University of New Mexico
UNM Digital Repository

History ETDs

Electronic Theses and Dissertations

2-13-2014

Invention and Contention: Place, Identity and Memory of the Spanish Past in the American Southwest, 1848-1940

Brian Luna Lucero

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/hist_etds

Recommended Citation

Luna Lucero, Brian. "Invention and Contention: Place, Identity and Memory of the Spanish Past in the American Southwest, 1848-1940." (2014). https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/hist_etds/48

This Dissertation is brought to you for free and open access by the Electronic Theses and Dissertations at UNM Digital Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in History ETDs by an authorized administrator of UNM Digital Repository. For more information, please contact disc@unm.edu.

Brian Luna Lucero
Candidate

History
Department

This dissertation is approved, and it is acceptable in quality and form for publication:

Approved by the Dissertation Committee:

Samuel Truett, Chairperson

Durwood Ball

Bárbara Reyes

Enrique Lamadrid

INVENTION AND CONTENTION: IDENTITY, PLACE, AND MEMORY OF THE SPANISH PAST IN THE AMERICAN SOUTHWEST, 1848-1940

BY

BRIAN LUNA LUCERO

B.A., Latin American Studies, Columbia University, 2001
M.A., History, University of New Mexico, 2005

DISSERTATION

Submitted in Partial Fulfillment of the
Requirements for the Degree of

Doctor of Philosophy
History

The University of New Mexico
Albuquerque, New Mexico

December, 2013

DEDICATION

To Myra, who knows more than anyone what this work means.

To Vada who always knew I would finish this.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

I must first thank my advisor, Sam Truett, for shaping my ideas and always offering sound advice on all aspects of the historian's life. I also thank my committee: Durwood Ball for his extensive proofreading, Bárbara Reyes for her unflagging encouragement and Enrique Lamadrid for his staunch support.

I may never have started on the road to this degree without the Mellon Minority Undergraduate Fellowship at Columbia University to light my path. This dissertation benefited from the support of several grants at vital points in the work. A travel grant from the Mellon Mays Fellowship allowed me to access archives out of state. A dissertation completion grant from Mellon Mays gave me precious time to focus on writing and introduced me to the most helpful colleagues I have known. Grants from UNM's Center for Regional Studies supported this work at all stages. Finally, I thank the Mellon Doctoral Fellowship at UNM for vital support during the research and writing of this work.

INVENTION AND CONTENTION:
IDENTITY, PLACE, AND MEMORY OF THE SPANISH PAST IN THE AMERICAN SOUTHWEST, 1848-1940

BY

BRIAN LUNA LUCERO

B.A., Latin American Studies,
M.A., History,
Ph.D. History

ABSTRACT

As the twentieth century unfolded, American writers, critics, and boosters presented a narrative of the arid Southwest as an exotic place blessed with a romantic history that could inspire, captivate and renew the many new white citizens flocking to rapidly growing cities. The history of Spanish colonialism in the area became a precious and exclusive cultural and economic resource. This dissertation tells the story of the commemoration of the Spanish past from 1848 to 1940 in three Spanish towns that grew into prominent American cities: Tucson, Arizona; Albuquerque, New Mexico; and San Antonio, Texas. In chapters centered on space, historic preservation, Mexican folk ritual, and pageants, this work examines the stories told about the Spanish past in these cities and reveals how people of differing classes and ethnicities gave meaning to the places they lived and to the process of American annexation of the region. That meaning shaped individual and social identities as well as the flow of power between them.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

TABLE OF CONTENTS VI

INTRODUCTION 1

CHAPTER OUTLINE 22

CHAPTER 1: THE BLACK LEGEND 25

COLONIAL RIVALRY AND THE BLACK LEGEND 27
THE ROMANTIC TURN 33
THE SPANISH PAST IN THE AMERICAN SOUTHWEST 39
MEMORY AND RACE IN THE SOUTHWEST 50
CONCLUSION 57

CHAPTER 2: SPACE AND THE SPANISH PAST 63

THE COLONIAL ORIGINS OF ALBUQUERQUE, SAN ANTONIO AND TUCSON 65
SHIFT OF CITY CENTERS 79
A CITY BOTH ANCIENT AND MODERN IN ASPECT 87
MODERNISM AS JUGGERNAUT 95
CONCLUSION 99

CHAPTER 3: HISTORIC PRESERVATION IN THE URBAN SOUTHWEST 101

PEJORATIVE VIEWS 102
THE THEORY AND PRACTICE OF HISTORIC PRESERVATION 108
PRESERVATION GOES WEST: THE ALAMO 113
THE SPANISH GOVERNOR'S PALACE 119
HISTORIC ABANDONMENT: TUCSON 128
TITLE BY ANNEXATION: HISTORIC PRESERVATION IN ALBUQUERQUE 135
CONCLUSION 137

CHAPTER 4: MEXICANO RITUAL AS COLONIAL TEXT 139

LOS PASTORES: ORIGINS AND DIFFUSION 141
LA GRAN FAMILIA MEXICANA: LOS PASTORES AS CULTURAL UNIFIER 145
THE POLITICS OF MEXICANO RITUAL 155
A CONFUSION OF IDEAS: LOS PASTORES AS VIEWED BY ACADEMICS 159
SPECTACLE AND RITUAL: THE ENGLISH PASTORELA 169
PASTORES AS ANTI-MODERN REDEMPTION 175
CONCLUSION 178

CHAPTER 5: PAGEANTRY 181

NEW PAGEANTRY IN THE UNITED STATES 182
THE SAN ANTONIO BICENTENNIAL 187
ALBUQUERQUE'S GOLDEN JUBILEE 197
THE CORONADO CUARTO CENTENNIAL 204
THE BAILE DE LAS FLORES 218
CONCLUSION 225

CONCLUSION 228

REFERENCES 237

INTRODUCTION

American visitors to the Southwest in the decades immediately after Mexico ceded that territory to the United States found the region to be dirty, barren, and primitive. In their eyes, the people, recently citizens of Mexico, appeared lazy, untrustworthy and slow-witted. Defining civilization by the number of hotels, railroads, and factories in a place, these newcomers concluded the Mexican Cession came up short in that count.[1] Yet as the twentieth century unfolded, American writers, critics, and boosters reimagined the narrative of the arid region as an exotic place blessed with a romantic history that could inspire, captivate and renew the many new white citizens flocking to rapidly growing cities. The history of Spanish colonialism in the area became a precious and exclusive cultural and economic resource. This dissertation tells the story of the commemoration of the Spanish past in the American Southwest with an eye to explaining how and why the content and form of that commemoration changed from the mid nineteenth century through the first decades of the twentieth.

In the late-nineteenth century, the people of the United States of America had to make sense of the incorporation of the northern territory of Mexico into their nation. While this annexation realized the ambitions of many to extend U.S. domains to the Pacific, it also brought in tens of thousands of Mexicans into a nation that was unwelcoming to them. Both the lingering enmity of the war and racial stereotypes that denigrated Mexicans created an environment hostile to the new citizens. Yet this persistent animosity churned behind an unfolding celebration of northern Mexico's colonial Spanish past.

---

[1] I will refer to this territory as both the Mexican Cession and the American Southwest, acknowledging that the Mexican North was annexed by the United States in three stages. Texas entered the United States as a state in 1845, Mexico ceded 525,000 square miles of its land to the United States through the Treaty of Guadalupe Hidalgo in 1848, and the United States purchased an additional 29,670 square miles of Mexican land in the Gadsen Purchase of 1854. For an overview of this expansion and its legal ramifications see Richard Griswold del Castillo, *The Treaty of Guadalupe Hidalgo: A Legacy of Conflict* (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1990).

In the work that follows, I argue that this historical development is not so contradictory as it appears. Just as the late-nineteenth and early-twentieth centuries saw the systematic dispossession of Mexicans through legal, economic, and political means, Mexicans were also dispossessed of their colonial inheritance through the institutionalization of an idealized Spanish past. The new, white immigrants who rapidly became a majority in the region's cities promulgated a figurative rupture that separated and differentially valued the Spanish past from the more contemporary Mexican period. This idea of two separate and distinct categories formed a view of history that allowed the newcomers both to celebrate their dominion by connecting it to the Spanish conquest of the region and to justify their power over the displaced Mexicanos by writing them out of the region's history.[2]

---

[2] Any study of history in the Southwest faces the challenge of employing suitable terminology for the various ethnic groups in the region. A writer must strike a balance between precision and clarity. Terms like *Anglo* and *Mexicano* present obviously diverse groups of people in monolithic terms. Concealing the historic experiences of the varied people of the Southwest behind a curtain of false homogeneity is not my intent. Yet I strive for simplicity and clarity in nomenclature that requires the use of such inclusive aggregate terms. These terms are largely determined by the relationship of the group to the Spanish past (i.e. Mexicanos being descendant of that past and Anglos being adopted heirs). *Spanish* and *Mexican* are key terms that will be used to describe conceptual categories rather than people of a specific national origin. Partially for that reason, I will

Despite this relentless pressure, the Mexicano people of the Southwest, both those with pre-1848 roots and recent immigrants, pushed back against the notion that the Spanish past belonged to a elite white Americans. As cultural heirs of the Spanish past, they recognized an ongoing connection between themselves and that history in opposition to a narrative based on rupture. With no interest in separating the Spanish past from their own experience of history, they turned to the cultural legacies of that era—language, religion, and music—to define themselves and their community. To the extent possible in their political circumstances, Mexicanos in the United States staked a claim to the Spanish past and promulgated a version of it based in continuity as a means of resisting the adoption of a public memory based on their subjugation.

A study of the commemoration of the Spanish past must acknowledge the prescient observations of activist, journalist, and California historian Carey McWilliams. His 1948 book *North from Mexico* declared that "the dichotomy which exists throughout the borderlands between what is 'Spanish' and what is 'Mexican' is a functional, not an ornamental, arrangement. Its function is to

---

use the term *Mexicano* to refer to people of ethnic Mexican origin regardless of citizenship status. *Mexicano* allows me to separate people from the loaded concepts of Spanish and Mexican inasmuch as that is possible. The word is also a satisfying compromise to the many local appellations, such as tejano, manito, sonorense and others, the people herein would call themselves. For the most part, the people to whom the term is applied would recognize themselves and each other as Mexicano on some level. Anglo serves as the obverse of Mexicano—that is people of the region not ethnically Mexican. These were generally white Americans who came to the Southwest after its annexation to the United States and wished to distinguish themselves from Mexicans. Wherever possible, I will enrich these broad categories with reference to specific individuals and communities.

deprive Mexicans of their heritage and keep them in their place."[3] He found that the veneration of all things "Spanish" (music, food, costumes) in Southern California undermined Mexican people and culture. Southern Californians were enraptured with Spanish language in their place names, Spanish architecture in their homes and public buildings, and a romantic sense of the lives of Spanish elites in California before the coming of the Americans. The esteem extended to people as well, "one who achieves success in the borderlands is 'Spanish'; one who doesn't is Mexican.'"[4] McWilliams dubbed this stereotype the "Spanish Fantasy Heritage," which he called "the most striking aspect of Anglo-Hispano relations."[5]

Piqued by the tension of a powerful elite praising the Spanish past while denigrating Mexican people in their own time, McWilliams laid a firm foundation for analyzing the Spanish fantasy in Southern California. The persistence of the fantasy and the "absurd dichotomy" behind it has made Southern California the focus of relatively numerous scholars interested in memory and the Spanish past as compared to the rest of former Spanish colonial territory.[6] Indeed, Southern

---

[3] Carey McWilliams, *North from Mexico: The Spanish-Speaking People of the United States* (Philadelphia: J. B. Lippincott Co., 1948), 39.

[4] Ibid., 37.

[5] Ibid., 41.

[6] For recent examples of the literature on the Spanish past in Los Angeles and Southern California generally see Phoebe S. Kropp, *California Vieja: Culture and Memory in a Modern American Place* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2006); William Alexander McClung, *Landscapes of Desire: Anglo Mythologies of Los Angeles* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2000); William Deverell, *Whitewashed Adobe: The Rise of Los Angeles and the Remaking of Its Mexican Past* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2004); Douglas Monroy, *Thrown among Strangers: The Making of*

California's approach to commemoration of the Spanish has been particularly colorful and showy, making it attractive to scholars and readers. From Helen Hunt Jackson's *Ramona* to the architectural confections of the Panama-California Exposition and the sun-drenched glamour of Hollywood ranchos, the history of the state has provided numerous examples of the appropriation and distortion of its history. The many studies on the commemoration and representation of the Spanish past in California suggest that section saw a disproportionate expression of the phenomenon.

But California did not have a monopoly on those distortions. Far to the east of Balboa Park and Olvera Street, in the other lands once settled by Spanish colonists and missionaries, the commemoration of the Spanish past also thrived. Some recent studies have touched on the topic in New Mexico, but few have included other geographic areas, much less focused on them.[7] Instead, the idea of Spanish fantasy heritage has been deployed to analyze various aspects of Southwest culture including architecture, tourism, and performance art.[8]

Mexican Culture in Frontier California (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1990), 261-80; Mike Davis, *City of Quartz: Excavating the Future in Los Angeles* (London: Verso, 1990), chs. 1, 2; Douglas Monroy, *Rebirth : Mexican Los Angeles from the Great Migration to the Great Depression* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1999); Kevin Starr, *Inventing the Dream: California through the Progressive Era* (New York: Oxford university Press, 1986), chs. 2, 3; Kevin Starr, *Material Dreams: Southern California through the 1920s* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1990), chs. 6, 10.

[7] Charles Montgomery, *The Spanish Redemption: Heritage, Power, and Loss on New Mexico's Upper Rio Grande* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2002); Chris Wilson, *The Myth of Santa Fe: Creating a Modern Regional Tradition* (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1997).

[8] See, for example, Matthew F. Bokovoy, *The San Diego World's Fairs and Southwestern Memory, 1880-1940* (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2005); Michelle

This dissertation builds on previous work on the commemoration of the Spanish past in by expanding the scope of that field along two dimensions. First, I approach memory of the Spanish past, not as a unilateral appropriation on the part of Anglos, but as an expression used by many citizens of the Southwest to define the meaning of their lives in a changing world. The history of this memory reveals that many versions of the past coexisted and changed over time and across space. Those interpretations of the past clashed, mixed, and jostled for dominance to form a generally accepted narrative of the conquest of the region and a sense of unique regional identity. Secondly, this work geographically expands the historical consideration of commemoration of the Spanish past beyond California. In order to focus the work while allowing enough breadth for useful comparison, I have grounded it in three cities as case studies: Tucson, Arizona; Albuquerque, New Mexico; and San Antonio; Texas. These three cities are historically similar to one another in that they were all founded in the Spanish colonial era and reflected the influence of that history in their demographics, built environment, and place names. Additionally, all boomed when the railroad connected them to the nation in the 1870s and 1880s. That growth brought industry and work to these cities, drawing both Anglo and Mexicano immigrants in massive numbers.

This population boom distinguishes and links the historic trajectories of the three cities. It meant that the civic identity of each changed quickly as white newcomers supplanted Mexicano citizens as a majority. That this transformation

---

Habell-Pallán, *Loca Motion: The Travels of Chicana and Latina Popular Culture* (New York: New York University, 2005); Wilson, *The Myth of Santa Fe.*

happened in each city at nearly the same time meant that the zeitgeist of the Gilded Age shaped the civic identities of these places. Both newcomers and long-standing residents built memories that defined the social and psychological dimensions of those places as surely as they constructed the streets and buildings that shaped its spatial form. The combination of palpable Spanish history and a rapidly growing immigrant population makes these three cities fruitful sites for studying the contestation of memory.

These cities lived in isolation from one another while part of Spain's American empire. Trade routes and roads for communication connected the northern frontier southward, ultimately to Mexico City. No trails ran latitudinally across the northern frontier. This isolation made each town considered in my study distinct in terms of degree and type of trade, missionary efforts and local culture. Such variations provide significant variables to consider as I track how each town changed when annexed to the United States. They also indicate a degree of heterogeneity that was obscured when the region became identified as the American Southwest. The generally accepted popular narrative of the Spanish past in the region is remarkably homogenous, as if the experiences of all the natives, soldiers, clergy, settlers and laborers were the same from California to Texas. Explaining why a homogenous story has taken hold of a heterogenous region is one of the primary aims of my dissertation.

U.S. colonization of the region advanced rapidly with the advent of the steam locomotive and railroad travel and transport after the Civil War. The railroad brought new trade opportunities to the cities of the Southwest accompanied by tens of thousands of workers, speculators, and swindlers to take advantage of them. These immigrants, largely Anglos from the eastern states, rapidly outnumbered the established Mexicano populations of the railroad towns. The population of Albuquerque, for example, grew from 1,307 in 1870, a decade before the railroad arrived, to 5,518 in 1890 and to 7,428 in 1900. Tucson grew from 3,500 residents in 1872 to more than 9,000 one year after the railroad's arrival in 1880. This sudden demographic shift meant that the newcomers did not have to assimilate to the social, political, and economic systems already existing in these places. Their nearly instant majority, coupled with the power of U.S. federal law, allowed the newcomers to supplant old economic and political elites such as traders, merchants, and government and judicial officials as well as to establish new laws, language, government structure, and political relationships.

The new Anglo majority of southwestern cities also held the ability to invent traditions that determined how the process of annexation was remembered and commemorated. This was not a unique capability; all groups that share a common culture can and do invent traditions to make sense of place and the past.[9] The charging pace of the new majority's growth allowed it to rapidly codify and assert its construction of history over alternative narratives. Several organizations and practices worked together to cement a dominant narrative.

---

[9] Historian Eric Hobsbawm identified the link between public rituals and national and ethnic identity and coined the term "invented tradition." His definition of tradition, "a set of practices, normally governed by overtly or tacitly accepted rules and of a ritual or symbolic nature, which seek to inculcate certain values and norms of behavior by repetition, which automatically implies continuity with the past," emphasizes the political power wielded by inventors of tradition. Eric Hobsbawm, "Inventing Traditions," in *The Invention of Tradition*, ed. Eric Hobsbawm and Terence Ranger(Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1983), 1.

These included governmental offices, newspapers, preservation societies, and popular literature. By the turn of the twentieth century, Anglos controlled these institutions in the cities of the former Mexican North.

Anglo elites wielded the power to institute invented traditions through control of space and public structures. Old Town Albuquerque, the missions in and around San Antonio (including the Alamo), San Xavier del Bac mission near Tucson, and the Spanish Governor's Palace in San Antonio are examples of this phenomenon. These places represent the Spanish past as both ideological and physical constructions. They simultaneously celebrate the Spanish heritage of cities within the Mexican Cession while glossing over the tensions inherent in U.S. colonization of the region and disempowering Mexicano locals. The primary goal of the creators of this space was to transform the contentious history of the region's transition from Spanish and Mexican control to U.S. sovereignty to a more placid one of American inheritance of Spanish land and culture.[10]

Rituals like the Fiesta de Los Vaqueros and Baile de los Flores in Tucson also forged a connection to the Spanish past while the Battle of Flowers parade in San Antonio celebrated American dominance of the city. Whether they embraced the past or marked a break from it, these performances formed a popular image of what the Southwest was and how it was connected to colonial Spain.[11] Because of their popularity and high profile, the narrative presented by these rituals and objects was widely accepted as history, both by residents of the cities and those elsewhere in the nation.[12]

---

[10] For a critical view of the selective preservation of Spanish space see William D. Estrada, "Los Angeles' Old Plaza and Olvera Street: Imagined and Contested Space," *Western Folklore* 58, no. 2 (1999); Wilson, *The Myth of Santa Fe*, especially chapters 4, 7, and 8.

[11] Tucson's current plans to reconstruct a Spanish mission downtown as part of the Rio Nuevo project exhibits the continuation of this trend.

Despite the intentions of Anglo civic elites to monopolize sources of cultural power, commemorations of the Spanish past provided Mexicanos with viable symbols for group identity and cohesion. Mexicano urbanites carried on traditions from the colonial past that had not been commodified by Anglo migrants. They participated in traditional Catholic festivals, fiestas for patron saints and holiday processions such as *Las Posadas*, dramatic presentations such as *Los Pastores* and other ritual performances such as the Matachines and *cristianos y moros* dances. Despite the heterogeneity of the region, Mexicanos in all three cities performed some combination of these rituals, creating a regional cultural link that was shaped by local conditions. These performances represent a uniquely Mexicano interpretation of Spanish colonialism that countered dominant visions of the region's past.[13]

---

[12] For a recent analysis of power, ethnicity, and the Battle of Flowers parade and its later incarnation as the San Antonio Fiesta see Laura Elizabeth Ehrisman, "Inventing the Fiesta City: Heritage and Performance in San Antonio's Public Culture" (University of Texas, 2003).

[13] Ritual dances and devotional dramas have been the object of several ethnographic studies by anthropologists, but few historians have looked at their significance and development over time. See Sylvia Rodríguez, *The Matachines Dance: Ritual Symbolism and Interethnic Relations in the Upper Río Grande Valley* (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1996); Richard R. Flores, *Los Pastores: History and Performance in the Mexican Shepherds' Play of South Texas* (Washington D. C.: Smithsonian Institution Press, 1995); Arthur Leon Campa, *Spanish Religious Folktheatre in the Southwest* (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1934); Julia Nott Waugh, *The Silver Cradle: Las Posadas, Los Pastores and Other Mexican American Traditions* (Austin: University of Texas Press, 1983).

The Mexicano populations in the cities studied by my project were never a monolithic and homogenous community. Over the decades their demography changed as the economic opportunities of the growing cities drew immigrants from south of the recently established U.S.-Mexican border. Mexicano natives and Mexicano immigrants forged a new cultural identity built on religion, language, a common sense of place, and invented tradition. Representations of the Spanish past united established Mexicanos with more-recently-arrived immigrants. Joint participation in these rituals deemphasized local origins, creating an urban conglomerate from formerly distinct groups that was able to vie for a stake in the new metropolitan order.[14] Yet the fact that the ratio of native Mexicanos to immigrant Mexicanos and immigrant Anglos was not the same in any of the three cities before the railroad boom and in the decades afterward makes for another useful variable of comparison.

The interactions between established Mexicanos and immigrants are an important regional variable for my study. Each of the cities I examine felt the impact of Mexican immigration differently. During and after the Mexican Revolution, for example, many more Mexican immigrants settled in San Antonio than in Albuquerque. In San Antonio this fact manifested in a different set of invented traditions that favored celebrations of Mexican nationalism such as Cinco de Mayo and Mexican Independence Day over commemorations of colonial Spain. The variations in local culture reveal broad perceptions of ethnic identity and their political implications as well as differing strategies of cultural preservation and assimilation through ritual and tradition.[15]

---

[14] This process supports Chris Wilson's assertion that urbanization makes different groups of people live more similarly while heightening the perceived differences between them. Wilson, *The Myth of Santa Fe*, 6.

This dissertation builds on previous examinations of the commemoration of the Spanish past by considering Mexicano forms of memory. Just as most studies of memory of the Spanish past have focused primarily on California, they have tended to scrutinize only Anglo appropriations of the Spanish past. In some ways, this pattern is understandable because these two angles pair well. The use of Mission Revival architecture on a grand and ubiquitous scale across Southern California makes the romanticized Spanish past an obvious part of the landscape. Furthermore, McWilliams' Spanish fantasy heritage sprang from observing the colorful fiestas and pageants of 1940s Los Angeles where tanned actors and energetic boosters played Spanish dons in public spectacles. The vision of Anglo newcomers performing as ersatz Spaniards caught his attention, and led him and later scholars to ask what these performances mean and what motivates the playacting. However, this colorful spectacle has, in many ways, taken attention away from other forms of memorialization, particularly those practiced by Mexicanos. While boosters parading through an American city dressed as conquistadors are colorful subjects of study, these performers hold no monopoly on the commemoration of Spanish history of the American Southwest.

I suggest that the fact that there is often little or no organic connection between Spanish colonists and the people who reenacted them in the twentieth century creates an attention-grabbing dissonance for both audiences and scholars. Moreover, Anglo businesses and boosters have left substantial documentation of the process of imagining the Spanish past and the uses to which they put that image, making that topic more attractive to historians. Mexicano people, on the other hand, share culture, language, and religion with their colonial forebears; so their commemoration of that legacy has appeared more natural and unremarkable. Add this quality to the relative paucity of documentation of Mexicano views of the Spanish past and the sum is a historiography suggesting that white Americans were the only people to use images and symbols of the Spanish past to realize their civic, psychic, and economic goals.

---

[15] For a thorough study of the politics of relationships between Mexican Americans and Mexican immigrants, see David G. Gutiérrez, *Walls and Mirrors: Mexican Americans, Mexican Immigrants, and the Politics of Ethnicity* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1995).

This is not to say that previous studies argue Anglo visions are the most valid construction of memory of the Spanish past. Indeed, most adopt a critical perspective and argue that Anglo perceptions of the Spanish past have been, in Phoebe Kropp's words, "ersatz, counterfeit, misrepresentative, ironic, [and] unique."[16] From this stance they demonstrate that the Anglo appropriation of the Spanish past has contributed as much to racial and ethnic division as to local and regional identity. David Gutiérrez asserts, "Many Mexican Americans knew, to a painful degree, that the seemingly harmless celebration of Spanish fiestas masked the disdain so many Americans felt about the actual remaining representatives of Hispanic culture in the West."[17] Yet these critical conclusions are based on what

---

[16] Kropp, *California Vieja*, 7.

[17] David G. Gutiérrez, "Significant to Whom? Mexican Americans and the History of the American West," *Western Historical Quarterly* 24, no. 4 (1993): 524.

Anglos thought and said about the Spanish past, and cast Mexicanos, the contemporary heirs to that colonial legacy, as exploited objects of the Spanish fantasy heritage. By revealing Mexicanos' cultural memory of the Spanish past and affirming that they articulated this memory to serve their own purposes, this dissertation seeks to reframe the story of unilateral exploitation as one of multilateral contestation.

Of course, this work cannot ignore the limitations imposed by available primary sources. However, the colorful pageants and imitative architecture that other scholars have looked to are not the only modes in which the Spanish past has been remembered. Taking a cue from cultural studies scholars, I examine Mexicano rituals, the devotional play *Los Pastores* in particular, as reflections of a collective memory of the Spanish past. By looking to these sources it is evident that Mexicanos commemorated the Spanish past both by contributing to Anglo modes of memory as well as by developing their own. This argument expands the view of memory of the Spanish past beyond exploitative appropriation. While validating the conclusions of other studies that have focused on the suppression of Mexicano political power through memory, I seek to enrich the history of the memory of the Spanish past by recasting those conclusions as the result of a more complicated process.

In part, this complication comes through weaving my analysis of memory into the cloth of Chicano history. The field, based on documenting the political history of Mexicano people in the American Southwest, has shown that Mexicano residents defended their interests in the urban and ethnic politics of the region.

Issues of identity and power lie at the heart of this field. These same issues also define the stakes of memorialization of the Spanish past. Following the lead established by the field, this work treats public memory as a ground that has been just as contested and exploited as the ground ceded in the Treaty of Guadalupe Hidalgo. Proceeding from this premise and incorporating scholarship on space and performance, this dissertation reveals the links between public memory and the shifts in power and identity that are the primary concern of Chicano historians. This linkage poses memory of the Spanish past as a prominent issue in scholarship on the interethnic politics of the Southwest.

New Mexico presents a particularly clear example of the political cachet tied to the romantic image of the Spanish past. In the period after the railroad boom, the Mexicano people of the territory developed a "language of blood" as historian John Nieto-Phillips has called it, that allowed them to tap into the growing fascination with the Spanish past.[18] The claim to Spanishness on the part of nuevomexicanos illustrates the complexity of staking a claim to the Spanish past and the power of stories that did so. Nuevomexicanos resisted domination by claiming the Spanish past through history and language. Nonetheless, while not entirely bowing to the tourist fantasies of the Anglo urban majority, nuevomexicanos banked on fascination in the story of Spanish colonialism to solidify and strengthen their political agency in the state and nation.

Some of the most important scholarship on place in the urban Southwest was produced during the first wave of Chicano history generated in the 1970s.

---

[18] John M. Nieto-Phillips, *Language of Blood: The Making of Spanish-American Identity in New Mexico, 1880s-1930s* (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2008).

These historians did not directly consider place as a category of analysis in the way that this study will, but they did draw connections between place, identity, and power. The process that historian Albert Camarillo called "barrioization" provided a framework for the exploration of political and social processes that eroded Mexicano power and penned them into ethnically separated barrios.[19] In a similar study, Richard Griswold del Castillo found the same segregation but drew a positive conclusion from it:

> The barrio gave a geographical identity, a feeling of being at home, to the dispossessed and poor. It was a place, a traditional place, that offered some security . . . . The creation of the barrio ensured ethnic survival. Proximity of residence reinforced the language, religion, and social habits of the Mexican-Americans and thus ensured the continuation of their distinctive culture.[20]

By adding ritual and collective memory to Griswold del Castillo's recipe for a cultural preservative (place, language, religion, and social habits) I will build on the legacy of Chicano community studies. The sense of place that Mexicanos developed through barrioization provided a strong foundation for their construction of their role in history.

The idea of barrioization as a force that turns space into an agent of ethnic survival stands in stark contrast to the remaking of space for capitalist production and profit. Historian Steven Hoelscher notes:

---

[19] Albert Camarillo, *Chicanos in a Changing Society: From Mexican Pueblos to American Barrios in Santa Barbara and Southern California, 1848-1930* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1979), 117-18.

[20] Richard Griswold del Castillo, *The Los Angeles Barrio, 1850-1890: A Social History* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1979), 150. For further examinations of ethnicity in the Los Angeles barrio, see Ricardo Romo, *East Los Angeles: History of a Barrio* (Austin: University of Texas Press, 1983); George J. Sánchez, *Becoming Mexican American: Ethnicity, Culture and Identity in Chicano Los Angeles, 1900-1945* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1993); Monroy, *Rebirth : Mexican Los Angeles from the Great Migration to the Great Depression.*

> Commodification—the process by which objects and activities come to be valued primarily in terms of their value in the marketplace and for their ability to signify an image—can take place as its starting point. Distinct places and the qualities they imbue...can be turned into commodities in their own right.[21]

The commodification of Spanish space in the Southwest is evident in the work of boosters and preservationists who sought to signify the image of their cities as unique and exotic through the creation of distinctive architectural styles based on elements of the Spanish past. These agents highlighted selected elements of the past on the landscape and reproduced them in new buildings. Juxtaposing this capitalist view of place against the notion of barrio as cultural stronghold demonstrates that the stakes of meaning given to the past were to high to be monopolized by any one group without contention.

This dissertation is built on the historiography of empire and exploitation in the Southwest while touching on another field, developed in the last two decades of twentieth century, that investigates cultural history through memory. Although approaches and subjects of study differ, the scholars behind this movement are united by the conviction that societies construct their pasts rather than objectively recording them, and that they do so to serve the needs of contemporary culture. I agree with historians Eric Hobsbawm and Terence Ranger that memory is both a reflection and product of the power held by a society's dominant groups. As he put it, "The history which became part of the fund of knowledge or the ideology of nation, state or movement is not what has actually been preserved in popular memory, but what has been selected, written, pictured, popularized and institutionalized by those whose function it is to do so."[22] The shared representations of the past that are the result of these constructions are the primary object of memory studies. In the case of this dissertation, the focus will not be what happened in the colonial era but how people reconstructed that period in the late-nineteenth and early-twentieth centuries and why it was culturally fruitful for them to tell the stories they related. Of course, any field that studies "shared" cultural representations must recognize the impossibility of a unanimous culture. Indeed, the tension between competing visions of the past and the political implications of which memories stick and which silences prevail is what drew me to study memory of the Spanish past. I aim to identify different versions of the past as they circulated in the time period under study and show how the elevation of one narrative above existing alternatives reproduces unequal political relationships in society. This disparity meant that more powerful groups had greater potential for their particular version of the past to be embraced and normalized.

---

[21] Steven Hoelscher, *Heritage on Stage: The Invention of Ethnic Place in America's Little Switzerland* (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1998), 22.

My approach to memory in the Southwest will draw on memory studies, a field that has been pursued and expanded by social scientists of many disciplines.[23] The field is by no means a new one, but publication of work at the intersection of memory studies and history has mushroomed in the last decade.[24] Historian Kerwin Klein identified the advent of memory studies in recent historiography:

---

[22] Eric Hobsbawm and Terence Ranger, eds., *The Invention of Tradition*(Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1983), 13.

[23] Most scholars attribute the origin of memory studies as a field to French sociologist Maurice Halbwachs, whose work in the 1920s suggested that memory was fundamentally social rather than personal. He contended that the individual could not recollect the past out of the context of a social framework. According to him, in order for the past "to be settled in the memory of a group, it needs to be presented in the concrete form of an

> For years, specialists have dealt with such well-known phenomena as oral history, autobiography, and commemorative rituals without ever pasting them together into something called *memory*. Where we once spoke of folk history or popular history or oral history or public history or even myth we now employ memory as a metahistorical category that subsumes all these various terms.[25]

In this work, memory as a category of analysis will focus on the stories that people tell about the past. These narratives were transmitted through numerous media including newspapers, literature, songs, rituals, dances, drama, and the built environment. These stories were never universally accepted nor universally understood. We cannot assume that all groups understood and valued the past in

---

event, of a personality, or of a locality." This argument is particularly germane to my work by connecting cognition of the past with perception of places and rituals. Maurice Halbwachs, *On Collective Memory / Maurice Halbwachs; Edited, Translated, and with an Introduction by Lewis A. Coser*, trans. Lewis A. Coser (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1992), 200.

[24] For a thorough historiography of history and memory studies, see Patrick Hutton, "Recent Scholarship on Memory and History," *The History Teacher* 33, no. 4 (2000). For notable recent reflection on memory by historians see Barry Schwartz, *Abraham Lincoln and the Forge of National Memory* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2000); Paul A. Shackel, *Memory in Black and White: Race, Commemoration, and the Post-Bellum Landscape* (New York: Altamira Press, 2003); David Glassberg, *Sense of History: The Place of the Past in American Life* (Amherst: University of Massachusetts Press, 2001); Katharine Hodgkin and Susannah Radstone, eds., *Contested Pasts: The Politics of Memory*(New York: Routledge, 2003).

[25] Kerwin Lee Klein, "On the Emergence of Memory in Historical Discourse," *Representations*, no. 69 (2000): 128. For additional criticism of memory as used in the study of history, see Wulf Kansteiner, "Finding Meaning in Memory: A Methodological Critique of Collective Memory Studies," *History and Theory* 41, no. 2 (2002); Alon Confino, "Collective Memory and Cultural History: Problems of Method," *The American Historical Review* 102, no. 5 (1997).

the same way. My work will track these disagreements or social dissonances in order to understand how some memories become popular and accepted as history while others are subsumed into local culture and folklore.

The key to deepening our understanding of memory as a political and social construct is to explore its relationship with representations of place. Place in this study will refer to the geographic area that serves as a physical and symbolic context for the construction of memory that distinguishes that area from others as a specific region. [26] The former Mexican North is an ideal case for studying the invention and contestation of the past. Being part of the American West, the region has been the object of much myth-making by Anglo-Americans.[27] The

---

[26] For an overview of the historiography of place see, Glassberg, *Sense of History: The Place of the Past in American Life*, ch. 5. Other recent works on place, history, and identity include Hoelscher, *Heritage on Stage: The Invention of Ethnic Place in America's Little Switzerland*; Richard L. Nostrand, *The Hispano Homeland* (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1992); Max Page, *The Creative Destruction of Manhattan, 1900-1940* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1999); David M. Wrobel and Michael C. Steiner, eds., *Many Wests: Place, Culture, and Regional Identity*(Lawrence: The University Press of Kansas, 1997); Stephanie Yuhl, *A Golden Haze of Memory: The Making of Historic Charleston* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2005); Sally Southwick, *Building on a Borrowed Past: Place and Identity in Pipestone, Minnesota* (Athens: Ohio University Press, 2005); James C. Cobb, *The Most Southern Place on Earth: The Mississippi Delta and the Roots of Regional Identity* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1992); James C. Cobb, *Away Down South: A History of Southern Identity* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2005).

[27] For construction and deconstruction of the myth of the American West, see Richard Slotkin, *Regeneration through Violence: The Mythology of the American Frontier, 1600-1860* (Middletown: Wesleyan University Press, 1973); Richard Slotkin, *The Fatal Environment: The Myth of the Frontier in the Age of Industrialization, 1800-1890* (New York: Atheneum, 1985); Frederick Jackson Turner, "The Significance of the Frontier in American History," in *Rereading Frederick Jackson Turner*, ed. John Mack Faragher(New Haven: Yale University Press, 1994); Richard Slotkin, *Gunfighter Nation: The Myth of the Frontier in Twentieth-Century America* (New York: Atheneum, 1992); Henry Nash Smith, *Virgin Land: The American West as Symbol and Myth* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1950).

West as an uncivilized frontier that served as the object of Euro-American conquest and economic development was a central theme of that mythology. The northernmost section of the Spanish empire challenged this myth because it was settled by another European and Christian civilization. This circumstance has created a region of the United States with two colonial heritages that can be presented in numerous ways from cooperative to oppositional. The recollection and retelling of these two lineages by the citizens of the Southwest reveals the ways those people made sense of their history and their identities as individuals, in groups, and as the population of booming cities.

Nearly two decades ago, Dolores Hayden declared that "urban landscapes are storehouses for . . . social memories, because natural features such as hills or harbors, as well as streets, buildings, and patterns of settlement, frame the lives of many people and often outlast many lifetimes." Despite this endurance, she continues, "The power of place . . . remains untapped for most working people's neighborhoods in most American cities, and for most ethnic history and most women's history."[28] In the time since she set forth this need for a new analysis of place, few scholars have responded with studies that take into account the social history of place.[29] In seeking to tap the power of place, I finalize the diagram of memory in the Southwest. Here, at the convergence of ethnicity, ritual, and place lies the contested ground at stake in the construction of memory of the Spanish past. Examining this intersection produces insights that radiate along all these lines and fill out the history of incorporation of the Mexican North and its people into the American Southwest.

---

[28] Dolores Hayden, *The Power of Place: Urban Landscapes as Public History* (Cambridge: The MIT Press, 1995), 9.

[29] For examples of scholars who have considered social history and place since Hayden's call, see Arnoldo de León, "Region and Ethnicity: Topographical Identities in Texas," in *Many Wests: Place, Culture, and Regional Identity*, ed. David M. Wrobel and Michael C. Steiner(Lawrence: The University Press of Kansas, 1997); Shackel, *Memory in Black and White: Race, Commemoration, and the Post-Bellum Landscape.*

Memories, whether true, misremembered or intentionally forgotten, make up who we are as individuals and as societies. If culture is the transmission of patterns of behavior and belief across generations, then any culture is no more than what the people in that culture collectively remember. The key to understanding cultural history, i.e. how people's behaviors and beliefs change over time, is studying memory as expressed in a collective mode. The cultural history of the American Southwest proves this point. The region, perhaps more than any other in the United States, has been defined by the politics of its history and the memorialization of cultures that preceded American dominion there.

CHAPTER OUTLINE

The United States expanded quickly between 1845 and 1848. In that very short period Mexico went to war with the United States over the annexation of Texas and ceded a half-million square miles of land in the treaty that ended the conflict. In ensuing years, numerous American soldiers, surveyors and adventurers visited their nation's new territorial holdings and published accounts of their travels to sate the curiosity of eastern readers interested in the region. Chapter One examines these accounts to establish how Americans imagined the Spanish past at this early stage. As these observers reconciled their cultural inheritance from Britain with the recent war against Mexico, the annexation of

Mexican land, and the inclusion of Mexicano people in U.S. territory, they redirected well-known anti-Spanish stereotypes against their former Mexican enemies. These commentators laid the groundwork for viewing the Spanish past as romantic and the Mexican present as degenerate. Following this foundational chapter, the dissertation proceeds on two interrelated fronts. Chapters two and three focus on material landscapes and chapters four and five study performance within those landscapes.

I begin Chapter Two by showing how Spanish colonial planning principles shaped the built environment of Tucson, Albuquerque and San Antonio. I then examine how the population boom brought about by the railroad at the end of the nineteenth century shifted the centers of these urban spaces away from their historic locations to new Anglo-controlled sites. Chapter Three considers the political implications of historic preservation in the Southwest. It tracks the ideological shift from the marginalization of the Spanish past expressed in the previous chapter to a new esteem evidenced by the move to preserve colonial-era buildings. That esteem was not evenly dispersed across the region, however. A combination of history, capital, and ideology gave historic preservation a greater purchase in San Antonio than elsewhere in the Southwest. This chapter pays particular attention to San Antonio to explain this development.

Chapters Four and Five center on memorialization through performance. After a narrative of the Spanish past was built around the physical space of the cities under study, urban citizens enacted that narrative through performance. Chapter four focuses on *Los Pastores*, a Christmas drama performed by Mexicanos in all the case-study cities. After establishing the ritual's colonial origins, the chapter follows its passage to the American Southwest in the 1910s and 1920s. Excluded by politics and finance from historic preservation project, Mexicano performers used the ritual to connect to one another and to their immediate ancestors. The chapter also tracks the reactions of Anglo observers to *Los Pastores* to demonstrate how the groups differed in their outlook on the Spanish past. Chapter Five moves into the 1930s, when a craze for historic pageants hit the Southwest. Through pageantry, Anglo elites were able to realize the fullest expression of imagined Spanish romance and muster their narrative of the Spanish past to support American patriotism.

CHAPTER 1: THE BLACK LEGEND

In 1844, Josiah Gregg's account of nine years plying the Santa Fe Trail, *Commerce of the Prairies*, introduced many Americans to the geography, people, culture and flora and fauna of Northern Mexico. Just over two decades earlier, Mexico's independence from Spain and the consequent opening of the Santa Fe-Chihuahua Trail to U.S. commerce had piqued the interest of Americans in their neighbor to the west. Gregg proved to be a talented ethnologist and naturalist. He spent more time getting to know the land and people of Northern Mexico than many of his compatriots, and his assessment of the region reflects that depth. Nonetheless, his withering appraisal of the people of New Mexico indicated an abiding aversion to them:

> The New Mexicans appear to have inherited much of the cruelty and intolerance of their ancestors, and no small portion of their bigotry and fanaticism. Being of a highly imaginative temperament and of rather accommodating moral principles—cunning, loquacious, quick of perception and sycophantic, their conversation frequently exhibits a degree of tact—a false glare of talent, eminently calculated to mislead and impose. They have no stability except in artifice; no profundity except for intrigue: qualities for which they have acquired an unenviable celebrity. Systematically cringing and subservient while out of power, as soon as the august mantle of authority falls upon their shoulders, there are but little bounds to their arrogance and vindictiveness of spirit.[1]

Gregg's disparagement comes from the prejudices of his time as well as his own intercultural misperceptions, but more interesting than the trader's chauvinism is the logic behind it. The Mexicans were mendacious, deceitful, and tyrannical because they had inherited those traits from the Spanish colonists who populated

---

[1] Josiah Gregg, *Commerce of the Prairies* (1844; reprint, with a new introduction by Archibald Hanna, Philadelphia: Lippincott, 1962), 116.

New Spain in the previous centuries. Gregg's contempt did not develop *ex nihilo*. The collective memory articulated in his book had its own predecessors to which he points in his assessment of nuevomexicano shortcomings. His genetic model of the transmission of vice indicated that the way Americans thought about Mexicans in the nineteenth century was bound up in their views of Spaniards and their earlier colonial enterprise in the New World.

This chapter frames the development of American attitudes toward Mexicano people and their culture in nineteenth-century America with the historical perception of Spanish people and culture upon which those attitudes were based. English politicians and intellectuals of the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries adopted a pejorative view of the Spanish rooted in political, commercial, and imperial rivalries. Dubbed the Black Legend, that notion was transported by the English colonists to North America. Those views softened markedly in the early nineteenth century as Latin American independence movements eroded Spain's imperial holdings. After independence, and with no enduring contest between the United States and Spain, the Black Legend no longer served a useful purpose in the United States This is not to say that the stereotypes of the Black Legend vanished suddenly or completely. They persisted in U.S. culture into the twentieth century, though over time they became increasingly associated with Mexicans rather than Spaniards.

In the nineteenth century, as belligerence between the United States and Spain diminished, contact and conflict between the United States and Mexico increased, culminating in the 1836 Texas Revolt and the U.S.-Mexico War of 1846-1848. The enmity generated by those confrontations, combined with

Mexicans' linguistic and religious connections to Spain, created an environment perfect for the transference of the Black Legend from Spaniard to Mexican. This reorientation of the Black Legend depended on a differentiation between the categories of Spanish and Mexican. These categories took on racially tinted, symbolic values that defined the role of each in American culture. Spaniards became white pioneers of the distant past, while Mexicans, doomed to off-whiteness by their hybrid heritage, occupied a subordinate position in the contemporary Southwest. The whitening of Spaniards worked in tandem with an antimodern narrative of the colonial era and an Orientalist view of Spain to lay the foundation of the romantic Spanish past of the American Southwest.

