2002). The date was originally estimated as Pliocene (Berry 1916b; Matson 1916) but has been debated for almost a century (Roy 1939; Stringfeld

and LaMoreaux 1957; Doering 1958; Isphording and Lamb 1971). Otvos (1997, 1998) estimated a Pliocene age based on evidence for higher sea level and intense subtropical/tropical weathering, as well as correlation with other regional formations. Recent work supports Berry's (1916b) Pliocene age estimation.

Floral fossils were found in peat deposits and rare, relatively unoxidized clay lenses (Stults 2003). They are located on the eastern shore of Perdido Bay in Baldwin County, Alabama (latitude 30° 24.05' N, longitude 87° 26.97' W), on the western shore of Perdido Bay on the Alabama-Florida border (latitude 30° 20.61' N, longitude 87° 29.12' W), in central Mobile County, Alabama (latitude 30° 43.74' N, longitude 88°8.57' W), and on the Scarborough School site on private property within the Mobile city limits (latitude 30° 43.74' N, longitude 88° 8.57' W) (Stults and Axsmith 2009, 2011b). Unfortunately, according to Stults and Axsmith (2011b), the fossiliferous layers at the Scarborough site are no longer accessible due to land reclamation efforts.

A variety of microfloral and megafloral fossils have been found, including pollen, leaves, fruits, and seeds (Stults et al. 2002; Stults 2003; Stults and Axsmith 2009; Stults et al. 2010; Stults and Axsmith 2011a, 2011b; Stults et al. 2011). The fossil taxa included native taxa such as *Liquidambar*, *Carpinus*, Cupressaceae, and *Pinus* (Stults et al. 2002; Stults and Axsmith 2009; Stults et al. 2010; Stults and Axsmith 2011b; Stults et al. 2011), as well as exotic taxa including *Pterocarya*, *Trapa*, Menispermaceae, *Gordonia*, and *Begonia* (Stults and Axsmith 2011a, 2011b). These fossils sites provided the earliest post-Eocene evidence of *Carpinus* in North America (Stults et al. 2002). The paleoenvironment was likely lacustrine wetlands. Leaf margin analysis of the sites by Stults (2003) gave a MAT of 17.6° C with a standard error of 2.7° C. The temperature in coastal Alabama during the Middle Pliocene was likely similar or slightly cooler

than the current MAT for the region of 19.3° C (Stults and Axsmith 2011). Today the MAT of the area is 19.6° C and the MAP is 1597 mm (NOAA-NCDC 2014).

<u>Peace Creek.</u> The Peace Creek site is a Late Pliocene sinkhole locality (approximately 2.8 Ma) in central Florida located in the Polk Upland between Lakeland Ridge, Lake Wales Ridge, and Lake Henry Ridge (latitude 27°54'45.8" N, longitude 81°45'14.8" W) (Hansen et al. 2001). The site is within the Hawthorn Group, which consists of the Arcadia Formation (upper Oligocene-lower Miocene) near the Bone Valley Member of the Peace River Formation (upper Miocene-lower Pliocene) (Hansen et al. 2001). The Peace Creek sinkhole formed in a thick carbonate unit, likely the Suwannee or Ocala Limestones. High sea levels during the Miocene and middle Pliocene refute the possibility that the site is older than late Pliocene (Hansen et al. 2001).

Palynological remains from the Peace Creek site were dominated by *Pinus* (Hansen et al. 2001). However, wetland and aquatic taxa including *Taxodium*, *Cyrilla*, *Sagittaria*, and *Nuphar* made up a large component of the studied pollen. Native taxa such as *Quercus*, *Carya*, *Pinus*, *Liquidambar*, and *Myrica* were prevalent in the pollen assemblage, but exotic taxa including *Pterocarya*, *Sciadopitys*, cf. *Ginkgo*, and cf. *Dacrydium* were also observed. Sediments and the pollen assemblage from this site suggested that it was a shallow-water wetland and alternated between bay swamp, shrub bog, cypress pond, water lily marsh, flag marsh, and wet prairie (Hansen et al. 2001). The paleoclimate was similar to that of modern Florida. Today the MAT of the area is 22.4° C and the MAP is 1316 mm (NOAA-NCDC 2014).

<u>Ohoopee River Dune Field.</u> The Ohoopee River Dune Field site in Emanuel County, Georgia is difficult to date (Rich et al. 2002). It is underlain by the Middle Miocene Altamaha Formation and overlain by Pleistocene dunes; however, the site itself cannot be decisively dated

(Rich personal communication 2013). The site was discovered by a series of auger holes drilled into the Pleistocene dunes (Rich et al. 2002). Clayey, organic-rich sediments were encountered during the drilling process. Analysis of the clayey sediments produced abundant palynomorphs, as well as palygorskite that is common in Miocene strata (Weaver and Beck 1977). The presence of *Momipites* also suggested a pre-Quaternary age, but the number of pollen grains was too small to be a reliable indication (Rich et al. 2002).

Microfloral fossils produced 87 different taxa, mostly of herbaceous plants, shrubs, and trees that are native to modern southeastern North America including *Nyssa*, *Taxodium*, *Carya*, and *Quercus* (Rich et al. 2002). Four exotic fossil genera were also present: *Casuarinidites*, *Momipites*, *Pterocarya*, and *Sciadopitys*. All identified palynomorphs represent terrestrial or freshwater species (Rich et al. 2002). Ecologically, the paleoenvironment of this site was probably composed of warm coastal swamps and open, flooded marshlands. Today the MAT of the area is 17.7° C and the MAP is 1198 mm (NOAA-NCDC 2014).

Analytical Procedures

The available fossil data were sufficiently identified to use the Coexistence Approach, but lacked the level of leaf preservation to warrant CLAMP (Climate Leaf Margin Analysis). Leaf Margin Analysis (LMA) for the floral fossils of the Citronelle Formation in Alabama was performed by Stults (2003).

Coexistence Approach

The Coexistence Approach (CA) was developed by Mosbrugger and Utescher (1997) and is a largely computer-based method of quantitative paleoclimate reconstruction. It has been used to estimate paleoclimate parameters of Neogene Europe (Uhl et al. 2003; Uhl et al. 2006), as well as eastern Asia (Liang et al. 2003). CA uses the modern climatic requirements of a fossil

taxon's nearest living relative (NLR). For a given climate parameter the estimated climatic interval is the range in which all, or most, NLRs can coexist. Analysis using CA requires a minimum of 10 taxa, the more taxa provide higher levels of resolution (Mosbrugger and Utescher 1997).

The floral fossils from 11 fossil sites were analyzed using the methods adapted from Mosbrugger and Utescher (1997) and Uhl et al. (2003). NLRs were determined to the genus level from the literature. For the extinct genera *Microdiptera* and *Mneme*, the extant genus *Decodon* was used as the nearest living relative (Graham 2013). NLR climatic parameters were obtained from the Palaeoflora Database (some parameters are available online at <u>http://palaeoflora.de</u>). From this analysis, the intervals for coexistence were calculated for mean annual temperature (MAT), cold month mean temperature (CMMT), warm month mean temperature (WMMT), mean annual precipitation (MAP), monthly maximum precipitation (MMaP), monthly minimum precipitation (MMiP), and warm month mean precipitation (WMMP). Comparison modern climate data were obtained from the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration National Climatic Data Center (NOAA-NCDC) website (http://ncdc.noaa.gov/cag).

GIS Reconstruction

Using the data from the CA analysis, the paleoclimate data for each fossil site were mapped on to a modern map of North America using ArcMap in ArcGIS 10.1. Two paleoclimate parameters were mapped: the mean annual temperature (MAT) and mean annual precipitation (MAP). Paleoclimate data were compared to modern climate data from the PRISM Climate Group at Oregon State University 30-Year Normals (<u>http://prism.oregonstate.edu/normals/</u>) to determine differences between the modern and paleoclimate. MAT and MAP were chosen so that paleoclimate and modern climate parameters were compared directly. The mean of estimated paleoclimatic intervals was used for comparison.

CHAPTER 3

RESULTS

Fossil Sites

Pollack Farm

During the Miocene, the Pollack Farm Site had a MAT that was higher than it is in the region today, but the modern MAP falls within the Miocene estimate (Table 2, Figs. 4, 5). Today the MAT of the Pollack Farm area is 12.9° C and the MAP is 1117 mm.

Table 2. Paleoclimate climatic intervals using the coexistence approach (CA) for 11 Neogene fossil sites for mean annual temperature (MAT), cold month mean temperature (CMMT), warm month mean temperature (WMMT), mean annual precipitation (MAP), monthly maximum precipitation (MMaP), monthly minimum precipitation (MMiP), and warm month mean precipitation (WMMP).

Fossil Site	MAT	CMMT	WMMT	MAP	MMaP	MMiP	WMMP
Pollack Farm Site	14.4-18.4	4.3-9.6	25.1-27.9	961-1520	109-196	42-56	108-175
Brandon Lignite	15.7-21.3	5.5-13.3	23.6-27.9	1096-1520	165-195	42-43	111-176
Legler Lignite	14.4-20.8	5.2-12.6	24-27.9	996-1347	204-293	52-56	99-142
Alum Bluff	20.4-21.7	13.3-14.8	26-27.9	823-932	204-241	29-45	108-176
Bryn Mawr	13.8-20.8	3.1-13.3	23.6-27.9	823-1613	204-245	9-59	79-180
Big Creek on Sicily Island	20.4-20.8	4.3-15.6	25-27.9	1122-1520	146-178	42-45	99-180
Brandywine	13.3-16.1	-0.1-7.8	23-25.6	735-1551	109-195	32-56	74-176
Gray Fossil Site	13.6-18.5	4.3-12.5	23.6-25.9	961-1167	109-151	42-56	99-176
Citronelle Formation	14.4-20.8	4.3-13.3	25.7-27.9	961-1355	113-195	42-43	94-163
Peace Creek Formation	14.4-21.9	4.3-13.6	23.6-27.9	961-1520	204-281	42-56	99-177
Ohoopee River Dune Field	14.4-20.8	1.8-13.3	23.6-27.9	823-1562	204-264	25-59	99-176

Brandon Lignite

The Brandon Lignite had a drastically warmer MAT during the Miocene (Table 2). Tiffney (1994) predicted that the Brandon Lignite had a MAT of 17.1° C with a mean annual range of temperature (MART) of 17° C. This differed dramatically from the MAT of the Brandon Lignite today of 7.6° C (Fig. 4). Tiffney (1994) also predicted that the MAP was about 1600 mm with seasonal fluctuations. This was slightly higher than the interval estimated by the CA (Fig. 5). The modern MAP of 953 mm is slightly lower than the Miocene MAP of 1096-1520 mm.



Comparison Paleo MAT and Modern MAT

Figure 4. Comparison of the modern MAT (green dots) and the paleo MAT interval (whiskers) for 11 fossil sites

Legler Lignite

The Legler Lignite had a good deal warmer MAT during the Miocene than the region has today, but the modern MAP falls within the estimated Miocene range (Table 2, Figs. 4, 5). Rachele (1976) predicted that the MAP was about 1270 mm, with an average January
temperature of 6° C and an average July temperature of 24° C. Today the Legler Lignite region has a MAT of 11.7° C and a MAP of 1211 mm.



Comparison Paleo MAP and Modern MAP

Figure 5. Comparison of the modern MAP (green dots) and the paleo MAP interval (whiskers) for 11 fossil sites

Alum Bluff

The Alum Bluff site was slightly warmer, but the modern MAP is higher than the estimated Miocene range (Table 2, Figs. 4, 5). Today Alum Bluff region has a MAT of 19.6° and a MAP of 1512 mm.

Bryn Mawr

During the Miocene the Bryn Mawr Site had a MAT that was slightly warmer than the region today, but the modern MAP falls within the expected Miocene range (Table 2, Figs. 4, 5). Today the Bryn Mawr region has a MAT of 12.2° C and a MAP of 1086 mm.

Big Creek on Sicily Island

The Big Creek on Sicily Island site had a MAT that was slightly warmer than today and a MAP that was slightly higher (Table 2, Figs. 4, 5). Today the MAT is 19.3° C and the MAP is 1539 mm. Overall, the climate does not appear to have changed much since the Miocene.

Brandywine

The Brandywine site had a similar MAT as the region today and a similar MAP (Table 2, Figs. 4, 5). Today the Brandywine area has a MAT of 13.3° C and a MAP of 1088 mm.

Gray Fossil Site

The Gray Fossil Site was probably warmer during the Neogene, and the modern MAP falls within the Neogene range (Table 2, Figs. 4, 5). Today the Gray Fossil Site has a MAT of 13.6° C and a MAP of 1153 mm. The presence of crocodilians at this site suggests that the CMMT was greater than 5.5° C (Shunk et al. 2006), while the presence of *Sinomenium* suggested a CMMT of -7.3°-21° C (Liu and Jacques 2010). Both of these estimates fall within or encompass the CA interval.

<u>Citronelle</u>

The Citronelle Formation had a comparable or cooler MAT during the Pliocene, while the MAP was lower than today (Table 2, Figs. 4, 5). Using LMA, Stults (2003) predicted a MAT of 17.6° C with a standard error of 2.7° C (14.9°-20.3° C). After including the standard error, both approaches yield similar results. The current MAT for the region is 19.3° C, suggesting that

the paleoclimate was similar to or slightly cooler than in the region today (Stults 2003; Stults and Axsmith 2011). The modern MAP of 1550 mm is greater than the Miocene MAP of 961-1355 mm.

Peace Creek

The Peace Creek had a cooler MAT during the Pliocene than today, but the modern MAP falls within the Pliocene range (Table 2, Figs. 4, 5). Today the MAT of the Peace Creek site is 22.4° C and the MAP is 1316 mm.

Ohoopee River Dune Field

The Ohoopee River Dune Field had both a MAT and a MAP that are comparable to the modern values (Table 2, Figs. 4, 5). Today the MAT of Ohoopee River Dune Field is 18.4° C and the MAP is 1171 mm.

