

INFORMING PRACTICE AND SABOTAGING MEMBERSHIP GROWTH:  
AN IDEOLOGICAL RHETORICAL ANALYSIS OF DISCURSIVE MATERIALS  
FROM KIWANIS INTERNATIONAL

Tonja LaFaye Stokes

Submitted to the faculty of the University Graduate School  
in partial fulfillment of the requirements  
for the degree  
Master of Arts  
in the Department of Communication Studies  
Indiana University

September 2015

Accepted by the Graduate Faculty, Indiana University, in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Arts.

Master's Thesis Committee

---

Catherine A. Dobris, Ph.D.

---

John Parrish-Sprowl, Ph.D.

---

Elizabeth M. Goering, Ph.D.

© 2015

Tonja LaFaye Stokes

## **Acknowledgements**

I would like to express my sincere thanks to my master's thesis advisor, Dr. Catherine A. Dobris, whose insights, pragmatic advice, encouragement, and tolerance of my unorthodox writing style made this thesis possible. As well, I would like to thank Drs. John Parrish-Sprowl and Elizabeth M. Goering for serving on my committee. I am privileged to have had these knowledgeable, interesting, and wise scholars as professors and as my committee members.

In addition, I would like to thank my family for their constant love and support. A special thank you is extended to our children, Zach, Sydney, Kailinn, and Nathan. Without Zach, this journey would never have even begun. He is a constant source of inspiration who never fails to provide intellectually stimulating and provocative points of view that challenge my thinking. Sydney and Kailinn, our near-teens, have spent countless hours tending to their baby brother and talking in hushed voices so that I could research and write. Not a day has gone by that Kailinn has not inquired about my progress, or that each of these powerhouses in potentia have not wished me luck with the day's thesis work. Nathan, though less than a year old, has given me tremendous comfort during much-needed respites from researching and writing and has been my motivation for continuing on. For my husband Justin, words are inadequate. There has been no obstacle that he has not helped remove, no goal he felt too lofty to pursue, no sacrifice he deemed too impractical to make. To my greatest champion and cheerleader, I give my deepest appreciation, most heartfelt thanks, and unending devotion.

This thesis is dedicated to the memory of my father, Daniel Clark Stokes, who not only asked me when graduate school would begin on the very day I received my undergraduate degree, but who continued to ask for years afterward. I wish we had had more time.

Tonja LaFaye Stokes

INFORMING PRACTICE AND SABOTAGING MEMBERSHIP GROWTH:  
AN IDEOLOGICAL RHETORICAL ANALYSIS OF DISCURSIVE MATERIALS  
FROM KIWANIS INTERNATIONAL

This study utilizes an ideological rhetorical analysis, applying Marxist and Feminist lenses, to artifacts from Kiwanis International, a prominent global service organization. These artifacts are: "The Permanent Objects of Kiwanis," guiding principles that were codified in 1924; "The Man Who Was God": a brief story about transforming from Kiwanis member to "Kiwanian," published in 1935 and 1985, respectively; and the 2012 "Join the Club" Membership Brochure.

The rhetoric of discursive materials is one of the most salient representations of group ideology. In turn, ideology, particularly when it reflects and perpetuates social hegemony, has a normalizing effect on itself. Ideology shapes identity; identity shapes strategies to set process norms that create social cohesion. Norms of social cohesion become culture; culture reinforces ideology. When these components mirror social hegemony and replicate hegemonic power, they create institutions, like service organizations; these institutions then legitimate and normalize positions of social privilege. Ultimately, ideology and social hegemony reveal themselves through organizational and member practices and organizationally-produced discursive material.

The purpose of this study is to analyze the historical, socio-political, and socio-cultural roots of Kiwanis International in order to draw logical conclusions about the organization's ideology for the purposes of understanding how that ideology contributes

to, justifies, and perpetuates an unconscious, neo-colonial view of philanthropy. Kiwanis International, on an organizational (macro) level and at the club/member (micro) level, is structured around positions of racial, ethnic, socio-economic, linguistic, gender, and religious privilege, and so mimics the hegemonic power centers and dominant ideologies of society at large. In turn, the products and practices of the organization reflect these positions of privilege and inhibits the organization's ability to attract traditionally excluded, disenfranchised, or under-represented groups.

Understanding that it is a contentious and futile to simply point where power relations exist and assert themselves, this study emphasizes where "othering" occurs in hopes of mitigating relations of domination and oppression between Kiwanis members and perspective members, and of moving forward the interests of those who have not traditionally been counted among Kiwanis' members but whose presence could save the organization.

Catherine A. Dobris, Ph.D.

## Table of Contents

### *Chapter I: Introduction*

Prologue .....	1
Rationale and Research Questions .....	3
Overview of Method .....	10
Rhetoric and Rhetorical Criticism .....	11
Ideological Criticism .....	12
Marxist and Feminist Lenses .....	13
Organization of Chapters .....	13

### *Chapter II: Review of the Literature*

Introduction .....	16
Background: The Impetus for Today's Service Organizations .....	17
Social Capital and the Economics of Social Capital .....	20
The Difficulties of Homogeneity and Diversity .....	26
Identity, Ideology, and Discourse .....	33
Conclusion .....	37

### *Chapter III: Methodology*

Introduction .....	42
Rhetorical Approaches .....	44
Ideological Criticism .....	44
Marxist Criticism .....	45
Feminist Criticism .....	46
Limitations and Other Considerations .....	51
Limitations .....	51
Considerations .....	52
Application of the Method .....	54
Description of the Artifacts .....	54
Artifact 1: The Objects of Kiwanis .....	55
Rhetorical Situation .....	56
Artifact 2: "The Man Who Was God" .....	58
Rhetorical Situation .....	61
Artifact 3: "Join the Club" Membership Brochure .....	63
Rhetorical Situation .....	72

### *Chapter IV: Analyses and Findings*

Analyses .....	74
Artifact 1: The Objects of Kiwanis .....	74
Artifact 2: "The Man Who Was God" .....	95
Artifact 3: "Join the Club" Membership Brochure .....	110
Findings .....	122



<i>Chapter V: Conclusion</i>	
Summary .....	140
Limitations .....	140
Contributions to the Field .....	143
Recommendations for Future Research .....	145
Conclusion .....	147
 <i>Bibliography</i> .....	 149
 <i>Chapter VI: Curriculum Vitae</i>	

## **Chapter I: Introduction**

### *Prologue*

The fifty years between 1865 and 1915 must have given most Americans the impression that the nation had fallen into sheer chaos. Presidents Lincoln, Garfield, and McKinley had been assassinated (Tindall and Shi, 700; "20. Garfield;" "25. McKinley"). The Reconstruction period after the Civil War (1861-1865) brought extremes both in movements toward equality for former slaves as well as attempts to curtail the liberties of the now-freed men and women (Tindall and Shi, 693-723). In the South, the economic systems that had depended on free labor plummeted into depression, while in the North, labor unions, influenced by the publication and subsequent popularity of Karl Marx's *Communist Manifesto*, rallied for fair pay and better working conditions ("Labor Movement"). An influx of immigrants who were neither considered white nor counted among the Protestant fold began settling across the country. By some estimates, 10 million immigrants arrived between 1865 and 1890 alone. Italians and Irish, who were predominantly Catholic, Slavs, Russians, Armenians, and Germans - many of whom were Jewish - Chinese, and Japanese were among the sojourners (Putnam, 267-373).

In this time of seemingly immense turmoil, however, there were glimpses of a hopeful future. The American West had been subdued. In 1898, the United States gained control of Cuba, Puerto Rico, and the Philippines as a result of the Spanish-American War, and Hawaii officially became a U.S. territory. Railways united even the most far-reaching corners of the nation. Machines and innovations both great and small, from dynamite used in mining to the tin can opener, marked this time period as the second

industrial revolution. This period created immense personal wealth for a select few, the likes of which had never before been seen, and Americans collectively were enjoying greater leisure time and a better standard of living than generations past (Putnam, 368-377). The era also introduced scientific studies, popularized psychiatry, and generated theories about societal constructs, upward mobility, and the capacity of people to either succeed or fail as their nature would dictate. Bolstered by Social Darwinism and the Protestant Work Ethic, it was truly an age of capitalist imperialism that was fed by nativism and justified and perpetuated by paternalism on national and societal levels (Charles, 19; Putnam, 367-373).

*World Politics in Modern Civilization* points out the link between Protestantism and capitalism, saying that Protestants regarded work to be a "divine calling" in America's colonial days (Barnes, 85). By the early 1900's, this idea, which would come to be known as the Protestant Work Ethic, was deeply ingrained in the American psyche. To be industrious and to earn money was to thwart the devil's playground of idle hands. What is more, the rise of overall national wealth, thanks to capitalistic pursuits, proved that United States was, indeed, the land of opportunity where hard work paid off – the place where God would help those who helped themselves, so to speak. At the same time, rising individual wealth called into question the very egalitarian principles upon which the nation had been founded. What is more, the pursuit of wealth posed a moral dilemma: how can one pursue capitalistic interests and still earn a spot in heaven since absolution, a Catholic enterprise, no longer applied and assured the faithful of life in the hereafter? As well, the rise in personal wealth revealed an innate conflict between capitalism and Christianity. In the light of Judeo-Christian values, how could the idea of seeing a

monetary reward for one's work be reconciled against the idea that greed is sinful and that caring for the less fortunate is not just one's duty, but the embodiment of Christ-on-earth? A remedy to these quandaries would eventually be found in the quasi-missionary impulses of service organizations, which began as social, fraternal clubs that morphed into business networking groups (Charles, 9-33).

It is fair to call the first forays into community service of these organizations "quasi-missionary" for three simple reasons. First, these organizations originally sprang up to provide men with a social outlet, not necessarily for the purpose of engaging in good works. Secondly, the altruism conducted by these groups in their early days were responses to the humanitarian works that women had been engaged in for some time; it was important that men not lose face or social standing to women, who were gaining new rights and making significant impacts in their communities (Charles, 5-9; 24). Lastly, Protestantism began endorsing altruism as a means of quelling social unrest (Charles, 24).

### *Rationale and Research Questions*

Today, Kiwanis recruits and retains members much as it did 100 years ago when it was founded. Recruitment efforts do not yield the kind of membership needed to sustain the organization for another 100 years. The questionable future of Kiwanis is not inconsequential. Globally, Kiwanians invest six million hours per year in service projects ("Headlines"). In very real terms, the decline or even demise of Kiwanis has implications for communities across the world. Moreover, though, the breakdown of service organizations has implications for American society. In his book, *Bowling Alone: The Collapse and Revival of the American Community*, Robert Putnam says that healthy

service organizations are one indicator of strong civic engagement; strong civic engagement helps to build stable communities that experience less crime and more economic growth (Putnam, 15-19, 307-318). Tocqueville, in *Democracy in America* contends that community engagement through civic associations is a hallmark of the American experience. Americans, he argues, learn to be citizens, to participate in the democratic process, understand political involvement, and simultaneously learn how to move individual interests forward with community interests through civic associations (Putnam, 48, 118, 135). At the same time, citizens who do not enjoy positions of privilege "benefit least from the existing democratic order," which may lead to "political apathy" (Green and Janmaat, 135-136). Yet, it is promise of having an equal stake in our collective, national future that helps create cohesion among Americans, irrespective of background (Green and Janmaat, 134-138). The inability of service organizations, like Kiwanis, to recruit diverse audiences on a large scale, then, is not just a matter of economics for the organization. It is not just a matter of a loss of volunteer hours. The decline or demise of Kiwanis means that a fundamental way of being American will become significantly altered for everyone; and there are no clear answers about what, if anything, will replace service organizations in helping to create the American experience.

The artifacts from Kiwanis International demonstrate the long-standing propensity of the organization to perpetuate and legitimate positions of white, male privilege through hegemonic and other ideologies. The ideologies that undergird Kiwanis' discursive materials alienates and others those who have traditionally been under-represented in the organization's membership rosters. At issue with the ideological positions presented in Kiwanis' artifacts is that the ability of the organization to realize membership diversity

beyond tokenism is limited at precisely the time in history when the organizations must expand their recruitment efforts beyond the white professional male in his 60's in order to survive financially. While the decline in membership represents a loss of labor hours related to club-specific community service projects, it also represents an unsustainable income loss trend as membership accounts for the largest single funding block (Fig. 1). Losses for the 2013-2014 totaled USD\$3.059 million. In the 2011-2012 and 2012-2013 years, the loss was USD\$613,000 and USD\$633,000, respectively. Currently, the organization has a deficit of USD\$1.91 million, offset by investments ("2013-2014 Kiwanis International Annual Report").

The 2006 Kiwanis International strategic plan lists embracing diversity as one of its core values, posits how it can become more diverse, sets diversity apart as a key strategic issue, and repeatedly cites increased diversity as a strategic goal. According to "Just the Facts, 2014" a document produced by Kiwanis, as of November 1, 2013, global membership had dropped to 207,790. Nearly 154,000 members were men with an average of 60 years of age. Between October 1, 2013 and September 30, 2014, membership in the Americas, comprised of the United States, Latin American, and the Canadian and Caribbean regions, had dropped from 152,322 to 147,533 ("2013-2014 Certified Membership Report").

Despite an increase in diversity having economic consequences, little headway is being made toward realizing a more ethnically, racially, religiously, politically, age- or gender- diverse Kiwanis. By 2012, Kiwanis' female membership made up only 26% of its global membership total, but this number drops as low as 15% depending on the source cited and how numbers were calculated ("Just the Facts, 2013"). This translates to about 6

women per each of Kiwanis' 8,344 clubs worldwide. Because membership reports are not generated to produce it, and the information is not necessarily collected from members, there is no comprehensive, organization-wide data related to ethnicity, religion, or political affiliation.

Because there is an historical track record of intersectionality between oppressed groups, particularly between women and racial and ethnic minorities living and functioning in patriarchal capitalist societies, the lack of gender diversity can be correlated to a lack of ethnic, racial, and religious diversity as well (Gottfried, 25). The following data, generated from the "Member Demographic Survey, 2014" that randomly solicited 35,584 English-speaking members from North America for responses about race/ethnicity, gender religion, age, political affiliation, education, and income among other questions, is offered in support of this claim:

- Race/ethnicity: 2.1% of the 1,372 respondents are white; 40 are African American; 20 are Asian/Pacific Islander, Multi-racial, or Hispanic, respectively
- Gender: 824 of the 1,372 respondents are men; 548 are female
- Age: 762 of the 1,372 respondents are 61 years of age or older
- Religion: 448 of the 1,297 respondents are Protestant; 263 are Roman Catholic; 138 are Evangelical Christian
- Political Affiliation: 506 of the 1,297 respondents are Conservative; 360 are moderate; 215 are Liberal; 294 describe themselves as "Other," declined to answer, or skipped the question

- Minimum Education: 466 of the 1,372 respondents hold a four-year university degree; 355 hold a Master's Degree; 192 hold a Doctorate or professional degree; 62 have a high school diploma
- Income: 600 of the 1,372 respondents earn \$50,000 to \$99,000 annually; 238 earn \$100,000 to \$124,999 annually; 261 earn between \$125,000 and \$149,999 annually; 152 earn \$150,000 or more annually; 273 earn \$49,999 or less annually

Though these statistics are not as comprehensive as they should be in order to provide a complete demographic picture of Kiwanis, it is evident that the organization has far to go in realizing diversity. This is recognized by the organization as it has a long-standing strategic plan that focuses on diversity as a membership growth issue. The fact that this plan was created a full eight years before an official demographic study was undertaken illustrates the lack of attention to, research about, and action taken to promote diversity.

Currently, Kiwanis is in the midst of a five-year global membership campaign to which USD\$4,000,000.00 has been allotted. The campaign, called "The Formula," was fully and officially launched for North America in 2014, although the ground work was being laid years before. The goals of the campaign are to open 1,650 new clubs with a starting minimum membership of 15, the required number to receive a charter; develop 2,700 new leaders within the membership structure; and add a minimum of 10 new members to all existing clubs over the course of five years ("Introducing The Formula").

It could be argued that as this campaign increases membership, the diversity issue organically resolves itself. For example, nearly 47,000 "youth" over 18 were added as "associate members" in 2014 ("Just the Facts, 2014"). However, calculating membership



numbers is not always such a straight-forward task. The youth who were added in the 2013-2014 were added because of their past association with Kiwanis youth programs ("Just the Facts, 2014"). There is no membership fee levied for these members; and there is not an explicit strategy to link associates members to clubs so that, upon the expiration of the associate member status, these youth feel compelled to become full-fledged, dues-paying members. In another example, Kiwanis counts clubs with membership below the required minimum of 15 to maintain a charter ("Kiwanis International Bylaws"). While the individuals are still members, bylaws dictate that clubs below 15 members are subject to charter revocation.

As a former employee who worked directly with district leadership on the campaign, I noticed two other phenomena. The Kiwanis year begins October 1 and ends the following September 30. Technically, members who do not pay their membership fees during a respective year should be deleted from club rosters within that year. However, club secretaries across all districts and regions, in an attempt to help district leadership meet recognition standards, typically do not delete members until the new membership year begins. At the organizational level, the 2013-2014 Certified Membership Report shows a loss of 5,000 members for the year for North America, significantly lower than in years past. However, rather than add individuals who became members in the early part of the October 2014 to the 2014-2015 year, they were added to the 2013-2014 year. Deletions during this same time period, however, remained on the 2014-2015 year.

The average Kiwanian, irrespective of country of residence, is 66 years of age.

Most of Kiwanis' members are white males. Norms of group formation and cohesion say that people are most likely to associate with others who are most like them (Putnam, 310-311); as a consequence, membership recruitment efforts have been largely conducted by white males for white males. Problematically, membership from among this demographic is in a steady decline. Since the average life expectancy for a white male in the United States alone is 76 years of age, Kiwanis must recognize the inevitable mortality of its most prominent member demographic and traditional membership target pool ("Life Expectancy"). In order to remain a viable, solvent organization for another 100 years, the organization must go beyond marketing ploys and hollow words in order to cultivate a more diverse membership.

For the purpose of identifying the ideological assumptions that may be inhibiting Kiwanis' ability to realize membership diversity, this study will utilize a rhetorical ideological analysis applying Marxist and feminist lenses to analyze three artifacts from Kiwanis International. An in-depth description of these can be found in the Methodology section of this study. This study will focus on the following research questions: How have the historical roots of the organization helped shape group identity? How is this identity, manifested through the discursive material, potentially alienating to traditionally under-represented groups? How do Kiwanis' discursive materials and practices inform, influence, support, and perpetuate each other?

To keep people engaged in service organizations for the sake of being engaged in democratic processes, Kiwanis' recruitment strategies and practices for relating to the community must be examined with a new, critical eye. Therefore, neither the questions posed by this study nor the analyses or findings are meant to disparage service

organizations or the people who belong to them. Rather, this study is meant to provide a logical, evidence-based place from which Kiwanis leadership may (re)consider the organization's ideological foundation from which the organization functions, the manifestations of ideology, and the impact of ideology on membership and practices and to provide pragmatic suggestions for approaches to volunteerism and group formation that will foster membership diversity and, ultimately, organizational growth.

### *Overview of Method*

As stated, this study will be a rhetorical ideological analysis that employs Marxist and Feminist lenses to better understand and analyze the artifacts. As such, appropriate procedures as outlined by *Sonja Foss in Rhetorical Criticism: Exploration and Practice, Fourth Edition* will be followed (214-220). This requires the selection of an artifact or artifacts for analysis, formulating the research question(s), analyzing the artifact(s), and writing the essay. Analysis of the artifacts consists of "(1) identifying the presented elements of the artifacts; (2) identifying the suggested elements linked to the presented elements; (3) formulating an ideology; and (4) identifying the functions served by the ideology" (Foss, 214). In order to analyze the artifacts, I will code them, identifying the presented and suggested elements. I will also note Marxist and Feminist points of intersection. This will allow for the identification of ideologies present in each artifact. As well, I will compare the artifacts to determine if particular ideologies reappear. These identified ideologies will serve as the units of analysis. Then, I will present the essay, which will include: an introduction to the research question(s) and contribution to rhetorical theory; a description of the artifact and corresponding rhetorical situation; a

description of the critical methods and lenses; findings of the analysis and discussion about the identified ideologies, their significance, and rhetorical strategies used to support those ideologies; and a discussion of the contribution of the analysis to rhetorical theory (Foss, 220).

### *Rhetoric and Rhetorical Criticism*

Sonja Foss describes "rhetoric" as interpreted to mean "empty, bombastic language that has no substance" or it is "flowery, ornamental speech laden with metaphors and other figures of speech" (Foss, 3). In both of these descriptions, we see that rhetoric is easily disregarded as disingenuous talk. But this is not the essence of rhetoric. Foss contends that rhetoric is a "discipline dating back to the fifth century B.C..." that concerns itself with "...the use of human symbols to communicate" (Foss, 3). Given this definition, rhetoric seeks to illuminate "humans as creators of rhetoric," "symbols as the medium for rhetoric," and "communication as the purpose for rhetoric" (Foss, 3). In short, rhetoric as a discipline helps us to understand how people shape their identities and cultures, how they assign symbols to things and how that assignment gives constitutive power to identity and culture, and how and why humans engage in this process (Foss, 4-5).

Rhetorical criticism is a qualitative research method. As such, analysis of communicative processes and communications, whether written, spoken, visual or nonverbal, is subjective. That does not mean that rhetorical criticism is without standards and standardization. For example, rhetorical criticism requires the identification of that which is to be studied, the "artifact;" and particular aspects of that artifact form the focus

of analysis and criticism, which must be based in and draw upon sound theory to make sense of the meaning of the artifact (Foss, 4-8). Because rhetorical criticism looks at particular artifacts, identifies specific points of analysis and criticism structured around answering particular research questions, then makes sense of the artifact by linking it to theory, rhetorical criticism concentrates on the *what?-so what?- now what?* of communicative acts and objects. Understanding an artifact's significance is enhanced by applying various "lenses," distinct ways of viewing an artifact's meaning that is founded on selected ideological assumptions. This study, as mentioned, applies an ideological criticism with Marxist and Feminist lenses to the artifact.

### *Ideological Criticism*

Ideology is "a pattern of beliefs that determines a group's interpretations of some aspect(s) of the world. These beliefs reflect a group's 'fundamental social, political or cultural interests (Foss, 209)." Ideological criticism seeks to reveal those interests and draw conclusions about their purposes and impact. Ideological criticism must include specific elements: the artifact must be selected and the research question(s) formulated. The artifact and its rhetorical situation (the context for how the artifact came to be) must be described. The unit or units of analysis -the who or what that is to studied - should be articulated. The artifact is then analyzed, highlighting prominent ideologies, scrutinizing the interests the ideology serves, and evaluating the strategies used to promote the ideology/ideologies. The analysis is then interpreted through and related to theoretical frameworks. Lastly, an ideological criticism will contemplate the contributions of the criticism to the discipline of Communications.

### *Marxist and Feminist Lenses*

Ideological meaning is not fixed. It changes over time due to myriad influences and circumstances. Because Ideological criticism is rooted in understanding ideology, and ideology is a subjective concept, it is an effective platform for introducing analysis through particular viewpoints - or "lenses." Lenses are often, in and of themselves, ideological positions. Two of these lenses - Marxism and Feminism – will serve the ideological criticism of this study. Of Marxism, Foss says, "Marxism is a way of analyzing cultural products in terms of the social and economic practices and institutions that produce them" (Foss, 211-212). The purpose of feminist criticism, Foss contends, is to "discover how the rhetorical construction of identity markers such as gender are used as justification for domination, how such domination is constructed as natural, and how that naturalness can be challenged" (Foss, 213). We can see, then, that both Marxism and Feminism concern themselves with political and social hegemony, class oppression, and the potential for resistance of oppressive power, authority, and ideologies. This makes them appropriate and effective lenses through which conclusions about the exclusionary characteristics of the artifacts to be analyzed will be drawn.

### *Organization of Chapters*

This study will include five chapters. Chapter One will provide a brief prologue, introduction, rationale for the study and research questions, an overview of the methodology, and an outline of the chapters. While the prologue may seem tedious, it provides a historical and socio-cultural context for modern service organizations, to

include Kiwanis. Additionally, the prologue offers a context for the discussions related importance capitalism, building social capital, and the dynamic interplay between power, identity, ideology and discourse that will comprise the analysis and finding portions of this study.

Chapter Two will provide additional historical background and the literature review for this study. The difficulty of this review is that, while there is much about volunteerism and volunteer trends, little has been written with the express purpose of tying the origins of service organizations to capitalism in order to dissect ideology and critique contemporary discursive practices and materials. This approach, I believe, is new ground in this particular line of research. This study calls on concepts from many disciplines, including communications, economics, organizational development, sociology, psychology, and education, and will rely on a wide variety of journal articles and books from those and other disciplines to inform the study.

Chapter Three will present the rhetorical method selected for application in this study: an ideological rhetorical criticism that utilizes Marxist and feminist lenses as a means of conducting an analysis of the selected artifacts. This chapter will explain why this rhetorical approach is appropriate for the selected artifacts and for realizing the intent of this study. This chapter will also define components of the method. That is, it will define "ideological," "Marxist," and "Feminist" criticisms in more exact terms. Limitations of the method and approaches will also be addressed in this chapter. Lastly, this chapter will provide descriptions of the artifacts.

Chapter Four will contain the analysis of the artifacts and present the findings.

Chapter Five will present a conclusion, summary, and discussion of research implications. This chapter will also address limitations of the method, present this study's contributions to the Field, and discuss implications for future research.



## **Chapter II: Review of the Literature**

### *Introduction*

Human relationships are complex, and the ways in which people identify themselves and relate to each other are multi-layered and often encoded with unrecognized expectations based on social stratifications. This complexity is compounded further by organizational hierarchies, institutional practices, and issues of privilege and disenfranchisement -all of which comprise the service club experience. At the heart of service clubs is the formation of social networks on the pretext of engaging in community service. While there is a good deal of literature available regarding philanthropy and voluntarism, very little of the literature is comprehensive enough to serve as a basis for discussing all of the intricacies associated with voluntarism through a service organization. These intricacies range from issues of class and status, social capital and social cohesion, positions of privilege and hegemonic power, to ideology, language and discourse -all of which are interconnected and will become pertinent to the analysis of the selected artifacts of this study.

A literature review is meant to explain the research topic, build a rationale for the problem being studied, and provide a framework for analysis. The complexity of problems confronting the men who started the service organizations upon which this study focuses, and the complexity of human relations in general, necessitates a broad-scope approach to a review of literature that a simple survey of books and data related to voluntarism and service organizations cannot proffer. For this reason, the disciplines of

communication, economics, political science and history, philanthropic studies, sociology, and women's and gender studies were sourced for this literature review.

An overview of the origins of today's service clubs and a brief discussion of the Protestant Work Ethic serves as background for this literature review. Scholarly works surveyed are then reviewed thematically in order to address broader topics of the influence of the Protestant Work Ethic. These themes include the building, use, and implications of social capital and social network formation; benefits and disadvantages of homogeneity and diversity on group formation; and relationship between ideology, identity, and discourse. All of these will resurface throughout the study.

*Background: The Impetus for Today's Service Organizations*

In the early 1900s, fraternal organizations -sources of male camaraderie and places where a sense of masculinity could be reaffirmed- shifted due to religious, cultural, and economic pressures (Charles, 9-33). In real and symbolic ways, women were rejecting the social and political restraints that had been imposed upon them: corsets and other restrictive clothing of the Victorian Era were rejected and calls for suffrage became louder. Access to and the pursuit of higher education for middle class women was a real possibility (Charles, 20-26). The turn of the century saw women, particularly those from the new middle class, challenging traditional gender roles, becoming more active and vocal in the public sphere, especially through charitable organizations, and shunning the idea that home and family were the only environs with which they need be concerned (Charles, 20-26).

New possibilities for autonomy prompted women to seek out opportunities, in female spaces, to exercise power and influence in socially acceptable ways. Largely through church organizations and civic groups, women began to take on serious community challenges after the economic depression of the 1890's while their male counterparts were content to associate purely for the sake of socialization. Child labor, prohibition, and education were among the causes taken up by women (Charles, 24-29). As the collective voice of women and their influence grew, men lamented their changing position in society and noted the "embarrassingly ineffectual" nature of their fraternal brotherhoods (Charles, 24).

Fraternal organizations had a social and moral dilemma, for, as it is put in *Service Clubs in American Society*, "... mainstream Protestantism was urging social responsibility as part of a struggle to restore social harmony" (Charles, 24)...Social services could "serve not only as a remedy for social disruption but also as a grounding for a new [male] middle-class identity" (Charles, 24). What men needed was a way to regain face, a means to better secure economic stability and restrain worker unrest, as well as some reassurance that salvation was possible. Social and fraternal organizations needed to adapt and take on humanitarian efforts but in a way that would promote industriousness, thereby upholding the Protestant-Work-Ethic-meets-capitalism world view.

Stemming from Calvinism, the Protestant Work Ethic touts frugality, self-reliance, and hard work as righteous behaviors. Calvinism, as a religious philosophy, teaches that only a select and unknown group of people will receive salvation while others will be sentenced to damnation, irrespective of what they do in life. In fact, God is

seen as a strict father who must punish His unruly children. Further, material gain may be seen as evidence of one's moral superiority and favored status, and the have-nots may be viewed as damned and dismissed as morally inferior. As a purely philanthropic or humanitarian enterprise, community service undertaken by a fraternal organization would not make sense as it would run counter to the white, middle class cultural norms of the day thereby putting the purveyor of good works "at risk" of scrutiny by his peers. Good works in and of themselves were simply not relevant to life in general and helped neither the giver get into Heaven nor the recipient learn to work hard. In fact, good works could even be considered to be interference in God's plan, an unrighteous and presumptive attempt to alleviate a deserved punishment. Capitalism, with its emphasis on material gain and competition, only reinforced the Calvinist/Protestant perspective that work was a "calling" and that engaging in work signified morality and merit (Bellah et al, "Habits" 65-66; Weber 63-69, 102-121).