COLONIAL RIVALRY AND THE BLACK LEGEND

Let us begin with the symbolic construction of Spain in the English mind during the age of European empires. A complex of stereotypes about Spaniards developed in the sixteenth century that, over time, spread across most of Europe. Typically, these stereotypes painted Spaniards as cruel, tyrannical, superstitious, despotic, duplicitous, closed-minded, lazy, greedy, feeble-minded, and weak-willed. As with all stereotypes, those historically applied to the Spanish implied that they did not exhibit these traits by choice, rather they were an innate quality that could not be avoided or changed. In aggregate, this cluster of stereotypes has come to be known as the Black Legend. As defined by historian Philip Wayne Powell, the Black Legend is "the accumulation of anti-Spanish prejudices, propagandas, hatreds, and denigratory half-truths arising out of Spain's long stay at the European summit in military, dynastic, religious, and economic affairs; all enhanced by the much-envied wealth and prestige of vast overseas possessions."[2] This negative view gained such traction among the Protestant imperial rivals to Spain that the "factual, historical consideration of [Spanish colonialism] never saw print in British America or, indeed, ever enjoyed much influence subsequently."[3] The sneering image of Spanish people, religion and culture took such a strong hold in Anglophone thought that it shaped popular views of Spaniards and their descendants in North America into the early-twentieth century.

The Black Legend persisted in English culture over such a long period because of the cultural work it performed. It simultaneously justified Spanish-English belligerence and served as a foil that defined the English. Rather than explaining that everything from the Protestant reformation to royal lines of succession and competition in the New World had fed antipathy between the two, the English declared the Spanish their natural enemies. Additionally, Spanish shortcomings demonstrated English cultural, moral, and religious superiority. The English defined themselves as everything the Black Legend Spaniard was not. English enlightenment promised reason, freedom, and democratic principles while Black Legend Spaniards represented superstition, restriction, and tyranny. Protestantism brought a liberation of religious thought and a more direct connection to God while Spanish Catholicism represented dogmatism in daily life and enslavement to the Pope. The perpetuation of the Black Legend in the United States from the eighteenth into the nineteenth centuries, therefore, was a vindication of Protestant, enlightenment ideals through vilification of their opposites projected onto the Spanish.

---

[2] Philip Wayne Powell, *Tree of Hate: Propaganda and Prejudices Affecting United States Relations with the Hispanic World* (Vallecito, California: Ross House Books, 1985), x.

[3] David S. Shields, *Oracles of Empire: Poetry, Politics, and Commerce in British America, 1690-1750* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1990), 175.

Furthermore, the history of wars of religion between the English and the Spanish ensured that economic and political rivalry burst into unmitigated hatred. The Catholic monarchs of the sixteenth and early seventeenth centuries built a massive American empire while deploying the Counter-Reformation against their Protestant enemies in England and the Netherlands. Constant opponents of the Spanish in religion and war, the English and the Dutch swiftly associated patriotism and religious orthodoxy with a deep hatred of the Spanish. Such odium is evident in Oliver Cromwell's efforts to unite England in detestation of the Spanish after his overthrow of the monarchy in 1653. In a 1656 speech he declared, "Why, truly, your great enemy is the Spaniard. ...He is a natural enemy, he is naturally so ... through that enmity that is in him against all that is of God that is in you ... contrary to that his blindness and darkness, led on by superstition and the implicitness of his faith in submitting to the See of Rome."[4] Cromwell saw no accident of history in the antipathy between Spain and England. God ordained their bloody rivalry. Peace between them was impossible,

---

[4] Oliver Cromwell, "Speech at the Opening of Parliament," in *The Black Legend: Anti-Spanish Attitudes in the Old World and the New*, ed. Charles Gibson(New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1971), 56-57.

"you could not have an honest nor an honourable peace with [a Spaniard]. ...He is naturally throughout an enemy, an enmity is put into him by God."[5]

Xenophobia was certainly nothing new when Spain reached its apex as an imperial power after the sixteenth century, but several historical factors made the hatred of Spain particularly long-lived. One of these factors was the coincidence of Spanish ascendance with the widespread use of the printing press. This technology allowed Spain's imperial competitors, England and Holland in particular, to run an ongoing and vicious war of propaganda that reached a broad audience. The most polemical anti-Spanish text of the sixteenth century was Dominican friar Bartolomé de Las Casas', *Brevísima Relación de la Destrucción de las Indias* (Brief Relation of the Destruction of the Indies).[6] Originally published in 1552, French, Flemish and English translations soon followed. In *Brevísima Relación*, Las Casas presented an exaggerated and distorted version of the violence of the Spanish conquest of the Caribbean. It served as "the single most powerful weapon of Spain's enemies, the best known and most used source for foreigners writing on Spanish overseas actions."[7] In 1656, not long after the British captured the Spanish colony of Jamaica, a new translation of Las Casas appeared in Puritan England with a more sinister title, *The Tears of the Indians: Being an Historical and True Account of the Cruel Massacres and Slaughter of*

---

[5] Ibid., 57.

[6] De Las Casas is still the subject of debate. Was he a selfless whistleblower or a zealous polemicist? For an overview see Powell, *Tree of Hate*, 30-36.

[7] Ibid., 32.

Above Twenty Millions of Innocent People. The translator dedicated the volume to Oliver Cromwell and included an anti-Spanish preface.

This anti-Spanish intellectual current readily took hold in the North American English colonies. The Puritans who came to New England in the seventeenth century arrived via viciously hispanophobic Holland and many anti-Spanish texts, including the *Tears of the Indians* circulated in the colonies. A lengthy poem titled "The Rising Glory of America" written by colonial poet Philip Freneau in 1771 and revised in 1786 shows the presence of anti-Spanish prejudice in the colonies and an American eagerness to contrast their "bloodless" conquest with Spain's rapacity. Freneau states the distinction directly: "Better these northern realms deserve our song,/ Discovered by Britannia for her sons;/ Undeluged with seas of Indian blood,/ Which cruel Spain on southern regions spilt;/ To gain by terrors what the generous breast/ Wins by fair treaty, conquers without blood."[8] In Freneau's view, the colonies of New England blessed by a lack of gold and silver were spared avarice and were favored with yeoman righteousness.

> Better these northern realms demand our song,
> Design'd by nature for the rural reign,
> For agriculture's toil.—No blood we shed
> For metals buried in a rocky waste.—
> Curs'd be that ore, which brutal makes our race
> And prompts mankind to shed a brother's blood.[9]

---

[8] Philip Freneau, *The Poems of Philip Freneau* (Philadelphia: Francis Bailey, 1786), 48.

[9] Ibid., 43.

The poem later explains that although precious metals can drive humanity to brutality, that quality is simply innate in the Spanish, "Whom blood and murder only satisfied,/ And all to glut their avarice and ambition!"[10] Indeed, Spaniards in Freneau's estimation stand out as "Europe's murdering breed."[11] Finally, the poet identifies the vicious Spaniard as the gutless and bloodthirsty contrast to merciful and righteous Americans, who stood apart from these killers because "each American, true hearted, learns/ To conquer, and to spare; for coward souls/ Alone seek vengeance on a vanquished foe."[12]

As scholar Eric Wertheimer has pointed out, "The Rising Glory of America" establishes a contrast between a saintly, virtuous, and innocent America and a sinfully corrupt Spain. This moral distinction serves to "answer the critical question of whether Americans were good enough to be republicans with imperial aspirations."[13] Thus, in the early stages of the development of American national identity, the Black Legend still proved useful as a foil of corrupt empire. The fact that Americans lacked the rapacity of Black Legend Spaniards justified both their independence and impending westward expansion.

---

[10] Ibid., 49.

[11] Ibid., 50.

[12] Ibid.

[13] Eric Wertheimer, *Imagined Empires: Incas, Aztecs, and the New World of American Literature, 1771-1876* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998), 50.

THE ROMANTIC TURN

Although the stereotypes of the Black Legend remained potent in the United States during the colonial era and immediately after independence, Americans' views of the Spanish softened in the nineteenth century. One of the first public figures to write in this positive vein was Washington Irving. The author gained fame following the publication of *The Sketch Book of Geoffrey Crayon, Gent* in 1819. The collection included "The Legend of Sleepy Hollow" and "Rip Van Winkle", and established Irving as a man of letters known for the American settings and vernacular language of his stories. He reveled in his newfound fame by traveling through Europe where English, French and German socialites feted him.

Settled in Madrid by 1826, Irving dove into Spanish history. He began weaving together history and fiction to produce a romantic vision of Spain's landscape and upper class. The first publication from this period, also the first he published without a pseudonym, was the hagiographical *The Life and Voyages of Christopher Columbus* released in 1828. The following year saw the publication of *The Chronicles of the Conquest of Granada* followed by *Tales of the Alhambra* three years later. This trio of books celebrated Columbus and his Spanish patrons and presented "the soft southern region of Andalusia" as an exotic Mediterranean utopia. These works, while casting a warm glow on particular Spaniards and their exploits, also carried forward hints of the Black Legend in their characterization of Spain's lower-class population. Irving combined travel narrative, archival research, Arabian folklore and imaginative fiction, while balancing familiar stereotypes against a romantic ambiance, to feed readers' hunger for exotic lands, peoples and customs.[14] Apparently, that hunger was profound since all three books sold well; *The Life and Voyages of Christopher Columbus* was reprinted in 175 editions before the onset of the twentieth century.[15]

As Irving's works celebrated and romanticized Spanish places and heroes, the United States acquired territory directly from Spain for the first time with the annexation of Florida.[16] Claimed by the Spanish in 1565, Florida remained under their control until 1763 when it was ceded to the English in exchange for Havana and Manila at the end of the Seven Years' War. At the conclusion of the American Revolutionary War, Spain regained the peninsula in 1783 under the Treaty of Versailles. The early nineteenth century saw several attempts by filibusters to take control of Florida in order to foment revolt. After General Andrew Jackson occupied Pensacola and San Marcos de Apalachee in 1818, Spain was forced to recognize the United States' *de facto* control of Florida, formally relinquishing it via the Adams-Onís treaty of 1819.[17]

In the midst of this territorial shuffling, Irving's nephew, Theodore, recognized that the success of his uncle's Spanish trio showed that a romantic take on Spanish images could capture a wide and eager readership. Raised in New York, the younger Irving traveled to Europe in 1828 at the age of nineteen to study languages. For three years he lived with his uncle in Madrid, Paris and London while the elder Irving researched and wrote the Spanish books.[18] Aiming to tap the same vein of romantic Spanish history that had been so lucrative to his uncle, he published *The Conquest of Florida under Hernando de Soto* in 1835. In the preface he claims that he felt motivated to write on the topic because “A full account of an expedition which throws such an air of romance over the early history of a portion of our country, would possess interest in the eyes of my countrymen.”[19] Surely, the younger Irving recognized the appeal of romantic history in the recent success of his uncle’s writing. He knew that American readers could readily embrace a romantic characterization of the Spanish explorer.

---

[14] Barbara Nugnes, "Paradise Regained: Washington Irving's Mythological Spain," in *America and the Mediterranean: Aisna, Associazione Italiana Di Studi Nord-Americani, Proceedings of the Sixteenth Biennial International Conference, Genova, November 8-11, 2001*, ed. Massimo Bacigalupo and Pierangelo Castagneto(Torino: Otto Editore, 2003), 333.

[15] Andrew Burstein, *The Original Knickerbocker: The Life of Washington Irving* (New York: Basic Books, 2008), 196.

[16] The Louisiana Purchase was a Spanish territory until 1800 when it passed to France. The French then sold the territory to the United States in 1803.

[17] David J. Weber, *The Spanish Frontier in North America* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1992), 299.

The success of the elder Irving’s Spanish trio and the younger Irving’s assessment of his readers demonstrate that the American populace of the nineteenth century exhibited a very different view of the Spanish past than that held by their compatriots a century earlier. Whereas earlier generations perpetuated the Black Legend view of the Spanish, the early nineteenth century found Americans desirous to read de Soto’s exploits, not to deplore a bloodthirsty villain but to absorb the air of romance and antiquity they cast over land that now belonged to the United States. This romantic ambience relied on a change in the characterization of the Spanish explorer from rapacious brigand to dashing adventurer. As the younger Irving declared, de Soto's endeavor was "daring and extravagant, and those concerned in it, were men who delighted in adventure and exploit."[20] Irving's de Soto reflects a general waning of anti-Spanish sentiments inspired by the Black Legend since the time of Freneau.

---

[18] “Washington Irving’s Nephew,” *The New York Times*, December 21, 1880.

[19] Theodore Irving, *The Conquest of Florida by Hernando De Soto* (New York: GP Putman & Co, 1857), viii.

While capturing the turn toward a romantic view of the Spanish past in their writing, the Irvings also cemented a key element of that trope—the Spanish adventurer as hero. The elder Irving established a rosy hue for the landscape and culture of Spain and the younger followed with the themes of the dashing explorer as embodied in de Soto. Numerous subsequent authors followed this literary path, even covering the same ground in the Florida Peninsula. In *The Early History of Florida,* George Fairbanks, a law clerk and, in later years, Florida state senator and mayor of St. Augustine demonstrated his familiarity with Black Legend stereotypes. [21] For example, he painted Ponce de Leon as a greedy villain who "looked forward to conquering new regions with his sword, which would gratify alike his desire for fame and his appetite for wealth."[22] However, he sheds the pejorative tone when describing of the exploits of Hernando de Soto.

---

[20] Ibid., xi.

[21] For a biography of Fairbanks, see Arthur Joseph Lynch, *George Rainsford Fairbanks: A Man of Many Facets* (Los Altos, California: Shambles Press, 1999).

[22] George R. Fairbanks, *The Early History of Florida: An Introductory Lecture Delivered by George R. Fairbanks, Esq., before the Florida Historical Society* (St. Augustine: The Florida Historical Society, 1857), 5.

Like Irving, Fairbanks lauded the Spanish explorer, “next to Cortez, the most distinguished of the successors of Columbus.”[23] Of de Soto’s exploits before he came to Florida, Fairbanks says, “He had been one of the most brilliant leaders in the conquest of Peru under Pizarro … he desired to achieve for himself alone the merits of *‘un Conquistador,’* the highest point of ambition to the chivalric spirits of that day.”[24] In Fairbanks’ estimation, de Soto was not only a brilliant military leader, but first in an age and culture framed by chivalry and honor. Fairbanks also gave a share of praise to de Soto’s entourage: “The most distinguished men in the kingdom sought to participate in the venture. … It bid fair to be an expedition of knights and gentlemen alone.”[25]

According to Fairbanks not only was the leader a noble man, the whole expedition consisted of Spain’s upper crust. Here he employed a trope common in romantic retellings of the Spanish past. Every Spaniard who crossed the Atlantic somehow arrived as a grandee of elevated rank. Rather than staying at home to enjoy their wealth and stature, every baron and marqués apparently clamored for a berth to the New World.[26]

Fairbanks’ focus on de Soto and his crew as dashing heroes motivated by glory and gallantry continues Theodore Irving’s praiseful tone. While not entirely scrubbed of Black Legend ideas, *The Early History of Florida* demonstrates an early draping of the brave explorer in Spanish romance. The presence of a Spanish adventurer as a hero and object of admiration in Fairbanks' story signifies the growing cultural entrenchment of an enduring trope celebrating a romantic Spanish past.

---

[23] Ibid., 8.

[24] Ibid.

[25] Ibid.

[26] The exploration and conquest of the Americas was, in fact, a middle and lower class process. Very few of those who crossed the ocean held any rank of nobility or significant wealth. More typically, expeditions shared risks, costs and rewards, allowing for personal initiative and effectiveness to determine leadership. Powell, *Tree of Hate*, 20.

Authors did not rely solely on dashing conquistadors to evoke the romantic Spanish past in Florida. They also imbued Florida's landscape with romantic hues. Most focused on St. Augustine, the oldest and most substantial of Spain's settlements in Florida, as the place where the Spanish past yet lived. Writing about the town in 1873, Harriet Beecher Stowe remarked, "The aspect of St. Augustine is quaint and strange, in harmony with its romantic history. …It is as if some little, old, dead-and-alive Spanish town with its fort and gateway and Moorish bell towers, had broken loose, floated over here, and got stranded on a sand bank."[27] She described life in St. Augustine as having "the indolent, dreamy stillness that characterizes life in Old Spain."[28] Thus, the degenerate laziness of the Black Legend was transformed into a lovely tranquility. Even as late-nineteenth-century Americans moved to new territory in the Southwest, they looked to St. Augustine as the epitome of Spanish romance. A journalist from Urbana, Illinois, who attended the 1889 meeting of the National Press Association in San Antonio, Texas, favorably compared the Spanish settlement of

---

[27] Harriet Beecher Stowe, *Palmetto-Leaves* (Boston: James R. Osgood and Company, 1873), 213.

[28] Ibid.

Texas to Florida: “The old part of the town is as quaint and as full of early Spanish lore as St. Augustine in Florida.”[29]

THE SPANISH PAST IN THE AMERICAN SOUTHWEST

Soon after the annexation of Florida in 1819, the people of the United States became interested in another former Spanish colonial outpost. In 1821 Mexico won its independence from Spain after a decade of struggle. The new republic to the west repealed many of the colonial regulations that isolated Mexico from the United States The Mexican government allowed merchants from the United States access to the Santa Fe-Chihuahua trade, a Spanish monopoly under colonial regulations. For the first time, many American trappers and traders got to see Mexico. As traders and travelers visited New Mexico and Texas in the 1820s and 1830s, they fed the curiosity of their countrymen with stories about their journeys. While the authors who explored the Spanish past in Florida did so historically, through conquistadors and colonial outposts, those who wrote about northern Mexico did so as travelers, filtering their visions of the Spanish past through their experiences in the Mexican present.[30]

This juxtaposition created a view of the territory of Northern Mexico, the people there, and the colonial history of the region unlike that formed in Florida.

---

[29] John H. Copeland, *Editorial Souvenir of San Antonio: Past, Present, and Future* (San Antonio: Johnson Brothers, 1892), 74.

[30] For an overview of this body of literature, see Raymund A. Paredes, "The Mexican Image in American Travel Literature, 1831-1869," *New Mexico Historical Review* 52, no. 1 (1977).

Few descendants of colonial Spaniards lived in Florida by the early nineteenth century, so the romantic narrative of Spanish Florida did not have to address contemporary people, allowing historians to monopolize the narrative of the peninsula. Those Americans who wrote about their travels through northern Mexico, on the other hand, witnessed the enduring legacy of Spanish colonialism evident in the people, their language, and their religion. The different visions of the Spanish past in Florida and northern Mexico reveal the prismatic transformation of the Black Legend in the nineteenth century. Rather than reflecting the pure vituperation of earlier formations, the Black Legend of the nineteenth century was refracted into a range of expressions covering the spectrum from revulsion to romance.

Certainly, the negative stereotypes mustered against Mexicans retained some connection to the classic Spanish Black Legend. Some travelers described the people they encountered in Mexico in terms wholly derived from the Black Legend by recognizing those people as transplanted Spaniards. In other words, they clearly saw the historical and cultural connection between Mexico and Spain, and attributed the repulsive qualities of Mexicans to their Spanish origins. One example of such a process is evident in the writings of Albert Pike. Joining a trading caravan to Santa Fe in 1831, he traveled from Taos across the Staked Plains to Arkansas the following year. Clearly inspired by Washington Irving, in 1834 he published an account of his adventures in Northern Mexico that mixed memoir with fiction and poetry. In that work, he directly acknowledged Irving's influence in his own characterization of Mexican peasants:

> The description which Irving, in his Tales of the Alhambra, gives of the lower class in Spain, will answer to perfection for the people of Mexico. They are a lazy, gossipping people, always lounging on their blankets and smoking the cigarillos--living on nothing, and without labor. From morning till night they doze or chatter, and are seldom seen to do any thing; but when a fandango comes they are all life and bustle. At least two thirds of the days of the year are fiestas, or feast days, when their conscience would smite them if they were to work, and in that matter they are particularly chary of their conscience.[31]

Pike painted the Mexicans in the same tones of indolence and laziness common to the Black Legend and freely acknowledged that he cribbed the stereotype from the Irving's views of the Spaniard. In this case Mexicans inherited the decadent traits of their colonial forbears.

The idea that Mexicans were doomed by a corrupt inheritance bestowed on them by evil Spanish colonists took on its most bilious tone in the writings of Henry Stuart Foote, a Mississippi lawyer who would later go on to be a senator and governor of that state. In 1841, Foote wrote and publishedtwo volumes after a visit to the Republic of Texas entitled *Texas and the Texans; or, Advance of the Anglo-Americans to the Southwest.* Clearly in favor of annexation, Foote presents a teleological narrative that sees no other course for Texas aside from an inevitable and justified domination by Anglo Americans in his lifetime. As the heirs to a corrupt Spanish colonialism, Foote argued, Mexicans were poorly equipped to govern themselves. The Americans, bequeathed superior laws, religion, and morals by the English, were therefore destined to take Texas and more of Mexico. Foote's writing frames the contest of the newly independent

---

[31] Albert Pike, *Prose Sketches and Poems: Written in the Western Country* (Boston: Light & Horton, 1834), 247.

Mexico and United States in familiar colonial-era terms—an essential step in the reshaping of the Black Legend for the nineteenth century.

Foote described Mexico as a land "where all notions of order and right had been already completely obliterated."[32] The phrase sets the tone for his argument—that the Spanish had done everything possible to corrupt Mexico and cripple the social development of its people. According to Foote, this degradation was permanent and insurmountable. The Spanish, he claimed, had condemned the people of Mexico to "a destiny of woe and degradation, in the iron grasp of which they will … remain to the end of time."[33]

Foote's withering assessment of Mexico and its people clearly reflects the influence of the Black Legend. The same hated traits pinned to Spaniards in earlier centuries reappear in his prose, for instance, his identification of Mexicans as "miscreants who imagined the highest glory of man to consist in his capability of successfully accomplishing exploits of violence and knavery."[34] Additionally, Foote recycled the notion that Spaniards were intentionally and fiercely ignorant. He claimed that Spanish policies "shut up the colonial settlements as to all information of any kind" and "brought about a complete stagnation of mind in the colonies."[35] Compare these assertions to naturalist Francis Willughby's contention two centuries earlier that "in all kind of good learning the Spaniards are behind the rest of Europe."[36] Foote reasserts the Black Legend's accusation of willful ignorance among the Spanish when he presses the same charge against Mexicans.

---

[32] Henry Stuart Foote, *Texas and the Texans: Or, Advance of the Anglo-Americans to the Southwest*, 2 vols., vol. 1 (Philadelphia: Thomas, Cowperthwait & Co., 1841), 83.

[33] Ibid., 85.

[34] Ibid., 84.

[35] Ibid., 86.

Foote found another topic in which to rehash Black Legend stereotypes and prove the superiority of the English: the legal systems of Mexico and the United States. Identifying colonial law as the key that determined the relative freedom or tyranny of the independent nations of North America, he declared, "had the early Spanish settlers brought with them to Mexico a system of Jurisprudence similar ... to that which is known as the common law of England ... they might possibly have realized something like a plan of free government."[37] The Spanish code of law was so bad, in fact, that "instead of a judicious and matured system of Juridical polity, the population of Mexico, since the commencement of Spanish rule, have been destitute of any code of laws whatever having a regular and uniform operation."[38] In this analysis, Foote drives home the point that Mexico was cursed by its own history to be inferior to the United States.

His denigration of Spanish policies reveal his motivation for writing his book. Not just a record of a trip to Texas, *Texas and the Texans* was meant to convince Americans of the need to annex Texas. The secondary title, *Advance of the Anglo-Americans to the Southwest* indicates Foote's hopes: that the region

---

[36] Francis Willughby, "Relation of a Voyage Made through a Great Part of Spain," in *The Black Legend: Anti-Spanish Attitudes in the Old World and the New*, ed. Charles Gibson(New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1971), 407.

[37] Foote, *Texas and the Texans*, 87.

[38] Ibid., 88.

(defined as the Southwest in relation to the United States) should be controlled by descendants of a superior English stock rather than a corrupted and hopeless Spanish forebear. His disparagement of the Spanish past made it clear that Spain left nothing of value to her Mexican descendants and the only redemption for Texas and the Southwest lay in the blessedhands of Anglo-American Southerners.

Foote's application of Black Legend stereotypes, while harsh, was hardly atypical of the Anglo prejudice expressed towards Mexicans in Texas. This hatred flowed in large part from the continuing violence between Texas and Mexico after the Texas Revolt in 1835-1836. Thomas Green, a Revolt veteran who would become a brigadier general for the Confederacy during the Civil War, expressed this animosity in his memoir of the Mier Expedition into northern Mexico in 1842. He assured his readers that one of his compatriots "had killed his score of Mexicans with less compunction of conscience than if they had been so many vipers"[39] and that he "can maintain a better stomach at the killing of a Mexican than at the killing of [a louse]."[40] Just as war created odium between the English and Spanish in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries, it also provoked the acrimony of Texans toward Mexicans in the nineteenth century.[41]

---

[39] Thomas J. Green, *Journal of the Texian Expedition against Mier* (Austin: The Steck Company, 1935), 265.

[40] Ibid., 269.

[41] There is substantial scholarship on the history of anti-Mexican sentiment in Texas. The classic work in the field is Arnoldo de León, *They Called Them Greasers: Anglo Attitudes toward Mexicans in Texas, 1821-1900* (Austin: University of Texas Press, 1983). See also, David Montejano, *Anglos and Mexicans in the Making of Texas, 1836-1986* (Austin: University of Texas Press, 1987)., especially chaps. 8-10, Julian Samora, Joe Bernal, and Albert Peña, *Gunpowder Justice: A Reassessment of the Texas Rangers* (Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame Press, 1979); William D Carrigan and Clive

The singularity of Texan hatred of Mexicans in the 1840s is especially evident when it is contrasted to American travelers' assessments of Californian Mexicans a decade later. While visitors to Texas saw Mexicans as barbarous, violent, and worthy of extermination, those who went to California generally described Mexicans as generous and carefree. Dana Walter Colton, an American Protestant minister who came to California in the mid-nineteenth century, viewed Californian Mexicans through the lens of romantic primitivism: "their habits are simple; their wants few; nature rolls almost every thing spontaneously into their lap." He elaborated on the work necessary to live in the land of plenty: "the slight labor required is more a diversion than a toil; and even this is shared by the Indian."[42] Unlike most writers who saw Californian Mexicans as lay-abouts without enough initiative to make good use of a fertile land, Colton emphasized their happiness and lack of avarice. To the Californians, money was only as good as the contentment it could provide and, apparently, they had found contentment enough in their Edenic homeland. This "genuine gladness of the heart" made the Californians hospitable, caring, and generous. Colton declared to his readers, "If I must be cast in sickness or destitution on the care of a stranger, let it be in California; but let it be before American avarice has hardened the heart and made a god of gold."[43]

Webb, "The Lynching of Persons of Mexican Origin or Descent in the United States, 1848 to 1928," *Journal of Social History* 37, no. 2 (2003); Benjamin H. Johnson, *Revolution in Texas : How a Forgotten Rebellion and Its Bloody Suppression Turned Mexicans into Americans* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2003).

[42] Walter Colton, *Three Years in California* (New York: Barnes, 1854), 222-23.

[43] Ibid., 223.

Colton's view of Mexican Californians demonstrates a divergence from the venom hurled at Mexicans in Texas. It also shows the influence of romantic literary tropes on the construction of a narrative about the pre-American past. In Colton's work, Mexicans were a part of a pastoral landscape that replenished the soul and promised wealth and splendor. By the late-nineteenth century, many authors cast California as a land of leisure and contentment destined to fall to an industrial juggernaut.[44]

The trader, naturalist and documentarian of nineteenth-century New Mexico Josiah Gregg represents a middle ground, both geographically and tempermentally, between Foote's scathing condemnation of Tejanos and Green's florid romanticization of the Californios. In describing a memorial filed by Juan de Oñate regarding his governorship of the early Spanish colony in New Mexico, he states:

> In every part of this singular document there may be traced evidences of that sordid lust for gold and power, which so disgraced all the Spanish conquests in America; and that religious fanaticism—that crusading spirit, which martyrized so many thousands of the aborigines of the new world under Spanish authority.[45]

Echoing Las Casas, he charged that the Spaniards "robbed the Indians of their country and treasure, and made menial slaves of them...promulgated the gospel at the point of the bayonet, and administered baptism by force of arms."[46] Yet while painting the Spaniards as harsh conquerors, he dismisses the difficulty of their achievements and describes the natives as “quietly acquiescing in both the civil and religious authority of the invaders, the yoke [being] easily riveted upon them, as they had neither the intelligence nor spirit to resist, until goaded to desperation.”[47]

---

[44] See for example, Helen Hunt Jackson, *Ramona* (New York: Modern Library, 2005; repr., 1884).

[45] Gregg, *Commerce of the Prairies*, 60.

[46] Ibid., 60-61.

Gregg also condemned New Mexicans as particularly ignorant, echoing the charges levied by Foote, his contemporary. Of education in New Mexico Gregg concluded, “There is no part of the civilized globe, perhaps, where the Arts have been so much neglected and the progress of Science so successfully impeded as in New Mexico.”[48] According to Gregg, their benighted condition stemmed from difficult frontier conditions than from willful deprivation on the part of Spain. As he explains it, “From the earliest time down to the secession of the colonies, it was always the policy of the Spanish Government as well as of the papal hierarchy, to keep every avenue of knowledge closed against their subjects of the New World; lest the lights of civil and religious liberty should reach them from their neighbors of the north.”[49]

Gregg , however, was not entirely derisive towards Mexicanos. He found more praiseworthy qualities in New Mexicans than did most of his contemporaries. He acknowledged their hospitality and proffered examples of their intelligence and industry. He avoided the common stereotype of universal cowardice and martial ineptitude:

---

[47] Ibid., 61.

[48] Ibid., 104.

[49] Ibid.

> the yeomanry of the country, inured as they are from their peculiar mode of life to every kind of fatigue and danger, possess a…moral courage. Their want of firmness in the field is partially the result of their want of confidence in their commanders; while the inefficacy and worthlessness of their weapons are alone sufficient to inspire a valiant heart with dismal forebodings.[50]

In these respects, Gregg proved to be an astute ethnographer looking beyond received prejudice to understand how people prosecuted their lives in a foreign place.

While Gregg should be counted among the more sympathetic chroniclers of life on the Northern Mexican frontier, it is evident that the Black Legend colored his observations. He saw Mexico as the inheritor of Spain's worst qualities and firmly believed that the Mexican people could do no better than they had, cursed as they were by corrupt, lazy, ignorant forbears. While he valorized the fortitude and courage of New Mexicans as individuals, he thought they were imprisoned by a system that prevented them from living well in the land conquered by their ancestors. That American merchants like himself would soon dominate the region was a forgone conclusion of history in Gregg's view.

The argument that Mexicans could not properly manage the resources at their fingertips persisted in the post-bellum West. In 1857 a West Point graduate and surveyor named Sylvester Mowry purchased a mine southeast of Tucson near the Mexican border. He managed it profitably until his arrest in 1862 for selling lead to the Confederacy. Beginning in the late 1850s, he compiled a guide to the history and mineral wealth of Arizona and Sonora. He aimed to promote Arizona's economic potential and thus bolster his investments there. The work grew from a talk to 48-page pamphlet to a 251-page volume by 1864.

---

[50] Ibid., 144.

Writing after the cession of Arizona to the United States in 1848, he adopted a congenial view of the Spanish past. He admired the Spanish colonists of Arizona as excellent miners and administrators: "many are the causes of the decay of mining in Northern Mexico, and they all emanate more or less directly from the overthrow of the Spanish domination."[51] The problem with Mexico, in Mowry's view, was that it was not Spanish enough: "The first suicidal act of the Mexican government was the expulsion of the Spanish from the country."[52] Thus, even in the commercial purview of a mine owner, the Spanish past represented a lost ideal inadequately reflected in the Mexican present.

Mowry's report of a region new to most Americans is nearly always filtered through his perspective as a miner, even when he narrates the Spanish past. For example, he judges the Spanish colonists deficient in managing mining labor:

> The Indians at length, thoroughly aroused by the cruelties of the Spaniards, by whom they were deprived of their liberty, forced to labor in the silver mines with inadequate food, and barbarously treated, finally rose, joined with tribes who had never been subdued, and gradually drove out or massacred their oppressors. A superior civilization disappeared before their devastating career, and today there is a scarcely a trace of it left, except scarcely visible ruins, evidences everywhere of extensive and hastily-deserted mining operations, and the tradition of the country. The mission of

---

[51] Sylvester Mowry, *Arizona and Sonora: The Geography, History, and Resources of the Silver Region of North America* (New York: Harper & Brothers, 1866), 131.

[52] Ibid.

> San Xavier del Bac, and the old towns of Tucson and Tubac, are the most prominent of these remains.[53]

Although his assessment contains some of the Black Legend characterization of Spaniards as particularly cruel, Mowry did not play up the indigenous people of Arizona as noble savages suffering at the hand of cruel masters. He presents the Spaniards as managers who pushed their workers too far. Clearly he does not believe the Spaniards had it coming and wishes that a more temperate hand may have spared retribution against “a superior civilization.” Notably, while assessing the Spanish as capitalists, he maintains a clear separation between “Spanish” and “Mexican.” The Spanish were hardy frontiersman and talented miners whom Mexicans foolishly shunned. Even in the economic calculations of an industrialist, “Spanish” mining represented a golden past while the “Mexican” present was an irredeemable cause doomed by self-defeating economic policies in need of proper (read American) management.

MEMORY AND RACE IN THE SOUTHWEST

The United States’ annexation of Texas as a state in 1845 along with the ensuing boundary dispute propelled it into war with Mexico in 1846. When that war ended two years later, the United States annexed a large portion of northern Mexico via the Treaty of Guadalupe Hidalgo and extended the territory with the Gadsden Purchase of 1854. The changes in borders and political relationships between the two nations contributed to a shift in the way Americans thought about Mexico and the Spanish past. The adversarial stance taken by Foote gave way to a more inquisitive approach. This is not to say that unflattering stereotypes disappeared. Rather, the Anglo descriptions of the Southwest focused less on justifying an imminent confrontation and more on incorporating newly annexed territory and the people therein. These observations were made from a racially conscious perspective that created an essential division between the categories of "Spanish" and "Mexican."

---

[53] Ibid., 20.

This territorial expansion brought a need for the United States to establish a clear boundary, pushing soldiers and surveyors into a land largely unknown to them. It also generated more curiosity about the people and towns of the new territory. Some soldiers and surveyors who traveled through the region wrote accounts of their journeys. These found wide audiences as books and as serialized publications. One of these stories came from an article about San Antonio that appeared in *Graham's Magazine*, a Philadelphia-based periodical in 1851. The author, an unnamed army officer, provides another Anglo American view of former Spanish holdings. His perspective, demonstrating a shift from earlier writings, correlates with a change in political relations between Mexico and the United States. With Mexico defeated and the cession of Mexico's North negotiated, the officer focused on racially categorizing the people whom he met and identifying a social hierarchy in the new order.

The anonymous soldier identified three distinct classes of people in San Antonio. He described the lowest class as "the connecting link between the savages and the Mexicans." They were "rude, uncultivated, fearless" herders and hunters of a “hardy, brigand, sun-burnt appearance.”[54] The second class was “a link between the Mexican and the Spaniard or Castilian.” Members of this class were “somewhat more civilized, more superstitious, owing to the influence of the priest, and yet possessed of less bravery, less generosity, and far less energy than the former.”[55] This was a vagabond class with little visible means of income that somehow managed to thrive. Their isolation on the frontier made them lethargic and incurious: “they have no enterprise or public zeal, no curiosity, but little patriotism—know nothing of government and laws, and seem incapable of feeling themselves, or appreciating in others, those lofty aspirations which fire the brain, warm the heart, nerve the arm, and burn the bosom of a free man.”[56] He avowed that they should not be trusted because “they are yet treacherous and deceptive, and can no more stand the frank honest gaze of a real white man, than a fox can the eye of a lion.”[57]

Both of these lower classes reflected shades of the Black Legend stereotypes: indolence, superstition, and ignorance. While the first group, most closely identified with “savages” is strong and hardy, the second appears as a classic Black Legend Spaniard, feckless, cunning and base. It is striking, however, that he is not referring to Spaniards here. The second group is only half-Spanish. According to this soldier, “Spaniards” made up the highest class of citizens of San

---

[54] Anonymous, "Scenes in Texas," *Graham's Magazine*1851, 38.

[55] Ibid.

[56] Ibid.

[57] Ibid.

Antonio. That group was "composed of the direct lineal descendants of Spanish dons and Castilian nobles, who, though stript of the titles and prerogatives which they enjoyed under a royal government; yet retain their dignity, their royalty, and their fortunes, and keeping aloof from the two degenerate and subordinate classes already described, are content to live in ease and aristocratic retirement."[58] This class was generally wealthier and, in the officer's eyes, more refined. They were educated in Mexico City or the United States, and had seen some of the world.

This unnamed officer's account of society in San Antonio reveals the ways that the mid-nineteenth-century view of the Spanish past differed from that of a century before. To his eyes, the Spanish were not an enemy, and why would they be? Spain was no longer the rich empire of Cromwell's time. By the 1850s, in addition to ceding Florida and granting independence to Mexico, Spain had lost control of Central America, Venezuela, Colombia, Argentina, Chile, and Peru. It was no longer a power of consequence in the Western Hemisphere. Furthermore, the United States had not experienced any fiery wars of religion with Spain so, the Americans did not develop the bloody hatred that the sixteenth century Dutch, for example, exercised.

Although nineteenth century Anglo Americans, as represented by the anonymous visitor to San Antonio, did not feel the same venom toward Spain as did their British forebears, they did repeat the damning charges of the Black Legend against the people of the former Mexican North. The content of these stereotypes remained the same while their target changed. The Black Legend no longer applied to Spaniards. Now it was used against Mexicans.

---

[58] Ibid.

The Black Legend performed a social and cultural function for those agents who employed it against the Spanish in the colonial era. It justified a status quo of enmity and belligerence, and it provided an antithesis to desired values. It served the same purpose in nineteenth-century America's relationship with Mexico and Mexicans. The Black Legend justified the status quo of American expansion and Mexican subjugation. It also provided a contrast for the values of industry, ingenuity, courage, honesty, sexual restraint, and self-sufficiency. In the nineteenth-century Anglo Americans transferred the odium of the Black Legend from Spaniards to Mexicans because promoting enmity with Mexicans served useful political and social ends that doing so with Spaniards no longer did.

The Black Legend as applied to Mexicans in the nineteenth century took on another aspect that demonstrates its use as a foil for the values of the time. In addition to their laziness, cowardice, dirtiness, and belligerence, Mexicans were derided for being a mixed race. In his assessment of social hierarchy in San Antonio, the unnamed army officer based his classifications on racial identification. The basic elements of his classification were essentialized races: the savage, the Mexican, and the Spaniard. These categories reflect nineteenth-century beliefs about race.[59] He employs a familiar spectrum of supposedly immutable racial groups that run from savage Indian to civilized European. In the middle of this hierarchy sits the Mexican.

---

[59] For a discussion of the racial beliefs of the nineteenth century see Reginald Horsman, *Race and Manifest Destiny: The Origins of American Racial Anglo-Saxonism* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1981), 43-56.

The location of Mexican people in the racial hierarchy of nineteenth-century America was not immediately apparent in the 1850s. The logic of race at the time identified three distinct racial categories: Whites, Blacks, and Indians. Many politicians and writers of the day wondered publicly where Mexicans fit in this scheme. Did their evident Indian ancestry mark them as racially Indian, or did their customs, color and inferior culture place them closer to Blacks?[60] In either case, most Americans, and certainly those in Texas, agreed that "whiteness meant not only not black, but also not Mexican."[61] This attitude is evident in the writing of the anonymous soldier in San Antonio who distinguished Spaniards from Mexicans but does not identify what separates them. Presumably, he assumed that his readers would know what he meant by "Mexican" and "Spanish." The racial identification of these two types of people as non-white and white respectively was key to separating them categorically and differentially valuing those categories even when applied to non-racialized categories such as music and architecture.

The author of "Scenes in Texas" relied on ideas of racial purity from his time to justify the social hierarchy of San Antonio. Note that both of the lower classes in his scheme are mixed race peoples. The lowest is "the connecting link between the savages and the Mexicans" while the second is a "link between the

---

[60] Ibid., 215.

[61] Neil Foley, *The White Scourge: Mexicans, Blacks, and Poor Whites in Texas Cotton Culture* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1997), 5.

Mexicans and the Spaniards." Only the highest class is of a pure lineage, a direct descendent of Castilian nobility. As historian and cultural critic Laura Gomez has pointed out, "Mexicans' status as a racially mixed group both made it possible for some Mexicans to occupy an 'off-white' position and for the group overall to be classified as an inferior 'mongrel' race."[62] We can see this effect evident in the writing of the unnamed soldier in Texas. He delineates racial categories by cutting through Mexican society, pulling the upper classes towards whiteness and using mixed ancestry to justify inferior racial status for the lower classes. Mexicans' indefinite status allowed for this push and pull into the spaces in between defined racial categories.

The anonymous soldier did not stand alone in his racialized description of Mexicanos in Texas. A contemporary, John Russell Bartlett, commissioner of the U.S.-Mexico boundary survey, drew much the same conclusions about the population along the Texas/Mexico border:

> There are a few respectable old families at El Paso, who possess much intelligence, as well as that elegance and dignity of manner which characterized their ancestors. ... A vast gulf intervenes between these Castilians and the masses, who are a mixed breed, possessing none of the virtues of their European ancestors, but all their vices, with those of the aborigines superadded. The Indian physiognomy is indelibly stamped upon them; and it required little sagacity to discriminate between the pure and the mixed race.[63]

---

[62] Laura E. Gómez, *Manifest Destinies: The Making of the Mexican American Race* (New York: New York University Press, 2007), 59.

[63] John Russell Bartlett, *Personal Narrative of Explorations and Incidents in Texas, New Mexico, California, Sonora and Chihuahua*, 2 vols., vol. 1 (New York: Appleton, 1854), 191.

Racial mixture between Europeans and Indians produced offspring that inherited the worst of both groups. In Bartlett's tenor, this meant that lower class Mexicanos lived beyond the bounds of respectability. Respect could be accrued to "old families," stemming both from a genetic inheritance (carried within a family) and age. Spaniards gained respect in this racial scheme for being on top of the ancient racial order.

Gregg also castigated Mexicans for their mixed heritage, but approached the insult from a different angle. Rather than pointing out that they had failed to live up to the sophistication of the Spaniards at the top of society, he showed that they fared poorly in comparison to New Mexico's native population. He lauded the Pueblos of New Mexico as "a remarkably sober and industrious race, conspicuous for morality and honesty, and very little given to quarrelling or dissipation, except when they have had much familiar intercourse with the Hispano-Mexicano population."[64] Thus, it was exposure to Mexicans that corrupted the otherwise pure Pueblos. Mexicanos were a contagion to avoid.

CONCLUSION

As noted above, stereotypes depend on categorization. The Black Legend relied on distinctly separate categories of English and Spanish. In the nineteenth-century United States the necessary division cut between American and Mexican, or to consider things racially, white and non-white. Historically, the Mexican nation succeeded the Spanish empire in the region now covered by the American

---

[64] Gregg, *Commerce of the Prairies*, 143.

Southwest. By culture, language, and religion, though not by national government, Mexico in the early nineteenth century was just as Spanish as it had been before independence. Certainly, independence and citizenship meant a great deal for the people of Mexico and for the nation's history, but the character of the Mexican people did not change at the moment they became citizens rather than subjects. To declare that a Spaniard is of a certain character and a Mexican is of a different type makes no sense when those types could have been the same individual. There is no clear demarcation in the Mexican North/American Southwest between the Spanish and the Mexican eras. Everything and everyone that has been a part of Spanish or Mexican history in the region sits along a finely graduated spectrum.[65]

The shifting ground of social categorization and the stereotypes associated with those categories allowed the elements of the Black Legend to be reformulated and applied in a new context. The story of the villainous Spaniard embraced by the English and early American colonists evolved into the story of the gallant Spaniard told in Florida and the Southwest. This symbolic transformation coincided with the fall of Spanish empire and the concomitant rise of U.S. imperialism and manifest destiny. As literary critic Maria de Guzmán explains, "Anglo-American works have Orientalized, racialized, and primitivized Spain, not in some historically 'objective' fashion but as a vanquished imperialist over and around whose abjected body the Anglo-American empire might be erected."[66] No longer the enemy to the United States, Spain became a symbol of lost glory. Imagining the Spanish past as an era of leisure and beauty implied that U.S. expansionism could revive that picturesque era.

---

[65] Some historians have tried to emphasize this connection and get around the categorical binary by referring to the Spanish-speaking people of the Mexican North and American Southwest as Spanish-Mexican. See, for example, Deena J. González, *Refusing the Favor: The Spanish-Mexican Women of Santa Fe, 1820-1880* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1999).