Overall Patterns

Throughout the Paleogene and Neogene there is an general pattern of decreasing temperature and precipitation. However, the analyzed fossil sites from Neogene eastern North America do not reflect this cooling and drying trend. Overall, there was a pattern of early and middle Miocene sites being warmer than today, the middle and late Miocene sites being comparable to today, and Pliocene sites being cooler than today (Figs. 4, 6). There was no clear pattern of precipitation (Figs. 5,7).



Figure 6. Comparison of modern MAT (base map) to estimated MAT (colored dots) of Neogene floral fossil sites in eastern North America. Modern MAT values are 30-year Normals from the PRISM Climate Group, Oregon State University, <u>http://prism.oregonstate.edu</u>. Copyright © 2014, PRISM Climate Group, Oregon State University, http://prism.oregonstate.edu Map created 1/23/2014.



Figure 7. Comparison of modern MAP (base map) to estimated MAP (colored dots) of Neogene floral fossil sites in eastern North America. Modern MAP values are 30-year Normals from the PRISM Climate Group, Oregon State University, <u>http://prism.oregonstate.edu</u>. Copyright © 2014, PRISM Climate Group, Oregon State University, http://prism.oregonstate.edu Map created 1/23/2014.

CHAPTER 4

DISCUSSION

Comparison of Methodologies

Only 4 of the fossil sites included in this analysis had previous paleoclimate reconstructions: the Brandon Lignite (Tiffney 1994), the Legler Lignite (Rachele 1976), the Gray Fossil Site (Shunk et al. 2006; Liu and Jacques 2010), and the Citronelle sites (Stults 2003). Tiffney (1994) estimated that the Brandon Lignite had a MAT of 17.1° C and a MART of 17° C, as well as a MAP of about 1600 mm. The coexistence approach gave the range 15.7° -21.3 ° C for the MAT. The MART can be inferred from the difference between the CMMT range (5.5° - 13.3° C) and the WMMT range (23.6° -27.9° C). However, the difference of 22.4° should be interpreted cautiously because it was not obtained directly. The coexistence approach gave a range of 1096-1520 mm for the MAP. The Tiffney's MAT estimate falls in the middle of the coexistence approach range, while his MAP estimate is greater than the coexistence approach range.

Rachele (1976) estimated the Legler Lignite to have a MAP of about 1270 mm, a mean January temperature of 6° C, and a mean July temperature of 24°C. The coexistence approach gave the range 996-1347 mm for the MAP, the range 5.2°-12.6°C for the CMMT, and the range 24°-27.9° C for the WMMT. Rachele's MAP estimate falls within the coexistence approach range. Rachele's January mean temperature prediction seems reasonable with respect to the coexistence approach range for CMMT, but the July mean temperature prediction could be a little low.

Shunk et al. (2006) used the presence of crocodilian fossils to estimate that the Gray Fossil Site had a CMMT of $> 5.5^{\circ}$ C. The coexistence approach gave the range $4.3^{\circ}-12.5^{\circ}$ C for

the CMMT. The previous estimate falls in the new range. Liu and Jacques (2010) suggested that the presence of *Sinomenium* indicated a CMMT of $-7.3^{\circ}-21^{\circ}$ C. This is a large range and encompassed the CA estimate. Stults (2003) used LMA to estimate a MAT of 17.6° C with a standard error of $\pm 2.7^{\circ}$ C (14.9°-20.3° C) at the Citronelle sites. This is nearly identical to the coexistence approach range of $14.4^{\circ}-20.8^{\circ}$ C.

Haywood et al. (2001) estimated that the Piacenzian stage of the Pliocene (2.6-3.6 Ma) in North America was between $2^{\circ}-4^{\circ}$ C warmer annually with higher levels of precipitation and less seasonality. Both the Citronelle sites (Stults et al. 2002) and the Peace Creek site (Hansen et al. 2001) fall in this time. For the Citronelle sites, the estimated MAT of $14.4^{\circ}-20.8^{\circ}$ is nearly identical to, if not slightly cooler than, the modern MAT of 19.3° C. Also, the estimated MAP of 961-1355 mm is less than the modern MAP of 1550 mm. This suggests the late Pliocene in the Gulf Coast of Alabama was actually cooler and drier than the region is today. The Peace Creek site, the only other Pliocene fossil site in this analysis, had an estimated MAT of $14.4^{\circ}-21.9^{\circ}$ C, which is cooler than the modern MAT of 22.4° at Peace Creek, while the Neogene estimated MAP of 961-1520 mm encompasses the modern MAP of 1316 mm.

However, these are only 2 Late Pliocene sites on the Gulf Coast and they are not necessarily representative of all of eastern North America at that time. However, this is unsurprising because Haywood et al. (2001) had difficulty simulating the climate of southern North America, which is where the Pliocene sites in this analysis were located. Haywood et al. (2001) and Salzmann et al. (2009) both asserted that the middle Pliocene can be used a 'test bed' for future global warning. However, these simulations will be incomplete without paleoclimate data from Neogene eastern North America, particularly from the Pliocene. Furthermore, a study by De Schepper et al. (2013) showed that during the early Late Pliocene (~3.3 Ma) a temporary

Northern Hemisphere glaciation caused by increased Pacific Ocean to Atlantic Ocean flow via the Central American Seaway cooled the high latitude oceans. A subsequent drop in sea level ceased Pacific Ocean inflow, leading to buildup of warm water in the Caribbean and the termination of the glaciation. This influx of cold water through the Central American Seaway could partially be the cause of the relatively cool temperatures estimated in the Gulf Coast during the late Pliocene.

The coexistence approach relies on climatic parameters of the nearest living relative from the Palaeoflora Database; therefore, it is vitally important that the database be accurate, up-to-date and inclusive. In my experience, this was not always the case. For example, in my own research I came across inaccurate genera: the genus *Toxicodendron* (poison ivy and poison sumac) was included in the genus *Rhus* (sumac), and *Engelhardia* was under the incorrect spelling of *Engelhardtia*. Also, while the Palaeoflora Database includes a large number of woody plant genera and a surprising number of ferns, it lacks herbaceous plants. This is likely due to the difficulty in identifying some herbaceous fossil taxa past the family level and the sheer number of species.

In order to verify the validity of the paleoclimate reconstruction method, Grimm and Denk (2012) used the coexistence approach to reconstruct modern flora using the MAT. They tested the resolution and reliability of the MAT interval on forests in North America, Georgia (Transcaucasia), China, and Japan using both the MAT given in the Palaeoflora Database as well as corrected values from Thompson (1999a, 1999b, 2001). Grimm and Denk (2012) stated that the CA should not be regarded as a quantitative method of reliably reconstructing mean annual temperatures with a high resolution. When the "corrected" MAT values were used for reconstructing coexistence intervals, the precision of the coexistence approach was no more than

5° C: differences of less than 2° C could not be resolved, and even differences of less than 5° C were hardly captured by reconstructed MAT intervals based on potential species-level NLRs (Grimm and Denk 2012). This strongly suggests that the assumed precision of 0.1° C of Mosbrugger and Utescher (1997) is not accurate.

Grimm and Denk (2012) also pointed out that 560 of the over 700 taxa in the Palaeoflora Database could potentially coexist at a MAT of 16° C. In other words, the majority of the taxa in the database could survive in modern North Carolina. For example, NLRs such as *Symplocos* and *Engelhardia* are frequently found in fossil assemblages, but their inaccurately warm climate intervals could lead to the incorrect elimination of other potential NLRs (Grimm and Denk 2012). Despite the apparent shortcomings of the coexistence approach, it is still relatively new and should not be entirely discounted.

In order to successfully, and carefully, implement the coexistence approach method in my research, I was conservative in my application. I mined the literature for floral lists and, if included, I used the authors' noted nearest living relatives. Also, even if the nearest living relative was identified to the species level, I ran the analysis at the genus level. However, this leads to a different set of problems. Genera generally have climatic ranges that are wider than that of individual species (Grimm and Denk 2012). This means that the coexistence intervals are much wider at fossil sites with fewer fossil taxa or in assemblages with many speciose genera. That meant that some sites had much wider coexistence intervals than others. Unfortunately, I was limited by the data in the literature, so if a fossil site had fewer than 15 unique fossil taxa I did not include it in this analysis. To combat bias in my analysis, I compared my coexistence approach results with that of Stults (2003) LMA from the Citronelle sites and other methods of quantitative paleoclimate reconstruction such as stable isotope analysis.

Grimm and Denk (2012) showed that relict taxa such as *Glyptostrobus*, *Engelhardia*, *Liquidambar*, *Taxodium*, and *Zelkova* determined MAT intervals in many studies. Many of my fossil sites' coexistence intervals were bookended by *Cyrilla* and *Sciadopitys*, two monotypic genera. Today *Cyrilla racemiflora* is distributed across the southeastern United States, while *Sciadopitys verticillata* is currently restricted to Japan. Unfortunately, *Sciadopitys* only had values for MAT in the Palaeoflora Database, so it could not be included in this study. The loss of *Sciadopitys* broadened the coexistence intervals, particularly for mean annual temperature.

While Grimm and Denk (2012) observed that "all roads lead to North Carolina" meaning that many NLRs can coexist at a MAT of 16° C—I had a similar trend converging in South Carolina. It would appear that throughout the Neogene the climate in eastern North America was most like that of South Carolina. Grimm and Denk (2012) also demonstrated that lower limits of coexistence intervals could be more meaningful than the upper limit or the center value, which means that my wide, conservative coexistence intervals could still be meaningful.

The nearest living relative coexistence approach allows for much flexibility in analysis; the more taxa included and the lower the taxonomic level identified, the more precise the analysis. This has both positive and negative impacts on analyses. For example, analysis at the species level would have a narrower range of optimal values because the climatic ranges of the taxa are more narrow to begin with. However the older the taxa, the more subjective this identification becomes. With the exception of monotypic genera, the selection of a species as the nearest living relative already makes an assumption about the paleoclimate. On the other hand, identifying the taxa only to the family level assumes less about the climatic requirements of the taxa, but the range of values would be prohibitively large and may not provide any insight on the paleoclimate. Using the genus level finds the middle ground between the approaches. While

some genera have remarkably large climatic intervals (*Quercus*, *Populus*, *Pinus*), others are not much larger than that of its respective species. However, it is important to remember that it was not until about 20 Ma that fossil angiosperms were referable to extant families and not until about 10 Ma that fossils were referable to extant genera (Traverse 1988).

Neogene Climate Patterns

The fossil sites in this analysis exhibited an unexpected pattern. There appeared to be a north/south age gradient among the fossil sites. The Brandon Lignite in Vermont is Early Miocene and is the northernmost site in this analysis (Fig. 8). Continuing south, the sites become younger and younger until the Pliocene Peace Creek site in Florida, which was the southernmost and youngest site. The Alum Bluff site (Middle Miocene) in Florida and the Big Creek on Sicily Island in Louisiana (Late Miocene) were exceptions to this pattern. Even the Ohoopee River Dune Field, which was difficult to date, appeared to follow this pattern. However, it is unclear whether this north-south age pattern is based on geology or coincidence. Unfortunately, that question is beyond the scope of this thesis but warrants future consideration.

Within the Neogene it is difficult to directly compare the Miocene and the Pliocene. First of all, the Miocene lasted from 23 Ma until 5.3 Ma (17.7 million years), while the Pliocene only lasted from 5.3 Ma until 2.6 Ma (2.7 million years). In other words, there is a greater time difference between the Early Miocene and the Late Miocene than between the Early Pliocene and the Late Pliocene. Secondly, this analysis of 11 sites included 8 Miocene sites, 1 Late Miocene or Early Pliocene site, and 2 Pliocene sites. This is not a balanced comparison.



Figure 8. Ages of Neogene floral fossil sites in eastern North America used in this analysis

However, conservative comparisons were possible. In general, the earliest Miocene sites were the most warmer than the climate expected in those regions today. Later Miocene sites were virtually the same temperature as expected in those regions today. Pliocene sites were cooler than expected in those regions today. Overall, the reconstructed temperature parameters reflected the expected cooling trend, though to a higher degree than expected, throughout the Neogene. However, there does not appear to be a drying trend.

The Ohoopee River Dune Field was a difficult fossil site to date (Rich et al. 2002; Rich personal communication 2013). It is underlain by the Middle Miocene Altamaha Formation and overlain by Pleistocene dunes. For that reason it was unclear where the site should fall in this analysis. However, after performing the CA analysis, the Ohoopee River Dune Field site appeared to fit best in the Middle or Late Miocene. Of the sites in this analysis early Miocene sites (Brandon Lignite, Pollack Farm, Legler Lignite, Bryn Mawr) tended to be the most warmer

than the current MAT, while middle and late Miocene sites (Alum Bluff, Big Creek on Sicily Island, Brandywine, Gray Fossil Site) tended to comparable to the current MAT, and Pliocene sites (Citronelle, Peace Creek) tended to be cooler than the current MAT. These patterns were not observable with respect to the MAP. Unlike temperature, which is primarily meridonially dependent, precipitation is primarily geologically dependent. However, it is problematic to use the age of fossil sites to describe patterns in paleoclimate and then use patterns in paleoclimate to predict the age of fossil sites. Therefore, this estimation should be taken cautiously.

Future Work

Unlike western North America with its abundance of Neogene sites and bounty of appropriately aged geological exposures, eastern North America does not have that bounty. Only 11 sites were included in this analysis and, of those sites, all but the Gray Fossil Site in Tennessee and the Brandon Lignite in Vermont were along the coast. Therefore, interpretations of paleoclimate must take into account the effects of the ocean. Though the Gray Fossil Site and the Brandon Lignite were not exposed to such forces, they do not form a representative sample, being separated by hundreds of kilometers and millions of years.