As the era's burgeoning capitalism saw great unrest between laborers and business, between the haves and have-nots, the Protestant Work Ethic explained, even excused, the growing gaps between the classes: someone who enjoyed material success was industrious and blessed. The person who struggled financially was not a hard worker. He was lazy. He was unruly. He was not right with God. In short, one's livelihood and one's value as a human became intertwined. In such a scenario, middle class men in particular could engage in humanitarian efforts in good conscience only if they became the shepherds of unruly children, if they, in effect, played the Father on earth who taught lesser men to be more Godly. By engaging in humanitarian efforts through fraternal/social groups turned business networking groups, the posture of

industriousness could be maintained, thus insulating group members from charges that their charity only enabled sloth. The Protestant Work Ethic, bolstered by the demands of capitalism, provided men of means or the potential for upward mobility to demonstrate their moral superiority, grow their personal wealth, and, importantly, gain social capital (Bellah et al, "The Good Society" 264-279).

### *Social Capital and the Economics of Social Capital*

Service organizations cannot be discussed without a discussion of "social capital." One definition of social capital is the "networks, norms, and social trust that facilitate coordination and cooperation for mutual benefits" (Putnam, 67). Chief among the benefits found in early service clubs were business networking. Most clubs, like Rotary and Kiwanis, originally mandated per-club quotas for business sector representation (Charles, 29). While these quotas generated a sense of exclusivity among members that was amplified by contrived value scarcity, thereby affording members' remarkable prestige, it is inadequate to limit the definition of social capital in such a way.

To fully understand social capital as a concept, the phrase must be disaggregated. "Social" has its roots in the Latin "socius" -friend- and "socialis" - allied ("Social"). Karl Marx well understood the bonding that naturally takes place between like-minded individuals or those who find themselves in the same predicaments or facing similar life circumstances. Of the patriarchal relationship between masters and laborers in the Middle Ages, for example, Marx says, "...there was a real bond uniting the journeymen who worked for the same master, a bond separating them from journeymen who worked for other masters...the journeymen were bound to the existing order by their interest in

becoming masters themselves” (Marx, 135). That is, the journeymen defined their world -who is within and outside their group- through their association with their master but also imagined themselves becoming master. *Rethinking Imperialism: A Study of Capitalist Rule* asserts, "...since the eclipse of colonialism, capitalist social formations to varying degrees, depending on their strength, have developed other (non-colonial) forms of (economic, political or/and ideological) expansionism" (Milios and Sotiropoulos, 101). The journeyman who embraces such hegemony perpetuates his own subjugated status and reinforces social inequity by recognizing the institutionalized importance of being "master," all the while buying in to the belief that there could not only be an equal playing field for him, but that he might also be able to experience upward social mobility.

Social theorist Pierre Bourdieu sees one's ability to move up the social ladder as intrinsically tied to the reputation of an actor's social networks (Bourdieu, 10). A social network that is most congruent with and reflective of a society's dominant ideologies often yields higher social capital simply through network association (Bourdieu, 10). However, since social capital is comprised of a group's assets, to include influence, trust, knowledge, power, and reciprocity, individuals must also contribute to the collective assets of a group to ensure individual social capital (Bourdieu, 10-11). In this way, social capital is as much a group commodity as a personal one in producing opportunities for upward social mobility.

Bourdieu suggests that access to a social network is often the result of "cultural capital," or the class or social status into which one is born and that produces benefits, such as travel or access to higher quality education, which he calls "objectified capital" (3-9). He asserts that the benefits of objectified capital are proportionate to how well that

objectified capital is leveraged (9). This assumes that the "wielders" of objectified capital have the same opportunities of access to social networks and, therefore, ignores the differences between those in positions of privilege and those in subordinated positions. Such an assertion presumes, for example, that a boy and a girl of equal class and status will have equal treatment in terms of education or that a man and women of equal class and status will have the same access to social networks and be treated equally within those networks.

Bourdieu's treatment of the actors of a social network as homogenous is in contrast to Gramsci's view on society. Gramsci saw society as a locus for power and control, which could be exercised through force or hegemonic ideology (Stoddart, 200-203). In the Gramscian view, there are always ever-narrowing power stratum naturally comprised of power wielders and subordinates, even within a social class or stratification (Stoddart, 200-203). Given Gramsci's perspective, some are inevitably disadvantaged in their ability to fully capitalize on their social networks or may simply belong to weak social networks with little social capital.

While Putnam does not speak about the inequities within an otherwise strong social network, he does address social networks that have high bonding but little or no bridging social capital ("Bowling" 22, 363). In his estimation, bridging social capital is the missing component that will help those from lower socio-economic classes with social mobility, enfranchisement, and economic stability. For Putnam, bridging social capital is, ideally, inclusive; bonding social capital is exclusive. Bridging social capital is that which ties people from disparate social networks together. By contrast, bonding social capital is that which ties people within a social network together by creating an in-

group/out-group schema for members (Putnam, "Bowling" 22-23). Accordingly, "bridging social capital can generate broader identities and reciprocity, whereas bonding social capital bolsters our narrower selves" (Putnam, "Bowling" 22-23).

Putnam maintains that there are positive and negative aspects of either type of social capital beyond inclusivity and exclusivity. Benefits include mutual support, cooperation, trust and relationship building, and institutional effectiveness. The negative aspects include factionalism, the perpetuation of power by the upper classes, and the co-option of the lower classes in promulgating the status quo to the detriment of realizing their collective power (Putnam, "Bowling" 350-363). This is supported, in part, by citation of the Roper Social and Political Trends survey which ties community "participation and extremism" in beliefs systems (Putnam, "Bowling" 340-341).

In Putnam's estimation, while bonding social capital is the most common to service organizations, bridging social capital is what is most needed to regenerate the American community through the revival of its voluntary associations and to enfranchise those who have weaker social networks. It is clear, therefore, that investing in efforts to create bridging social capital is not beneficial just for the disenfranchised; it is also necessary to preserve service clubs and to further a larger, societal understanding of democratic processes.

Just as Putnam reflects on the functionality of capital and its types, so too does Bourdieu, who, in "The Forms of Capital," posits that there are three types of capital - cultural, social, and economic. To him, the capital generated by formal social networks is always a transaction of economy and an economic transaction (1-2). Although cultural and social capital do not necessarily produce a tangible profit that can be assigned a



dollar value, although this sometimes happens, they nonetheless produce a profit through the "multiplier effect" to both the bearer of the capital and the group to which he or she belongs (10-11). Social and cultural capital compounded through social networks of people with equal or better-than-one's-own social and cultural capital amplifies the capital of the group and of the individuals within that group.

Because all three forms of capital are focused on resources -on who has them, who can earn or access them, and who can best leverage them- Bourdieu's idea of "profit" takes on new importance when there is a less-than-equitable distribution of capital, particularly cultural and social capital. That is to say, it is in the absence of capital that the value of capital is found. He says, "...any given cultural competence (e.g. being able to read in a world of illiterates) derives a scarcity value from its position in the distribution of cultural capital and yields profits of distinction for its owner" (6). He goes on to argue that profits are "mediated by the relationship of (objective and/or subjective) competition" between the possessors of capital who are competing for the same goods in which scarcity -and social value-is generated" (6-7). The by-invitation joining practices of service organizations give the perception of scarcity, that there are only so many open spots in a prestigious organization, which raises their cultural value. As well, this marketed exclusivity tells the initiate that he or she is part of a select in-group and therefore is privy to a higher rung of social capital on which he or she can draw to boost personal social capital and gain greater social mobility. The institutionalized relationship to which Marx referred when speaking of the master and journeyman is still apparent through service clubs, and by securing the social capital of an exclusive network, opportunities for social mobility are increased. In turn, both the new social sphere and

the gains made within that sphere hold the promise of adding something to the life of the member, be it helping the member to be perceived as more worthy than he would normally be regarded as an unconnected individual or by validating both his existence and his right to consume, equated to the ability to call upon the credentials of a social network for personal gain.

It is appropriate that the word "capital" is associated with the phrase "social capital" since prestige and social mobility have economic ramifications. Just as capital in the monetary sense can be invested to yield more wealth; advantageous social connections yield other, equally advantageous connections; and reputation builds reputation (Lin, 4). According to Wilson and Musick, "Social connections provide the resources—information, pooled labor, trust—that make volunteering more likely" (699). The more one participates in the activities of a service club, the deeper and more ample one's relationships. The collective of those relationships become social networks, and it is through these networks that social capital continues to be built and wielded. Key, here, is the idea of a "network," which implies that building social capital is not a linear process, but rather the formation of an intricate web of reputation, reciprocity, and trust. Thus, social capital is an investment, a commodity, and a product (Lin, 4; Marx, 433).

The economic view of social capital is a simply-explained but no-so- neatly-addressed issue. Just as it "takes money to make money," as the cliché goes, it takes social capital to yield social capital. Those who have been traditionally absent from the membership rosters of service organizations tend to represent those whose social capital is regarded as non-existent or irrelevant to service organizations. Thus, either consciously, as in the historical decision to exclude women and minorities from

membership, or subconsciously through every day practices, service organizations perpetuate and normalize the homogeneity that is contributing to their wholesale demise.

*The Difficulties of Homogeneity and Diversity*

Clearly, group formation and social cohesion are more organic processes when group members share common interests, values, and world views. In *Better Together: Restoring the American Community*, authors Robert Putnam and Lewis Feldstein insist that sharing a "reservoir of cultural referents" is central for group cohesion (279). People naturally gravitate toward those who reinforce the rightness of their position (Putnam, "Better Together" 341). In terms of service organizations, people tend to very often "invite" people who already share, at least in part, their world view (312). When an invitee agrees to join, he or she indicates his or her adoption of "at least implicitly, a set of values" (Putnam, "Better Together" 389). Thus, membership in service organizations remains relatively ideologically homogenous (Putnam, "Better Together" 341).

As Bourdieu points out, as group members bond, each member becomes a guardian of the group's boundaries, constituted by its norms, practices, ideology, and way of existing within and relating to the larger society (11-12). When dominant group ideology is adopted and replicated, hegemonic power is asserted, accepted, and reified. Tocqueville, in *American Democracy*, makes a pertinent observation to support the idea of a service organization as a "dominant group" reflecting and reinforcing the cultural capital produced by hegemonic ideology. He asserts that the average man may not care about or even understand how his own life and that of the State are intertwined. However, by involving himself with local matters, he not only begins to understand his

place in a bigger schema, but also replicates that schema in his own community (91). With their bureaucracies, hierarchies, and political structures and practices, service organizations very much mirror dominant, white, middle class norms and, like society at large, those who are best equipped to access and leverage cultural, social, and economic capital comprise the typical membership (Putnam, "Bowling" 340-341; Stoddart, 204). Given Tocqueville's opinion, the inability of service organizations to cultivate a more diverse membership has implications for society as whole as well; avenues that can help the disenfranchised become franchised, that can help bring about a better understanding of political action and democratic processes to younger generations, remain closed to those outside the circle of privilege.

The hegemony reflected in and promulgated by a service organization's ideology and daily practices has critical implications for communities. First, white middle class ideology and institutions are normalized and normalizing. The relative homogeneity of membership creates the illusion of egalitarianism (Putnam, "Bowling" 341; Stoddart 208). That illusion is preserved by avoiding or eliminating dissenting voices, engaging in activities and practices that reinforce the "rightness" of the group's position, and reaffirming group identity and exclusivity (Stoddart, 205; Drayton and Prins, 116; Bourdieu, 9-10). The result is an institutional manifestation of power that represents a kind of cultural expansionism that demands that subordinated classes, in order to gain access to the social networks, social capital, and potential upward social mobility found in institutions and associations, conform to marginalizing ideologies and hegemonic powers (Stoddart, 213-216). Putnam inadvertently invokes this very strategy when he assumes that bridging social capital can eliminate the war between "liberty and tolerance"

(Putnam, "Bowling" 351). Putnam, rightly, believes that bridging social capital, forged with a place-based social network, has the power to unite a diverse array of individuals and, more importantly, rejuvenate civic engagement.

Problematically, though, he presents no strategies to help eliminate homogeneity nor to quell the reach of hegemonic ideologies. Putnam clearly defines social capital by the framework of a patriarchal ideology, believing that social capital is at its best and most effective when it occurs vis à vis formal social networks, defined through the lens of white middle-class values, mores, and institutions such as service clubs, parent-teacher organizations, and professional groups. This is not to say that Putnam does not recognize or validate informal social networks or the social capital that is built within them (Putnam, "Bowling" 320-325). However, he believes these informal social networks have a tendency to be weaker than formal networks and weaker still when constructed by those who "need them the most" - the poor, minorities, the un- or under-educated, or any combination of the three (Putnam, "Bowling" 321). Rather than decrying the systems and institutions that naturally limit the voice and influence of the disenfranchised or under-represented, Putnam advocates for the disenfranchised and under-represented to conform to and operate within the existing hegemonic framework of American society which has already excluded and marginalized some while lifting others up (Putnam, "Bowling" 360-363).

Salter contends that the "pervasive and unmarked nature of colonial whiteness continues to shape contemporary praxis" and that "reflecting on white support, consideration of individual (white) agency requires engagement with structural and hegemonic assumptions central to whiteness" (Salter, 91). So, while Putnam recognizes

that hegemony in groups is problematic and that bridging social capital can provide a method to increased civic engagement, he neglects to address, or even recognize his own, (white) world view that neglects to challenge the causes of homogeneity and the hegemonic ideologies of institutions.

Salter's statement on praxis is relevant here because the community involvement practices of service organizations are a form of cultural expansionism. This is not to say that service organizations do not conduct altruistic outreach. However, it is to challenge the hegemonic ideology that guides their altruism.

Cultural expansionism has two important implications for service clubs. First, when those from traditionally under-represented groups join, it fosters a false conception of the reality of diversity within a club or organization. Secondly, it reinforces group ideology, which often translates into a neo-colonial approach to membership diversity efforts and community service projects. One hallmark of a neo-colonial attitude, particularly toward service, is the idea that the person engaging in some altruistic service has the power and the answers; those receiving the services become "object lessons" for the altruistic (Stewart). Helping others often involves the giver of help deciding what the receiver needs, and it is in the giving of help that the giver realizes his or her calling, becomes grateful for what he or she has, or becomes emboldened to "fix" people. In Kiwanis, this is known as a "Kiwanis moment," and it marks the experience that makes it possible for someone transcend from member to "Kiwanian." The moment and experience is fixed for the service club member exclusive of the recipient of help.

To grow, service organizations must actively reject obsequiousness to the operational, ideological, and linguistic status quo as homage to tradition. The overt and

covert exclusion of the traditionally under-represented and community engagement that resembles cultural colonization must prompt service organizations to ask themselves not *how* to recruit and retain a more diverse membership but rather *why* people who do not fit the typical membership profile would want to join.

The benefits of strong social networks that yield high bridging social capital for the sake of access to opportunities for upward mobility have been presented as one possible explanation for joining, even for those from among an under-represented group; but Laclau and Mouffe present another possibility. They consider hegemonic power to be the conveyor of political will that is given form through discourse (Stoddart, 206-208); and, of course, it is on the ideological hegemony found in the selected artifacts that this study's analysis will concentrate. For them, we do not define ourselves by class but through the construction of a "collective political identity" in an effort to "create relations of 'equivalence' between subject positions" (Stoddart, 207). Each of us is born into existing discourses and discursive processes and have only the discourses and discursive processes we come to know with which to comprehend and articulate our existence and frame reality (Stoddart, 206-208). In a sense, acceptance and emulation of dominant discourse and discursive processes can provide a type of alignment with the dominant ideology and a simultaneous, a perceived shirking of the subject position (Stoddart, 207, 214).

Fanon considers this kind of action by the marginalized to be a typical reaction to colonization. While the dominant class is "valorized" and its cultural hegemony normalized, the subject position of the marginalized is reinforced at many levels to the extent that association with the dominant class becomes a way to reassert worthiness

(Stoddart, 214). In Fanon's argument, Marx's concept of the journeyman who seeks to be master is again evident.

Laclau and Mouffe, Gramsci, and Foucault all acknowledge that the existence of dominant discourses and discursive processes have the ability to create counter-movements steeped in a heightened awareness and embrace of the subject position (Stoddart, 206-210). Approaching the interplay of hegemony, identity, and discourse with a Gramscian framework, Laclau and Mouffe assert that opportunities to resist the dominant will and to build oppositional identities equally and always exist (Stoddart, 206- 208). So, while some members of subject groups may join service organizations, the inability of these organizations to diversify membership on a grand scale cannot simply be explained by cultural norms that support relative homogeneity (Putnam, 312). The idea that the lack of diversity may also be explained as a conscious, or even organic, reaction to the custom of exclusionary practices and attitudes of these service organizations is worth considering.

Since the 1980's, "otherness" has become a rallying point for the disenfranchised and sparked or even renewed a sense of group identity and shared fate and constructed a platform for connectedness between groups (Krznaric, 13, 27). Service organizations have discouraged or officially prohibited women, minorities, and the otherwise under-represented throughout their histories; and, as the artifacts will demonstrate, have "othered," regarded, and continue to regard them as "object lessons" in service projects. As a result, excluded groups may have now moved past their desire, if it ever really existed, to be co-opted into service organizations, preferring to create their own power centers and social networks and redefine social capital in more culturally relevant terms.



The lack of diversity poses real-world issues that are not easily solved for service organizations. On one hand, the creation of discursive materials requires the trust, cooperation, a shared identity that is forged through bonding social capital (Adler and Kwon, 32). In *The Good Society*, Bellah et al contend that writing is now nearly always the product of discursive communities (171).

This holds true for Kiwanis, where discursive materials and products are created by a consensus between employees and board committees and, sometimes, select membership representatives. Together, they settle on the "Kiwanis story" they wish to tell. However, discourse is often functions ideologically and is mobilized to reinforce systems of power and authority. Because the creators of Kiwanis' discursive material subscribe to the same ideological foundations and rely on bonding social capital to reach agreement about the creation of discursive materials and products, they also eliminate the "kind of public discourse and deliberation that is conducive to democratic citizenship (Guttman qtd. in "Bowling," Putnam, 171). In a world where there is competition for membership, where the social capital found in membership translates to economic capital through membership dues, and membership growth depends on reaching traditionally under-represented audiences, market forces compel service organizations to undertake survival strategies that rely less on bonding social capital and more on bridging social capital (Adler and Kwon, 32). More importantly, service organizations must recognize their place in American society and put into practice the egalitarian ideals that they have long espoused. Such a task can be accomplished only by critically examining and understanding the messages they send and the practices those messages foster.

### *Identity, Ideology, and Discourse*

Service organizations must, but have yet to, pay attention to ideology. In "Ideology: A Multidisciplinary Approach," Teun van Dijk contends that ideology is the foundation of social cognition, influencing "values, attitudes, opinions, knowledge, and mental models of events" (12). As well, ideology is always evaluative (49). That is, the acceptance of an ideology is always done at the cost of rejecting another because ideology represents the "problems and conflict of interests of -or between- social groups" (67). Additionally, ideologies prescribe how people should view and interact with the world on the basis of "social identity" (67-68, 71). van Dijk asserts that there are always discursive demonstrations of ideologies, and that discursive manifestations shape and reflect social contexts, such as how institutions are formed and function, group formation and in-group/out-group relations, and other "micro" and "macro" reproductions of society (12). In this way, ideology, discursive materials, and the social context and implications of each are mutually constitutive but also mutually reflexive (14). In short, service organizations mimic, normalize, and mirror the systems of privilege and oppression and class and status structuration of society at large through their words and practices.

Organizations, aided by communications, depend on their ability to create and maintain legitimacy in order to preserve an audience. Given this, it is not a radical notion to propose that positions of privilege shape not just discourse and knowledge, but also the regulation of both (Adler and Kwon, 33; Darder et al, eds., 63). In *The Good Society*, Richard Ohmann is cited as arguing that modern rhetoric has forsaken persuasion as a primary strategy to reach an audience in lieu of a more conversational, informal style that "lowers the barriers between speaker or writer and audience" (Bellah et al 171). This

approach allows authors or speakers and their audiences to co-create an agreed-upon reality that has the ability to obfuscate yet legitimate hegemonic ideologies.

Related to this, van Dijk says that ideology is consistently related to "(false) consciousness, truth and falsity, common sense and (in) consistency" (12). So, while the language of discursive material may have become less formal it still draws on the language of privilege where white middle class norms and values act as referents. This position is congruent with van Dijk's; van Dijk maintains that the inevitable and constant existence of ideology always raises questions of power and elitism, domination and resistance, and the construction and role of institutions and groups on each other and on community (12-13). By van Dijk's argument, discursive materials naturally always create ideologies, present ideological positions, and oppositional ideologies.

In part, ideology and discursive materials are so intertwined because language is a primary tool with which we make sense of and explain the world around us and with which beliefs are interpreted and articulated (van Dijk, 23-30). Ideology not only represents "socially shared ideas," ideologies become normalized and reified when couched in the everyday language of rhetoric (van Dijk, 15, 13-18). However, van Dijk cautions against taking a "discursive reductionist" view of ideology and language, saying that there is a distinction between the expression of beliefs and beliefs themselves in any discourse (42). In short, practice and discourse may not always be in lock-step. Such a point of view can be seen in the discursive self-presentation of service clubs as models of egalitarianism but that nonetheless engage in exclusionary practices.

The dialectical difference between discourse and practice may be attributed to, at least in part, the gap that exists between the varying degrees of ideological beliefs held by

a group's individual members and institutional ideological production and products (van Dijk 40-45). To wit, individual members of a group, by becoming group members, demonstrate an acceptance of an organization's ideology; this acceptance is based on an individual's understanding and interpretation of that ideology. However, articulations and interpretations of ideology are influenced by our respective, corresponding identities and places in the social schema.

Foucault argues that identity exists largely because we have been convinced of the truth of that position through social processes (Stoddart, 204). The formation of identity, whether avowed or ascribed, is an inescapable reality for humans, and "class and status co-exist, in varying combinations as features in all societies"(Stoddart, 204). As a consequence, all people are subject to, and must acquiesce to, power and authority to varying degrees (Salter, 73; Scott, 4, 22; "Archaeology of Knowledge"). Language and language use, social practices, and "reality," including conceptions of identity and notions of socio cultural "commonsense," are all shaped by and help to shape discursive material and processes.

For van Dijk, it is impossible that institutions are not ideologically positioned because they are the vanguards of knowledge (49-50). He contends that knowledge "may be used, abused," applied "to control people," and to perpetuate the institution (50). Bourdieu contends that institutions have "performative magic," and are, therefore, pivotal in the interplay between hegemony, ideology, identity, reality, and discourse (11). He maintains that institutions establish self-serving parameters and provide the framework for the establishment of social networks whose purpose is to promulgate the institution itself. He argues that the creation of social networks is the "product of investment

strategies" that produces or reproduces social relationships (11). These relationships are meant to invoke both feelings of "durable obligations" or "institutionally guaranteed (rights)" so that there is an on-going reproduction of social capital and a sense that social capital should be constructed in a prescribed manner that best supports institutions (11-12). Social capital, he contends, is the "basis for the existence of the group," but it exists for the sake of eventually realizing economic capital (13). Like Adler and Kwon, he explains that various strategies must be used to create and maintain institutional legitimacy (Bourdieu, 15-17; Adler and Kwon, 33). Discourse is one such strategy (Stoddart, 193; van Dijk, 51-54).

In discussing the dissonance between post-structuralism and post-Marxist points of view, Stoddart points out that Foucault regards "discourse" as varying "systems of thought" to which people are repeatedly exposed in abundance (203). From Foucault's perspective, discourse is not simply related to written or spoken communications or patterns of ideas conveyed in myriad communications mechanisms, but also to who generates and regulates discourse (Stoddart 193-204). He contends that ideology can be used to gain power and control when it takes on discursive form (Stoddart, 204). The discursive materials of service organizations are reflective of a particular set of values and beliefs and, therefore, operate to reinforce the socio-cultural position of the organizations and function as hegemonic ideology. As Stoddart points out, "culture and knowledge are mobilized to reproduce social privilege and inequality" (222). The institutions and institutionalized practices of privileged groups legitimate and reify positions privilege and inequality through what Bourdieu dubs the "performative magic of the power of instituting..." (9). As the artifacts will demonstrate, ideologies are

enacted, performed, and repurposed for the sake of institutional self-perpetuation through the concrete practices of the clubs and new member recruitment, respectively.

### *Conclusion*

One of the challenges to this study is that research related to service organizations has largely focused on broad topics, such as their origins or the effects of social capital. To my knowledge, no research has been conducted on the discursive materials of service organizations for the sake understanding how ideology affects and is reflected in language, social practices, and the construction of reality and how this impedes membership recruitment efforts. Therefore, a wide variety of disciplines were required for this literature review.

To provide context for this study, this review began with an historical background for today's service organizations, tracing their evolution from fraternal brotherhoods to businessmen's networking groups and, finally, to service organizations that garnered and still garner membership mainly from among white, professional males. In this background information, care was taken to illustrate how changing gender dynamics and the growing influence of women's groups, because they were engaged in charitable works, provoked men to reassert their societal position and authority through service organizations that intentionally excluded women until the late 1980's when it finally became illegal to do so. This has implications for the analysis of the artifacts, which will illustrate the deep socio-cultural context for othering and marginalizing women that persists even today.

The background section also addressed the influence of the Protestant Work Ethic on service clubs for the purpose of explaining why fraternal brotherhoods and businessmen's networking groups were initially reluctant to engage in community service. However, capitalism demanded a new interpretation of the Protestant Work Ethic. In this interpretation, charitable works on a wide scale became acceptable because they helped to quell labor unrest, redirect the energies of the immigrants, and build the social capital, networking capacity, and social mobility of the altruistic. Implicit in the relationship of the Protestant Work Ethic and service clubs are ideologies of capitalism and moral traditionalism, both of which recur in the analysis of the artifacts.

The review of the literature itself was separated into three distinct thematic areas: social capital and the economics of social capital, difficulties with homogeneity and diversity, and ideology, identity, and discourse. The purpose of these sections was to illuminate how and why social capital and social networks are formed, to illustrate both the benefits and challenges of homogeneity, and to discuss how knowledge, power, and ideology shape and are shaped by discourse.

In "Social Capital and the Economics of Social Capital," the work of Putnam, Bourdieu, and Marx was cited extensively. This section dealt with the differing ways Putnam and Bourdieu distinguish social capital and its functions. Putnam regards social capital as the trust, reciprocity, and cooperation that binds a group of people or groups. Bourdieu, on the other hand, treats social capital as a bi-product of capitalism, asserting that cultural and social capital can be converted into economic capital. This section also raised a point of critique related to Bourdieu's disregard of the "isms" that exist, even within powerful social networks and which create inequities. The issue of social capital

and social networks have important implications for the analysis of the artifacts, which will be examined for their ability to use discourse to create a sense of in-group/out-group status and convey the promise of power and social mobility in order to recruit, retain, and rally members around institutional ideologies.

"The Difficulties of Homogeneity and Diversity" drew primarily on the work of Marx, Gramsci, and Laclau and Mouffe as presented by Mark Stoddart at the University of British Columbia, and again on Putnam. This section concentrated on positioning service organizations as a "dominant group" whose hierarchies, bureaucracies, and political workings mirror those of the larger society. This section also used ideological hegemony to explain the self-reinforcing nature of homogeneity and as a platform to discuss the illusion of egalitarianism that exists in service organizations. As well, this section addressed the ideas of cultural expansionism and neo-colonialism that underpin the recruitment efforts and service projects of service organizations.

This section also posited that perhaps the inability of clubs to realize diversity of any significance might be attributed to under-represented groups taking an ideologically oppositional position by creating their own culturally relevant organizations. Such acts can be a deliberate, like intentionally seeking out representative groups, or occur organically since people congregate with those who affirm their respective identity and world view. Lastly, this section critiqued Putnam's work in *Bowling Alone*. Putnam advocates bridging social capital to link groups and give the marginalized greater access to more beneficial social networks and build long-term social capital. The issues raised in this are two-fold: first, Putnam discounts the efficacy of informal social networks in applying patriarchal parameters to create a "good" social network. Secondly, he expects



that the marginalized will conform to, and be welcomed by, an already alienating system of practices.

The last section, "Identity, ideology, and Discourse," utilized the work of van Dijk, Foucault as presented by Stoddart, and Adler and Kwon to help explain how discourse shapes and is shaped by society, how discourse is influenced by power relations and carries with it ideologies, and how discourse can be used as a mechanism for social control. This section discussed the socio-cognitive function and naturally discriminatory and prescriptive nature of ideology. In other words, ideology shapes identity and one's understanding of how to operate within society; adoption of an ideology naturally creates in-groups and out-groups and dictates corresponding norms of behavior and attitudes for in-group members, especially toward out-group members. This section also addresses the relationship between ideology and discourse, legitimated through institutions, as a mechanism for perpetuating yet obscuring inequities.

This review of literature was intended to untangle the major elements involved in the confluence of ideology, institution, and discourse in order to provide a theoretical framework for the ideological rhetorical analysis of the artifacts. For nearly 100 years, the ideologies of Kiwanis have persisted in the organization's discursive materials without question. Of ideology, van Dijk says, "Ideologies have often been declared really influential if nobody notices them, and if they define common sense" (50). This is the case with Kiwanis.

Even now, with membership numbers dwindling and the need to reach more diverse audiences becoming more intense, the ideological underpinnings of the organization's discursive materials and the corresponding implications for membership

recruitment have not been studied. Rather, the strategy for addressing the membership issues has been to modernize jargon, to speak the language of diversity but neglect institutional practices toward that end, and to refine public relations spin. It is a crucial time to examine the ideologies promoted in Kiwanis' discursive materials in order that organization either embark on a systematic and long-term effort toward culture change that is reflected in new ideologies, adjust its membership diversity goals to be more congruent with the inclusive or exclusive messages communicated in discursive materials, or seek new ways of communicating how the existing ideologies are applicable to traditionally under-represented audiences.