While the symbol of the fallen empire proved a useful foundation for building U.S. identity, the construction site was not without encumbrances. The Spanish past was much more complicated than any symbol could convey. The existing built environment, history, and the people of the American Southwest left the Anglo travelers, who viewed the region in the nineteenth century, ambivalent. The region had elements of Spanish history (the missions, the Christianized natives, the domination of a European language and culture) that they admired, juxtaposed with other elements of that same history (corruption, slow economic development, war-time enemies, mixed-race people) that they despised. The culture of colonialism and the racial logic of the era did not support such a complicated and sometimes paradoxical outcome. Stories that presented a romantic Spanish past and a corrupted Mexican present took hold and began to echo one another until they were widely adopted. In practice, this often meant that old buildings and institutions became identified with the Spanish past, while living people and their daily and ritual practices became Mexican.

Modern memory of the Spanish past was forged in this categorical binary. A good example of the past identified as Spanish and separated categorically from the present can be found in descriptions of colonial-era missions by nineteenth-century Americans. With the upheaval of Mexican Independence and its anti-clerical overtones, most of the Spanish-era missions had been abandoned by the orders who tended to them and had been partially dismantled and repurposed by locals. By the time the United States annexed the region the unused and unmaintained missions lay in varying states of ruin, providing a Rorschach test of viewers' perceptions of the Spanish past. A traveler visiting San Antonio in 1881 lauded the missions' builders as "brave Franciscan monks ... who entered an unknown wilderness, peopled with savage tribes and wild animals. ... They raised lofty temples in praise of religion, and brought bowing to their altars the heathen tribes surrounding them." While romanticizing the founders of the missions, visitors eulogized their present decay, "abandoned to the wilderness from which they sprang."[67]

---

[66] María DeGuzmán, *Spain's Long Shadow: The Black Legend, Off-Whiteness, and Anglo-American Empire* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2005), xxv.

When Anglo-Americans visited these buildings in the nineteenth century they saw them as romantic echoes of Granada. "These old missions still lift their belfried towers above the encroaching chaparral, and present examples of ancient ecclesiastical architecture unexcelled for beauty of design and exquisite detail of workmanship within the borders of the United States," said one turn of the century traveler.[68] While rhapsodizing about the Moorish ornamentation, they often complained about the dirty Mexicans whose family and livestock occupied those once-grand but now-fallen buildings. Of the Mexicano family who looked after Mission Concepción in 1890, a guidebook warned readers that they could offer no stories of the history of the building because “to them the past of the Mission is as a sealed book and it has no romance for them.”[69] Rather than establishing a connection between the missionaries, colonists and Indian neophytes who built the missions and the Mexican people who occupied the buildings in their own time, these visitors saw Mexicans as interlopers in the Spanish past. The categorical separation of Spanish past from the Mexican present excluded Mexicans from their own history. The past is “a sealed book” that they are unable to appreciate. The American tourist, on the other hand, can value the romance of the Spanish past and is therefore entitled to succeed the Spaniards as imperial sovereigns in the region.

---

[67] George P. Goff, *San Antonio and Environs* (Lancaster, PA: Inquirer Printing and Publishing Company, 1881), 65.

[68] Kirk Munroe, "San Antonio De Bexar," *Harper's Weekly*, September 25 1897, 957.

The visions of the Spanish past expressed by the Americans who came to the Southwest after its annexation and before the full incorporation brought on by the railroad establish a pattern for describing the region that persisted over time. These travelers built a memory of the past anchored in the colonial era and divided from the present. *Spanish* came to be more than a reference to a language or a national origin. It encompassed an ideology embedded in memory. The missions of the Southwest were Spanish because they were undertaken by Spanish-speaking missionaries who worked under the sponsorship of Spain’s crown or empire in the New World, but nineteenth-century Anglos made them Spanish by imbuing them with an air of romance and exoticism that extended to other buildings, people and institutions.

---

[69] William Corner, *San Antonio De Bexar: A Guide and History* (San Antonio: Bainbridge and Corner, 1890), 15.

The memory of the Spanish past that buttressed a new version of the Black Legend served several purposes. It explained the status quo and provided a contrast for nineteenth-century American values. It also presented a story of a land that was once beautiful and glorious. It was settled and civilized by white Europeans, but it had fallen at the hands of the Mexicans cursed by their mongrel blood. This story readily justified American expansion and the shameful outcome of the U.S.-Mexico war. It was a reassuring tale. Commandeering this land was no crime this land if the people who nominally possessed it were just letting its resources and wealth go to waste. Better to take possession of the once beautiful missions than to let Mexicans use them as they pleased. They could not appreciate their grandeur anyway.

CHAPTER 2: SPACE AND THE SPANISH PAST

American stereotypes of Mexicans grew from a history of prejudice and propaganda stretching back two centuries. This antecedent thought influenced anti-Mexican sentiment in the nineteenth century and is central to the story of memory of the Spanish past. That memory was also encountered and expressed physically in the urban space of the American Southwest. While the stereotypes of Spaniards and Mexicans detailed in the previous chapter existed in the published thoughts of American commentators, those ideas were expressed physically in the growth and development of the cities in the Southwest following the railroad boom of the late-nineteenth century. Memory is an internal phenomenon made external through creative expression. In order to study memory in the past, historians look to writing, drama, visual art, and folklore to find internal ideas manifested externally and documented. Buildings, streets, parks, and other manipulations of the landscape are also documents that show how people made memory manifest. Memory guides architects, planners, and lay builders as to the placement, scale, and style of forms on multiple levels from the city block to the mantelpiece. Culture and precedent both constrain options and influence choices in the construction of the built environment.

The last decades of the nineteenth century constitute a unique period in the history of the urban Southwest. In those years tens of thousands of Americans came to build in the cities of the former Mexican North. Distinctive forms, influenced by different threads of memory, met, clashed, and intermingled in the same space. This reorganization of the built environment invited comparison of the Spanish and Mexican styles of organizing space with the American style. Inevitably, the classification of space and architecture as Spanish or Mexican brought in the prejudices and assumptions associated with those categories.

The populations of Tucson, Albuquerque, and San Antonio exploded in the late-nineteenth century after the arrival of the railroad. Two building styles and spatial logics coexisted in these spaces. Anglo immigrants built in the style familiar to them, using construction materials borne on the railroad. These buildings went up beside and atop Spanish buildings laid out according to colonial planning principles, and expanded and maintained through the Mexican era. This juxtaposition transformed the urban Southwest in two key ways. First, the centers of these cities shifted from plazas established by colonial founders to new commercial zones built around the railroad. This pattern created modern, American urban spaces that stood out from the Spanish/Mexican forms already present in the cities. This led to the second transformation: the booming population of new comers divided the buildings and spaces of the cities based on racial and temporal binaries (i.e. ancient/Spanish and modern/American). This structure echoed the categories carved out by Spanish fantasy heritage, but expanded on them with associations to space and historic eras. Furthermore, this categorization gave rise to a narrative of southwestern cities as places where two eras existed simultaneously in the same space. Although the idealized Spanish past and progressive American present coexisted in this schema, they did so in conflict with each other. This opposition set the stage for romanticization of an embattled Spanish past while relegating Mexicano people to historical limbo, not fitting correctly in either the ancient or modern spaces.

An assessment of how late-nineteenth-century citizens memorialized the Spanish past in their urban environments must begin with the way that Spanish subjects designed their urban spaces. Tucson, Albuquerque, and San Antonio began as Spanish settlements and still reflect colonial planning principles today. The space and structures made by colonial settlers in these places also provided the raw materials for memorialization by future residents. These materials served as the backdrop against which the romantic ideal of the Spanish past could be staged. Indeed, there could be no Spanish or Mission revival architecture had the original not presented a model to emulate.

THE COLONIAL ORIGINS OF ALBUQUERQUE, SAN ANTONIO AND TUCSON

The Spanish colonists who settled on the northern frontier of New Spain laid out their towns according to the design principles set forth by the 1573 Laws of the Indies. This collection of 148 laws regulated many facets of life in the colonies including relations with natives and governmental and fiduciary structures. They also dictated the location and layout of presidios, missions, and pueblos in the Spanish colonies. Several of them specifically addressed how space in the settlement should be laid out. They decreed that colonial settlements begin with a plaza at the center and that ample room be left around the plaza so that it would remain the central space as the town grew. The main church and buildings for the royal council and cabildo would sit adjacent to the plaza. The document declared that eight streets of the town should radiate from the corners of the plaza and one should emanate from each side. These twelve principal streets would ensure that all citizens could easily travel to the plaza no matter where they lived. These laws intended the plaza to become a center of celebration and commerce, specifically spelling out the need for enough space to parade horses in a fiesta and covered portals under which merchants could set up their shops.[1]

The Laws of the Indies provided practical guidance for constructing settlements that functioned well and kept their residents healthy and safe. For instance, the document required tanneries and slaughterhouses to be located away and downwind of the towns' centers. In addition to such practical concerns, the Laws of the Indies also served a very important cultural function. It transmitted Spanish identity across time and over great distances. By prescribing a standard layout to settlements across Spain's empire, the laws created a standard, easily replicated Spanish space. Residents of and visitors to the colonial settlements constructed in accordance with the Laws of the Indies recognized that they existed in a space controlled by the Spanish empire. In this way, the Laws of the Indies bound space and Spanish identity together. The urban space and its reproduction across the Americas from Lima to Santa Fe impressed residents with a connection to the Spanish empire.

Spanish colonists established their first settlement on the northern frontier in New Mexico in 1598 only to be expelled by the Pueblo Revolt of 1680. After the return of colonists in 1692 Spanish administrators encouraged resettlement by issuing land grants, both private and communal, to soldiers and settlers. Over the next decades, five grants were made along the Rio Grande within what is today Albuquerque.[2] The grants encompassed irrigated lands near the river and upland pastures for grazing. The desire to raise food on and take resources from a broad swath of land combined with a lower threat from raiding Indians caused the settlers of the area to spread out over nearly thirty miles along the Rio Grande between Sandia Pueblo and Isleta Pueblo. The numerous land grants and sprawling settlement pattern distinguished space in colonial Albuquerque from that in Tucson and San Antonio. The modern city of Albuquerque grew from more than a dozen colonial villages, a fact that is obscured by the city's commandeering of one village's name.

---

[1] Dora P. Crouch, Daniel J. Garr, and Axel I. Mundigo, *Spanish City Planning in North America* (Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 1982), 13-19; Gilberto Rafael Cruz, *Let There Be Towns: Spanish Municipal Origins in the American Southwest, 1610-1810* (College Station: Texas A&M University Press, 1988).

Atrisco was the first land grant established in the valley after reconquest. In 1692, Diego De Vargas, captain of the mission to reconquer New Mexico, bestowed a tract on the west side of the river to Fernando Durán y Cháves in recognition of his service and his family's pre-Revolt claim to the area. Durán y Cháves took formal possession of the grant in 1703.[3] Over the next century, settlers founded several small villages on the grant in addition to the main Atrisco plaza. Primary among these was Ranchos de Atrisco which came to be known as Armijo after a prosperous Zacatecas family that settled there in the early eighteenth century.[4]

---

[2] The five grants are, north to south: Alameda, Elena Gallegos, Villa de Alburquerque, Atrisco, and Pajarito.

[3] Joseph Metzgar, "The Atrisco Land Grant; 1692-1977," *New Mexico Historical Review* 52, no. 4 (1977): 270.

[4] John B. Colligan, *The Juan Paéz Hurtado Expedition of 1695: Fraud in Recruiting Colonists for New Mexico* (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1995), 40.

In 1694, the Spanish government conferred another grant in the Rio Grande Valley to Diego Montoya as a prize for his aid in the reconquest. The original grant papers were lost, so Montoya asked to have the grant affirmed again in 1712. Montoya's grant abutted others made to the village of Alameda and Sandia Pueblo on its north side and the villa of Alburquerque on the south. His land encompassed 70,000 acres including river bottomlands and *ejidos* (commons) on the east mesa and Sandia foothills. [5] Montoya's son transferred the grant to Elena Gallegos de Gurulé around 1716 and the grant became known as the Elena Gallegos Grant.[6] Her descendants remained on the grant for generations. Nearly all the Gurulés in the valley lived on the Elena Gallegos grant through the nineteenth century.[7] As was true of most other families in the valley, the Gurulés' identity was tied to a land grant. Settlers established several villages on the grant, most of them named after prominent families including Los Gallegos, Los Griegos, Los Candelarias, and Los Poblanos (named after the

---

[5] Ranchos de Albuquerque Grant, *Records of the Court of Private Land Claims* (CPLC) Spanish Archives of New Mexico (SANM) I , Microfilm Roll 38, case 51.

[6] Elena Gallegos was married to Santiago Gurulé who died some time before 1716. Gallegos retook her maiden name after her husband's death, as was customary for eighteenth-century Spanish women.

[7] 1790 Spanish Census in Virginia Langham Olmsted, comp., *New Mexico Spanish & Mexican Colonial Censuses 1790, 1823, 1845* (Albuquerque: New Mexico Genealogical Society, 1975), 12-14; 1802 Census in Virginia Langham Olmsted, comp., *Spanish and Mexican Censuses of New Mexico 1750-1835* (Albuquerque: New Mexico Genealogical Society, 1981), 128.

Ortega family from Puebla, Mexico). Largest among these was Los Ranchos de Alburquerque.[8]

In April of 1706, the governor of New Mexico, Francisco Cuervo y Valdés, founded Alburquerque across the Rio Grande from Atrisco.[9] The governor declared Alburquerque to be a *villa* (town), thus locating it in the Spanish administrative hierarchy. A villa was larger than a *pueblo* (village), but smaller than a *ciudad* (city). There were no ciudades in New Mexico, so villas were the largest settlements in the territory. By declaring Alburquerque to be a villa, Cuervo y Valdés hoped to make it a center of trade, government, religion, and territorial defense. Such importance was not allotted to new settlements arbitrarily. Spanish law required at least thirty families and a priest to found a villa.[10] This was a tall order on the sparsely populated frontier of eighteenth-century New Mexico. It appears that Cuervo y Valdés exaggerated the population of the new town in order to call it a villa. He also exaggerated progress made in the construction of the San Felipe church on Alburquerque's plaza.[11]

---

[8] The Elena Gallegos grant is sometimes referred to as the Los Ranchos de Alburquerque grant though Los Ranchos was a village within the larger individual grant belonging to Gallegos' descendents. The confusion in names stems from the practice of naming grants after the largest village within them rather than after the grantee, a convention that the Elena Gallegos grant breaks.

[9] Marc Simmons, *Albuquerque, a Narrative History* (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1982), 81-94.

[10] *The Albuquerque Town Grant, Its Character and History with a Map of the Grant and the City of Albuquerque* (Washington, D. C.: W.H. Moore, 1884), 3.

[11] Simmons, *Albuquerque*, 86-94.

In 1710, Francisco Montes Vigil petitioned the governor to create the Alameda grant north of Alburquerque on the west side of the river. It spanned the distance between the northern boundary of Alburquerque and the southern boundary of Sandia Pueblo, a distance of about four Spanish leagues. The river delineated its eastern border and the ridge dividing the watersheds of the Rio Grande and the Rio Puerco defined its west. Within a decade, settlers established villages on the grant at Alameda and Corrales.[12]

Sometime before 1746 the Spanish Crown conferred land south of Atrisco, known as Pajarito, to Josefa Baca. The original documents of the grant have been lost, so we do not know why Señora Baca was deserving of such a reward. The first record of the Pajarito grant is in Baca's will of 1746. Upon her death, she gave her son Captain Antonio Baca the grant stretching from Atrisco in the north to the village of Los Padillas in the south and from the Rio Grande to the Rio Puerco. In the 1750s, he conveyed it to Clemente Gutierrez, who had married his niece Apolonia Baca.[13]

While the sprawling settlement of the valley did not hew to the intentions of the Laws of the Indies, the Villa de Alburquerque followed the design principles established in the law. The most prominent church in the valley, San Felipe de Neri, sat at the west edge of the plaza, which was further encircled by homes.[14] Yet the villa was not the only settlement that adhered to the Laws of the

---

[12] Alameda Grant, *CPLC*, SANM I, Microfilm roll 34, case 11.

[13] Pajarito Grant, *CPLC*, SANM I, Microfilm roll 41, case 73.

[14] After the church collapsed in 1792, it was rebuilt on the north side of the plaza

Indies. Several other villages in the valley had their own plazas. Notable among these were Los Griegos and Los Candelarias to the north and Atrisco to the south. These spaces adapted the classic form prescribed by the Laws of the Indies, their plazas cordoned by a chapel and private residences, and applied that form on a smaller scale. As the law intended, these plazas served as gathering places where settlers could interact en masse for worship, socialization, and recreation. The settlers who lived in these spaces developed personal and communal identities rooted in the plazas. Thus, despite the fact that the Villa de Alburquerque was the commercial and religious center of the valley, the people who lived near the villa considered themselves from Atrisco or Alameda or any of the other villages strung along the river. [15]

Like Albuquerque, San Antonio is a city of multiple colonial origins. The Spanish presence in San Antonio began in 1691 when a group of Spanish soldiers and priests named a spot at the headwaters of a stream for Saint Anthony of Padua on whose saint's day they encountered it. Although the place had a Spanish name, San Antonio's location on the edge of a plain controlled by Indians forestalled colonial settlement for another twenty-seven years. In 1718, Martín de Alarcón, Governor of Tejas, led a small party of soldiers and colonists recruited at government expense to establish a presidio at San Antonio. Fray Antonio Olivares and a party responsible for creating a mission near the settlement arrived soon thereafter. Alarcón placed the mission on the west bank of the river, calling it San

---

[15] Brian Luna Lucero, "Old Towns Challenged by the Boom Town: The Villages of the Middle Rio Grande Valley and the Albuquerque Tricentennial," *New Mexico Historical Review* 82, no. 1 (2007).

Antonio de Valero. Four days later, at a site on San Pedro Creek three-quarters of a league from the river, he founded the Villa de Béxar.[16] Thus, San Antonio began with the complete triumverate of Spanish colonial power: military, church, and state located in the presidio, mission, and villa. Within three years, both the mission and the presidio were relocated further south where they have remained.[17] In 1722, the Spanish reinforced the presidio and founded a new mission, San José y San Miguel de Aguayo, south of San Antonio de Valero.[18]

In 1731, such changes came to the settlements of the San Antonio River valley that the year is recognized as a second founding. In that year the church relocated three missions, Nuestra Señora de la Purísima Concepción, San Juan Capistrano, and San Francisco de la Espada, from East Texas to the San Antonio River Valley. The shuttering of a presidio near them two years earlier had removed the protection and coercive force needed to control area Indians. Their relocation south of Mission San José brought them the support of the presidio at San Antonio and a new population of neophytes. All of these missions now sit within the metropolitan area of San Antonio. Another event that shaped the city's civic identity came in 1731 when fifty-six colonists, recruited at royal expense from the Canary Islands, founded the town of San Fernando de Béxar adjacent to the presidio.[19] By the mid-eighteenth century a presidio, a villa, and five missions stretched along the San Antonio River. These institutions, founded separately but profoundly interdependent, constituted the colonial roots of San Antonio.

---

[16] Jesús de la Teja, *San Antonio De Béxar: A Community on New Spain's Northern Frontier* (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1995), 8.

[17] Lewis F. Fisher, *Saving San Antonio: The Precarious Preservation of a Heritage* (Lubbock: Texas Tech University Press, 1996), 14-17.

[18] "Fundación del pueblo y misión de San José y de San Miguel de Aguayo" Spanish Collection, General Land Office, Austin, Texas, cited in de la Teja, *San Antonio De Béxar*, 9.

The planning principles of the Laws of the Indies also strongly influenced the construction of space in San Fernando de Béxar. The Plaza de las Islas, named for the Canary Islander colonists whose royal land grants formed San Fernando de Béxar, stood at the center of town between the cathedral and the Casa Real. It measured six hundred by four hundred Spanish feet, precisely the dimensions prescribed by the Laws of the Indies. Behind the cathedral sat the Plaza de Armas, a space laid out by soldier-settlers as the center of the presidio San Antonio de Béxar. The construction of space in both the town and the presidio made an impression on visitors. In 1874, a traveler remarked on the evident imprint that Spanish planning policies left on San Antonio: “San Antonio is the only town in the United States which has a thoroughly European aspect, and it is more, in its other quarters, like some remote and obscure town in Spain than like any of the bustling villages of France or Germany.”[20] The principles from the Laws of the Indies enacted in San Fernando and San Antonio successfully shaped the urban space of those settlements. Even a generation into the American period visitors recognized San Antonio as a fundamentally Spanish space.

---

[19] Ibid., 10-11.

[20] Edward King, "Glimpses of Texas--I: A Visit to San Antonio," *Scribner's Monthly: An Illustrated Magazine*, January 1874, 310.

Although colonial prescriptions guided the founding of separate settlements along the San Antonio River, they grew into one another over the eighteenth century. San Fernando de Béxar incorporated the presidio's lands by the 1770s. Once San Fernando and San Antonio merged, the town had two major plazas that Bejareños put to different purposes. The Plaza de las Islas, home to San Fernando Cathedral, served as a social center where the citizenry gathered for political rallies and religious festivities.[21] Plaza de Armas, originally a training ground and defensive redoubt for Spanish soldiers was transformed during the Mexican era. By the 1830s civilian residents occupied the buildings encircling the plaza, and it became an open-air meat and produce market.[22] These changes indicate that the Bejareños adapted to the growth of their city and national independence while maintaining a Spanish view of space. The plaza remained a vital commercial and social space at the center of urban life even as national allegiances changed.

Among the three cities considered here, identifying a single point of time to mark as the beginning of Spanish Tucson is most difficult. The year 1775 is an often-cited date.[23] In August of that year, Hugo O'Conor "selected and marked out" a new presidio at a place known as San Agustín de Tucson to, "effectively close the Apache frontier."[24] Despite the seeming clarity of this action as the beginning of Tucson, it was not the first, nor even the first Spanish, settlement in the area.

---

[21] Timothy M. Matovina, *Tejano Religion and Ethnicity: San Antonio, 1821-1860* (Austin: University of Texas Press, 1995), 21.

[22] Richard R. Flores, *Remembering the Alamo: Memory, Modernity, and the Master Symbol* (Austin: University of Texas Press, 2002), 40-41.

[23] Thomas Sheridan, *Los Tucsonenses: The Mexican Community in Tucson, 1854-1941* (Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1986), 9-10. Tucson boosters also used this date to justify a commemoration program to coincide with the United States' bicentennial

Well before the arrival of Spanish soldiers and missionaries the Santa Cruz River nourished the valley that made the area attractive to Pima settlers. The verdant valley and unbaptized souls attracted Jesuit missionaries, who set out to explore northern Sonora late in the seventeenth century. Jesuit priest Eusebio Kino probably passed the site on his way to the Gila River in 1694, but did not give the place a Spanish name until 1698, when he christened a settlement on the west side of the river between San Agustín de Oiaur and San Xavier del Bac as San Cosme de Tucsón.[25] A Spanish name did not bring European settlement to Tucson, however. Kino himself had little lasting impact on the settlement, and in ensuing decades, held at bay by the arid environment, raiding Apaches, and the Pima Revolt in 1751, missionaries made little headway in establishing a permanent outpost.[26]

The revolt and Spanish reaction to it shaped the future of Tucson as a settlement. In the eyes of the Spanish, Tucson had previously constituted little more than a *visita*, a site occasionally visited by priests stationed at a nearby mission. After the revolt, local Pimas resettled more densely at Tucson, forming a village that began to rival the mission at San Xavier del Bac in population. The revolt also propelled discussion between the Jesuits and governor of Sonora on the placement of a presidio at or near Tucson.[27] Any plans the Jesuits had to expand their presence in Tucson evaporated when a royal decree expelling the order from New Spain arrived in 1767.

---

[24] Kieran McCarty, *Desert Documentary: The Spanish Years, 1767-1821* (Tucson: Arizona Historical Society, 1976), 26.

[25] Henry F. Dobyns, *Spanish Colonial Tucson: A Demographic History* (Tucson: Unversity of Arizona Press, 1976), 4.

[26] Charles Leland Sonnichsen, *Tucson: The Life and Times of an American City* (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1987), 12-16.

In 1770 or 1771 Franciscan priest Francisco Garcés and Captain Juan Bautista de Anza, the commander of the presido at Tubac, directed soldiers and Pimas to erect an adobe wall around a communal building near the village. A year later, Garcés oversaw the erection of a chapel within the fortifications, creating the mission of San Agustín de Tucson.[28] This fortified settlement repelled Apache raiders and protected the Spanish and Pima settlers inside. O'Conor's presidio, situated across the river from the mission compound, made the valley into a permanent stronghold. For the next hundred years, soldiers and settlers from the presidio guarded Spanish and Pima inhabitants throughout the Santa Cruz valley.

In accordance with Tucson's function as a defensive fortification, an adobe wall three feet thick, twelve feet high, and three hundred yards long on each side enclosed the town. The houses and stables of the town sat flush against the wall, their doors open to the interior plaza. The town wall rose four or five feet above the roofs of the houses forming a parapet from which townspeople could fire on raiders.[29] An open space in the center of the town served the ceremonial and festive functions of a plaza while also providing a space to herd livestock during raids. The only major structure outside the town walls was the presidio, some three hundred yards away. It stretched 250 feet on each side with walls twelve feet high and two feet thick and two bastions at opposite corners.[30] The mission also grew in the eighteenth century. Sometime between 1797 and 1804, a massive two-story convento was erected at mission. The huge building dominated the mission compound until its abandonment when the Mexican government ordered the missions to secularize in 1828.[31]

---

[27] Dobyns, *Spanish Colonial Tucson*, 15-16.

[28] Sonnichsen, *Tucson*, 15.

[29] F. Adams, "Tucson in 1847: Reminiscences of Judge F. Adams--Description of the Fort, and So Forth," *Arizona Historical Review* 1(1929): 83.

Tucson did not hew as closely to the edicts in the Laws of the Indies as Albuquerque and San Antonio did. The town diverged from the colonial norm because it sat on a heavily raided frontier. Frequent Apache depredations kept settlers close to the presidio walls. Tucsonenses built few structures outside the walls and therefore did not a construct a plaza-centered town like those found elsewhere on the northern frontier. Nonetheless, a space inside of the presidio served the purposes of a plaza. Soldiers drilled there, vendors sold food and goods, and it sheltered settlers and livestock in times of peril.

While the prescriptions of the Laws of the Indies guided the layout of Spanish settlements on the northern frontier, local materials dictated the construction of the buildings within that plan. Even the churches and mission chapels that anchored the communities lacked ornamentation or imported materials because builders could not acquire those sorts of architectural embellishments at any price. Thus, the built environment in each settlement reflected the materials that could be procured locally and worked by hand. In Tucson and Albuquerque, that exigency meant buildings were nearly exclusively made of adobe. There simply was no other material suitable for widespread use near those settlements. Builders used limited timber to support window and door spans as well as earthen roofs. Stone, an equally restricted resource, went into foundations for adobe walls. Adobe served the environmental needs of Albuquerque and Tucson well. The thermal mass of the buildings evened out the temperature extremes of the high desert. Even the most expensive and labor intensive buildings such as the San Xavier del Bac mission and the San Felipe de Neri cathedral were constructed from ubiquitous adobe blocks. The material did have a drawback; making adobe blocks required many hands to extract clay, mix it with water and straw, press the mix into forms, remove the forms for drying and stack the bricks after they were dried. Built structures required significant maintenance to keep the adobe walls from eroding away. This labor requirement limited the size and permanence of adobe structures.

---

[30] Ibid.

[31] Sonnichsen, *Tucson*, 27.

The materials available around colonial San Antonio distinguished the built environment of that place from other settlements of equal size on the northern frontier. The most visible difference, especially in the larger, more expensive buildings, was the use of limestone. The settlement's situation on a limestone escarpment provided easily workable blocks for churches like San Fernando cathedral and the missions along the San Antonio River as well as for quotidian structures throughout the city. San Antonio's environment also provided light timber more abundantly than areas to the west. The laborers of the city used this material for the widespread construction of *jacales*, small buildings with walls made of upright posts buried in the ground and filled in with a mud plaster all covered with a thatch roof. The jacal and the adobe both went through phases of denigration and veneration following annexation. Initially viewed as cheap housing for poor people, these humble building styles later represented the exotic atmosphere of the Southwest.

SHIFT OF CITY CENTERS

Although the urban spaces in Tucson, Albuquerque, and San Antonio retained physical signs of their Spanish colonial origins after their annexation to the United States, they experienced extensive reorganization in the late-nineteenth century. The political and economic power of the United States wrought numerous changes in this period including a reshaping of urban space. Booming populations that arrived with the railroads shifted the centers of each city away from the plazas that Spanish planners had intended to be their cores. This physical transformation reinforced American domination of the region.

In the middle Rio Grande Valley surrounding Albuquerque, the transition from a string of Spanish-Mexican villages to an American city began with the arrival of the railroad in 1880. The Atchison, Topeka and Santa Fe Railway had been laying track westward from Topeka, Kansas, since 1868. After the company pressed into New Mexico via Raton Pass, engineers bypassed the settlements of the middle Rio Grande Valley and laid track on the sandy hills to the east. The technical and economic benefits of this route made it the railroad's preference. The route ran in an efficiently straight line that avoided the periodic flooding of the valley floor. This route also pleased the financiers of the railroad because it traveled through land that a local real-estate concern offered to sell at a low price in exchange for profits from development.[32]

While laying tracks to the east of the settled area of the valley, the AT&SF also built a depot and shops along the tracks south of the Villa de Alburquerque cutting through the fields of Barelas, a colonial village and river crossing. Even though the new depot sat two miles away from the Spanish plaza in the villa, the railroad company named the stop Albuquerque. Soon, existing residents and newcomers both called the railroad town built around the depot New Town and the Spanish villa Old Town. Though these two shared a name and were connected by a mule-drawn streetcar, they maintained a steady antipathy toward each other. In recentering the commercial and social space of the valley on New Albuquerque, the railroad sapped Old Albuquerque of its centrality in the economic and social life of the valley. The old plaza lost business and even its post office to the new town.[33]

The railroad also changed San Antonio's spatial organization. Before 1850 the Spanish plazas (Islas and Armas) sat physically and experientially at the center of town. The spaces they enclosed served as meeting places, market places and forums for political assembly. The arrival of the Galveston, Harrisburg and San Antonio line in 1877 shifted commercial and social interaction west to Alamo

---

[32] Simmons, *Albuquerque*, 218.

[33] Sheldon Holland Dike, *Territorial Post Offices of New Mexico* (Albuquerque: S.H. Dike, 1958), 4-6.

Plaza.[34] The relocation of the city's central plaza altered the experience of space for most residents of San Antonio and marked the transition of San Antonio from a Spanish-Mexican town to an American city. Alamo Plaza recentered urban life in San Antonio not only because it was closer to the railroad depot than the other plazas, but also because the merchants and institutions who occupied the storefronts encircling the plaza created a commercial district that drew San Antonio's growing population.

The San Antonio City Council radically transformed Alamo Plaza in 1889 when it ordered and funded the planting of a garden in the plaza's center.[35] This development marked Alamo Plaza as distinct from the Plaza de las Islas and the Plaza de Armas. As stipulated by the Laws of the Indies, these spaces were designed to be open, public and accessible. All citizens could meet, socialize, and transact business there. By landscaping Alamo Plaza, city elites created a space that felt and functioned like an American park rather than a Spanish plaza. Rather than supporting the congregation of citizens, the new landscaping guided traffic out of the plaza and into the privately owned shops and saloons around it.[36] This reorientation of urban space acknowledged that Alamo Plaza had become the center of American San Antonio. The city's other plazas were also transformed to reflect a new orientation of urban space. The most radical change came in the same year as the work in Alamo Plaza. The City Council directed the construction of a Beaux-Arts style City Hall in the open space of the presido's Plaza de Armas. This action destroyed the space as a plaza. Plaza de Islas had a park placed in it in 1892, though it remained a mostly-open space, likely because of its connection to San Fernando Cathedral at its west side.

---

[34] Flores, *Remembering the Alamo*, 51.

[35] Ibid., 52.

[36] Ibid., 57.

By the arrival of the twentieth century, public space in San Antonio had been completely reoriented. Visitors to the city recognized the Alamo as the center of San Antonio, seemingly unaware that it was part of the mission and historically separate from the town. For example, a journalist visiting the city in 1905 proclaimed that "historic Alamo Plaza" sat at the center of the city. The fact that he identified the space as "historic" suggests he and other visitors believed it to have always been the center of the city with no historical predecessor.[37] Visitors and recent immigrants took this understanding of urban space from the maps published at the time. Most maps clearly identified Alamo Plaza while indicating Plaza de las Islas or Plaza de las Armas in smaller type if they did so at all. Many published maps identified City Hall and the Bexar County Courthouse without indicating that they sat in Military and Main Plazas respectively.[38]

The reshaping of San Antonio's public spaces after the arrival of the railroad and the ensuing boom of immigration or emigration demonstrates the differing views of urban space held under the Spanish and Anglo systems. As indicated by the Laws of the Indies, the plaza existed as an intentionally constructed space under the Spanish system. It served as defensive redoubt, parade ground, and marketplace, indeed the nucleus of Spanish urban life. It was consciously planned to be open to serve these functions. The Anglo system had no corollary open space, so the plazas of the American Southwest appeared as empty spaces, voids to be filled.[39] In San Antonio, La Plaza de Armas seemed the perfect spot to erect a new city-hall building. Alamo Plaza, Plaza de las Islas and many other plazas in the Southwest became parks laid out in a typical turn-of-the-century American style.[40]

---

[37] Harry Alexander MacFadden, *Rambles in the Far West* (Holidaysburg, PA: Standard Printing House, 1906), 47.

[38] "Clarke's Official Map, City of San Antonio Texas," (1924) Briscoe Center for American History, University of Texas at Austin.

Tucson also changed orientation after its annexation to the United States, growing southward after the Gadsden Purchase. Apache raiding had diminished previous to this growth and the protection of the United States promised further security allowing Tucsonenses to settle farther from the presidio's walls.[41] Anglo displacement of Mexicanos from the prime commercial real estate at the city's center near the presidio drove this growth. Indeed, by 1862, Anglos owned twenty-one of the thirty-three residences within the presidio. They also controlled most of the real estate along Calle Real (Tucson's main thoroughfare) and Calle del Correo where the Butterfield stage stopped to deliver mail.[42] These changes in ownership reflect a growing concentration of Tucson's wealth in the hands of Anglo immigrants.

---

[39] For the form, meaning and politics of Spanish plazas in the Americas see Santa Arias and Mariselle Melendez, eds., *Mapping Colonial Spanish America: Places and Commonplaces of Identity, Culture, and Experience*(Lewisburg: Bucknell University Press, 2002); Daniel Arreola, ed. *Hispanic Spaces, Latino Places: Community and Cultural Diversity in Contemporary America*(Austin: University of Texas Press, 2004); Daniel D. Arreola, "Plaza Towns of South Texas," *Geographical Review* 82, no. 1 (1992); Daniel D. Arreola, "Urban Ethnic Landscape Identity," *Geographical Review* 85, no. 4 (1995); Setha Low, *On the Plaza: The Politics of Public Space and Culture* (Austin: University of Texas Press, 2000); Don Mitchell and Lynn A. Staeheli, "Turning Social Relations into Space: Property, Law and the Plaza of Santa Fe, New Mexico," *Landscape Research* 30, no. 3 (2005); Joseph L Scarpaci, *Plazas and Barrios: Heritage Tourism and Globalization in the Latin American Centro Histórico* (Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 2004); Chris Wilson and Stefanos Polyzoides, *The Plazas of New Mexico* (San Antonio: Trinity University Press, 2011).

[40] Nina Veregge, "Transformations of Spanish Urban Landscapes in the American Southwest, 1821-1900," *Journal of the Southwest* 35, no. 4 (1993): 396.

[41] Sheridan, *Los Tucsonenses*, 58.

The Mexicanos who settled south of the presidio chose to construct space in their new neighborhood in a familiar fashion. Although no longer beholden to the Laws of the Indies, these new settlers built their adobe homes in an unbroken line around a central plaza. The dwellings built up in the 1860s looked just like the fortified plazas that had protected eighteenth century Spaniards from Indian raids. The communal space, known as the Plaza de la Mesilla, shows that cultural assumptions shared by Mexicano builders directed the construction of space even when legal directives no longer applied.[43] The plaza even got its own church after private donors funded the construction of San Agustín in 1862. Soon, the Plaza de la Mesilla served social and economic functions similar to the plazas built by Spanish colonists. It was a gathering place for citizens that unified them as a community. The high point of this communal spirit came every August 28 with the fiesta of San Agustín, which began with a mass at the church and a procession around the plaza. The parade defined the communal space by tying private homes, the public plaza, and the church together while proclaiming the religious and cultural unity of Tucson's Mexicanos.[44]

---

[42] Ibid., 79.

[43] Abigail A. Van Slyck, "What the Bishop Learned: The Importance of Claiming Space at Tucson's Church Plaza," *Journal of Arizona History* 39(1998): 125.

The Plaza de la Mesilla became a site of contention when Tucson officially incorporated in 1872. Since the presidio's walls had confined settlement in Tucson until the nineteenth century, the Tucsonenses who lived on the plaza were newcomers to that land. Because their title did not derive from a Spanish or Mexican land grant, they could not prove ownership of land outside their home plots under the terms of the Gadsden Purchase. Upon Tucson's incorporation, all unimproved lands within the city limits became public property. The following year, the City Council auctioned off the right to control the plaza during the church's fiesta. The highest bidder won the right to regulate the booths selling food and liquor and providing sanctioned gambling. The council revealed its control of the space by exercising its regulatory powers to transform a community gathering into a marketable commodity.[45]

As Anglos rapidly dominated the newly incorporated city, Plaza de la Mesilla came to be known as Church Plaza. This change in name accompanied the City Council's continued efforts to reshape space in and around the plaza. Just like the city builders in San Antonio who erected a government building in the middle of Military Plaza, the councilors of Tucson saw the plaza not as a designed and constructed space but as an emptiness to be filled. This attitude became evident when they renamed Calle de Alegria as Congress Street and widened it. In order to do so, they took twenty-four feet from the back lots of the homes facing the plaza and added the same amount to the plaza-facing side of their lots. Although nominally a fair trade, extra square footage at the front door of the houses reduced the plaza's size and changed the relationship of the homes to the plaza. Rather than a familiar Spanish arrangement with the house built right up to the property line, the exchange transformed the lots to an American style with a front yard.[46] The Tucson city council thought it natural to take public property and transfer it to private homes. That they did not recognize this as compromising the communal nature of the plaza indicates their view of the plaza as empty space needing to be filled.[47]

---

[44] Ibid.: 127.

[45] Ibid.: 128.

Just as in Albuquerque, the railroad shifted Tucson's commercial center after its arrival in 1880. The engineers of the Southern Pacific Railroad (SP) chose to follow the natural contours of the Santa Cruz Valley, laying their tracks a half mile east of town. The SP station acted as a magnet drawing Anglo-controlled capital and building to the east and establishing itself as the new center of Tucson.[48] The newly widened Congress Street became a main thoroughfare to the depot. The homeowners on the north edge of the Plaza de la Mesilla reoriented their homes to face the new street leaving the plaza, as architectural historian Abigail Van Slyck described it, “a leftover place in the urban fabric where trash waited to be taken away.”[49]

---

[46] Ibid.: 128-29.

[47] The changes to the plaza reflected its marginalization. After the church was sold in 1898 it served as a hotel, base for bootleggers, and garage before being razed in 1936. After the church left, the plaza lost favor with respectable Tucsonans.

[48] Sheridan, *Los Tucsonenses*, 83.

The reorientation of urban space in all three cities increased the monetary and symbolic value of newly constructed buildings in the relocated city centers. New buildings indicated activity, production, and economic growth—in short, progress—under the new American order. Builders used milled lumber, machined trim work, and glass windows borne on the railroad to build these new centers in a distinctly American style. The built environment that remained from the Spanish era and from the even-more-recent Mexican construction suffered a loss of esteem and was of little value in the railroad boomtowns of the late-nineteenth century.

A CITY BOTH ANCIENT AND MODERN IN ASPECT

At the end of the nineteenth century, after the railroad boom had taken hold in San Antonio, observers of the city noted a duality in its urban space. In 1897, a reporter described San Antonio as “a city of the past, the present, and the future. A city of the frontier that presents crumbling relics of mediaeval architecture among its chief attractions. A city both ancient and modern in aspect, possessed of an atmosphere at once foreign and homelike.”[50] The unique built environment of San Antonio created this sense of different points in time existing in the same space. Because Anglo settlement occurred nearly on top of Spanish settlement, the late-nineteenth-century viewer discovered an urban space very much in transition. A generation later, another visitor reported that the city still felt like two different eras at once: "Ancient landmarks of bravery—indicative of the first settlements in 1718—are still standing in the midst of modernity and progress. Age old missions, and the traditions surrounding them, blend with the bustling of the metropolitan city to produce an atmosphere of tranquility and pleasure."[51]

---

[49] Van Slyck, "What the Bishop Learned," 134.

[50] Munroe, "San Antonio De Bexar," 957.

The trope of the southwestern city as a unique place where ancient and the modern commingled in the same space thrived elsewhere in the region. Boosters regularly promoted travel to the Southwest as a trip back in time that did not forsake the comforts of the modern world. Of Tucson, one promoter wrote:

> From the picture rocks or hieroglyphics of the Indian to the Latin of the Padres, the story is told by ancient houses of rock; old fortifications; old trails; burying grounds and missions. From these to our modern times are the adobe buildings of Spanish influence; the plazas with that ancient air of the long ago; the hand-hewn planks in some of the thick-walled houses yet standing; the courthouse, with its high-ceilings and towered roof; the narrow streets, with the houses at the sidewalks; and the wider streets, with pavement and houses with fences and yards. These are the relics here for you to see. Tucson, the city different, in a land of sunshine, where one may ramble in the ancient or modern as he likes.[52]

Again, the city was pitched as a singular place where the forms and materials of the past still existed. Boosters like these emphasized the Spanish past as the asset that set the Southwest apart while also assuring prospective visitors that the region was not stuck in the past. Yet the heavily touted "Spanish influence" that promoters hoped would lure visitors and prosperity to their cities was only present in the most physical sense. In this case, they focused on the buildings, spaces and materials that still existed, but say nothing of those Mexicans who maintained them over time. The Spanish past exists in the adobe blocks, hand-hewn planks and thick-walled houses of the city, but not in the people who knew how to work those materials or who lived and worshipped in those places. The material of the past served as spectacle while the living remnants of that past figuratively vanished from sight.

---

[51] Passenger Traffic Department, *San Antonio, a Picturesque Metropolis of the Southwest* (Houston: Southern Pacific Lines, ca. 1920s), n.p.

[52] "Tucson: The World's Sunshine Center" n.d., n.p., Ephemera Files: Places-Arizona-Tucson-guidebooks-general, Arizona Historical Society, Tucson, Arizona.

A 1939 booster pamphlet promoting San Antonio proclaimed: "Nowhere else has been enacted such stirring historical drama. In no other place has been captured the charm and loveliness, the quaintness, the old-world atmosphere, the curious blending of old and new as in San Antonio."[53] Like a buried gem exposed by a quirk of local geology, boosters touted this juxtaposition of old and new as a valuable asset, calling one and all to come and see the singular, wondrous resource. Advertising "old-world atmosphere" in the Southwest began decades before the San Antonio Municipal Information Bureau published this pamphlet. Indeed, boosters had sold the Spanish past as a rare commodity to all interested in the exotic and romantic since the railroads arrived. The boosters of San Antonio, Albuquerque and Tucson peddled these cities as extraordinary places where the commingling of the Spanish past and the American present created an alluring urban atmosphere.

---

[53] *Picturesque San Antonio, Where Life Is Different*, (San Antonio: San Antonio Municipal Information Bureau, 1939), n.p.

The arrival of the railroad in the late-nineteenth century fundamentally transformed the style and form of urban space in the Southwest. It brought people with new notions of space and design as well as the materials necessary to realize those ideas to an environment laid out along colonial Spanish principles. From modifying existing structures with factory-produced and railroad-delivered building materials to platting new streets and subdivisions, these newcomers altered urban space on multiple scales. As construction in the new style flourished, residents in each city had to contend with space in transition from one form to another. In some places the forms stood miles apart; in others they sat atop and within each other. This juxtaposition made urban citizens keenly aware of the relationship between the Spanish past and their present. The way they defined that relationship by dividing history into ancient and modern eras, developing stereotypes from building types and materials that belonged to those eras, and valuing them differently reveals an emerging rhetoric that separated the Spanish past from the American present. Conceptually relegating living Mexicano citizens to a liminal space, neither ancient nor modern, was a significant corollary to this rhetoric.

Boosters, citizens and visitors took note of the Spanish past and American present bumping into one another. When they expressed this in their narratives about the Southwest, they did so not in terms of culture, language, religion or other intangible qualities. Most frequently, they illustrated the point physically with descriptions of space—how it was laid out and the structures that occupied it. The remnants of the Spanish built environment anchored writers' claims of antiquity. One guidebook described San Antonio as a "quaint old Spanish town, with its contracted streets and its ancient adobe homes projecting their roofs over narrow sidewalks."[54] The size and layout of the streets along with the primary building material gave the space an "ancient" air. Another guidebook, titled "Beautiful San Antonio," identified specific buildings and the images of the past they evoked; "Here is the Alamo, an ancient Spanish chapel . . . . Here are the Missions and the historic Cathedral of San Fernando, breathing the spirit of the Spaniard and the Moor in survivals of continental architecture of wonderful beauty."[55] The reverential ideal presented here, that San Antonio's buildings live in the present as "breathing…survivals" illustrates how metaphor and symbolism brought the Spanish past figuratively back to life. The city's unique romance stemmed from its imagined connection to Spaniards, Moors, and Old World Europe. *Beautiful San Antonio* identifies the city as a unique place where Spanish spirit lives. The connection to colonial Spain comes from the abandoned missions, which have been conceptually resurrected in the postrailroad era.