The Pipe Creek Sinkhole in Indiana could help to shine light on the question of paleoclimate (Farlow et al., 2001; Farlow and Argast 2006; Shunk et al. 2009). It is located well into the interior of the continent and could help to complete the paleoclimatic puzzle. Unfortunately, the site was discovered fairly recently and the initial investigation is still being published in the scientific literature. While the fauna of the site have been relatively well described, the flora are virtually unknown. Few floral identifications have been performed to the genus level; most floral fossils have only been identified to the family or even order. It appears

that the site has a boon of floral fossils and it is vital that a paleobotanist study these fossils to fill out the picture of the site.

Furthermore, the paucity of Neogene sites in North America is exacerbated by the near absence of Pliocene sites. While the late Miocene/early Pliocene Gray Fossil Site does offer some insight, the late Pliocene Citronelle sites and the late Pliocene Peace Creek site take on the brunt of the analysis. It is not realistic to make conclusions about the paleoclimate of all of eastern North America based on the results of two Gulf Coast fossil sites. Future analyses would benefit from the inclusion of more Pliocene sites, particularly from further north and in the interior of the continent. However, at the time of this writing, those fossil sites do not exist.

CHAPTER 5

CONCLUSION

The Neogene a transitional period in Earth's history, with decreasing temperatures and precipitation across the globe, as well as changes in the paleoenvironment and floral and faunal makeup. However, in eastern North America there is a distinct lack of Neogene fossil sites. Of the 11 fossil sites with enough taxa to perform a coexistence approach analysis (Pollack Farm, Brandon Lignite, Legler Lignite, Alum Bluff, Bryn Mawr, Big Creek on Sicily Island, Brandywine, Gray Fossil Site, Citronelle, Peace Creek, Ohoopee River Dune Field), there were 2 primary broad patterns. Firstly, there was a general trend that early and middle Miocene sites were warmer than the area today, while middle and late Miocene sites were comparable to the area today, and Pliocene sites were similar to or cooler than the area today. This pattern of cool Pliocene sites along the Gulf Coast could be due to Northern Hemisphere glaciations during the middle Pliocene. However, there is no clear pattern of increased precipitation, as would be expected from global climate trends. Secondly, there is a rough pattern of early Neogene sites in the northern regions of eastern North America with younger sites further south. This pattern could be due to geology or be entirely coincidental.

Neogene paleoclimate data from eastern North America will have a great impact on the study of North America paleoclimate as well as future climate predictions. By including the paleoclimate of the entire continent in climate models, predictions will become more accurate.

REFERENCES

Anderson, B.G., Borns, H.W. 1997. The Ice Age world. Oslo: Scandinavian University Press.

- Barghoorn, E.S., Spackman, Jr. W. 1949. A preliminary study of the flora of the Brandon Lignite. American Journal of Science 247: 33-39.
- Benson, R.N., Jordan, R.R., Spoljaric, N. 1985. Geological studies of Cretaceous and Tertiary section, Test Well Je32-04, central Delaware. Delaware Geological Survey Bulletin 17.
- Berry, E.W. 1916a. The physical conditions and age indicated by the flora of the Alum Bluff Formation. US Geological Survey Professional Paper, Report No.: P0098-E.
- Berry, E.W. 1916b. The flora of the Citronelle Formation. US Geological Survey Professional Paper, Report No.: P0098-L.
- Berry, E.W. 1917. The flora of the Catahoula Formation. US Geological Survey Professional Paper, Report No.: P0098-M.
- Bryant, J.D., MacFadden, B.J., Mueller, P.A. 1992. Improved chronologic resolution of the Hawthorn and Alum Bluff Groups in northern Florida: Implications for Miocene chronostratigraphy. Geology Society of America Bulletin 104: 208-218.
- Cerling, T.E., Harris, J.M., MacFadden, B.J., Leakey, M.G., Quade, J., Elsenmann, V., Ehleringer, J.R. 1997. Global vegetation change through the Miocene/Pliocene boundary. Nature 389: 153-158.
- Cerling, T.E., Ehleringer, J.R., Harris, J.M. 1998. Carbon dioxide starvation, the development of C₄ ecosystems and mammalian evolution. Philosophical Transactions of Royal Society of London, B, Biological Sciences 353: 159-171.
- Chawner, W.D. 1936. Geology of Catahoula and Concordia Parishes. Department of Conservation, Louisiana Geological Survey, New Orleans. Geological Bulletin No. 9.
- Clark, G.M., Kohl, M., Moore, H.L., Sasowsky, I.D. 2005. The Gray Fossil Site: A spectacular example in Tennessee of ancient regolith occurrences in carbonate terranes, Valley and Ridge Subprovince, Southern Appalachians, U.S.A. In: Beck, B.F. editor. Tenth multidisciplinary conference on Sinkholes and the engineering and environmental impacts of karst. San Antonio TX) American Society of Civil Engineers; P. 82-90.
- Climate at a Glance [Internet]. 2014. National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration-National Climatic Data Center. [cited 2014 Jan 20]. Available from: <u>http://ncdc.noaa.gov/cag/</u>.

- Corbett, S.L. 2004. The Middle Miocene Alum Bluff Flora, Liberty County, Florida [Master's thesis]. [Gainesville, (FL)]: University of Florida.
- Crowley, T.J. 1996. Pliocene climates: the nature of the problem. Marine Micropaleontology 27: 3-12.
- DeSantis, L.R.G., Wallace, S.C. 2008. Neogene forests from the Appalachians of Tennessee, USA: Geochemical evidence from fossil mammal teeth. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology 266: 59-68.
- De Schepper, S., Groeneveld, J., Naafs, B.D.A., Van Renterghem, C., Hennissen, J., Head, M.J., Louwye, S., Fabian, K. 2013. North Hemisphere glaciation during the globally warm early Late Pliocene. PLOS ONE 8: 1-15.
- Doering, J.A. 1958. Citronelle age problem. Bulletin of the American Association of Petroleum Geologists 42: 764-786.
- Farlow, J.O., Argast, A. 2006. Preservation of fossil bone from the Pipe Creek Sinkhole (Late Neogene, Grant County, Indiana, U.S.A.). Journal of Paleontological Society of Korea 22: 51-75.
- Farlow, J.O., Sunderman, J.A., Havens, J.J., Swinehart, A.L., Holman, J.A., Richards, R.L., Miller, N.G., Martin, R.A., Hunt, Jr., R.M., Storrs, G.W., Curry, B.B., Fluegeman, R.H., Dawson, M.R., Flint, M.E.T. 2001. The Pipe Creek Sinkhole Biota, a Diverse Late Tertiary Continental Fossil Assemblage from Grant County, Indiana. The American Midland Naturalist 145: 367-378.
- Gong, F., Karsai, I., Liu, Y.S. 2010. Vitis seeds (Vitaceae) from the late Neogene Gray Fossil Site, northeastern Tennessee, USA. Review of Palaeobotany and Palynology 162: 71-83.
- Graham, A. 1993. History of the vegetation: Cretaceous (Maastrichtian)-Tertiary. In: Flora of North America Editorial Committee, editors. Flora of North America, Vol. 1. Oxford University Press, New York. p. 57-70.
- Graham, S.A. 2013. Fossil records in the Lythraceae. The Botanical Review 79: 48-145.
- Greller, A.M., Rachele, L.D. 1983. Climatic limits of exotic genera in the Legler palynoflora, Miocene, New Jersey, U.S.A. Review of Palaeobotany and Palynology 40: 149-163.
- Grimm, G.W., Denk, T. 2012. Reliability and resolution of the coexistence approach—A revalidation using modern-day data. Review of Palaeobotany and Palynology 172: 33-47.
- Groot, J.J., Ramsey, K.W., Wehmiller, J.F. 1990. Ages of the Bethany, Beaverdam, and Omar Formations of Southern Delaware. Delaware Geological Survey Report of Investigations No. 47. 22 p.

- Groot, J.J. 1991. Palynological evidence for Late Miocene, Pliocene and early Pleistocene climate changes in the middle U.S. Atlantic Coastal Plain. Quaternary Science Reviews 10: 147-162.
- Groot, J.J. 1992. Plant microfossils of the Calvert Formation of Delaware. Delaware Geological Survey Report of Investigation No. 50. 17 p.
- Groot, J.J. 1998. Palynomorphs from the lower Miocene Pollack Farm Site, Delaware. In: Benson. R.N., editor. Geology and paleontology of the lower Miocene Pollack Farm Fossil Site, Delaware: Delaware Geological Survey Special Publication No. 21: 55–57.
- Hansen, B.C.S., Grimm, E.C., Watts, W.A. 2001. Palynology of the Peace Creek site, Polk County, Florida. Geological Society of America Bulletin 113: 682-692.
- Haywood, A.M., Valdes, P.J., Sellwood, B.W., Kaplan, J.O., Dowsett, H.J. 2001. Modeling Middle Pliocene warm climates of the USA. Palaeotologia Electronica 4: 1-21.
- Hickson, T.A., Ness, A.J., Lamb, M.A. 2010. Miocene tectonics and climate in the Lake Mead region recorded by Horse Spring Formation carbonates. Geological Society of America Special Papers 463: 121-145.
- Howe, H.V. 1933. Review of the Tertiary stratigraphy of Louisiana. American Association of Petroleum Geologists Bulletin 17: 613-655.
- Isphording, W.C., Lamb, G.M. 1971. Age and origin of the Citronelle Formation in the Alabama. Geological Society of America Bulletin 82: 775-780.
- Jarzen, D.M., Corbett, S.L., Manchester, S.R. 2010. Palynology and paleoecology of the Middle Miocene Alum Bluff flora, Liberty County, Florida USA. Palynology 34: 261-286.
- Koch, P.L. 1998. Isotopic reconstructions of past continental environments. Annual Review of Earth and Planetary Sciences 26: 573-613.
- Kohn, M.J., Cerling, T.E. 2002. Stable isotope compositions of biological apatite. Reviews in Mineralogy and Geochemistry 48: 455-488.
- Liang, M.M., Bruch, A., Collinson, M., Mosbrugger, V., Li, C.S., Sun, Q.G., Hilton, J. 2003. Testing the climatic estimates from different palaeobotanical methods: an example from the Middle Miocene Shangwang flora of China. Palaeogeography Palaeoclimatology Palaeoecology 198: 279-301.
- Liu, Y.S., Jacques, F.M.B. 2010. Sinomenium macrocarpum sp. nov. (Menispermaceae) from the Miocene-Pliocene transition of Gray, northeast Tennessee, USA. Review of Palaeobotany and Palynology 159: 112-122.
- Manchester, S.R. 1999. Biogeographical relationships of North American tertiary floras. Annals of the Missouri Botanical Garden 86: 472-522.

- Matson, G.C. 1916. The Pliocene Citronelle Formation of the Gulf Coastal Plain. US Geological Survey Professional Paper, Report No.: P0098-L.
- Matson, G.C. 1917. The Catahoula Sandstone. US Geological Survey Professional Paper, Report No.: P0098-M.
- McCartan, L., Tiffney, B.H., Wolfe, J.A., Ager, T.A., Wing, S.L., Sirkin, L.A., Ward, L.W., Brooks, J. 1990. Late Tertiary floral assemblage from upland gravel deposits of the southern Maryland Coastal Plain. Geology 18: 311-314.
- McInerney, F.A., Strömberg, C.A.E., White, J.W.C. 2011. The Neogene transition from C₃ to C₄ grasslands in North America: stable carbon isotope ratios of fossil phytoliths. Paleobiology 37: 23-49.
- Mead, J.I., Schubert, B.W., Wallace, S.C., Swift, S.L. 2012. Helodermatid lizard from the Mio-Pliocene oak-hickory forest of Tennessee, eastern USA, and a review of monstersaurian osteoderms. *Acta Palaeontologica Polonica* 57: 111-121.
- Means, H. 2002. Introduction to the geology of the Upper Apalachicola River basin. Southeastern Geological Society Field Trip Guidebook 42: 1-15.
- Micheels, A., Bruch, A.A., Eronen, J., Fortelius, M., Harzhauser, M., Utescher, T., Mosbrugger, V. 2010. Analysis of heat transport mechanisms from a Late Miocene model experiment with a fully-coupled atmosphere-ocean general circulation model. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology 304: 337-350.
- Mosbrugger, V., Utescher, T. 1997. The coexistence approach—a method for quantitative reconstructions of Tertiary terrestrial palaeoclimate data using plant fossils. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology 134: 61-86.
- Murray, G.E. 1961. Geology of the Atlantic and Gulf Coastal Province of North America. Harper and Brothers, Publishers, New York, 692 p.
- Ochoa, D., Whitelaw, M., Liu, Y.S., Zavada, M. 2012. Palynology of Neogene sediments at the Gray Fossil Site, Tennessee, USA: Floristic implications. Review of Palaeobotany and Palynology 184: 36-48.
- Otvos, E.G. 1997. Northeastern Gulf Coastal Plain revisited Neogene and Quaternary units and events – old and new concepts. Gulf Coast Association of Geological Societies Annual Meeting, New Orleans. New Orleans Geological Society Guidebook, Louisiana – Northwest Florida Field Trip. New Orleans Geological Society, p. 20-36.
- Otvos, E.G. 1998. Citronelle Formation, Northeastern Gulf Coastal Plain: Pliocene stratigraphic framework and age issues. Gulf Coast Association of Geological Societies Transactions 48.