### **Chapter III: Methodology**

#### *Introduction*

This thesis will employ an ideological rhetorical analysis, applying Marxist and Feminist lenses, to conduct an analysis of the artifacts "The Objects of Kiwanis," "The Man Who Was God," which is the prologue to *The Men Who Wear the K*, and the 2012 membership marketing brochure. These artifacts were selected because they represent three distinct points in the Kiwanis timeline: shortly after organizational inception, when issues of organization structures, practices, and ideologies that influence group formation and social identity were just beginning to arise; the beginning of a steady and persistent membership decline; and present-day, when membership is in the depth of a thirty-year low. The documents generated from these strategic points will demonstrate the deeply ingrained nature of the organization's ideologies and provide provocative points of analysis and comparison.

van Dijk asserts that ideology manifests in both discourse and actions (132). The ideological rhetorical approach was chosen as the tool for analyzing the selected artifacts because, above all, this study is concerned with the underlying and pervasive evaluative beliefs of Kiwanis International that become manifest in its discursive practices and, more concretely, its publications. Issues of group formation, hegemony, power, and authority are central to the ideological analysis. Kiwanis International, on an organizational (macro) level and at the club/member (micro) level, is structured around positions of racial, ethnic, socio-economic, linguistic, gender, sexual orientation/sexual identity, and religious privilege, and so mimics the hegemonic power centers and

dominant ideologies of society at large. In turn, the products and practices of the organization reflect these positions of privilege and alienate potential members at a time when membership numbers are critical for the financial stability and future of the organization.

Though the analyses of this study concentrate solely on artifacts from Kiwanis International, background information about the rise of modern service organizations is provided in the prologue to give historical and socio-cultural context to the artifact analysis. A rhetorical analysis is a qualitative research method. In accordance with the standards of such a method, this study will rely on scholarly research to support observations made in the analyses.

This study also draws on a demographic and other statistical data and reports as appropriate. The demographic data is from the 2014 membership survey that was sent randomly via email to nearly 37,000 English-speaking Kiwanis members residing in North America. 2,151 complete or partial responses were received through email, phone, or the web-based tool Survey Monkey. Questions were compiled and approved by a committee of the Board of Directors, all of whom are volunteers. The survey was administered by Kiwanis International staff with the approval of the organization's Executive Director. Respondents were given 90 days to submit their answers by phone or email. Additional sourced material includes, but is not limited to, the 2013-2014 Kiwanis International Annual Report, regional membership growth reports, and historical membership reports. These data inform Kiwanis' ongoing membership campaign, discussed in the Rationale section of Chapter One. Additional materials include strategic plans, campaign educational materials, and the Kiwanis International bylaws.

## *Rhetorical Approaches*

### *Ideological Criticism*

Ideology is a system of beliefs, ideals, attitudes, and values of groups of people. As such, they influence how they reaction to and with others and the world around them (Foss, 209). Karl Marx regarded ideology to be the link the between philosophy and reality, a link that obscures, distracts from, or completely reinterprets history (Marx, 106, 107). Marx believed that ideology is often generated by the dominant class and that, without careful examination, is relatively unrecognizable because ways of being and interacting are obfuscated, normalized, and legitimated (Marx, 105-117). In his estimation, ideology is the essence around which a group organizes itself to determine its collective course of action and the distribution of resources. Ideology helps groups determine their norms and values and what norms and values are to be imposed on others (Marx, 105-117). In this way, ideology becomes a shared social experience, the essence of which becomes evident in a group's language, practices, and inclusion or exclusion of individuals.

According to *The Encyclopedia of Communication Theory*, ideology is a "belief/value system that functions to maintain or challenge the existing order" (Littlejohn and Foss, A-I, 496). Multiple ideologies can exist within the same context. In other words, a single rhetorical artifact may contain several ideologies at once (Foss, 210). Given these definitions, parameters, and functions of ideology, ideological criticism is an apropos analytical approach for rhetorical artifacts from Kiwanis International. These artifacts not only reveal a variety of ideologies, those ideologies serve to create a view of Kiwanis that is not necessarily reflected in the reality of the

world at large. Additionally, those ideologies reflect, normalize, and perpetuate relationships of dominance and subordination between Kiwanis members and out-group members.

### *Marxist Criticism*

Because Marxism deals with economic, political, institutional, and social influences on class and status, it offers a logical theoretical perspective for this study (Foss, 211-212). Marxist criticism is as concerned with the social activities of capitalist systems and how and where institutions function to reinforce, defend, and renew the status quo as much as it is with the capitalist/labor dynamic (Foss, 212). An "institution" is a significant practice, place, or thing that is embedded in a culture. As the historical background of the prologue shows, service organizations are certainly institutions in the American society: Kiwanis is among the nation's three preeminent service organizations, alongside Rotary International and Lions International. "Preeminence" is based on years in existence, membership numbers, revenue generated, and the prestige of organizational partners. Additionally, civic engagement through organized delivery systems is a very "American" approach that combines altruism and self-interest and provides a means for the common person to understand and take action in community affairs. In this regard Tocqueville argued that civic associations engage people in political affairs. Because of this, civic associations represent democracy realized (Tocqueville, 2: 72-76). The application of Marxist criticism to Kiwanis' discursive materials offers a practical means for understanding the socio-political posture of Kiwanis as an institution. Because of the organization's deep capitalist roots steeped in the Protestant Work Ethic, and because the

current membership dilemma is, ultimately, a problem of economics, a Marxist lens makes additional sense as issues of group formation, social capital, class and status, and power, authority, and resistance are explored through the artifacts.

The concepts of "capitalist" and "labor" will figure prominently in the analysis, and the reader is encouraged to think of these words as political and socio-economic conceptions rather than confining classifications. The intent of thinking about these terms more broadly is to educe a greater understanding of not just the impact of privileged positions, but also of the shifting nature of positions of privilege: the principle of scarcity says that value is found in absence. That is, a *thing* becomes more valuable when it is available to fewer people; and, even within circles of privilege, there are stratifications of privilege. These stratifications change based on the locus of power and perceptions of exclusivity. In relating the capitalist/labor perspective to the artifacts, parallels will be drawn between Kiwanis officers and officials and "capitalists," general Kiwanis club members and "labor," "scarcity" as exclusivity, and "capital" and social capital as a values assets and "commodities."

### *Feminist Criticism*

As a broad perspective, feminist criticism assumes that men and women have differing access to power and that displays of power for each are prescribed by societal norms and, therefore, expectedly distinct; these differences affect communication and the interpreted meaning of communications (Littlejohn and Foss, 1: 395). Feminist criticism nearly universally explores the oppression and marginalization of women and the normalized male point of view in patriarchal societies in order to expose the inequities

innate in patriarchy in hopes of promoting gender equality. Consequently, feminist criticism may center on debating interpretations and manifestations of “feminism,” seeking to determine how a text might “constrain and/or enable women,” or highlighting the ways in which the value's system and morays of dominant group(s) exclude, subjugate, or objectify women (Brizee and Tompkins). This study is concerned with understanding the ways in which the selected artifacts illustrate the ways in which it is a matter of cultural practice to exclude, devalue, and “other” women while upholding the male point of view as the constant, normalized operational framework of the organization. It is important to note that a feminist lens is applied for the sake of understanding and articulating cultural norms, not for reviewing individual circumstances. Conclusions about the general regard for women that is demonstrated through the artifacts should not be taken as a statement about the beliefs and habits of individual men nor about the positions of individual women in Kiwanis.

Given that a United States Supreme Court order in the late 1980's forced the admittance of women into service organizations, that there is such an imbalanced male-to- female ratio in the membership rosters, and that membership diversity is a pressing issue for Kiwanis, feminist criticism presents a practical perspective from which to understand how the organization's discursive materials affect the recruitment of women that address many, often opposing, ideologies, this study will reflect the theories of Liberal Feminism and Socialist Feminism. Liberal Feminism takes the view that all people are created equally and should be treated accordingly. However, Liberal Feminism also supports the notion that gender socialization subjugates women and keeps men in positions of power to create the rules, legislation, and social norms that restrict



women, thereby perpetuating patriarchy. Liberal feminists, therefore, support legislation and political action that challenges patriarchy and moves women toward a state of being and functioning with the same liberties and latitudes of men (Johnson).

According to Littlejohn and Foss, feminist rhetorical criticism can function independently or be coupled with other critical methods (1:395). Because a Marxist perspective is also being utilized in this study, the Socialist Feminist view point will also help to frame the analysis and findings. It should be made clear, however, that this study will not rely on a pure Marxist-Feminist perspective. In this light, some important distinctions between the approaches should be made. Then, terms should be defined. Lastly, a rationale for Social Feminism as an approach needs to be provided.

Socialist Feminism contends that class structure and gender oppression targeting the socially ascribed role of "woman" are correlated. Socialist Feminism regards the work of women as under-rated, unappreciated, and under-valued because it has traditionally occurred outside the realm of production and been relegated to domestic spheres. This way of existing has been normalized over eons, but in the United States became particularly legitimated through the Fordist Model of Production. This model is relevant to this study for two reasons. First, from family life to education, the Fordist Model permeated all aspects of American life beyond work. For example, the Fordist Model, demanded that employees adhere to a traditional family structure, comprised of a paid working man and a stay-at-home wife (Weeks, 63-65). The adoption of the Fordist Model further cemented gender roles in society through economics as a family's livelihood could very well depend on compliance with imposed gender norms. Secondly, in psychological terms, the Fordist Model equated production to the right to consume and

even levied the expectation of consumption (Weeks, 88-89). Those who produce are entitled to consume. This entitlement elevates the "producer"- man- over the "non-producer" - woman. Thus, if women are not producers, their domestic work has little value and their right to consume is limited, even regulated by men (Weeks, 48-65). In a society influenced by the Protestant Work Ethic and Calvinism, paid work equates to identity and individual worth. Work deemed to have little social value results in a "worker" of questionable identity and certainly little worth. Power, therefore, is concentrated and remains in the hands of the producers and those who control the means of production.

It should be clear from the explanations of Socialist Feminism and Marxism that the two are connected in the view that capitalism and capitalist structures are oppressive agents and creators of class oppression. However, Socialist Feminist criticism, unlike Marxist criticism, is concerned specifically with the impact of capitalism and capitalist structures on women. Socialist Feminist criticism regards womanhood as a cultural identifier that cuts across and underscores all other cultural identifiers, such as race/ethnicity, sexual orientation, religion, socio-economic status, or education. In this way, Marx's ideas on labor and the laboring class will be stretched in this study by regarding women as a figurative "laboring class." In other words, gender oppression is not just analogous to class oppression. It is a form of it.

An important distinction should be made at this point. Socialist Feminism, though it challenges capitalism and patriarchy, believes that men and women must work together to end class and gender oppression through political means, in part by putting an end to conceptions of class and gender ("Different Types of Feminist Theories").

Socialist Feminism seeks to create male allies with which to partner and to work inside existing systems and structures. Marxist-Feminist criticism also seeks to transfer the characteristics of labor and laboring class to women; and, like Socialist Feminism, Marxist Feminism seeks to overturn the oppressive agents of class and gender. However, unlike Socialist Feminism, Marxist-Feminism sees capitalism as such an oppressive force in the lives of women that it needs to be eradicated. Additionally, Marxist-Feminism posits that there are levels of gender oppression tied with capitalism that are influenced by economics, education, and colonization and that liberation of the most oppressed first will result in liberation for the rest (Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy).

Marxist-Feminist criticism as a means of feminist criticism has been rejected as an approach for this study not as a personal statement of disagreement but rather for more pragmatic purposes. First, it is clear that by becoming part of a male-dominated organization, the women of Kiwanis intend to work alongside men, not to create their own female-dominated or female-exclusive spaces. Secondly, given the typical income Kiwanis members, per the demographic data, it can be surmised that female Kiwanis members benefit from capitalism, just as do their male counterparts, and would most likely have no interest in overthrowing capitalism or opting out of capitalistic ventures. Thirdly, there is no data available regarding the demographics of those affected by service projects, which means that the levels of disenfranchisement with which Marxist-Feminism concerns itself could only be left to speculation. Lastly, I believe it would be patronizing of me, given my own positions of privilege as a white, educated, middle class, heterosexual, gender-conforming, Christian, native-born American to speak on issues related to and for women of color or colonized women. The experiences of

women of color and colonized women are not my experiences and so, I cannot speak to them specifically from a first-person perspective. That is not to say these issues will not be discussed; they will, but in broad-sweeping terms and from the point of view that gender is the first unifier of women as marginalized people in a patriarchal, capitalist society. This tactic is much more compatible with and representative of Socialist Feminism.

### *Limitations and Other Considerations*

#### *Limitations*

Like any method of analysis, rhetorical ideological criticism has limitations. Perhaps one of its most significant limitations is that it is subjective. The interpretation of the significance of an ideology is never absolute. An ideological analysis requires identification of both presented and suggested elements. While the process for identification is systematized, a person's background and experiences will influence which elements are selected for analysis and what conclusions drawn about their meaning and impact.

Identifying and explaining presented and suggested elements, and the analysis of an artifact itself, are also subject to the consequences of being surrounded by and steeped in ideologies. In other words, ideology affects behavior and dictates what is accepted to be commonsensical. Therefore, the critique may be remiss in identifying important ideologies because those ideologies seem benign or irrelevant. Another limitation is that a single rhetorical artifact can contain several ideologies or even competing or conflicting ideologies; and these must be addressed.

Other limitations center on the lenses taken in this study. As related to feminist criticism, the most significant limitation, for me personally, has been described in recognizing my various positions of privilege. Turning to Marxism, this approach may be critiqued as being ideological. Secondly, Marxism is concerned with the interplay of economics, class struggle, and politics a full understanding of the economic, political, and socio-cultural conditions in which an artifact is constructed is vital for proper application of the approach. Information collected about the rhetorical situation of an artifact generated outside of recent memory is subject to modern or long-standing ideologies.

### *Considerations*

There are considerations related to this study that bear mentioning. First, I am a Kiwanis member, though I do not attend meetings for logistical reasons. Secondly, the demographic data and regional member reports cited were acquired in the course of my employment with Kiwanis for the purpose of developing strategies to help clubs reach membership goals. While these are not documents that are available to the public via the website, neither are they protected or confidential documents; and no directive, either implicit or explicit, was ever given to hold these documents in a protected status. I have never been asked to share the particulars of this thesis with my supervisors or colleagues who have, over the course of the past year, been aware that service organizations, membership challenges, and Kiwanis would be the focus of this study and that this study would be an ideological rhetorical analysis that applied Marxist and Feminist lenses to critique discursive material. As an aside, Kiwanis' financial information is available to the public due to the organization's 501(C) 3 status.

Thirdly, in January 2015, I voluntarily terminated my employment with Kiwanis, despite being offered incentives to remain with the organization. I left the position only to attend to family matters and in order to complete this study. My employment ended under good terms and with stellar performance reviews.

Lastly, my personal biases and their implications for this study should be addressed. As the data demonstrates, members largely classify themselves as politically conservative. I am far left-leaning politically. As well, I identify as Roman Catholic and subscribe to the concept of Liberation Theology. Liberation Theology regards Christianity as a social justice tool that is especially concerned with leveraging the Word as a means of advocating equality for the poor and otherwise disenfranchised. By contrast, most of Kiwanis' employees and members are Protestant. I am also generations younger than the typical member yet have an equivalent professional history and educational level.

The differences in world views between myself and the people whom I served in the capacity of my position prompted me to ask the research questions that ultimately led to undertaking this study. However, in recognition of the wide variance between my own political ideology and the shared political ideology of many of the organization's members, I chose to exclude meeting transcripts, committee meeting notes, and field notes used to fulfill the duties of my job from the research, writing, analysis, and editing phases of this study in an effort to remain as objective as possible and to provide high-quality scholarship. Two experiences related to how membership numbers are calculated were, however, cited in the "Rationale" portion of Chapter One in order to help illustrate the pressing nature of the membership recruitment issue.

### *Application of the Method*

A description of the selected artifacts was presented as a first step in applying ideological criticism. Additionally, a detailed description of the rhetorical situation for each artifact was presented. In accordance with the procedures for an ideological analysis as a qualitative research method, the presented elements were identified in each artifact (Foss, 209-220). These elements were then coded in order to identify suggested elements. Foss calls these the "ideas, references, themes, allusions, or concepts" that can be inferred in an artifact (216). The suggested elements were organized thematically to reveal the ideology or ideologies underpinning each artifact. Lists of the presented and suggested elements are not included in this study. Each artifact was then studied to determine the function of the ideology or ideologies. Stemming from Marxist theories of materialism, ideology is believed to operate largely on an unconscious level in support the status quo, as set by those with power (Littlejohn and Foss, 1:497). According to Althusser, an ideology incorporated into the psyche helps orient people to their "realities" (Littlejohn and Foss, 1:499). The analyses of the artifacts, therefore, focus on how the artifact functions for its intended audiences and what implications those functions have on in-group and out-group formation and, ultimately, membership recruitment efforts. The additional step of identifying over- arching ideologies between artifacts was also taken, the results of which are discussed in the "Findings" portion of Chapter 4.

### *Description of the Artifacts*

This study will analyze three artifacts specific to Kiwanis International: "The Objects of Kiwanis," the prologue to *The Men Who Wear the K*, written by long-time,

legendary Kiwanian L.A. "Larry" Hapgood, and a membership marketing brochure that was current in 2014 when research for this study began.

*Artifact 1: The Objects of Kiwanis*

The Objects of Kiwanis are arranged in order of import and are as follows:

- Object 1 - To give primacy to the human and spiritual rather than to the material values of life.
- Object 2 - To encourage the daily living of the Golden Rule in all human relationships.
- Object 3 - To promote the adoption and the application of higher social, business, and professional standards.
- Object 4 - To develop, by precept and example, a more intelligent, aggressive, and serviceable citizenship.
- Object 5 - To provide, through Kiwanis clubs, a practical means to form enduring friendships, to render altruistic service, and to build better communities.
- Object 6 - To cooperate in creating and maintaining that sound public opinion and high idealism which make possible the increase of righteousness, justice, patriotism, and goodwill.

These Objects can be found in a variety of locations ranging from club membership materials and websites to the Kiwanis International website and its membership brochure and other printed "collateral." Approved by delegates at the 1924 convention, the Objects are nearly always billed as "The Permanent Objects of Kiwanis" and are typically printed or otherwise referenced as a lot ("the Objects") unless there was a need to cite a specific Object in the course of making a point, the six Objects are seen by Kiwanians as a single - and singular -statement of identity.



### *Rhetorical Situation*

From the time that Kiwanis was conceived as an organization, there were struggles over the kind of organization it would be. One camp saw Kiwanis as a business networking group; and, indeed, this was the group's purpose at its inception (Hapgood, 9). As evidence, consider that Kiwanis, like Rotary, established quotas and limitations on representation from specific business sectors for club membership. As well, the name "Kiwanis" was originally touted as an "Indian" (Native American) word meaning, "We Trade" (Hapgood, 9). The other camp saw philanthropy as the prime directive of members at the most relevant point of social cohesion between them. The divide represented not just a clash among members about how they would relate to each other, but also how and to what extent they would relate to the community at large. The divide represented a great schism in group identity that had to be resolved in order for the organization to continue (Hapgood, 9-11). Fortunately for the organization, this critical matter of identity was settled quite early in the organization's development (ca.1915). Ultimately, the organization "emerged from the bickering and dissension into a service organization with a purpose" (Hapgood, 11). By 1920, the Kiwanis "We Trade" tagline was replaced with "We Build" to be more reflective of the organization's philanthropic aims ("History Outline").

By the time of the 1924-25 Denver Convention, Kiwanis had become an "international" organization with the launch of clubs in Canada. As the organization grew and expanded to other countries, it became apparent to organization leadership that businessmen agreeing to conduct good works under the unifying name of Kiwanis was not enough to help define and drive the organization forward. They had once again

reached a moment of needing to redefine their identity for the sake of social cohesion and the management of expectations. During the convention, International President Johnson articulated this position and urged members to rally around a set of values that would openly and unabashedly declare Kiwanis as a 'greater constructive force' in the 'affairs of today' (Hapgood, 77). This not to say that Kiwanis was without identity before the Objects. From 1917 to 1924, there were "regulations;" but as Hapgood points out, these dealt largely with administrative matters. Additionally, clubs and districts had already developed and operated through their own "objects," as in the case of the Providence club (Hapgood, 61-62). The Providence Objects are as follows (Hapgood, 62):

- Object 1: To standardize and disseminate Kiwanian principles of fair dealing and practices and observance of the Golden Rule.
- Object 2: To encourage, promote, and supervise the organization of Kiwanis clubs.
- Object 3: To study the work of existing clubs and their value to their respective members and communities, and to clear the information thus required for the benefit of all Kiwanis clubs
- Object 4: To promote the spirit of fraternalism among Kiwanians and among Kiwanis clubs.
- Object 5: To discuss and study the science of business building and promote cooperation between its members in the development of various lines they represent.
- Object 6: To promote and encourage the living of the Golden Rule in private, civic, and social and business life.

The Providence Objects worked operationally for other clubs and districts, and the organization itself for a time. However, by the 1924 Convention, issues with the Providence Objects were raised, and the revision process was undertaken (Hapgood, 66).

The Objects of Kiwanis submitted per that revision are as follows (Hapgood, 66):

- Object 1: To emphasize the spiritual rather than the material values in human relations.
- Object 2: To develop by precept and example the knowledge of a man's true relationship to his fellow man.

- Object 3: To encourage the living of the Golden Rule in private, social, business, and civic life as the fundamental basis of this relationship.
- Object 4: To promote the knowledge of more perfect business methods and standards to the end of the greater efficiency of the members, the added dignity to their various classifications, and the increased service to society.
- Object 5: To encourage, promote, and sponsor the organization of Kiwanis clubs, and to cooperate in the development of chartered Kiwanis clubs.
- Object 6: To cooperate, as far as possible with similar clubs, and with all individuals and organizations that are promoting human welfare and a high standard of citizenship.

The word "spiritual" became a source of great debate among members at the 1924 Denver Convention. Many wanted explicit language about Christianity while others shied away from specific theological references. In the end, "spiritual" remained as it was seen to be a more universal way of articulating the importance of good character and, therefore, more befitting of the organization's aims (Hapgood, 67). Since the Objects were revised and codified at the Convention, they have remained unaltered, even unto punctuation.

*Artifact 2: "The Man Who Was God"*

"The Man Who Was God" is a brief, two and a half-page story that serves as the centerpiece of the prologue of the book *The Men Who Wear the K* by L.A. "Larry" Hapgood. The story is a reprint of an account told by Roe Fulkerson, a founding Kiwanis member, that was originally published in 1935 in *The Kiwanis Magazine* in a section called "My Personal Pages," Fulkerson's regular column (Hapgood, "Prologue"). The story is presumably an authentic account, relayed to Fulkerson, by a past International president Carl Endicott about his own transformation from Kiwanis member to

“Kiwanian” through his “Kiwani moment.” In the organization, a “Kiwani moment” is an experience of profound transcendence experienced through community service that cements the member’s commitment to the organization and to engage in good works on behalf of the organization.

"The Man Who Was God" appears on pages x, xi, and xii of Hapgood's 1981 book. The characters acting in the story are male. This is confirmed at the midway point of the tale when each admits to the other “how much we loved our wives” (xi). Told through a dual-functioning narrator who is at both a character of the tale and omniscient the story centers on the narrator speaking with a new Kiwanis member who is going to the International convention for the first time. It opens with the line, "I know a fellow who once was God." The "fellow" is described as "big and fat" with "ash gullies across his stomach"(x).

As abruptly as the description starts, it stops, and the action-is reoriented from the "fellow" to explaining the "three occasions on which the tightest-lipped man opens up" (x). These are a long car ride, a fishing trip, and a hotel room "far from home" (x). The narrator says that when these opportunities arise, he likes to ask "men" what their conception of God is. The narrator notes how many people see God as a man with white hair who sits on a cloud. He states, "In general, they visualize Him as being like Michelangelo's statue of Moses on the tomb of Pope Julius II, San Pietro in Vincoli Rome" (x). The narrator then adds that the information was not drawn on from being cultured, but rather from an encyclopedia.

The narrator then begins to recount the tale of when the God question was asked of the "fellow." At this point, the omniscient narrator again takes over the story telling,

saying that the "fellow" cried while he relayed the encounter. Of his crying, the narrator declares to his audience, "I told you already that he is a big sissy" (xi). The narrator then recites quatrain XCIX from the Rubaiyat by Omar Khayyam (who is referred to as "Old Omar") (xi). This quatrain articulates the desire of its speaker to have the knowledge of God and to work alongside Him to realize a world more representative of the speaker's ideal, which, of course, coincides with God's.

The narrator then begins to recount the tale of when he asked the God question of the "fellow," revealed to be Carl Endicott only at the story's conclusion, while they were resting in a hotel room after travelling together. At this point, the narrator interrupts his retelling to describe the "fellow" once more. He notes that the fellow is so fat that he had to be put in the largest chair in the room. He smokes small cigars, or at least they appear small in his ample hands, so frequently that there is always a dusting of ash on his shirt (x). Finally, the narrator refocuses on the fellow's response to the God question. "I was, once;" he reveals. And so begins the narrator's second-hand account of the fellow's time that he was God (xi).

The story proceeds thusly: the "fellow" and his Kiwanis club members agreed to drive "underprivileged" kids to area hospitals and camps. One particular day, the fellow was having incredibly bad luck. Anything that could go wrong had gone wrong. So, when the call came from the club's secretary asking him to take "a crippled child" to the hospital the next day, he did not want to obligate himself. Despite his reluctance, the fellow obligates himself to take on the task (xi). The next day, upon reaching the "little house" where the child lived, the child's mother carried him out and put him in the car in the front seat, and "mumbled her thanks in tears" (xi). After driving a block or so, the

child asked the man if he was God. The fellow said that he was not. The child, however, insisted that the must be God, saying, "I heard mother praying beside my bed that God would help me get to the hospital so I can get well and play baseball and go swimming like other boys" (xi). After the fellow again assures the boy he is not God, the boy surmises the fellow must be working for Him. This is a designation that the fellow accepts, but adds the caveat that he is "only a part-time employee" (xi).

At this point, the omniscient narrator again takes over the story telling, saying that the fellow cried while he relayed the encounter. Of his crying, the narrator declares to his audience, "I told you already that he is a big sissy" (xi). Addressing his audience, he concludes that the "fellow," revealed to be Carl Endicott, will be immediately recognizable at the convention because of the narrator's vivid description. He adds that Endicott will probably hit him (the narrator) for retelling the story. "He may be a sissy about sentimental things, but he used to be a football player!" he exclaims (xii).

### *Rhetorical Situation*

"The Man Who Was God" is a particular passage from the prologue of the book, *The Men Who Wear the K* by L.A. "Larry" Hapgood. Hapgood is a long-time legendary Kiwanis member who became part of the International office's organizational staff in 1952. He would go on to become an Associate Secretary Emeritus of Kiwanis International (Hapgood). *Men Who Wear the K*, published in 1981 with a Kiwanis International copyright, chronicles the history of Kiwanis from the "ah-ha moment" in which it was conceived to 1981. The book contains a variety of pictures as well as quotations from official meetings, conventions, and correspondence. It is just over 237

pages (with the Preface, Prologue, Epilogue, and Appendices) that are separated into 25 chapters. These chapters are as follows:

1. A New Day in Detroit
2. Another Start in Cleveland
3. The First Convention and Beyond
4. Back to Detroit
5. Providence-An Early Turning Point
6. The Year Leading to Birmingham
7. The Breaking Point
8. Extending the Life of Kiwanis
9. Administrative Changes
10. A Continuing Battle Ends in Victory
11. Objectives and Committee Implementation
12. International Themes, Committee Projects, Major Emphasis Projects
13. Leadership Education
14. International Extension
15. A Periodical of Personality
16. Key Clubs
17. Circle K
18. The International Headquarters
19. The Kiwanis International Foundation
20. Service Club Leaders
21. The Reality of Change
22. Kiwanis and Organizational Relationships
23. Conventions
24. Kiwanis in Action
25. Looking to the Future

It should be noted that, when Hapgood's book was published, the admittance of women into the organization as official Kiwanis members had been a contentious issue; and the admittance of women had been repeatedly rejected by member vote. A Supreme Court decision ultimately forced male service organizations to accept women into their rosters (ca. 1985-1987) (Women in Kiwanis, "Workshop: 25 years of making a difference,").

*Artifact 3: "Join the Club" Club Membership Brochure*

The 2012 "Join the Club" Membership Brochure is an 8.5" x 11" trifold, full color, double-sided document. As such, a page by page description will occur in the following manner: (1) cover page, (2) cover page/internal, (3) back flap/external, (4) center panel/internal, (5) back flap/ internal, and (6) center panel/external.

(1) Cover Page:

The cover is divided into four distinct print areas. At the top, a wide, light blue band, edged with a narrow white band, displays the Kiwanis round logo. This logo is navy blue, surrounded by gold roped edging. In the center is the outline of a gold circle and inside this a white "K". Between the gold circle and the gold roped edge, on the navy blue background, appear the words "Kiwanis International," with "Kiwanis" following the top curve of the circular logo and "International" following the bottom curve of the circular logo. To the right of this (as one is looking at the brochure) appears the word "Kiwanis" in bold, navy blue type. Only the K is capitalized; however, the lower case "i" is as tall as the K. In the white band that stretches across the light blue banner is the website in grey lettering.

Below this, stretching across the width of the panel and taking up more than one third of it, is a picture of a white woman in her middle 30s with two white children who appear to be about seven and nine years of age, respectively. The woman has long, dark hair which is slightly unkempt. She wears a center part and keeps a bit of her hair tucked behind an ear. Only portions of her hands are visible and it is unclear if she wears a wedding ring. She is shown from the hips up and is slightly bent over to show something to the children. The girl standing beside her has long, dishwater blonde hair that is pulled



off of her forehead by a black and white polka dotted headband. She is wearing a black and white polka dotted sun dress that is trimmed in white. She is shown from the hips up. To the other side of her stands the little boy. He has dark, close-cropped hair and wears a blue, green, and white plaid shirt. He is shown from the mid-torso up. The background of the picture is blurred for effect, making the image of the three people more prominent and attention-grabbing. The trio is standing in tall grass, investigating something in nature. It can be concluded that, since she controls the object being examined, the adult woman is leading the investigation.