The presence of spaces associated with an ancient Spanish past in the modern cities of the Southwest created a tension that residents of those places knew well. For example, Lina Fergusson Browne, granddaughter of Albuquerque merchant Franz Huning, recalled the two very different towns named Albuquerque that she knew in her youth at the end of the nineteenth century:

> Old Town, where Spanish was the prevailing language, was . . . called *Mexican*. . . . With the coming of the railroad in 1880 New Town soon became the business center of Albuquerque while Old

---

[54] Goff, *San Antonio and Environs*, 11.

[55] L.F. Kelly and S. Williamson, *Beautiful San Antonio* (San Antonio: J. R. Wood Printing, 1909), n.p.

> Town withdrew into its own past. . . . The Old Town Plaza was . . . a quiet, charming, typically Mexican plaza, across-the-border in feeling. New Town was something very different. Here one had crossed back into the U.S.A. It looked much like the setting for any typical Western.[56]

The new construction brought by Albuquerque's railroad boom went up miles away from any colonial urban center. Anglo and Mexicano places stood apart from one another, unlike San Antonio where they overlapped. For Albuquerque residents like Browne, this distance created a feeling of different eras divided by a border. Consequently, Albuquerque developed a Spanish district at Old Town, a space named for its association with the past and separation from the modern era.

The foreignness of Spanish spaces like Old Town made them both unintelligible and alluring to American observers. A magazine article on San Antonio remarked on the "streets in the old part of the city [that] follow the incomprehensible fashion of the older cities of Southern Europe and Asia, being very narrow and also very crooked." Yet these incomprehensible spaces did not threaten the authors, rather they found the spaces

> as picturesque as they are narrow with their medley of Mexicans with their ox carts and beasts of burden; fine American turn-outs with their fair occupants; mule trains from the western plains, and all conceivable vehicles and other traffic confined within such narrow limits as to give them an air of great bustle and life.[57]

---

[56] Franz Huning, *Trader on the Santa Fe Trail: The Memoirs of Franz Huning*, ed. Lina Fergusson Browne (Albuquerque: University of Albuquerque, 1973), 114-15.

[57] Kate Efnor and Laura J. Irvine, "Historical Sketch of San Antonio," in *The American Sketch Book: An Historical and Home Monthly*, ed. Bella French Swisher(Austin: The Sketch Book Company, 1881), 387.

Rather than inspiring xenophobia, likening the streets of Old Albuquerque or San Antonio to Southern Europe or Asia, evoked an alluring exoticism, a place bustling with life and stimulating unpredictability.

The Mission San Xavier del Bac served as a site for memorializing the idealized Spanish past around Tucson. The narrative of this mission differs from most others in the Southwest because San Xavier has remained a functioning parish church to the present day. Rather than moldering ruins waiting to be mentally resurrected, San Xavier presented visitors with a living, functioning church. This did not stop them from imagining it as a place outside the modern era, however. A Tucson guidebook revealed a yearning for antiquity in its claim that construction of the mission began in 1692, noting that year was "almost a century before the first missionary arrived in California." At San Xavier, the guide promised, a tourist could watch "Indians till the surrounding lands and worship within the walls of this sacred mission as did their ancestors.... This fine, peaceful old place of worship has a continuous history of actual use approaching two and a half centuries."[58] In fact, the building that the guidebook referred to was built in the last decades of the eighteenth century. Fantasy trumped history in this case, demonstrating that the age of a mission (even older than those in California!) provided valuable grounds for the boosters of the 1930s to stake a claim to the colonial past of Arizona.

In addition to assigning value to the colonial history of the mission, this guide also esteemed the Indians who still work and worship there. Viewing the agricultural labor and religious devotion to the Catholic mission of the Tohono O'odham in the 1930s served as a vehicle for transporting visitors to the past. By likening the modern Tohono O'odham to their ancestors, boosters in Tucson made the modern parish of San Xavier into a place out of time. This is precisely the same phenomenon exhibited with abandoned missions. The place never moves out of the past though it materially exists in the present. In Tucson the Indians of San Xavier were conceptually exiled to the past along with the mission. The idea that natives could be viewed on their reservation living as colonial era novitiates effectively separated those living people from the modern era.

---

[58] "New Life in the Land of Sunshine," 1935, n.p., Ephemera Files: Places-Arizona-Tucson-guidebooks-general, Arizona Historical Society, Tucson, Arizona.

Notwithstanding the persistence of San Xavier, missions also represented decay and ruin in the imagined narrative of the Spanish past. One writer declared that by the nineteenth century, the missions of San Antonio had been "abandoned to the wilderness from which they sprang."[59] The built environment, as encountered in the late-nineteenth and early-twentieth century, served as a complete metaphor for the Spanish past to contemporary observers. In the ruins before them, they saw a sacred space that had been laid out in the wilderness and that had tamed the wild savages there and made them servile. At the same time, the decay of that space indicated failure, abandonment and decline. The Spanish past may have been glorious, but it was gone. The Mexican nation the Americans had acquired was not an extension of that glory. It was a wilderness to which the ruins of the mission had succumbed.

---

[59] Goff, *San Antonio and Environs*, 65.

If missions stood as the emblematic buildings of the romantic Spanish past, then the emblematic person of that ideal must have been the missionary. Unlike the adventurer, wandering and exploring through space, the missionary settled and altered space by building. Visitors to mission ruins could imagine this stock Spanish character in that space, and modern-day boosters encouraged them to indulge that fantasy through romantic descriptions of missionaries' lives and work. These narratives presented the missionary character as courageous in the face of hostile savagery. One guide to the missions of San Antonio described them as "brave Franciscan monks . . . who entered an unknown wilderness, peopled with savage tribes and wild animals. . . . They raised lofty temples in praise of religion, and brought bowing to their altars the heathen tribes surrounding them."[60] Their "lofty temples" were both the purpose of their sojourn in northern New Spain as well as the lasting artifact of their time there. Thus, the action of building, projecting ordered space on a "wild" and "savage" landscape defined the Spanish project in the North. Missionaries, more than soldiers, administrators, farmers, herders, or any other kind of colonial settler encapsulated the ideal Spaniard.

MODERNISM AS JUGGERNAUT

As writers contrasted the Spanish and American systems of organizing space, they also imagined them in competition with each other. That imagined contest always had a clear winner. The ancient and Spanish would inevitably and necessarily give way to the modern and American. As one observer wrote, "San

---

[60] Ibid.

Antonio presents to the observant traveler the aspect of a staid ancient city being slowly but surely crowded out of existence by the irresistible and ceaseless march of progress."[61] This unavoidable doom made the experience of the Spanish past an even rarer commodity. As a pamphlet enticing tuberculosis patients to relocate to Albuquerque declared: "It's vanishing! It's becoming new! That fascinating world of ancient cities, of strange peoples, of storied pasts. Its last stronghold is New Mexico, the last state unspoiled by civilization. Come now and discover romance that the later visitor will never see."[62] This sense of urgency was meant to spur uncertain visitors to come. It also indicated the assumed inevitability of the loss of the Spanish past. Another pamphlet on Tucson noted, "At no other spot in America do we find the old Spanish influence of the sixteenth century so intermingled with the onward force of the civilization from other races."[63] That the "onward force" mentioned here would wipe out that past and dominate the modern era was implicit.

Often this announcement of the unstoppable rise of modern American culture linked space to people. The prevalence of American styles of architecture and planning in the urban Southwest attested to the domination of the region by American people. In this logic, the Mexicanos who lived there had no choice but to surrender to an unavoidable fate, just as their outdated homes would soon fall to modern structures. A San Antonio guidebook colorfully described the encounter:

---

[61] Ibid., 12.

[62] The Albuquerque Civic Council, "Albuquerque," 1925, The Albuquerque and New Mexico Pamphlet Collection, box1 folder 4A, Center for Southwest Research and Special Collections, Albuquerque, New Mexico.

[63] "Tucson: The World's Sunshine Center," n.d., n.p. in AHS Ephemera Files Places-Arizona-Tucson-guidebooks-general

> A new people have rushed in, and the thin-blooded native shrinks aside for the new-comer, basks in the sun, and beholds, in amazement, the rising palace, towering far above his low, flat-roofed adobe or stone hovel, and sees also, the modern business structures push from their places the one story, half-battlemented, loop-holed dwellings of a long past period. He draws his once rich and bright, but now faded poncho about his stooped shoulders, and slinks away, breathing a curse, and a sigh for the past, when he sat unmolested, in plentitude of idleness and sunshine, free from the bustling ways and strange habits of the intruder.[64]

Thus, the ability to transform space radically by building “modern business structures” and “palaces” characterized the new arrivals while such endeavors lay beyond the reach of the defeated natives. The guidebook’s juxtaposition of different spatial logics and styles did not only indicate a confrontation of two historic legacies, it reflected an imagined social order. The towering commercial buildings overshadowed the low hovels of the Mexicanos. They and their buildings exist in a “long past period” once glorious, just as the native’s poncho was once rich and bright, but now faded. Submissive resignation to the new order was the only appropriate response.

While guidebooks and travelers’ narratives defined the urban Southwest as a place where ancient and modern spaces coexisted, they ultimately pushed Mexicano and Indian people out of the active, living space of the cities. This is not to say that nonwhite people were physically excluded from urban spaces, but rather they were conceptually relegated to a place in the unspecified past. This schema tied racial identity to temporal categorization; eras became synonymous with people. White Americans belonged to and controlled the modern world that displaced Mexicano and Indian people and their concepts of space. An Albuquerque booster organization, for example, described the city as the "home of three civilizations—the modern, the ancient Spanish and the Indian."[65] By this definition, the Spaniard and the Indian could not be modern. Instead, these explicitly "ancient" people existed in temporal limbo outside the modern world. This relegation of nonwhite people to an imagined past created a self-supporting logic that defined the modern Southwest as a place for white Americans. The Albuquerque Civic Council identified itself as simply "modern" while casting the legacy of Mexicano and Native New Mexico outside that category somewhere in the deep past. This act dissipated Mexicano and Indian claims to urban space, consigning them to be, as historian Phoebe Kropp described them, people who "survived into the present only as artifacts, colorful but awkward remnants of another time."[66] By displacing living Mexicanos and Indians into the ancient past while celebrating Spanish missionaries as progenitors of white civilization, boosters whitened the Spanish past, both in a racial sense and as a turn away from the denigration of the Black Legend.

---

[64] Goff, *San Antonio and Environs*, 14.

By linking groups of people with specific time periods, the authors of guidebooks and travel narratives justified American domination of the Mexican Cession and the people therein. Just as time inevitably moves forward and new things replace old, American modernism must inevitably replace the ancient cultures of the Southwest. This forgone conclusion allowed for Mexicano people to live physically in the same time and space as Anglo elites without being seen as contenders for control of that space. Naturally, it seemed, they lived a defeated existence in an ancient temporal realm. Their lives, like old buildings and streets, provided a colorful backdrop to the unfolding modernism brought by American newcomers.

---

[65] The Albuquerque Civic Council, "Albuquerque."

[66] Kropp, *California Vieja*, 5.

CONCLUSION

The tension created by the meeting of English and Spanish imperial legacies found physical expression in the built environment of the urban Southwest. The forms and layout of buildings and public space defined the colonial settlements of northern New Spain as Spanish outposts. The population boom of the nineteenth century's last decades brought an Anglo majority to these spaces. The newcomers changed both the physical space of their urban landscapes and the cultural value of that space. Physically, the late-nineteenth century saw a reorientation of space to new urban centers built around railroad stations and along routes with easy access to them. This transformation marginalized and, in some cases, destroyed the plaza-centered urban plan that the Spanish had established in the colonial era. As the railroad carried more and more people into the cities at the dawn of the twentieth century, the cultural elites of the new majority sought to distinguish their cities and pitch them as good places to visit and live. To that end they crafted a narrative that acknowledged the presence of the remains of the colonial built environment while relegating those remains to a distant past. In this separation between the white modern American present and the ancient Spanish past, the image of a romantic but fallen Spanish world took hold. This narrative took the physical remains of the built environment as the most symbolic element of that era. Social and cultural legacies were largely ignored or were bound up with the physical space of the past.

The romantic view of the Spanish past grew in tandem with the idea that Anglo newcomers should serve as stewards of that legacy. As the United States exerted more complete legal, economic, and political control over the region, Spanish/Mexican building styles and materials changed in perceived value. Once seen as substandard products of a corrupt and decadent culture, the built environment of the Southwest became a signifier of the exotic and unique allure of the region. This shift in significance set the stage for the restoration and recreation of those elements of the Spanish past that best suited the fantasy narrative.

CHAPTER 3: HISTORIC PRESERVATION IN THE URBAN SOUTHWEST

One of the particular manipulations of space and the built environment came through the historic preservation movement. In the American Southwest, preservationists sought to define the region through historic preservation projects. A number of these aimed to preserve buildings constructed during the colonial era. Yet this preservation was not deployed evenly throughout the region. The Spanish missions of San Antonio, for example, garnered a following of preservationists who worked to have them rebuilt and restored to commemorate an idealized view of the Spanish past while the missions around Tucson were allowed to weather away. Several factors affected the presence and strength of historic preservation movements in Tucson, Albuquerque and San Antonio. Most important was the formation of a civic identity. Historic preservation organizations and the governments and philanthropists who funded them tended to restore buildings that supported an existing civic identity.[1] If the people of a city did not embrace an identity that centered on the Spanish past, the buildings evocative of that era were not likely to draw the attention of preservationists. In addition to an identity that celebrated the Spanish past, historic preservation of colonial buildings required devoted organizations, sympathetic government officials and generous philanthropists. This combination constituted a recipe for preservation. Only when these elements came together properly was the Spanish past preserved.

---

[1] For more on the development of civic identities in the American West, see Judy Mattivi Morley, *Historic Preservation & the Imagined West: Albuquerque, Denver, and Seattle* (Lawrence: University Press of Kansas, 2006), 15-17.

For these reasons, the story of historic preservation in the American Southwest before World War II is most clearly reflected in the story of historic preservation in San Antonio. The city had several distinct attributes that combined to sustain preservationists. Five colonial missions built of limestone set the city apart, and active groups of well-connected preservationists created and managed preservation projects there while city officials and committed philanthropists contributed their support. No other city pursued preservation of structures from the Spanish past as early and on such a scale as San Antonio. Preservationists in Albuquerque and Tucson in particular began with less substantial colonial-era structures and did not mobilize the energy and funds necessary for a preservation movement until well into the second half of the twentieth century. This chapter, although focused on events and people in San Antonio, should be read in the larger context of the historic preservation movement as it developed in the United States at the beginning of the twentieth century and its particular course in the Southwest. That trajectory begins with Americans' initial encounters with the Spanish/Mexican built environment of the region.

PEJORATIVE VIEWS

Many American visitors who came to the American Southwest in the mid- to late-nineteenth century commented on the buildings they saw there. The built environment of the region did not fare well in their judgment. These travelers perceived Mexicanos through a collection of negative stereotypes (laziness, dirtiness, shiftlessness, criminality) rooted in the anti-Spanish sentiment of the

Black Legend.[2] They extended these pejorative views to the structures Mexicanos built and lived in as well. These early commentators envisioned the buildings they encountered as physical manifestations of the degenerate character traits they saw in Mexicanos. Thus, when viewing Mexicano homes, they saw them as filthy, simply built with little effort, flimsy, and unrefined. Their descriptions also reinforced animalistic themes. Rather than homes for people, visitors saw the buildings as holes where vermin hid. The prevalent anti-Mexican views and prejudices held by white Americans colored their valuation of for the built environment of the urban Southwest.

Structures made of adobe, the most ubiquitous and sensible building material in the desert Southwest, garnered harsh derision from American visitors. When John Russell Bartlett, leader of the U. S. team that surveyed the U.S./Mexico border in 1854, visited Tucson, he commented on the quality of Tucsonense homes. “The houses in Tucson,” he observed, “are all of adobe, and the majority are in a state of ruin. No attention seems to be given to repair; but as soon as a dwelling becomes uninhabitable, it is deserted, the miserable tenants creeping into some other hovel where they eke out their existence.”[3] Bartlett implicitly judges the Tucsonenses as lazy and inept as he condemns the decrepitude of their homes. The image of “miserable tenants creeping” evokes a subhuman snake or rat that finds shelter in whatever hollow nature provides. He does not seem bothered by the contradiction in this image. If the people of

---

[2] See chapter one for a deeper discussion of the historic development and content of anti-Mexicano sentiment.

[3] Bartlett, *Personal Narrative*, 295.

Tucson were so lazy that they readily abandoned their homes rather than repairing wear and tear, who built the sturdier structures to which they fled? Surely, some among them possessed sufficient industry to erect the houses in the first place. Elisions such as this indicate that Bartlett's architectural criticism is meant more as a swipe at the Tucsonenses than a comment on the upkeep of their housing.

A decade after Bartlett's border sojourn and soon after the formation of the Arizona Territory, J. Ross Browne, a government functionary and world traveler based in California, came to Arizona with his friend Charles D. Poston, the territory's first Indian agent. While Poston intended to visit with leaders of the tribes in his district, Browne sought colorful stories about Arizona and Sonora for a series of articles collected in his book *Adventures in the Apache Country* published in 1867. During the trip, the party stopped in Tucson which Browne described as "a city of mudboxes, dingy and dilapidated, cracked and baked into a composite of dust and filth."[4] The land around the Tucsonenses' adobe homes was "littered about with broken corrals, sheds, bake-ovens, carcasses of dead animals and broken pottery." The image of a dirty, broken city left no room for misinterpretation. Browne's Tucson was a decadent city in need of proper management and sound building techniques. Once again, the insult to Tucsonenses, who apparently could not build anything durable or even remove rotting animal carcasses from around their homes, is unspoken but clear.

---

[4] John Ross Browne, *Adventures in the Apache Country: A Tour through Arizona and Sonora, with Notes on the Silver Regions of Nevada* (New York: Harper and Brothers, 1869), 131.

The jacal, a structure made of close-set poles tied together and filled in with earth, also suffered derision in the judgment of American visitors. A United States Army officer who came to San Antonio in 1851 got the structural details right while disparaging the homes of San Antonio's lower classes as "miserable huts, built of crooked musket-logs stuck endwise into the ground, the crevices filled with clay, without windows, with dirt floors, and generally thatched with prairie grass or bull rushes."[5] Some decades later, the negative views of Mexicano dwellings remained. In 1881, diarist George P. Goff of Pennsylvania called the Texas jacal "the home of indigent Mexicans and half-breeds." He further described the buildings as "like nothing else of all the known habitations of mankind…very little better than the abodes of the cave-dwellers." After placing Texas Mexicanos well below civilized on the scale of human progress, Goff depicted the residents of the typical jacal, tying them closely to their abodes: "Here the inmates dwell in listless idleness and hopeless poverty, with the usual quantity of dogs and children, living to-day on what they got yesterday, and hoping to have to-morrow the same as they had to-day-heavily seasoned with red pepper."[6]

Goff's characterization of the jacal-dwelling Mexicanos demonstrates a pervasive prejudice shared by Bartlett and Browne. Whether housed in adobe or a jacal, Mexicanos could neither build sound structures nor maintain them. The built environment tangibly illustrated the character flaws of the builders. Poor maintenance and deficient materials indicated laziness and ineptitude. Homes drowned by the clamor of too many children reflected injudicious sexuality. Poverty, building style, and morality merged in a tautological circle to justify presuppositions of Mexicano inferiority.

---

[5] Anonymous, "Scenes in Texas," 37.

[6] Goff, *San Antonio and Environs*, 17.

While these observers scorned the vernacular structures of the urban Southwest, they and their contemporaries regarded the Spanish missions much more highly. This demonstrates that the dichotomy of things Mexican and things Spanish was firmly applied to the realm of architecture. Although Tucson's "mudboxes" repulsed Browne, he felt differently about San Xavier del Bac, a colonial mission for the Tohono O'odham outside the city. Notwithstanding the mission's adobe construction, he pronounced it "one of the most beautiful and picturesque edifices of the kind to be found on the North American continent."[7] The beauty of the church struck Browne because of its location: "I was surprised to see such a splendid monument of civilization in the wilds of Arizona."[8] The "dust and filth" of Tucson were exactly what Browne expected to find in Arizona, an expectation broken by the grandeur of San Xavier. His identification of the Jesuit mission as an emblem of civilization amid the wilds of Arizona (presumably Tucson included) is particularly telling. The mission created by Spanish missionaries and Tohono O'odham laborers was exalted, grand, and civilized while homes of Mexicano Tucsonenses were degenerate, decadent, and wild. This de-evolution from Spanish civilization to Mexicano barbarity hinges on the categorical separation and valuation of “Spanish” and “Mexican.”

---

[7] Browne, *Adventures in the Apache Country*, 140.

[8] Ibid.

Browne further clarified his view that Mexicano people did not belong in the idyllic world of the Spanish mission. While visiting San Xavier he encountered a few “Mexicans” living among the Tohono O’odham near the mission. The Mexicans were “regarded with distrust, and complaint is made that they have intruded themselves against the wish of the tribe.” Browne reported that his traveling companion, Charles Poston, also the Indian agent of Arizona, “ordered the Mexicans to leave.”[9] Browne does not further describe the nature of the Mexicans intrusion, or how they took Poston’s eviction. Nonetheless, his story reveals the nature of the Mexicans’ transgression. Apparently, they were in the wrong place and the wrong time. Browne assigned dusty and dilapidated Tucson to the “baked and dried Mexicans” and “Sonoranian buffoons.”[10] Magnificent San Xavier del Bac, on the other hand, was meant for the Tohono O’odham. Browne separated these two groups and assigned them separate spatial territories, effectively locking Mexicanos out of a connection to the Spanish past as represented by the historic mission but sheltering the natives in it.

American visitors who came to the Southwest at the end of the nineteenth century generally disparaged the buildings that they found there. Vernacular architecture appeared unsophisticated and indecent to them. The finer workmanship of the Spanish missions represented the only structures of note in an otherwise bleak built environment. This followed the established dichotomy of a romantic Spanish past and degenerate Mexican present. This legacy of derision also influenced the preservationists who worked in the region in the twentieth century to pay little attention to Spanish/Mexican vernacular architecture. Not only was the style considered substandard, and perhaps subhuman, but it did not fit in with the prevailing ethos of the early historic preservation movement, which was defined by a nearly unwavering focus on celebrating military heroes through sites deemed significant to their history. These conditions made the application of early preservation principles to the structures of the Southwest challenging.

---

[9] Ibid.

[10] Ibid., 133.

THE THEORY AND PRACTICE OF HISTORIC PRESERVATION

A fixation on buildings in which famous politicians and military leaders lived or worked guided historic preservation of the late-nineteenth century. The historic value of these sites came from their association more with a “great man” rather than their own history, architectural style or relationship to their surroundings. This precedent defined the public importance of the practice of historic preservation and served as a criterion for viable preservation sites for generations.

The first preservation project based on association with a great man in the United States arrived with the State of New York’s 1850 purchase of Hasbrouck House in Newburgh. This house had served as General Washington's headquarters during the last two years of the American Revolution. Its association with the revered general and president motivated the state government’s purchase. The argument presented by the legislative committee that oversaw acquisition of the house illustrated the fundamental motivations for this type of “great man” preservation:

> If our love of country is excited when we read the biography of our revolutionary heroes, or the history of revolutionary events, how much more will the flame of patriotism burn in our bosoms when we tread the ground where was shed the blood of our fathers, or when we move among the scenes where were conceived and consummated their noble achievements...No traveler who touches upon the shores of Orange county will hesitate to make the pilgrimage to this beautiful spot...and if he have an American heart in his bosom, he will feel himself a better man; his patriotism will kindle with deeper emotion; his aspirations of his country's good will ascend from a more devout mind for having visited the ‘Headquarters of Washington.’[11]

This argument for preservation captures the perspective of the early preservationists in the U.S. The Hasbrouck House was valuable to them neither as an example of colonial architecture nor as a home at all. The building served as a tangible prompt or symbol to revere Washington and his monumental deeds. This reverence, the preservers hoped, would bind visitors together in a specific national identity. The reference to the bloodshed of “our fathers” used by the legislators indicates their belief that history is important because it reminds Americans of their filial obligation to hallowed heroes of the past. The state should purchase Hasbrouck House, the preservationists argued, to make it a symbol consecrated with the blood of kin that animated patriotic feelings through its connection to the cult of Washington. They continued the sanguinary image by asserting that the site would move those persons with “an American heart.” The campaign to make the site a public monument succeeded because its backers created a narrative of memory that identified the place with a great man and invoked nationalist identity as due payment for the sacrifice of the nation's forbears.

---

[11] Richard Caldwell, *A True History of the Acquisition of Washington's Headquarters at Newburgh by the State of New York* (Salisbury Mills, NY: Stivers, Slauson and Boyd, 1887), 8-9.

"Great man" preservation continued along the same lines six years after the Hasbrouck House became property of the State of New York when the state legislature of Tennessee resolved to purchase Andrew Jackson's estate, the Hermitage. The legislature justified the acquisition with the same reverential nationalism invoked in New York: "It is good policy in a republican government to...inculcate sentiments of veneration for those departed heroes who have rendered important services to their country in times of danger."[12] Again, the estate itself was not really the object of preservation. Preservationists wanted to acquire the Hermitage to deploy it as a symbol and didactic tool that would inspire visitors to revere an American military hero. The narrative elements of bloodshed, sacrifice and militarism remained the crux of the preservationist's justifications.

These examples illustrate the origins of the historic preservation movement in the United States. Architectural distinctiveness or notable beauty did not motivate the movement. Preservationists focused on sites that could serve as a symbolic framework on which they could hang a reverential nationalism. Preservation was didactic and moralistic through and through. These examples also demonstrate the leading role adopted by state governments in this period.

---

[12] U.S. Congress, Senate Committee on the Library, *Care and Preservation of the Hermitage*, Report 314, to accompany S.4797, 60th Cong., 1st Sess., February 28, 1908 (Washington, Government Printing office, 1908), 3.

Few private foundations supported historic preservation projects in the antebellum era and federal involvement would not come for another century. Nonetheless, early preservationists found support in state governments when their projects met the political ideal of preservation in that era.

At this early stage, preservationists saw the historical built environment as a tool to instruct Americans in lessons of morality and patriotism--virtues aligned with values ascribed to women in American culture. Upper- and middle-class women of the later-nineteenth century contended that they should serve as guardians of culture and morals. This argument hinged on the Victorian belief that women were morally superior to men.[13] Through organizations like the Woman's Christian Temperance Union female evangelical Protestants sought to influence government policies on temperance, abolition, moral reform and peace.[14] These associations provided educated, connected women a venue for organizing around shared concerns and training in the use of moral leverage to prompt action from the state. Thus, reform provided a claim to moral authority for women in a society that largely dismissed their concerns.[15] Pursuit of moral uprightness and patriotism attracted some of these women to support preservation and heritage projects. As more women engaged in preservation work, they formed associations for that express purpose. Their actions proved that private historic preservation organizations could function as a viable alternative to government-based programs.

---

[13] Barbara J. Howe, "Women in Historic Preservation: The Legacy of Ann Pamela Cunningham," *The Public Historian* 12, no. 1 (1990): 32.

[14] Ian Tyrrell, *Woman's World/Woman's Christian Temperance Union: The Women's Christian Temperance Union in International Perspective, 1800-1930* (Chapel Hill: The University of North Carolina Press, 1991), 4.

[15] Peggy Pascoe, *Relations of Rescue: The Search for Female Moral Authority in the American West, 1874-1939* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1990), xvi-xvii.

In 1853, Ann Pamela Cunningham founded the first women's historic preservation organization, the Mount Vernon Ladies' Association (MVLA), to purchase and preserve George Washington's Virginia plantation. Cunningham's efforts proved so successful that in addition to completing one of the nation's first preservation projects, she set numerous precedents that steered the field of historic preservation for the next century. Cunningham most significantly diverged from contemporary preservation projects in her belief that private citizens, not government, should be responsible for undertaking preservation projects. Her work with the MVLA also reinforced numerous assumptions about historic preservation, namely that sites associated with military and political heroes warranted preservation; that these sites should evoke a near-sacred reverence for the past; and that acquiring and managing properties for preservation was a woman's work.[16] The late-nineteenth century saw a proliferation of women's organizations concerned with historic preservation in the Cunningham mode. These included the Daughters of the American Revolution, the Colonial Dames of America, and importantly for this study, the Daughters of the Republic of Texas.[17]

---

[16] William J. Murtagh, *Keeping Time: The History and Theory of Preservation in America* (Pittstown, N.J.: Main Street Press, 1988), 30.

[17] Howe, "Women in Historic Preservation," 36.

PRESERVATION GOES WEST: THE ALAMO

In light of the precedents that linked historic preservation to the celebration of patriotism, nationalism and Great Men, it is no wonder that the first site west of the Mississippi purchased for historic preservation was the San Antonio de Valero mission, better known as the Alamo. It is also no surprise that a women's organization took the helm in the preservation and interpretation of the mission. In 1883 the state of Texas purchased the Spanish mission expressly to prevent it from being altered or destroyed by any other party.[18]

Although historic preservation began in Texas a full generation after the preservation of Hasbrouck House, the Hermitage, and Mount Vernon, the Texans echoed the sentiments expressed over those sites. They argued that the importance of the building in the history of Texas derived from great Texan men shedding blood in self-sacrifice for a nationalist triumph. That narrative centered on the March 1836 battle of the Texas Rebellion when Mexican troops wiped out the Texian rebels garrisoned at the mission. Fired with desire to revenge the loss at the Alamo, Texian forces prevailed in the Battle of San Jacinto a month later, ending the revolt and winning Texian independence. By the late-nineteenth century, the standoff at the Alamo became an origin myth for Texas. The site's history combined with its distinctive architecture and location in San Antonio made it a prime candidate for preservation.

San Antonio's primacy in historic preservation came, in part, from the geologic makeup of the land under and around the city. The area around the city provides a bounty of soft, easily quarried limestone. Spanish missionaries and their native followers used this stone to build five missions along the San Antonio River in the eighteenth century. These buildings as well as secular limestone structures were more resistant to decay and loss than the adobe structures found in Albuquerque and Tucson. Thus, in the period before the advent of historic preservation, San Antonio's buildings did not fall into total ruin from exposure to the elements, although they did suffer plenty of damage and partial collapse. Weather and time did not pose the most dangerous threats to the missions, however. Vandals savaged the missions and souvenir-hunters stole artwork from inside them. On two occasions, at Mission Concepción in 1885 and at the Alamo in 1840, Bexar County even considered selling the stones of the missions as loose building materials to the highest bidder.[19] The attitudes behind these actions demonstrate that preservation of the Spanish past was not an innate quality among San Antonio's citizens but one that developed over time. Despite the lack of sentimentality for the past and the damage dealt by time, the stone missions proved durable enough to survive at least partially until someone decided they were worth preserving.

---

[18] Fisher, *Saving San Antonio*, 40-42.

The Alamo's stone walls almost did not make it into the era of preservation. Blasted by Mexican artillery during the siege, the building remained in disrepair for more than a decade. One San Antonian remembered it at the time of Texas' annexation to the United States as "a veritable ruin. No doors or windows shut out the sunlight or the storm."[20] Far from revered, the former mission languished, serving only to house bats and swallows. In 1849, the U.S. Army rented the Alamo complex to use as a quartermaster's depot. Army engineers cleared the grounds, rebuilt the convento, roofed the chapel, and added the distinctive scroll to the top of the chapel's front wall. After the army left in 1876, the Catholic Church sold the convent to merchant Honoré Grenet, who built a general store around its walls. Grenet rented the chapel as warehouse space. This adaptive reuse shored up the damaged mission structures, but did not prevent further damage. Changing attitudes toward the structure brought new threats. An 1890 history of San Antonio lamented the "wanton mutilation [of the Alamo]...by thoughtless relic hunters."[21] Indeed, the attention of those seeking souvenirs from the old limestone chapel proved a more dire menace than neglect and incautious reuse.

---

[19] Ibid., 46-47.

[20] John Frost, *Incidents and Narratives of Travel in Europe, Asia, Africa and America: In Various Periods of History* (Auburn, N.Y.: JE Beardsley, 1857), 59.

In 1891, a group of women organized to defend the Alamo and other landmarks from the harm caused by this complacency. At a meeting the following year, the group called themselves the Daughters of the Republic of Texas and declared their mission to be the "acquisition, preservation and proper adornment of the historic spots ...associated with deeds of heroism...[and to] implant in the minds and hearts of succeeding generations a desire to emulate the example and maintain the high principles of patriotic devotion bequeathed them by their ancestors."[22] Clearly inspired by the tenets of the preservation movement, the

---

[21] Corner, *San Antonio De Bexar: A Guide and History*, 13.

[22] Adele B. Looscan, "The Work of the Daughters of the Republic of Texas in Behalf of the Alamo," *The Quarterly of the Texas State Historical Association* 8, no. 1 (1904): 81.

DRT sought to develop the sites of Texas history into symbols that inspired veneration of military heroes. The Alamo sat at the top of its list.

Adina de Zavala, granddaughter of Texan patriot Lorenzo de Zavala, quickly rose to take charge of the Alamo preservation project, establishing the de Zavala branch of the DRT in San Antonio in 1893. In 1903, when a buyer stepped forward with plans to purchase the convento, to demolish it, and erect a modern hotel that would overshadow the chapel, Zavala sprang into action. She persuaded Gustav Schmeltzer, who had taken over Grenet's mercantile business in the convento, to give the DRT the first option to purchase the building. When the DRT could not make good on the contract, heiress Clara Driscoll, whose grandfathers both fought for Texas independence, made the payment with her own money to forestall development. Driscoll's action and political connections spurred the State of Texas to purchase the convento in 1905 and name the DRT custodians over it and the chapel.[23] The acquisition of the Alamo illustrates the unique confluence of public and private support that drove historic preservation in San Antonio.

The DRT's victory realized a dream held by many preservationists to save the Alamo. Yet a major question at the core of the preservation movement remained unanswered. What exactly was the Alamo? The defenders of 1836 commandeered several buildings in a three-acre space, improvising defensive barriers in the gaps between existing walls. They fought and died across the whole compound. If the memorialized Alamo honored this ranging battle, then what physically constituted the Alamo? Zavala and Driscoll, both enthralled with Texas history and equally dedicated to memorializing the heroes of the 1836 siege, could not agree on what physical remains of the Spanish mission should be preserved as the Alamo.

---

[23] For a more complete account of the founding of the DRT and the competing visions for preservation of the Alamo, see Randy Roberts and James S. Olson, *A Line in the Sand: The Alamo in Blood and Memory* (New York: Free Press, 2001), 205-15. and L. Robert Ables, "The Second Battle for the Alamo.," *The Southwestern Historical Quarterly* 70, no. 3 (1967). For a study of the political conditions and personal experiences that motivated Driscoll and Zavala, see Flores, *Remembering the Alamo*, 71-92.

Zavala held the broader view of preservation. She wanted to maintain every piece of colonial architecture still standing and incorporate them into a complex that memorialized the Texian defenders. In her vision, the chapel would stand as a solemn cenotaph and the convento would house a museum and library on the first floor and a Texas heroes "hall of fame" on the second. Driscoll, on the other hand, pushed for aesthetic impact above all else. She envisioned the ancient chapel dominating an open plaza. This site would anchor the city and stand as its symbolic heart. Her plan allowed nothing to impinge on the centrality of the chapel, no matter its provenance.[24]

These debates over the site and its meaning illuminate how competing visions of the past roil and jostle in the course of historic preservation. Ultimately Driscoll and her supporters broke from Zavala and created a new chapter of the DRT. Zavala lost clout with the Alamo project and Driscoll had the top floor of the convento razed. A portion of the ground floor wall was spared, but Driscoll continued to control the DRT and the Alamo until her death in 1945.

---

[24] Roberts and Olson, *A Line in the Sand*, 210.

"The Second Battle of the Alamo", as the Zavala-Driscoll clash is known, presents a dramatic example of competing visions of preservation. Yet most histories of the conflict overlook the seemingly unanimous and unquestioned decision of the DRT to preserve the Alamo as a memorial to the fallen Texians of the 1836 battle, largely ignoring the previous century of history embodied in the mission. This elision reveals the choices made by preservationists in any project and shows that preservation is a highly subjective practice. The DRT memorialized the Alamo as the site of their fallen heroes and forgot about its history as a mission and military garrison.[25] Zavala's plan to encompass more of the colonial mission in the memorial proved unpalatable to the organization. It is no surprise that the Daughters of the Republic of Texas sought to tell a story about the Texas Revolution rather than one on the Spanish past and its legacy in the region. The narrative is the result of a simple calculation of self-interest and the hero worshipping ethos of historic preservation at the time. The standoff at the Alamo is the pivotal moment in the DRT's view of Texas history. It is the vindication of Texian rebellion not yet ruined by the crushing defeat suffered in the Civil War. Indeed, to become a member of the DRT, a woman had to prove that she was descended from one of those Texas rebels. Why would such a group wish to memorialize a story of Catholic missionaries and Indian converts when they had no personal or family stake in that history?

---

[25] For an overview of the vital questions at the root of the Alamo narrative couched in a compelling investigation of history, power, and willful forgetting, see Michel-Rolph Trouillot, *Silencing the Past: Power and the Production of History* (Boston: Beacon Press, 1995), 10-14.

THE SPANISH GOVERNOR'S PALACE

Adina de Zavala's ouster from the Alamo preservation project did not sever her attachment to San Antonio's Spanish past. She soon devoted her attention to another building, certainly of colonial vintage but of peripheral importance to the Spanish government of Texas. Her quest to enshrine the building as a symbol of San Antonio's colonial grandeur occupied her for two decades. Her public efforts began in March 1915 when she published an article in the *San Antonio Express* declaring that a dilapidated old building on the west side of Military Plaza was, in fact, the former palace of the Spanish governor of Texas.[26] That this building had been constructed in the colonial era was obvious; a keystone above the door bears the image of a two-headed eagle (the Hapsburg coat of arms) and the date 1749. Who built and occupied the building in the eighteenth century was yet unclear in 1915. This uncertainty did not stop Zavala from characterizing the building as a former home to Spanish nobility and dedicating her substantial energy and connections to its purchase and restoration.

In her campaign to preserve the building, Zavala spun a romantic tale of its Spanish past. She declared the private property owned by one of the government functionaries of colonial San Antonio "was nominally the 'palace,' and was the property of the crown." Perhaps spurred by her failure to mobilize sufficient backers to realize her vision at the Alamo, Zavala exaggerated the building's significance, claiming that it "may be the only representation in existence of Spain's imperial power on American soil" and that the "descendants of aristocrats" had dwelled there. Notably, she did not build her preservation campaign around any particular person who lived in the past. Unlike the Alamo and other "great man" preservation projects Zavala promoted the Spanish Governor's Palace as a place that evoked a specific time important in San Antonio's history rather than as a place connected to a renowned person. To her, the building was a reminder of "the old days of refinement and culture" that she hoped would be "saved from the vandals."[27] This shift of focus from the "great men" who fought and died at the Alamo to a building emblematic of an idealized time reflected a larger reorientation in historic preservation that came with the progressvism and antimodernism that sprouted after World War I.

---

[26] Adina de Zavala, "Governor's Palace with Imperial Coat of Arms Tells of the Spanish Rule," *San Antonio Express,* March 21, 1915, 8.

Being located on Military Plaza, the building likely served as the home of the presidio commander. A cartographer who mapped San Antonio in 1766 labeled the building "casa del capitan."[28] In 1804, wealthy rancher Ignacio Pérez purchased the building. It would remain in his family for 125 years. Over that span of time, it served as a home for several families, a pawn shop, a saloon, and a feed and produce store.[29] By the time Zavala began her campaign to restore the building, it had undergone several renovations including one that covered the front with an awning and billboards for the stores inside the building and others on the plaza.

---

[27] Ibid.

[28] Kenneth Hafertepe, "The Romantic Rhetoric of the Spanish Governor's Palace, San Antonio, Texas," *The Southwestern Historical Quarterly* 107, no. 2 (2003): 242.

[29] Ibid.: 242-45.

Through the 1920s Adina De Zavala continued to push for the restoration of the Spanish Governor's Palace. She recycled her plans for a "Texas Hall of Fame" for the Alamo Convento, including the same museum in her proposals for the Palace.[30] She traded on the publicity she garnered in attempting to restore the Alamo Convento. The campaign for the Spanish Governor's Palace established her as the preeminent expert on historic preservation in San Antonio if not all of Texas. She faced a challenge to that superiority in 1924 when a new group formed to advocate for and oversee historic preservation in San Antonio.

Founded by two artistically minded society ladies, the San Antonio Conservation Society (SACS) brought together thirteen women to save the Market House, an 1859 Greek Revival structure west of Main Plaza. Their objective was notable not only for being among the first organized efforts to save a building in the West from destruction, but also for focusing not on the home of a great leader or site of a pivotal battle but on a commercial building where common people met to exchange goods. The organization of SACS reportedly infuriated Zavala, who saw the preservation of historic San Antonio buildings as her exclusive domain. Only through extended and tearful negotiations did the SACS receive Zavala's benediction.[31]

Finally, in March 1928, Zavala and the would-be restorers of the Spanish Governor's Palace had their victory. A "renewed plea" on the part of "Miss De Zavala and the representatives of many women's clubs" convinced newly elected mayor, C. M. Chambers, to endorse a plan to include $55,000 to purchase the building in a municipal-bond issue.[32] With the issue of ownership resolved, the city moved to begin restoration of the building, a task no easier than funding its purchase. The first question, whom to entrust with overseeing the restoration, seemed to have a simple answer considering the years of effort by Zavala in support of the project. The politics of preservation in San Antonio required a more inclusive approach, however. By the late 1920s, Zavala was not the only well-connected woman in San Antonio interested in preservation. In order to please the several groups interested in the property and the social capital that would come from restoring it, Mayor Chambers appointed a committee of eighteen members representing the city's women's organizations including the Daughters of the Republic of Texas, The Daughters of the American Revolution, and the San Antonio Conservation Society. Most disappointingly for Zavala, the mayor named Rena Maverick Green of SACS the chairwoman of the committee.[33]

---

[30] "Old Palace Plan Pushed," *San Antonio Express*, June 30, 1920, 18

[31] Fisher, *Saving San Antonio*, 97.

Even with the administrative organization out of the way, the restoration project faced significant challenges. Foremost among these was the fact that very little documentation existed on the finishes and layout of the original building. After nearly two centuries of use as a house, office, apartments, saloon, and store, the Palace included numerous additions and alterations. No one knew what to preserve and what to remove. While contemporary preservation philosophy eschews arbitrarily identifying a single date to which a building should be restored, the preservationists of 1920s San Antonio were uncomfortable with such ambiguity. True to their era, they sought to eradicate the complexity evident in more than a century of modification and use.

---

[32] "Mayor Endorses Old Palace Bonds," *San Antonio Express*, March 27, 1928, 10

[33] "Society Denied Exclusive Custody of Spanish Palace," *San Antonio Express*, February 6, 1929, 6; "Size of Palace Board Criticized*," San Antonio Express,* February 8, 1929, 7

The job of figuring out what a restored Governor's Palace would look like and how to get it there fell to architect Harvey Partridge Smith. A native of Minneapolis, he had studied architecture at the École des Beaux-Arts in Paris. After working as an architect in California, he settled in San Antonio, where he became a booster of the city's architectural heritage. He was an early supporter of the building's preservation, sharing Zavala's romantic view of the structure. In 1918 he described the building as "a little inconspicuous one-story stone building where most of the famous men of the old Southwest were wined and dined, where dark eyed senoritas [sic] were wont to try their captivating charms on the dashing young officers who frequented its portal."[34] Smith maintained a romantic view of the building through the twenties while the preservation project languished.

After landing the job to restore the Palace, Smith pursued inspiration in another historic reconstruction in the Spanish borderlands. As he testified in a newspaper article, "One of the most helpful events, which gave us accurate information about various details for the building, was the trip I took to Santa Fe, N.M., to investigate the old Governor's Palace there." Smith returned to San Antonio with sketches of the Palace of the Governors as well as buildings in Taos

---

[34] Harvey Partridge Smith, *Romantic San Antonio* (San Antonio: Jackson Printing Company, 1918), n.p.