- Owens, J.P., Minard, J.P. 1979. Upper Cenozoic sediments of the Lower Delaware Valley and the northern Delmarva Peninsula, New Jersey, Pennsylvania, Delaware, and Maryland. U.S. Geological Survey Professional Paper, Report No.: 1067-D: 1-47.
- Palaeoflora database [Internet]. 2014. NECLIME. [cited 2013 Jun 6]. Available from <u>http://palaeoflora.de</u>.
- Parmalee, P., Klippel, W., Meylan, P., Holman, J. 2002. A Late Miocene-Early Pliocene population of Trachemys (Testudines: Emydidae) from East Tennessee. Annals of Carnegie Museum 71: 233-240.
- Pazzaglia, F.J., Robinson, R.A.J., Traverse, A. 1997. Palynology of the Bryn Mawr Formation (Miocene): insights on the age and genesis of Middle Atlantic margin fluvial deposits. Sedimentary Geology 108: 19-44.
- PRISM Climate Group 30-Year Normals database [Internet]. 2014. Oregon State University. [cited 2014 Jan 23]. Available from <u>http://prism.oregonstate.edu</u>.
- Rachele, L.D. 1976. Palynology of the Legler Lignite; A deposit in the Tertiary Cohansey Formation of New Jersey, U.S.A. Review of Palaeobotany and Palynology 22: 225-252.
- Raven, P.H., Axelrod, D.I. 1974. Angiosperm biogeography and past continental movements. Annals of the Missouri Botanical Garden 61: 539-673.
- Raymo, M.E., Grant, B., Horowitz, M., Rau, G.H. 1996. Mid-Pliocene warmth: stronger greenhouse and stronger conveyor. Marine Micropaleontology 27: 313-326.
- Retallack, G.J. 2001. Cenozoic expansion of grasslands and climatic cooling. The Journal of Geology 109: 407-426.
- Retallack, G.J. 2004. Late Miocene climate and life on land in Oregon within a context of Neogene global change. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology 214: 97-123.
- Retallack, G.J. 2005. Pedogenic carbonate proxies of amount and seasonality of precipitation. Geology 33: 333-336.
- Retallack, G.J. 2007. Cenozoic paleoclimate on land in North America. The Journal of Geology 115: 271-294.
- Rich, F.J., Pirkle, F.L., Arenberg, E. 2002. Palynology and paleoecology of strata associated with the Ohoopee River dune field, Emanuel County, Georgia. Palynology 26: 239-256.
- Roy, C.F. 1939. Type locality of Citronelle Formation Citronelle, Alabama. Bulletin of the American Association of Petroleum Geologists 23: 1553-1559.

- Salzmann, U., Haywood, A.M., Lunt, D.J. 2009. The past is a guide to the future? Comparing Middle Pliocene vegetation with predicted biome distributions for the twenty-first century. Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society, A, Physical, Mathematical and Engineering Sciences 367: 189-204.
- Schmidt, W. 1986. Alum Bluff, Liberty County, Florida. In: T.L. Neathery, editor Centennial Field Guide, Southeastern Section of the Geological Society of America 6: 355-357.
- Scott, T.M. 1997. Miocene to Holocene history of Florida. In: Randazzo, A.F., Jones, D.S., editors. The geology of Florida. Gainesville: University Press of Florida. p. 57-67.
- Scott, T.M. 2002. Notes on the Miocene series of the Upper Apalachicola River Valley. Southeastern Geological Society Field Trip Guidebook 42: 16-18.
- Sheldon, N.D., Retallack, G.J., Tanaka, S. 2002. Geochemical climofunctions from North American soils and application to paleosols across the Eocene-Oligocene boundary in Oregon. Journal of Geology 110: 687-696.
- Shunk, A.J., Driese, S.G., Clark, G.M. 2006. Latest Miocene to earliest Pliocene sedimentation and climate record derived from paleosinkhole fill deposits, Gray Fossil Site, northeastern Tennessee, U.S.A. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology 231: 265-278.
- Shunk, A.J., Driese, S.G., Farlow, J.O., Zavada, M.S., Zobaa, M.K. 2009. Late Neogene paleoclimate and paleoenvironment reconstructions from the Pipe Creek Sinkhole, Indiana, USA. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology 274: 173-184.
- Steppuhn, A., Micheels, A., Geiger, G., Mosbrugger, V. 2006. Reconstructing the Late Miocene climate and oceanic heat flux using the AGCM ECHAM4 coupled to a mixed-layer ocean model with adjusted flux correction. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology 238: 399-423.
- Stringfeld, V.T., LaMoreaux, P.E. 1957. Age of Citronelle Formation in Gulf Coastal Plain. Bulletin of the American Association of Petroleum Geologists 41: 742-757.
- Stults, D.Z. 2003. Paleoecological analysis of the Citronelle Formation from the paleoflora of three sites in Alabama [Master's thesis]. [Mobile, (AL)]: University of South Alabama.
- Stults, D.Z., Axsmith, B.J., Haywick, D. 2002. Evidence of *Carpinus* (Betulaceae) in the Late Tertiary (Pliocene) of Alabama. American Journal of Botany 89: 1547-1549.
- Stults, D.Z., Axsmith, B.J. 2009. Betulaceae from the Pliocene and Pleistocene of southwest Alabama, southeastern United States. Review of Palaeobotany and Palynology 155: 25-31.
- Stults, D.Z., Axsmith, B.J., Liu, Y.S. 2010. Evidence of white pine (Pinus subgenus Strobus) dominance from the Pliocene northeastern Gulf of Mexico coastal plain. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology 287: 95-100.

- Stults, D.Z., Axsmith, B.J. 2011a. First macrofossil record of *Begonia* (Begoniaceae). American Journal of Botany 98: 150-153.
- Stults, D.Z., Axsmith, B.J. 2011b. Filling the gaps in the Neogene plant fossil record of eastern North America: New data from the Pliocene of Alabama. Review of Palaeobotany and Palynology 167: 1-9.
- Stults, D.Z., Wagner-Cremer, F., Axsmith, B.J. 2011. Atmospheric paleo-CO₂ estimates based on Taxodium distichum (Cupressaceae) fossils from the Miocene and Pliocene of Eastern North America. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology 309: 327-332.
- Tiffney, B.H. 1985a. Perspectives on the origin of the floristic similarity between eastern Asia and eastern North America. Journal of the Arnold Arboretum 66: 73-94.
- Tiffney, B.H. 1985b. The Eocene North Atlantic land bridge: Its importance in Tertiary and modern phytogeography of the Northern Hemisphere. Journal of the Arnold Arboretum 66: 243-273.
- Tiffney, B.H. 1994. Re-evaluation of the age of the Brandon Lignite (Vermont, USA) based on plant megafossils. Review of Palaeobotany and Palynology 82: 299-315.
- Thompson, R.S., Anderson, K.H., Bartlein, P.J. 1999a. Atlas of relations between climatic parameters and distribution of important trees and shrubs in North America—introduction and conifers. US Geological Survey Professional Paper, Report No.: 1650-A.
- Thompson, R.S., Anderson, K.H., Bartlein, P.J. 1999b. Atlas of relations between climatic parameters and distributions of important trees and shrubs in North America—Hardwoods. US Geological Survey Professional Paper, Report No.: 1650-B.
- Thompson, R.S., Anderson, K.H., Bartlein, P.J. 2001. Atlas of relations between climatic parameter and distribution of important trees and shrubs in North America—additional conifers, hardwoods, and monocots. U.S. Geological Survey Professional Paper, Report No.: 1650-C.
- Traverse, A. 1988. Paleopalynology: Boston, Unwin Hyman; 600 p.
- Traverse, A. 1994. Palynofloral geochronology of the Brandon Lignite of Vermont, USA. Review of Palaeobotany and Palynology 82: 265-297.
- Uhl, D., Mosbrugger, V., Bruch, A., Utescher, T. 2003. Reconstructing palaeotemperatures using leaf floras—case studies for a comparison of leaf margin analysis and the coexistence approach. Review of Palaeobotany and Palynology 126: 49-64.

- Uhl, D., Bruch, A.A., Traiser, C., Klotz, S. 2006. Palaeoclimate estimates for the Middle Miocene Schrotzburg flora (S Germany): a multi-method approach. International Journal of Earth Sciences (Geologische Rundschau) 95: 1071-1085.
- Utescher, T., Bruch, A.A., Micheels, A., Mosbrugger, V., Popova, S. 2011. Cenozoic climate gradients in Eurasia—a paleo perspective on future climate change? Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology 304: 351-358.
- Van Der Burgh, J., Visscher, H., Dilcher, D.L., Kürscher, W.M. 1993. Paleoatmospheric signatures in Neogene fossil leaves. Science 260: 1788-1790.
- Wallace, S.C. Wang, X. 2004. Two new carnivores from an unusual late Tertiary forest biota in eastern North America. Nature 431: 556-559.
- Ward, L.W., Blackwelder, B.W. 1980. Stratigraphic revisions of Upper Miocene and Lower Pliocene beds of Chesapeake Group, middle Atlantic coastal plain. U.S. Geological Survey Bulletin, Report No.: 1482-D.
- Weaver, C.E., Beck, K.C. 1977. Miocene of the S.E. United States: A model for chemical sedimentation in a peri-marine environment. Elsevier, New York; 234 p.
- Whitelaw, J.L., Mickus, K., Whitelaw, M.J., Nave, J. 2008. High-resolution gravity study of the Gray Fossil Site. Geophysics 73: B25-B32.
- Wrenn, J.H., Elsik, W.C., McCulloh, R.P. 2003. Palynologic age determination of the Catahoula Formation, Big Creek, Sicily Island, Louisiana. GCAGS/GCSSEPM Transactions 53: 867-877.
- Xiang, Q.Y., Soltis, D.E., Soltis, P.S., Manchester, S.R., Crawford, D.J. 2000. Timing the eastern Asian-eastern North American floristic disjunction: molecular clock corroborates paleontological estimates. Molecular Phylogenetics and Evolution 15: 462-472.
- Zachos, J., Pagani, M., Sloan, L., Thomas, E., Billups, K. 2001. Trends, rhythms, and aberrations in global climate 65 Ma to present. Science 292: 686-693.
- Zachos, J.C., Dickens, G.R., Zeebe, R.E. 2008. An early Cenozoic perspective on greenhouse warming and carbon-cycle dynamics. Nature 451: 279-283.
- Zobaa, M.K., Zavada, M.S., Whitelaw, M.J., Shunk, A.J., Oboh-Ikuenobe, F.E. 2011. Palynology and palynofacies analyses of the Gray Fossil Site, eastern Tennessee: Their role in understanding the basin-fill history. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology 308: 433-444.

APPENDICES

Appendix A

				~		
Alum Bl	uff Raw	Results	and	Climate	Intervals	

Organ	Fossil Taxon	NLR	MAT	CMMT	WMMT	MAP	•	MMaP	MMiP	WMMP
Pollen	Ranunculacidites	Alchorea sp.	16.8 - 27.7	3.8 - 27	21.9 - 28.9	629	3151	128 - 389	4 - 165	43 - 221
	Alnipollenites	Alnus sp.	-13.3 - 27.4	-40.9 - 25.6	12 - 38.6	41	2559	8 - 353	0 - 135	8 - 207
	Carya	Carya sp.	4.4 - 26.6	-11.5 - 22.2	19.3 - 30.6	373	1724	68 - 434	8 - 93	45 - 258
	Magnastriatites	Ceratopteris sp.	20.4 - 27.7	13.3 - 27	25 - 29.4	517	3151	146 - 566	1 - 165	29 - 227
	Cyathea	Cyathea sp.	10.2 - 27.7	5.2 - 27	14.6 - 28.1	666	3151	134 - 454	12 - 165	93 - 224
	Diospyros	Diospyros sp.	6.9 - 27.1	-12.8 - 23.5	18.3 - 29.5	376	2348	92 - 295	1 - 83	58 - 185
	Dryopteris	Dryopteris sp.	3.1 - 27.7	-9.5 - 27	17.8 - 29.5	777	3151	92 - 322	29 - 165	92 - 312
	Momipites	Engelhardia sp.	13.8 - 27	3.1 - 25	22.1 - 33.6	823	3172	204 - 518	5 - 152	79 - 431
	Ephedripites	Ephedra sp.	3.1 - 28.8	-12 - 25	16.4 - 32.9	33	932	5 - 178	0 - 45	2 - 61
	Gleditsia	Gleditsia sp.	5.7 - 21.7	-8.1 - 14.8	14.5 - 28.9	644	2559	90 - 363	1 - 154	72 - 269
	Ilex	Ilex sp.	-0.4 - 27.7	-12.9 - 27	10.4 - 33.6	641	3151	98 - 389	2 - 165	4 - 431
	Juglanspollenites	Juglans sp.	0 - 27.5	-22.7 - 25	9.5 - 31.2	210	2617	28 - 582	1 - 114	2 - 189
	Liquidambar	Liquidambar sp.	11.5 - 24.6	-1 - 23.8	23 - 29.3	619	1823	109 - 340	2 - 72	5 - 195
	Lygodiumsporites	Lygodium sp.	9.3-27.1	-2.8 - 25.6	21.6 - 29.8	1122	2845	115 - 349	19 - 157	68 - 217
	Myrica	Myrica sp.	-8.9 - 28.1	-29 - 27	8.9 - 33.9	233	3151	34 - 508	0 - 165	0 - 221
	Nyssapollenites	Nyssa sp.	-1.1 - 23.9	-25.8 - 19.4	18.9 - 27.9	305	2645	73 - 340	0 - 122	55 - 246
	Paliurus	Paliurus sp.	10 - 23.1	-7.3 - 17	25 - 28.8	396	1958	108 - 448	4 - 70	108 - 431
	Nijssenosporites	Pityrogramma sp.	11.3 - 27.7	8.6 - 27	13.7 - 28.1	264	3151	55 - 389	0 - 165	2 - 221
	Pinus	Pinus sp.	-9.2 - 25.5	-36.8 - 21.4	7.1 - 32.9	180	1741	28 - 293	0 - 94	0 - 304
	Podocarpidites	Podocarpus sp.	4.9 - 27.7	-0.6 - 27	10.6 - 28.8	652	3401	68 - 448	16 - 165	26 - 431
	Pteris	Pteris sp.	2 - 27.7	-12.8 - 27	13.5 - 28.2	705	3151	84 - 454	6 - 165	82 - 269
	Quercus	Quercus sp.	-1.4 - 27	-25.1 - 25.9	8.4 - 28.3	201	3905	33 - 610	0 - 180	5 - 180
	Sabalites	Sabal sp.	16.5 - 26.4	4.8 - 25.2	26 - 27.9	629	1840	134 - 241	4 - 72	43 - 227
	Sequoiapollenites	Sequoia sp.	9.1 - 25	-2.7 - 19.8	13.7 - 31.2	222	1613	60 - 245	0 - 93	3 - 227
	Taxodium	Taxodium sp.	13.3 - 25	-0.1 - 19.8	18.9 - 31.2	290	2615	60 - 265	0 - 93	19 - 227
	Ulmus	Ulmus sp.	-4.9 - 26.6	-25.8 - 26.1	16 - 29.4	201	3285	33 - 569	0 - 75	0 - 239
	Vitis	Vitis sp.	0 - 27.4	-22.7 - 25.6	17.2 - 31.2	210	1562	44 - 264	0 - 94	2 - 176