Below this and to the left, stretching over just half the width the brochure panel and approximately three inches tall is the picture of eight people in a conference room sitting around a table. One person is cut out of the frame, but the arm is visible. The picture is taken from this perspective looking toward the other end, where a blonde (or possibly white-haired) white woman in red sits. Behind her is a bank of windows through which sunlight pours. The table is wooden and oblong. The group is composed of four men and what appears to be a fifth (as the arm of the person cut out of the shot appears to be masculine) and three women. With the woman in red as the center point, the meeting attendees are seated male, female, male, male (down the right) and male, female, male (down the left). All group members appear to be white. All group members appear to be 50 years of age or younger. A bell and gavel, symbols of a Kiwanis club and tools used to call a meeting to order by the President or his/her designee, sit at the end of the table from the perspective end of the frame; that is, they are near the person cut out of the frame (save the arm).

The final section of the cover is a block approximately four inches by four inches. The field is white. At the top, on separate lines in dark blue print, it reads: "A desire to serve." "A place to connect." "Join the club." Join the club is in bold. Below this, offset by white space, is a black and white picture of a Kiwanis International Convention. It is taken from a balcony vantage point looking down onto the convention floor at thousands of people. It is not possible to make out details about the attendees. At one end of the convention floor is a riser with delegates. An American flag and a British flag flank the Kiwanis logo.

(2) Cover Page/Internal:

This page, topped with a thin light blue banner that bleeds off the page (continues past the margin), is divided into four print areas. The first takes up about one quarter of the page vertically and stretches across the width of the page. In bold, dark blue it reads in two lines: "A sense of community" (line 1) and below this, "a source of fulfillment." Below this in significantly smaller letter is gold print, it reads in three lines: "At your local Kiwanis club, members enjoy the company of friends" (line 1), "who share their passion for service - while exploring opportunities" (line 2), "for leadership, networking and more." This is accentuated with an ultra-thin blue line that bleeds off the page and into the center panel.

To the left and below this is a picture that is approximately four inches by five inches that bleeds off the outside margin. It depicts a Kiwanis club meeting as evidenced by the Kiwanis club blue and gold banner with the Kiwanis logo in the background, flanked by the Canadian flag, and the Kiwanis club bell in the foreground. This photo

features a balding white man, most likely in his late fifties and to his left a line of people, partially, intentionally blurred. All the attendees are white.

Underneath this is photo of the Indianapolis-based Kiwanis International headquarters, taken from an angle. The building is long and low building with a flat roof. The word "Kiwanis" and the Kiwanis logo are visible. Taken on a sunny, summer day, the sky is vivid blue and streaked with clouds. The trees, which are fully leaf-covered, and the manicured lawn are brilliant green. The American, Indiana, and Kiwanis flags are hoisted to full-staff and blow in the breeze. To the right, toward the flags, the building bears the words "Kiwanis International" and "Serving the children of the world" over a bank of office windows.

Below this picture is a block of text. In dark blue print, it reads: "How we change lives:" In smaller, gold print organized in four lines, it reads: "Support children's hospitals," "Support local Kiwanis youth programs," "Raise money for schools and shelters," "Help build and renovate playgrounds," "Create reading programs." Each one of these is separated by a dark blue dot placed at the mid (vertical) point of the text.

To the right of this, starting at the top just below the "A sense of community" header and corresponding thin blue line is another block of multi-line and bullet-pointed text. In black it reads, "Kiwanis club members get together to improves lives and serve communities. As a Kiwanian you can expect:" In larger, dark blue print, is a bullet-point list that reads: "Fun and fellowship," "Education and networking," "Service projects and activities," "Leadership opportunities," "Recognition and personal growth," "Visibility in your community." In smaller, black print of four lines, it reads: "Members determine when and where the club meets, and what projects the club takes

on. It's a gratifying return on a reasonable investment of time." Below this is picture of approximately two inches by three inches, arranged vertically. It features the Kiwanis bell and gavel, traditional elements of a Kiwanis meeting. In fact, when clubs charter and become officially recognized by Kiwanis International, the club has may acquire these items. The bell has a blue and red recognition ribbon draped around it.

### (3) Back Flap/External:

This page is divided into five print areas. At the top is a black and white picture of children from the 1920-1930 era. Each looks about five to six years old and is standing on a scale in a row, in alternating boy/girl fashion. The girls all wear dresses or sweaters and skirts, tights, and ankle boots. The boys wear a variety of sweaters or shirts with ties or neck sashes, short pants, long stockings and ankle boots. Below this in large blue, bold print of two lines it reads: "A long tradition of new possibilities." Below this in still smaller gold print of four lines, it reads: "Every day, people discover that a Kiwanis club offers opportunities they've always been looking for. They've been making that discovery for nearly 100 years."

To the right of the picture of the children is a black and white picture of a group of men seated in rounds in the dining room at the 1916 Cleveland Convention. All the men appear to be white. Each is wearing a suit, a white or light colored shirt, and nearly all don a tie. Many are wearing hats reminiscent of a fez. The dining hall is richly-appointed. Six light pendants hang from the coffered ceiling. The walls and trim appear to be hardwood, and there is a row of large windows, each topped with a smaller stained glass window. The flooring has a mosaic pattern, most likely two colors of porcelain,

marble, or other stone. Each table is covered with a white linen cloth and laid with serving dishes. Napkins are folded into neat, crisp triangles at each place setting. This picture is approximately two and a half inches wide by three inches long and is arranged vertically on the membership brochure. Below the picture, a line of text in small black print reads: "Founded in 1915, the Kiwanis family now includes:" Beneath are three bullets, in larger dark blue print, that read: "Nearly 600,000 members of all ages," "More than 15,000 clubs for adults and youth," "A presence in 80 nations and geographic areas." Below this in smaller black print of four lines it reads: "As a Kiwanis club member, you'll become part of a global organization of members who volunteer their time and dedication. Help point the way toward the future by taking your place in a great tradition."

The bottom third of this page is dedicated to a perforated, beige panel that stretches from the left margin to right and bleeds off the bottom of the page. This is one side of the membership application. In bold, large, dark blue print, it reads "Join the club," and instructs: "Fill out the attached form and start making an impact on children's lives!" A series of questions, with either check boxes or lines for answers, follow. These ask where to send mail to the applicant; past and current life- membership status; and committee preference (administration or community service). It then has an affirmation statement directed at the applicant, which reads: "I accept this application for membership and agree to conform to the bylaws of this club and comply with the obligations of membership as explained by my sponsor." There is a place for the applicant to sign and date the application.

(4) Center Panel/Internal:

This panel is divided in three horizontal print areas. The first is mainly white space. The same ultra-thin blue line that started on the previous page bleeds over to this page, as does the thin light blue banner at the very top. In the upper right corner is a picture of a young boy, looking down at him into his face. He is approximately four to five years of age, is white with brown hair and brown eyes. He is smiling. He wears a bright orange tee shirt. Underneath and stretching across the two columns into which the page's central text is divided, is a headline in large, bold, dark blue print. It reads:

"Become a part of young lives." Below this, in two lines of smaller, gold print, it reads:

"As a Kiwanis club member, you'll have a chance to change young people's lives – by getting directly involved." It then lists all of the youth-focused programs that Kiwanis clubs can sponsor. These include Kiwanis Kids for elementary school students, 6 to 12 years of age. Kiwanis Kids involves two recognition programs, Terrific kids, which promotes "character development," and Bring Up Grades, which supports and rewards academic achievement. Other programs include Builders Club for the 12 to 14 year old set; Key Club for high school students aged 15 to 18; Key Leader, a leadership program for high school and college students; Circle K International, the university version of Kiwanis; and Aktion Club, which focuses on offering service club opportunities for "adults with disabilities."

Below these two columns of text are two pictures. The first features three, possibly four, adults walking in the woods with a group of five young people. Everyone, except one man, is dressed casually in jeans, shorts, capris, tee shirts, and tennis shoes. The man, who has dark hair, wears khakis, a collared polo shirt, a belt, tennis shoes, and

a watch on his left wrist. His ethnicity is unclear. Of the adults, two are women. One appears to be in her late sixties. The age of the other cannot be discerned. She appears to be Asian, but again, the ethnicity is difficult to discern. With the exception of one youth, a girl in the background, everyone else is white. To the right of this picture is a close up, headshot of two girls (presumably from the previous picture). They are huddled, smiling, close together. One girl is African American, and is approximately eleven or twelve years old. She wears her long hair in braids that end with a collection of multi-colored, heart shaped beads. Her hair is pulled back on one side, and her cheek is painted with a little animal. The other girl is white with very blonde, shoulder-length hair that she wears with bangs and tucked behind her ears at the sides. She is considerably shorter (reaching only the shoulders of the other girl) but still appears to be in the same age range. She wears wire-rimmed glasses.

(5) Back Flap/Internal:

This page is divided into three horizontal print areas. The first, at the very top of the page, features two pictures placed side-by-side and set off by white space. The first picture is approximately two and a half inches tall by five inches wide and is arranged horizontally. It features an (Asian) toddler of approximately two or three years of age wrapped in a checked cloth lying on a collection of colorful fabrics and woven mats. His or her shoulder and arms and legs are bare, and the child has dark hair (though very little).

On one side of the frame, the hand of an adult whose finger is being clasped by the child can be seen. On the other side of the frame, is another adult hand and a bottle,

which the child also holds. In the background of the shot there are bottles of what look like water. Beside this picture is a considerably smaller picture that bleeds off the outside page margin. It is a woman receiving a vaccination. The woman appears to be in her twenties and is possibly Asian (again, the ethnicity is difficult to discern). Only the arm and shot-giving hand of the person administering the vaccine can be seen. It is clear that the person administering the vaccine is a woman: she wears a wedding ring and another ring (both of which are fairly large) on her left ring and middle finger. She also wears a small watch with a small wrist band that would be typically marketed to women. Lastly, the way she holds her hand is decidedly feminine. She is White.

Below these pictures, in large, bold, dark blue print it reads: "Local passion. Global impact." Below this in smaller, gold print of two lines, it reads: "In 2010, Kiwanis International launched The Eliminate Project: Kiwanis eliminating maternal and neonatal tetanus." Below this, in one column is a block of text, in small, black print, that outlines Kiwanis' partnership with UNICEF and fundraising goals (\$110 million US by 2015). To the right of this is the joint Kiwanis/UNICEF ELIMINATE logo. The letters MNT are in dark blue, to signify "maternal and neonatal tetanus."

The bottom third of the page again is a beige perforated panel that stretches from left margin to right and bleeds off the bottom of the page. This is page one of the membership application. It bears the same title and instructions for completion as its partner page. All of the fields on this page are meant to collect personal and contact information and are fill-in. Questions range from full name, to nickname, gender, date of birth, name of "Spouse/partner," full home address, phone number and personal email. Applicants are then asked to supply professional information in the form of the name of



employer, the applicant's professional title, full business address, and business phone number and email. There is small print at the bottom of this panel that reads, "By providing my email address, I recognize that I am opting in to receive regular communication from Kiwanis International."

(6) Center Panel/External:

This panel serves as the back of the brochure. As with the other panels, it bears the same light blue and white banner as described on the front. The panel features a large, monotone blue Kiwanis logo, made slightly transparent, around which each of the Objects of Kiwanis are arranged. The headline, printed in large dark blue font, is situated in two lines and reads: "The objects of Kiwanis International." Below this, in smaller gold print, it reads: "These principles have guided Kiwanis' work since 1924." The bottom of the page contains a small, color version of the Kiwanis logo and the word "Kiwanis," the organizations' address, domestic and international phone numbers, the website, and a collateral serial number and print date.

*Rhetorical Situation*

'Kiwanis "Join the Club" brochures are available to clubs from Kiwanis International for free in packs of 25 when ordered in advance from the Kiwanis Family Store. Any club member can order/request brochures in this fashion, though most typically the person ordering would be a membership committee or marketing committee chair, club secretary, or club president/vice president. At the club level, these are most often used during membership drives, special guest days/programs days, or during

service projects. They may also be used during conferences, conventions, leadership training, or board meetings. They may be used as an accompaniment to a press release to provide background information to members of the press. Other uses vary by club. The brochures can also receive in a "club opening kit," which designated Kiwanians who are leading the effort to start a new club can receive. Kiwanis' "collateral" materials are created in-house by its communications/marketing team, frequently in conjunction with other departments, selected volunteers, and members of corresponding committees of the board of directors; the communications team is accountable to the board of directors, both directly and indirectly.

## Chapter IV: Analyses and Findings

### *Analyses*

#### *Artifact 1: The Objects of Kiwanis*

It is clear that the roots of Kiwanis International are found in the business world. A short time after inception, the organization offered professionals and entrepreneurs the opportunity to do good works in the community. However, this moral impetus was secondary to strengthening business connections. "The (Permanent) Objects of Kiwanis International" is, essentially, an institutional values statement. Referred to from this point forward as "Objects" or "the Objects," these brief but simple statements have guided the interactions, work, and civic engagement of Kiwanians and defined the organization's goals and culture for 91 years. Though only 100 words, these six statements are far from simplistic.

When the Objects were codified in 1924, Kiwanis had already redefined itself yet again to be, above all, a community service organization that would pull its membership largely from the professional and entrepreneurial realms. Nonetheless, the Objects make it clear that business is a primordial concern for Kiwanians. In fact, though the Objects read like a thoughtful expansion on "The Golden Rule," significant attention is placed on the Protestant Work Ethic, professional social cohesion, and deference to power and authority in promotion of the ideologies of capitalism and traditional morality.

The question regarding the Objects is not whether they are "good" or "bad" but rather, after nine decades as a service organization, do the Objects still function as an accurate and valid organizational values statement, given the need of the organization to

reach previously under-represented members and make itself sustainable for another 100 years. To address this question and bring clarity to the impact of the Objects, the analysis of the Objects will be structured on a per-statement basis, with the relevant units of analysis discussed within the context of and in relationship to the respective sentence. It is important to note that the Objects, while presented here in their traditional order, are not typically numbered. They are numbered for utility.

1) "To give primacy to the human and spiritual rather than to the material values of life."

The most striking aspects of this statement are the use of "primacy" and the concept of "values." As an ordinal referent, "primacy" implies rank; if something is first, then, another must follow. In this way, "material values" are not excluded or denounced through the Objects, but are relegated to a state of secondary importance in terms of Kiwanis priorities. In the years prior to codification of the Objects, Kiwanis had moved from being an organization of businessmen who engaged in service to a service organization comprised of businessmen. Primary import placed on human and spirit values and secondary import placed on material values is akin to a position statement that reflects club priorities and demographic composition circa 1924.

"Value" itself is a nebulous concept. A "value" can at once refer to a standard of conduct while implying merit, worth, and worthiness. Thus, "value" has both moral implications and exchange and commodity connotations. It is important to note that the writers and ratifiers of the Objects not only utilize "values" as an umbrella for their beliefs, they categorize beliefs according to the qualifiers of "human," "spiritual," and "material," when they could have just as easily generated a purpose statement and code of

ethics such as the Lions International statement which emphasizes not only what kind of world Lions want to create, but also outlines what members will do to achieve that aim and what their personal responsibilities are for their own conduct as individuals and a group ("Purpose and Code of Ethics").

Value theory suggests that "values" are "beliefs" with a moral component. As such, they influence and reflect one's sense of "right" and "wrong," "good" and "bad," and serve as the benchmark against which the measure the rightness or goodness of the values and actions of others is applied ("Values: Psychological Perspectives"). The more congruent someone's values are with our own, the more likely those values are to be judged positively. Values, then, serve a bonding function for people and groups. By setting out "human," "spiritual," and "material" as the value systems most important to them, of all possible values systems, the Kiwanians of 1924 establish the means by which a disparate band of individuals will be aligned. Of value systems, the International Encyclopedia of the Social and Behavioral Sciences says:

Thus, discussion of values is intimately tied with social life. At the group level, values are scripts or cultural ideals held in common by members of a group; the group's social mind.' Differences in these cultural ideals, especially those with a moral component, determine and distinguish different social systems. In this sense Weber's Protestant 'ethic' and 'spirit' of capitalism describe value systems. Values, to which individuals feel they owe an allegiance as members of a particular group or society, are seen as the glue that makes social life possible within groups. Yet, they also set the stage for frictions and lack of consensual harmony in intergroup interactions. Values are thus at the heart of the human enterprise; embedded in social systems, they are what makes social order both possible and resistant to change. Values are not simply individual traits; they are social agreements about what is right, good, to be cherished ("Values, Sociology of").

The idea that values can also be a source of disharmony among group members is one that the writers and ratifiers of the Objects anticipated. International President Perry

Patterson is quoted as saying, of the choice to use the adjective "spiritual" to modify "values," "we gear up our machinery to place upon this word spiritual the interpretation which will absolutely fit every man in his chair at every Kiwanis table in the land" (Hapgood, 67). Further, the ambiguity of "human values" and "spiritual values" avoids possibly conflicting opinions about their respective meaning and, by doing so, helps to build trust among members. In expressing his desire to create definitions that would not alienate any member, Perry seems to innately understand that group cohesion will be built around an unspoken understanding of what these words mean based on shared class and values ("Culture and Social Class, 11"). Reliance on members to supply their own definition of these words is a statement of trust that members will act in accordance with implicit social morays.

"Values" as a concept relies on a motivational construct. Group members individually acknowledge and prioritize standards of behavior, or "values," that move them toward realizing the three primordial goals of meeting biological needs, coordinating social interactions, and promoting the existence and well-being of the group(s) ("Values: Psychological Perspectives," 16151). The inclusion of "material values" in the Kiwanis-recognized trinity of values acknowledges that basic needs must be met. However, its relegation as a secondary, rather than primary, focus is meant to provide direction when human and spiritual values come into conflict with material values. According to Schwarz, "...in any given situation more than one personally endorsed value may apply, and the behavioral choice appropriate for one value may conflict with the behavioral choice appropriate to another value" ("Values: Psychological Perspectives," 16151). In this and the other statements that make up the Objects it is clear

that, above all, Kiwanis members consider the conveyance of their conception of morality into society to be central to their identification as Kiwanians.

2) "To encourage the daily living of the Golden Rule in all human relationships."

Central to the "Golden Rule" is the idea of moral obligation toward others, implying that each person should strive to treat others fairly. Key here is the implication of mutual benefit, typically described as the "ethic of reciprocity" ("Golden Rule"). Kiwanis began as an organization whose intent was to "develop closer social and commercial interests among business and professional men" (Putnam, 135). Therefore, the idea that the "Golden Rule" referenced in this statement is exclusively about altruism is an over-reach.

Reciprocity is central to building bonding social capital. According to Putnam, "social capital" calls attention to the fact that civic virtue is most powerful when embedded in a dense network of reciprocal relations" (19). The economic resources that come to bear on social networks is an important part of this equation. As Putnam points out, "...most of us get our jobs because of whom we know, not what we know - that is our social capital" (20). Thus, reciprocity has the power to convince people to cooperate or at least limit their degree of non-cooperation on the promise that giving a favor now will yield a favor later (Fehr and Gächter, 170). Consequently, the Golden Rule and its generalized reciprocity indicate that favors become commodities resulting from an economic exchange, a profit from investing trust and building in-group social capital.

3) "To promote the adoption and the application of higher social, business and professional standards."

By 1924, when the Objects were codified, corrupt political machines had long been at work in local governments. It was the heyday of the American gangster. Books like Sinclair Lewis' *The Jungle* highlighted the plight of immigrants and the working poor. And, the wheels of economic collapse were already turning: over-production in manufacturing and farming alike was exacerbated by stagnant wages which limited American's disposable income ("Causes of the Great Depression"). At the same time, corporations, even monopolies, began to take shape, often forcing smaller business out of the market (Putnam, 369). This had to have been an unsettling social and commercial environment to the average businessman. Putnam writes, "...Progressive intellectuals articulated a broader yearning for the community values of small-town life, nostalgia provoked by the materialism, individualism, and 'bigness' of the new America. The pace and degree of the social change through which Americans had just lived a century ago were profoundly disorienting" (378-379).

It is no surprise, then, that many of the Objects are constructed around addressing what is lacking in business, in relationships, in communities. This is the case with Object 3 when the comparative adjective "higher" is coupled with "standards." Note here that the authors of the Objects reject the options "high standards" and "highest standards," but instead opt of the middle ground, "higher standards." Focusing on the "highest" standards, "social" and "business and professional" standards could very well be placed at odds with each other and undermine the notion that hard work, not birth, could determine social status. Of the era, Putnam writes, "Progressives struggled with themselves over the



choice between professionalism and grassroots democracy, though in the end professionalism would win out" (378). Such centrist language serves to uphold and reinforce middle class norms, mitigate risks to the building of trust and social capital, and create a conservative consensus in support of the Protestant Work Ethic.

The 1900's bring about a time when it is believed a man's merit could push him up through the class ranks. From this perspective, those who work hard achieve and have the material things that demonstrate their successes and, more importantly, their moral superiority. Inversely, those who struggle with poverty do so because something is amiss in their character: they are lazy or immoral, or both. This is, after all, the essence of the Protestant Work Ethic (Putnam, 378). While Kiwanians of 1924 are keen to help the less fortunate through service projects, much of their work centers on "character education" in an effort to combat the decline of principles that was evidenced by poverty (Charles, 6). Typical of the middle class of the day, there is a deep concern over one's reputation, particularly as it relates to morality and honor.

What would it mean, then, to apply the "highest" standard to social relationships? Between members of the professional middle class, the answer is simple: to treat each other honestly, to engage in fair dealings, to practice self-control, courtesy, and respect ("Manly Honor - Part III"). However, the implication is different when looking at relationships between middle and lower classes. "Then, as now, massive urban concentrations of ethnic minorities posed basic questions of social justice and social stability. Then, as now, the comfortable middle class was torn between the seductive attractions of escape and the deeper demands of redemptive solidarity," Putnam writes (381). To enter a deeper relationship between classes, to enter into a state of "redemptive

solidarity," is to recognize inequities. The recognition of inequity must be consciously addressed, either by offering assistance or deciding to withhold assistance. Intentionally withholding assistance appears cruel whereas offering assistance to the extent of "redemptive solidarity" is anathema to the Protestant Work Ethic because it relies on the charity of others rather than achieving based on hard work and individual merit. Opting for "higher" social standards, then, allows members to remain in willful ignorance of the extent of the plight of those in poverty and preserves the illusion that "character education" is a valuable and valid way to address society's ills (Charles, 7; Putnam, 395). In a sense, "higher" standards are the best course for gaining the most reward for the least risk, thereby creating concurrence about purpose among group members.

4) "To develop, by precept and example, a more intelligent, aggressive and serviceable citizenship."

Between 1900 and 1930, there is a resurgent and particularly strong and widespread Nativist sentiment among many Americans. "Scientific" evidence like Social Darwinism and Eugenics helped give credence to prejudices and provide support for legitimating an anti-immigrant, pro-White Protestant American world view. Not only is legislation passed to limit immigration, immigrant rights, and the enfranchisement of Black citizens, groups such as the Ku Klux Klan and the American Protective Association experience a boom in growth ("American Protective Association"). While it is true that Kiwanis, in 1914, stops the Ku Klux Klan from organizing in a particular town, the decision to do so may be based more in economics than a sense of racial justice ("Headlines: 100 Years of Kiwanis;" Charles, 30-31). On this matter, Charles writes,

"The Klan threatened the middle-class unity that service clubs hoped to promote...the conflict was also based on a different vision of community; service club members were far more willing than Klan members to welcome the transformation of the corporate economy and its associated bureaucracy and consumerism" (31). It is also true that clubs from Lions, Rotary, and Kiwanis all have membership representation from immigrant and non-Protestant groups, but this representation is intentionally limited and permissible," thanks to the economic and professional status of those from under-represented groups. "What club service did require was business or professional standing and a sense of community stewardship," Charles writes, adding of organization attitudes toward immigrants and non-Protestants, "Their own perpetuation of racial and gender restrictions shows that service organizations had hardly jettisoned the boundaries that defined Victorian middle-class life (Charles, 30-31)." In this, it is clear that the service clubs of 1924 very much reflect the racial, economic, and gender barriers that exist in the larger society.

The choice to use "citizenship" in statement 4 of the Objects rather than "citizenry" is telling of the times. While the two words both reference a group of people bound by the same city, state, or nation, the words are distinguishable by what is expected of the members of that group. "Citizenry" is "all the citizens of a place; a whole body of citizens" ("Citizenry") .By contrast, "citizenship," is the "state of being vested with the rights, privileges, and duties of a citizen; the character of an individual viewed as a member of society; behavior in terms of duties, obligations, and functions of a citizen" (Dictionary.com). This distinguisher is important as it points to the idea that not every member of the populace is regarded as a citizen with corresponding rights and

obligations, or even the moral character needed to be worthy of being a citizen. Whether by legislation that prevents the legal attainment of citizenship, as in the case with Asian immigrants, efforts to impede participation in Democratic processes, as in the case with Blacks, or lingering resentment over women's suffrage, a portion of the populace is deemed ineligible or incapable of being a citizen in the truest sense ("Immigration-An Overview;" "The Fight for Women's Suffrage"). The small band of non-white, non-Christian men allowed to enter club life is the exception, not the rule.

It is perhaps intentional that this "foreign" group was kept small, for a small group is a controllable group. Of the time, Putnam writes, "An even greater debate has raged among historians about whether the Progressive Era was about social reform or social control or social revolution. Some scholars have argued that middle-class reformers organized voluntary associations to exert control over rambunctious, uncouth working-class immigrants" (399-400). Service clubs followed this impetus to not only help preserve the illusion of egalitarianism, but also to help guide the unruly masses.

Service clubs of all types made efforts to inculcate character, patriotism, compliance, and a work ethic in boys especially. Rotary, for example, called boys "men in the making" and argued, "'A neglected boyhood means a neglected America...'" (Charles, 78). The use of the words "aggressive" and "serviceable" in relationship to "citizenship" indicate that Kiwanis, as well, followed this line of thinking. Merriam-Webster online defines "aggressive" as "marked obtrusive energy" and "marked by driving forceful energy or initiative: enterprising. Of course, there are other definitions for "aggressive," ones related to violence, for example. However, by the context of the Objects and 1924 white America's fear of immigrants and Blacks, these definitions can

safely be ruled out as desirable outcomes ("Making and Remaking America"). Likewise, Webster's defines "serviceable" as "helpful, useful" and "fit for use; of adequate quality" ("Serviceable"). These words indicate that people, particularly youth, must be groomed and conditioned in order to become fit to assume the role of citizen. As one Kiwanian of the era puts it, "Boys need help before their personality reaches a crisis...Where our young manhood finds no adequate outlet for their strongest native capacities and the outlet for their special abilities blocked they are thwarted. They become neurotic, apathetic, or savagely rebellious" (Charles, 81). Yet, statement 4 of the Objects is not just about socializing and shaping youth. This quote affirms the notion that the parents of these boys were incapable of rearing them properly and that it was incumbent upon Kiwanians to impart character and morality to others, to "rescue" them.

A popular "Kiwani moment" that exemplifies Kiwanians as saviors is found in the story of Walter Kiwanis, a five year-old boy living in Detroit circa 1915. Walter's mother, a divorcee, cannot care for him. In response to her need, the Detroit club adopts Walter, legally re-names him Walter Kiwanis, secures a foster family to care for him, and assumes all the expenses of his care until such a time as his mother can remarry and take him back in (24-25). Of this, Kiwanis historian L.A. "Larry" Hapgood writes, "She visited the boy regularly and always reminded him as well as herself of how thankful they should be for such good friends" (Hapgood, 25). Hapgood continues, "Walter returned to his mother. But whatever debt he had to the club, the club really owned him much more. He had helped set the pattern of future Kiwanis work among "undeprivileged children" (25). Thus, in a tidy, pleasing, inspiring manner closes; and Hapgood's account of Walter Kiwanis; and on the surface appears to simply be about challenging Kiwanians

to practice being the kind of citizen they wish to see, to practice the Golden Rule. There is, however, a tone of underlying misogyny, moral judgment, and male supremacy in the story.

Matters of family life and child rearing are, traditionally, the domain of women by societal standards. "The History of Divorce" says that women have long been charged with the "cleanliness, godliness, culture, and manners in the family" (Warner). As well, women have been expected to be the "monitors" of male behavior in general. It was also her job to keep her husband happy ("The Role of the Wife and Mother"). By the early 1900's, climbing divorce rates were blamed on, among other things, the growing women's movement ("Warner"). Of divorce and marriage, Cahn writes, "In the nineteenth century, conformity benefitted women; if they were the innocent spouse who had taken care of the children, the household, and their husbands, then they were protected against divorce" (6). In this view of marriage, it is clear that the responsibility for preserving the family was put upon the woman. "The History of Divorce" webpage says that Freud considered divorces to be the result of childhood neuroses acted out in adulthood. A failed marriage, therefore, reflected the personal shortcomings of a woman, if not women and general; moreover, it made women responsible for creating the situation of potentially "neurotic" and "savagely rebellious" boys on whose behalf Kiwanians needed to intervene for their own good.

5) "To provide, through Kiwanis clubs, a practical means to form enduring friendships, to render altruistic service and to build better communities."