"and other ancient towns of that section."[35] Smith's search for authentic colonial architecture in New Mexico indicates the rise of a regional identity based on the Spanish past that tied together places that had little connection to one another in the colonial era. At the time of Smith's visit, the Palace of the Governors had risen to become the iconic building of Santa Fe's Spanish-Pueblo Revival style. A 1909 renovation had updated the façade of the building fronting the plaza, cementing the Santa Fe style while incorporating Beaux Arts principles of design and use.[36]

Smith viewed his work to restore the Spanish Governor's Palace as more than an architectural job. Indeed, he hoped that the building would persuade San Antonians to regard more highly the Spanish past in their city. At the presentation of the completed restoration he called on the citizens of San Antonio to ensure that their city maintain its individuality and not let the pursuit of economic gain and population growth cause them to lose the city's distinctiveness. Smith queried modern San Antonians: "Did you ever stop to think how great a part this historical background of ours could play in the purely commercial progress of the city? Have you ever stopped to reflect on the shrewdness of the businessmen of California, for instance, in advertising their old missions with their historical background and thus luring tourists by the thousands?" He warned that San Antonio would lose its distinct character "if we keep on tearing down and neglecting the few historical buildings we have left…straightening all our narrow, crooked streets, making a concrete –lined canal of our beautiful river, changing Spanish names of our streets and plazas such as Main, Broadway, Commerce, etc., and in numerous other ways, trying to make our city look just like any modern city in the United States." Smith further decried booster publications that highlight "factories and industrial plants, skyscrapers and fine homes" to attract settlers from the East. After all, he pointed out, those people were used to bigger factories and taller skyscrapers than any that could be found in Texas. The key to attracting new residents and businesses, Smith believed, was to create an exotic sense of the city based on "our wonderful old missions, and other historical and picturesque assets of which San Antonio possesses more, perhaps, than any other city in the United States."[37] Zavala, Smith and SACS built the idea of the Spanish Governors Palace as a reflection of colonial romance and adventure well before they reinforced it with brick and mortar. This story explains why San Antonio had a much more active historic preservation movement in the early-twentieth century than any other southwestern city outside California.

---

[35] Harvey Partridge Smith, "Architect Who Restored Palace Appeals to San Antonio to Keep Individuality All Its Own," *San Antonio Express*, March 1, 1931, 6

[36] Wilson, *The Myth of Santa Fe*, 125-26.

If there was any doubt that Zavala's and Smith's romantic view of the Spanish past resonated with the people of San Antonio, the opening of the restored Spanish Governor's Palace on March 4, 1931, eliminated it. In anticipation of the opening, a journalist played up the romantic past of the building, promising that the ceremony would be "reminiscent of that great adventure, the founding of civil government in the wilderness 200 years ago."[38]

---

[37] Smith, "Architect Who Restored Palace," 7.

[38] "Memories of Past Lurk in Old Building," *San Antonio Light*, March 1, 1931, 19.

To celebrate the opening, organizers put together a pageant titled “The Coming of the Canary Islanders.” They promised that the performance would be “an authentic reproduction of actual happenings when the settlers arrived, taken from old documents.”[39]

Although both the arrival of colonists from the Canary Islands and the construction of the Spanish Governor’s Palace occurred in the colonial era, they have very little to do with each other. Canary Islanders came to San Antonio nearly two decades before construction of the Spanish Governor’s Palace began. Indeed, the pageant was timed to coincide with the bicentennial anniversary of the arrival of Canary Islanders, not with any aspect of the Palace.[40] Reenacting the arrival of those colonists at the dedication of that building cut across the chronology of real events and pulled the Spanish Governor’s Palace out of its historical context. This collapse of the past further indicated that preservationists wanted to evoke a romantic view of the past rather than offer strictly accurate lessons in the city’s history.

This reshaping of the past caused little stir in the city. It seems that the citizens of San Antonio did not necessarily expect historic preservation to hew to the facts of the past. One commenter recognized that San Antonio’s colonial history “has become involved with legend and legend is often indistinguishable from history… nevertheless, legend has fascinating tales to tell.”[41] After this disclaimer the writer proceeds to relay some of the juicy stories he had heard about the Spanish Governor's Palace. The first of these recounted the jealousy of an unnamed governor whose younger brother dallied too long with the governor's young Spanish bride in one of the cities to the south. After a messenger conveyed the news of his brother's betrayal in a parlor of the Spanish Governor's Palace, the governor rode day and night to exact bloody revenge on his brother and his bride. In killing them, "the honor of his home and his noble house stood vindicated."[42]

---

[39] “Memories of Past Lurk in Old Building,” *San Antonio Light*, March 1, 1931, 19.

[40] See chapter 5 for further discussion of pageantry in the San Antonio bicentennial celebration.

[41] “Memories of Past Lurk in Old Building,” *San Antonio Light*, March 1, 1931, 19.

Another writer conveyed a similarly macabre tale lost in the mists of time. A woman who came to visit the building soon after its opening told the writer that her mother was murdered there sixty years before. Without adding any details he summed up the meaning of this tragedy for his readers, "This, and many other interesting tales, which we heard from time to time, served to enhance the romance with which the old building is enveloped."[43]

The writers who penned these stories knew that they contained, at best, a grain of truth, yet persisted to retell them. The restoration of the Spanish Governor's Palace was based on a similar logic. Rather than adhering strictly to demonstrable facts, it reflected a certain image people held of the past: romantic, honor-bound, and a little dangerous.

---

[42] "Memories of Past Lurk in Old Building," *San Antonio Light,* March 1, 1931, 19.

[43] "Restored Palace Here Unique as Relic of Dynasty," *San Antonio Express*, June 9, 1936, 19

HISTORIC ABANDONMENT: TUCSON

The story of historic preservation of the Spanish past in Tucson is a harder one to tell than that of San Antonio. Although both cities began as colonial settlements that included both a mission and a presidio, the built environment from that history did not survive in Tucson nearly as well as it did in San Antonio. One reason for this was the fragility of the buildings themselves. Lacking the type of stone found in San Antonio, Tucsonense colonists built with adobe blocks made with the abundant clay from the banks of the Santa Cruz River. These structures needed frequent reapplications of mud plaster to keep the wind and rain from eroding them away. This meant that the sentiment for the colonial buildings of Arizona had to be constantly high for the buildings to be maintained. Disregard meant disrepair, which led to collapse. Tucson's colonial structures did not enjoy the esteem their upkeep demanded. The pejorative views expressed by early visitors did not quickly dissipate and the influx of white American settlers who came to Tucson in the late-nineteenth century did not support a narrative of Spanish romance for their adopted home. They wanted Arizona to be a state and strived to create an American image for the territory that hindered support for preserving the Spanish past. There was no heroic bloodshed in a colonial chapel to rally around. The city's boosters eschewed a civic identity based on the Spanish past and rallied the image of Tucson as the city of sun that saturated visitors and residents in good health.

The early Anglo settlers of Tucson faced a dilemma. While dismissive of adobe "mudboxes," the natural environment provided little else to build with and the cost of importing materials by cart or even railcar made them dear. Few alternatives to adobe existed until a French entrepreneur found a way to turn the abundance of clay soil in and around the city into durable, ubiquitous, and very American-looking bricks. Quintus Monier was a French stonemason and bricklayer who came to the U.S. in 1877. While state officials in Texas were negotiating the purchase of the Alamo, he was cutting stone and laying brick for some of the most notable buildings in the region. He won the contract to build St. Francis Cathedral in Santa Fe, and over the next eighteen years he built the Loretto Academy, St. Michael's College and numerous other governmental, commercial and residential buildings there.[44] In 1894, Monier traveled to Tucson to build St. Augustine Cathedral, the largest brick structure in Arizona at the time. He settled in Tucson, purchasing land on which to base his newly incorporated company, the Tucson Pressed Brick Company. Over the years Monier constructed many prominent brick buildings such as St. Joseph's Academy, St. Mary's Sanatorium, the Eagle Milling Company, and several buildings for the University of Arizona. He also built numerous commercial and residential structures while producing bricks for use by others masons in structures across southern Arizona.[45]

The key to Monier's success as a builder and brickmaker was his industrialization of brickmaking in southern Arizona. Though the region around Tucson had been known for containing clay suitable for block making since the colonial era, Monier was the first to bring in machines to process, extrude and press that clay into bricks. By the 1910s, the Tucson Pressed Brick Company was producing seventy thousand bricks a day 1910s.[46] This massive production rate made brick cheap. As Tucson's population boomed into the twentieth century, builders used the inexpensive blocks to erect structures across the city.

---

[44] Michael W. Diehl and Allison C. Diehl, "Economics, Ideology, and the Brick Industry in Tucson," *Journal of the Southwest* 43, no. 3 (2001): 423.

[45] Ibid.: 425-29.

Economic factors did not entirely drive the success of the Tucson Pressed Brick Company, however. After the arrival of the railroad and the expansion of brick production, brick took on a symbolic value. It represented modern building practices and an American style. Builders and planners intentionally rejected indigenous materials in favor of brick with the goal of making Tucson appear like an American city. This was especially important to American immigrants who wished to make Arizona a state. An 1891 newspaper editorial stated: "All new buildings should be brick or stone, since it has been determined that they can be constructed at no greater cost than adobe and are just as cool. The time has come to discard mud houses and adopt the modern style."[47]

The Spanish missions of Tucson were not without their champions. Most prominent among them was Frank Lockwood, an English professor who joined the faculty at the University of Arizona in 1916. He soon took a passionate interest in local history that led him to collect reminiscences and colorful anecdotes from residents who knew Tucson before the railroad came.[48] In pursuit of interesting stories and the settings where they took place, Lockwood traveled widely across Arizona and Sonora, often in the company of other academics including the influential historian, Herbert Bolton. Sometimes these trips traced the paths of Spanish explorers such as Juan Bautista de Anza and missionaries such as Eusebio Francisco Kino.[49] The latter was clearly his favorite figure from Arizona's Spanish past. He wrote of himself that "his interest in Kino, the original pioneer, quite outstripped his admiration for Anza and his bold enterprise, great as that achievement was."[50]

---

[46] Ibid.: 429.

[47] "Brick to Last," *Arizona Daily Star*, August 20, 1891, 3.

[48] Lockwood published several collected biographies based on these interviews including *Arizona Characters* in 1928, *Tucson—The Old Pueblo* in 1930, *Pioneer Days in Arizona* in 1932, and *Life in Old Tucson, 1854-1864* in 1943.

In April 1928 Lockwood "felt a keen desire to acquaint others with the Kino mission chain and the scenic beauty of this region."[51] He arranged to bring the governors of Arizona and Sonora and Arizona's state historian along on one of his tramps to plot a tour of missions founded by Father Kino. The circuit was to begin and end in Tucson, taking tourists by automobile on a three-day tour of missions in Arizona and across the border. The *Arizona Daily Star* quoted Lockwood in full-on booster mode declaring that "the Kino missions...are more ancient, more interesting historically, and more beautiful architecturally by far than the California chain."[52] In addition to fostering cooperation between the states and bringing tourists to stay in Arizona and Sonora, Lockwood sought to

---

[49] John Bret Harte, "Frank C. Lockwood: Historian of the Southwest," *Arizona and the West* 9, no. 2 (1967): 117-18.

[50] Frank C. Lockwood, *With Padre Kino on the Trail* (Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1934), 9.

[51] Ibid., 11.

[52] "Arizonans Tour in Padre Steps," *Arizona Daily Star*, April 12, 1928, 6.

"open the way for many people to visualize the dramatic past through the study of these noble relics of Spanish architecture."[53] Yet despite Lockwood's enthusiasm and political influence, the tourist road never materialized. As Lockwood himself attested, the condition of the roads made the route difficult. In any case, the fact the project did not get much traction indicated a lack of support or interest or both for mission tourism.

Undiscouraged by the lack of success on a transnational mission road, Lockwood continued imploring the people of Tucson to embrace the Spanish past. He showed a broad awareness of the importance of the Spanish past in the developing civic identities of other cities in an article he penned for the *Tucson Daily Citizen* in 1929. He counted Tucson among "the five most important cities in America from the point of view of antiquity," along with St. Augustine, Santa Fe, San Antonio, and Williamsburg, and he asked why Tucsonans had not played up that history as the other cities had. San Antonio, he noted, "is famous everywhere for the preservation of its cherished shrine and its utilization of the glamour of the Spanish past." Santa Fe "has been preserved, or made over, until it has come to be looked upon as the most unique and appealing city in America."

Lockwood was prescient in recognizing the appeal of an exotic Spanish past, whether extracted from the built environment of the colonial era or reimagined in new buildings evoking that era. He offered three steps for Tucson to gain ground in the "utilization of the glamour of the Spanish past" based solidly in historic preservation practices. First, Tucson should "revive as many as possible of the ancient and colorful street names." Second, the people of the city should restore St. Augustine Cathedral. And, lastly, they should "place suitable brass markers on the houses that still survive from the very early American days."[54]

---

[53] Lockwood, *With Padre Kino on the Trail*, 11.

Lockwood's advocacy failed to spark a historic preservation movement along the lines of San Antonio's. Tucson's history did not bring together a group of concerned citizens, financial support from government and philanthropists, and a civic identity that valued the Spanish past. The Tucson Pressed Brick Company did not just symbolically displace the Spanish past of Arizona by providing a cheap building material. The company's operation sat on a site that included the remains of pre-Columbian villages of different eras as well as the San Agustín mission complex. The need for clay to feed the mills, presses and kilns of the brickyard ensured the demise of those structures and the visible history they represented.

San Agustín, founded in 1775, included a chapel, convento, mission, fields, and cemetery. The convento's walls stood some thirty feet tall, the top story defined by rows of arched windows that ran along every side. Abandoned sometime around the expulsion of the Franciscans from Mexico in 1828, the building faced an uncertain future. In 1852, John Russell Bartlett sketched the building and its crumbling roof while passing through on the boundary survey. Some time after, portions of the San Agustín chapel were knocked down so that the blocks could be repurposed in the construction of a homestead just south of the mission.[55] Over the decades, visitors photographed the convento as its walls eroded away. By the 1930s, a low ridge was all that remained of the convento's walls. By 1940 the clay mining of the Tucson Pressed Brick Company had obliterated most of the mission and the cemetery. The old adobes of the mission walls and the bones of Native converts buried nearby all went into the pug mill to be ground up and added to the bricks of Tucson's modern façade. In the 1950s, after the production of the Tucson Pressed Brick Company fell off, the massive holes left by its clay mining were filled with garbage when the site became a city dump.[56] The treatment of one of Tucson's most important colonial sites demonstrates that the residents who built and defined the city after the railroad's arrival sought progress over preservation.

---

[54] Frank C. Lockwood, "Tucson, Past, Present, and Future," *Tucson Daily Citizen*, March 30, 1929, 3.

The inability for a preservation movement to coalesce in Tucson as one had in San Antonio was evident in a 1932 episode. That April, an article in the *Tucson Citizen* bemoaned the loss of San Jose Mission, an adobe structure on the west bank of the Santa Cruz River a few blocks south of Congress Street. Treasure seekers hunting Spanish gold threatened the landmark in this case. Spurred by stories of Jesuit fathers who buried gold and valuables to keep them away from raiding Apaches, these urban prospectors had already caused the collapse of one wall by digging through its foundation. The article's author lamented the destruction of the "once beautiful walls" of the mission and pointed out that nothing of any value had been found through digging. The last line of the article declares that "a movement is under foot at the university to ask the city to halt the unnecessary destruction of the ruins."[57] This article, the last statement particularly, clearly defined the position of historic preservationists in Tucson. The city's residents had a sense of its Spanish past and a champion for the cause at the University of Arizona in Frank Lockwood. The San Jose mission sat a short distance from Downtown Tucson and was visible and unavoidable to most Tucsonans. The article indicates that the threat against the colonial landmark worried some residents. Yet the colonial remains of the Spanish past combined with the spark of concern evident in the letter to the *Citizen* proved insufficient to ignite a preservation movement.

---

[55] Cameron Greenleaf and Andrew Wallace, "Tucson: Pueblo, Presidio, and American City; a Synopsis of Its History," *Arizoniana* 3, no. 2 (1962): 21.

[56] Mark D Elson, William H Doelle, and Lisa G. Eppley, "Archaeological Assessment of the Mission Road Extension: Testing at Az Bb: 13: 6 (Asm)," in *Technical Report*(Institute for American Research, 1987), 7-8; Robert J Hard and William H. Doelle, *The San AgustíN Mission Site, Tucson, Arizona*, vol. 118, Archaeological Series (Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1978), 42; Diehl and Diehl, "Economics, Ideology, and the Brick Industry in Tucson," 437.

TITLE BY ANNEXATION: HISTORIC PRESERVATION IN ALBUQUERQUE

Albuquerqueans likewise failed to organize to protect the built environment of the Spanish past until more than a century after U.S. annexation. Therefore the movement falls largely outside of the purview of this dissertation. Recall that two towns named Albuquerque existed after 1880 and that residents saw a gulf between the two so broad that they considered them to be located in different countries.[58] As New Albuquerque grew into the twentieth century, developers filled the empty land above the valley with subdivisions of craftsman bungalows that declared the railroad town's American-ness. Meanwhile the Hispano descendants of the Spanish settlers as well as newcomers drawn to the center of the state's economy resided in the old villages along the river outside municipal government. Yet by the end of the 1940s, as the Hispano families of Old Albuquerque lost political clout in Bernalillo County, the figurative distance between the two Albuquerques narrowed.

---

[57] "San Jose's Walls Crumbling Under Prospector's Picks" *Tucson Citizen*, April 4, 1932, 4.

[58] See previous chapter.

The city had experienced the wave of Spanish romance that broke over the region beginning in the late-nineteenth century. Mission architecture arrived in New Town with the construction of the Alvarado Hotel adjacent to the train depot in 1902 and flourished into Moorish/Pueblo style with the erection of the Franciscan Hotel in 1923. Political elites and boosters saw a new value in the old Spanish settlements. Regarding the possibility of annexing Old Town, City Commissioner Clyde Tingley mused, "The City of Albuquerque will get a historical background of great importance.... We could advertise that the city was founded in 1706."[59] Like a nouveau riche yearning to buy a title, Albuquerque sought to become a romantic Spanish village with the right annexation. But the families of Old Albuquerque and the other villages of the valley assiduously resisted incorporation into the growing city as long as they could. The plaza of the Villa de Alburquerque was one of the last holdouts—forestalling annexation with numerous protests and legal parries until 1949.[60] The public movement of historic preservation in Albuquerque began in 1957 when the city commission created a special zoning category for historic districts specifically to control the style of building in Old Town.[61]

---

[59] "City Annexation of Old Town Urged," *Albuquerque Journal*, February 18, 1948, 1.

[60] Michael F. Logan, *Fighting Sprawl and City Hall: Resistance to Urban Growth in the Southwest* (Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1995), 115-18.

CONCLUSION

By examining the history of historic preservation across the cities of the American Southwest, the differences in civic identity and the way it shaped perception of the Spanish past in each of these places becomes clear. San Antonio stands as the center of historic preservation while Albuquerque and Tucson experienced many fewer historic preservation projects, which came decades later. This is, in part, due to San Antonio's grand missions but it also reflects different relationships between the Spanish past and modern America in each city.

A narrative that the Republic of Texas was born of blood in the Mission de Valero provided the hook for San Antonio's female elites to establish a preservation agenda. Their activity set the stage for preservationist reverence of the Spanish past in the form of the other missions and the Spanish Governor's Palace. On the other hand, the people of Albuquerque and especially Tucson turned a blind eye to the Spanish built environment of their cities. Boosters in both cities sought to establish a civic identity that emphasized American-ness and modernity over an ancient Spanish heritage.

The story of historic preservation in the American Southwest reflects the first attempts at capitalizing on the Spanish past as a unique commodity rather than dismissing it or pushing it aside. This course generally parallels that of Southern California. In both places, the exalted missions that remained from the colonial era provided the stage where the first ideas of Spanish romance could be carried out. It makes sense that the enduring built environment should provide the hook for a romantic Spanish past. After all, it was already there in the landscape, open to interpretation. The tangible reality of mission architecture came to carry such weight for the civic identity of the cities of the Southwest that the aesthetic dominated the architecture of public buildings between the 1920s and 1950s. In those decades, Anglos and Mexicanos both performed their visions of the Spanish past in colonial spaces, authentic and contrived.

---

[61] For an extended look at historic preservation in Old Town and the construction of heritage in the old plaza, see Morley, *Historic Preservation & the Imagined West*, 21-42.

CHAPTER 4: MEXICANO RITUAL AS COLONIAL TEXT

If the urban space created by colonial planning principles and the remnants of that era's built environment provided the stage upon which memory was enacted, the public rituals and pageants of the 1910s-1930s make up the performances through which Mexicanos and white Americans negotiated their relationships to the Spanish past. The second part of this dissertation considers modes of performance as vessels for memory of the Spanish past. Examining performance as negotiation of identity reveals the proliferation of meanings made of the Spanish past in the American Southwest. In different venues across the Southwest, public and private, religious and secular, wherever a performer could find an audience, that group of people explored the relationship between themselves and the past. Unlike historic preservation, a movement that required significant organizational and financial resources, performance provided a more accessible medium for expression of the past's meaning. Those interpretations multiplied even more rapidly in the early-twentieth century, a period of intense change in the Southwest. Among the historic performed expressions of the Spanish past were Mexicano religious dramas drawn from the colonial era and presented to modern audiences. This chapter takes up those performances and the contestation over their meaning.

In the late-nineteenth and early-twentieth centuries, religious dramas and dances flourished among Mexicanos in the American Southwest and the Mexican North. Dances like the Matachines and dramas like Las Posadas and Los Pastores, which originated in Central Mexico in the colonial era, had reached the northern frontier by the beginning of the nineteenth century. These rituals provided entertainment to audiences and a medium for religious devotion to performers. Usually transmitted orally from one performer to another, the scripts, music, and choreography of these rituals were colonial artifacts maintained and repurposed to serve the modern needs of Mexicano communities. By passing them along, Mexicanos in Mexico and the American Southwest have preserved these rituals to the present day.

Originally practiced in the colonial era to teach Catholic values and the meaning of holidays, these rituals served nineteenth-century Mexicanos as objects of religious devotion and entertainment. Despite the colonial provenance of these dramas and dances, nineteenth-century Mexicanos did not perform them out of a desire to preserve the colonial past; rather they used rituals derived from colonial missionary projects to forge a group identity and define the boundaries of a Mexicano homeland in the American Southwest. By defining these elements through religious ritual, Mexicanos were able to resist all-out American domination of the region and negotiate their place in the political order that emerged after annexation. These texts form a largely unexamined connection to the Spanish past maintained by Mexicanos in the American Southwest.

This chapter will juxtapose the different ways that Mexicanos and Anglos characterized religious rituals and made sense of their origins in the Spanish colonial era. While Mexicanos found a sense of identity in these rituals, Anglo observers regarded them as corruptions of a brighter age. This attitude widened the gap between the concepts of “Spanish” and “Mexican.” Mexicanos adapted the colonial texts they inherited from the Spanish era and used them to express ethnic identity, honor family, define a transnational region as a homeland, and refute economic and political domination—without drawing a sharp line between themselves and the origins of their practices. Anglo journalists and folklorists, on the other hand, denied Mexicano performers the credit of preserving colonial texts and carrying them into the modern era. By conceptually dividing "Spanish" texts from "Mexican" performers, these commentators cast Mexicanos as corrupters of their own heritage and nominated themselves to save Spanish tradition by recording and preserving Mexicano cultural practices.

LOS PASTORES: ORIGINS AND DIFFUSION

In the late-nineteenth and early-twentieth centuries, Mexicanos of the American Southwest practiced religious folkloric rituals in cities, towns and rural villages across the region. Among these were various dances, dramas, and feasts including Matachines, Los Reyes Magos, Moros y Cristianos, and Las Posadas. Los Pastores, a play about shepherds traveling to see the Christ child, was widely practiced and documented. As one commentator noted, "Just as every plaza in New Mexico has its church, its patron saint, and its fiesta, so every ranch, placita or vecindad has its 'Pastores.'"[1] The ritual was prevalent outside New Mexico too, being practiced in Mexicano communities from Texas to California and across Northern Mexico. This ubiquity fostered variation with the length of the play and the number and names of characters with dialogue differing across the drama's geographic range. Despite these variations across time and place, the common motivators of spiritual devotion and community entertainment provide a thread that linked regional performances of Los Pastores through generations. This chapter focuses exclusively on Los Pastores both because it is relatively well-documented and because its role and development mirrors other religious rituals in the Borderlands.

---

[1] Aurora Lucero-White, *Coloquios De Los Pastores (Colloquies of the Shepherds) a Centuries-Old Christmas Folk Play* (Santa Fe: Santa Fe Press, 1940), 4.

As suggested by the title (meaning The Shepherds), the main characters of all versions of Los Pastores are a number of shepherds traveling to Bethlehem to welcome the Christ child. Because the play, also known as La Pastorela, takes place during the Nativity, it was customarily performed on Noche Buena (Christmas Eve). In addition to the shepherds, Los Pastores usually features a hermit as well as supernatural manifestations of good (an angel, or specifically the archangel Michael or Gabriel) and evil (Lucifer, Luzbel, or a generic Diablo). Most likely, there never existed a canonical version of Los Pastores. Rather, the stock characters served as general types upon which each director could hang lessons about morality and devotion while entertaining audiences with contemporary jokes and asides.

The drama has no clear provenance. The most thorough study on its origins remains a 1965 monograph by folklorist Juan B. Rael. According to Rael, Los Pastores is exclusive to the colony of New Spain. Although influenced by Spanish forms and themes, it is a creation wholly of the New World. No examples of the play have been found in the other former Spanish colonies of the Caribbean or Central and South America.[2] Most plays of the colonial era, both in Spain and in the Americas were not published because printing was expensive and presses dear. These conditions muddy the drama's origins. The documentary trail of this text has also been obscured by the method of its transmission. Most performances of Los Pastores were recited from memory. Each performer learned his role orally from someone who had played it before. Generally, the play was only transcribed to facilitate its use by a troupe. The resulting transcript was a functional document that rapidly deteriorated from multiple readings and heavy use.[3] Even a half-century ago, Rael had trouble finding manuscripts of Los Pastores more than a generation old. The only source in his time, as now, for older versions of the play were those preserved by libraries or republished in journals of folklore. There exist today no copies of a Pastorela antedating the nineteenth century.

---

[2] Juan B. Rael, *The Sources and Diffusion of the Mexican Shepherds' Plays* (Guadalajara: Libreria La Joyita, 1965), 11.

These multiple factors leave a broad documentary gap for the twenty-first century historian to look back into. Those who study colonial Spanish and literature surmise that Los Pastores started in New Spain in the colonial era. Originally intended as a didactic aid for conversion of indigenous populations of Mexico, growing mestizo communities adopted the play over the eighteenth century. Once incorporated, instead of serving as a pedagogical tool of the Spanish missionaries, the Pastorela became an instrument of religious maintenance and cultural identity.[4] Thus the play changed meaning and purpose as it traveled north. Born from Spanish drama, it became a missionary production in Mexico and ultimately a folk practice in the Southwest.

---

[3] Ibid., 47.

[4] Flores, *Los Pastores (1995)*, 45.

Although local versions, performed at different times and in different sites, altered the text of the drama, Los Pastores has maintained distinctive traits of form, stock characters, and a playful air. Later iterations of the play, though varied, have enough similarities to suggest a common origin. From this conjectured starting point, it traveled to the colonial centers of ecclesiastical education at Zacatecas, Durango, and Querétaro and out to the northern frontier. By tracing textual similarities Rael was able to find three main trunks of distribution that carried Los Pastores from Central Mexico to California, New Mexico, and Texas. There, generations of Mexicanos practiced it for devotion, tradition, and entertainment, adding local color over time.[5]

Rael observed in his time a decline in the popularity and practice of Los Pastores, which he attributed to new forms of entertainment.[6] The appeal of the play had become increasingly limited and remained strongest in the more remote parts of Mexico and the American Southwest. Because of this decline, he felt that the Pastores had reached is widest geographic spread and most-complete literary development by the mid twentieth century.[7] Despite a decline from its peak of popularity in the early-twentieth century, Pastores continues to be performed today, perpetuating the colonial text ever further.

---

[5] Rael, *The Sources and Diffusion of the Mexican Shepherds' Plays*, 53.

[6] Igo seconded this in his bibliography claiming that “the young people … are scornful of the old ways and refuse to help preserve them.” John Igo, *Los Pastores: An Annotated Bibliography* (San Antonio: San Antonio College Library, 1967), vii.

[7] Rael, *The Sources and Diffusion of the Mexican Shepherds' Plays*, 43.

LA GRAN FAMILIA MEXICANA: LOS PASTORES AS CULTURAL UNIFIER

The romantic view of the Spanish past relies on images of Conquistadores, missionary priests, and Indian neophytes. These civilizing heroes have been resurrected as colorful characters to populate stories, plays, and parades. The trappings of these images—robes and swords—indicate that they are not of the modern era. This distance from the present situates the Spanish past as something distinct and separate from today, cleft from the present. Colonial texts carried forward via rituals like Los Pastores, on the other hand, form an invisible counternarrative to the larger story of Spanish commemoration.

They have escaped notice for two reasons. First, these texts come from a mostly unbroken thread of tradition. They are rituals that have been performed steadily, if not continuously, since the colonial era, but always in a contemporary (as opposed to a nostalgic) context. This makes them stick out less as resurrected elements of the colonial past because they appear to be products of the current day and the generations immediately preceding. Secondly, Mexicanos who did not leave a distinct historical trail performed them and preserved them by passing them to future generations. These performances took place in chapels, dancehalls, plazas, backyards, and a thousand other places where no one made any kind of document that could be archived and made available to us today. For every performance we have a record of, there may be hundreds more that went undocumented. Because performers of rituals such as Los Pastores did not emphasize the colonial origins of the texts they performed, these practices have come to be viewed as culture rather than commemoration. Thus, ethnographers and folklorists have studied the ritual as folk culture more often than historians have studied it as a colonial document.

Although most performances of Los Pastores went undocumented, the evidence that the ritual flourished in the late-nineteenth and early-twentieth centuries is ample. Notices of performances of Los Pastores abound in Spanish-language newspapers from the time. Any issue from the week before Christmas Eve contained notices of some troupe or another performing this colonial-era drama. For example, San Antonio's newspapers announced Pastores, "an old Mexican custom," on Christmas Eve in 1883.[8] In 1903 Albuquerque's *La Bandera Americana* announced that youth from around the plaza would be perfoming a Pastorela that Christmas.[9] In 1915, the editor of *El Tucsonense* attended the rehearsal of a Pastorela directed by José Castelan. The drama was performed at the Teatro Carmen and sponsored by the Sociedad Católica Tucsonense. This technically adept version of the play included flying snakes, floating clouds, and actors who magically disappeared.[10] Castelan staged the show at the Teatro Carmen the following year as well.[11] Such notices occurred annually, usually announcing performances of Los Pastores around Christmas. Occasionally,

---

[8] "Light Flashes," *San Antonio Light*, December 24, 1883, 4.

[9] "Pastorela," *La Bandera Americana,* December 24, 1903, 1.

[10] "Pastorela," *El Tucsonense*, December 15, 1915, 3.

[11] "Pastorela," *El Tucsonense*, December 23, 1916, 3.

Pastores was performed at other times of the year, often as a fundraiser or for the dedication of a church.

Spanish-language newspapers notified readers of performances before they happened and provided follow-up stories afterward. These newspapers document not only the prevalence of rituals like Pastores, but also why Mexicanos in the Southwest found these performances valuable and continued to perform and support them. Although it is difficult to know exactly what Los Pastores meant to the performers and audiences of a century ago, advertisements for scripts and props give an idea. Advertisements sell products by appealing to the hopes and ideals of consumers. They encourage consumers to buy by suggesting that the purchase of a product will fulfill a consumer's desire. By applying this logic to the advertisements for items necessary to perform Los Pastores that appeared in Spanish-language newspapers, we can get a sense of why the ritual mattered to Mexicanos of the American Southwest.

Advertisements for Pastores scripts were more frequent than those for props and costumes. Sometimes these were simply a line in a list of books for sale by a local dealer. More elaborate advertisements that exclusively featured Los Pastores products also ran. An example of this type appeared in San Antonio's *La Prensa* and *La Epoca* several times in the early 1920s. It was for a publisher and bookseller called "Galvancito" who was selling scripts and supplies for staging the play and for performing Las Posadas. He could supply figurines and decorative moss to dress the stage, a doll to play the role of baby Jesus, and shining cloth for making costumes.[12] The list of supplies as well as the repeated appearance of the ad indicates that, at least in Galvancito's estimation, there was a substantial market for Pastores supplies in South Texas in the 1920s.

The ads presented by Galvancito and others indicate what they sold but, more importantly, how they sold it. They catered to the desires of Mexicans to feel connected to large, trans-generational families. They also sold products by appealing to a sense of nationalism that connected Mexicanos to Mexico and defined a region within the former Mexican North as a Mexicano homeland where residents shared culture and values. One pitch described Las Posadas and Los Pastores as "dos festividades que, año por año, celebran con inusitado entusiasmo todas las clases sociales de México" (two festivals that, year after year, all the social classes of Mexico celebrate with unusual enthusiasm). These were not merely holiday traditions, they were universally-practiced rituals shared by all Mexicanos. The same ad went beyond claiming that Las Posadas and Los Pastores unified all Mexicanos to stating that practicing these rituals defined national identity and citizenship for those living across the border: "Honremos a nuestra Patria en el extranjero, conservando y propagando sus curiosas tradiciones" (We honor our homeland abroad, preserving and propagating her unique traditions).[13] A 1919 ad offering scripts for both Las Posadas and los Pastores for sale by mail from San Antonio lured readers with the hook "¿Recuerda Ud. Esta tradicional devoción de nuestra tierra?" (Do you remember this traditional devotion of our land?).[14] The language implies a connection through land and tradition shared by the Spanish speaking readers of *La Prensa*. This nationalist tone struck a chord of memory. Christmas dramas became more than a holiday tradition; they became a clear way for Mexicanos in the United States to honor and remember their cultural homeland.

---

[12] See, for example, *La Prensa,* October-December, 1920.

[13] "Preparemonos para la Noche Buena" *La Epoca,* September 26, 1920, 6.

In addition to appealing to nationalist yearning, newspapers described Mexicano rituals as a medium for connecting to the immediate past and to extended family through a continuous cultural link. The *Defensor del Pueblo*, based in Socorro, New Mexico, in a story about the Fiestas de San Lorenzo in the nearby town of Polvadera described the festival as "memorables desde tiempos prehistoricos" (memorable since prehistoric times). Additionally, the paper identified a role for the rituals associated with the festival in the immediate past. The Fiestas, a celebration of the community's patron saint were, according to the *Defensor*, carried out

> segun las tradiciones del tiempo transcurrido, y lo que nos podemos acordar desde nuestra niñez, 40, 50 años y más que nuestros padres y abuelos nos relataban, de los tiempos de las Pastorelas, zarzuelas y danzas de matachines que todavia en recientes años han puesto en escenario durante sus festividades y ceremonias religiosas" (according to the traditions of a bygone era that we knew since childhood going back forty, fifty years or more to the days of the Pastorelas, zarzuelas, and matachines dances that our parents and grandparents told us about that, in recent years, have appeared on stage during festivals and religious ceremonies).[15]

---

[14] "¡Posadas! ¡Pastorela!," *La Prensa,* October 31, 1919, 10.

[15] "La Gran Fiesta De Polvadera Se Celebrará Con Entusiasmo," *El Defensor Del Pueblo,* June 19, 1929, 4.

Los Pastores and other rituals provided a connection to the immediate past because they had been performed continuously by generations of Mexicanos. Emphasis on tradition and ancestry inscribed the performances with meaning. Another seller echoed this appeal to family ties by describing Los Pastores as a "Drama bellisimo con que se recreaban nuestros abuelos y gustará a todas las generaciones" (beautiful drama enjoyed by our grandparents and beloved by all generations).[16]

These ads make the case for the importance of Los Pastores based on its association to the extended family and immediate past. They declare that cultural practices held people of several generations together. Performers and audience both invoked respect for a tradition inherited from immediate forbears and connected to those family members through the performance. They valued these colonial era texts for their descent from living and recently departed embodiments of tradition.

In fact, evocations of family accompanied calls to nationalism so often in advertisements for Pastores materials that they often blended with each other. This rhetorical mode demonstrates how vendors commercialized tradition, family, and nation to sell materials for rituals. As one advertiser put it, the rituals around Christmas (Noche Buena, Año Nuevo, Los Santos Reyes, and la Candelaria) were the most important religious festivals "que la gran familia Mexicana celebra todos los años" (that the great Mexican family celebrates every year). Such language extends the family to envelop the nation, creating a larger

---

[16] "¡Posadas! ¡Pastorela!," 10.

Mexican family ("la gran familia mexicana") united by ritual. These statements define a national and ethnic identity rooted in consumption and performance of ritual. The ad also assured potential customers that the script offered was "la verdadera PASTORELA gustada por los Mexicanos" (The true Pastorela beloved by Mexicanos).[17] Such a concern for authenticity assumes that the potential customer is looking for a script that will be recognized and appreciated by other Mexicanos. The Pastorela is a shared part of Mexicano identity that the seller of these scripts seeks to supply. To practice and enjoy pastores is to be Mexicano.

In referring to previous generations who performed Pastores, the Spanish-language advertisements invoked family connections and, just as importantly, continuity with the past. Another 1920 ad from the publisher Galvancito demonstrates this clearly in describing Pastores as "el hermoso drama biblico que año tras año y sin interrupción se acostumbra hasta en el pueblecito más pequeño de nuestra México, sin que jamás nos fastidiemos de verlo" (the lovely biblical drama that, year to year without interruption, is seen in the smallest village of our Mexico, and yet we never tire of viewing it).[18] The publisher uses popularity as the clear hook of his ad, but the nod to continuity should not be ignored. Pastores is important because it is a tradition that has continued without interruption. Not to carry it forward might break this chain. Mexicanos living in San Antonio in the 1920s certainly encountered many changes (the Mexican Revolution, migration, modernization). Advertisers recognized this chaotic situation and sought to sell their goods by appealing to tradition and continuity.

---

[17] Ibid.

[18] "¿Quiere Ud. Pasar una agradable Noche Buena?" *El Imparcial de Texas*, November 4, 1920, 2.

The fact that cultural traditions like Los Pastores appeared alongside syrups to aid digestion and department-store holiday sales in newspaper advertisements suggests a link between culture and capitalism in the urban Southwest. Indeed, there is a dissonance to the ads proffering the traditions of generations past in mass-produced, widely distributed newspapers. The story of Mexicanos' turbulent entry into the United States of the 1920s must consider the interplay of colonial-era tradition and modern commercialism. But, the fact that some small publishers profited from the commercialization of the drama does not negate the important social and cultural function served by Mexicano performances of the ritual. While some publishers marketed scripts and sold materials for the staging of the drama, the performances themselves unfolded as a display of cultural continuity. Mexicanos built altars in their homes to show religious devotion, while the Pastores performers invested many hours in learning their parts to perform wherever an altar had been built. Audiences usually consisted of the friends and family of the performance or host. While a bit of money may have occasionally changed hands, the performances displayed religious devotion, interpersonal connection and cultural propagation. Contrast this with other performances by paid actors in a tourist venue who give a show for a paying audience with whom they have little personal connection.

In addition to defining and strengthening urban Mexicano communities, performances of Los Pastores also identified the borders of a Mexicano cultural zone located in the Southwest and northern Mexico. If, as the Spanish language press proclaimed, the performance of Pastores verified the existence of a Mexicano community, then the outline of a Mexicano region can be traced by tracking the geographic distribution of performances. Clearly, the Mexicanos of the early-twentieth century had a similar idea, as evidenced by the desire of Spanish-language newspaper readers for news of ritual performances beyond the local sphere. In August 1921 *La Prensa* informed its readers that Pastores had been performed in Los Angleles. A family by the name of Espinosa sponsored the performance to dedicate the Santa Isabel church on Boyle Avenue.[19] The paper also notified its readers that Christmas celebrations in Seligman, Arizona included two Pastorelas, one sponsored by the Ordoñez family and another for Día de Los Reyes Magos (Three Kings Day or Epiphany) by the Perea family.[20] Reports of performance of Los Pastores also came in from northern Mexico. In 1926 a notice of a performance in Nuevo Laredo, Tamaulipas (across the border from Laredo, Texas) included the names of the actors and the roles they played.[21]

Earlier cross-border connections are indicated in a San Antonio newspaper announcement that the several Pastores companies of that city would be offering a public performance of the play for twenty-five cents a head on December 28 and 29, 1891. The proceeds of "the first time that the pastores have ever consented to appear in public" supported drought sufferers in Laguna,

---

[19] "Pastorela En Santa Isabel," *La Prensa*, August 14, 1921, 13.

[20] "Las Fiestas De Navidad Entre Los Mexicanos De Seligman Arizona," *La Prensa*, January 4, 1928, 9.

[21] "Fue Celebrado El Tradicional Día De Los Reyes," *La Prensa*, January 9, 1926, 2.

Durango.[22] This charitable performance reveals several salient aspects of the ritual and its performance by late-nineteenth-century Tejanos. First, San Antonio apparently supported several companies of Pastores performers at the turn of the century. Second, these numerous dramatists used the performance not only for their own devotion but also as an entertainment and fundraiser that could be channeled to supporting compatriots in Mexico.

Newspaper announcements of ritual performances in other cities were clearly not intended to draw a visiting audience from the place where the notices ran. The appearance of notices of performances in other cities indicates a pervasive desire for news about Mexicanos in other places in the United States and along the border. The notices most often ran after the performance had occurred. The language of the announcement was also different when it came from another city. Local notices usually included some enticement to visit the performance, often extolling the particular beauty of the performance or the hard work put in by directors and actors. Notices from elsewhere did not include this information. Sometimes they conveyed the success of the performance or how much locals enjoyed it. One bit of information transmitted more frequently by the notices from abroad were the names of sponsors and actors involved in productions suggesting that readers may have been expected to recognize them by name.

Ritual performances tied people in disparate places together. The news that a Pastorela had happened some hundreds of miles away linked performers of the play with distant newspaper readers. It also defined the boundaries of a Mexicano cultural homeland by indicating where Mexicano cultural practices happened. Because the rituals were one of the defining aspects of Mexicano ethnicity, their performance in a certain place defined that place as part of a Mexicano landscape. The inclusion of names of sponsors and actors in the news also indicates a personal connection, perhaps kinship, that may have tied people together. News of ritual performances identified Mexicanos as a group through shared practices while connecting individual performers to family and peers in varied locations.

---

[22] "Public Pastores," *San Antonio Daily Light*, December 28, 1891, 1.

THE POLITICS OF MEXICANO RITUAL

Considering religious rituals without being able to observe them and interview their practitioners presents a definite difficulty to historians. We can see that they occurred, but we can only surmise the motivations behind the action and the meaning that it produced. Although the people who memorized the roles of Los Pastores and performed the drama in churches, on streets, in backyards, and in fields at the turn of the century and in the decades that followed are not available to comment on what that action meant to them, we can draw some conclusions from the fact that the action happened at all.

Mexicano ritual, as produced in the American Southwest in the late-nineteenth and early-twentieth century, had profound political implications. Anthropologist Partha Chatterjee argues that among colonized people, nationalism divides the social world into two domains: the material and cultural. As the material domain modernizes and assimilates along lines dictated by colonizing forces, the cultural domain increasingly asserts the elements that differentiate the colonized from the colonizer.[23] Although Chatterjee's work derives from India's relationship to the West, his notion of culture as resistance against domination can be transplanted to any colonial context. The point is, in a colonial society, the colonized are cut off from economic and political means of power so they turn to cultural independence as a source of strength and resistance. In the American Southwest, rituals of religious devotion served as a marker of cultural separation because religion was one of the primary differences that set colonizer and colonized apart from one another. In the late-nineteenth century, economic and political domination made the region more similar to the rest of the United States in the spheres of economy and state (both elements of the material domain in Chatterjee's reckoning). Defining difference through religious rituals like Los Pastores was an important act of resistance against material domination and homogenization.

Folklorist José Limón reinforces the idea that forms of cultural expression are often erected as defense against a changing world. This notion is based on the idea that Mexicano folklore in the borderlands is "embedded in a history of social conflict, and therefore, as a text, continually signifies and refers to the confrontation of larger social forces defined by ethnicity and class."[24] In this social confrontation, cultural expression serves as a means of resistance. Limón states:

---

[23] Partha Chatterjee, *The Nation and Its Fragments: Colonial and Postcolonial Histories* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1993), 6.

[24] José E Limón, *The Return of the Mexican Ballad: Américo Paredes and His Anthropological Text as Persuasive Political Performance*, vol. 16, Working Paper Series (Stanford: Stanford Center For Chicano Research, 1986), 12-13.

> Dramatistic and static genres may…be interpreted in a conceptual framework of resistance, although perhaps in a more indirect mode. They do not contest the social order through the direct symbolic statement of opposing values. Rather, such a generic performance offers contestation by limiting the hegemony of the dominant culture in the lives of the native population. As folk behaviors, they stand as critical alternatives to those imposed from without and from above in the social structure."[25]

In Límon's view, modern, capitalist systems have "induced folklore's decline, not by attacking the expression itself but by dissolving, fragmenting, and atomizing its nutritive social context."[26] Indeed, if we accept this conclusion to be true, then the continuation and reproduction of folkloric practices like Los Pastores, especially to the end of sociability and solidarity are a form of resistance. The performers of Los Pastores were doing no less than trying to take control of their own world amid a system that repeatedly denied them that possibility.