Range of Cold Month Mean Temperature





Range of Mean Annual Precipitation





Range of Monthly Minimum Precipitation



Appendix B

Organ	Fossil Taxon	NLR	MAT	CMMT	WMMT	MAP	MMaP	MMiP	WMMP
Pollen	Abies	Abies sp.	-6.7 - 27.4	-26 - 25.6	7.1 - 29.5	373 - 2648	57 - 369	0 - 135	0 - 344
	Acacia	Acacia sp.	7.6 - 27.7	-0.1 - 27	14.3 - 29	180 - 3151	30 - 389	4 - 165	7 - 304
	Acer	Acer sp.	-0.4 - 24	-24.2 - 20.6	12.9 - 29.3	115 - 2559	19 - 370	1 - 135	1 - 366
	Carya	Carya sp.	4.4 - 26.6	-11.5 - 22.2	19.3 - 30.6	373 - 1724	68 - 434	8 - 93	45 - 258
	Clethra	Clethra sp.	7.4 - 27.7	-3.6 - 27	18.8 - 28.8	803 - 3151	113 - 389	1 - 165	94 - 229
	Ephedra	Ephedra sp.	3.1 - 28.8	-12 - 25	16.4 - 32.9	33 - 932	5 - 178	0 - 45	2 - 61
	Ilex	Ilex sp.	-0.4 - 27.7	-12.9 - 27	10.4 - 33.6	641 - 3151	98 - 389	2 - 165	4 - 431
	Juglans	Juglans sp.	0 - 27.5	-22.7 - 25	9.5 - 31.2	210 - 2617	28 - 582	1 - 114	2 - 189
	Liquidambar	Liquidambar sp.	11.5 - 24.6	-1 - 23.8	23 - 29.3	619 - 1823	109 - 340	2 - 72	5 - 195
	Momipites	Engelhardia sp.	13.8 - 27	3.1 - 25	22.1 - 33.6	823 - 3172	204 - 518	5 - 152	79 - 431
	Myrica	Myrica sp.	-8.9 - 28.1	-29 - 27	8.9 - 33.9	233 - 3151	34 - 508	0 - 165	0 - 221
	Pinus	Pinus sp.	-9.2 - 25.5	-36.8 - 21.4	7.1 - 32.9	180 - 1741	28 - 293	0 - 94	0 - 304
	Pterocarya	Pterocarya sp.	3.9 - 24.2	-12.8 - 17	15.3 - 31.6	246 - 2648	46 - 424	1 - 64	2 - 424
	Quercus	Quercus sp.	-1.4 - 27	-25.1 - 25.9	8.4 - 28.3	201 - 3905	33 - 610	0 - 180	5 - 180
	Salix	Salix sp.	-17 - 27.7	-50.1 - 26.5	7.6 - 32.9	122 - 2399	22 - 448	0 - 108	0 - 252
	Sequoiapollenites	Sequoia sp.	9.1 - 25	-2.7 - 19.8	13.7 - 31.2	222 - 1613	60 - 245	0 - 93	3 - 227
	Taxodium distichum	Taxodium sp	13.3 - 25	-0.1 - 19.8	18.9 - 31.2	290 - 2615	60 - 265	0 - 93	19 - 227
	Tiliapollenites	Tilia sp.	2.5 - 20.8	-17.7 - 13.3	15 - 28.1	373 - 1958	68 - 454	9 - 83	45 - 258
	Tsuga	Tsuga sp.	-1.8 - 21.9	-15.6 - 15.6	11 - 29.5	285 - 2648	48 - 350	0 - 108	0 - 344
	Cyrilla	Cyrilla sp.	13.6 - 23.9	4.3 - 19.4	23.6 - 27.9	961 - 1520	109 - 196	42 - 56	99 - 196
	Magnastriatites	Ceratopteris sp.	20.4 - 27.7	13.3 - 27	25 - 29.4	517 - 3151	146 - 566	1 - 165	29 - 227
	Lygodiumsporites	Lygodium sp.	9.3 - 27.1	-2.8 - 25.6	21.6 - 29.8	1122 - 2845	115 - 349	19 - 157	68 - 217

Big Creek on Sicily Island Raw Results and Climate Intervals





Range of Cold Month Mean Temperature

curest Eiving Relati





Range of Mean Annual Precipitation





Range of Monthly Minimum Precipitation

Nearest Living Relative



Appendix C

Organ	Fossil Taxon	NLR	MAT	CMMT	WMMT	MAP	MMaP	MMiP	WMMP
Fruit	Alangium	Alangium sp.	8.5 - 27.7	-7.3 - 27	16.4 - 28.5	338 - 3151	92 - 389	1 - 165	66 - 221
	Caldesia	Caldesia sp.	3.3 - 25.9	-20.1 - 17	17.1 - 31.45	566 - 1812	78 - 448	2 - 43	78 - 431
	Carya	Carya sp.	4.4 - 26.6	-11.5 - 22.2	19.3 - 30.6	373 - 1724	68 - 434	8 - 93	45 - 258
	Gordonia	Gordonia sp.	14.4 - 25.5	0.9 - 21.4	20.2 - 29.4	810 - 2100	106 - 304	3 - 74	62 - 304
	Illicium	Illicium sp.	-0.4 - 27.7	-12.9 -27	10.4 - 33.6	641 - 3151	98 - 389	2 - 165	4 - 431
	*Melliodendron	Melliodendron sp.	15.7 - 21.9	5.5 - 13.6	20.2 - 29.5	1096 - 1864	220 - 304	3 - 55	111 - 304
	Nyssa	Nyssa sp.	-1.1 - 23.9	-25.8 - 19.4	18.9 - 27.9	305 - 2645	73 - 340	0 - 122	55 - 246
	Quercus	Quercus sp.	-1.4 - 27	-25.1 - 25.9	8.4 - 28.3	201 - 3905	33 - 610	0 - 180	5 - 180
	Symplocos	Symplocos sp.	13.6 - 27.7	1.8 - 27	23.6 - 32.2	505 - 3151	109 - 436	3 - 208	43 - 208
Seed	Cleyera	Cleyera sp.	14.7 - 26.6	3.7 - 26.1	20.4 - 28.9	803 - 3285	161 - 569	1 - 53	105 - 227
	Ilex	Ilex sp.	-0.4 - 27.7	-12.9 - 27	10.4 - 33.6	641 - 3151	98 - 389	2 - 165	4 - 431
	Magnolia	Magnolia sp.	4.1 - 27	-10.2 - 25.9	17.1 -28.6	578 - 3500	102 - 610	1 - 180	70 - 462
	*Microdiptera	**Decodon sp.	3.4 - 21.3	-12.9 - 13.3	18.9 - 28.6	592 - 1613	103 - 195	22 - 93	58 - 195
	Parthenocissus	Parthenocissus sp.	4.4 - 22.2	-12.8 - 13.6	13.9 - 28.5	385 - 1551	86 - 225	3 - 89	26 - 217
	Phellodendron	Phellodendron sp.	0 - 23.1	-24.2 - 17	17.8 - 28.8	534 - 1812	98 - 448	3 - 59	92 - 431
	Rubus	Rubus sp.	-12 - 21.7	-38.8 - 15.2	15.3 - 28.2	254 - 2100	34 - 322	4 - 71	5 - 269
	Vitis	Vitis sp.	0 - 27.4	-22.7 - 25.6	17.2 - 31.2	210 - 1562	44 - 264	0 - 94	2 - 176
	Zanthoxylum	Zanthoxylum sp.	3.4 - 27.8	-12.9 - 26.4	18.9 - 28.9	735 - 1882	83 - 366	5 - 59	78 - 366
Wood	*Cyrilla	Cyrilla sp.	13.6 - 23.9	4.3 - 19.4	23.6 - 27.9	961 - 1520	109 - 196	42 - 56	99 - 196
	Persea	Persea sp.	14.4 - 23.9	3.7 - 19.4	22 - 28.9	223 - 1613	53 - 241	5 - 93	2 - 196
Pollen	*Momipites spackmanianus	**Engelhardia sp.	13.8 - 27	3.1 - 25	22.1 - 33.6	823 - 3172	204 - 518	5 - 152	79 - 431
	Pterocaryapollenites vermontensis	**Pterocarya sp.	3.9 - 24.2	-12.8 - 17	15.3 - 31.6	246 - 2648	46 - 424	1 - 64	2 - 424
	Juglanspollenites hornianus	**Juglans sp.	0 - 27.5	-22.7 - 25	9.5 - 31.2	210 - 2617	28 - 582	1 - 114	2 - 189
	Iteapollis angustiporatus	**Itea sp.	7.7 - 27.7	-0.1 -29.4	21.7 - 29.4	102 - 3151	49 - 389	25 - 165	13.5 - 221
	Faguspollenites parvifossilis	**Fagus sp.	4.4 - 23.1	-11.5 - 17	17.3 - 28.5	376 - 2648	46 - 448	5 - 94	5 - 431
	Liquidambarpollenites brandonensis	**Liquidambar sp.	11.5 - 24.6	-1 - 23.8	23 - 29.3	619 - 1823	109 - 340	2 - 72	5 - 195
	*Rhuspollenites carbogenus	**Rhus sp.	3.4 - 24.9	-12.9 - 22.2	18.9 - 29.4	735 - 1613	73 - 195	18 - 93	49 - 195

Brandon Lignite Raw Results and Climate Intervals

* Taxon is outlier in at least one climate interval** Nearest Living Relative different genus than Fossil Taxon





Range of Cold Month Mean Temperature




Range of Mean Annual Precipitation





Range of Monthly Minimum Precipitation



Appendix D

Brandywine Raw Results and Climate Intervals

Organ	Fossil Taxon	NLR	MAT	CMMT	WMMT	MAP	MMaP	MMiP	WMMP
Leaf	Potamogeton	Potamogeton sp.	-15 - 23.5	-41.4 - 23	10.2 - 28.2	114 - 2648	15 - 448	0 - 157	0 - 431
	Taxodium	Taxodium sp.	13.3 - 25	-0.1 - 19.8	18.9 - 31.2	290 - 2615	60 - 265	0 - 93	19 - 227
	Nyssa	Nyssa sp.	-1.1 - 23.9	-25.8 - 19.4	18.9 - 27.9	305 - 2645	73 - 340	0 - 122	55 - 246
	Vitis	Vitis sp.	0 - 27.4	-22.7 - 25.6	17.2 - 31.2	210 - 1562	44 - 264	0 - 94	2 - 176
	Smilax	Smilax sp.	-1.1 - 27.7	-25.8 - 27	15.1 - 33.1	37 - 3151	8 - 389	0 - 165	0 - 221
	Salix	Salix sp.	-17 - 27.7	-50.1 - 26.5	7.6 - 32.9	122 - 2399	22 - 448	0 - 108	0 - 252
	Populus balsamifera/ P. heterophylla	Populus sp.	-16 - 26	-49 - 13.6	9.8 - 35.6	25 - 2559	8 - 358	0 - 93	0 - 224
	Ilex cornuta	Ilex sp.	-0.4 - 27.7	-12.9 - 27	10.4 - 33.6	641 - 3151	98 - 389	2 - 165	4 - 431
	Platanus occidentalis	Platanus sp.	6.6 - 27.4	-10.9 - 25.6	13.7 - 29.5	399 - 2540	71 - 566	0 - 83	0 - 196
	Toxicodendron radicans	Toxicodendron sp.	3.4 - 24.9	-12.9 - 22.2	18.9 - 29.4	735 - 1613	73 - 195	18 - 93	49 - 195
	Quercus	Quercus sp.	-1.4 - 27	-25.1 - 25.9	8.4 - 28.3	201 - 3905	33 - 610	0 - 180	5 - 180
	Alangium	Alangium sp.	8.5 - 27.7	-7.3 - 27	16.4 - 28.5	338 - 3151	92 - 389	1 - 165	66 - 221
	Carya	Carya sp.	4.4 - 26.6	-11.5 - 22.2	19.3 - 30.6	373 - 1724	68 - 434	8 - 93	45 - 258
	Pterocarya	Pterocarya sp.	3.9 - 24.2	-12.8 - 17	15.3 - 31.6	246 - 2648	46 - 424	1 - 64	2 - 424
	Gleditsia triacanthos	Gleditsia sp.	5.7 - 21.7	-8.1 - 14.8	14.5 - 28.9	644 - 2559	90 - 363	1 - 154	72 - 269
	Sophora	Sophora sp.	8.2 - 27.1	-5.6 - 26.1	13.7 - 29.8	373 - 3285	74 - 569	3 - 56	3 - 312
	Ulmus	Ulmus sp.	-4.9 - 26.6	-25.8 - 26.1	16 - 29.4	201 - 3285	33 - 569	0 - 75	0 - 239
Fruit/Seed	Trapa	Trapa sp.	-1.1 - 27.7	-25.8 - 27	19.6 - 28.3	177 - 3151	27 - 389	2 - 165	27 - 221
	Mneme	**Decodon sp.	3.4 - 21.3	-12.9 - 13.3	18.9 - 28.6	592 - 1613	103 - 195	22 - 93	58 - 195
	Hamamelis	Hamamelis sp.	6.6 - 18.3	-10.9 - 10.2	18.8 - 29.5	631 - 1864	74 - 295	18 - 94	74 - 196
	Parthenocissus	Parthenocissus sp.	4.4 - 22.2	-12.8 - 13.6	13.9 - 28.5	385 - 1551	86 - 225	3 - 89	26 - 217
	Acer	Acer sp.	-0.4 - 24	-24.2 - 20.6	12.9 - 29.3	115 - 2559	19 - 370	1 - 135	1 - 366
	Cornus	Cornus sp.	-12 - 23.1	-38.8 - 17	14.6 - 28.5	254 - 1958	52 - 448	0 - 93	0 - 431
	Sambucus	Sambucus sp.	-9.2 - 27.7	-38.2 - 27	12.2 - 28.1	226 - 3151	43 - 448	0 - 165	15 - 431
Pollen	Nuphar	Nuphar sp.	-12 - 24.3	-38.8 - 19.2	9.8 - 28.2	115 - 1958	19 - 281	4 - 83	11 - 177
	Liquidambar	Liquidambar sp.	11.5 - 24.6	-1 - 23.8	23 - 29.3	619 - 1823	109 - 340	2 - 72	5 - 195
	Alnus	Alnus sp.	-13.3 - 27.4	-40.9 - 25.6	12 - 38.6	41 - 2559	8 - 353	0 - 135	8 - 207
	Betula	Betula sp.	-15 - 25.8	-41 - 21.1	1.3 - 28.7	110 - 2559	23 - 353	0 - 135	2 - 312
	Euonymus	Euonymus sp.	2.5 - 27.7	-17.7 - 27	17.8 - 29.5	517 - 3151	81 - 398	0 - 165	10 - 221
	Fagus	Fagus sp.	4.4 - 23.1	-11.5 - 17	17.3 - 28.5	376 - 2648	46 - 448	5 - 94	5 - 431
	Liriodendron	Liriodendron sp.	8.7 - 21.3	-3.9 - 13.3	21.9 - 28.4	776 - 1967	75 - 370	32 - 93	74 - 236
	Juglans	Juglans sp.	0 - 27.5	-22.7 - 25	9.5 - 31.2	210 - 2617	28 - 582	1 - 114	2 - 189