Statement 5 of the Objects, like those before it, follows a pattern of co-mingling

civic responsibility and capitalism, with civic responsibility serving as a means by which reward can be secured. For example, Statement 1 acknowledges the importance of material values. Statement 2's reference to the Golden Rule and, by extension, the principle of reciprocity, promotes the idea that a favor now will yield a return at some later point by someone equally capable of returning that favor; reciprocity is a standard practice in both building social capital and in the business world (Molm et al). In statement 3, there is explicit mention of business and professional standards; and here, the case has been made that the selection of "higher standards" rather than "highest standards" denotes a cautious risk-reward disposition. Though not previously discussed, the relationship between the term "aggressive" and the business world cannot be dismissed as coincidental use in Statement 4 since "aggressive" is commonplace in the parlance of finance. When speaking of markets, investments, or competitive, for example, "aggressive" is "used to describe investments that involve some risk or investors that take risks in order to gain the best results" ("Aggressive," BusinessDictionary.com). This is precisely the point of statement 4: to invest time and effort to cultivate a citizenship that is more reflective of white, middle-class, Protestant ideals. The key phrases of statement 5 - "through Kiwanis clubs," "form enduring friendships," "render altruistic service," and "build better communities"- also point to the same kind of sublimation of individual interests for the sake of a better whole of which Tocqueville speaks in *Democracy in America* (Bellah et al, "Habits," 174). Hence, civic responsibility is the investment, and social or economic capital and the opportunity to condition the populace are the dividends. Mention of "altruistic service," conjures notions of selflessness and benevolence.

Throughout global cultures, altruism, which refers to the doctrine that says people are morally obligated to work to benefit others, is regarded as a virtue ("Altruism"). Many anthropologists believe that our brains are essentially hardwired to work cooperatively for the greater good (Szalavitz). Even used as scientific term, "altruism" indicates behavior of an organism that benefits other organisms at a cost to itself (Zalta). In terms of altruism related to evolutionary biology, "The costs and benefits are measured in terms of reproductive fitness, or expected number of offspring. So by behaving altruistically, an organism reduces the number of offspring it is likely to produce itself, but boosts the number that other organisms are likely to produce (Zalta). Likewise, in societies, altruistic behavior invariably leads to both sacrifices and rewards for the purveyor of that behavior, even if the purveyor is not completely cognizant of the rewards. When, as with Statement 5, the Kiwanians of 1924 speak of building "better communities," they have in mind a kind of shared conception of what the world of tomorrow will look like, just as the narrator of "The Man Who Was God" expressed in reciting a quatrain from the Rubaiyat. This future world is the reward for an investment of time now. What may not be immediate in the mind, however, is the benefit that economically stable communities will bring them as businessmen.

Yet, Statement 5 of the Objects clearly links the club-level altruism of "building better communities" to economics despite such a linkage representing a long-established pattern of thought among within Kiwanis. For example, post-World War I measures seek to "improve social and economic conditions," by focusing on tax reduction programs and "maintenance of the federal reserve banking system in the United States, uniformity of laws in interstate and foreign commerce, reduction in government cost and manpower"



(Hapgood, 72-77). In 1928, the Kiwanis business standards are first realized; these later become the Kiwanis Code of Ethics (Hapgood, 72-79). In the early days of Kiwanis, just as now, Chambers of Commerce are seen as potential partners for community service and sources of membership (Hapgood, 77; "Hosting a Membership Drive tool"). Statement 5 of the Objects reflects the sentiment that economic stability creates communities made stable by social cohesion, which, in turn, creates economic opportunity (Bellah et al, "Habits" 258-262).

It is important to note that statement 5 does not call for random "friendships" to create better communities; these friendships are created through the social networks found in Kiwanis clubs, where democracy and the democratic process are full effect. In *Habits of the Heart*, Bellah et al write, "Americans have sought in the ideal of community a shared trust to anchor and complete the desire for a free and fulfilled self. This quest finds its public analogue in the desire to integrate economic pursuits and interrelationships in an encompassing fabric of national institutional life" (256). Putnam correlates the existence of associations, like service organizations, to development, making the case that where service organizations exist there is high social capital and more rapid, stable economic development (344-346). "In *An Economic Approach to Social Capital*," Glaeser et al contend, "Economists understand the role that repeated social interaction plays in solving free rider problems and reducing opportunism" (F437). The fear of people not doing their fair share is a real concern for the white, capitalist, middle class that has been steeped in the Protestant Work Ethic. Friendships formed in social networks helps ensure against this through naturally cultivated reciprocity. By contributing an investment of his time and building relationships with other Kiwanians,

the member is both helping and receiving help - help in building his own social capital, help in building the group's social capital which may be called upon at some point, and help shaping a community that is prepared for expanded economic opportunity.

Tocqueville, in *Democracy in America*, argues that individually, citizens are essentially powerless. Together, however, they have immense influence. He says, "In politics men combine for great undertakings; and the use they make of the principle of association in important affairs practically teaches them that it is their interest to help each other in those of less moment" ("Chapter VII - Connection of Civil and Political Associations"). While Tocqueville speaks particularly of political machinations here, the principle that there is strength in organized numbers is still applicable to service organizations. He points out, "Political associations may therefore be considered as large free schools, where all the members of the community go to learn the general theory of association" ("Chapter VII - Connection of Civil and Political Associations"). More importantly, it teaches individuals how to maneuver the systems and institutions of dominant society (Durlauf and Fafchamps, 11). In other words, becoming part of an association, particularly one that is reflective of the way the larger society operates, teaches deference to and acceptance of authority, tolerance for hierarchies and hierarchical procedures, self-reliance without the undermining individualism that Tocqueville warns against, and reflects and perpetuates capitalism.

The Kiwanians of 1924 were businessmen who felt compelled to influence the world around them. They were "economic actors oriented fundamentally by moral imperatives" (Portes, 5). As such, it would have been highly unlikely that they would have been wholly unaware of the rewards that altruistic service would bring. "Building

better communities" holds the promise of a more politically active citizenry, social capital and reciprocity, economically stable communities where business can thrive and money can be made, a more self-reliant populace, and the opportunity to exercise power and influence.

6) "To cooperate in creating and maintaining that sound public opinion and high idealism which make possible the increase of righteousness, justice, patriotism and goodwill."

Statement 6 reflects the politics of the common good as mediated through a capitalist worldview and the concept of "noblesse oblige." The politics of the common good calls for individuals to do those things which benefit all of society rather than the individual exclusively (Bellah et al, "Habits" 256-264). Noblesse oblige is the idea that those with position, wealth, and status are morally obligated to help the poor and less privileged ("Noblesse Oblige").

The first indication that the proponents of the Objects even simply share a world view is found with one simple word: "that" in the phrase "That sound public opinion and high idealism." Here, "That" functions as a restrictive element that limits and focuses meaning (Grinker). This indicates the "sound public opinion and high idealism" of Statement 6 are understood and agreed to by group members.

The use of the word "goodwill," in particular, provides evidence that the shared world view of members is a capitalistic one. "Goodwill" can be interpreted to have a double meaning here. Not only does it refer to benevolence, but in commerce it refers to "an intangible, salable asset arising from the reputation of a business and its relations with customers, distinct from the value of its stock and other tangible assets" (Business

Dictionary.com, "Goodwill"). "Goodwill" as an intangible asset, then, is as much about engaging in community service as it is building the reputation of Kiwanis clubs. This symbiotic relationship is, after all, considered the critical formula for growing membership (Hapgood, 53).

Interestingly, "goodwill" also refers to an approach to labor relations. This approach says that the welfare of employees has a direct impact on productivity. To this point, there is a parallel between club hierarchy and Marx's view of the capitalist/laborer relationship since, within club life, club officers and officials function as the "capitalists" who control the means of production. Production in this case equates to the types of service projects and other activities in which a club engages. Theoretically, while membership should vote on projects and activities, fiduciary responsibility and accounting, as well as reporting to the International office, is left to officers and officials. In-person voting is also the only allowable means of voting as of 2014 when research for this study began. This is problematic given the overall decline in meeting attendance across North America). This gives club leaderships tremendous influence over the direction of labor of the general membership.

Club members, and officers/officials alike, provide the labor that makes community service (and club life) a reality. Regarding club members as laborers whose treatment affects productivity is not far-fetched. Hapgood writes, "Success in Kiwanis growth will always occur when the needs of the individual Kiwanian are met" (53). He goes on to warn members against discounting those who are not quite fully engaged, cautioning,

"Everyone whose interest is in being a good volunteer, of course, will recall many members who can best be described as simply, 'joiners.' But

even though clubs may have been handicapped in service work and their image tarnished because a group of fifty, seventy-five, or even a hundred men do not perform service as they might, the joiners should not be too severely criticized. Fellowship plays an important part in Kiwanis, and men join, in part, to enjoy that facet" (53).

Hapgood's argument is that the needs of club members (the laborers), whether seeking friendships, creating business and social connections, socializing, or engaging in community service, should be recognized and respected to promote the overall health and well-being of the club, which is, ultimately, measured in the number of members required to keep a charter. Maintaining a charter means a club and its members stay on Kiwanis' rosters; staying on the rosters generates organizational income through membership dues, merchandise, and convention and other fees.

Capitalism, noblesse oblige, and the politics of the greater good are not quite the strange bedfellows that at first they seem. Indeed, Andrew Carnegie and other "robber barons," who built vast empires in fraternal organization to service club evolutionary period, regard wealth as a means to lift up society ("Andrew Carnegie"). For J.D. Rockefeller, wealth and philanthropy must go hand-in-hand ("John D. Rockefeller"). However, these philanthropic endeavors are hardly completely benevolent. Carnegie, for example, believes philanthropy must "raise the moral and intellectual level of the masses" (Sage). From this perspective, if wealth is earned because a man is moral, then the poor must be immoral and poor immigrants doubly so since they tended to live in cities, which were seen as hubs of decadence, depravity, and sloth (Sage, Zinn, Putnam, "Bowling" 374). Putnam quotes historian Don Kirschner as saying, 'the cities were esthetically repulsive, commercially spastic, culturally balkanized, morally depraved, medically lethal, socially oppressive, and politically oppressive' (374). Cities, regarded as being

"commercially spastic," would naturally be of concern for the capitalist. Putnam writes, "...many Americans at the close of the nineteenth century felt morality eroding and community fracturing" (378, 379). "Saving" a nation from moral peril through character development and imparting a sense of national pride and unity to the foreign newcomers is a means to an economic end. Such an effort can be undertaken through "exploitation" or "cultivation" (Bellah et al, "The Good Society" 265). In a time of high nativism, Statement 6 of the Objects, reflects this exploitation and cultivation disposition toward the lower- and working-classes.

Cultivation focuses on education, character development, and nationalism; exploitation puts capitalist competition, cheap labor, and individual accumulation of wealth ahead of the public good Bellah et al, "The Good Society" 265). The treatment of the lower- and working-classes is not seen as an either/or proposition in terms of cultivation and exploitation. Instead, the milieu of the day tended toward cultivation as a path toward exploitation with less resistance. Therefore, the character of a corresponding altruism is not one of pure benevolence. Altruistic endeavors are meant to reform the morals and character of the populace in order to develop a sense of national and community pride so that the ability to conduct business, to engage in the aforementioned labor-approach goodwill, is preserved.

Consider the use of the words, "righteousness," "justice," and "patriotism" in Statement 6. "Righteous" is not simply a reference to virtuousness or morality. It connotes moral perfection and even moral superiority ("Righteous"). In the Christian tradition, justice and righteousness are linked. For example, the English Standard

Version of the bible reads, "Righteousness and justice are the foundation of your throne; steadfast love and faithfulness go before you" (Psalm 89:14"). Other passages establish authority as the natural order that results from righteousness and justice: Deuteronomy 4:8 reads, "And what other nation is so great as to have such righteous decrees and laws as this body of laws I am setting before you today?" (Psalm 89:14); and deference to authority is regarded as the natural by-product of righteousness and justice: "Love and faithfulness meet together; righteousness and peace kiss each other" ("Psalm 89:14"). Labor unrest, socialist and women's movements, and unionization -all typically centered in cities and within immigrant communities- are disrupting the economic status quo (Smitha). Teaching immigrants and city dwellers to be "righteous," to appreciate "justice," and to be patriots has economic benefits, and Christianity is a tool used to aid in the realization of those benefits.

Where Christian ideology fails, or perhaps as a supplement it, indoctrination in the "American way" of doing things provides yet another strategy to "construct a modern and cohesive social order" ("U.S. Americanization"). The Good Society points out, "A company with people who work well together will outperform, many times over, a company with the same physical equipment where the workers are not responsible and where no one trusts anyone or is willing to take any risks" (Bellah et al 94). An entire community that counts a stable workforce among its assets surely is a place where business can easily, safely, and efficiently be conducted, leading to a viable economy. Likewise, a stable and economically thriving community invites the creation of Kiwanis clubs because communities become places where business and businessmen can be found. The creation of clubs does not simply generate revenue in the form of

membership dues for Kiwanis as an organization; it also helps to build the individual and collective social capital that is enjoyed through the social networks born in clubs.

Statement 6, therefore, demonstrates that civilizing the masses is just good business; and in Statement 6, the same pattern of using benevolent-sounding language that is encoded with capitalistic meanings to extol the virtues of capitalism and the transformative power exclusive to Institution is evident.

*Artifact 2: "The Man Who Was God"*

On the surface, the brief story, "The Man Who Was God," follows a man on his journey from Kiwanis member to "Kiwanian" - that pivotal moment when a member has an experience so powerful that it cements his attachment to Kiwanis. As could be surmised from the title, the story is loaded with religious imagery. As well, it contains veiled accusations of moral deficiency against outliers, stereotypical assertions of masculinity, male dominance, and misogyny, and displays of power and authority operating under the illusion of egalitarianism. A deeper analysis reveals that the story centers on two Weberian concepts, "world mastery" and "salvation anxiety," and is really a metaphor for moral redemption, via Kiwanis, that allows the main character to become part of civilized society. Thus, the ideologies of (male) meritocracy and institutional belonging are the dominant ones conveyed by the story.

"World mastery" is the idea that people should become instruments of God's will and create a world over which man has dominion while carrying out God's will (McNamee and Miller, 4). "Salvation anxiety," the exclusive product of the Calvinistic roots of Protestantism, relates to worrying about whether one is among the predetermined



numbers who will be "saved" (McNamee and Miller, 4). The ideology of meritocracy, particularly in relationship to capitalistic societies, holds that since all people have an equal opportunity to succeed, those who do so because of their own merit (McNamee and Miller, 4). Success, therefore, is enjoyed by those who have "earned" it. The ideology of institutional belonging is defined here as the acceptance of and acquiescence to organizational power structure and hierarchies in order to realize personal goals, gain acceptance, and form identity.

The story opens with a narrator who speaks in both first person as a character of the story and as an omniscient voice, specifically during the action that leads to the redemption of the main character, "the fellow." By speaking in first person, the narrator as a character takes pains to present himself as a "regular Joe." This allows the narrator to build trust with his audience as well as convey the message that Kiwanis membership has an equalizing effect among its members. Thus, the narrator is a representation of institutional power and authority is able to demonstrate individual and collective benefits of joining the system.

To present himself as an ordinary, unassuming man, the narrator uses several strategies. For example, very early on in the story, he presents himself as an anti-intellectual. In describing how men with whom he has spoken have imagined God, the narrator says, "...they visualize Him as being like Michelangelo's statue of Moses on the tomb of Pope Julius II, San Pietro in Vincoli, Rome" (x). He quickly dismisses his knowledge by saying, "I looked that one up in the encyclopedia!" (x). This statement is not just a denial of knowledge, but is an indictment of intellectuals. According to the book *Anti-Intellectualism in American Life*, there is a long history of distrust of

intellectuals that is consistently justified with accusations that they are manipulative, ungodly, and effeminate (Hofstadter, 180-196). After all, from whence comes the challenge to creationism or the charge that religion is a "universal neurosis" and the "opium of the people?" ("Challenges to Religious Experiences"). Intellectuals are such silver-tongued devils, figuratively and literally, that the narrator does not simply disavow his knowledge, he does so emphatically with the use of an exclamation point. In the years between 1870 and 1910, only about 9 of every 100 people graduated high school; this ratio remained unchanged until about 1950. Moreover, 60% of graduates between 1909 and 1910 were women (Snyder). By claiming to have looked up facts about a statue, the narrator is not just asserting that he is, like his compatriots, an ordinary man, but also distances himself from the feminine; it is an assertion that he is a "man's man" and can, therefore, be trusted.

The use the word "fellow," what would have been slang in the 1930's, to describe the main character of his story is yet another strategy the narrator uses to demonstrate equality. As a socio-linguistic device, slang denotes both in-group and out-group status. Used with in-group members, it denotes solidarity. While an array of other slang words could have been used such as "pal," "chum," "buster"- the use of "fellow" indicates that the men have shared interests, namely the work of Kiwanis ("Fellow"). Further, it is the root of "fellowship," a selling point of Kiwanis since its inception. "Fellowship," by definition is not just "friendship." According to Webster's New Collegiate Dictionary it means: "(b) the community of interest, activity, feeling or experience, i.e. a unified body of people of equal rank sharing in common interests, goals, and characteristics, etc.; (c)

partnership, membership" (455). Linking "fellow"ship with equality is powerful in that it implies that the fate of one Kiwanian should be taken to be the fate of all Kiwanians.

Lastly, "fellowship" has religious implications. 1 John 1:3 is one among several Bible passages that reference fellowship: "We proclaim to you what we have seen and heard, so that you also may have fellowship with us. And our fellowship is with the Father and with his Son, Jesus Christ" ("1 John 1:3"). While the word "fellowship" itself never appears in the story, the word "fellow" as referent for "fellowship" is meant to link these men, and all men of Kiwanis, together through the democratic ideals of equality and individually constructed merit, sanctioned through Christianity. This inclusion of Christianity cannot be ignored, for just as Christianity promises redemption, so too does Kiwanis. Kiwanis is the vehicle through which lives are transformed and the means by which members enjoy a fellowship of a higher order.

While no date is associated with the events that precipitated this story, the event itself upon which the story is centered has to have occurred somewhere between 1915, when Kiwanis was launched, and 1935, when the story was first published. Prior to this time, and even lingering into the twentieth century, weight had meaning. A man's weight could be an indication of a man's wealth; a man of girth was a man of leisure. In a patriarchal, capitalist society that equates status a personal value, a man whose potbelly indicated wealth was a man of status ("Social Darwinism"). However, by the 1930s, obesity becomes a concern for the medical community (Brewis). Indeed, "fatness" would eventually become a "key marker of inferiority, of an uncivilized, barbaric, and primitive body" (Erdman Farrell). As the narrator stresses the main character's obesity, saying, "He is one of those billowy, rolling fat men. I had put him in the largest chair in the room

because there is so much overhang when he sits in an ordinary chair (x)," he also emphasizes the man's moral turpitude. Vice, gluttony, greed, selfishness, uncleanness, sloth, and wastefulness are all implied in these descriptions of the main character.

The questionable morality of the main character is underscored in the narrator's description of the man's smoking habits, indicating vice and uncleanness. The narrator is particularly critical of the way in which the fellow lets ash fall from his cigar. The narrator says,

On his stomach at each button of his vest is a gully which runs across him. When the cigar is at its greatest length, the ashes fall off into the lowest gully. At the end of two minutes, the cigar has shortened up till the ashes fall in the second gully. Thus it goes. Each two minutes the shortening of the cigar drops the ashes in a higher and closer gully, until at the end of twelve minutes the cigar is burned and all the gullies are full of ashes. Then he generally spoils it all by laughing at something and all the ashes go tumbling down from the top gully into the next below, and so on until those in the last fully fall out onto the floor because he has no lap to catch them in" (x).

The narrator goes on to describe the main character as someone who is ill-tempered, self-pitying, and not terribly generous of spirit, at least in the beginning of the story. The narrator explains that the day the man is asked to take a child to children's hospital on behalf of his Kiwanis club as a day when everything is going awry, so much so that the main character is "holding a one-man lodge of sorrow for his own benefit," regards taking the child as a nuisance more than anything, and refers to the child as a "confounded kid" and even "it" (xi). It is clear, the main character is not a man whose weight represents wealth and proves the validity of Social Darwinism. Instead, this is a man whose physique, immobility, and very visage are the corporeal signs of a soul in turmoil, proven by his nearly hostile attitude toward the prospect of helping needy child.

There are 23 references to "ashes" in the Christian Bible. In many of these, ashes are linked to mourning and purification rituals ("Knowing Jesus"). Sometimes, as in the case of Numbers 19:10 and Isaiah 44:20, ashes reference living outside of faith or the path toward redemption ("Ashes"). The care of the narrator in describing how the ashes fall and are brushed away, therefore, is a metaphor for the main character's missed opportunities for redemption. As Kiwanians are bound in a fellowship of equals, his salvation is the group's salvation.

Yet, the men are not exactly equal within the Kiwanian sphere, despite the picture presented. While the narrator is himself is a Kiwanian, he is also a transcendent character who represents the hegemonic power of Institution. There are several telling strategies that validate the narrator-as-institutional power theory. First, the story does not exist without the narrator in any form, be it Kiwanian/author Roe Fulkerson, omniscient narrator, or narrator-as-character. Likewise, Kiwanians cannot exist as Kiwanis members without Kiwanis International.

Secondly, the narrator takes pains to establish his equality with readers/listeners; such effort implies that he is cognizant of the stratification among members. That the narrator is the one to address this stratification, to "rectify" it, indicates that he is the true power center of the story. From an organizational perspective, a similar power dynamic occurs within Kiwanis with its Trustees, members of the board of directors. Though these men (and today, women) are Kiwanians, they represent the upper stratus of Kiwanis membership. Ideally, the member/Trustee relationship mimics the democratic process, with Trustees carrying out the will of their constituents in the same way that elected political leaders are supposed to carry out the will of the proletariat. Irrespective of what

the catalyst for their actions may be, the decisions and agendas of the Trustees direct the energies and influence the operations of the organization and affect hundreds of thousands of members throughout the world.

Lastly, the narrator has descriptive and physical power over the main character, and ultimately, control over the listener (the third character who remains silent throughout the story) and the reader. Kiwanis International and its Trustees have the power to determine where international conventions will be held, what constitutes a club, whether charters will be revoked for non-compliance, and are able to apply myriad controls over clubs. As well, Kiwanis International, through its staff and trustees, control how Kiwanians see each other and how the world sees Kiwanians through discursive materials.

In the same way that victors control history, so too does the narrator of a story control the story. The timeline, tone, point of view, pace of the action, norms by which the story is told (formal versus informal, for example), and, ultimately, the reader/listener's emotional reaction to the story are controlled by the narrator (Szurmak and Thuna). The story, which is being told to an ever-silent third character, begins and ends in the present while the body of the story is told in retrospect, as the narrator's memory of being told the original tale by the main character. While this story could have unfolded without the narrator's first person account, the narrator nonetheless immediately inserts himself into the story. In fact, the story not only opens with the self-referencing line, "I know a fellow who once was God," the narrator uses "I" three times in the four sentence, opening paragraph (x). Further, the story cannot occur without the narrator, for it is his question ("I like to ask men what their idea is of the appearance of God") that

serves as the impetus for his first person narration and the retelling of the main character's story, at which point the narrator assumes an omniscient voice (xi). Lastly, though the narrator is supposed to be speaking directly to a presumably new Kiwanian (the third character), that voice is never heard, even at the conclusion of the story when the narrator speaks directly to the third character, telling him what to expect when they arrive at the convention to which they are en route; there is no turn-taking as would be expected in a conversation, particularly among "equals" (King, 205). The lack of turn taking between the narrator and the third character and the complete silence of the third character throughout the story demonstrates the power of the narrator as a long-time Kiwanian with membership seniority and the lack of power of the third character as a new Kiwanian. As well, the main character's agency realized only through the narrator's description, giving narrator complete ascriptive power over the main character. In this, it is evident that there are hierarchies and a locus of power even among a fellowship of equals and calls into question the supposed egalitarianism of club life.

Since the story could have been presented without the narrator acting as a character in the story, the question of why these devices are used must be addressed. Different narration techniques render different results for the reader and the story. Roe Fulkerson, the narrator/author of the story, was known to have a "flair for writing" and served as the editor of Kiwanis Magazine for many years. As an experienced and somewhat successful writer, his narrative techniques might be explained away simply as being the most interesting way to tell a story. However, given Fulkerson's relationship to Kiwanis and the influence he had within the organization and upon its members, this is not a comprehensive enough explanation of the narrative techniques.

Roe Fulkerson is counted among the most prominent members of Kiwanis International. It is Fulkerson who, directing the legislative committee, first proposes that the organization be led by a board of trustees and, quite controversially, contracts a "national organizer" who will act as a paid membership recruiter; this measure was ultimately approved (Hapgood, 28). Fulkerson also gives the nominating speech that leads to the unanimous election of Perry Patterson in 1918 (Hapgood, 37). It is Fulkerson who puts forth the idea that "Kiwanis" be reinterpreted and changed from "We Trade" to "We Build," a phrase which Fulkerson contends is inspired by God (Hapgood, 62); "We Build" stands as the interpretation of "Kiwanis." It is clear that Fulkerson is an accomplished writer and orator that he is not just a leader among his peers but a change agent within Kiwanis, and that Christianity is a significant cultural marker for him.

What is more, it is clear that Fulkerson's contributions to the organization added to the group's collective social capital, giving Fulkerson the right to also utilize this social capital. The silence of the third character in comparison with the constant talking of the narrator indicates that the third character, like all new Kiwanians, has not yet demonstrated a capacity to contribute to the collective social capital and cannot yet "consume" it; the third character is lower on the social stratum. Given his political position and influence within Kiwanis, his religious affiliation, and his gift for communication and persuasion, Fulkerson's narrative techniques and ability to convey message through them can hardly be dismissed as merely creative writing choices.

Attention should now be turned to other evidence that the narrator represents institutional power and authority. One among the proofs already offered is the idea that the narrator makes an effort to establish himself as a regular man and, thereby, proffer the



notion that Kiwanis membership has an equalizing effect on membership. The narrator does this in two significant ways. First, he frequently uses the personal pronoun "I," calls the main character "my friend," and uses the pronoun "we." Secondly, in disavowing his knowledge of the statue of Moses, as suggested earlier, he attempts to distance himself from learned men and the stigma of being learned among a populace that simply is not well educated. In fact, Fulkerson is quite educated by the standards of the day and worked in the professional capacity of optician before becoming part of the Kiwanis bureaucracy (Jonak and Stall). Moreover, the narrator quotes a quatrain from the Rubaiyat of Omar Khayyam, a roughly 800 year old poem whose popular translation had circulated since the 1850s ("Rubaiyat of Omar Khayyam").

Fulkerson's attempt to use the narrator to demonstrate the equalizing nature of club life is ironic in that hiding power can only be done by those with power. *Analyzing Genres in Political Communication: Theory and Practice*, presents the idea that politicians make efforts to establish solidarity with their audience, saying:

[the politician] "portrays himself as a protagonist who listens to the needs and, above all, is not estranged from ordinary people. Thus the small story is not of immediate relevance to the politician's argumentation, but rather serves as the interpersonal function signifying solidarity. This is reflected in the use of the personal pronouns I and you whose domain of reference is not clear-cut (Bull and Fetzer, 2006)'. Small stories provide political agents with the opportunity of presenting themselves as private agents who are simple ordinary people. The stories are used strategically to express alignment with the audience to reconstruct credibility and responsibility" (Cap and Okulska, 95).

Cap and Okulska's explanation is applicable to Fulkerson's telling of the story; establishing credibility with the audience is central to ethos and important for any speaker. Fulkerson, the writer, is nothing if not a politician within the institution of Kiwanis; and it is this position that highlights a darker side of Fulkerson's use of the

narrator-as -everyman since the obfuscation of power protects power (Stoddart, 201). Of Gramscian theories, Stoddart says that "ideological systems work to integrate people into social networks of oppression and subordination" (209). In club life, social capital cannot be built without a social network of members. This network carries with it the inferred promise that, bound together in fellowship and a shared world view, members can count on each other for favors with an investment of their own time. Presenting the club as a place of realized democracy infers the guarantee that every club member has equal access to equal "shares" of social capital. In a society that equates one's worth as an individual to the right to "consume," the recognition of power and hierarchy shatters the illusion of democracy (Weeks, 48-64). The recognition of power forces the recognition that the earning of spending of social capital is dependent on and corresponds to status, and those closest to the real locus of power -the institution- enjoy more status and the benefits therein, including decision-making, access to information and knowledge, and the ability to speak.

The narrator's power allows him to decide whether the main character, the fellow, will be a member of the group or will be estranged from the group. Frequently, the narrator "others" him, associating the main character with the inferior, ineffectual, or deficient. To do this, the narrator associates the main character with socially-accepted, stereotypically feminine traits and behaviors. For example, the narrator remarks, "The conversation lagged because the fat man was getting sentimental. He tried hard to act hardboiled, but it was all surface. His hardness is like the lipstick on a girl's lips... Beneath there is a warm -- Oh, well. What I mean is that he is a big sissy" (xi). He goes on to use the pejorative "sissy" in relationship to the main character's emotions two more

times; and in another instance, "He was as busy as a young lady centipede putting on her stockings, and mad besides!" (xi). The narrator concludes the story by warning the third character that, should he see the narrator with black eyes at the upcoming convention, it is because the main character assaulted him for re-telling the story of how the main character came to be God. To that end, he tells the third character that the main character is a "sissy" about "sentimental things" (xii). Beyond being another means of asserting his power, these associations to the feminine serve to underscore the premise that the main character is a lost man in need of salvation. The last line of the story reflects this idea. In it, the narrator says, "He may be a sissy about sentimental things, but he used to be a football player!" (xii). What we see is that, at one point, the main character had all the attributes appropriated to masculinity and male gender role identity as defined by a rejection of the feminine, a propensity toward aggression, assumption of control and power, self-reliance and the quest for success but somehow he lost his way ("Gender Stereotypes").

The presentation of the main character as a "lost" man is also demonstrated in the narrator's objectification of the main character. In speaking of him, the narrator says, "I hope you will pardon the detail, but it is fascinating to watch him," as if the main character is an animal in the zoo or the principal feature of a spectator sport (x). From a feminist perspective, objectification can signal: "instrumentality: the treatment of a person as a tool for the objectifier's purposes; fungility: the treatment of a person as interchangeable with other objects ("Feminist Perspectives on Objectification").