Anthropologist Richard Flores argues that Mexicano rituals carry meaning beyond the stories that they enact. The staging of Los Pastores, Las Posadas, or the Matachines dance is a political event that cannot be separated from the cultural politics and social identities of the time and place where they are performed.[27] Of his San Antonio-based study on Los Pastores, he remarks, "The fact that Los Pastores has been performed in South Texas by Mexicans who have been relegated to a marginal role by the social powers that be is critical to an understanding of its historical and contemporary significance."[28] This significance, he argues, lies in the contentiousness of culture in the colonial setting of the American Southwest. Cultural expressions like Los Pastores are not merely forms of entertainment or even venues to enact religious devotion. They were and are ways that a disempowered people can define themselves in opposition to a dominant culture. As Flores states, "Los Pastores, as a cultural text that has been and often continues to be performed in a social climate that is indifferent, if not antagonistic, to its cultural makeup, is an effort by its practitioners to negotiate that same environment."[29]

---

[25] "Folklore, Social Conflict, and the United States-Mexico Border," in *Handbook of American Folklore*, ed. Richard M. Dorson(Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1983), 222.

[26] "Western Marxism and Folklore: A Critical Introduction," *Journal of American Folklore*, no. 96 (1983): 40.

[27] Richard R. Flores, "Los Pastores: Performance, Poetics, and Politics in Folk Drama" (Dissertation, University of Texas, 1989), 7-12. Although Flores' work on Los Pastores is

The newspaper records of performances of Los Pastores across the borderlands in the decades following the arrival of railroad lines demonstrate that cultural expressions were just as loaded with political power then as now. The contemporary theorists cited here present a model of culture as resistance that makes sense for those who performed the play in the early-twentieth century. From the records available we can see that Los Pastores was important to these performers because it made them feel connected to one another. These connections stretched through generations, as when the San Antonio newspaper *La Prensa* identified Los Pastores as a "beautiful drama enjoyed by our

---

based on an ethnographic study of a San Antonio troupe in the 1980s, I find many of his conclusions germane to analysis of performances of the drama from farther in the past.

[28] Flores, *Los Pastores (1995)*, 8.

[29] Ibid., 9.

grandparents and beloved by all generations." They also reached across geographic boundaries such as when the same newspaper informed its Texas readers of Pastorelas performed in Arizona and California. These stories of Los Pastores, performed in the past and across the region, bound the Mexicanos of the early-twentieth century. It is in this bond that we can identify Chatterjee's cultural resistance. Los Pastores created a multi-dimensional definition of what it meant to be Mexicano. One facet of that definition was temporal. Los Pastores was important to early-twentieth-century Mexicanos because their grandparents had performed it. It is no coincidence that they inscribed this colonial era drama with meaning by associating it with a generation that lived before white Americans had come to dominate the region. The play also defined Mexicano identity regionally. The borderland citizens could identify their belonging to a larger group distributed across the Mexican North and American Southwest because they shared a cultural tradition.

A CONFUSION OF IDEAS: LOS PASTORES AS VIEWED BY ACADEMICS

The spread of Los Pastores across the American Southwest coincided with the professionalization of humanities scholarship. As anthropologists and folklorists formed professional societies and established the parameters of their fields, Mexicanos continued to perform devotional rituals to define their homeland and connect with one another. That the scholarly gaze of humanists would fall on Los Pastores was, perhaps, inevitable. What these scholars said about the ritual reveals their thoughts on the Spanish past and the ownership of culture. The academics interested in Mexicano ritual adhered to the central paradigm of late-nineteenth-century anthropology, which plotted all human societies as points of differential progress on a spectrum of cultural evolution. Western Europeans occupied the apogee in this model and anthropologists evaluated other cultures in order to determine their relative barbarity as compared to the established ideal.[30]

Two works initiated scholarly interest in of Los Pastores as practiced in the United States. Both focused on the ritual in South Texas. The first, an article entitled "The Miracle Play of the Rio Grande," appeared in *The Journal of American Folk-Lore*, published by the American Folklore Society, in 1893.[31] John G. Bourke authored the article. Born in 1846, he lied about his age to join the Pennsylvania Volunteer Cavalry when just sixteen years old. His career with the U.S. Army continued after the conclusion of the Civil War when he attended West Point. After graduation and a commission as a second lieutenant, he was posted west to serve in wars against the Apache, Cheyenne and Lakota. His time in the West saw the development of his interest in ethnology, especially among Native Americans. He kept a series of journals recording his travels and observations and serving as the basis for *Scatologic Rites of All Nations,* a comparative work published in 1891. After losing a dispute over the value of his anthropological work to the U.S. Army, Bourke's superiors punitively reassigned him to the military district of south Texas. Once there, the culture of Mexicano people piqued his ethnographic interest.[32]

---

[30] George W. Stocking Jr., *Victorian Anthropology* (New York: The Free Press, 1987), 3-6.

[31] The American Folklore Society was founded in 1888. Its formation in the late-nineteenth century was part of a larger movement of professional organization among humanities scholars that also saw the founding of groups such as the Modern Language Association (1883), the American Historical Association (1884), and the American Anthropological Association (1902). The AFS published a series was called the Memoirs of the American Folklore Society. It ran into the 1960s and covered a wide range of folkloric topics around the globe.

The second work, published by the American Folklore Society in 1907, acknowledged Bourke's article and expanded on it by presenting a complete text and translation of a South Texas Pastorela as well as compiling observations and excerpts from others in Texas and New Mexico. The book was the ninth volume in the Memoirs of the American Folklore Society series.[33] The series reflected the interest of early-twentieth-century anthropologists in the folklore of indigenous people of the United States. Indeed, other volumes in the series cover such topics as "Traditions of the Skidi Pawnee" and "Tewa Tales." Little is known about the volume's editor, M. R. Cole who appears to have not published any other works.

The writings of Bourke and Cole not only document the practice of Los Pastores in Texas and New Mexico, but also reflect the modes of interpretation favored by the Anglo academics who turned their gaze to Mexicano cultural practices at the turn of the century. These folklorists emphasized the foreignness of Pastores and the ritual's medieval origin, concluding that the performance they witnessed was a corruption of a more perfect version that existed somewhere in the colonial past. Overall, these arguments separated the text of Los Pastores from the people who preserved and performed it. This separation ultimately served to position Los Pastores as an ancient artifact of the Spanish past waiting to be retrieved, examined, interpreted and displayed by academics with the proper modern credentials.

---

[32] Joseph C. Porter, *Paper Medicine Man: John Gregory Bourke and His American West* (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1986), 17.

[33] M. R. Cole, ed. *Los Pastores: A Mexican Play of the Nativity*(Boston: Houghton, Mifflin, 1907).

Folklorists identified Los Pastores as a decidedly foreign ritual, sometimes emphasizing its Mexican aspects, other times focusing on its Spanish roots. No matter the perspective, the point was that Pastores belonged to a culture outside of the modern West and therefore fell into the purview of ethnology. Cole found that "the popular production of an old Miracle Play on American soil, at the end of the nineteenth century, is really surprising, and brings home the fact that no inconsiderable part of the population is still Mexican in everything but name."[34] Although Cole references Bourke's writings from fifteen years earlier, he expresses astonishment that rituals like the Pastorela continued to be performed in the Southwest. This demonstrates that although colonial Spanish texts persisted in Mexicano ritual, they were not widely known in the early-twentieth century, even to the folklorists who would most likely be attuned to such practices.

Cole emphasized the distance between the sentiments of modern Americans and Pastores-performing Mexicanos. "The spirit which once made all Christian Europe delight in the miracle play is extinct in our race," he declared.[35] This statement situates Mexicans not only as racially separate from Cole and his readers, but also as a premodern people perhaps related to modern Americans through a common ancestor in Christian Europe, but most certainly on a divergent and stunted branch of the family tree. The emotional impact of the drama could not apparently be felt by Anglos, who had advanced beyond Mexicanos via modernity and its rejection of religious mysticism. Other observers echoed the notion that performance of Los Pastores indicated that Mexicanos were trapped in a stage of cultural progress long surpassed by western Europeans. An early comment in the *San Antonio Daily Light* described the Pastores as “closely analogous to the Passion Play, although it is done in very primitive style” and, a year later, as “an amateur resemblance to the Passion Play.”[36] According to this formulation, Mexicano performances of Pastores were amateur, primitive copies of an ancient and superior European version.

---

[34] Ibid., ix-x.

[35] Ibid., xxxi.

This construction made it rhetorically possible to admire the devotion of Mexicanos while condemning the naivety of that devotion. A San Antonio journalist explained: “One must understand the Mexican people and their devoutness and intense religious feeling to fully appreciate how strongly the presentation of Los Pastores affects their minds. Their very souls seem poured out in their devotions.” Yet even the acknowledgement of heartfelt zeal served as ground for launching insults. As the writer concluded, Mexicanos devoted so much of their body and spirit to performing Los Pastores because “to their simple minds, heaven seems to be very near.”[37] Thus, expressing zeal for and finding delight in an ancient ritual indicated a lack of cultural progress among

---

[36] “City Local News,” *San Antonio Daily Light*, December 11, 1889, 9; “The Week’s Chapter,” *San Antonio Daily Light*, November 8, 1890, 15.

[37] “The Nativity,” *San Antonio Daily Light*, December, 23, 1891, 2.

Mexicanos.

The sense of foreignness and separation expressed by folklorists reveals how practices and rituals differentiated Americans from Mexicanos. Practicing colonial era rituals like Los Pastores, Las Posadas and Matachines inscribed Mexicanos with a distinct ethnic identity. The fact that people in South Texas remembered and performed Los Pastores is one of the things that made them Mexican. Though they may have lived in the United States, to Anglo academics their cultural practices marked them as foreigners and pre-modern throwbacks.

Many observers of Los Pastores guessed at its origins, which did not reveal the roots of the play so much as demonstrate the folklorists' ideas about the relationship of the Spanish past to the Mexicano performers before them. The colonial origins of the play became an imagined ideal against which modern performances could be judged. Some made blind gestures toward an original source somewhere in the misty past. Such was the case when the *San Antonio Daily Light* characterized the Pastores as "ancient, semi-barbaric rites."[38] Others sought a more precise geographic starting point. Bourke, for example, felt certain that the play was "beyond question, a transplantation from beyond the sea."[39] He deduced that, because many settlers of northern Mexico hailed from the Canary Islands, the play originated there.

The notion that the Pastores presented in the twentieth-century Southwest had an ancient origin in the colonial era was pervasive among white observers.

---

[38] "The Pastores," *San Antonio Daily Light*, December 11, 1897, 5.

[39] John G. Bourke, "The Miracle Play of the Rio Grande," *The Journal of American Folklore* 6, no. 21 (1893): 89.

Yet while valuing the play, they gave little credit to the dramatists who preserved it by performing it and teaching it to others over generations. “Unconsciously they present a mediaeval drama plucked from the heart of Catholic Spain and grafted in Cortez’s time upon the Aztec Branch,” declared one observer.[40] The Mexicano people who carried the ritual forward did not figure positively into the folklorist’s view. At best, they were unaware of the cultural significance of their play. They presented it “unconsciously,” without awareness of its origins or importance. At worst, they performed it improperly, corrupting the colonial ideal the folklorists imagined.

Corruption is another prominent theme in academic analyses of Pastores. In the introduction to a transcription of the South Texas version of Los Pastores, Cole judged the work to be "very corrupt, as is shown by the loose construction, the confusion of ideas, and the condition of much of the verse."[41] Clearly, the Pastores did not conform to Cole's notions of well-formed drama. The structure and verse lacked a rigidity that he wished for. The fact that he deemed the play corrupt indicates a vision of a perfect version that lay somewhere farther in the past and that had been violated by modern Mexican practitioners. This criticism echoes the narrative trope of the glorious Spanish past that had fallen to the Mexican present.

Cole returned to the theme of a fallen ideal in the concluding paragraph of the introduction to *A Mexican Play of the Nativity*. The paragraph begins with the assertion that "the crude modern performances of Los Pastores differ in different localities ... but they all seem to be as genuine professions of faith as were the splendid *autos sacramentales* of the seventeenth century."[42] Here, Cole's categorization of Spanish and Mexican and their differential valuation are clear. The modern performance is "crude" while the colonial was "splendid.” Though these are linked by a common devotional desire, the Mexican is clearly a poor descendant of a rich past.

---

[40] Ione William Tanner Wright, *San Antonio De Béxar: Historical, Traditional, Legendary; an Epitome of Early Texas History* (Austin: Morgan Printing Company, 1916), 138.

[41] Cole, ed. *Los Pastores*, xv.

In these varied ways, the performances of Los Pastores documented across the American Southwest appeared inadequate to the folklorists who observed them. Not content to observe and catalog, Bourke took a definite stance on the quality of the performances he witnessed. He described Los Pastores as a "homely, crudely constructed, but feelingly acted miracle play."[43] Bourke further characterized the action of the play as “ceaseless repetitions, and promenades and countermarches without end or object, save, perhaps, to allow each artist opportunity for a nasalized enunciation of his verses, in chant or monologue."[44] He described the music as "inferior” and found the singing “execrable.” This was because the Mexicanos of the valley were, to him, innately incapable of singing well. As Bourke said it, “the voices of the women and men of the Lower Rio

---

[42] Ibid., xxxi.

[43] Bourke, "The Miracle Play of the Rio Grande," 89.

[44] Ibid.: 90.

Grande are generally too attenuated and stridulous to be pleasing."[45] In other words, their act of devotion could not possibly produce an enjoyable and rewarding performance with any merit. Bourke, subject to the strictures of anthropology in his day, judged the quality of Mexicano culture while he documented it. It is no surprise that ethnocentrism compelled him to find abounding deficiencies.

He also savaged the "ludicrous incongruities" of the play-primarily anachronisms and geographical errors inconsistent with a group of shepherds traveling to Bethlehem on the night of Christ's birth. The hermit character, for example, carried a wooden rosary made from thread spools and a crucifix—symbols that meant nothing until after Christ's death. Likewise, the archangel Michael invoked Mary, Christ's mother, to defeat Lucifer when that name would not yet be endowed with holy significance. Bourke also found it unreasonable that the Semitic shepherds prepared tamales and tacos to sustain them on their journey.[46] These criticisms indicate that Bourke missed the point of the performance. While the South Texas Mexicanos were enacting a ritual of devotion laden with local, ethnic overtones, the army officer thought them oblivious for not doing so with historic accuracy. He makes no allowance for local adaptation, instead criticizing the performers for not producing his ideal.

Bourke also seems to have missed the subversive resistance enacted through the performances he observed. While describing the costumes of the players, he noted, “Whenever it could be done, Lucifer was dressed in the uniform of a cavalry officer.”[47] That he attributed little significance to this wardrobe decision suggests that he missed a substantial subtext to the play. Pastores incorporates playful and mocking elements in costuming and production. Certain characters, especially the hermit, customarily poke fun at the audience and make jokes about current events.[48] This mockery further reinforced a communal identity of performers and audience as they shared laughter over the absurdity and hardship of their lives. While the hermits wore simple costumes to represent their asceticism, the devils bore the most ornate and colorful garb to reflect their garish diabolism.[49] That the Mexicanos of South Texas portrayed this quality with the uniform of a United States Cavalry officer indicates a ludic and subversive approach to the occupation of their land by armed forces.

---

[45] Ibid.: 91.

[46] Ibid.

Although early anthropologists found reasons to both admire and condemn the performances of Los Pastores in the Southwest, they ultimately reached the same conclusion: primitive rituals like Los Pastores would not weather the storm of modernity and only white academics like themselves could preserve the tradition for the future. Cole stated plainly, “Even [in south Texas] the tradition may fade away, and we are sincerely grateful to the collectors who rescued these fragments of the past, before the modern spirit could sweep them away in the name of progress."[50] He offers gratitude not to the performers who preserved the play across generations but to the ethnologists who documented it in the field. Only vigilant scholars such as those members of the American Folklore Society could rescue and preserve that past. By staking a claim to preservation of culture, this idea separates performers from performance. Rather than being recognized as preservationists, those who memorized and acted out Los Pastores appear as vessels of culture. If anything, they were corrupters of a glorious Spanish past. Only modern, rational folklorists could save traditions of the past from the juggernaut of modernity upon whose back they rode. This fundamental argument undergirds the popularization of the romantic Spanish past. Culture becomes another squandered resource to be better managed, reaped and distributed by American newcomers.

---

[47] Ibid.: 90.

[48] Flores, *Los Pastores (1995)*, 57-58.

[49] Ibid., 51-52.

SPECTACLE AND RITUAL: THE ENGLISH PASTORELA

Indeed, as the early decades of the twentieth century unfolded across the American Southwest, more white academics took notice of Mexicano rituals and contemplated their status and function. The outlook of observers of the late teens and onward differed from that of the turn-of-the-century ethnographers in the value they placed on the performances as colonial artifacts. While Bourke and Cole saw modern performances of Los Pastores as poor imitations of a colonial ideal, later observers appreciated them as remnants of a premodern world that should be valued for their simplicity and purity. Despite esteeming Mexicano rituals and seeing a more continuous connection between them and the colonial era, the successors to the early ethnologists arrived at the same conclusion as their predecessors: that the rituals could only be redeemed by white Americans.

---

[50] Cole, ed. *Los Pastores*, xxxi.

Ethnologists were not the only whites in the Southwest interested in Los Pastores. The ritual engrossed people of all walks of life across the region. That performances of the play usually occurred only seasonally and in private made it all the more alluring and exotic to curious Anglos. English-language newspapers document this curiosity in articles and announcements noting the onset of Pastores season, explaining the purpose and meaning of the play and even reporting on excursions by adventurous Americans to seek out the spectacle. When these texts are juxtaposed with the Spanish-language notices of Pastores, it is clear that Anglos in the Southwest were generally oblivious to the performance or had tenuous knowledge of its practice and meaning. A San Antonio newspaper explained why this condition persisted: "it is difficult to find just where Pastores is to be held on a certain night since these simple, pious people have learned that the Americans do not always treat their drama with the respect that is due the solemnity of the occasion."[51] Pastores remained an exclusively Mexicano performance. Entirely controlling access to scripts, costumes, music, and performance space, Mexicanos were able to speak to a limited audience for their own purposes while Anglos observed performances as passive interlopers.

Among the first breaches of the exclusivity of Los Pastores came in the early decades of the twentieth century when the business and professional elites of San Antonio made the change from Pastores consumers to producers. In the fall of 1913, a group of boosters formed a committee to stage an English-language performance of Los Pastores. Why did these civic elites harbor such sentiment for a colorful local tradition? A clear motivation drove the Pastores committee. They were convinced that the Pastores, as presented in San Antonio, "has inherent wonderful possibilities in the way of becoming the foundation…for a great Christmas festival [that] will draw people from all parts of the state and thousands of tourists from other sections."[52] Rather than lamenting the threat modernity posed to a colorful tradition as earlier academics had, they saw the drama as a unique cultural and economic asset that could be developed to benefit San Antonio's tourism industry.

---

[51] "'Los Pastores,' the Passion Play of the Aztecs Will be Enacted at the Chapel of the Miracles," *San Antonio Light and Gazette*, December 18, 1910, 15.

The directors of the Pastores committee already had significant experience in creating and promoting spectacles for tourists through their involvement in the Battle of Flowers Association. Inspired by a popular Fat Tuesday flower battle that had become a tradition in Nice, France, a group of upper-class San Antonio women staged the first Battle of Flowers parade in 1891. The event commemorated the 1836 Battle of San Jacinto (when the Texian rebels aided by Tejano federalists defeated Mexican troops and secured independence for the Republic of Texas) and coincided with a visit by President Benjamin Harrison. A parade of carriages and bicycles festooned with fresh cut flowers formed near Alamo Plaza, traveled down Commerce Street and circled Main Plaza before returning to Alamo Plaza. There, the procession divided into two columns that circled the plaza in opposite directions so that the occupants of the carriages could bombard each other and the crowd of spectators with flowers.[53] The parade grew in popularity and scope over ensuing years, becoming a significant tourist draw for San Antonio by the beginning of the twentieth century.

---

[52] "'Los Pastores' a Christmas Feature in San Antonio," *San Antonio Light,* December 21, 1913, 24.

In 1909, a regal tone was added to the event when John Carrington, secretary of the San Antonio Chamber of Commerce, along with friends Franz Groos and J.H. Frost founded the Order of the Alamo, an organization of wealthy men and political elites who gathered to select a young woman to preside as queen over the Battle of Flowers.[54] The pageantry associated with festival royalty greatly contributed to the amplification of the Battle of the Flowers as spectacle and tourist event. By the twenty-first century, the changes to the Battle of Flowers begun by Carrington have transformed the event into Fiesta, a ten-day spectacle of more than two hundred events, including three parades, that draw crowds of more than two hundred thousand spectators.[55]

Carrington headed the Pastores committee and recruited numerous allies from the Battle of Flowers Association. Initially a one-off production to raise funds for the Battle of Flowers, they changed course and decided to direct all profits to future productions of the play. At the same time they formally organized a Pastores committee separate from the Battle of Flowers

---

[53] The Carnival parade in Nice also inspired the first Tournament of Roses parade in Pasadena, California, on January 1, 1890. Judith Berg Sobré, *San Antonio on Parade: Six Historic Festivals* (College Station: Texas A&M University Press, 2003), 155-59.

[54] Laura Hernández-Ehrisman, *Inventing the Fiesta City: Heritage and Carnival in San Antonio* (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2008), 49.

[55] Ibid., 3.

Association.[56] They hoped to create a midwinter attraction on the scale of the Battle of Flowers to bring tourist revenue in an otherwise slow time of the year. Carrington served as chairman of the committee with distinguished businessman and bank president Franz Groos serving as treasurer. The rest of the committee—Birdie Coleman, wife of millionaire rancher Thomas Coleman and president of the Battle of Flowers Association; banker William Herff; and Sidney Wells, manager of the Grand Opera House—constituted San Antonio's wealthy and powerful.[57] The committee funded the performance by selling subscriptions to patrons who were recognized in a souvenir program.[58] These promotional techniques changed the nature of Pastores performances even more than the English translation.

While the religious themes remained in the Christmastime drama, it took on an entirely different function. Rather than being a community building function, it became a tourist draw. The fundamental change lay in the relationship between performers and audience. Traditional performances of Pastores occurred wherever the faithful built an altar. The performance provided proof of devotion for both the performers and the sponsor. When the play was moved to an opera house and performed for a paying audience, it transformed from ritual to spectacle. A ritual is performed for the spiritual benefit of those who take part while the purpose of spectacle is the performance itself. Rituals are performed to be participated in; spectacles are performed to be watched.

---

[56] "Los Pastores Will Be Made Annual Event," *San Antonio Light*, December 7, 1913, 20.

[57] "'Los Pastores' a Christmas Feature in San Antonio," *San Antonio Light*, December 21, 1913, 24.

[58] "Work Proceeds on Christmas Drama," *San Antonio Light*, December 14, 1913, 8.

Despite their vision of Los Pastores as an exotic practice that had the potential to draw thousands, the Pastores Committee did not believe the script of the drama was accessible enough. One representative stated that, as the committee saw it, "Los Pastores has many dramatic elements and with a little pruning and rearranging it may constitute a dramatic performance that, to the non-religious eyes of the layman, is well worth seeing."[59] Thus, the committee worked on the unpolished gem that was Los Pastores to make it suitable for a broad English-speaking audience, largely by excising the accumulated local color added by Mexicano folk in its retelling over generations. This compulsion to edit and rearrange the play in order its value harkened back to the anthropologists who saw a Spanish ideal behind the Mexican performance. By taking the drama away from the performers who preserved it and diluting the religious devotion inherent in the laborious process of learning and performing the play, the Pastores Committee sought to transform the tradition while displacing Mexicano performers from its meaning and significance.

Notwithstanding the efforts of the Pastores committee, the English version of the play did not become the center of San Antonio's winter tourist season. Although they expressed, with typical booster zeal, certainty that the 1913 performance would make enough money to endow future performances, there is no mention of an English version of the play in subsequent years. By 1922, in fact, the *San Antonio Express* recommended traditional performances of Pastores as a local attraction that residents should take visitors to see. “Very few tourists ever have seen ‘Los Pastores,’” the newspaper observed, “or know what it means, and there is not facility for their seeing the play.”[60] Apparently, the Pastores Committee made very little impression. A decade after their efforts, Pastores was still seen as a peculiar custom transpiring on the edges of English-speaking San Antonio.

---

[59] "'Los Pastores' to Be Staged in English," *San Antonio Light,* December 1, 1913, 3.

PASTORES AS ANTI-MODERN REDEMPTION

Anglo American interest in Los Pastores continued in the years after World War I. The modern bohemians who gathered in New Mexico’s artists colonies after the war certainly knew about the drama. By the time of their arrival, it had rippled through academic and popular publications and it resonated with their desire to bypass modernity via aesthetics rooted in premodern cultures. Novelist and writer Mary Austin, who joined the cadre of authors and artists centered in Taos and Santa Fe in 1924, identified Los Pastores as a particularly beautiful expression of colonial Spanish spirituality. In a 1927 article, “Native Drama in Our Southwest,” she defined the elements of the ritual that made it so appealing; “Such plays as ‘Los Pastores’…show literary quality with an explicit folk flavor, and such variations of style and handling as suggest Colonial origins.”[61] The drama charmed her less for its content and more for the time and people it came from: Spanish folk of the colonial era. The foreign and ancient origin of this relic fascinated Austin. She believed that ancient rites performed by Mexicano and Pueblo people would provide

---

[60] “Give Visitors Something to Talk About When They Go Home, ” *San Antonio Express*, December 17, 1922, 33.

[61] Mary Austin, "Native Drama in Our Southwest," *The Nation*, April 20 1927, 437-38.

> the securest groundwork for a type of dramatic writing which will be inevitably fitted to carry all that the Southwest has to express. In so doing it will probably be found to be more expressive for what we call American uses...than anything derived from purely Nordic sources, such as Greek and Elizabethan playwriting.[62]

The search for a more indigenous American aesthetic experience drove Austin and others like her to the West. In Los Pastores, she recognized the object of this search, foreign and exotic yet relatable enough to resonate with her ideals. Her outright declaration of its superiority directly contradicts the assumptions of earlier anthropologists. Rather than finding fault in the folk characteristics of the play, she praises them as the most valuable elements. Perhaps Los Pastores could be the cultural artifact that defied modernity to redeem high culture from it.

Despite her wish that ancient ritual might enlighten modern Americans, Austin acknowledged the plight of colonial Spanish culture at the brink of modernity. She observed that Penitente passion plays in New Mexico were "now so rapidly disappearing before the assaults of the of the bargain-counter spirit which incites Americans to rush in wherever there is a rumor of beauty and strangeness, to tear it to tatters of sensation."[63] Thus, while she valued Mexicano culture more highly than early anthropologists like Bourke, she reached a similar conclusion; the pressures of modern life would surely overcome these practices.

---

[62] Ibid., 440.

[63] Ibid., 438.

Indeed, the fear that Spanish and Indian beliefs would soon be lost inspired the preservationism that ran through her writing.

Yet Austin's adulation of Los Pastores was not entirely selfless. While the colonial roots of dramas like Pastores tickled her anti-modernist fancy, she placed her own interests at the center of her cultural advocacy. She, like other bohemian refugees from the industrialized United States, believed they held salvage title to New Mexico's "beauty and strangeness." Only aesthetes of the proper training and perspective could understand these valuable artifacts and preserve them from further damage. Austin epitomized this paternalistic attitude when she founded the Spanish Colonial Arts Society in Santa Fe in 1932. She held the conviction that the preservation of Hispanic art forms in New Mexico depended on the Society. Thus, when she stated that "the emergence of a native Southwestern drama is only a matter of a little time and intelligent fostering," she clearly meant that she and her allies would provide the intelligence and fostering.[64]

The Mexicano preservationists whom she so admired for maintaining religious traditions in the face of cultural colonialism held no part in her plan for future preservation. She makes her position on the importance of their devotion clear in concluding the essay. She explains, "The whole history of plastic art goes to show that the only way any of it was ever incorporated into the evolutionary history of culture was to cut it out cleanly from the creedal and mythologic root."[65] Dramas like Los Pastores could not have a significance outside of their parochial use unless stripped of religious meaning and recontextualized as art for art's sake. Certainly, this could not have been a job Austin intended for Mexicano devotees. She would surely nominate organizations of white aesthetes like her Spanish Colonial Arts society as best suited to that purpose. Ultimately then, Austin reached the same conclusion as early anthropologists by a different route. Spanish colonial rites like Los Pastores could only be preserved by separating them from Mexicano performers and turning them over to white caretakers.

---

[64] Ibid., 441.

CONCLUSION

Considering religious rituals as colonial texts reveals that, across the Southwest, Mexicanos leaned on the Spanish past and its implied connection to family and tradition to help interpret their place in the modern United States. The drama constituted a cultural patrimony that tied Mexicanos to one another across a broad geographic expanse and to forbears across the span of generations. While sold as a commodity via modern media, the performance of the drama created counternarratives to American political and economic domination of the region.

Anglo observers assigned different values to the Mexicano Pastores ritual according to their time and position. The earliest mentions in English newspapers cast it as a mysterious and elusive rite performed in closed communities on cold winter nights. The first academics to record the ritual saw it as a crude rendering of a golden ideal. Later writers and boosters found cultural and monetary value in the ritual and its survival in the Southwest. Regardless of their different assessments, these observers are united in the distance they forced between the performance (and performers) of Los Pastores and the modern world. At the root of their appraisal of Pastores always sits the presupposition that, as performed by Mexicanos, the play is not a modern practice. In 1910, the *San Antonio Light* described this distance bodily: "Standing aside from modern civilization and traveling backward to the barbaric, primitive childhood of the race, the student will understand the charm and the enchantment, the psychological and religious study that is embraced in the simple, sacramental drama." [66] The only way to comprehend the drama is to step outside modern thought and take on a more primitive frame of mind. For Bourke and Cole, this distance implied that the primordial Southwest must lamentably but inevitably perish beneath the pressures of the modern world. Carrington and Austin sought financial and social profit in bridging the distance between colonial artifact and modern audience. All cases included the necessary stipulation that Pastores be valued only inasmuch as it is separated from Mexicano performers. By distancing Mexicano performers from their performance and denying them credit as preservationists, Anglo observers of Los Pastores reinforced the rupture between the Spanish past and the modern Southwest while transforming Pastores from a participatory, unifying ritual into a cultural fetish for their consumption.

---

[65] Ibid.

While folklorists of the late-nineteenth and early-twentieth century did not express explicit opposition or hostility to performances of Los Pastores, their comments make it clear that they viewed the practice as a corruption of a more perfect original that had existed in a distant time and place. Claiming that it was the duty of folklorists and ethnographers to preserve this cultural artifact made the charge of corruption even more egregious. By casting the tradition that Mexicanos had carried forward from the colonial era through memorization and oral transmission as a distortion, these critics tried to drive a conceptual wedge between the brilliant Spanish past and the decadent Mexican present perpetuating the tropes initiated by the reorientation of the Black Legend. This bifurcation would prove to be an essential distinction for further celebration and commemoration of the Spanish colonial era in the American Southwest.

---

[66] "'Los Pastores,' The Passion Play of the Aztecs Will be Enacted at the Chapel of the Miracles," *San Antonio Light and Gazette,* December 18, 1910, 15.

CHAPTER 5: PAGEANTRY

A craze for pageants--commemorative, outdoor, community-produced spectacles depicting historic scenes--swept the United States in the first decades of the twentieth century. People across the country clamored to commemorate local history by writing a script, assembling a troupe and building a stage (or hiring a professional from a thriving pool of pageant makers to do it for them). The trend reached the American Southwest by the 1930s and continued on for more than a decade. Since the pageants focused on local color and history, those produced in Tucson, Albuquerque, and San Antonio prominently featured the Spanish colonial era. The lively performances touted the romantic glory of the Spanish past while underscoring the triumphant ascent of the United States over the American Southwest. The era of pageantry marks an apogee of romantic retellings of colonial history and the closest affinity between white elites and imagined Spanish valor.

The pageantry era also denotes the arrival of a regional consensus on the elements that represented the Spanish past in the American Southwest and how that history set the region apart from the rest of the nation. Pageants cemented the missionary and the conquistador as quintessential Spanish types that served as recognizable symbols of regional identity. While these types played prominent roles in stories about the Spanish past over the previous half century, the spectacle delivered through pageants broadened the exposure of these characters and made them visual icons of the Spanish past.

NEW PAGEANTRY IN THE UNITED STATES

Pageants tied to religious and secular festivals have a long history extending back to medieval liturgical drama and the Renaissance masque as well as various modes of carnival performance. Medieval Britons produced and viewed pageant processions during merrymaking for May Day, Midsummer and Halloween among other ritual holidays, for example. These occasions for feasting, drinking, and sexual license expressed and reinforced community identity. The pre-modern pageant, a plebeian entertainment associated with ritual revelry, only added to the merriment of these occasions.[1]

While pageantry's name and aspects of communal performance draw from premodern roots, it took on a different meaning with the arrival of the twentieth century as the form focused on community performances staged for entertainment and education. Quite apart from unprincipled medieval ribaldry, British dramatists blended history, allegory and spectacle in grand performances that dramatized the history of a locality.[2] This "New Pageantry" sought to inculcate its audience with morality and patriotism.[3] In order to reach massive audiences the New Pageantry produced imposing shows on immense stages. One proponent of New Pageantry defined "the real pageant" as an event "given out of doors, its spectators number thousands...the stage is as vast as the eye can reach and the production aims to reproduce actuality rather than illusion."[4] In addition to their grand scale, these pageants also usually commemorated the anniversary of a date significant to the locality, often the founding of the place or establishment of government. These full, half, and quarter century anniversaries became rallying points for communities to mark the occasion with a pageant that demonstrated the history of their locality and how greatly they had progressed there.

---

[1] Two standouts in a broad literature on this subject are David Underdown, *Revel, Riot, and Rebellion: Popular Politics and Culture in England, 1603-1660* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1985). and Ronald Hutton, *The Rise and Fall of Merry England: The Ritual Year, 1400-1700* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1994).

[2] Helen McCarthy, "The League of Nations, Public Ritual and National Identity in Britain, C.1919–56," *History Workshop Journal* 70, no. 1 (2010): 114.

[3] David Glassberg, *American Historical Pageantry: The Uses of Tradition in the Early Twentieth Century* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1990), 43.

The first significant production of New Pageantry, written and directed by Louis Napoleon Parker, commemorated the twelve hundredth anniversary of the founding of Sherbourne, a village in Warwickshire, England, in 1905. The pageant reenacted a series of dramatic episodes from the town's past in front of the ruins of Sherbourne castle. Parker characterized his pageant as starkly anti-modern, describing it as a means to counter the "modernising spirit which destroys all loveliness and has no loveliness of its own to put in its place."[5] Historian David Glassberg elaborated on this sentiment, pointing out that, "historical pageantry flourished at the intersection of progressivism and antimodernism and placed nostalgic imagery in a dynamic, future-oriented reform context."[6] The Sherbourne pageant attracted a large audience and turned a profit for the organizers. Parker's style of performance, a blend of stage drama and outdoor procession, proved capable of drawing large crowds. He was soon engaged to create community productions in Warwick, Bury St. Edmunds, Dover, York and Colchester. Over the next decade, the popularity of New Pageantry spread in the U.S. along with Parker's fame. An American manual from 1912 on staging pageants lauded him as "inventor and founder of modern pageantry whose...pageants have exceeded all others in beauty and literary quality."[7]

---

[4] Esther Willard Bates, *Pageants and Pageantry* (Boston: Ginn and Co., 1912), 7.

[5] Glassberg, *American Historical Pageantry*, 44.

[6] Ibid., 5.

By the 1910s, the United States had also, as one contemporary writer noted, "gone pageant mad."[8] The success and civic idealism of Parker's work in Britain inspired American imitators. Pageants became so widespread that pageant makers incorporated the American Pageant Association in 1913 to establish standards for the disparate artists and directors behind the movement. The APA also sought to guide the development of pageantry in the U.S. through publications, training programs and professional certification for pageant masters.[9] The organization of the APA reflects a high point in pageant production in the East and Midwest. In the decade following the organization's founding, hundreds of groups staged pageants using their materials and certified professionals. Some of these productions were hugely successful like the 1914 Pageant of St. Louis, which attracted a nightly audience of one hundred thousand. Inspired by such sensations, numerous cities and small towns planned to stage their own community dramas celebrating local history.

---

[7] Bates, *Pageants and Pageantry*, 4.

[8] Adelia Belle Beard, "The American Pageant," *American Homes and Gardens*, July 1912, 239.

[9] Glassberg, *American Historical Pageantry*, 108-09.

New Pageantry also grew in popularity by incorporating the reform ideals of the day. A call for social reform and optimistic belief in social change through democratic cooperation reflected the confidence and positivism of the Progressive Era. Many American devotees of pageantry saw the form as a supreme combination of art and democracy. They aligned their efforts with larger reform movements in education and urban life to emphasize the political impact of pageantry. Pageants could harness the "play instinct" and teach urban citizens about the past while organizing them to cooperatively improve themselves and their communities. Progressive idealists saw this as a pure embodiment of locally-grown democracy and populist reform. An organizer of St. Louis' massive and popular Pageant and Masque identified the egalitarian attitude behind the movement: "The spirit of the playground, arch-enemy of caste, was the germ that animated the thought of this municipal art into life." The democratic underpinnings of pageantry "[bound] the people more closely in an understanding of their power and civic obligation."[10] This political aspect of pageantry came through in ubiquitous themes of unity and improvement as well as in productions addressing Progressive Era issues including Women's suffrage, racism, and labor.[11]

---

[10] St. Louis Pageant Drama Association, *Pageant and Masque of Saint Louis 1914: Reports of the Chairmen of Committees* (St. Louis: Shelly Print, 1916), 5.

[11] 1913 alone saw the production of the National Women Suffrage Pageant, the Paterson Strike Pageant and the Star of Ethiopia Pageant staged as part of the NAACP's commemoration of the fiftieth anniversary of the Emancipation Proclamation. Sarah J. Moore, "Making a Spectacle of Suffrage: The National Woman Suffrage Pageant, 1913," *Journal of American Culture* 20, no. 1 (1997): 90.

Pageant makers sought to teach moral, patriotic lessons through a controlled version of the history of their locality. To that end, they presented stirring and unambiguous scenes that appealed to a wide audience and incorporated multiple groups of citizens. Children and immigrants were especially targeted as audiences for the moral and patriotic lessons of the pageants. Despite the democratic ethos underlying New Pageantry, it should not be viewed as empowering the increasingly diverse urban citizenry of the early-twentieth century. As historian Charles Montgomery explains: "At a time when American cities were fractured into competing ethnoracial blocs, the prewar pageants portrayed a unified civic culture. What audiences did not see was the behind-the-scenes leadership of an Anglo-American elite, whose interests were inevitably served by whatever civic unity was achieved."[12] Pageants in the American Southwest adopted this broad view of history, often beginning with Native American settlements and including recent influxes of immigrants. Likewise, they did so to project a narrative of progress that celebrated the elite organizers and supporters of the pageants who sat at the pinnacle of modern progress.

After World War I, pageant makers largely abandoned the progressive ideals that drove their efforts before the war. The meteoric rise of the film industry diminished popular interest in pageants as a form of expressive art for the masses while wartime propaganda turned attention away from local histories to a broad national patriotism.[13] Pageant makers persisted in a less idealistic vein after the 1920s. In this era, the pageantry movement blossomed in the Southwest. The art form worked brilliantly as a promotional tool that capitalized on the spectacular, romantic vision of the Spanish past that had developed over previous decades. By the 1930s, audiences recognized the pageant as a form of public celebration and civic engagement through theater. Boosters of the region clamored to stage ever-larger productions that touted their cities and their particular version of history while drawing large crowds to view the spectacle. An infrastructure of dramatists and theatrical supply companies that had grown up during the prewar pageant boom provided the material and technical expertise to support boosters' grand visions.

---

[12] Montgomery, *The Spanish Redemption*, 134.

THE SAN ANTONIO BICENTENNIAL

San Antonians heartily embraced pageantry to bolster their city's civic identity as the movement swept across the Southwest in the mid to late 1930s. Pageantry came to the cities of the Southwest nearly at the same time because it arrived as a recent fad from the East and Midwest when all the cities valued their Spanish origins to approximately the same degree. This meant that major civic organizations across the region were eager to promote the Spanish past in their cities and nearly all chose to do so by staging a pageant. Yet it is worthwhile to begin our examination of pageantry in San Antonio because, as the previous chapters have shown, by the 1930s San Antonio had developed a civic identity based in part on its Spanish history and had a cadre of politicians, boosters, and philanthropists interested in promoting that identity. Sure enough, that promotional apparatus found good reason to stage pageants in the city in the 1930s.

---

[13] Glassberg, *American Historical Pageantry*, 231.

The pageantry movement in San Antonio arrived on the back of an altogether different mode of celebrating the Spanish past. In early 1929, a group of civic and business leaders formed the Mission Road Improvement League (MRIL) with the goal of creating a Mission Road that connected San Antonio with the Concepción, San Juan, and San Francisco de la Espada missions to the southeast of the city. After a year's work, the MRIL had persuaded the city government to change the name of South Loop and Concepcion roads to Mission Road. They sought more than this symbolic change, however, hoping to widen and beautify the roadway. This goal required both funds for landscaping and garbage removal, and a legal right of way from landowners along the road.

The road project coincided with the rise of automobile tourism to and through San Antonio. Improving the road to the missions, the most visited tourist attractions outside the city, made economic sense and placed the Spanish past, once again, at the center of city boosterism. A writer for the *San Antonio Express* reporting on the project declared the missions "among the community's most valuable possessions," further noting that "as a tourist attraction alone they are worth preserving and providing with suitable approaches and environment. As things of beauty in themselves, the Missions are to be appraised higher still; but as a spiritual heritage, these ancient, crumbling edifices are altogether priceless."[14]

Certainly, the portrayal of Spanish missions as decaying ruins of a golden era was nothing new. As demonstrated by the attempt at an English Pastorela and the rise of historic preservation, romance colored the popular view of the Spanish past in San Antonio by the 1930s. This colorful cast proved successful in luring tourists to visit those relics of romantic days gone by while distinguishing San Antonio from other Texas cities. The MRIL's timing was not accidental, however. They began planning the road project in anticipation of a metric moment. The year 1931 would mark the two hundredth anniversary of the relocation of Concepción, San Juan, and San Francisco de la Espada missions from East Texas to the San Antonio River valley. A road improvement project provided needed jobs while perking up the city, but this venture was about more than Depression-era economics. The MRIL sought not only to improve the road to the missions but to use the timing of their project to raise funds and heighten the missions' attractiveness to tourists.

Since the anniversary of the missions' relocation occurred in the midst of the pageant movement, the road project was soon wedded to historic drama. In July 1930 the *San Antonio Express* reported that the MRIL had "tentatively...agreed that a pageant should depict the founding of the Missions and other dramatic incidents of San Antonio's life two centuries ago."[15] Evidently, the MRIL sought to elevate the profile of the missions in the minds of San

---

[14] "Conditions Along the Mission Road," *San Antonio Express,* July 31, 1930, 8.

[15] Ibid.

Antonioans through reenactment of their founding nearby. The MRIL recognized a bicentennial pageant as the ideal way to catch the swell of civic pride and historic awareness emphasized by the pageant movement.

As it happens, 1931 marked two bicentennials for San Antonio. In addition to the relocation of the missions, 1731 also saw the arrival of sixteen families recruited from the Canary Islands to settle near the presidio. These settlers founded San Fernando de Béxar immediately east of the presidio toward the river and Mission Valero. By the end of 1930, the Mission Road project faded in importance while the commemoration of the Canary Island settlers became the central theme of the bicentennial celebration and its pageant.[16] The MRIL lost more ground in early 1931 when the commissioners of Bexar County declared that the Mission Road widening project could not possibly be completed in time for the bicentennial celebration because of difficulties in obtaining the proper right of way. Despite the disappointment brought on by the failed road project, the MRIL reorganized to devote its energies to staging a pageant commemorating the missions.[17]

As the bicentennial celebration expanded beyond improvements of the mission road, a new organization called the Committee of One Hundred supplanted the MRIL as event planners. Edward Heusinger, a "leader for years in the local scientific circles" and amateur historian, founded the Committee in the summer of 1930 to "create 'something different,' a celebration quite characteristic of San Antonio and worthy of its romantic origin and glorious history."[18] Several other city elites with an interest in the history of Spanish Texas formed the founding membership of the Committee of One Hundred including Willard Frances Scarborough and Adina de Zavala.[19] In early 1931 the Committee hired Coates Guinn to produce a pageant for the bicentennial and planned for another pageant, "Birth of San Antonio," to be directed by Merrill Bishop, assistant director of junior education in the city's public schools.[20]

---

[16] "Eminent Guests of the San Antonio Bicentennial," *San Antonio Express,* December 9, 1930, 8.

[17] "Mission Road Work Cannot Be Done by March 5," *San Antonio Light*, January 13, 1931, 10.