Zelkova-type	Zelkova sp.	7.3 - 21.9	-12.8 - 13.6	19.4 - 29.7	246 - 2648	46 - 369	3 - 59	3 - 344
Pinus	Pinus sp.	-9.2 - 25.5	-36.8 - 21.4	7.1 - 32.9	180 - 1741	28 - 293	0 - 94	0 - 304
Larix	Larix sp.	-15 - 16.1	-41.4 - 7.8	5.4 - 25.6	122 - 2500	34 - 500	1 - 83	5 - 228

** Nearest Living Relative different genus than Fossil Taxon









Range of Mean Annual Precipitation





Range of Monthly Minimum Precipitation

Nearest Living Relative



Appendix E

Organ	Fossil Taxon	NLR	MAT	CMMT	WMMT	MAP	MMaP	MMiP	WMMP
Pollen	Abies	Abies sp.	-6.7 - 27.4	-26 - 25.6	7.1 - 29.5	373 - 2648	57 - 369	0 - 135	0 - 344
	Acer	Acer sp.	-0.4 - 24	-24.2 - 20.6	12.9 - 29.3	115 - 2559	19 - 370	1 - 135	1 - 366
	Alangium	Alangium sp.	8.5 - 27.7	-7.3 - 27	16.4 - 28.5	338 - 3151	92 - 389	1 - 165	66 - 221
	Alnus	Alnus sp.	-13.3 - 27.4	-40.9 - 25.6	12 - 38.6	41 - 2559	8 - 353	0 - 135	8 - 207
	Betula	Betula sp.	-15 - 25.8	-41 - 21.1	1.3 - 28.7	110 - 2559	23 - 353	0 - 135	2 - 312
	Carya	Carya sp.	4.4 - 26.6	-11.5 - 22.2	19.3 - 30.6	373 - 1724	68 - 434	8 - 93	45 - 258
	Castanea?	Castanea sp.	8.7 - 24.2	-3.9 - 16.7	21.6 - 29.4	473 - 1857	70 - 424	3 - 88	3 - 239
	Engelhardia-type	Engelhardia sp	13.8 - 27	3.1 - 25	22.1 - 33.6	823 - 3172	204 - 518	5 - 152	79 - 431
	Fagus	Fagus sp.	4.4 - 23.1	-11.5 - 17	17.3 - 28.5	376 - 2648	46 - 448	5 - 94	5 - 431
	Ilex	Ilex sp.	-0.4 - 27.7	-12.9 - 27	10.4 - 33.6	641 - 3151	98 - 389	2 - 165	4 - 431
	Juglans	Juglans sp.	0 - 27.5	-22.7 - 25	9.5 - 31.2	210 - 2617	28 - 582	1 - 114	2 - 189
	Liquidambar	Liquidambar sp.	11.5 - 24.6	-1 - 23.8	23 - 29.3	619 - 1823	109 - 340	2 - 72	5 - 195
	Myrica	Myrica sp.	-8.9 - 28.1	-29 - 27	8.9 - 33.9	233 - 3151	34 - 508	0 - 165	0 - 221
	Nyssa	Nyssa sp.	-1.1 - 23.9	-25.8 - 19.4	18.9 - 27.9	305 - 2645	73 - 340	0 - 122	55 - 246
	Picea	Picea sp.	-8.9 - 21.7	-28.6 - 15.6	7.3 - 31.6	142 - 6000	36 - 700	2 - 400	2 - 400
	Pinus	Pinus sp.	-9.2 - 25.5	-36.8 - 21.4	7.1 - 32.9	180 - 1741	28 - 293	0 - 94	0 - 304
	Pterocarya-type	Pterocarya sp.	3.9 - 24.2	-12.8 - 17	15.3 - 31.6	246 - 2648	46 - 424	1 - 64	2 - 424
	Quercus	Quercus sp.	-1.4 - 27	-25.1 - 25.9	8.4 - 28.3	201 - 3905	33 - 610	0 - 180	5 - 180
	Salix	Salix sp.	-17 - 27.7	-50.1 - 26.5	7.6 - 32.9	122 - 2399	22 - 448	0 - 108	0 - 252
	Sequoia	Sequoia sp.	9.1 - 25	-2.7 - 19.8	13.7 - 31.2	222 - 1613	60 - 245	0 - 93	3 - 227
	Symplocos	Symplocos sp.	13.6 - 27.7	1.8 - 27	23.6 - 32.2	505 - 3151	109 - 436	3 - 208	43 - 208
	Tilia	Tilia sp.	2.5 - 20.8	-17.7 - 13.3	15 - 28.1	373 - 1958	68 - 454	9 - 83	45 - 258
	Tsuga	Tsuga sp.	-1.8 - 21.9	-15.6 - 15.6	11 - 29.5	285 - 2648	48 - 350	0 - 108	0 - 344
	Ulmus	Ulmus sp.	-4.9 - 26.6	-25.8 - 26.1	16 - 29.4	201 - 3285	33 - 569	0 - 75	0 - 239
	Zelkova-type	Zelkova sp.	7.3 - 21.9	-12.8 - 13.6	19.4 - 29.7	246 - 2648	46 - 369	3 - 59	3 - 344

Bryn Mawr Raw Results and Climate Intervals





Range of Cold Month Mean Temperature













Appendix F

Citronelle Raw	^r Results	s and	Climate	Interval	ls
----------------	----------------------	-------	---------	----------	----

Organ	Fossil Taxon	NLR	MAT	CMMT	WMMT	MAP	MMaP	MMiP	WMMP
Pollen	Pinus strobus	Pinus sp.	-9.2 - 25.5	-36.8 - 21.4	7.1 - 32.9	180 - 1741	28 - 293	0 - 94	0 - 304
	Betula nigra	Betula sp.	-15 - 25.8	-41 - 21.1	1.3 - 28.7	110 - 2559	23 - 353	0 - 135	2 - 312
	Liquidambar styraciflua	Liquidambar sp.	11.5 - 24.6	-1 - 23.8	23 - 29.3	619 - 1823	109 - 340	2 - 72	5 - 195
Leaf	Carpinus caroliniana	Carpinus sp.	0 - 25.8	-22.7 - 21.1	16.8 - 28.7	164 - 2648	20 - 350	2 - 55	2 - 344
	Cornus sp.	Cornus sp.	-12 - 23.1	-38.8 - 17	14.6 - 28.5	254 - 1958	52 - 448	0 - 93	0 - 431
	Nyssa aquatica	Nyssa sp.	-1.1 - 23.9	-25.8 - 19.4	18.9 - 27.9	305 - 2645	73 - 340	0 - 122	55 - 246
	Cyrilla racemiflora	Cyrilla sp.	13.6 - 23.9	4.3 - 19.4	23.6 - 27.9	961 - 1520	109 - 196	42 - 56	99 - 196
	Cocculus carolinus	Cocculus sp.	13.4 - 25.4	-0.7 - 24.3	25.7 - 32.9	184 - 2869	22 - 329	2 - 160	20 - 261
	Populus deltoides	Populus sp.	-16 - 26	-49 - 13.6	9.8 - 35.6	25 - 2559	8 - 358	0 - 93	0 - 224
	Gordonia sp.	Gordonia sp.	14.4 - 25.5	0.9 - 21.4	20.2 - 29.4	810 - 2100	106 - 304	3 - 74	62 - 304
	Vitis rotundifolia	Vitis sp.	0 - 27.4	-22.7 - 25.6	17.2 - 31.2	210 - 1562	44 - 264	0 - 94	2 - 176
	Taxodium distichum	Taxodium sp.	13.3 - 25	-0.1 - 19.8	18.9 - 31.2	290 - 2615	60 - 265	0 - 93	19 - 227
	Smilax walteri	Smilax sp.	-1.1 - 27.7	-25.8 - 27	15.1 - 33.1	37 - 3151	8 - 389	0 - 165	0 - 221
	Acer saccharinum	Acer sp.	-0.4 - 24	-24.2 - 20.6	12.9 - 29.3	115 - 2559	19 - 370	1 - 135	1 - 366
	A. negundo								
	A. rubrum	*1		10.0.05	10 1 00 1				
	Ilex decidua	Ilex sp.	-0.4 - 27.7	-12.9 - 27	10.4 - 33.6	641 - 3151	98 - 389	2 - 165	4 - 431
	Ostrya virginiana	Ostrya sp.	2.5 - 21.9	-17.7 - 19.3	20.2 - 28.1	279 - 1355	74 - 237	0 - 43	0 - 228
	Gaylussacia frondosa	Gaylussacia sp.	12.5 - 22.7	0.7 - 20.2	21.5 - 28.1	671 - 1355	113 - 195	2 - 74	94 - 195
	Vaccinium arboretum V. corymbosum	Vaccinium sp.	-12.4 - 20.8	-27.9 - 13.3	3.9 - 29.2	110 - 1958	23 - 386	1 - 83	20 - 248
	Gleditsia triacanthos	Gleditsia sp.	5.7 - 21.7	-8.1 - 14.8	14.5 - 28.9	644 - 2559	90 - 363	1 - 154	72 - 269
	Castanea pumila C. dentata	Castanea sp.	8.7 - 24.2	-3.9 - 16.7	21.6 - 29.4	473 - 1857	70 - 424	3 - 88	3 - 239
	Quercus falcata Q. laevis Q. laurifolia Q. nuttallii Q. viara	Quercus sp.	-1.4 - 27	-25.1 - 25.9	8.4 - 28.3	201 - 3905	33 - 610	0 - 180	5 - 180
	Q. nigra Q. virginiana Carya aquatica C. glabra C. pallida C. tomentosa	Carya sp.	4.4 - 26.6	-11.5 - 22.2	19.3 - 30.6	373 - 1724	68 - 434	8 - 93	45 - 258

	Persea palustris	Persea sp.	14.4 - 23.9	3.7 - 19.4	22 - 28.9	233 - 1613	53 - 241	5 - 93	2 - 196
	Fraxinus caroliniana	Fraxinus sp.	0 - 24	-25.8 - 16.7	14.9 - 33.9	148 - 1844	28 - 358	2 - 95	0 - 239
	Amelanchier arborea	Amelanchier sp.	-8.9 - 27.4	-29 - 25.6	13.8 - 29.5	201 - 2399	33 - 336	0 - 108	33 - 196
	Crataegus spathulata	Crataegus sp.	5.4 - 21.4	-12.8 - 13.9	17.3 - 28.9	385 - 1355	53 - 195	2 - 61	2 - 195
	Rubus argutus	Rubus sp.	-12 - 21.7	-38.8 - 15.2	15.3 - 28.2	254 - 2100	34 - 322	4 - 71	5 - 269
	Salix floridana	Salix sp.	-17 - 27.7	-50.1 - 26.5	7.6 - 32.9	122 - 2399	22 - 448	0 - 108	0 - 252
	Bumelia sp.	Bumelia sp.	12.9 - 26.6	-0.7 - 26.1	23.6 - 29.4	867 - 3285	106 - 569	32 - 93	49 - 163
	Ulmus alata	Ulmus sp.	-4.9 - 26.6	-25.8 - 26.1	16 - 29.4	201 - 3285	33 - 569	0 - 75	0 - 239
	Diospyros virginiana	Diospyros sp.	6.9 - 27.1	-12.8 - 23.5	18.3 - 29.5	376 - 2348	92 - 295	1 - 83	58 - 185
	Liriodendron tulipifera	Liriodendron sp.	8.7 - 21.3	-3.9 - 13.3	21.9 - 28.4	776 - 1967	74 - 370	32 - 93	74 - 236
	Morus rubra	Morus sp.	3.1 - 21.9	-11.8 - 13.6	15.6 - 28.9	305 - 1722	82 - 292	0 - 83	82 - 264
	Platanus occidentalis	Platanus sp.	6.6 - 27.4	-10.9 - 25.6	13.7 - 29.5	399 - 2540	71 - 566	0 - 83	0 - 196
Shoots	Juniperus virginiana	Juniperus sp.	-15.6 - 24.9	-48.9 - 22.2	12 - 29	155 - 1958	33 - 303	0 - 83	0 - 258