In another example, the narrator says of the main character, "I had put him in the largest chair in the room..." (x). The narrator does not say that he suggests the main

character sit in the largest chair or that he directed him to sit in a particular chair. The main character is neither infirmed nor inebriated, so he is physically capable of sitting without assistance. Yet, the narrator places the main character in a seat as if he were a thing. Foucault explains, "space is fundamental in any exercise of power" ("Space, Power and Knowledge"). Sullivan, in *Revealing Whiteness*, says that privilege "hides... in habits of controlling space, including the way that other people live in that space" (158-159). By deciding where the main character should sit and by physically placing him there, the narrator limits all other seating options available to the main character. The narrator, therefore, does not simply have ascriptive power over the main character, he also has physical power over him, which the main character accepts; and in this is seen a subtle assertion of masculine dominance to stereotypical feminine passivity. In other words, the main character's acceptance of being placed in a chair is an indication that he has willingly relinquished his agency to the narrator.

The main character's ascribed identity, loss of agency, objectification, and submission to the narrator in comparison to the narrator's power and control reaffirms stereotypical ideas of male dominance and female passivity. This power dynamic is reinforced through paternalism. For example, the narrator gives an explanation for "placing" the main character in the chair, saying, "because there is so much overhang when he sits in an ordinary chair" (x). In this way, the narrator makes an effort to convince not just the main character, but also the third character and the reader, that, although he is limiting the main character's options, he is doing so for his own benefit.

Most striking about this micro-level look at the relationship between the main character and the narrator is that it reflects the macro-level relationship between the club

members and institution in that the narrator controls the story, and in controlling the story controls the man's redemption. That is to say, without the narrator, the redemption story does not exist; it is the story that creates the reality. Likewise, it is the institution that promises to deliver the member into beneficial relationships of democratic equality.

Szurmak and Thuna, in discussing the power of point of view and narrative, maintain,

"Progressing through the events of a story by the means of a narrative path that contextualizes these events and creates scope for embedding details within a guiding structure is the way in which people deal with life. It is so, perhaps, because this is how they learn" (547).

Fulkerson, as both a narrator of and character in the story, is the literal framer of the story. The story begins and ends with him; and it is he who is making sense of the events for the audience for the purpose of conveying the lesson that becoming part of the workings of the institutional machine has redemptive power and that the institution of Kiwanis as one that has an "equalizing effect" among men, even the most flawed, unworthy, or socially backward or lost men like the main character.

The third character and the reader understand that the main character is eventually redeemed because he becomes God, as the title and the first line of the story tell us. As he is redeemed, so too are his fellow Kiwanians thanks, in part, to the equalizing effect of the institution. Moreover, consider that the narrator reports that he frequently asks men what their conception of God is. This description is interpreted by Fulkerson the writer and conveyed by the narrator as reminiscent of the statue of Moses on the tomb of a Pope. This has the effect of linking Kiwanians to the Divine via the narrator's interpretation and generalization of their description: Moses had direct interaction with God. A pope is, by Catholic tradition, the embodiment of Christ on earth. Fulkerson's description subtly intimates that Kiwanians also "interact" with God. Fulkerson again

uses this technique by having the narrator quote a quatrain from the Rubaiyat of Omar Khayyam to the third character. The quatrain reads:

Ah love! Could you and I with Him conspire  
To grasp this sorry Scheme of Things entire,  
Would we not shatter it to bits -- and then  
Re-mould it more to the Heart's Desire (xi)

In selecting this quatrain, we see that the Divine's bidding is realized not through just human intervention, but specifically through Kiwanis intervention. He says, "God has taken this happy, laughing bunch of Kiwanians and used them as instruments to carry out His divine will" (xii). However, Fulkerson-the-writer cannot move his audience to adopt his intended view of Kiwanis without first demonstrating the salvation and new-found righteousness of the main character. This is done expressly in the narrator's account of the interaction between the "crippled child" and the main character as they drive to children's hospital.

The child asks if the man is God, and this is quickly refuted. The child, however, surmises that if the man driving is not God, he must at least work for Him (since he overheard his mother praying the night before for help, which ultimately comes in the form of the main character). To this, the main character says, "I guess I am, son, but I'm afraid I'm only a part-time employee. I don't work for him regularly, but I'm going to do a lot more work for him from now on!" (xi). There are two telling indications of the man's redemption and now higher moral standing. First, the child is no longer referred to as "it." The main character has become paternalistic toward the child, referring to him as "son." Of course, the reference to the child as a "son" also confers the status of the Divine to main character. Secondly, the narrator notes that the man is crying and that those tears are "mixing with the ashes in the gullies across his stomach" (xi). In a sense,

the narrator is chronicling acts related to Biblical purifying rituals ("Ashes"). The main character, by his own efforts and by operating within in congruence with the expectations of the institution, has ceased to be a Kiwanis member and become a "Kiwanian," and in doing so enjoys success. As the narrator says, "My fat friend has realized this dream. He had been mistaken for God and for the nonce<sup>1</sup> was God to one crippled child!" (xii). Thus, the message is clear: if the main character can become "God," all men can through the institution of Kiwanis.

*Artifact 3: "Join the Club" Membership Brochure*

The 2012 "Join the Club" brochure exemplifies two complementary ideologies with origins in manufacturing: social efficiency and behavioral engineering. In economic terms, social efficiency is a cost-pricing principle that concerns itself with finding the nexus between demand price and marginal cost (Watkins). Behavioral engineering concentrates on six areas where "problems" can be identified and corrected (Gilbert). These areas are: (1) data, (2) instruments, (3) incentives, (4) knowledge, (5) capacity, and (6) motives. Both ideologies are applicable to Kiwanis for a variety of reasons. First, each model operates from a deficits perspective, meaning that it is meant to identify and address a gap. In business, the gap identified by social efficiency relates to setting the optimum price point; in behavioral engineering the point is to identify where performance is poor and use data to propose solutions to improve performance. In Kiwanis, the gap is what is missing in a community, in the life of a perspective member, and in the life of youth; and all of this is to be addressed by Kiwanians and Kiwanis programs.

---

<sup>1</sup> This is a direct quote from Hapgood's reprint of Fulkerson's story. "Nonce" does not appear to be a typo.

Secondly, social efficiency speaks to the production chain of raw material, laborer, and finished product. It is this conception, quickly adopted and adapted by the education field that is most relevant to this analysis. Franklin Bobbitt, who led the movement to translate the business interpretation of social efficiency into an educational model, saw parallels between employees and students as "raw material," a finished product and the adults coming out of the education system, and factory workers and teachers as the hands through which raw materials pass to become the final product (Bobbitt). In this same fashion, the 2012 membership brochure treats youth and would be Kiwanis members as "raw material;" Kiwanians (those Kiwanis members who have had their "Kiwanis moment," that defining experience that solidifies commitment to the organization) are the desired finished product; and the institution of Kiwanis acts as the teacher/factory worker.

For its part, behavioral engineering, with its focus on modifying performance, is a means of re-civilizing society. In *Service Clubs in American Society*, Charles writes, "... instead of changing community conditions to better serve youth, members proposed to train youth to better adapt to society (122-123). This idea is congruent with the evolution of service organizations, which began to "place responsibility on the individual –who could achieve success by self-adjustment," (Charles, 24, 121-122).

As social efficiency has been explained and related to the 2012 "Join the Club" brochure, this analysis will discuss the ways in which the concepts of "raw material," "finished product," and "factory worker/teacher" are evident in the artifact and how sociological family dynamics play a part in this. The idea of "family" is an important one in Kiwanis' culture and discursive materials; and "family" is a recurring theme of the



2012 "Join the Club" brochure. Correlating Kiwanis to family also fits with Bobbitt's interpretation of social efficiency: children are the raw materials. Related adults are the teachers/factory workers, and social cohesion and the perpetuation of society are the finished products. Allusions to family in Kiwanis discursive material promote this perspective. In *The Problem with Work: Feminism, Marxism, Antiwork Politics, and Postwork Imaginaries*, author Kathi Weeks makes the case that children are, essentially, communal commodities. That is, they are the producers and consumers of tomorrow and, as such, do not just have the potential to produce capital, but to also "reproduce society" (141). This is very evident in Kiwanis, where children and youth are considered the lifeblood of the organization.

The urgency to recruit youth is as strong today as it was in the early days of Kiwanis when the need to adapt to having become an international organization called for linking membership growth and youth-oriented service projects as a means of creating a unified international organization (Hapgood, 70). Nearly one hundred years later, this is still a concern. For example, in 2014, 45,000 "graduating Key Club and CKI alumni" (high school and college Kiwanis programs) were added to Kiwanis' membership rosters as "associate members." This membership is valid for one year and has no corresponding fee. It is hoped that these youth will respond to this incentive and become full-fledged Kiwanians after their one year associate member status expires ("Just the Facts"). To that end, district and club level leadership where these people live are charged by the International office and the membership campaign with trying to connect the associate members to specific clubs ("The Formula"). As well, current candidates for International

Trustee, Arthur Riley and Frank Arenz, both promote the idea of supporting youth and link membership growth and youth leadership development either implicitly or explicitly.

Lastly, it should also be noted that the membership application that is contained in the 2012 "Join the Club" brochure is only a preliminary one. Once the prospective member agrees to join and pays a fee, a fuller application is submitted for acceptance or denial of membership. This application asks specifically about the prospective member's past Service Leadership Program participation ("Kiwanis Membership Information"). These efforts underscore a long-standing cultural expectation to cultivate the next generation of Kiwanians, typically through youth-oriented programming called "Service Leadership Programs." From the elementary school-focused Kiwanis Kids, which encompasses the Terrific Kids and Bring Up Grades programs, through the post-secondary-focused Circle K International, youth programs are points on a continuum intended to end at becoming a Kiwanian as defined as an adult who is a member of a club and not part of the Aktion Club. Aktion clubs focus on adults with disabilities, usually cognitive, and members of Aktion clubs are not counted as part of Kiwanis general membership but rather as part of its Service Leadership Programs membership. Each of these touts "leadership opportunities," "leadership development," a place to "become capable leaders," or positions itself as a "leadership program." At the same time, leadership is linked to performing community service as each youth program has a community service aspect. By participating in a Kiwanis youth program, youth become the next wave of the "more intelligent, aggressive, and serviceable citizenship" that Kiwanis is charged with cultivating, according to the Objects (Artifact #1).

With all of this concentration on youth and youth programs, it is important to keep in mind that the audience of the 2012 "Join the Club" brochure is the potential adult member, defined as 18 years of age or older, who is being "sold" an opportunity to have the potential to shape the public sphere by influencing both their community and the youth of their community. To that end, it is significant that the brochure depicts, either through text or visual images, Kiwanis as a family. Applied sociology related to the family dynamic treats the family as a "mini-society" that mirrors larger society and adheres to the same defining characteristics. These characteristics, or controls, include hierarchy and hierarchical structures, socialization, segregation, ritual, and understanding and reacting appropriately to social cues ("Applying Applied Sociology"). Of these, segregation, hierarchy, and socialization are pertinent both to the depiction of the organization as a family and to this analysis.

To illustrate the concept of "segregation," consider that while youth-oriented programs are collectively referred to as "Service Leadership Programs," each independently referred to as a "Kiwanis-family" organization. In another example, membership as a whole is referred to as the "Kiwanis family," but this reference serves as the heading under which bullet points about the inclusion of "all ages" in Kiwanis membership and "more than 15,000 clubs for adults and youth" (panel 3, outside). Clearly, youth and adults are part of the entire package, but each group has its own domain.

In terms of hierarchy and hierarchical structures, visual representations of adults and children together, where the adult's face is seen, shows adults either in the foreground or directing children (panel 1, outside cover; panel 2, inside). In these examples, adults

dominate the frame space. On the front panel, the adult is taller than either of the children (though she is bent down). She is wearing red, a "power color" ("The Color Red"). Lastly, she controls the object being examined by the children. In the center panel, the children walk behind four adults, implying adult dominance. The children all wear "uniforms" of jean shorts, tennis shoes, and identical tie-dyed shirts. Three of the four adults wear their own clothes; the fourth adult is dressed in the same fashion as the youth. The two adults occupying the center of the frame are women. They are animated and have their arms wide open. The eldest woman stands out in the field. She has white hair and is wearing a white sweater set, light khakis, and white tennis shoes. A third photo, under the section dedicated to encouraging membership as a way to eradicate Maternal and Neonatal Tetanus worldwide, depicts a child who is grasping the finger of an adult. Nothing of the adult save the hand can be seen. To the other side of the child rests a bottle being grasped by an adult hand; again, the hand is the only visible part of the adult. The adult, then, has the ultimate power over the infant: to feed and comfort him or her.

Parenting for Social Change points out that parent-directed interactions between adults and children are often symptomatic of internalized paradigms of control common to "institutions, systems, cultures, and societies that are built on power and control over others" ("Power Over or Power With Children?"). The photographs involving children reflect this notion. On the cover page, a photograph shows a woman interacting with children. On the inside cover, another photo shows four adults walking with a group of similarly-dressed youth. The men in this photo are literally in the periphery, flanking the group; the two women are centered in the frame. In photographs of children and adults

together, women are most physically closest to the children, reflecting traditional woman-as-caregiver norms.

These photos stand in sharp contrast to other photos in the brochure that show members engaged in Kiwanis business. In these instances, men are centered in the frame and are also shown with symbols of power within Kiwanis: the gong, the gavel, the Kiwanis logo. A photo on the front cover of the brochure seems to be an exception to this. However, closer inspection reveals another story. This picture shows a group gathered around a long conference table, and all the attention is turned to a woman sitting at the "head" of the table - a power position. Like the picture of the woman directing the learning of the children, this woman, too, wears red. It appears that she is in control of the meeting. However, the angle of the shot pushes her far back into the frame; it is the men of the group who are closest to the fore. Additionally, the symbols of power, in this case the gong and the gavel, are at the other end of the table where a male arm can be seen in the shot. With the males and the symbols of power concentrated in the fore and the woman pushed to background, we see that the presentation of egalitarianism between the genders is superficial, if not illusory.

In sum, photographs that show adults and children associate women with caregiving by physical proximity in the frame while photographs of adults men and women may focus on a woman by putting her in the center of the frame, but the symbols of power are in closest proximity to the men in the photos. Feminist theory typically views the private as political. The structures of families and of social systems are reflective of the state of the political state of women. While the question of whether members have held leadership positions within Kiwanis was not disaggregated by gender,

referring to the demographic survey, it follows that the numbers of women in leadership roles will be relatively small. Approximately 40% of respondents to the 2014 membership demographic survey are female. Of these same respondents, only 24% saw diversity as a way to address shrinking membership numbers at the club-level. Of the 20 trustees, only four are women. For the second time in its 100-year history, a woman is vice president, and fall 2015 will mark the first time that a woman will have assumed the role of president. As the 2012 language of the "Join the Club" brochure repeatedly correlates Kiwanis to family, the contrast in these types of photos illustrate the way in which Kiwanis reflects the roles of women in society and in familial life, but also how deeply the "internalized paradigms of control common to institutions, systems, cultures, and societies' that are built on power and control over others" is apparent in "parent-directed" interactions between adults and children.

This brings us to a second observation related to parent-child power dynamics as depicted in the brochure. While the Kiwanians interacting with youth are not parents of that youth, they do assume a quasi-parenting role in those interactions since would-be members are asked to "come be a good influence," to "change young people's lives," and to "guide" young people. Creating distinct realms for youth and adults within Kiwanis serves as a figurative familial control and a literal societal control that aids in establishing hierarchical structures, of which the perspective member will be a part. In sociological and familial segregation, there is an innate and unequal distribution of power; in families, this power is in the hands of elders. In business, this power is most typically concentrated in the hands of managers and executives. In Kiwanis, this power is seemingly with the adult Kiwanian in relationship to the youth he or she influences. Thus, it is the promise

to have the ability to modify the behavior of youth, to "re-civilize" successive generations, that is the selling point for a potential Kiwanis member.

Despite strictly interpreted roles and expected, corresponding behaviors, and the imbalance of power in control paradigms, segregation and hierarchy will fail if the segregation is so complete that parts of the whole cannot function toward the realization of the same end product. That is to say, factory workers and managers and executives operate in different spheres, but they do so with the end goal of creating a commodity. Children and adults of a family may often function independently of one another, but a healthy family incorporates moments of overlap for the sake of family bonding. In Kiwanis, the same dynamic is in effect. Youth have their own programs as do adults. However, each group is united around certain beliefs which lead to social cohesion. The key to this cohesion is socialization, defined as "the creation of shared beliefs and ideals that lead to the norms of a micro society. Socialization is the indicator as to how one should interact within a society" ("Applying Applied Sociology"). Here, socialization functions as a method of behavior engineering in that the visual elements underscore the importance of order and procedures and deference to authority while the language of the brochure attempts to establish a sense of connectedness and of social cohesion.

Photos on the front panel, for example, depict a modern club meeting and a convention (1917 or after as the American and British flags are shown; Kiwanis become an international organization at the 1916 Convention). In the modern photo, meeting participants are gathered around a large conference table focusing their attention on one participant. At the end of the table opposite the participant are two powerful Kiwanis symbols: the gavel and the gong. These signify that a meeting is official, and are used

when beginning or ending a meeting. These symbols of civility tell the onlooker that the participant to whom all attention is given has the floor and that prescribed protocols are being observed. Likewise in the International Convention photo, participants are seated in neat rows with their attention focused on an elevated platform. Between the American and British flags, and below the Kiwanis logo that hangs between them, is a sign that mentions "individual responsibility." Again, orderliness, procedures, and decorum prevail.

This theme is carried elsewhere in the brochure. For example, on the inside of the cover panel, there are three pictures. One is of a Kiwanis meeting. Again, there is a central figure with participants gathered around a table that has the gong prominently positioned. Behind the central figure is both the Canadian flag and the club's Kiwanis banner. Below this is a picture of the Kiwanis International building - a long, low building with aesthetically pleasing, symmetrical windows and porticos perched on a perfectly manicured lawn. The last photo on this page is of the gong and gavel. On the inside of the back cover, there are two photos from the early days of Kiwanis. One features a row of children arranged boy-girl fashion. Each is standing on a scale. Beside this is another convention photo, this time in a well-appointed banquet hall. Members are well-dressed, donning ties and jackets, and are arranged around tables or are standing along a wall to pose for the picture. The orderliness of the subjects in the photos and the rituals, procedures and conduct depicted literally illustrate the idea that Kiwanis is a micro-society with traditions, a power and control structure, rules of comportment, and individual responsibility for the greater good that is built around order and group identity, marked by the symbols of Kiwanis.



The language of the brochure undergirds this idea, running threads of social cohesion and group-mindedness throughout the brochures. Pertinent phrases include: "a place to connect," "members enjoy the company of friends who share their passion for service," "we change lives," "As a Kiwanis club member, you'll have a chance to change young people's lives --by getting directly involved," and "As a Kiwanis club member, you'll become part of a global organization..." As well, some language speaks directly to the traditional Kiwanis target audience, professionals, by presenting membership as a "networking" opportunity and a "gratifying return on a reasonable investment of time." Here, we see nods to Tocqueville's concept of "self-interest rightly understood," as social cohesion, social responsibility, and individual rewards are linked. This language promises the potential member that he or she can mold future generations (and by extension, society at large or even the world), that he or she can build a personal legacy by becoming part of a global organization that is 100 years old, or that he or she can simply make friends or business connections by becoming a member, which implies believing in and promoting the organization's goals and priorities, accepting personal identification through membership status, and conforming to the organization's expectations. Potential members, in fact, agree to this in writing by signing a statement on the enclosed preliminary application that reads, "I accept this application for membership and agree to conform to the bylaws of this club and comply with the obligations of membership as explained to me by my sponsor."

At the beginning of this analysis, I proposed that the ideologies of social efficiency and behavioral engineering are dominant in the 2012 "Join the Club" brochure. To make that case, I put forth the argument that Kiwanis functions like a micro-society in

the same way that a family is a micro-society. To that end, I discussed the use of the word "family" and Kiwanis' disposition toward and purpose for segregation among age groups, and presented and related ideas from Kathi Weeks, "Parenting for Social Change," and from the field of applied sociology. As well, I applied the social efficiency model to Kiwanis by first presenting the deficit that the 2012 "Join the Club" brochure hopes to resolve: a lack of members. I pointed out that this is addressed by attempting to cultivate youth interest in the organization through Service Leadership Programs and the associate member designation for past Service Leadership Program participants and by recruiting adult members. In both of these instances, the youth and the would-be member are the "raw material" of the social efficiency model. Then, I made the case that it is through the institution of Kiwanis that people come to be "Kiwansians," the "finished product," with Kiwanis functioning akin to the way the elders of a family ultimately generate adults. I also posited that the ability to create or to shape behavior implies control and reflects the concept of behavioral engineering. Accordingly, I argued that just as managers and executives evaluate and propose steps to alter employee behavior or adults in families model behavior and offer corrective actions to children, Kiwanis shapes behavior through socialization through culture, practice, and product; the discursive elements of the 2012 "Join the Club" brochure illustrate a shared belief in civic responsibility that yields a dividend and deference to power and authority as means to create social cohesion, to re-civilize successive generations of Kiwanians.

## *Findings*

We think from, but not necessarily about, ideology. Yet, ideology is always present, and ideological perspectives often becomes apparent through behaviors, displays of power, belief systems, and group identification, which are expressed both through social practices, human interactions, and discursive material (Dared et al, 69). Of ideology, *The Critical Pedagogy Reader* says that it has both positive and negative functions (Dared et al, 69). As a positive function, ideology helps provide "frameworks of thought" by which humans make sense of the world, give meaning to situations or relationships, and form groups (Dared et al, 69). The Kiwanis artifacts are utilized in this way for in-group members. For example, the argument has been made that the use of the word "that" in the phrase "that sound public opinion" of Object 6 of Artifact 1 indicates that the Kiwanians of 1924 were united in a common understanding about their world. Use and citation of the Objects by today's Kiwanians indicates they, too, have that same shared common understanding.

Ideology has a negative function as well. *The Critical Pedagogy Reader* refers to the work of John Thompson, who asserts that the negative functions are dissimulation, legitimation, fragmentation, and reification (Dared et al). Dissimulation concerns itself with "concealed," "denied," or "obscured" dominance (70). Legitimation speaks to the preservation, perpetuation, and normalization of a system of domination that is presented repeatedly and accepted as "legitimate and worthy of respect" (70). Fragmentation "occurs when relations of domination are sustained by the production of meanings in a way which fragments groups so that they are placed in opposition to one another" (70). Reification "occurs when transitory historical states of affairs are presented as permanent,

natural, and commonsensical -as if they exist outside of time" (70). These "modes," as Thompson calls them, are evident in all three Kiwanis artifacts. There is a sense that the community service acts in which Kiwanians engage are demonstrable proofs of their superior morality. These acts, however, center largely on directing the populace to be of better character. For example, in the Objects, much effort is directed at developing the habits of the populace. It is through community service that the main character in "The Man Who Was God" (re)claims his morality. In the 2012 "Join the Club" membership brochure, service is directed at the potential ability to have a hand in the character education of youth. With the Objects and the membership brochure, values and appropriate comportment for other are set by Kiwanians, making legitimation and fragmentation evident. "The Man Who Was God" demonstrates the importance and place of the institution as the way to truly become part a productive member of society. Reification, therefore, is clear here.

There is little doubt that the work of Kiwanians makes the world a better place. The roster of impactful service projects on a global scale is immense and impressive. However, it is also clear that while the ideologies of Kiwanis bolster the in-group experience and social cohesion of members, they also serve to justify, maintain, and perpetuate an imbalance of power between members and the public that tilts in Kiwanis' favor. Community service is the locus of this power imbalance. Service has been part of the organization for nearly 100 years. Clubs are required by bylaw to engage in community service; and community service is offered by many as an explanation for joining ("Member Demographic Survey, 2014"). Additionally, one moves from becoming a member to being a "Kiwanian," when an overwhelming "Kiwanis moment"

occurs through service. Community service is the Kiwanis way of being, making it a transcendent and reifying act.

Thompson's negative-function modes, the power imbalance and importance of institution are well exemplified in the artifact "The Man Who Was God." Though the story has a feel-good element, it becomes clear that the person with the ability and resources necessary to address an issue assumes a power position when rendering aid. The recipient assumes the subordinate, objectified position. This power dynamic often leads to a paternalistic view, if not outright protective treatment, of those in subordinate power positions. Paternalism takes the position that the person with power knows what is best for others and is obliged to act accordingly, thwarting the ability of the recipient of service to engage in self-determination. This is seen in the physicality of the situation: the boy's mother must depend on the Kiwanian to assist her child, and the boy is "crippled" (xi).

Language choices can be evidence of paternalism. It is his interaction with the "object" of the act of service, the child, that reminds the main character of his implied, innate integrity. The term "object" is employed intentionally, for it is how the main character initially regards the child (xi). It is not until the child elevates the man to the status of God, and "others" himself by recognizing that his physical condition sets him apart from other boys that the "object" becomes human. In other words, his humanity is not restored until he accepts his subordinate role. It is at the point that the child simultaneously humbles himself and equates the main character to God that he is humanized by being called "son" (xi). Even then, his humanness is not innate but

ascribed by the main character and the narrator, reducing the child to an object lesson for the main character.

Religious imagery also helps to make this story one of elevated paternalism. The main character mistaken for "God" and the boy as "son" is a rather obvious metaphor for God, the Father, and humans as children of God. Beyond this however, the main character's anger, bad habits, and reluctance to help indicate he is also a lost "child" of "God." While it could be argued that the main character was always intrinsically moral since he transported the boy to the hospital despite his initial resistance, it is the actual act of service that restores the main character's integrity for the narrator. The act of service, therefore, becomes a redemptive sacrifice and, in this regard, alludes to the sacrifice of Christ by God. In this, the institution of Kiwanis takes on tremendous import, for it is the institution that provides the forum for the sacrifice, as well as the main character's redemption and his rise to the status of "God." Thus, community service through Kiwanis is not simply an action given life through an organization, it is a way to realize a heightened morality and exercise power in a way that is normalized, legitimated, and made transcendent by relying on language that recalls Christianity and family, both spiritually and corporeally.

The power imbalance between Kiwanians and community members is demonstrated in the artifacts, but it becomes an identifiable behavior in actual community service where paternalism is often actualized. Kendall suggests that community service becomes paternalism when the service project is taken on as charity and lacks reciprocity (9-10). Reciprocity would dictate that both the givers and the receivers of service collaborate in creating and implementing a service project and that

each is considered a learner as well as a teacher (Kendall, 22). The artifacts lack evidence of such reciprocity. For example, despite calling Kiwanis youth programming a "two-way street," the reciprocity to which Kendall refers, the "reciprocity" is limited to the Kiwanians receiving "fresh inspiration" from the youth involved in the programs (center panel, inside). For their part, the youth receive a "good influence" from the Kiwanians, which is consistent with the trend found in all the artifacts to alter the character and behavior of others. In both "The Man Who Was God" and the Objects, reciprocity relates not to the sharing of resources but to the dynamic of investments and dividends. The investments, time and moral direction, are made only by Kiwanians. In "The Man Who Was God," the dividend is a feel good moment. In the Objects and the membership brochure, the dividend is a citizenry that adheres to white, middle class norms and values.

By precept, the planning and implementation of community service projects also lacks reciprocity. For example, Kiwanis produces a form called "Rediscovering your community." The form is meant to help identify community needs so that a project that is relevant and responsive can be undertaken. This survey recommends the following list of people be contacted:

- Club partners
- Members of other groups with which the club already has a relationship
- Community leaders
- Government officials
- Public safety officials
- School administrators
- Service Leadership Program faculty advisors and students
- Chamber of commerce leaders
- Librarians
- Members of the local media
- Hospital directors
- Members of faith-based organizations

- “Key” business owners
- Representatives of other organizations serving children (e.g., Boys & Girls Clubs)
- Residents/commuters (to gauge needs with impromptu interviews)

New club members and existing club members will sometimes be included in the list of potential interviewees. The results of the survey are used to generate ideas for community service projects or to determine if existing projects still have import for the club. Most striking about this list is that, with the exception of "Residents or commuters," all the recommended points of contact are the traditional power brokers of a patriarchal, capitalist society. Their points of view about what a community needs are naturally influenced by their positions of privilege and possibly informed by political agendas. Additionally, explicit mention of a community's power brokers to the virtual exclusion of ordinary community members communicates the attitude that community members have little information or can contribute very little to the design of service projects. Since this a document created by, published by, and used as a teaching tool by Kiwanis International, the omission seems a ratification of service as a do-to or do-for rather than a do-with, endeavor.

There is additional evidence to support the idea that input from and participation by non-Kiwanians is not recognized as a missing portion of the service project planning process. First, the "Rediscovering your community" survey is brief and superficial. Rather than a needs assessment that gathers both quantitative and qualitative data, it is a list of interview questions around perceptions of community needs and recommendations for service projects to be answered by the most prominent community members. A more thorough assessment, the sort of which is standard practice in the business, social service, and non-profits sectors, could provide information about poverty levels, working



conditions, family and living arrangements, crime, and community assets such as nonprofits, civic centers, faith centers, recreation centers, and data about on civic participation by community members. All of this information, along with interviews with a wider range of people, could more fully inform the project planning process and provide a platform for real reciprocity with the community. This is not to make the assumption that individual Kiwanians or individual clubs do not go through the steps of garnering in-depth information about a community or do not engage average community members. Some may. However, there is no system within Kiwanis International that tracks exactly how clubs engage in community service planning and implementation, and herein rests the issue.