The founders built a very broad and well-ordered organization charged with lofty goals. In addition to the group handling the pageants, they also formed a spate of subcommittees for religious celebration, education, civic affairs, commemorative medals, beautification, among others. At the beginning of 1931, the Committee occupied a suite of offices in the National Bank of Commerce Building, indicating both their increased planning responsibility and their profound interconnection with San Antonio's business elite.[21]

Even at the earliest suggestions of a bicentennial commemoration, a pageant took center stage. The *San Antonio Express* stated "among the impressive features already proposed is a pageant depicting San Antonio's beginnings and the founding of the Missions." The editorial assured readers that "the bicentennial observance will revive something of the city's glorious past and bring it added renown."[22] The committee planned a six-day program including at least three pageants: a drama featuring the city's founding; a school children's pageant featuring the arrival of the Canary Islanders; and a religious pageant on the founding of the three missions south of San Antonio. These pageants harkened back to the prewar pageants staged to boost local pride through dissemination of a controlled, positive version of the past. The official program promised, "By awakening a dormant historical sense, the celebration surely will enable thoughtful San Anotonians to see their city in longer perspective, and thereby better to appreciate the elements which enter into its busy life of today."[23] Yet these lofty goals did not eclipse the economic stakes that also drove city leaders. Mayor C. M. Chambers anticipated fifty thousand visitors to San Antonio for the bicentennial. In a plea for private contributions to the event, he gushed that it would be "one of the greatest celebrations in the history of the Southwest."[24]

---

[18] "Distinctive Events of the San Antonio Bicentennial," *San Antonio Express*, October 23, 1930, 14.

[19] The Committee of One Hundred's charter was signed by Heusinger, Scarborough, de Zavala, General B.B. Buck, Frost Woodhull, and Mrs. E.O. Saratt. "Bi-Centennial Celebration Plan Begun Two Years Ago," *San Antonio Express,* March 1, 1931, 2a.

[20] Clara Caffery Pancoast "Celebration Will Mark Era In History," *San Antonio Light,* January 11, 1931, Society, Music, Clubs & Clubwomen section, 1.

[21] "Bi-Centennial Celebration Plan Begun Two Years Ago," *San Antonio Express,* March 1, 1931, 2a.

The fortuitous coincidence of San Fernando's founding and the relocation of the three missions from East Texas in the same year gave the planners of San

---

[22] "Organizing for the San Antonio Bicentennial," *San Antonio Express*, September 14, 1930, 8a.

[23] "Bicentennial Program--The San Antonio Perspective," *San Antonio Express,* January 27, 1931, 10.

[24] "Catholic and Protestant Prelates Join Hands in Drive to Promote Success of Bi-Centennial Festival," *San Antonio Express*, December 17, 1930, 16.

Antonio's bicentennial celebrations numerous episodes from the Spanish past to commemorate. From the beginning, the planners of the bicentennial collapsed the founding of San Fernando and the relocation of the Missions into a single story. This made sense logistically; it was easier to plan a single slate of events. It also allowed the stories of disparate events to feed into one another and create a single point of Spanish origin for 1930s Texans to look back at. The *San Antonio Express* noted the mutual promotion achieved by the commemoration: "More people than ever before will visit [the missions] now that the bicentennial program calls [them] to public notice."[25]

As the event grew, it came to encapsulate a range of public ceremonies not necessarily tied to anything that happened two centuries before. Among these incongruities were the dedication of the Spanish Governor's Palace (constructed in 1749), a "Texas Heroes Day Pilgrimage to the Alamo" led by the Daughters of the Republic of Texas, and memorial services at the grave of Ben Milam, martyr of the 1835 siege of Bexar. By the time the bicentennial arrived, it represented all of San Antonio's Spanish and Mexican past collapsed to a single point. The planners of the event used this simplified origin to promote the bicentennial as a commemoration of the city's past, broadly considered.

Even as the Committee of One Hundred planned the commemoration of "two hundred years of civil government in San Antonio", they readily acknowledged that Spaniards settled in the city prior to 1731. As students of the history of Spanish Texas, Heusinger, Scarborough, and the other members of the committee knew well that the Mission San Antonio de Valero and the presidio San Antonio de Béxar had been established in the valley in 1718. Yet they celebrated the arrival of the Canary Islanders as the beginning of the city because the pageantry associated with the approaching bicentennial trumped historic facts. Having a metric moment to rally around was more important than a strict accounting of chronology. The editor of the *Express* resolved the discrepancy by ignoring it altogether. After noting that the area covered by San Antonio had Spanish settlers before 1731, he concluded that "in any event, San Antonio is entitled to rank among the oldest cities in this country."[26] Boosters like the one writing for the *Express* sought to mine the past for its value in the present regardless of strict historic veracity. One editorialist made the history as income equation clear, "this city should cherish its history and traditions, that it may profit most from past achievements." [27] The bicentennial and accompanying pageants were not just reenactments of the past meant to entertain a curious audience. They aimed to transform history into profits, both in cash and prestige.

---

[25] "Think," *San Antonio Express*, November 20, 1930, 1.

Indeed, the age of the city, as compared to others in the U.S., became a distinction to be celebrated during the bicentennial. The boosters planning the bicentennial recognized San Antonio's Spanish past as a valuable resource. In order to exploit that resource, they crafted a narrative connecting past and present. For example, the *Express* published a story on the eve of the bicentennial noting that “San Antonio has had a municipal government which is beyond a doubt one of the longest continuous city governments in America." This narrative depended on an imagined genealogy that made the 1930s city commission the descendant of the cabildo established by the Canary Islanders.[28] In this way, the elites planning the bicentennial positioned themselves as heirs to the Spaniards who established San Antonio. Their inheritance did not come by blood but through connection to local government.

---

[26] “Organizing for the San Antonio Bicentennial,” *San Antonio Express*, September 14, 1930, 8a.

[27] Ibid.

In fact, San Antonio's boosters used the city's age to inflate its value relative to other cities. This occurred frequently in reference to the upcoming World's Fair in Chicago. The fair would not open until 1933, but its planning began in 1928 and by 1930 it had already been well-publicized. The Century of Progress, as the fair was known, would commemorate the centennial anniversary of the incorporation of the City of Chicago. Despite the fact that Chicago's exposition was orders of magnitude larger than San Antonio's celebration, the shared commemoration of city origins encouraged observers to draw comparisons. San Antonio's boosters often cited the fact that the presidio and mission antedated the villa by more than a decade, making San Antonio more than a century old when the town of Chicago was organized. The *Express* staked the city's claim boldly: "the two commemorative events stand in contrast, and set into relief San Antonio's rank among the country's older cities."[29] The past became a commodity for San Antonio's boosters. If they could not boast the commercial might or stream of visitors that Chicago did, they could fall back on the city's ancient roots and they took every opportunity to do so.

---

[28] "City Government Among Oldest" *San Antonio Express,* March 1, 1931, 2a.

[29] "Bicentennial Program--The San Antonio Perspective," *San Antonio Express*, January 27, 1931, 10.

While boosters used the city's age as an asset, they had to face the issue of religious difference. In commemorating the bicentennial, San Antonio's white, Protestant elites found themselves celebrating the establishment of three Catholic missions, a tough sell in the 1920s. As plans for the bicentennial came together, Rev. W. T Capers, bishop of the Episcopal diocese, eliminated such suspicions. He saw no conflict in his support for the bicentennial celebration: "We Protestants have been given an opportunity to help in making this a great patriotic event commemorating the 200th anniversary of the city's founding." Note Capers' deft reframing of the occasion. He ignores the missions' founding and identifies the bicentennial of the founding of San Fernando as a patriotic occasion. In Capers' view, the Spanish Catholic roots of the city mattered less than its American present. He rallied San Antonio's citizens by assuring them that their city's Catholic past would not trouble the present: "it is history that Catholics discovered this, the paradise of America...San Antonio belongs to all of us and we should all do our part in putting the bicentennial over big."[30] Thus the Catholic missions and frontier villa founded before George Washington was born came to be celebrated as the secular beginning of an American city.

Capers' approach to defusing any discontent over the Catholic beginnings of San Antonio demonstrates how pageants diluted historical events to fit the American present. He characterized the central role of Spanish missions in settling Northern New Spain as "history," meaning something that is off in the past and a mere curiosity to modern people. He emphasizes that San Antonio now belongs to all citizens. These two statements mirror the general form taken by the pageants of the 1930s. They offered historical vignettes that ultimately celebrated the modern people producing and watching them.

---

[30] "Catholic and Protestant Prelates Join Hands in Drive to Promote Success of Bi-Centennial Festival," *San Antonio Express*, December 17, 1930, 16.

San Antonio's foray into the pageantry movement arrived hand in hand with commemoration of the Spanish past. Through pageantry and commemorative festival, San Antonians forged a civic identity based on the colonial past of their city. They used this long past to call attention to their progress into the twentieth century. By celebrating the colonial Spanish settlement, they promoted their city as a modern American metropolis destined for greatness. In the next few years, the central city of New Mexico would adopt a similar narrative and promotional tactic.

ALBUQUERQUE'S GOLDEN JUBILEE

"Indications are that the city will be jammed with visitors," the *Albuquerque Journal* promised on July 4, 1935. The crowds flocking to New Mexico's metropolis came for Albuquerque's Golden Jubilee, a celebration of the fiftieth anniversary of the city's incorporation. The celebration had begun two days earlier and each day saw more people arriving to view the spectacle. By Independence Day, according to the *Journal*, "the whole surrounding country is expected to pour into Albuquerque."[31] Many attractions drew thousands into Albuquerque for the Jubilee. Each day of festivities began at ten o'clock with a parade followed by various athletic *events* and entertainment. The pinnacle of the celebration came nightly with the performance of *Crossroads of the Southwest*, a historical pageant celebrating Albuquerque. The pageant featured a cast of five hundred performing on a one-hundred-foot-wide stage in University of New Mexico Stadium. The show promised to depict the story of Albuquerque from time immemorial to the modern day. That it was performed the week of Fourth of July ensured that audiences would receive a hearty dose of patriotic spirit as well.

---

[31] "Big Finale Today For Jubilee," *Albuquerque Journal*, July 4, 1935, 1.

Albuquerque's Golden Jubilee demonstrates the power of metric moments in determining when pageants were presented. Although the area around the city boasted several colonial villages founded in the late seventeenth and early eighteenth centuries, the Jubilee's promoters chose to produce days of pageantry and festivity in commemoration of the legal incorporation of the City of Albuquerque in 1885. Rather than celebrating the arrival of Spanish colonists, or even the founding of the American railroad town, the pageant makers centered their festival around the formation of municipal government because it had occurred precisely a half-century before. "Golden Jubilee" made for better ad copy than "229th Anniversary of a Nearby Spanish Settlement." In 1935 the City of Albuquerque was still in the midst of a campaign to annex the colonial era villages along the river and Old Albuquerque sat outside city limits. The staging of the Golden Jubilee therefore represents a moment in history when boosters' desire to claim municipal origins in the Spanish past outstripped the actual fact of the city's legal boundaries.

In order to stage the pageant, the organizers of the Golden Jubilee hired the John B. Rogers Company based in Fostoria, Ohio. The Rogers Company benefited greatly from the pageantry boom of the first decades of the twentieth century. Founded in 1903 to provide costumes and scripts to amateur musical shows put on by fraternal organizations, women's clubs, and schools, the firm had grown to become the nation's largest commercial production company of historic pageants by the mid-1920s.[32] In addition to providing costumes, props, and scripts, the Rogers Company also furnished directors to plug local historical episodes into the company's standard formula of drama and dance interludes to create local pageants. The firm's generic history pageant drew heavily from the scripts and guidebooks published by academic dramatists and progressive social workers.[33] This adaptable base followed a narrative of discovery and progress that included scenes of the meeting, of Native Americans and European explorers, man's dominion over nature, the coming of the railroad/canal, and a dance of many nations. The Rogers Company sent Russell Rowland to Albuquerque to handle the Golden Jubilee. The colorful dance numbers and allegorical vignettes present in *Crossroads of the Southwest* were probably Rowland's application of the Rogers formula.

The local history came from Erna Fergusson, schoolteacher, journalist, Ivy-League trained historian, tour guide and daughter of two prominent New Mexican families. A lifelong student of New Mexican culture, Fergusson was known in the 1930s for leading tours through Pueblo Country and her newspaper column “Do You Remember?”[34] As the pageant historian in charge of writing and designing the historic scenes in the show, Fergusson imbued the Rogers Company generic formula with local color.

---

[32] Glassberg, *American Historical Pageantry*, 237.

[33] Ibid., 257.

Although *Crossroads of the Southwest* depicted Albuquerque as home to Pueblo Indians, Spaniards, and Mexicans, it really was about the city as an American place. The pageant presented all history as inevitably leading to American control of the city. As the story unfolds, it becomes clear that this political status was superior and desirable. The pageant’s allegorical opening episode set the tone. Albuquerque, “Queen of the Golden Jubilee and Pageant”, escorted by her Princesses, Pages, and Color Bearers entered the stage to greet Columbia who is attended by her Forty-eight States and her Color Bearers. Columbia’s reply, “We are happy tonight to receive your welcome to this gathering in remembrance and honor of those worthy men and courageous women, who here began a march of progress, the direction of which has been Forward. May Forward be your watchword—and your goal, Perfection.”[35] The opening scenes clearly establish a narrative of improvement. The United States literally accepts Albuquerque into her fold and offers a benediction of progress indicating elevation from an imperfect past. The pageant will delve into that past with the purpose of celebrating the apogee of civilization attained in the American present.

---

[34] For a biography of Fergusson and her impact in New Mexico, see Robert Gish, *Beautiful Swift Fox: Erna Fergusson and the Modern Southwest* (College Station: Texas A & M University Press, 1996).

[35] Albuquerque’s Golden Jubilee Official Program n.p., Albuquerque and New Mexico Pamphlet Collection, MSS112BC Box 1, Folder 4b, Center for Southwest Research, University Libraries, University of New Mexico.

After two episodes representing creation and the life of "The Red Man," the latter presented by students from the Albuquerque Indian School, the show depicted the arrival of Spaniards in an episode entitled "The Coming of Coronado." *Crossroads of the Southwest* portrays the Spanish conquest as unchallenged and the era of Spanish rule as carefree. For example, Coronado and his men "were welcomed by the Indians, who saw no harm in all that hocus pocus with flags and the cross."[36] Here, the narrative paints the Spanish as natural and effortless successors to the Indians as rulers of New Mexico. Note also the anti-Catholic tone of the play; the Spaniards' Catholicism is presented as a trifle, hardly more evolved that the pagan mysticism of the natives. The episodic arrangement of the pageant reinforces the narrative by transferring power from one group to another in each episode. The pageant shows no discontent or belligerence. The natives of New Mexico accept new conquests and cede power willingly. Unsurprisingly, the later episodes establish the same narrative for the coming of Americans. When Zebulon Pike arrives in Albuquerque, he finds wealthy hacendados in "a beautiful life, slow and easy, the sort of living that it seems should never end."[37] Yet as the audience knows, Pike represents precisely that end. He arrived in New Mexico as the advance agent of American civilization, just early enough to lament the loss of a land and people destined for domination.

---

[36] Ibid.

[37] Ibid.

In mobilizing a narrative of progress and inevitable succession, *Crossroads of the Southwest* normalized the region's social hierarchy. Just as the third episode portrayed Pueblos as grateful to be conquered by the Spanish for the protection they offered, episode six, "American occupation" portrayed Mexicanos as grateful for the governmental stability and protection from Navajos, Apaches, and Comanches offered by the United States' conquest. As the program describes it, "a blue-coated army promising protection from Indians, recognition of property rights, religious freedom, was welcome, and the establishment of the United States in New Mexico so easy that it is properly called the Occupation, not the conquest. New Mexico was glad to see the Stars and Stripes unfurl."[38] Progress, as characterized by the pageant, consisted of ever stronger forms of government and military power taking control of New Mexico over time. This narrative clearly associated the time of each nation's arrival in the Southwest with that nation's worth and fitness to govern. Thus, Pueblos willfully ceded to the superior Spanish who willfully ceded to the United States.

After an episode showing the arrival of the railroad and "a few years of gay, rollicking fisticuffs" *Crossroads of the Southwest* reached a crescendo that left no doubt that American government represented the pinnacle of civilization. Once the Albuquerqueans on stage formed a City Council, "the melting pot of the Nations" took the stage. In a generic number surely drawn by Rowland from his company's repertoire, a dancing mass depicted "various nations in appropriate costumes, each group offering its dances and drills." Despite the many nations represented on stage, the program assured the audience that "Patriotism here ascends to the highest pinnacle."[39] The show's grand finale consisted of "the entire cast in a spectacular ensemble in honor of the Stars and Stripes and in memory of the departed heroes of all wars." At the conclusion of the program the audience stood to sing the Star-Spangled Banner with the cast of the show, including the actors portraying immigrants and Spaniards and the children from the Albuquerque Indian School. This last episode, with immigrant dances followed by the national anthem and a salute to military heroes expanded the hierarchy established in the previous acts. While people of many nations now lived in New Mexico, the pageant emphasized their uniform allegiance to the United States and the unquestionable heroism of the nation's fallen soldiers.

---

[38] Ibid.

Albuquerque's Golden Jubilee proved to be a successful production. The *Journal* proclaimed that "the New Mexico night was ideal for the outdoor show. The background of the Sandia Mountains, the green turf of the football field and the colorful costumes made a magnificent effect."[40] For those thousands who saw *Crossroads of the Southwest*, the message could not have been clearer. The pageant defined American patriotism through the American melting pot and Anglo-American superiority. That narrative justified social hierarchy in the city through historical allegory and a vision of the future where New Mexico fit in with the other states of the Union. This heavy slant toward American patriotism contrasts with the contemporaneous San Antonio bicentennial that focused on the missions and Canary Islanders. Most likely this is the result of using the Rogers Company's generic show formulas that emphasized patriotism and melting pot assimilation. This malleable foundation provided colorful scenes like Columbia's benediction and the immigrant dances, but Fergusson worked in local history with no shortage of verve for New Mexico's Spanish past, the depth of which was borne out by the state's next big pageant.

---

[39] Ibid.

[40] "Pageant Audience Increases For Its Second Presentation" *Albuquerque Journal*, July 4, 1935, 3.

THE CORONADO CUARTO CENTENNIAL

As *Crossroads of the Southwest* played out at University Stadium, the planning of another New Mexico pageant was already well under way. In 1935, the state legislature established the Coronado Fourth Centennial Corporation in anticipation of the four hundredth anniversary of Francisco Vásquez de Coronado's journey into northern New Spain, which would occur in 1940. The Corporation convened for the first time in Santa Fe on March 18, 1935. James Zimmerman, president of the University of New Mexico, served as president of the corporation and Erna Fegusson, script writer for the Golden Jubilee pageant, served as vice president. The group decided to name the commemoration the "Coronado Cuarto Centennial" because "this name combines a touch of Spanish and English in its wording, indicates the four hundredth anniversary of Coronado's accomplishment and is short, snappy, and easily pronounced."[41]

---

[41] Coronado Cuarto Centennial Commission Collection, UNMA 007 Box 1, Commission Meetings & Minutes 1936-1938, Center for Southwest Research, University Libraries, University of New Mexico.

Likewise, they used the name for their organization, calling themselves the Coronado Cuarto Centennial Commission (CCCC) and decided to establish their headquarters in Albuquerque.

Initially, the members of CCCC proposed various, whimsical modes of commemorating the era of Coronado by emulating an idealized Spanish past. These efforts reflected the broad scope of the Cuarto Centennial and one of the first statewide attempts to translate New Mexico's Spanish past into a tourist attraction. For example, a member of the commission suggested that the people of New Mexico "adopt for 1940 a definitely planned and attractive Conquistadores attire, one for men and one for women."[42] Another commissioner agreed that "Those participating and on special occasions all citizens, should wear attractive conquistadores attire." Surely, few twentieth century New Mexicans looked forward to wearing the durable and functional garb sixteenth century Spaniards carried on their exploration of a far-flung frontier. They did not intend to truly emulate the Spanish soldiers, but to romanticize them with a sartorial tribute. Costume designer Carmen Espinosa predicted that during the Cuarto Centennial, "Fashions that were in vogue from 1540 on will be revived, and we will live again those adventuresome days and will revel in the customs of other years."[43] Dressing as they imagined Spaniards did effectively allowed followers of the Cuarto Centennial to live the life of colorful romance they imagined the Spaniards lived. The costumes allowed them to enter their own idealized version of the past and revel in its exotic romance.

---

[42] Coronado Cuarto Centennial Commission Collection, UNMA 007 Box 2, Commission Meetings 1938-1940, Center for Southwest Research, University Libraries, University of New Mexico.

[43] Carmen Espinosa, "Coronado Celebration Costumes," *New Mexico Magazine*1940, 20.

The commission also recommended that New Mexicans “make use of Spanish more extensively during the year. Have it spoken more than ordinarily at cafes, hotels, etc.”[44] In promoting the Spanish language, they sought to memorialize the Spanish past by amplifying its legacy in the present. By encouraging Spanish speakers to use that language in public places, the commissioners hoped to reveal a sometimes hidden element of New Mexican culture to visitors. This encouragement belied the pejorative view of the Spanish past in the years before statehood. Spanish became a resource to be unearthed and prominently featured in order to draw the 1940s closer to the 1540s.

The commission also wanted to identify descendants of Coronado, “Coronado’s Children” as they called them, and invite them to the commemoration with the goal of attracting publicity.[45] The desire to find and venerate the descendants of famous historical figures was a common aspect of the pageant movement. For example, a 1908 commemoration of Philadelphia’s founding included Henry W. Bache impersonating his great-grandfather,

---

[44] Coronado Cuarto Centennial Commission Collection, UNMA 007 Box 2, Commission Meetings 1938-1940, Center for Southwest Research, University Libraries, University of New Mexico.

[45] Third Annual Report, 1938, New Mexico Coronado Cuarto Centennial Commission Collection, AC 161-p, Fray Angélico Chávez History Library, Museum of New Mexico, 55. The name clearly references *Coronado’s Children,* a collection of legends about lost mines and buried treasure in the Southwest written by folklorist J. Frank Dobie in 1930. Dobie used the term not to refer to Spanish/Mexican descendants of Coronado, but to spiritual descendents who combed the region for elusive treasure.

Benjamin Franklin.[46] Likewise, the 1914 St. Louis pageant included a scene called “the Lafayette Ball” that featured elites from the city’s old families impersonating their forebears gathering for an 1825 soiree. The participation of these hereditary elites represented a benediction of the pageant from those whom it honored. While the historical figures could only be present as a reenactment or symbol, their descendants provided a living connection to the past while also promoting their own ancestral exceptionalism.

Planning their commemoration in the midst of the pageant movement, the CCCC naturally included a pageant in the Cuarto Centennial from the start. One of their first reports promised that “The historic scenes of the past 400 years will be outlined for presentation in unique and colorful drama and pageant.”[47] In planning their pageant, the CCCC compared the Cuarto Centennial to the Century of Progress in Chicago and the Texas Centennial Exposition held in Dallas in 1936. Although lacking the commercial backing of those larger events, they hoped a spectacular show could draw large crowds. Early on they recognized their financial limitations, rejecting the idea of building a fairground to hold a commercial exposition and a carnival as too costly and focusing instead on the pageant and an educational program as the two main efforts of the organization.[48]

---

[46] Glassberg, *American Historical Pageantry*, 49.

[47] Third Annual Report, 1938, New Mexico Coronado Cuarto Centennial Commission Collection, AC 161-p, Fray Angélico Chávez History Library, Museum of New Mexico, 61

By 1936 the organizers of the Cuarto Centennial Commission decided that the commemoration they envisioned would be too large for any single venue in the state. Primarily, they worried that no place in New Mexico had enough hotel rooms to hold the crowds they hoped to draw. In order to alleviate crowds, bring the event to more New Mexicans, and generate more revenue, they decided to create a mobile pageant that could be trucked around the state and elsewhere in the region. They also wanted to promote the Cuarto Centennial by combining it with existing celebrations and rituals where possible. Thus, disparate events like Clovis Pioneer Days, the Roswell Fair, and the First Nations Gathering at Gallup were folded into the Coronado event. The official program of the Cuarto Centennial promised that these auxiliary festivals, regardless of the ethnicities of performers, would provide "an opportunity to all the outside world to witness fiesta life in the Spanish vein throughout the entire state."[49] The festive nature of Spanish blood (note the metaphor) made the state appealing, exotic and unique and provided the foundation of the Cuarto Centennial's enterprise.

From the beginning, the CCCC yoked the pageantry of the Coronado Cuarto Centennial to an educational program. The Commission characterized this endeavor as a means for building interest for the big event in 1940. As their 1938 report stated, "cooperation with all institutions of learning throughout the State, would be the most effective and non-costly form of publicity that could be used to perpetrate interest in the 1940 Celebration."[50] But the education program was more than publicity. The Coronado Cuarto Centennial was supposed to educate New Mexicans and culturally advance them. To that end, the educational program of the CCCC included publishing two series of books on New Mexico history. One, called the Bandelier Series, was to include scholarly monographs and collections of translated Spanish and Mexican documents. Originally slated for thirteen titles, some of which consisted of multiple volumes, the Bandelier series slanted heavily towards the colonial era. The other, the Coronado Series, was to present geography and popular history. Planned for eighteen titles, the Coronado Series would cover geography of the state, Pueblo religion, and history from Coronado's voyage to statehood.[51]

---

[48] Second Annual Report, 1937, New Mexico Coronado Cuarto Centennial Commission Collection, AC 161-p, Fray Angélico Chávez History Library, Museum of New Mexico, 12.

[49] Coronado Entrada program n.p., New Mexico Coronado Cuarto Centennial Commission Collection, AC 161-p, Fray Angélico Chávez History Library, Museum of New Mexico.

Yet despite prodding historians to publish works on the Spanish past, the commission made it clear that the Cuarto Centennial celebration was not about the glory of days gone by. One of their reports stated that, "The Coronado celebration should be guided by thoughts of the future. It must, for both cultural and educational reasons, look into the past, but it should not look to the past...We shall, therefore, in planning to present the past, also plan definitely for the future."[52] This celebration of the past was meant to drive progress and growth for the future. The pageant makers wanted to instruct New Mexicans on the past while ensuring they kept their eyes forward. Choosing to gaze into the future from Coronado's imagined perspective is significant. Coronado, as envisioned by the CCCC, was a brave trailblazer who risked his honor to seek adventure and wealth. His courtroom vindication proved his explorations and their deadly consequences to be righteous. The audacious but just conquistador symbolized the energy heralded by the myth of the West. Invigorated by the adventures of Coronado, New Mexicans would push forward together to a better future—sentiments drawn straight from the Progressive Era and the first expressions of the New Pageantry movement.

---

[50] Third Annual Report, 1938, New Mexico Coronado Cuarto Centennial Commission Collection, AC 161-p, Fray Angélico Chávez History Library, Museum of New Mexico, 15

[51] Second Annual Report, 1937, New Mexico Coronado Cuarto Centennial Commission Collection, AC 161-p, Fray Angélico Chávez History Library, Museum of New Mexico, 12.

Indeed, although the Coronado Cuarto Centennial commemorated the past, it defined social relationships in the present and established a narrative of progress culminating in white American domination. One of the CCCC's reports clarifies their vision of the past. The report identifies the historic periods of the Southwest so they fit together in a teleological arc that echoed the story presented in *Crossroads of the Southwest* a few years earlier. The first period was "the prehistoric era, when the land was inhabited by 'the first people,' the ancestors of the Red Man." This characterization relegated indigenous people to a place outside of history. Their dominion was unrecorded and long past. The Spanish era marked an interlude between the prehistoric past of the Indians and the coming of white Americans. The report described this final era as the period “when the Southwest was taken over by the Frontiersman and the Early Empire Builders, who paved the way for this section of the country to become part of the United States.”[53] Thus, New Mexico’s entry into the United States stands as the inevitable end of the story, ordained by the vanishing of the “Red Man” and prepared for by the arrival of American traders and trappers. The Cuarto Centennial was undertaken to justify and disseminate this conclusion.

---

[52] Third Annual Report, 1938, New Mexico Coronado Cuarto Centennial Commission Collection, AC 161-p, Fray Angélico Chávez History Library, Museum of New Mexico, 18. emphasis original

Initial funding for the CCCC came from a small appropriation from the state legislature and, to a larger degree, from private subscriptions drummed up by the board.[54] In July 1936, the commission hired archivist Herbert Brayer to solicit subscriptions. They paid him a commission and he hired 15 other men from UNM to help sell with him. In another reference to the Spanish past, the Commission referred to their salesmen as “Los Conquistadores.” Rather than exploring the frontiers of an empire however, these conquistadors sought treasure of another sort. They also helped plan meetings, solicit publicity, recruit volunteers and issue press releases.[55]

---

[53] Second Annual Report, 1937, New Mexico Coronado Cuarto Centennial Commission Collection, AC 161-p, Fray Angélico Chávez History Library, Museum of New Mexico, 14

[54] From 1935 until 1939, the CCCC raised $14,325 through private donations. Fourth Annual Report, Fray Angélico Chávez History Library, 5.

[55] Second Annual Report, 1937, New Mexico Coronado Cuarto Centennial Commission Collection, AC 161-p, Fray Angélico Chávez History Library, Museum of New Mexico, 20.

The fundraising efforts of Brayer and Los Conquistadores helped keep the commission working through 1937 and 1938, but evidently could not sustain the entire pageant program. Ultimately, the presentation of the Cuarto Centennial hinged on the ability of the CCCC, and Zimmerman in particular, to mobilize their connections to the state's congressional delegation and garner the support of the federal government. An early attempt to raise funds hinged on the striking of 150,000 commemorative fifty-cent pieces that the commission planned to sell for a dollar. In May 1938 Harold Ickes, Secretary of the Interior, organized the National Inter-Departmental Committee to aid the Coronado Cuarto Centennial commission. The committee included other cabinet members including the Secretaries of War, State, and Agriculture. Officially, the committee was charged with aiding the CCCC and the New Mexico Congressional delegation in winning the support of Congress and the Executive Branch.[56] After passing both houses of Congress with the strong support of the New Mexico delegation, the commemorative coins ultimately fell to President Roosevelt's veto. In a memorandum clarifying the veto, Roosevelt explained that he saw such coins as a misuse of the mint system and contrary to the stated purpose of the Treasury Department. Despite its ultimate failure, the support drawn to the commemorative coin bill demonstrates the strength of the CCCC's clout in Washington.

---

[56] Fourth Annual Report, 1939, New Mexico Coronado Cuarto Centennial Commission Collection, AC 161-p, Fray Angélico Chávez History Library, Museum of New Mexico, 4.

That reach proved to be essential to the production of the Cuarto Centennial Pageant. Although the commemorative coin did not come to fruition, President Roosevelt proved to be an ally of the program. In a November 1938 meeting with James Zimmerman and Managing Director of the CCCC, Clinton Anderson, he indicated his support of an appropriation for the Cuarto Centennial.[57] By late 1939 these connections paid off augmenting a $30,000 state appropriation with $200,000 from the federal government.[58] This federal largesse sets the Cuarto Centennial apart from other pageants of the day. Most pageants relied entirely on local support and fought to keep above water financially. The federal grant provided a necessary boost that enabled the Cuarto Centennial to get off the ground.

Just as they depended on the federal government for financing, the CCCC relied on the services of freelancers who provided the artistic and technical expertise necessary for such a large production. By the late 1930s, a cottage industry of pageantry production professionals had developed to serve the needs of pageants big and small. The Commission hired Thomas Wood Stevens, "internationally known pageant writer," to write a script and direct the pageant. Stevens had more than two decades' experience directing stage plays and pageants. He had previously directed Shakespeare plays in replica Globe theaters for the Century of Progress in Chicago, in San Diego in 1935, and at the New York World's Fair in 1939. He also wrote and directed historical pageants for St. Louis, Richmond, Charlotte, Santa Fe, Fort Niagara and Yorktown.[59] They also hired the Jerome H. Cargill organization of New York as production managers and brought on Lucy Barton from the Traphagen School of Design in New York as costume designer. She oversaw nearly one thousand costumes "which are completely authentic and selected only after months of careful research."[60] Les Marzolf, who had worked at the Chicago World's Fair and the Pageant of Niagara handled the props, weapons, armor, special scenic effects and lighting. These artists created a production that came to include more than twenty thousand performers and technicians. They performed on a stage three hundred feet long backed by a fifty-foot high backdrop. The whole production could be disassembled and packed onto trucks that carried it to seventeen sites in New Mexico, West Texas, and Arizona.

---

[57] Fourth Annual Report, 1939, New Mexico Coronado Cuarto Centennial Commission Collection, AC 161-p, Fray Angélico Chávez History Library, Museum of New Mexico, 20.

[58] Coronado Entrada program n.p., New Mexico Coronado Cuarto Centennial Commission Collection, AC 161-p, Fray Angélico Chávez History Library, Museum of New Mexico.

The pageant opened with a scene set in Compostela, New Spain on February 22, 1540, the eve of the expedition. The conquistadores' exploits played out in eighteen subsequent scenes that reenacted the expedition including the battle at Hawikuh, the Spaniards' arrival at the Grand Canyon, their voyage to Quivira, and the martyrdom of Padre Juan de Padilla. The trial to determine Coronado's culpability in the failure of the expedition served as the pageant's emotional crescendo. Spectators watched as a royal court weighed the Conquistador's fate. After Coronado's on-stage acquittal "the color and gaiety and sparkle of Old Spain reign again in glorious fiesta. The plaza is filled with dancing groups, and the tortures of the long trail move into history."[61] The exuberance of this finale clearly establishes the pageant's position on Coronado and the expedition he led. Not only did the Cuarto Centennial commemorate the anniversary of Coronado's voyage, it celebrated it as a colorful and festive adventure of New World exploration.

---

[59] Glassberg, *American Historical Pageantry*, 239. The Cuarto Centennial would be among the last productions Stevens worked on. He died in 1942.

[60] Coronado Entrada program n.p., New Mexico Coronado Cuarto Centennial Commission Collection, AC 161-p, Fray Angélico Chávez History Library, Museum of New Mexico.

Indeed, Stevens intended the Coronado pageant to be "a memorial to those lusty and brave Spanish Grandees who founded the customs which have survived the ravages of time in a majority of the Southwest."[62] In other words, the pageant romanticized Spanish conquerors and explorers while also identifying them as the progenitors of the American Southwest. This vision fit the need of the CCCC to portray the Coronado expedition as the start of a chain of history that extended into their day and led up to their prominence in the region. The story of Coronado's journey as an American achievement came through to the pageant's audience loud and clear. *New Mexico Magazine*, published by the State Bureau of

---

[61] Coronado Entrada program n.p., New Mexico Coronado Cuarto Centennial Commission Collection, AC 161-p, Fray Angélico Chávez History Library, Museum of New Mexico.

[62] Coronado Entrada program n.p., New Mexico Coronado Cuarto Centennial Commission Collection, AC 161-p, Fray Angélico Chávez History Library, Museum of New Mexico.

Publications in Albuquerque, identified Coronado's expedition as "the beginning of the American Southwest."[63] Another review stated

> working in complete harmony, this group has turned out one of the outstanding historical dramatizations of the age, bringing to the fore, for the first time, the little known southwestern history which is a vital background of the United States. It should be borne in mind that Coronado explored the vast region now comprising New Mexico, Arizona, West Texas, Oklahoma, Kansas and Colorado more than 80 years before the Pilgrims landed at Plymouth Rock.[64]

The pageant argued that Coronado's journey defined the Southwest as a distinct region before any other part of the United States existed. That the geographic descriptions only make sense from the perspective of the 1940s and that a sixteenth century Spaniard would know nothing about the Southwest, the United States or New Mexico mattered little. Coronado served as a symbol of ancient civilization and colorful romance. By the 1940s both of these qualities lured tourists and new residents to he Southwest.

As in other modes of memory of the Spanish past, age proved to be a valuable resource to be mined from the Coronado expedition. The official program of the pageant displayed photographs of the mission churches at Isleta and Taos pueblos, touting them as "all more than a century and a half *older* than the Missions of California."[65] Likewise, a program ad for the Albuquerque Hilton notes that “Santa Fe, within short driving distance of the Hilton is America’s Oldest Capital.”[66] These promotions did not mention anything of the specific history of buildings and settlements they pushed. Age alone seemed to be sufficient to draw tourist interest. Yet as earnest as New Mexico’s boosters were about promoting the state’s antiquity, they nearly always counterbalanced those claims with an assurance that New Mexico was modern, progressive, and growing. Another ad placed by the Albuquerque Gas and Electric Company made the contrast plain, “Although the Southwest is older historically than any other part of the United States, New Mexico today is young, vital, growing.”[67]

---

[63] Edmund Sherman, "New Mexico Celebrates," *New Mexico Magazine*1940, 11.

[64] Coronado Entrada program n.p., New Mexico Coronado Cuarto Centennial Commission Collection, AC 161-p, Fray Angélico Chávez History Library, Museum of New Mexico.

[65] Coronado Entrada program n.p., New Mexico Coronado Cuarto Centennial Commission Collection, AC 161-p, Fray Angélico Chávez History Library, Museum of New Mexico. (emphasis original)

The Coronado Cuarto Centennial was the biggest pageant ever staged in New Mexico, both in terms of scope and money spent. It presented Coronado’s expedition as the key turning point in New Mexican history, the moment that banished Native dominion to the past and paved the way for white American civilization to dominate. In celebrating the anniversary of the Coronado expedition, the elites in the CCCC celebrated themselves. To do so, they turned to the ideals of the pageantry movement and the services of the commercial firms it had created. The Cuarto Centennial’s aim to define a region, show New Mexicans to themselves, establish a sense of community among the audience and educate the public in a particular version of the past all tie the pageant into the progressive goals of the pageantry movement. The federal support garnered by the CCCC and their allies in Washington set the pageant apart from the more locally focused exhibitions that preceded it. In this way the CCCC created a pageant that was at once typical of those popular to the east in previous decades while making it distinctly New Mexican through its focus on the Spanish past and dependence on federal funding.

---

[66] Coronado Entrada program n.p., New Mexico Coronado Cuarto Centennial Commission Collection, AC 161-p, Fray Angélico Chávez History Library, Museum of New Mexico.

[67] Coronado Entrada program n.p., New Mexico Coronado Cuarto Centennial Commission Collection, AC 161-p, Fray Angélico Chávez History Library, Museum of New Mexico.

THE BAILE DE LAS FLORES

The best example of pageantry in Tucson was not nominally a pageant at all. An annual ball called the Baile de las Flores raised funds to support the St Luke's in the Desert Sanatorium, a facility run by the Episcopal Church for tubercular men who lacked means for their treatment and convalescence. Between the 1920s and 40s, the Baile became the major social event for Tucson's wealthy citizens. Despite not calling itself a pageant, the timing of the event, the design and costuming it inspired, as well as the narrative it disseminated connect it to the aesthetics of pageantry movement. Unlike the public outdoor spectacles produced elsewhere, Baile de Las Flores did not aspire to nourish democracy and impart moral principles. Instead, the organizers and attendees adopted the movement's playfulness and love of the exotic while omitting its progressive principles. Baile de las Flores represented a culmination of esteem for the Spanish past in Tucson, particularly noteworthy in a city where citizens took little action to preserve or celebrate the Spanish past before the 1920s.

By 1920 St. Luke's was only making half the money needed to run the facility from what it charged its patients. In that year, the Lady Board of Visitors, a group of philanthropic women responsible for obtaining donations of cash, furniture, and services for the sanitorium, decided to put on a ball to raise funds to cover the remainder of the facility's operating expenses. In 1928, Edythe Choate Young , then serving as President of the Board, adopted a Spanish theme for the ball. She had the Santa Rita hotel decorated to look like a Spanish garden. Mrs. Walt Coburn, Chairman of Decorations, described the scene,

> Fresh pepper boughs were hung around the balcony....Five large Mexican colored straw hats were hung around the balcony against the pepper branches and colored strings of gourds were hung between the hats. The paper flowers were wound around the upper pillars of the balcony and the top of the large center chandelier was banked with green pepper boughs and paper flowers. Sixty-four colored paper silhouettes of Spanish dancing girls, gay caballeros, and brave toreadors were pasted on the eight large columns in the center of the ballroom.[68]

After each event, the decorations committee arranged to have the decorations stored for use in following years. Young encouraged attendees to come wearing Spanish-style gowns, mantillas, high combs, sombreros, and colored robes. To mark the new theme, she renamed the now-annual event the Baile de Las Flores.[69] Tucson's hotels proved to be an ideal setting for romanticizing the Spanish past. Both the Santa Rita and El Conquistador, built in 1904 and 1928 respectively, hosted the Baile numerous times over the years. The Mission Revival architecture of these upscale hotels demonstrates that reverence of the

---

[68] Mrs. Walt Coburn, Decorations – Baile de las Flores – February 7, 1942, St Luke's in the Desert Papers, MS 630 Box 1, Folder 6, Arizona Historical Society

[69] "Annual Charity Ball, Baile de las Flores, To Be Held Saturday Night," *The Tucson Liberator,* February 7, 1945, St Luke's in the Desert Papers, MS 630 Box 1, Folder 7, Arizona Historical Society; Connie Long "Baile de Las Flores is Social History at Its Best," *Tucson Citizen,* January 26, 1984, 3. Although there might be a connection to San Antonio's Battle of Flowers parade that began in 1891, I found no indication that this name referred to anything other than the Board of Visitor's idea of a romantic and easily translatable Spanish sobriquet.

Spanish past had become commercially viable in the first decades of the twentieth century in Tucson. No doubt, their ambiance inspired the decorators of the Baile and colored the evening's experience for the attendees.

The Baile season began when colorful invitations arrived in the mailboxes of the city's elite. Although the artwork on them varied each year, it always depicted typically romanticized poses: the young lovers' tryst under a flowered balcony, a woman in a large ruffled skirt striding across a courtyard, men in sombreros, a woman with flowers in her hair clutching a fan in one hand and her flowing skirt in the other. If the invitations did not feature young lovers or an alluring female, they depicted a trio or quartet of male musicians clad in sombreros and serapes. These images of set the tone for the festivities to come. They promised that the event would be transportative, relocating attendees to an imagined time when Spanish colonists lived a carefree life amidst blooming flowers, soft music, and moonlit rendezvous.[70] Notably, these images portrayed a timeless romance from a misty past not tied to any specific time or nationality.

The Baile de las Flores raised funds for St. Luke's Sanatorium, but it was much more than a fundraising event when read in context of pageantry, the gala emerges as a performance in which the attendees played a central role. Their costumes transformed the evening from philanthropic revelry to pageant spectacle. As one newspaper editorial described it, the Baile "provides grown-ups legitimate expression of their desire to dress up in Spanish costumes."[71] This desire was rooted in the images of the romantic Spanish past displayed on the invitations to the Baile. By dressing up in costumes, attendees could make their fantasies about the past incarnate while displaying their wealth and capacity for travel and leisure.

---

[70] This is an image promulgated in California in the late-nineteenth and early-twentieth centuries. For more on the image and its contribution to social relations in the American Southwest, see Kropp, Mc Williams

This costumed performance was not limited to the night of the Baile. In the weeks leading up to the event, the *Arizona Daily Star* and the *Tucson Citizen* would run articles promoting the ball featuring the women of the Lady Board of Visitors and their daughters modeling their costumes and recounting the shopping excursions on which they acquired them. Year after year, the women of the Board posed in their expensive homes wearing a mantilla purchased in Spain or a peasant skirt picked up on a shopping excursion in Sonora. The newspaper promotions featuring Tucson's upper stratum made it possible for the Baile to be both restricted and public at the same time. The private, exclusive affair unfolded in the public view of society pages and department stores ads. Alongside announcements of pre and post Baile dinners and cocktail parties, the people of Tucson watched their city's elites acting out their Spanish fantasies.

Although some attendees collected their costumes for the Baile de las Flores on trips to Mexico or even to Spain, local merchants did not miss the chance to ride the glamorous coattails of the society event to promote their wares. In the same newspapers that covered the Board's preparations for the Baile, stores like Penney's, Levy's, The White House, Steinfeld's, Gertrude Rubin, Dave

---

[71] "Baile de las Flores," *Arizona Daily Star*, February 2, 1941

Bloom and Sons, and Gus Taylor's advertised their formal wear for both men and women. Some advertisers included a notice in an otherwise unrelated ad that mentioned the time and place where the Baile would be held. Others, especially Steinfeld's, ran advertisements specially made for the event that featured Spanish style dresses, shoes, jewelry and accessories including mantilla combs and fans.[72][73] Tucson's department stores recognized the aspirational quality of dressing in costume for the Baile de las Flores. They sought to capitalize not only on the potential sales to those attending the event, but to align their stores with the romantic image of the event and the sophistication of its patrons.