Range of Cold Month Mean Temperature





Range of Mean Annual Precipitation







Range of Monthly Maximum Precipitation



Range of Warm Month Mean Precipitation

Appendix G

Gray Fossil Site Raw Results and Climate Intervals
--

Organ	Fossil Taxon	NLR	MAT	CMMT	WMMT	MAP	MMaP	MMiP	WMMP
Seed	Vitis grayensis/	Vitis sp.	0 - 27.4	-22.7 - 25.6	17.2 - 31.2	210 - 1562	44 - 264	0 - 94	2 - 176
	Vitis lanatoides/								
	Vitis latisculcata								
Pollen	Abies	Abies sp.	-6.7 - 27.4	-26 - 25.6	7.1 - 29.5	373 - 2648	57 - 369	0 - 135	0 - 344
	Acer	Acer sp.	-0.4 - 24	-24.2 - 20.6	12.9 - 29.3	115 - 2559	19 - 370	1 - 135	1 - 366
	Alnus	Alnus sp.	-13.3 - 27.4	-40.9 - 25.6	12 - 38.6	41 - 2559	8 - 353	0 - 135	8 - 207
	Betula	Betula sp.	-15 - 25.8	-41 - 21.1	1.3 - 28.7	110 - 2559	23 - 353	0 - 135	2 - 312
	Carya	Carya sp.	4.4 - 26.6	-11.5 - 22.2	19.3 - 30.6	373 - 1724	68 - 434	8 - 93	45 - 258
	Castanea	Castanea sp.	8.7 - 24.2	-3.9 - 16.7	21.6 - 29.4	473 - 1857	70 - 424	3 - 88	3 - 239
	*Celtis	Celtis sp.	2.5 - 25.8	-17.7 - 23	18.7 - 28.8	116 - 2730	25 - 597	0 - 24	2 - 533
	Corylus	Corylus sp.	-4.9 - 24	-32.4 - 16.7	12.9 - 29.4	389 - 1682	45 - 343	3 - 73	3 - 239
	Croton type	Croton sp.	9.3 - 27.7	-2.8 - 27	18.7 - 32.9	184 - 3151	28 - 389	2 - 165	2 - 221
	<i>Cyrilla</i> type	Cyrilla sp.	13.6 - 23.9	4.3 - 19.4	23.6 - 27.9	961 - 1520	109 - 196	42 - 56	99 - 196
	Elaeagnus	Elaeagnus sp.	-0.4 - 27.7	-24.2 - 27	18.2 - 28.5	84 - 3151	28 - 389	2 - 165	13 - 221
	Fagus	Fagus sp.	4.4 - 23.1	-11.5 - 17	17.3 - 28.5	376 - 2648	46 - 448	5 - 94	5 - 431
	Fraxinus	Fraxinus sp.	0 - 24	-25.8 - 16.7	14.9 - 33.9	148 - 1844	28 - 358	2 - 95	0 - 239
	Ilex vomitaria	Ilex sp.	-0.4 - 27.7	-12.9 - 27	10.4 - 33.6	641 - 3151	98 - 389	2 - 165	4 - 431
	*Linum	Linum sp.	4.6 - 20.5	-7.9 - 17.8	14.2 - 28.4	233 - 1167	53 - 151	0 - 62	0 - 79
	Liquidambar styraciflua	Liquidambar sp.	11.5 - 24.6	-1 - 23.8	23 - 29.3	619 - 1823	109 - 340	2 - 72	5 - 195
	Myrica	Myrica sp.	-8.9 - 28.1	-29 - 27	8.9 - 33.9	233 - 3151	34 - 508	0 - 165	0 - 221
	Nyssa	Nyssa sp.	-1.1 - 23.9	-25.8 - 19.4	18.9 - 27.9	305 - 2645	73 - 340	0 - 122	55 - 246
	Picea	Picea sp.	-8.9 - 21.7	-28.6 - 15.6	7.3 - 31.6	142 - 6000	36 - 700	2 - 400	2 - 400
	Pinus	Pinus sp.	-9.2 - 25.5	-36.8 - 21.4	7.1 - 32.9	180 - 1741	28 - 293	0 - 94	0 - 304
	Pterocarya	Pterocarya sp.	3.9 - 24.2	-12.8 - 17	15.3 - 31.6	246 - 2648	46 - 424	1 - 64	2 - 424
	Quercus	Quercus sp.	-1.4 - 27	-25.1 - 25.9	8.4 - 28.3	201 - 3905	33 - 610	0 - 180	5 - 180
	Rhus	Rhus sp.	3.4 - 24.9	-12.9 - 22.2	18.9 - 29.4	735 - 1613	73 - 195	18 - 93	49 - 195
	Salix	Salix sp.	-17 - 27.7	-50.1 - 26.5	7.6 - 32.9	122 - 2399	22 - 448	0 - 108	0 - 252
	Taxodium	Taxodium sp.	13.3 - 25	-0.1 - 19.8	18.9 - 31.2	290 - 2615	60 - 265	0 - 93	19 - 227
	Tilia	Tilia sp.	2.5 - 20.8	-17.7 - 13.3	15 - 28.1	373 - 1958	68 - 454	9 - 83	45 - 258
	Tsuga canadensis	Tsuga sp.	-1.8 - 21.9	-15.6 - 15.6	11 - 29.5	285 - 2648	48 - 350	0 - 108	0 - 344
	Taxus	Taxus sp.	5.9 - 18.5	-4.7 - 12.5	13.7 - 25.9	470 - 2399	56 - 336	1 - 108	3 - 149
	Ulmus rubra	Ulmus sp.	-4.9 - 26.6	-25.8 - 26.1	16 - 29.4	201 - 3285	33 - 569	0 - 75	0 - 239
	Viburnum	Viburnum sp.	-1.1 - 27.7	-25.8 - 27	12.9 - 36.1	193 - 3151	46 - 389	0 - 165	0 - 226

* Taxon is outlier in at least one climate interval





Range of Cold Month Mean Temperature







Range of Monthly Minimum Precipitation





Range of Warm Month Mean Precipitation

Appendix H

Legler Li	ignite Ray	v Results a	and Climate	Intervals
	0			

Organ	Fossil Taxon	NLR	MAT	CMMT	WMMT	MAP	MMaP	MMiP	WMMP
Pollen	Cyathea parvula	Cyathea sp.	10.2 - 27.7	5.2 - 27	14.6 - 28.1	666 - 3151	134 - 454	12 - 165	93 - 224
	Pinus taeda	Pinus sp.	-9.2 - 25.5	-36.8 - 21.4	7.1 - 32.9	180 - 1741	28 - 293	0 - 94	0 - 304
	Picea rubens	Picea sp.	-8.9 - 21.7	-28.6 - 15.6	7.3 - 31.6	142 - 6000	36 - 700	2 - 400	2 - 400
	Podocarpus nubigens	Podocarpus sp.	4.9 - 27.7	-0.6 - 27	10.6 - 28.8	652 - 3401	68 - 448	16 - 165	26 - 431
	Taxodium distichum	Taxodium sp.	13.3 - 25	-0.1 - 19.8	18.9 - 31.2	290 - 2615	60 - 265	0 - 93	19 - 227
	Salix nigra	Salix sp.	-17 - 27.7	-50.1 - 26.5	7.6 - 32.9	122 - 2399	22 - 448	0 - 108	0 - 252
	Populus balsamifera	Populus sp.	-16 - 26	-49 - 13.6	9.8 - 35.6	25 - 2559	8 - 358	0 - 93	0 - 224
	Alnus serrulata	Alnus sp.	-13.3 - 27.4	-40.9 - 25.6	12 - 38.6	41 - 2559	8 - 353	0 - 135	8 - 207
	Carya ovata	Carya sp.	4.4 - 26.6	-11.5 - 22.2	19.3 - 30.6	373 - 1724	68 - 434	8 - 93	45 - 258
	Pterocarya stenoptera	Pterocarya sp.	3.9 - 24.2	-12.8 - 17	15.3 - 31.6	246 - 2648	46 - 424	1 - 64	2 - 424
	*Engelhardia spicata	Engelhardia sp.	13.8 - 27	3.1 - 25	22.1 - 33.6	823 - 3172	204 - 518	5 - 152	79 - 431
	Fagus grandifolia	Fagus sp.	4.4 - 23.1	-11.5 - 17	17.3 - 28.5	376 - 2648	46 - 448	5 - 94	5 - 431
	Castanea dentata	Castanea sp.	8.7 - 24.2	-3.9 - 16.7	21.6 - 29.4	473 - 1857	70 - 424	3 - 88	3 - 239
	Quercus alba	Quercus sp.	-1.4 - 27	-25.1 - 25.9	8.4 - 28.3	201 - 3905	33 - 610	0 - 180	5 - 180
	Ulmus rubra	Ulmus sp.	-4.9 - 26.6	-25.8 - 26.1	16 - 29.4	201 - 3285	33 - 569	0 - 75	0 - 239
	Liquidambar styraciflua	Liquidambar sp.	11.5 - 24.6	-1 - 23.8	23 - 29.3	619 - 1823	109 - 340	2 - 72	5 - 195
	*Cyrilla racemiflora	Cyrilla sp.	13.6 - 23.9	4.3 - 19.4	23.6 - 27.9	961 - 1520	109 - 196	42 - 56	99 - 196
	Ilex verticillata	Ilex sp.	-0.4 - 27.7	-12.9 - 27	10.4 - 33.6	641 - 3151	98 - 389	2 - 165	4 - 431
	Tilia americana	Tilia sp.	2.5 - 20.8	-17.7 - 13.3	15 - 28.1	373 - 1958	68 - 454	9 - 83	45 - 258
	Gordonia lasianthus	Gordonia sp.	14.4 - 25.5	0.9 - 21.4	20.2 - 29.4	810 - 2100	106 - 304	3 - 74	62 - 304
	Nyssa sylvatica	Nyssa sp.	-1.1 - 23.9	-25.8 - 19.4	18.9 - 27.9	305 - 2645	73 - 340	0 - 122	55 - 246
	Clethra alnifolia	Clethra sp.	7.4 - 27.7	-3.6 - 27	18.8 - 28.8	803 - 3151	113 - 389	1 - 165	94 - 229
	*Oxydendrum arboreum	Oxydendrum sp.	11.2 - 21.1	-1.6 - 12.6	24 - 28.9	996 - 1347	117 - 146	52 - 75	89 - 142
	Fraxinus americana	Fraxinus sp.	0 - 24	-25.8 - 26.7	24.9 - 33.9	148 - 1844	28 - 358	2 - 95	0 - 239

* Taxon is outlier in at least one climate interval





Range of Cold Month MeanTemperature











Nearest Living Relative



Range of Warm Month Mean Precipitation

Appendix I

Ohoopee River Dune Field Raw Results and Climate Intervals
--

Organ	Fossil Taxon	NLR	MAT	CMMT	WMMT	MAP	MMaP	MMiP	WMMP
Pollen	Acer	Acer sp.	-0.4 - 24	-24.2 - 20.6	12.9 - 29.3	115 - 2559	19 - 370	1 - 135	1-366
	Alnus	Alnus sp.	-13.3 - 27.4	-40.9 - 25.6	12 - 38.6	41 - 2559	8 - 353	0 - 135	8 - 207
	Betula	Betula sp.	-15 - 25.8	-41 - 21.1	1.3 - 28.7	110 - 2559	23 - 353	0 - 135	2 - 312
	Carya	Carya sp.	4.4 - 26.6	-11.5 - 22.2	19.3 - 30.6	373 - 1724	68 - 434	8 - 93	45 - 258
	Castanea	Castanea sp.	8.7 - 24.2	-3.9 - 16.7	21.6 - 29.4	473 - 1857	70 - 424	3 - 88	3 - 239
	Catalpa	Catalpa sp.	7.3 - 22.2	-13 - 13.6	20.2 - 29	396 - 1967	103 - 370	3 - 72	81 - 304
	Cephalanthus	Cephalanthus sp.	4.7 - 27.7	-10.9 - 27	13.9 - 32.9	184 - 3151	20 - 389	2 - 165	20 - 221
	Corylus	Corylus sp.	-4.9 - 24	-32.4 - 16.7	12.9 - 29.4	389 - 1682	45 - 343	3 - 73	3 - 239
	*Decodon	Decodon sp.	3.4 - 21.3	-12.9 - 13.3	18.9 - 28.6	592 - 1613	103 - 195	22 - 93	58 - 195
	Fagus	Fagus sp.	4.4 - 23.1	-11.5 - 17	17.3 - 28.5	376 - 2648	46 - 448	5 - 94	5 - 431
	Fraxinus	Fraxinus sp.	0 - 24	-25.8 - 16.7	14.9 - 33.9	148 -1844	28 - 358	2 - 95	0 - 239
	Gordonia	Gordonia sp.	14.4 - 25.5	0.9 - 21.4	20.2 - 29.4	810 - 2100	106 - 304	3 - 74	62 - 304
	Ilex	Ilex sp.	-0.4 - 27.7	-12.9 - 27	10.4 - 33.6	641 - 3151	98 - 389	2 - 165	4 - 431
	Itea	Itea sp.	7.7 - 27.7	-0.1 - 29.4	21.7 - 29.4	102 - 3151	49 - 389	25 - 165	13.52 - 221
	Juglans	Juglans sp.	0 - 27.5	-22.7 - 25	9.5 - 31.2	210 - 2617	28 - 582	1 - 114	2 - 189
	Liquidambar	Liquidambar sp.	11.5 - 24.6	-1 - 23.8	23 - 29.3	619 - 1823	109 - 340	2 - 72	5 - 195
	Magnolia	Magnolia sp.	4.1 - 27	-10.2 - 25.9	17.1 - 28.6	578 - 3500	102 - 610	1 - 180	70 - 462
	**Momipites	Engelhardia sp.	13.8 - 27	3.1 - 25	22.1 - 33.6	823 - 3172	204 - 518	5 - 152	79 - 431
	Myrica	Myrica sp.	-8.9 - 28.1	-29 - 27	8.9 - 33.9	233 - 3151	34 - 508	0 - 165	0 - 221
	Nuphar	Nuphar sp.	-12 - 24.3	-38.8 - 19.2	9.8 - 28.2	115 - 1958	19 - 281	4 - 83	11 - 177
	Nymphaea	Nymphaea sp.	-3.4 - 26.9	-25.8 - 24.8	12.8 - 33.6	287 - 2399	56 - 467	0 - 108	47 - 269
	Nyssa	Nyssa sp.	-1.1 - 23.9	-25.8 - 19.4	18.9 - 27.9	305 - 2645	73 - 340	0 - 122	55 - 246
	Osmunda	Osmunda sp.	0.2 - 25.8	-16.6 - 24.1	16.3 - 29.5	206 - 4150	34 - 914	2 - 59	2 - 228
	Picea	Picea sp.	-8.9 - 21.7	-28.6 - 15.6	7.3 - 31.6	142 - 6000	36 - 700	2 - 400	2 - 400
	Pinus	Pinus sp.	-9.2 - 25.5	-36.8 - 21.4	7.1 - 32.9	180 - 1741	28 - 293	0 - 94	0 - 304
	Platanus	Platanus sp.	6.6 - 27.4	-10.9 - 25.6	13.7 - 29.5	399 - 2540	71 - 566	0 - 83	0 - 196
	Pterocarya	Pterocarya sp.	3.9 - 24.2	-12.8 - 17	15.3 - 31.6	246 - 2648	46 - 424	1-64	2 - 424
	Quercus	Quercus sp.	-1.4 - 27	-25.1 - 25.9	8.4 - 28.3	201 - 3905	33 - 610	0 - 180	5 - 180
	Rhus	Rhus sp.	3.4 - 24.9	-12.9 - 22.2	18.9 - 29.4	735 - 1613	73 - 195	18 - 93	49 - 195
	Salix	Salix sp.	-17 - 27.7	-50.1 - 26.5	7.6 - 32.9	122 - 2399	22 - 448	0 - 108	0 - 252
	Symplocos	Symplocos sp.	13.6 - 27.7	1.8 - 27	23.6 - 32.2	505 - 3151	109 - 436	3 - 208	43 - 208
	Taxodium	Taxodium sp.	13.3 - 25	-0.1 - 19.8	18.9 - 31.2	290 - 2615	60 - 265	0 - 93	19 - 227
	Tilia	Tilia sp.	2.5 - 20.8	-17.7 - 13.3	15 - 28.1	373 - 1958	68 - 454	9 - 83	45 - 258