Structuration theory as it relates to groups and organizations suggests that "formal structure substitutes for and preempts other communication" (Littlejohn and Foss, ends, 450-453). The lack of a community engagement tracking system, comprehensive needs assessment forms that are standardized and promoted by the International office, and community engagement procedures that demand reciprocity demonstrates institutional traditionalist thinking and even a disregard for community. Structuration theory would also say that community, as whole, represents another identifiable group within the Kiwanis organization, along with members and International office employees. However, members who do not represent the powerbroker set are kept on the periphery by institutional practices and attitudes. An organization built on the idea of and dedicated to community service must regard those it serves in the same way members and employees are regarded. However, the artifacts demonstrate ideologies that are incompatible with encouraging such a situation; these ideologies have translated into a

lived reality in service project planning and implementation that largely ignores the human element of community. That is to say, community is not thought of as a group of people with resources and knowledge to share, but rather a place to demonstrate superior morality. In this, community service projects acquire a semblance of community-based imperialism and neo-colonialism. A discussion about the imperialistic and neo-colonial aspects of service projects begin with a definition of terms. Webster's defines "imperialism" as follows:

- 1) a policy or practice by which a country increases its power by gaining control over other areas of the world
- 2) the effect that a powerful country or group of countries has in changing or influencing the way people live in other, poorer countries

A Google search of "definition + neo-colonialism" tenders this definition: "the use of economic, political, cultural, or other pressures to control or influence other countries, especially former dependencies." "Neo-colonialism" is defined by Webster's as "the economic and political policies by which a great power indirectly maintains or extends its influence over other areas or people" ("Neocolonialism").

It could be argued that the term "great power" is not an accurate assessment of the Kiwanis' position within American society, and so, the definition is not applicable here. "Great power" should be given parameters to demonstrate that, indeed, the definition is apropos to Kiwanis. First, Kiwanis is a membership association. As discussed in the review of literature, Tocqueville regarded associations as representative of the structures of a democratic society, as a means to teach citizens how democracy functions, and serves a catalyst to engage citizens in the politics. Secondly, if greatest is defined by scale and longevity, Kiwanis meets both these criteria. 2015 marks the 100th anniversary

of the organization, which counts 628,302 adult and youth among who represent nearly 8,200 clubs in more than 80 countries and regions ("Just the Facts, 2014"). Kiwanis is the third largest community service organization in the United States. The organization brought in nearly USD \$8.5 million in 2013-2014 ("2013-2014 Kiwanis International Annual Report"). Lastly, if greatness is measured by the company one keeps, then Kiwanis is among the elite of service organizations. Its current global partner to eliminate maternal and neonatal tetanus is UNICEF. Its past partners to eliminate Iodine Deficiency Syndrome were UNICEF and the Bill & Melinda Gates Foundation ("Press Room"). Several famous and influential people have been members of Kiwanis or participated in its youth clubs, including President Franklin D. Roosevelt, Indianapolis Mayor Greg Ballard, Senator Trent Lott, President Bill Clinton, Habitat for Humanity founder Millard Fuller, Joe Namath, Brad Pitt, and Elvis Presley (Woolley and Peters; "Celebs Who Were Key Clubbers").

The definitions of "neo-colonialism" vary slightly, but the nuances are significant as one deals with political policy and the other with political and cultural pressures as influencers on the marginalized. Such pressures are revealed in the artifacts, and the rhetoric of Kiwanis remains relatively consistent in the period between the organization's formative years and today. For example, in "The Men Who Wear the K," the book from which the artifact "The Man Who Was God" was sourced, annual themes often touted the importance of personal responsibility or linked patriotism to citizenship (Hapgood, 91, 226). Irrespective of the era, Kiwanis has long regarded its "job" to be one of educating others about proper conduct and "healthy attitudes," be it through character development programs or workshops on how to comply with the "the law" (Hapgood, 78, 91).

Policy as a tool to maintain power and influence is demonstrated in Kiwanis through both the absence of policies and protocols related to engaging out-group members, which has already been discussed, as well as actual policies that discourage out-group inclusion; the focus of this section will be those policies as communicated through the bylaws. Kiwanis' bylaws do not impede a club from organizing special committees ("Kiwanis International Bylaws: Article VI, Sec. 2)." However, that committees should consist exclusively of members is made evident both through the language of the bylaws and by the International office's own example. Article V, Section 8, Part E says that in order for a charter to be granted to a club, "officers, committees, and members" have been fully informed of their "obligations" in being representatives of Kiwanis ("Kiwanis International Bylaws"). This statement makes it clear that there is a power hierarchy within the structure of clubs and implies that committees are conceived of as made up only of members. Article XX relates to the ability of an International president to form a special committee, which is nonetheless "advisable by a majority of the Board of Trustees" (Kiwanis International Bylaws, Sec. 8). Section 6 says that any special committees may "consist of only one (1) member" ("Kiwanis International Bylaws"). As with Article V, Sections 6 and 8 illustrate the power dynamics of the organization and the importance of hierarchy in the Kiwanis' structure by distinguishing a "member" from the other, unnamed people who might serve on the special committee. Harkening back to the implicit committee exclusivity of Article V, it is understood that those who would make up a special committee would be comprised of Trustees and high-ranking Kiwanis International employees. Additionally, soliciting the opinions of only one typical member from among the general Kiwanis membership of nearly 244,000

adult members demonstrates an organizational attitude that garnering a variety of opinions is irrelevant. As well, it presumes that all the expertise needed to solve an issue is already to be found in the existing leadership. The "one member" approach to special committees is a not just paternalistic, it is a way to maintain power and control through exclusivity.

Adler and Kwon, in citing Burt's work on social capital, say that being privy to, manipulating, and deciding who gets information is one indicator of high social capital (24). They point out that access to multiple information points is also a marker of high social capital (24). Consequently, although a sole member may serve on a special committee, that one member is still an elite because he or she has access to information that no other average member has. In this we see that, even within structures of privilege, there is stratification. As well, bringing in one privileged member to represent the interests and concerns of hundreds of thousands of members is reminiscent of Kiwanis' endorsement of consulting with community powerbrokers to design community service projects and avoid potentially dissenting voices.

Smith says that the exercise of social power must involve rules that shape behavior of in-group and out-group members, and that discourse is an effective means to reach that end (Stoddart, 209-210). He also suggests that ruling relations on the macro-social level are replicated at the micro-social level (Stoddart, 210). Kiwanis International's rules and norms influence behavior at the club-level. On postcolonial attitudes, *Theories of Human Communication* says that when this occurs, those who are not part of a dominant group are "othered," objectified and "dominated by the process of knowledge reproduction" (Littlejohn and Foss, eds., 408). As Kiwanis' rhetoric,

practices, and policies demonstrate, open, inclusive community engagement is institutionally rejected; and community is regarded at all levels as a place to exercise power and spread a culturally singular view of "rightness."

Demonstrations of an imperialistic and neo-colonial view of community are not just found in community service projects. Membership recruitment practices are also at issue. In Kiwanis, the design of community service projects and membership recruitment are intrinsically intertwined when it comes to opening a new club. Therefore, a discussion of membership recruitment in conjunction with a discussion of community service projects is warranted. "The Dictionary of Unfamiliar Words" defines "imperialism" as "a policy of gaining power over other nations by seizing their territory or dominating their economies" ("Imperialism"). Hobson saw colonialism and imperialism differently, contending that imperialism is global and concerns itself with creating an economic advantage for colonizers (Milios and Sotiropolous, 12). Marxist theorist also distinguish colonialism from imperialism in economic terms, saying that imperialism represents the last phase of colonization in which capitalistic interests are forwarded and monopolies are formed (Milios and Sotiropolous, 12). In keeping with the view of these theorists, this discussion will focus on the economic implications of an imperialistic approach to member recruitment. First, however, it is important to understand the symbiotic nature of community service project development and membership recruitment.

Kiwanis utilizes a survey called the "Community exploration form" to gather information that will influence the decision to open a club in a particular location. A complement to the "Rediscovering your community" form, the "Community exploration

form" provides an opportunity to collect qualitative and quantitative data about a community. The quantitative data collection centers on demographics, economic and housing situations, and education and employment. Qualitative data is garnered through two interview questions. One asks what youth service programs should be started; the other asks what service projects a new club should take on. Like the "Rediscovering your community" form, these questions are solicited from a community's powerbrokers. Once visited by a Kiwanian, these powerbrokers are asked to provide names of others who should be visited to give opinions about potential community service project. In the course of gaining information about a community's, the powerbrokers are also asked to join the club as charter members. A charter member is one of the original 15 members needed to grant a new club a charter. Not infrequently, powerbrokers are asked to join a new club as a charter member even if only for the first year. The rationale for doing this is that by lending his or her "good name" to a club in formation, other people of prominence will want to join the club. The social and collective cultural capital that they represent will continue to be cultivated in recruiting more members up to, and hopefully beyond, the 15 required for charter ("The Formula: Workbooks for Club Openers and Club Counselors").

Status-influenced membership recruitment is not just limited to new club opening situations; existing clubs also source a limited pool of potential members. This happens in two significant ways. First, as Putnam points out in *Bowling Alone*, "like-minded people" have a propensity to "congregate in the same places" and the choices one makes are profoundly affected by the choices made by the company one keeps (Putnam, 310-312). He, as well as theorists like Bourdieu, suggests that social capital is not only the

natural by-product of cohesive groups, but that social capital is compounded when the advantaged form groups (Putnam 339-349, Bourdieu, 1-8; 10-17). Kiwanis' 2014 Demographic Survey demonstrates that Kiwanis members, in general, enjoy higher income levels, more advanced education, and status as professionals. Consequently, when members recruit from their sphere of influence, they are concentrating and consolidating their collective and individual social and cultural capital.

Documents from Kiwanis directed at membership recruitment reflect the notion that people with high social capital seek out and create relationships with people who also have high social capital. The "Hosting an Open House tool" recommends sources of potential recruits, ranging from chamber of commerce members to co-workers. "Step 2: Invite" of this form reads: "To get ideas for who to invite, check out the chamber of commerce list of businesses or conduct a roster analysis." However, the people most likely to join are those your members know well, such as:

- Friends
- Co-workers
- Clients
- Neighbors
- Family members
- Business professionals
- Other community leaders
- Church members

This document is a clear indication that Kiwanians are encouraged to find members from among their spheres of influence, where invited members also have access to the same kinds of privileged professional and social networks of Kiwanians. "Privilege," here, is meant to convey the idea that a status or cultural identifier has been so normalized that references to it seem commonsensical and could not possibly be seen as alienating. A reference to "church members" is an example of presenting and forwarding a privileged



position. The 2014 Demographic Survey shows that the majority of Kiwanis' members claim some sort of Christian faith. Of the 1,297 respondents who answered the question about faith, 108 skipped the question; 58 claimed atheism or agnosticism; 30 claimed spiritualism; 25 claimed Judaism; and 0 claimed Islam. Referencing "church" rather than a neutral term like "faith community," therefore, indicates how Christianity has been normalized to be a cultural indicator for Kiwanians. This same kind of privileging is found in the recommendation to recruit members from among "clients," "co-workers," and "business professionals." In this instance, the privileging, or normalization, is found in professional, rather than blue collar, status. Clients are the domain of business professionals; the co-workers of business professionals are most likely other professionals.

Beyond inviting members from one's own privileged sphere of influence, the second way membership recruitment happens is through targeted invitation of strangers. The "Roster analysis" mentioned above is meant to help clubs identify who is missing from their club, by occupation, and create a targeted recruitment list. The vast majority of these are white collar rather than blue collar jobs. For example, "J" references a janitorial supply company owner, but not a janitor. "O" lists office supply store owner, but not office supply store clerk. As discussed in the review of the literature and in the analysis of the artifacts, the Protestant Work Ethic has been and continues to be a major influencing ideology in Kiwanis. The Protestant Work Ethic regards work to be "a calling" (Bellah et al, "Habits" 65-66). Under capitalism, the Protestant Work Ethic correlates profession to status and is reflective of human value. The more prestigious one's job, as defined by the absence of physical labor, the more status one enjoys and is,

consequently, more highly regarded than his or her blue collar counterparts (Bellah, et al, "The Good Society," 264-266; Weeks, 38-61).

Also significant to this roster is the omission of "homemaker" from the "H" section. Weeks argues that, in a patriarchal, capitalist society, "work" is defined by production. Women, in their role as traditional caregivers, are not regarded by as producers because their work does not yield tangible results. As a result, the role of homemaker/caregiver is devalued (Weeks, 61-69). She also argues that that the disregard for work without an immediately recognizable economic impact makes work inherently gendered (Weeks, 61-69). Edmunds and Turner contend that today's society reflects a "national consciousness" that is based on the founding fathers' conception of themselves (95). This has created a "(masculine) generational consciousness" that ascribes definitions to women and demands that, if they are to be recognized, it is through conformity with male norms (96). The Roster analysis therefore, demonstrates that the value of women as potential contributors to a club's social capital is predicated on their ability to produce in the patriarchal, capitalist sense.

The value of social capital must be considered in an argument that posits that the Kiwanis approach to membership recruitment and community engagement reflects imperialistic tendencies. Imperialism concerns itself with protecting points of economic domination. Bourdieu argues that social and cultural capitals translate to economic capital in a process he calls "conversion," and that economic capital ensures social and cultural capital (14-17). Putnam offers a concrete example of this, saying "...many Americans -perhaps even most of us- get our jobs through personal connections. If we lack social capital, economic sociologists have shown, our economic prospects are

seriously reduced, even if we have lots of talent and training ("human capital")" (289).

Significantly, neither the sphere-of-influence nor the targeted recruitment methods focus on attracting members based on their interest in the community service initiatives of a club despite service being the primary directive of clubs. Nor do any of the tools for membership recruitment, such as the "Rediscovering your community" or "Community exploration" forms endorse involving community members beyond powerbrokers; the degree of social and cultural capital that an average community member might bring is questionable, but high social and cultural capital is nearly ensured when members are asked to recruit from among the privileged. Relative homogeneity helps protect and promote a club's social and cultural capital.

One of the markers of imperialism is the creation of monopoly (Milios and Sotiropolous, 12); and club homogeneity is one strategy to realize that aim because it allows a club to strategically market itself through implied exclusivity. Bourdieu argues that when there is competition for goods between "possessors of capital," perceptions of scarcity increases a good's value (6). The "appropriation of profits," he contends grants more power, especially power to govern, to the possessor of capital (6-7). Positioning a club as an exclusive body is important since Kiwanis, Rotary, and Lions are competing for essentially the same groups of privileged, professional members. As clubs attract more, prestigious members, who typically carry high social and cultural capital, the club's social and cultural capital increases, as does that of the other members of the club. Such clubs become the possessors of capital, which makes attracting other, privilege members easier. Naturally, as clubs across the globe follow suit, the social and cultural capital of Kiwanis International as an organization and an institution is increased. More

importantly, the power of clubs and Kiwanis to influence the morality, values, character, and behavior of the citizens of a community increases. The artifacts illustrate, and club and International practices indicate, that this has been and continues to be an organizational priority.

## **Chapter V: Conclusion**

### *Summary*

This study began with the premise that an ideology will always manifest itself not just in cultural practices, but also in discursive material. To that end, the aim of this study was to analyze three artifacts from Kiwanis International, one of today's three predominant global service organizations based in the United States, for the purpose of understanding the ideology undergirding the discursive material. Currently, Kiwanis is in the midst of a USD\$4,000,000.00 campaign to boost membership, and some effort has been placed on reaching previously under-represented audiences, such as those under 40 years of age and women. The goal of this study was to identify ideologies inhered in the three artifacts and to draw conclusions about how those ideologies might impede membership recruitment efforts, particularly those aimed at reaching more diverse audiences. Employing an ideological rhetorical analysis that applied feminist and Marxist lenses, the artifacts reveal that, despite being a "service organization," the Kiwanis of today still reflects its business sector roots in its adoption of capitalist ideologies and the resulting enactment of capitalistic practices. First, Kiwanis' priority focus on membership is an economic issue as the organization's operating budget continues to shrink each year due to member attrition and low recruitment. Increased member recruitment and retention will abate the financial losses from which the organization now suffers. Second, membership recruitment is a matter of social capital. Recruiting just the right member increases the social capital of a club and the organization; as well, it increases the bonding social capital found between members.

Capitalism naturally creates classes and status hierarchies, which most benefit those inside the system. The exclusion of the “othered” is a natural consequence of hierarchies. The capitalist system of society at large is reflected and replicated within Kiwanis. Marx, Weber, and Bourdieu all argue that the scarcity principle is central to capitalism. This principle says that the perceived value of goods or services increases the more these commodities become limited. Scarcity operates in club life through invitation-only membership, a practice that breeds homogeneity, which builds bonding social capital. However, it is bridging social capital -creating relationships with people who neither look nor think like the Kiwanis member described in demographic data- that is needed to keep the organization afloat.

Homogeneity and exclusivity are problematic for Kiwanis' membership campaign. Service organizations must expand to new markets, just as would a capitalistic enterprise in a similar situation. Paradoxically, the new members needed to ensure economic stability in the future are the same audiences that are subject to a paternalistic treatment; and it is this treatment that may be at the heart of Kiwanis' failure to reach diverse audiences. Recruiting privileged members of a community not only means that the same type of member is being solicited repeatedly, it also possibly gives a skewed perspective about what a community's needs really are. As well, it leads to the pervasive sense that, because membership is made of a community's powerbrokers, that members already know what is best for a community. Consequently, because community service lacks reciprocity, it becomes a "monopolistic domination of the many by the few" (Bellah et al, "The Good Society" 85). Current practices may build bonding social capital between members, but it does little to foster much-needed bridging social capital.

collateral. Kiwanis' 100 years as a service organization represents thousands of pieces of discursive material, much of which has been archived for posterity. Since the intent of this study was to discern whether an ideological thread runs from the early days of Kiwanis to the modern era and, if so, what the impact is on membership recruitment, an analysis of key materials produced at strategic points in Kiwanis history made the analysis manageable without diminishing the validity of the analysis.

Beyond this, the three artifacts were selected because they represent the "Kiwanis service story": congruent with Kiwanis' transformation to a service organization comprised of business men, the Objects mark the moment that Kiwanis and Kiwanians articulate an ethical code of conduct that is not outwardly centered on business affairs; "The Man Who Was God" represents not only the organizational evolution to service but is also allegorical; and the 2012 "Join the Club" marketing brochure is an attempt to continue that service story by demonstrating the worthiness and benefits of service to potential members.

Finally, these documents utilize linguistic and visual elements to constitute institutional "realities" that reify the institutional power of the organization (Searle, 2-58). Kiwanis has the power to link good people doing good work across the globe; Kiwanis can give a sense of order to the world; Kiwanians can become your family; Kiwanis can help you find your purpose; these are the kinds of institutional realities communicated through the selected artifacts.

The second limitation of the method, particularly as applied to the selected artifacts, can be found in the narrow scope of ideologies discussed in the analyses and findings. Ideologies of conservatism, authoritarianism, nationalism, and commonsense,

among others, are found in the artifacts. However, these were not necessarily addressed in detail due to the overwhelming abundance of ideologies present. The study was not intended to extrapolate and explicate every ideology found in the artifacts, but to identify those that correspond with every day practices.

Lastly, the method may be criticized for its interpretative nature. As Allen points out, "... rhetoric bears the marks of a long and sometimes sordid history of sophistic oratory and biased argumentation." The subjectivity for which rhetorical analysis, particularly ideological rhetorical analysis, may be criticized is the result of the ideological positions of the critique. Van Dijk says that not only do all humans subscribe to ideologies, but that ideologies are an intrinsic part of our social structure, that they help us categorize information and understand the world (6-13). It is impossible that the critique of an artifact would not reflect the personal ideological positions and assumptions of the critic. Ideologies, therefore, not only comprise a critic's a priori knowledge, this knowledge may change over time so that what the critic deems relevant or significant today may vary over time.

### *Contributions to the Field*

Prior research on service organizations has centered nearly exclusively on issues related to group formation and cohesion and the building and uses of social capital in order to explain the societal implications for declining service organization membership. This research has sought to correlate membership decline with external environmental factors, such as a growing welfare state or social justice movements. While research, like Putnam's, acknowledges the problems of homogeneity for groups and organizations and



even provides a socio-psychological explanation for the existence of homogeneity, to my knowledge, none of the research has examined the internal institutional factors that create and perpetuate homogeneity, particularly in service organizations.

This study advances the theory that the ideologies of service organizations, evident in discursive materials and made real through organizational and member practices, have alienated the very audiences that Kiwanis needs – and that all of the predominant service organizations need – in order to stave off irrelevancy. In order to realize a more diverse membership, Kiwanis, Lions, and Rotary must revisit the messages that they send to members and non-members, how those messages are articulated through and become practice, and determine if those messages and corresponding ideologies are the “face” that the organizations want to put forward. Such an examination of ideology in discursive materials and practice presents a previously ignored method of performance analysis for service organizations as they grapple with creating social cohesion while strengthening membership diversity.

While this study proposes that the mutually constitutive and reflexive nature of ideology and practice have created a situation that undermines Kiwanis’ ability to attract and retain a more diverse membership, this study also proposes oppositional consciousness and ideology as a secondary, or even a parallel explanation for the organization’s lack of diversity. Oppositional consciousness is “an empowering mental state that prepares members of an oppressed group to undermine, reform, or overthrow a dominant system” (Manbridge and Morris, eds., 5). By not joining, the traditionally excluded are recognizing their exclusion and the neo-colonial approach toward community involvement in which service organizations engage. In joining culturally-

relevant groups, such as women's groups or networks for minority business owners, the traditionally excluded are creating their own spaces and cultivating their own social capital-producing networks. In doing so, they are developing, adopting, adapting, and promoting ideological positions that are more consistent with and reflective of their experiences and world view.

Manifestation of oppositional consciousness and ideologies are not new, and there is some research that chronicles the rise of culturally-specific groups to the decline of groups like Kiwanis. Putnam, for example, cites the Roper Political and Social Trends survey to make this exact case. However, to my knowledge, neither service organizations nor scholarly research have conducted in-depth and large-scale investigations that correlate the rise in membership for one group to the decline in membership for another group beyond counting membership numbers. That is to say, there has been no large-scale ethnographic study that seeks to understand why the disenfranchised select one group over another, nor to determine if the rise of culturally-relevant groups and the decline of traditional groups, like Kiwanis, is reflective of and congruent with the changing demographics of American society. Such a study would naturally pose important questions about how the United States is "remaking" itself in response to its demographics and how oppositional ideologies can become hegemonic ideologies.

#### *Recommendations for Future Research*

The work of this study could be furthered in a few, complementary ways. First, an ideological rhetorical analysis of a greater scope of discursive materials, such as recruitment team training materials, could be undertaken. This would not only validate

the claims of this study, but may also identify other ideological positions which may be alienating to members from more diverse audiences. Kiwanis would then have the ability to make fully-informed, fully self-aware decisions about its approaches membership and its future. These may include a reaffirmation of ideologies, which may necessitate a revised membership goal; a reaffirmation of ideologies alongside the development of strategies and new discursive materials that demonstrate how traditionally under-represented audiences can, and should, have a stake in Kiwanis and Kiwanis clubs; or the creation of a new ideological vision of the future of Kiwanis that is constructed in concert with traditionally under-represented audiences. Of this latter option, the adoption of new ideologies is a long process with a high likelihood of failure; and, frankly, Kiwanis does not have the luxury of time that such a process would take. However, the organization could mitigate some of the alienating facets of its outstanding ideologies by revising its language to be more reflective of the intent to reach reciprocity in service projects and by creating educational materials and seminars around reciprocal club-community relationships and diversity (rather than tokenism) for membership with the assistance of qualified professionals.

This study could also be furthered by either a longitudinal study of service projects complemented by pre- and post-project attitudinal surveys of both club and community members. This would allow Kiwanis to pinpoint the realm in which most projects fall (for example: fundraising, playground renovation, or social services), determine how long-lasting the projects are, and discern points of divergence between community and club member perceptions of the service projects. Such steps would give Kiwanians the tools they need more fully engage with the community in project planning,

implementation, and maintenance going forward. Lastly, a fantasy theme analysis or genre analysis of artifacts would also be effective approaches here. With either of these, two approaches could be taken. First, an analysis of particular pieces of discursive material, such as membership marketing brochures, over time for a single organization might be undertaken. Such an analysis might reveal what "story" is consistently told through these documents. The organization might then ask itself: Is this really the story we want to tell? To whom will this story most likely appeal? Is the person to whom this story appeals our target member? Do our practices, strategies, and tactics attract this member?

### *Conclusion*

Humans have always and will always organize themselves in groups. Coalescing around a shared worldview helps to ensure that group members can trust each other and are working toward the same goal. In this way, burdens are lessened, risks are minimized, and rewards are amplified. While this study examines how groups are formed within service organizations, particularly Kiwanis, the more pressing issue can be found in the proposition that the problems of service organizations in reaching diverse audiences represents the cultural disconnect that exists in society-at-large between those in positions of privilege and outliers. Additionally, this study proposes that the decline of service organization membership may well represent a changing dynamic in group formation across American society as a whole. If, as Tocqueville and Putnam contend, civic engagement through associations is reflective of and a tool for teaching democracy and democratic processes, the decline of American service organizations in the United

States can be seen as an indicator of a shifting of American consciousness. Backstrom et al say, "understanding the structure and dynamics of social groups is a natural goal for network analysis, since such groups tend to be embedded within larger social network structures" (1). Therefore, understanding the changing dynamics and problems with service organizations can aid in reaching a better understanding of what it means to be American in the 21st Century.

## **Bibliography**

### *Artifacts*

Hapgood, L.A. "Larry." "Prologue: The Man Who Was God." The Men Who Wear the K: The Story of Kiwanis. Indianapolis: Kiwanis International, 1981.

"The Objects of Kiwanis." Kiwanis International. 1924.

"Join the Club Membership Brochure: Kiwanis International. 2012

### *Definitions*

"Aggressive." BusinessDictionary.com. Web Finance, Inc., 2015. Web. 13 Feb. 2015. <<http://www.businessdictionary.com/definition/aggressive.html>>.

"Aggressive." Merriam-Webster. Encyclopædia Britannica, Co., 2015. Web. 13 Feb. 2015. <<http://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/aggressive>>.

"Altruism." Wikipedia, 2015. Web. 13 Feb. <<https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Altruism>>.

"Citizen." Dictionary.com. Dictionary.com, LLC, 2015. Web. 13 Feb. 2015. <<http://dictionary.reference.com/browse/citizen>>.

"Citizenry." Merriam-Webster. Encyclopædia Britannica, Co., 2015. Web. 13 Feb. 2015. <<http://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/citizenry>>.

"Definition + Neo-colonialism." Google search. Web. 3 Feb. 2015. <<https://www.google.com/webhp?sourceid=chrome-instant&ion=1&espv=2&ie=UTF-8#safe=strict&q=definition+%2B+neo-colonialism>>.

"Fellow." Merriam-Webster. Encyclopædia Britannica, Co., 2015. Web. 13 Feb. 2015. <<http://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/fellow>>.

"Fellowship." Webster's Ninth New Collegiate Dictionary. Springfield: Merriam-Webster, Inc., 1985. Print.

"Goodwill." BusinessDictionary.com. Web Finance, Inc., 2015. Web. 13 Feb. 2015. <<http://www.businessdictionary.com/definition/goodwill.html>>.

"Goodwill." Merriam-Webster. Encyclopædia Britannica, Co., 2015. Web. 13 Feb. 2015 <<http://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/good%20will>>.

- "Ideology." Encyclopedia of Communication Theory. Vol. 1. Thousand Oaks: Sage, 2009. 497. Print.
- "Imperialism." Dictionary of Unfamiliar Words. New York: Skyhorse, 2008. Print.
- "Neocolonialism." Merriam-Webster. Encyclopædia Britannica, Co., 2015. Web. 13 Feb. 2015. <<http://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/neocolonialism>>.
- "Noblesse Oblige." Merriam-Webster. Encyclopædia Britannica, Co., 2015. Web. 13 Feb. 2015. <<http://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/noblesse%20oblige>>.
- "Online Etymology Dictionary." Online Etymology Dictionary. Web. 7 Apr. 2015. <<http://www.etymonline.com/index.php?term=social>>.
- "Righteous." Merriam-Webster. Encyclopædia Britannica, Co., 2015. Web. 13 Feb. 2015. <<http://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/righteous>>.
- "Social." Google search: Etymology + Social. Web. 2 Feb. 2015. <<https://www.google.com/webhp?sourceid=chrome-instant&ion=1&espv=2&ie=UTF-8#q=etymology%20%2B%20social>>.
- "Social Darwinism," Microsoft Encarta Online Encyclopedia 2000. <<http://encarta.msn.com>>. 1997-2000. Microsoft Corporation.

### *Feminism/Feminist Criticism*

- Brizee, Allen and J. Case Tompkins. "Feminist Criticism (19602-Present)." Purdue OWL: Literary Theory and Schools of Criticism. Purdue University, 21 Apr. 2010. Web. 7 Apr. 2015. <<https://owl.english.purdue.edu/owl/resource/722/11/>>.
- Cahn, Naomi. "Faithless Wives and Lazy Husbands: Gender Norms in Nineteenth Century." Divorce Law, 2002 U. Ill. L. Rev. 651 (2002).
- "Different Types of Feminist Theories." Different Types of Feminist Theories. Web. 7 Apr. 2015. <<http://www.caragillis.com/LBCC/Different%20Types%20of%20Femini.htm>>.
- "Feminist Political Philosophy." Stanford University Encyclopedia of Philosophy. Stanford University, 1 Apr. 2014. Web. 7 Apr. 2015. <<http://plato.stanford.edu/entries/feminism-political/>>.
- "Feminist Rhetorical Criticism." Encyclopedia of Communication Theory. Vol. 1. Thousand Oaks: Sage, 2009. 395. Print.