Just as the annual Baile de las Flores featured festive decorations in a Spanish theme, they also featured "Spanish" entertainers. In its first year the Baile featured a "Spanish band" and a jazz band, both dressed in colorful attire befitting the Spanish theme.[74] Through the 1930s and 40s the Lady Board of Visitors regularly booked Mexicano musicians and dancers to entertain the antendees. Newspaper stories and organizational records indicate these entertainers were the only Mexicanos regularly involved with the Baile. They occupied a liminal space in the evening's program between participant and outsider. Their inclusion in the event required a symbolic shedding of Mexican identity in favor of Spanish characteristics that better matched the Baile's theme. This is evident in the newspaper coverage of the ball. Although the photos run in the newspapers most often show performers in Mexican costumes belonging to groups like "The Jalisco Quartet", or "Quarteto Janitzio", the articles and event programs describe them as "interpreters of Spanish music."[75] The Tucson Citizen, for example, promised that the Mexican peasant dresses worn by a troupe of dancers would "heighten the gay Spanish atmosphere" of the evening.[76] That the organizers of the Baile hired bands with Mexican names to play "Spanish" music indicates a disconnect between the entertainment imagined by organizers and the musicians available for hire in Tucson. Yet the organizers insisted on reckoning Mexicano performers as Spanish because maintaining a Spanish ambiance at the Baile trumped the geographic and cultural origins of the performers who served as set pieces for the festivities.

---

[73] See, for example, the many clippings in St Luke's in the Desert Papers, MS 630 Box 1, Folder 2, Arizona Historical Society, and elsewhere in the same manuscript collection.

[74] Connie Long "Baile de Las Flores is Social History at Its Best," *Tucson Citizen,* January 26, 1984, 3.

While the Baile de las Flores shared a carnivalesque spirit and recreations of historical costume with the pageants produced in the first decades of the twentieth century in England and the Eastern United States as well as those produced contemporaneously in the Southwest, it differed in a key detail. Tucson's celebration did not rely on a central narrative that aimed to commemorate a particular event or era. Most other pageants celebrated the anniversary of a town's founding or some other noteworthy event long-passed. The Baile, on the other hand, called Tucsonans to revel in the staged atmosphere of the Spanish past divorced from specific historic context. As a result, the costumes, music, invitations, and decorations drew from a range of styles and images that all fit into the imagined category of "Spanish." Because of this lack of specific focus, the Baile de las Flores persisted for decades, much longer than pageants tied to a specific anniversary could.[77] This pliability, in fact, gave the Baile de Las Flores its meaning. Rather than transporting participants to a specific historical event so that they could internalize it and interpret their own lives in its light, it allowed them a chance to craft alternate identities based loosely in the past. The Spanish theme of Baile de las Flores reflected a larger development in the popular culture of the 1920s and 30s associating Spain and the Spanish colonists who inhabited the northern frontier with a life of grandeur and romance. The Baile's revelers playing dashing dons and demure señoritas while wearing clothes purchased on vacations to Spain or Mexico broadcast affluence and leisure, qualities echoed in the vision of the Spanish past they embraced.

---

[75] "Entertainers at Annual Ball of the Flowers," *Tucson Citizen,* February 2, 1945 in St Luke's in the Desert Papers, MS 630 Box 2, Folder 20, Arizona Historical Society

[76] "Flower Girls in Costume," *Tucson Citizen*, February 10, 1945 in St Luke's in the Desert Papers, MS 630 Box 2, Folder 20, Arizona Historical Society

Perhaps the fact that many of Tucson's elite did not live in the city year-round was another factor in their lack of support for a traditional pageant with a clear narrative.[78] The promoters of Baile de las Flores did not aim to bolster civic pride or instill patriotism in the public. Rather, they sought to raise funds from the wealthy by creating a place where they could act out the romantic ideals of the

---

[77] According to Julie Green, "The Baile—Social Event With A Heart," *Tucson Citizen*, February 18, 1969, money from Baile de las Flores went to fund a chest clinic at the University of Arizona Medical Center in that year. The sanitarium itself was shuttered and reopened in 1980 as an assisted living facility for senior citizens, Connie Long "Baile de Las Flores is Social History at Its Best," *Tucson Citizen,* January 26, 1984, 3. The Baile persisted to benefit the new St. Luke's home. In 2011, a website advertised tickets to the 92nd annual Baile de las Flores.

[78] Baile de Las Flores was always held in February so that those who wintered in Tucson could attend and contribute.

Spanish past current in their day. Since the attendees were mostly part-time residents or recent arrivals, they did not feel personally connected to the particular history of the place the way elites of Sherbourne or Philadelphia did. They generally had no long-established family history in Arizona. Therefore they could invoke the imagery of the Spanish past to celebrate the wealth that allowed them to escape the snow and toil of the industrial Northeast and Midwest for the sunshine and leisure of the Desert Southwest rather than the specific history of Tucson that distinguished them and their families.

CONCLUSION

Before the 1930s, commemoration of the Spanish past in the cities of the Southwest developed unevenly. San Antonio remained notably ahead of Albuquerque and Tucson in imagining a civic identity based on the Spanish past and mobilizing projects that supported that identity through commemoration of the colonial era. The pageants produced in the 1930s demonstrate the first region-wide synchronization of memory. Thus, this decade marks the crystallization of a regional identity rooted in the Spanish past. From this point on, the boosters of the Southwest universally embraced and broadcast the image of the conquistador, missionary and neophyte Indian as emblematic and distinct to their place. Pageantry did not cause this symbolic alignment, rather the national trend displayed what had been developing over the previous half century. Pageants were designed by their makers to be transparent and didactic expressions of the meaning of the past. By reading the explicit messages transmitted through them and uncovering implicit agendas, we can assemble the hitherto disparate stands of memory that came together in the imagined fabric of the Spanish past.

Three primary facets define the image of the Spanish past presented in the pageants of the 1930s. The first is the institution of the Spanish/Mexican dichotomy. Southwestern pageants explicitly celebrated Spaniards in aggregate (Canary Islanders), individually (Coronado) and symbolically (Baile de Las Flores). Simultaneously, they all excluded Mexicanos qua Mexicans. Mexicano culture entered pageantry only under the symbolic guise of Spanish-ness as evidenced in the hiring of musicians for the Baile de las Flores and the sudden support of bilingualism during the Coronado Cuarto Centennial. In all cases, Mexicano people served as objects of the pageantry, not creators or participants.

The second hallmark of Southwestern pageantry was the elevation of image over fact. While the organizers of the Cuarto Centennial yoked their pageant to a push for scholarly output, the pageant itself favored high drama over historic veracity. San Antonio's bicentennial, while commemorating historic events, blended them together with later developments into an invigorating origin myth. Tucsonans took their symbolic celebration of the Spanish past to the extreme edges of abstraction. Playing as Spaniards in Mexican peasant skirts under the Moorish confections dreamed up by twentieth century architects, they dedicated themselves wholeheartedly to a Spanish tone without celebrating any specific event or person.

Finally, pageants firmly established the conquistador, missionary, and neophyte Indian as the quintessential colonial characters and the mission as their natural expression of space. The San Antonio bicentennial pivoted on the relocation of Spanish missions while the Coronado Cuarto Centennial centered on the first conquistador in New Mexico. The Baile de las Flores did not celebrate a specific Spaniard, but the images on the invitations and the architecture of the hotels in which it was held supported the mission as the exemplary structure of the Spanish past. Contrast other colonial types and definitions of space. The merchant and the plaza, for example, rarely enter the particularly designed world of the Spanish past.

These three facets, while present in previous historical narratives cohered into a region-defining vision just as the pageantry movement grew in popularity in the Southwest. Pageantry represents both a mode of expression, like religious ritual and historic preservation, but because of its scale and popularity also indicates consensus building in the historic narrative of the Spanish past. This consensus, never universal nor uncontested, aligned the tropes that defined the Southwest as distinct from the rest of the nation. That distinction has characterized the culture, economy, and mythic allure of the Southwest into the present.

CONCLUSION

Pageants, already old news further east, reached the peak of their popularity in the Southwest in the 1930s. The huge commitment of money and energy required to produce them made the movement difficult to sustain. Audiences turned to other forms of entertainment, notably motion pictures, and were also distracted by the looming war. Without the guaranteed turnout of a large crowd, organizers stopped producing big shows. Although the mode of celebrating local history in spectacular outdoor shows fell out of fashion, an invented memory of the Spanish past continued to define the cities of the American Southwest through the twentieth century. One can look back to the history of the last decade to find plentiful evidence that memory of the Spanish past still enchants citizens of the urban Southwest while drawing visitors from around the world to the region.

The Albuquerque Tricentennial of 2006 provides a ready example of the persistence of the pageant spirit despite the reduction of its scope. Clyde Tingley's 1948 prediction that annexation would bring an air of antiquity to Albuquerque came true. After the city council annexed Old Town, boosters and local historians started claiming 1706 as the founding date for the whole metropolis. They recast the railroad boomtown's former rival as the site of its origin to the absolute exclusion of all other colonial era settlements within city limits. This creation story capitalized on the railroad town's appropriation of the plaza's name to draw an artificially straight line of history from the Spanish villa to the booming Southwestern city. By the twenty-first century, that origin story was so deeply ensconced in the city's civic identity that few thought twice about the municipal government planning an eighteen-month-long celebration of the city's three-hundreth birthday.

At the celebration's kickoff event in April 2005, Mayor Martin Chávez declared: "This is a rebranding of Albuquerque … if you want to find the greatness of this city, you reach into our history and our traditions and our cultures."[1] His eye was certainly focused on a version of the past when, in April 2006, he stepped into the gazebo at the center of Old Town Plaza wearing a red velvet frock coat and a cavalier's hat ornamented with an ostrich plume. The colorful costume was meant to make him look like Capitan Martin Hurtado, first alcalde of the Villa de Alburquerque. In this role Chávez presented land deeds to other reenactors, some of them descendants of the original Spanish grantees.[2] Both for the romantic tone and for the historic inaccuracy, this performance of the dispensation of land grants from the Spanish crown could have been played in a 1930s pageant. The 2006 performance indicates the lasting power of images evoking a Spanish past as a common vocabulary for expressing festive history and civic pride or "greatness" in the mayor's words.

The pageantry of the Albuquerque Tricentennial demonstrates that the Spanish past is still a potent symbol in the Southwest. The commemoration stands as but one of the more prominent celebrations of the Spanish past in recent history. Notwithstanding the waning popularity of pageantry since World War II, the phenomena presented in this dissertation persist today. The Alamo is one of the most visited sites in Texas, its distinctive roofline scroll (added by the U.S. Army in 1849) echoed in modern buildings, business names, and iconography throughout the city. St. Luke's Home threw the 94th annual Baile de Las Flores in March, 2013. Pastores troupes continue performing their version of the Christmas drama across the region. Faux-adobe stucco and red tile roofs still appear as the default building style for shopping centers and housing developments.

---

[1] Lloyd Jojola, "City Launches Tricentennial Celebration at Balloon Fiesta Park," *Albuquerque Journal* April 17, 2005.

[2] Leann Holt, "Diverse Crowd Gathers for Tricentennial Fiesta," *Albuquerque Journal* April 24, 2006.

The Spanish past continues to define the Southwest as a region distinct from the rest of the country though the political relationships and demographics of the region have changed since the early-twentieth century. That this common element of memory has persisted through the changes wrought by history is notable. Born of stories retold thousands of times, the invented memory of the Spanish past has clearly served a cultural and social need in modern America and continues to do so today. The history of the last half-century has changed the process of commemorating the Spanish past while hardly budging the narrative version of it.

World War II transformed the urban Southwest as thoroughly as the modernization of the 1880s did. The war brought massive air bases to Tucson, Albuquerque, and San Antonio that boosted the economies of those cities and drew a huge influx of newcomers. These developments mirrored those brought by the railroad in the late-nineteenth century. With the Cold War came increased federal investment in the military bases and another population boom attracted by and fueling the concomitant economic growth. The efforts to mobilize Americans as a nation at war created a national culture that seemed to leave little room for regional peculiarity. New mobility for workers and servicemen took Mexicanos to other parts of the U.S. and brought more outsiders to the Southwest. These developments pushed distinct regional cultures to the background in favor of a patriotic nationalism.

Another stress on the dominance of regional Spanish romance came from Chicano activism in the 1960s and 70s. World War II, the upward mobility it brought to veterans and their families, and the economic boom of Southwest cities contributed to the movement. Concentrated in the cities and college campuses on the Southwest, the movement advocated for Mexicano political rights. This political agitation changed the cultural assumptions of urban life. Descriptions of Mexicanos as a backward race, doomed to defeat by their own deficiencies, modified from the Black legend and common in popular culture up through the 1940s, were less accepted in public discourse. Chicano activism also mobilized Mexicano voters and activists as a political bloc and brought Mexicanos to positions of power in city councils and other government bodies. By gaining access to political power in city governments, some Mexicanos were positioned to disturb the established stories told about the Spanish past. In part, that era of activism led to the 2006 reenactment of land granting in Albuquerque by a hispano mayor and descendants of the Spanish grantees rather than Anglo newcomers, which was the norm in previous eras.

Yet as time has passed and governing bodies, cultural norms, and demographic statistics have changed, memory of the Spanish past seems to be cemented in place. The images and stories presented in public retellings of the Spanish past have hardly varied since the days of Washington Irving and Helen Hunt Jackson. While the gushing romance has been toned down and the harsh racism softened, the characters and stories remain the same. A golden age of New Spain dominated by dashing conquistadors and staunch missionaries persists in the stories told about the Southwest before it was the Southwest. This romantic public memory has lasted through the vicissitudes of time because it has become so deeply enmeshed with the identity of the region and the people who live in it.

Celebration of the same aspects of the Spanish past in the same way again and again reinforces the invented memory and its social consequences. At the core of this memory remains the separation of Spanish past from the Mexican present. While instructing people how to remember the past of the region, these celebrations continue to tell us what we should forget. The narrative that focuses on types of people outside of our contemporary lives (armored explorers, robe-clad missionaries) pushes Spanish history far into the past and separates it from the heirs to that history living today. By focusing so fiercely on the distant past, memory in the Southwest has discounted the process of historical change. This intentional distancing erases the relationship between past and present.

The durability of the romantic Spanish past does not, however, mean that challenges to the dominant narrative have ceased. Los Pastores continues to be performed by troupes throughout the Southwest. Anthropologist Richard Flores recognized it as a means of cultural resistance in his ethnography of the ritual published in 1995.[3] Yet it does not function as the same regional unifier that it once did. The interaction of audience and troupe and the devotion underlying it cannot be found as ubiquitously as it was in the earlier part of the century. It is an enduring cultural practice that has lost the power to reform identity that it once held. Recent scholarship suggests that a new ritual has taken hold as a means of defining Mexicano identity and relating counternarratives. Día de los Muertos has become a popular celebration in the United States, separated from its religious roots and transformed into a secular pan-Latino celebration. Anthropologist Stanley Brandes states that,

> [Day of the Dead] in recent years has assumed an increasingly political cast, linking the celebration specifically to Mexico and Mexican national identity. The Day of the Dead helps to create an interpretation of the world in which Mexico is unique, culturally discrete, and above all different from the two powers that have dominated the country throughout its long existence: Spain and the United States.[4]

The connection to cultural identity and the ritual's use as a resistance to domination link celebrations of Día de los Muertos to the historical Mexicano practices discussed in this dissertation.

Día de los Muertos provides an interesting medium for identity making against the Spanish fantasy past in the late twentieth century because, like the romantic Spanish past, it is also an invented tradition. Since at least the 1890s, Mexicanos in the United States honored their deceased relatives by cleaning and decorating their graves on All Saints' and All Souls' days. These practices changed in the 1970s when Chicano artists incorporated elements and images from Día de los Muertos celebration of southern and central Mexico into the ritual.[5] The colorful, secular, widely advertised events held at public facilities like a school, community center or museum are the result of recent changes. The skulls, flowers, and altars that animate and distinguish these celebrations represent a novel hybridity appended to an ancient tradition that defines a contemporary pan-Latino identity[6] The contemporary celebration also differs from the Pastorela in its openness. Whereas Pastores was a private demonstration of communal devotion, Día de los Muertos is often a colorful and well-publicized show. The imagery associated with the holiday has gained wide popularity and has been adopted by numerous commercial enterprises and cultural organizations.[7] This openness makes Día de los Muertos a viable and visible medium for transmitting an identity and connection to the past that emphasizes Mexican roots.

---

[3] Flores, *Los Pastores (1995)*.

[4] Stanley Brandes, "The Day of the Dead, Halloween, and the Quest for Mexican National Identity," *Journal Of American Folklore* 111, no. 442 (1998): 359.

This dissertation strives to demonstrate that a dominant narrative came together from multiple threads. Each story in that multitude of visions jostled for broader acceptance. Narratives begat counternarratives told by Mexicanos shut out of public memory-making. Aiming to recast the history of the Spanish empire as one of cultural continuity and ethnic connections across space, the vision of the Spanish past espoused in Mexicano rituals like the Pastorela demonstrates a history of resistance to the standard story. New rituals like Día de los Muertos reveal the persistence of that resistance to classification by a dominant narrative. In analyzing the content and purpose of memories of the Spanish past, this work and many of those cited herein contribute to that resistance. By uncovering the ways that memory of the Spanish past celebrated and justified American domination of the region and positioning the practice as more than a celebration of heroic history, scholarship on memory has provided a vocabulary and methodology to disentangle history from the imagined past and to use that separation to illuminate the minds and values of people with whom we cannot speak because of temporal distance. In this work, I have moved towards recognizing the disputed ground that lies underneath popular memories. I hope that others will continue to examine the ways that those who have been displaced from history by invented memories told their own stories and established their own version of the past.

---

[5] Regina M. Marchi, "Hybridity and Authenticity in U.S. Day of the Dead Celebrations," *Journal of American Folklore* 126, no. 501 (2013): 279-80.

[6] *Day of the Dead in the USA: The Migration and Transformation of a Cultural Phenomenon* (New Brunswick, N.J.: Rutgers University Press, 2009), 2.

[7] Ibid., 116-17.

Ultimately, memory of the Spanish past in the American Southwest is a mode of controlling power. Specifically, it commands the power to tell stories that contextualize and give meaning to the past. By actively engaging the Spanish past in public spaces and retelling stories that glorified Spanish conquest, Anglos who celebrated that memory sought to place themselves at the end of the civilizing process started by the Spanish. At different times and places, Mexicanos attempted to both jump into the romantic Spanish storytelling by emphasizing their Spanish roots and long connection to the region and to distance themselves from the stock narrative by interpreting their colonial inheritance in ways that made sense to them. This is not to say that the process was premeditated on any part. Rather, it unfolded over a century of time when it produced desired cultural and social outcomes. Stories of the Spanish past gave citizens of the Southwest a sense that they belonged to the region and that it belonged to them.

The physical and ideological construction of the romantic Spanish past defined the Southwest as a region and justified its conquest by white Americans. It provided a widely-understood mythology that celebrated and promoted the cities within the region while glossing over the tensions inherent in the history of colonization. Although the process and timeline of construction differed from place to place, the intended outcome was the same—to cast the contentious history of the region's transition from Spanish and Mexican control to U.S. sovereignty as a placid story of American inheritance of Spanish land and culture. Mexicanos, aware of the violence against their narrative represented by this imagined past, sought to draw ties to their own history in order to solidify their identities on their terms. That contemporary Mexicanos have a greater role in commemorations like the Albuquerque Tricentennial indicates a triumph of the romantic past and a greater potential for that narrative to be co-opted to alternative ends. Counternarratives persist in new traditions like Día de los Muertos. Streams of migration from Mexico continue to bring Mexicanos with their own vision of the Spanish past and Spanish/Mexican identity into the Southwest. The confrontation of the stories held by the many citizens of the Southwest and the history of memory in the region ensure that the Spanish past will continue to be contested ground.

REFERENCES

Newspapers

Albuquerque Journal
Arizona Daily Star [Tucson, AZ]
El Defensor del Pueblo [Socorro, NM]
El Imparcial de Texas [San Antonio, TX]
El Tucsonense
La Bandera Americana [Albuquerque, NM]
La Epoca [San Antonio, TX]
La Prensa [San Antonio, TX]
New York Times
San Antonio Daily Light
San Antonio Express
Tucson Citizen
Tucson Daily Citizen

Archives

Arizona Historical Society Library and Archives, Tucson.

Briscoe Center for American History, University of Texas at Austin.

Center for Southwest Research, Zimmerman Library, University of New Mexico, Albuquerque.

Daughters of the Republic of Texas Library, San Antonio Texas.

Fray Angélico Chávez History Library, Santa Fe, New Mexico.

San Antonio Conservation Society Library, San Antonio, Texas.

Special Collections at the University of Arizona Libraries, Tucson.

Special Collections, John Peace Library, University of Texas at San Antonio.

Published Sources

Ables, L. Robert. "The Second Battle for the Alamo." *The Southwestern Historical Quarterly* 70, no. 3 (January 1967 1967): 372-413.

Adams, F. "Tucson in 1847: Reminiscences of Judge F. Adams--Description of the Fort, and So Forth." *Arizona Historical Review* 1 (Winter, 1929 1929): 83-85.

Anonymous. "Scenes in Texas." *Graham's Magazine*, 1851, 37-40.

Arias, Santa, and Mariselle Melendez, eds. *Mapping Colonial Spanish America: Places and Commonplaces of Identity, Culture, and Experience.* Lewisburg: Bucknell University Press, 2002.

Arreola, Daniel, ed. *Hispanic Spaces, Latino Places: Community and Cultural Diversity in Contemporary America*. Austin: University of Texas Press, 2004.

Arreola, Daniel D. "Plaza Towns of South Texas." *Geographical Review* 82, no. 1 (January, 1992 1992): 56-73.

———. "Urban Ethnic Landscape Identity." *Geographical Review* 85, no. 4 (October, 1995 1995): 518-34.

Austin, Mary. "Native Drama in Our Southwest." *The Nation*, April 20 1927, 437-40.

Bartlett, John Russell. *Personal Narrative of Explorations and Incidents in Texas, New Mexico, California, Sonora and Chihuahua*. 2 vols. Vol. 1, New York: Appleton, 1854.

Bates, Esther Willard. *Pageants and Pageantry.* Boston: Ginn and Co., 1912.

Beard, Adelia Belle. "The American Pageant." *American Homes and Gardens*, July 1912, 239-41, 63-64.

Berg Sobré, Judith. *San Antonio on Parade: Six Historic Festivals.* College Station: Texas A&M University Press, 2003.

Bokovoy, Matthew F. *The San Diego World's Fairs and Southwestern Memory, 1880-1940.* Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2005.

Bourke, John G. "The Miracle Play of the Rio Grande." *The Journal of American Folklore* 6, no. 21 (April- June, 1893 1893): 89-95.

Brandes, Stanley. "The Day of the Dead, Halloween, and the Quest for Mexican National Identity." *Journal Of American Folklore* 111, no. 442 (1998): 359-80.

Browne, John Ross. *Adventures in the Apache Country: A Tour through Arizona and Sonora, with Notes on the Silver Regions of Nevada.* New York: Harper and Brothers, 1869.

Burstein, Andrew. *The Original Knickerbocker: The Life of Washington Irving.* New York: Basic Books, 2008.

Caldwell, Richard. *A True History of the Acquisition of Washington's Headquarters at Newburgh by the State of New York* Salisbury Mills, NY: Stivers, Slauson and Boyd, 1887.

Camarillo, Albert. *Chicanos in a Changing Society: From Mexican Pueblos to American Barrios in Santa Barbara and Southern California, 1848-1930.* Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1979.

Campa, Arthur Leon. *Spanish Religious Folktheatre in the Southwest.* Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1934.

Carrigan, William D, and Clive Webb. "The Lynching of Persons of Mexican Origin or Descent in the United States, 1848 to 1928." *Journal of Social History* 37, no. 2 (2003): 411-38.

Chatterjee, Partha. *The Nation and Its Fragments: Colonial and Postcolonial Histories.* Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1993.

Cobb, James C. *Away Down South: A History of Southern Identity.* New York: Oxford University Press, 2005.

———. *The Most Southern Place on Earth: The Mississippi Delta and the Roots of Regional Identity.* New York: Oxford University Press, 1992.

Cole, M. R., ed. *Los Pastores: A Mexican Play of the Nativity.* Boston: Houghton, Mifflin, 1907.

Colligan, John B. *The Juan Paéz Hurtado Expedition of 1695: Fraud in Recruiting Colonists for New Mexico.* Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1995.

Colton, Walter. *Three Years in California.* New York: Barnes, 1854.

Confino, Alon. "Collective Memory and Cultural History: Problems of Method." *The American Historical Review* 102, no. 5 (1997): 1386-403.

Copeland, John H. *Editorial Souvenir of San Antonio: Past, Present, and Future.* San Antonio: Johnson Brothers, 1892.

Corner, William. *San Antonio De Bexar: A Guide and History.* San Antonio: Bainbridge and Corner, 1890.

Cromwell, Oliver. "Speech at the Opening of Parliament." In *The Black Legend: Anti-Spanish Attitudes in the Old World and the New*, edited by Charles Gibson. New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1971.

Crouch, Dora P., Daniel J. Garr, and Axel I. Mundigo. *Spanish City Planning in North America.* Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 1982.

Cruz, Gilberto Rafael. *Let There Be Towns: Spanish Municipal Origins in the American Southwest, 1610-1810.* College Station: Texas A&M University Press, 1988.

Davis, Mike. *City of Quartz: Excavating the Future in Los Angeles.* London: Verso, 1990.

de la Teja, Jesús. *San Antonio De Béxar: A Community on New Spain's Northern Frontier.* Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1995.

de León, Arnoldo. "Region and Ethnicity: Topographical Identities in Texas." In *Many Wests: Place, Culture, and Regional Identity*, edited by David M. Wrobel and Michael C. Steiner. Lawrence: The University Press of Kansas, 1997.

———. *They Called Them Greasers: Anglo Attitudes toward Mexicans in Texas, 1821-1900* Austin: University of Texas Press, 1983.

DeGuzmán, María. *Spain's Long Shadow: The Black Legend, Off-Whiteness, and Anglo-American Empire.* Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2005.

Deverell, William. *Whitewashed Adobe: The Rise of Los Angeles and the Remaking of Its Mexican Past.* Berkeley: University of California Press, 2004.

Diehl, Michael W., and Allison C. Diehl. "Economics, Ideology, and the Brick Industry in Tucson." *Journal of the Southwest* 43, no. 3 (2001): 423-46.

Dike, Sheldon Holland. *Territorial Post Offices of New Mexico.* Albuquerque: S.H. Dike, 1958.

Dobyns, Henry F. *Spanish Colonial Tucson: A Demographic History.* Tucson: Unversity of Arizona Press, 1976.

Efnor, Kate, and Laura J. Irvine. "Historical Sketch of San Antonio." In *The American Sketch Book: An Historical and Home Monthly*, edited by Bella French Swisher, 357-99. Austin: The Sketch Book Company, 1881.

Ehrisman, Laura Elizabeth. "Inventing the Fiesta City: Heritage and Performance in San Antonio's Public Culture." University of Texas, 2003.

Elson, Mark D, William H Doelle, and Lisa G. Eppley. "Archaeological Assessment of the Mission Road Extension: Testing at Az Bb: 13: 6 (Asm)." In *Technical Report*: Institute for American Research, 1987.

Espinosa, Carmen. "Coronado Celebration Costumes." *New Mexico Magazine*, 1940, 20-21.

Estrada, William D. "Los Angeles' Old Plaza and Olvera Street: Imagined and Contested Space." *Western Folklore* 58, no. 2 (Winter 1999): 107-29.

Fairbanks, George R. *The Early History of Florida: An Introductory Lecture Delivered by George R. Fairbanks, Esq., before the Florida Historical Society.* St. Augustine: The Florida Historical Society, 1857.

Fisher, Lewis F. *Saving San Antonio: The Precarious Preservation of a Heritage.* Lubbock: Texas Tech University Press, 1996.

Flores, Richard R. *Los Pastores: History and Performance in the Mexican Shepherds' Play of South Texas.* Washington D. C.: Smithsonian Institution Press, 1995.

———. "Los Pastores: Performance, Poetics, and Politics in Folk Drama." Dissertation, University of Texas, 1989.

Flores, Richard R. . *Remembering the Alamo: Memory, Modernity, and the Master Symbol.* Austin: University of Texas Press, 2002.

Foley, Neil. *The White Scourge: Mexicans, Blacks, and Poor Whites in Texas Cotton Culture.* Berkeley: University of California Press, 1997.

Foote, Henry Stuart. *Texas and the Texans: Or, Advance of the Anglo-Americans to the Southwest.* 2 vols. Vol. 1, Philadelphia: Thomas, Cowperthwait & Co., 1841.

Freneau, Philip. *The Poems of Philip Freneau.* Philadelphia: Francis Bailey, 1786.

Frost, John. *Incidents and Narratives of Travel in Europe, Asia, Africa and America: In Various Periods of History.* Auburn, N.Y.: JE Beardsley, 1857.

Gish, Robert. *Beautiful Swift Fox: Erna Fergusson and the Modern Southwest.* College Station: Texas A & M University Press, 1996.

Glassberg, David. *American Historical Pageantry: The Uses of Tradition in the Early Twentieth Century.* Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1990.

———. *Sense of History: The Place of the Past in American Life.* Amherst: University of Massachusetts Press, 2001.

Goff, George P. *San Antonio and Environs.* Lancaster, PA: Inquirer Printing and Publishing Company, 1881.

Gómez, Laura E. *Manifest Destinies: The Making of the Mexican American Race.* New York: New York University Press, 2007.

González, Deena J. *Refusing the Favor: The Spanish-Mexican Women of Santa Fe, 1820-1880*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1999.

Green, Thomas J. *Journal of the Texian Expedition against Mier*. Austin: The Steck Company, 1935.

Greenleaf, Cameron, and Andrew Wallace. "Tucson: Pueblo, Presidio, and American City; a Synopsis of Its History." *Arizoniana* 3, no. 2 (Summer 1962 1962): 18-27.

Gregg, Josiah. *Commerce of the Prairies*. 1844; reprint, with a new introduction by Archibald Hanna, Philadelphia: Lippincott, 1962. 1844.

Griswold del Castillo, Richard. *The Los Angeles Barrio, 1850-1890: A Social History*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1979.

———. *The Treaty of Guadalupe Hidalgo: A Legacy of Conflict*. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1990.

Gutiérrez, David G. "Significant to Whom? Mexican Americans and the History of the American West." *Western Historical Quarterly* 24, no. 4 (November 1993 1993): 519-40.

———. *Walls and Mirrors: Mexican Americans, Mexican Immigrants, and the Politics of Ethnicity*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1995.

Habell-Palla n, Michelle. *Loca Motion: The Travels of Chicana and Latina Popular Culture*. New York: New York University, 2005.

Hafertepe, Kenneth. "The Romantic Rhetoric of the Spanish Governor's Palace, San Antonio, Texas." *The Southwestern Historical Quarterly* 107, no. 2 (2003): 238-77.

Halbwachs, Maurice. *On Collective Memory / Maurice Halbwachs; Edited, Translated, and with an Introduction by Lewis A. Coser*. Translated by Lewis A. Coser. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1992.

Hard, Robert J, and William H. Doelle. *The San Agusti N Mission Site, Tucson, Arizona*. Archaeological Series. Vol. 118, Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1978.

Harte, John Bret. "Frank C. Lockwood: Historian of the Southwest." *Arizona and the West* 9, no. 2 (Summer, 1967 1967): 109-30.

Hayden, Dolores. *The Power of Place: Urban Landscapes as Public History*. Cambridge: The MIT Press, 1995.

Herna ndez-Ehrisman, Laura. *Inventing the Fiesta City: Heritage and Carnival in San Antonio.* Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2008.

Hobsbawm, Eric. "Inventing Traditions." In *The Invention of Tradition*, edited by Eric Hobsbawm and Terence Ranger. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1983.

Hobsbawm, Eric , and Terence Ranger, eds. *The Invention of Tradition.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1983.

Hodgkin, Katharine, and Susannah Radstone, eds. *Contested Pasts: The Politics of Memory.* New York: Routledge, 2003.

Hoelscher, Steven. *Heritage on Stage: The Invention of Ethnic Place in America's Little Switzerland.* Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1998.

Horsman, Reginald. *Race and Manifest Destiny: The Origins of American Racial Anglo-Saxonism.* Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1981.

Howe, Barbara J. "Women in Historic Preservation: The Legacy of Ann Pamela Cunningham." *The Public Historian* 12, no. 1 (1990): 31-61.

Huning, Franz. *Trader on the Santa Fe Trail: The Memoirs of Franz Huning.* edited by Lina Fergusson Browne Albuquerque: University of Albuquerque, 1973.

Hutton, Patrick. "Recent Scholarship on Memory and History." *The History Teacher* 33, no. 4 (2000): 533-48.

Hutton, Ronald. *The Rise and Fall of Merry England: The Ritual Year, 1400-1700.* New York: Oxford University Press, 1994.

Igo, John. *Los Pastores: An Annotated Bibliography.* San Antonio: San Antonio College Library, 1967.

Irving, Theodore. *The Conquest of Florida by Hernando De Soto.* New York: GP Putman & Co, 1857.

Jackson, Helen Hunt. *Ramona.* New York: Modern Library, 2005. 1884.

Johnson, Benjamin H. *Revolution in Texas : How a Forgotten Rebellion and Its Bloody Suppression Turned Mexicans into Americans* New Haven: Yale University Press, 2003.

Kansteiner, Wulf. "Finding Meaning in Memory: A Methodological Critique of Collective Memory Studies." *History and Theory* 41, no. 2 (2002): 179-97.

Kelly, L.F., and S. Williamson. *Beautiful San Antonio.* San Antonio: J. R. Wood Printing, 1909.

King, Edward. "Glimpses of Texas--I: A Visit to San Antonio." *Scribner's Monthly: An Illustrated Magazine*, January 1874, 302-22.

Klein, Kerwin Lee. "On the Emergence of Memory in Historical Discourse." *Representations*, no. 69 (Winter 2000): 127-50.

Kropp, Phoebe S. *California Vieja: Culture and Memory in a Modern American Place.* Berkeley: University of California Press, 2006.

Limón, José E. "Folklore, Social Conflict, and the United States-Mexico Border." In *Handbook of American Folklore*, edited by Richard M. Dorson. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1983.

———. *The Return of the Mexican Ballad: Américo Paredes and His Anthropological Text as Persuasive Political Performance.* Working Paper Series. Vol. 16, Stanford: Stanford Center For Chicano Research, 1986.

———. "Western Marxism and Folklore: A Critical Introduction." *Journal of American Folklore*, no. 96 (1983): 34-52.

Lockwood, Frank C. *With Padre Kino on the Trail.* Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1934.

Logan, Michael F. *Fighting Sprawl and City Hall: Resistance to Urban Growth in the Southwest.* Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1995.

Looscan, Adele B. "The Work of the Daughters of the Republic of Texas in Behalf of the Alamo." *The Quarterly of the Texas State Historical Association* 8, no. 1 (July 1904 1904): 79-82.

Low, Setha. *On the Plaza: The Politics of Public Space and Culture.* Austin: University of Texas Press, 2000.

Lucero-White, Aurora. *Coloquios De Los Pastores (Colloquies of the Shepherds) a Centuries-Old Christmas Folk Play.* Santa Fe: Santa Fe Press, 1940.

Luna Lucero, Brian. "Old Towns Challenged by the Boom Town: The Villages of the Middle Rio Grande Valley and the Albuquerque Tricentennial." *New Mexico Historical Review* 82, no. 1 (Winter 2007 2007): 37-69.

Lynch, Arthur Joseph. *George Rainsford Fairbanks: A Man of Many Facets.* Los Altos, California: Shambles Press, 1999.

MacFadden, Harry Alexander. *Rambles in the Far West.* Holidaysburg, PA: Standard Printing House, 1906.

Marchi, Regina M. *Day of the Dead in the USA: The Migration and Transformation of a Cultural Phenomenon.* New Brunswick, N.J.: Rutgers University Press, 2009.

———. "Hybridity and Authenticity in U.S. Day of the Dead Celebrations." *Journal of American Folklore* 126, no. 501 (Summer 2013 2013): 272-301.

Matovina, Timothy M. *Tejano Religion and Ethnicity: San Antonio, 1821-1860.* Austin: University of Texas Press, 1995.

McCarthy, Helen. "The League of Nations, Public Ritual and National Identity in Britain, C.1919–56." *History Workshop Journal* 70, no. 1 (2010 2010): 108-32.

McCarty, Kieran. *Desert Documentary: The Spanish Years, 1767-1821.* Tucson: Arizona Historical Society, 1976.

McClung, William Alexander. *Landscapes of Desire: Anglo Mythologies of Los Angeles* Berkeley: University of California Press, 2000.

McWilliams, Carey. *North from Mexico: The Spanish-Speaking People of the United States.* Philadelphia: J. B. Lippincott Co., 1948.

Metzgar, Joseph. "The Atrisco Land Grant; 1692-1977." *New Mexico Historical Review* 52, no. 4 (October 1977 1977): 269-96.

Mitchell, Don, and Lynn A. Staeheli. "Turning Social Relations into Space: Property, Law and the Plaza of Santa Fe, New Mexico." *Landscape Research* 30, no. 3 (2005 2005): 361-78.

Monroy, Douglas. *Rebirth : Mexican Los Angeles from the Great Migration to the Great Depression.* Berkeley: University of California Press, 1999.

———. *Thrown among Strangers: The Making of Mexican Culture in Frontier California.* Berkeley: University of California Press, 1990.

Montejano, David. *Anglos and Mexicans in the Making of Texas, 1836-1986.* Austin: University of Texas Press, 1987.

Montgomery, Charles. *The Spanish Redemption: Heritage, Power, and Loss on New Mexico's Upper Rio Grande* Berkeley: University of California Press, 2002.

Moore, Sarah J. "Making a Spectacle of Suffrage: The National Woman Suffrage Pageant, 1913." *Journal of American Culture* 20, no. 1 (1997): 89-103.

Morley, Judy Mattivi. *Historic Preservation & the Imagined West: Albuquerque, Denver, and Seattle.* Lawrence: University Press of Kansas, 2006.

Mowry, Sylvester. *Arizona and Sonora: The Geography, History, and Resources of the Silver Region of North America.* New York: Harper & Brothers, 1866.

Munroe, Kirk. "San Antonio De Bexar." *Harper's Weekly*, September 25 1897, 957-58.

Murtagh, William J. *Keeping Time: The History and Theory of Preservation in America.* Pittstown, N.J.: Main Street Press, 1988.

Nieto-Phillips, John M. *Language of Blood: The Making of Spanish-American Identity in New Mexico, 1880s-1930s.* Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2008.

Nostrand, Richard L. *The Hispano Homeland.* Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1992.

Nugnes, Barbara. "Paradise Regained: Washington Irving's Mythological Spain." In *America and the Mediterranean: Aisna, Associazione Italiana Di Studi Nord-Americani, Proceedings of the Sixteenth Biennial International Conference, Genova, November 8-11, 2001*, edited by Massimo Bacigalupo and Pierangelo Castagneto. Torino: Otto Editore, 2003.

Page, Max. *The Creative Destruction of Manhattan, 1900-1940.* Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1999.

Paredes, Raymund A. "The Mexican Image in American Travel Literature, 1831-1869." *New Mexico Historical Review* 52, no. 1 (Jan 1 1977): 5-29.

Pascoe, Peggy. *Relations of Rescue: The Search for Female Moral Authority in the American West, 1874-1939.* New York: Oxford University Press, 1990.

Passenger Traffic Department. *San Antonio, a Picturesque Metropolis of the Southwest.* Houston: Southern Pacific Lines, ca. 1920s.

Picturesque San Antonio, Where Life Is Different. San Antonio: San Antonio Municipal Information Bureau, 1939.

Pike, Albert. *Prose Sketches and Poems: Written in the Western Country.* Boston: Light & Horton, 1834.

Porter, Joseph C. *Paper Medicine Man: John Gregory Bourke and His American West.* Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1986.

Powell, Philip Wayne. *Tree of Hate: Propaganda and Prejudices Affecting United States Relations with the Hispanic World.* Vallecito, California: Ross House Books, 1985.

Rael, Juan B. *The Sources and Diffusion of the Mexican Shepherds' Plays.* Guadalajara: Libreria La Joyita, 1965.

Roberts, Randy, and James S. Olson. *A Line in the Sand: The Alamo in Blood and Memory.* New York: Free Press, 2001.

Rodríguez, Sylvia. *The Matachines Dance: Ritual Symbolism and Interethnic Relations in the Upper Río Grande Valley.* Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1996.

Romo, Ricardo. *East Los Angeles: History of a Barrio* Austin: University of Texas Press, 1983.

Samora, Julian, Joe Bernal, and Albert Peña. *Gunpowder Justice: A Reassessment of the Texas Rangers.* Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame Press, 1979.

Sánchez, George J. *Becoming Mexican American: Ethnicity, Culture and Identity in Chicano Los Angeles, 1900-1945.* New York: Oxford University Press, 1993.

Scarpaci, Joseph L. *Plazas and Barrios: Heritage Tourism and Globalization in the Latin American Centro Histórico.* Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 2004.

Schwartz, Barry. *Abraham Lincoln and the Forge of National Memory.* Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2000.

Shackel, Paul A. *Memory in Black and White: Race, Commemoration, and the Post-Bellum Landscape.* New York: Altamira Press, 2003.

Sheridan, Thomas. *Los Tucsonenses: The Mexican Community in Tucson, 1854-1941.* Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1986.

Sherman, Edmund. "New Mexico Celebrates." *New Mexico Magazine*, 1940, 11-15.

Shields, David S. . *Oracles of Empire: Poetry, Politics, and Commerce in British America, 1690-1750.* Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1990.

Simmons, Marc. *Albuquerque, a Narrative History.* Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1982.

Slotkin, Richard. *Gunfighter Nation: The Myth of the Frontier in Twentieth-Century America.* New York: Atheneum, 1992.

———. *Regeneration through Violence: The Mythology of the American Frontier, 1600-1860.* Middletown: Wesleyan University Press, 1973.

———. *The Fatal Environment: The Myth of the Frontier in the Age of Industrialization, 1800-1890.* New York: Atheneum, 1985.

Smith, Harvey Partridge. *Romantic San Antonio* San Antonio: Jackson Printing Company, 1918.

Smith, Henry Nash. *Virgin Land: The American West as Symbol and Myth.* Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1950.

Sonnichsen, Charles Leland. *Tucson: The Life and Times of an American City.* Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1987.

Southwick, Sally. *Building on a Borrowed Past: Place and Identity in Pipestone, Minnesota*. Athens: Ohio University Press, 2005.

St. Louis Pageant Drama Association. *Pageant and Masque of Saint Louis 1914: Reports of the Chairmen of Committees.* St. Louis: Shelly Print, 1916.

Starr, Kevin. *Inventing the Dream: California through the Progressive Era.* New York: Oxford university Press, 1986.

———. *Material Dreams: Southern California through the 1920s.* New York: Oxford University Press, 1990.

Stocking Jr., George W. . *Victorian Anthropology.* New York: The Free Press, 1987.

Stowe, Harriet Beecher. *Palmetto-Leaves*. Boston: James R. Osgood and Company, 1873.

The Albuquerque Town Grant, Its Character and History with a Map of the Grant and the City of Albuquerque Washington, D. C.: W.H. Moore, 1884.

Trouillot, Michel-Rolph. *Silencing the Past: Power and the Production of History* Boston: Beacon Press, 1995.

Turner, Frederick Jackson. "The Significance of the Frontier in American History." In *Rereading Frederick Jackson Turner*, edited by John Mack Faragher. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1994.

Tyrrell, Ian. *Woman's World/Woman's Christian Temperance Union: The Women's Christian Temperance Union in International Perspective, 1800-1930*. Chapel Hill: The University of North Carolina Press, 1991.

Underdown, David. *Revel, Riot, and Rebellion: Popular Politics and Culture in England, 1603-1660.* New York: Oxford University Press, 1985.

Van Slyck, Abigail A. "What the Bishop Learned: The Importance of Claiming Space at Tucson's Church Plaza." *Journal of Arizona History* 39 (Summer 1998 1998): 121-40.

Veregge, Nina. "Transformations of Spanish Urban Landscapes in the American Southwest, 1821-1900." *Journal of the Southwest* 35, no. 4 (1993): 371-459.

Waugh, Julia Nott. *The Silver Cradle: Las Posadas, Los Pastores and Other Mexican American Traditions*. Austin: University of Texas Press, 1983.

Weber, David J. *The Spanish Frontier in North America*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1992.

Wertheimer, Eric. *Imagined Empires: Incas, Aztecs, and the New World of American Literature, 1771-1876*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998.

Willughby, Francis. "Relation of a Voyage Made through a Great Part of Spain." In *The Black Legend: Anti-Spanish Attitudes in the Old World and the New*, edited by Charles Gibson. New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1971.

Wilson, Chris. *The Myth of Santa Fe: Creating a Modern Regional Tradition.* Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1997.

Wilson, Chris, and Stefanos Polyzoides. *The Plazas of New Mexico*. San Antonio: Trinity University Press, 2011.

Wright, Ione William Tanner. *San Antonio De Béxar: Historical, Traditional, Legendary; an Epitome of Early Texas History*. Austin: Morgan Printing Company, 1916.

Wrobel, David M., and Michael C. Steiner, eds. *Many Wests: Place, Culture, and Regional Identity*. Lawrence: The University Press of Kansas, 1997.

Yuhl, Stephanie. *A Golden Haze of Memory: The Making of Historic Charleston.* Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2005.