Tsuga	Tsuga sp.	-1.8 - 21.9	-15.6 - 15.6	11 - 29.5	285 - 2648	48 - 350	0 - 108	0 - 344
Ulmus	Ulmus sp.	-4.9 - 26.6	-25.8 - 26.1	16 - 29.4	201 - 3285	33 - 569	0 - 75	0 - 239
Viburnum	Viburnum sp.	-1.1 - 27.7	-25.8 - 27	12.9 - 36.1	193 - 3151	46 - 389	0 - 165	0 - 226
Vitis	Vitis	0 - 27.4	-22.7 - 25.6	17.2 - 31.2	210 - 1562	44 - 264	0 - 94	2 - 176

* Taxon is outlier in at least one climate interval** Nearest Living Relative different genus than Fossil Taxon





Range of Cold Month Mean Temperature











Nearest Living Relative


Nearest Living Relative

Appendix J

Organ	Fossil Taxon	NLR	MAT	CMMT	WMMT	MAP	MMaP	MMiP	WMMP
Pollen	Pinus	Pinus sp.	-9.2 - 25.5	-36.8 - 21.4	7.1 - 32.9	180 - 1741	28 - 293	0 - 94	0 - 304
	Quercus	Quercus sp.	-1.4 - 27	-25.1 - 25.9	8.4 - 28.3	201 - 3905	33 - 610	0 - 180	5 - 180
	Carya	Carya sp.	4.4 - 26.6	-11.5 - 22.2	19.3 - 30.6	373 - 1724	68 - 434	8 - 93	45 - 258
	Dodonaea	Dodonaea sp.	10 - 27.7	4.3 - 27	15.4 - 30.9	224 - 3151	25 - 389	6 - 165	18 - 304
	Liquidambar	Liquidambar sp.	11.5 - 24.6	-1 - 23.8	23 - 29.3	619 - 1823	109 - 340	2 - 72	5 - 195
	Ulmus	Ulmus sp.	-4.9 - 26.6	-25.8 - 26.1	16 - 29.4	201 - 3285	33 - 569	0 - 75	0 - 239
	Pterocarya	Pterocarya sp.	3.9 - 24.2	-12.8 - 17	15.3 - 31.6	246 - 2648	46 - 424	1 - 64	2 - 424
	Cyrilla racemiflora	Cyrilla sp.	13.6 - 23.9	4.3 - 19.4	23.6 - 27.9	961 - 1520	109 - 196	42 - 56	99 - 196
	Ilex	Ilex sp.	-0.4 - 27.7	-12.9 - 27	10.4 - 33.6	641 - 3151	98 - 389	2 - 165	4 - 431
	Gordonia	Gordonia sp.	14.4 - 25.5	0.9 - 21.4	20.2 - 29.4	810 - 2100	106 - 304	3 - 74	62 - 304
	Myrica	Myrica sp.	-8.9 - 28.1	-29 - 27	8.9 - 33.9	233 - 3151	34 - 508	0 - 165	0 - 221
	Alnus	Alnus sp.	-13.3 - 27.4	-40.9 - 25.6	12 - 38.6	41 - 2559	8 - 353	0 - 135	8 - 207
	Nuphar	Nuphar sp.	-12 - 24.3	-38.8 - 19.2	9.8 - 28.2	115 - 1958	19 - 281	4 - 83	11 - 177
	<i>Tsuga canadensis</i> -type/	Tsuga sp.	-1.8 - 21.9	-15.6 - 15.6	11 - 29.5	285 - 2648	48 - 350	0 - 108	0 - 344
	cf. Tsuga mertensiana								
	cf. Dacrydium	Dacrydium sp.	6.7 - 27.7	2.5 - 27	11.7 - 28.1	361 - 3151	50 - 389	2 - 165	2 - 221
	Podocarpus	Podocarpus sp.	4.9 - 27.7	-0.6- 27	10.6 - 28.8	652 - 3401	68 - 448	16 - 165	26 - 431
	cf. Engelhardia	Engelhardia sp.	13.8 - 27	3.1 - 25	22.1 - 33.6	823 - 3172	204 - 518	5 - 152	79 - 431
	cf. Zelkova	Zelkova sp.	7.3-21.9	-12.8 - 13.6	19.4 - 29.7	24.6 - 2648	46 - 369	3 - 59	3 - 344

Peace Creek Raw Results and Climate Intervals





Range of Cold Month Mean Temperature

110



Nearest Living Relative



Range of Mean Annual Precipitation





Range of Monthly Minimum Precipitation

Nearest Living Relative



Range of Warm Month Mean Precipitation

Appendix K

Pollack Farm Raw R	Results and	Climate	Intervals
--------------------	-------------	---------	-----------

Organ	Fossil	NLR	MAT	CMMT	WMMT	MAP	MMaP	MMiP	WMMP
0	Taxon								
Pollen	Alnus	Alnus sp.	-13.3 - 27.4	-40.9 - 25.6	12 - 38.6	41 - 2559	8 - 353	0 - 135	8 - 207
	Betula	Betula sp.	-15 - 25.8	-41 - 21.1	1.3 - 28.7	110 - 2559	23 - 353	0 - 135	2 - 312
	Carya	Carya sp.	4.4 - 26.6	-11.5 - 22.2	19.3 - 30.6	373 - 1724	68 - 434	8 - 93	45 - 258
	*Momipites	**Engelhardia sp.	13.8 - 27	3.1 - 25	22.1 - 33.6	823 - 3172	204 - 518	5 - 152	79 - 431
	Juglans	Juglans sp.	0 - 27.5	-22.7 - 25	9.5 - 31.2	210 - 2617	28 - 582	1 - 114	2 - 189
	Pterocarya	Pterocarya sp.	3.9 - 24.2	-12.8 - 17	15.3 - 31.6	246 - 2648	46 - 424	1 - 64	2 - 424
	Castanea	Castanea sp.	8.7 - 24.2	-3.9 - 16.7	21.6 - 29.4	473 - 1857	70 - 424	3 - 88	3 - 239
	Fagus	Fagus sp.	4.4 - 23.1	-11.5 - 17	17.3 - 28.5	376 - 2648	46 - 448	5 - 94	5 - 431
	Quercus	Quercus sp.	-1.4 - 27	-25.1 - 25.9	8.4 - 28.3	201 - 3905	33 - 610	0 - 180	5 - 180
	Ilex	Ilex sp.	-0.4 - 27.7	-12.9 - 27	10.4 - 33.6	641 - 3151	98 - 389	2 - 165	4 - 431
	Liquidambar	Liquidambar sp.	11.5 - 24.6	-1 - 23.8	23 - 29.3	619 - 1823	109 - 340	2 - 72	5 - 195
	Nyssa	Nyssa sp.	-1.1 - 23.9	-25.8 - 19.4	18.9 - 27.9	305 - 2645	73 - 340	0 - 122	55 - 246
	Tilia	Tilia sp.	2.5 - 20.8	-17.7 - 13.3	15 - 28.1	373 - 1958	68 - 454	9 - 83	45 - 258
	Ulmus	Ulmus sp.	-4.9 - 26.6	-25.8 - 26.1	16 - 29.4	201 - 3285	33 - 569	0 - 75	0 - 239
	Cyrilla	Cyrilla sp.	13.6 - 23.9	4.3 - 19.4	23.6 - 27.9	961 - 1520	109 - 196	42 - 56	99 - 196
	Symplocos	Symplocos sp.	13.6 - 27.7	1.8 - 27	23.6 - 32.2	505 - 3151	109 - 436	3 - 208	43 - 208
	*Manilkara	Manilkara sp.	22 - 28.7	16.3 - 27	25.1 - 30.6	298 - 3151	77 - 582	1 - 165	27 - 403
	Alangium(?)	Alangium sp.	8.5 - 27.7	-7.3 - 27	16.4 - 28.5	338 - 3151	92 - 389	1 - 165	66 - 221
	Gordonia	Gordonia sp.	14.4 - 25.5	0.9 - 21.4	20.2 - 29.4	810 - 2100	106 - 304	3 - 74	62 - 304
	Eucommia	Eucommia sp.	10.6 - 19.4	-7.3 - 9.6	20.2 - 29.3	396 - 1967	108 - 370	3 - 64	108 - 304
	Pinus	Pinus sp.	-9.2 - 25.5	-36.8 - 21.4	7.1 - 32.9	180 - 1741	28 - 293	0 - 94	0 - 304
	Tsuga	Tsuga sp.	-1.8 - 21.9	-15.6 - 15.6	11 - 29.5	285 - 2648	48 - 350	0 - 108	0 - 344
	Podocarpus	Podocarpus sp.	4.9 - 27.7	-0.6 - 27	10.6 - 28.8	652 - 3401	68 - 448	16 - 165	26 - 431
	*Cedrus	Cedrus sp.	11.6 - 18.4	-0.3 - 12.5	19.4 - 31.8	164 - 1577	43 - 434	0 - 41	0 - 175
	Sequoia type	Sequoia sp.	9.1 - 25	-2.7 - 19.8	13.7 - 31.2	222 - 1613	60 - 245	0 - 93	3 - 227
	Taxodium	Taxodium sp.	13.3 - 25	-0.1 - 19.8	18.9 - 31.2	290 - 2615	60 - 265	0 - 93	19 - 227

* Taxon is outlier in at least one climate interval** Nearest Living Relative different genus than Fossil Taxon







Nearest Living Relative



Range of Mean Annual Precipitation

Nearest Living Relative





Nearest Living Relative



VITA

KYRIE ALYSON BAUMGARTNER

Education:	Hanover-Horton Schools, Hanover and Horton, Michigan				
	B.S. Program in the Environment, University of Michigan, Ann Arbor, Michigan 2012				
	M.S. Biology, East Tennessee State University, Johnson City Tennessee 2014				
Professional Experience:	Outreach Facilitator, University of Michigan Museum of Natural History, Ann Arbor, Michigan 2010-2011				
	Docent, University of Michigan Museum of Natural History, Ann Arbor, Michigan 2010-12				
	Volunteer Fossil Preparator, University of Michigan Museum of Paleontology, Ann Arbor, Michigan 2010-2012				
	Paleontological Intern, The Mammoth Site of Hot Springs, South Dakota, 2011 and 2012				
	Graduate Research Assistant, East Tennessee State University, Department of Biological Sciences, 2012-2014				
	Lab Volunteer, Gray Fossil Site, Johnson City, Tennessee 2013- 2014				
Presentations:	Geological Society of America Annual Meeting, October, 2013 Baumgartner, Kyrie A. 2013. Paleoclimate Reconstructions of Three Mid-Atlantic Miocene Sites. Geological Society of Americ Abstracts with Programs 45:7.				
	Lunchtime Lectures at the Gray Fossil Site, April 5, 2014 "Back to the Future: Paleoclimate, Paleoenvironment and the Gray Fossil Site"				
Honors and Awards:	University Honors, University of Michigan, 2010 and 2012				
	2013 GSA Southeast Section Student Travel Grant, Awarded by GSA				

	Golden Key International Honor Society Invitation, 2013
Affiliations:	Geological Society of America-GSA. Student Member
	ETSU Graduate & Professional Student Association-GPSA
	Don Sundquist Center for Excellence in Paleontology at ETSU