- "Gender Stereotypes: Masculinity and Femininity." *Newsweek*. (2000): 159-185. Print.
- Gimenez, Martha. "What's Material About Materialist Feminism? A Marxist Feminist Critique." *Radical Philosophy*, 101. May/June 2002: 18-19. Print.
- Gottfried, Heidi. "Reflections on Intersectionality: Gender, Class, Race and Nation," *Journal of Gender Studies* Vol. 11, 2008: 23-40.
- Johnson Lewis, Jone. "Liberal Feminism: What is Liberal Feminism?" *About Education*. About.com. 1 Jan. 2015. Web. 7 Apr. 2015. <<http://womens.history.about.com/od/glossary/a/Liberal-Feminism.htm>>.
- Krause, Wanda. Women in Civil Society. New York: Macmillan, 2008. Print.
- Mansbridge, Jane J. and Aldon Morris, eds. Oppositional Consciousness: The Subjective Roots of Social Protest. Chicago: University of Chicago Press. 2001. Print.
- Smitha, Frank E. "Morality, Feminism, and Class." *MacroHistory and World Timeline*. 2015. Web. 2 May 2015. <<http://www.fsmitha.com/h2/ch03-2.htm>>.
- "The Fight for Women's Suffrage." *History.com - Topics*. Web. 3 Jan. 2015. <<http://www.history.com/topics/womens-history/the-fight-for-womens-suffrage>>.
- "The Role of the Wife and Mother." Kate Chopin. Loyola University, 2009. Web. 22 May 2015. <<http://www.loyno.edu/~kchopin/new/women/motherhood.html>>.
- Warner, Jan. "History of Divorce in America." *The History of Divorce: How it Continues to Affect You*. Web. 22 May 2015. <<http://www.lifemanagement.com/fsa8.2.1137/>>.
- Zalta, Edward, ed. "Feminist Perspectives on Objectification." Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy. 2015.

### *Ideology/Ideological Criticism*

- Boucher, Geoff. The Charmed Circle of Ideology: A Critique of Laclau and Mouffe, Butler and Zizek. Seddon, Vic: Re-press, 2009. Print.
- Darder, Antonia, Marta P. Baltodano, and Roldolfo D. Torres, eds. The Critical Pedagogy Reader. Second ed. New York: RoutledgeFalmer, 2009.
- Drayton, Brendaly and Prins, Esther. "The Enactment of Hegemony through Identity Construction: Insights from The Presentation of Self in Everyday Life." *The Pennsylvania State University*. Print.



- "Archaeology of Knowledge." Philosophy Archive: Marxist.org. Web. 7 Apr. 2015. <<https://www.marxists.org/reference/subject/philosophy/works/fr/foucaul2.htm>>.
- Stoddart, Mark. "Ideology, Hegemony, Discourse: A Critical Review of Theories of Knowledge and Power." *Social Thought & Research*. 28 (2007): 191-225. Print.
- "U.S. Americanization - American National Identity And Ideologies Of Americanization." Read more: U.S. Americanization - American National Identity And Ideologies Of Americanization - Movement, Immigrants, United, and English - JRank Article. <<http://science.jrank.org/pages/8266/Americanization-U-S-American-National-Identity-Ideologies-Americanization.html>>.
- van Dijk, Teun A. Ideology: A Multidisciplinary Approach. London: SAGE. 2000.

*Kiwanis International*

- "Hosting a Membership Drive." Strengthen Your Club. Kiwanis International: Indianapolis, 2015. Web. 3 May 2015. <[http://www.kiwanis.org/\(c\)-strengthen-your-club/\(c\)-hosting-a-membership-drive#.VXxg\\_fIVhHw](http://www.kiwanis.org/(c)-strengthen-your-club/(c)-hosting-a-membership-drive#.VXxg_fIVhHw)>.
- "Hosting a Membership Drive tool." Kiwanis: (c) Strengthen Your Club: (c) Hosting a Membership Drive. Indianapolis: Kiwanis International, 2015. Web. 3 May 2015. <<http://www.kiwanis.org/Custom/KiwanisDownload/Download/01c59054-8b41-600c-92b9-ff0000034f91>>.
- "Introducing The Formula." Indianapolis: Kiwanis International, 2014. Print.
- Jonak, Chuck, and Sam Stall. The Kiwanis Legacy: Building Communities, Serving the World. Indianapolis: Kiwanis International, 2004. Print.
- "Just the Facts, 2013." Indianapolis: Kiwanis International, 2013. <<http://www.kiwanis.org/kiwanis/news/search-results?cx=011161751152385715535:lnchditok-m&terms=Just%20the%20Facts%202013#.VXjuqPIVhHw>>.
- "Just the Facts, 2014." Indianapolis: Kiwanis International, 2014. <<http://www.kiwanis.org/kiwanis/news/search-results?cx=011161751152385715535:lnchditok-m&terms=Just%20the%20Facts%202013#.VXjuqPIVhHw>>.
- "Kiwanis International Bylaws." Indianapolis: Kiwanis International, 2014. Print. <<http://www.kiwanis.org/docs/default-source/club-administration/club-bylaws/governance-kiwanis-international-bylaws>>.

- "Kiwanis International Strategic Plan." Kiwanis International. Indianapolis: Kiwanis International, 2006. Print.
- "Kiwanis Research and Brand Foundation." Market Analysis. Indianapolis: Borshoff, 2014. Print.
- "Member Demographic Survey, 2014." Indianapolis: Kiwanis International, 2014. Print.
- "Our History." Our History. 1 Jan. 2015. Web. 7 Apr. 2015. <<http://www.kiwanis.org/kiwanis/about-kiwanis/ourhistory#.VSQkjPnF9Ao>>.
- "Project Dashboard." Eliminate Project. Kiwanis International. 1 Jan. 2015. Web. 7 Apr. 2015. <<http://sites.kiwanis.org/Kiwanis/en/theELIMINATEproject/Progress/ProgressDashboard.aspx>>.
- "Rediscover Your Community's Needs tool." Kiwanis: The Formula: Strengthen Your Club: Rediscover Your Community's Needs. Indianapolis: Kiwanis International, 2015. Web 3 Feb. 2015. <[http://www.kiwanis.org/docs/default-source/the-formula-\(club-strengthening-opening\)/club-strengthening/achieving-club-excellence-tools/guide-ace\\_rediscovering\\_your\\_community.pdf?sfvrsn=4](http://www.kiwanis.org/docs/default-source/the-formula-(club-strengthening-opening)/club-strengthening/achieving-club-excellence-tools/guide-ace_rediscovering_your_community.pdf?sfvrsn=4)>.
- "Roster Analysis." Strengthen Your Club. Indianapolis: Kiwanis International, 2015. Web. 3 May 2015. <<http://www.kiwanis.org/Custom/KiwanisDownload/Download/aaf84631-0e8c-46c8-8086-c2fb6b6f213e>>.
- "The Formula: Workbooks for Club Openers and Club Counselors." The Formula. Indianapolis: Kiwanis International, 2014. Print.
- "2013-2014 Certified Membership Report." Indianapolis: Kiwanis International, 2014. Print.
- "2013-2014 Kiwanis International Annual Report." Indianapolis: Kiwanis International, 2014. <[http://www.kiwanis.org/kiwanisone/lead/club-leaders/treasurer/kiwanis-international-annual-reports-audit-reports#.VXjx6\\_IVhHw](http://www.kiwanis.org/kiwanisone/lead/club-leaders/treasurer/kiwanis-international-annual-reports-audit-reports#.VXjx6_IVhHw)>.
- "Workshop: Is 26% Enough?". Women in Kiwanis. Web. 7 Apr. 2015. <<http://www.kiwanis.org/kiwanisone/about-us/learn-about-kiwanis/women-in-kiwanis#.VR3atPnF9Ao>>.
- "Workshop: 25 years of making a difference". Women in Kiwanis. Web. 7 Apr. 2015. <<http://www.kiwanis.org/kiwanisone/about-us/learn-about-kiwanis/women-in-kiwanis#.VR3atPnF9Ao>>.

*Labor/Marxism/Marxist Criticism*

"Challenges to Religious Experiences from Freud and Marx." *Philosophy of Religion. Scandalon* 2015. Web. 3 Feb. 2015. <[http://www.scandalon.co.uk/philosophy/challenges\\_religious\\_experience.htm](http://www.scandalon.co.uk/philosophy/challenges_religious_experience.htm)>.

Delaney, Tim and Bob Schwartz. "A Critique of The German Ideology." *Marxists.org. Marx/Engels Internet Archive* (2000). Web. 7 Apr. 2015. <[https://www.marxists.org/archive/marx/works/download/Marx\\_The\\_German\\_Ideology.pdf](https://www.marxists.org/archive/marx/works/download/Marx_The_German_Ideology.pdf)>.

Gimenez, Martha. "What's Material About Materialist Feminism? A Marxist Feminist Critique." *Radical Philosophy*, 101. May/June 2002: 18-19. Print.

"Labor Movement." *History.com. A&E Television Networks*. Web. 7 Apr. 2015. <<http://www.history.com/topics/labor>>.

Sage, Henry. "The Gilded Age: The American Worker: The War Between Capital and Labor." *Sage American History: A Survey of America's Past*. Web. 2 May 2014. <[http://sageamericanhistory.net/gildedage/topics/capital\\_labor\\_immigration.html](http://sageamericanhistory.net/gildedage/topics/capital_labor_immigration.html)>.

Scott, John. Stratification & Power: Structures of Class, Status and Command. Cambridge: Polity Press. 1996.

Simon, Lawrence H. ed. Karl Marx: Selected Writings. Indianapolis: Hackett Publishing, 1994. Print.

Weber, Max. The Protestant Ethic and the Spirit of Capitalism. London: Routledge. 2001.

Weeks, Kathi. The Problem with Work: Feminism, Marxism, Antiwork Politics, and Postwork Imaginaries. Durham and London: Duke University Press. 2011.

*Neo-Colonialism/Imperialism*

Barnes, Harry Elmer. World Politics in Modern Civilization: the Contributions of Nationalism, Capitalism, Imperialism and Militarism to Human Culture and International Anarchy. New York: A.A. Knopf, 1930. Print.

Milios, John and Sotiropolous, Dimitris P. Rethinking Imperialism: A Study of Capitalist Rule. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2009. Print.

Salter, Colin. Whiteness and Social Change: Remnant Colonialisms and White Civility in Australia and Canada. Newcastle upon Tyne: Cambridge Scholars Publishing. 2013.

Stewart, Kerry, rep. "Is 'voluntourism' the new colonialism?." Encounter. ABC Radio National. Radio. <<http://www.abc.net/au/radionational/programs/encounter/5341384>>.

### *Power/Privilege*

"Applying Applied Sociology in the Family." Appliedsoc.org, 2015. Web. 3 Feb. 2015. <<http://www.appliedsoc.org/family/>>.

King, Rachel. "Power, struggle and control: An Analysis of turn-taking in Edward Albee's *Who's Afraid of Virginia Woolf*." Innervate. 3.2010-2011 (University of Nottingham, School of English Studies): 86-91. Print.

"Power Over or Power With Children?" Parenting for Social Change, 2015. Web. 3 Feb. 2015. <<https://www.parentingforsocialchange.com/power-over-children.html/>>.

"Space, Knowledge and Power." Michael Foucault interview by Paul Rabinow; Christian Huber, translator. 1982. Harvard University: Cambridge. Print. <<http://isites.harvard.edu/fs/docs/icb.topic1412058.files/Week7/Foucault.SKP.pdf>>.

Sullivan, Shannon. Revealing Whiteness: The Unconscious Habits of Racial Privilege. Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press. 2006.

### *Rhetoric/Rhetorical Criticism*

Foss, Sonja A. Rhetorical Criticism: Exploration and Practice. 4th ed. Longrove: Waveland, 2009. Print.

Littlejohn, Stephen W. and Karen A. Foss. Theories of Human Communication, 10th ed. Longrove: Waveland, 2011. Print.

Roberts-Miller, Trish. "Understanding Misunderstandings: How to Do a Rhetorical Analysis." Trish Roberts-Miller, 2008. Web. 28 May 2015. <<http://www.drw.utexas.edu/roberts-miller/handouts/rhetorical-analysis>>.

### *Social Capital*

Adler, Paul S. and Seok-Woo Kwon. "Social Capital: Prospects for a New Concept." *Academy of Management Review*. Vol. 27. Issue 1 (Jan. 2002): 17-40. Print. <http://www.jstore.org/stable/4134367>.

- Bourdieu, Pierre. "The Forms of Capital." 1986. Web. 7 Apr. 2015. <<https://www.marxists.org/reference/subject/philosophy/works/fr/bourdieu-forms-capital.htm>>.
- Durlauf, Steven N., and Marcel Fafchamps. "Social Capital." Letter Working Paper 10485 of NBER Working Paper Series. Cambridge: National Bureau of Economic Research, May 2004. Print. <<http://www.nber.org/papers/w10485>>.
- Fehr, Ernst, and Simon Gächter. 2000. "Fairness and Retaliation: The Economics of Reciprocity." *Journal of Economic Perspectives*, 14(3): 159-181.
- Forbes, Kevin F. and Zampelli, Ernest M. "Volunteerism: The Influences of Social, Religious, and Human Capital." *Nonprofit and Voluntary Sector Quarterly*, 2014. Vol. 43 (2), 227-253.
- Glaeser, Edward L., David Laibson, and Bruce Sacerdote. "An Economic Approach to Social Capital." *Economic Journal*. 112.No (2002): F437-F458. Print.
- Molm, Linda D., David A. Schaefer, and Jessica L. Collett. "The Value of Reciprocity." *Social Psychology Quarterly*. 70.2 (2007): 199-217. Print.
- Siisiäinen, Martti. "Two Concepts of Social Capital: Bourdieu vs. Putnman." Fourth International Conference - "The Third Sector: For What and For Whom?" International Society for Third Sector Research. Trinity College. Dublin, Ireland. 5-8 Jul. 2000. Lecture.

#### *Social Cohesion/Social Networks*

- Backstrom, Lars, Dan Huttenlocher, Xiangyang Lan, and Jon Kleinberg. "Group Formation in Large Social Networks: Membership, Growth, and Evolution." National Science Foundation Grants, Institute for the Social Science at Cornell, John D. and Catherine T. MacArthur Foundation. Web. 27 May 2015. <<http://www.cs.cornell.edu/~lars/kdd06-comm.pdf>>.
- Berger, Peter L. ed. The Limits of Social Cohesion: Conflict and Mediation in Pluralist Societies. Boulder: Westview Press. 1998. Print.
- Edmunds, June and Bryan S. Turner. Generations, Culture and Society. Buckingham: Open University Press. 2002. Print.
- Granovetter, M., (1985), "Economic Action and Social Structure: The Problem of Embeddedness," *American Journal of Sociology*, 91, 3, 481-510.
- Green, Andy, and Jan Germen Janmaat. Regimes of Social Cohesion: Societies and the Crisis of Globalization. Hampshire: Palgrave Macmillan, 2011. Print.

Lin, Nan. "Social Networks and Status Attainment." *Annual Review of Sociology* (1999). 25: 467-487. Print.

Searle, John. The Construction of Social Reality. New York: The Free Press. 1995.

*Additional*

"About Rotary." About Rotary. 1 Jan. 2015. Web. 7 Apr. 2015. <<https://www.rotary.org/en/about-rotary>>.

"American Protective Association." *Immigration in America*. 30 May 2011. Web. 11 Jun. 2015. <<http://immigrationinamerica.org/340-american-protective-association.html>>.

"Andrew Carnegie." Wikipedia, 2015. Web. 13 February 2015. <[https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Andrew\\_Carnegie](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Andrew_Carnegie)>.

"ARMY.MIL, The Official Homepage of the United States Army." *Army, Veterans Groups Focus on Reintegration for Soldiers*. U.S. Army, 29 Jan. 2014. Web. 7 Apr. 2015. <<http://www.army.mil/article/118920/>>.

"Ashes." *Knowing Jesus*. Web. 22 May 2015. <<http://bible.knowing-jesus.com/Ashes>>.

Bellah, Robert, et al. The Good Society. New York: Vintage Books, 1992.

Bellah, Robert, et al. Habits of the Heart: Individualism and Commitment in American Life. Berkeley: University of California Press. 2008. Print.

Bobbitt, Franklin. The Curriculum. Boston: Houghton Mifflin. 1918. Print

Brewis, Alexandra A. Obesity: Cultural and Biocultural Perspectives. Piscataway: Rutgers Press, 2011. Print.

Cap, Piotr, and Urszula Okulska. Analyzing Genres in Political Communication: Theory and Practice. Lodz: John Benjamins Company, 2015. Print.

Charles, Jeffrey A. Service Clubs in American Society: Rotary, Kiwanis, and Lions. Urbana and Chicago: University of Illinois Press. 1993. Print.

Duignan, Peter J. "Publications: Analysis." Hoover Institution. Stanford University, 15 Sep 2003. Web. 3 February 2015. <<http://www.hoover.org/research/making-and-remaking-america-immigration-united-states>>.

Erdman Farrell, Amy. Fat Shame: Stigma and the Fat Body in American Culture. New York: NYU Press. 2011. Print.

- "Family & Women's Membership Development Chairperson News." Lions Club International. 2011. Vol. 3, Issue 8. Print.
- Finke, Roger, and Rodney Stark. "Turning Pews into People: Estimating 19th Century Church Membership." *Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion*. 25.2 (1986): 180-192. Print.
- "Garfield, James." The White House. The White House. Web. 7 Apr. 2015. <<https://www.whitehouse.gov/1600/presidents/jamesgarfield>>.
- "Golden Rule." Wikipedia, 2015. Web. 13 Feb. 2015. <[https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Golden\\_Rule](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Golden_Rule)>.
- Grinker, Marc A.. "That Versus Which." *The Legal Writing Teaching Assistant: The Law Student's Guide to Good Writing*. Web. 4 Jan 2015. <[http://www.kentlaw.edu/academics/lrw/grinker/LwtaThat\\_Versus\\_Which.htm](http://www.kentlaw.edu/academics/lrw/grinker/LwtaThat_Versus_Which.htm)>.
- Hofstadter, Richard. *Anti-Intellectualism in American Life*. Toronto: Knopf, Inc. and Random House, 1963. Print.
- "John D. Rockefeller." Wikipedia, 2015. Web. 13 Feb. 2015. <[https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/John\\_D.Rockefeller](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/John_D.Rockefeller)>.
- Joseph, Miranda. *Against the Romance of Community*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press. 2002
- Kendall, J. C. *Combining service and learning: An introduction*. Vols. 1-2 (pp. 1- 36). Raleigh, NC: National Society for Internships and Experiential Education. 1990. Print.
- Krznaric, Roman. *How Change Happens: Interdisciplinary Perspectives for Human Development: An Oxfam GB Research Report*. Oxfam. 2007.
- "Life Expectancy." USA LifeExpectancy. LeDuc Media. Web. 22 May 2015. <<http://www.worldlifeexpectancy.com/usa/life-expectancy>>.
- "Lions Clubs Code of Ethics." Purpose and Ethics. Lions Clubs International: Oak Brook, 2015. <<http://www.lionsclubs.org/EN/who-we-are/mission-and-history/purpose-and-ethics.php>>.
- "Manly Honor - Part III." A Man's Life on Manhood. *The Art of Manliness*, 2012. Web. 2 May 2015. <<http://www.artofmanliness.com/2012/11/06/honor-during-victorian-era/>>. May, Linda.
- "Service Club Membership Has Declined Since the 1940s." *Advisor & Source Newspapers*. SourceNewspapers.com, 26 Dec. 2012. Web. 7 Apr. 2015.

<<http://www.sourcenewspapers.com/articles/2012/12/26/news/doc50db7e7a69a2b336424596.txt>>.

McNamee, Stephen J., and Robert K. Miller, Jr. The Meritocracy Myth. 3rd. Lanham: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, Inc., 2014. Print.

"1 John 1:3." Bible Gateway. Web. 22 May 2015. <[https://www.biblegateway.com/passage/?search=1 John 1:3](https://www.biblegateway.com/passage/?search=1%20John%201:3)>.

"Psalm 89:14." Bible Hub. Web. 22 May 2015. <<http://biblehub.com/psalms/89-14.htm>>.

Peters, Gerhard, and John, T. Woolley. "Franklin D. Roosevelt." The American Presidency Project. Web. 14 April 2015. <<http://www.presidency.ucsb.edu/ws/?pid=15312>>.

Portes, Alejandro. Economic Sociology of Immigration, The: Essays on Networks, Ethnicity, and Entrepreneurship. New York: Russell Sage Foundation, 1995. Project MUSE. Web. 11 Jun. 2015.

"Press Room - Press Releases and Statement." Bill & Melinda Gates Foundation Joins UNICEF and Kiwanis International to Eliminate Iodine Deficiency Disorders. New York: Bill & Melinda Gates Foundation. Print. <<http://www.gatesfoundation.org/Media-Center/Press-Releases/2000/11/Preventing-Iodine-Deficiency-Disorders>>.

"Project New Hope." Lions in Action. Lions International. 1 Jan. 2015. Web. 7 Apr. 2015. <<http://www.lionsclubs.org/EN/our-impact/lions-in-action/project-new-hope.php>>.

"Projects." Companion Community Development Alternatives. CoCoDA, Inc. Web. 7 Apr. 2015. <<http://cocoda.weebly.com/projects.html>>.

Putnam, Robert. D. Bowling Alone: The Collapse and Revival of American Community. New York: Simon & Schuster, 2000. Print.

Putnam, Robert D., et al. Better Together: Restoring the American Community. New York: Simon & Schuster. 2003.

"Rubaiyat of Omar Khayyam." Wikipedia, 2015. Web. 13 Feb. 2015. <[https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Rubaiyat\\_of\\_Omar\\_Khayyam](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Rubaiyat_of_Omar_Khayyam)>. Shmoop Editorial Team.

"Immigration in The 1920s." Shmoop.com. Shmoop University, Inc., 11 Nov. 2008. Web. 13 Jun. 2015. <<http://www.shmoop.com/1920s/immigration.html>>.

Smelser, Neil J., and Paul B. Baltes. "Values: Psychological Perspectives." p. 16151. International Encyclopedia of Social & Behavioral Sciences. Atlanta: 2004.



- Snyder, Thomas, D. "120 Years of American Education: A Statistical Portrait United States of America." U.S. Department of Education: Office of Educational Research and Improvement. Washington, DC: National Center for Education Statistics, 1993. Print.
- Szalavitz, Maia. "The Biology of Kindness: How It Makes Us Happier and Healthier." Time. 09 May 2013: Social Connection. Web. 10 Jun. 2015. <<http://healthland.time.com/2013/05/09/why-kindness-can-make-us-happier-healthier/>>.
- Szurmak, Joanna and Mindy Thuna. "Tell Me a Story: The Use of Narrative as a Tool." Annual Conference. Indianapolis: American Library Association, 2013. Print.
- "The American Experience." Grubin, David. Corporation for Public Broadcasting. PBS, Harrisburg. 1988. Television.
- "The Century: America's Time - The Beginning: Seeds of Change." American Broadcasting Company. ABC. 2013. Television.
- "The Color Red." Empower-Yourself-With-Psychology.com, 2015. Web. 3 Feb. 2015. <<http://www.empower-yourself-with-color-psychology.com/color-red.html>>.
- Tindall, George Brown, and David E. Shi. America: A Narrative History, 3rd ed. Vol. 1. New York: Norton, 2004. 700. Print
- Tocqueville, Alexis De, and Phillips Bradley. Democracy in America. New York: A.A. Knopf, 1945. Print.
- "20. James Garfield." The White House. The White House. Web. 13 Feb. 2015. <<https://www.whitehouse.gov/1600/presidents/jamesgarfield>>.
- "25. William McKinley." The White House. The White House. Web. 13 Feb. 2015. <<https://www.whitehouse.gov/photos-and-video/photos/25-william-mckinley>>.
- "USA, Canada & Caribbean Islands." Regional Membership Supplement. Evanston: Rotary International, 2013. Print.
- Watkins, Thayer. "In Multi-Plant Industries the Efficiency-Relevant Marginal Cost is the Minimum Average Cost of the Marginal Plant. Southern Economic Journal. Vol. 48, No. 1. July 1981. pps 149-155. Print.
- "Who We Are." Service Club Organization. 1 Jan. 2015. Web. 7 Apr. 2015. <<http://www.lionsclub.org/EN/who-we-are/index.php>>.
- Wilson, John, and Marc Musick. "Who Cares? Toward an Integrated Theory of Volunteer Work." American Sociological Review. 694-712. Print.
- Woolley, John and Gerhard Peters. "Franklin D. Roosevelt." The American Presidency

Project, 2015. Web. 3 May 2015. <<http://www.presidency.ucsb.edu/ws/?pid=15312>>.

Zalta, Edward, ed. "Biological Altruism." Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy. 2015. Print.

Zinn, Howard. "Chapter 11: Robber Barons and Rebels." *History is a Weapon; A People's History of the United States*. 2015. Web. 12 Jan 2015. <<http://www.historyisaweapon.com/defcon1/zinnbaron11.html>>.

## **Chapter VI: Curriculum Vitae**

### **Tonja LaFaye Stokes**

#### **Education**

- M.A. Applied Communications, 2010-2015  
Indiana University-Purdue University Indianapolis
- American Society for Training and Development (Chicago, Illinois), 2013  
Coaching Certificate
- The Fundraising School, The Center on Philanthropy at Indiana University, 2006  
Certificate: Fundraising for Small Nonprofits
- B.A. English/Spanish, 2003  
Indiana University-Purdue University Indianapolis  
Grade: Highest Honors
- Universal - Centro de Lengua y Comunicación Social (Cuernavaca, Mexico), 2002  
Advanced coursework completed

#### **Employment**

- Communications and Marketing Consultant, Indianapolis, Indiana, 2015
- Kiwanis International, Indianapolis, Indiana, Regional Development Strategist,  
2013 – 2015
- IU School of Education, Indianapolis, Indiana, Communications/Marketing, 2013  
Program and Curriculum Development/Training Consultant, Indianapolis, Indiana,  
2012 – 2014
- Indiana Association for the Education of Young Children, Inc., Indianapolis, Indiana,  
Communications Director, 2006 – 2012
- Indiana Association for the Education of Young Children, Inc., Indianapolis, Indiana,  
Communications Contractor, 2004 – 2006
- Indiana Partnerships Center, Indianapolis, Indiana, Community Relations Director,  
2000 – 2006
- Indiana University-Purdue University, Indianapolis, Indiana, Spanish Instructor,  
2004

## **Professional Memberships**

- Public Relations Society of America
- American Communication Association
- National Communication Association
- Hoosier Chapter of the Public Relations Society of America
- American Society of Association Executives
- American Translators Association
- Midwest Association of Translators and Interpreters
- Former Board Member: Companion Community Development Alternatives

## **Skills and Qualifications**

- Experienced teacher, presenter, facilitator, lecturer
- Curriculum and evaluation development and delivery
- English/Spanish bilingual
- Grant writing (awards to \$800,000)
- Special events planning and volunteer coordination (largest event hosted 4,000 attendees annually)
- Development of internship opportunities and internship handbook
- Diversity outreach planning and implementation
- Contract manager and reporting agent for early childhood education sub-grantees (\$250,000); development of new reporting systems for tracking grantees' use of funds and attainment of grant objectives
- Internal/external market analysis and budget/market projections
- Preparation and presentation of budget requests; vendor and contractor negotiations
- Inventory control systems development
- Contributed material central for training to global membership campaign for international non-profit
- Representative on the Paths to QUALITY communications and marketing committee (State of Indiana, Family and Social Services Administration, Bureau of Child Care), 2006- 2012
- Bolstered organizational membership to a 40-year high while the national office and other affiliates experienced a membership decline
- Created communications and social media policies and materials for a membership organization with 13 chapters
- Intern, volunteer, and staff management (of up to 120)

## **Teaching**

- Coaching Conversations
- Diversity and Inclusion
- Core Values/Consensus Building training
- Stages of Group Formation and Social Cohesion

- Marketing and Communications Management
- No Child Left Behind, Public Law 221, and Parent Rights training
- Emergent Literacy education courses for parents
- Emergent Literacy education course for immigrant parents
- Internships supervision, 2000- 2012
- Beginning Spanish, IUPUI

### **Research Interests**

Though the topic of study has varied, from family response to medical trauma to the power of slang as a means of establishing political identity and group solidarity to the subjugation of women in developing nations, my research interests have always focused on social justice and systems change issues. Specifically, I am interested in the ways in which language can help create systems and practices of power and oppression while also being utilized as a tool of resistance by marginalized peoples.

### **Publications and Presentations**

- Preliminary and Final Conference Program, 2006 - 2012
- Infant-Toddler Specialists of Indiana Institute Programs, 2007- 2009
- Monthly Newsletter through US Department of Education, Office of Innovation and Improvement, Parent Information Resource Center, 2000 - 2006
- *A New Normal: Exploring the Reactions, Challenges, and Coping Mechanisms of Parents with Seriously Ill Children* (documentary): Undergraduate research project
- Invited to serve on a panel to redesign marketing materials for a national nonprofit with more than 50 chapters, 2005
- Invited to appear on local television as subject matter expert to discuss school choice options under the No Child Left Behind Act (Fox 59), 2004

### **Conferences and Courses**

- Presenter: T.E.A.C.H. Early Childhood@ INDIANA National Conference (marketing and communications for non-profits), 2007
- Presenter/Facilitator: The Indiana Academy for Parent Leadership, 2002 – 2006
- Presenter: Twenty-First Century Scholars State-wide Parent Conference, "Parents Believe - Scholars Achieve," 2004
- Attendee: ASAE/The Center for Association Leadership, 2008

### **Funding and Academic Awards**

- Top Graduate Research Award, 2015: *Political Coalition Building Curriculum*
- Dean's List, 2009

- Dean's List, 1994 - 2003
- Highest Honors graduation designation, 2003
- Spanish Academic Achievement Award, 2002
- Margaret A. Cook Foreign Study Award, 2001/2002
- Christel DeHaan Family Foundation Scholarship for International Studies, 2001
- Margaret A. Cook Foreign Study Award, 2000/2001
- Institute of International Education Midwest Educational Associates Scholarship, 2001
- American Studies Achievement Award, 2001
- Member, Sigma Epsilon, Sigma Delta Pi, La Sociedad Nacional Hispánica
- Member, Golden Key International Honor Society
- Who's Who Among Students in American Universities and Colleges