

2012

SparOptLib - A Testing Library of Sparse Solution Recovery Problems

Ana-Iulia Alexandrescu
Lehigh University

Follow this and additional works at: <http://preserve.lehigh.edu/etd>

Recommended Citation

Alexandrescu, Ana-Iulia, "SparOptLib - A Testing Library of Sparse Solution Recovery Problems" (2012). *Theses and Dissertations*. Paper 1323.

This Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by Lehigh Preserve. It has been accepted for inclusion in Theses and Dissertations by an authorized administrator of Lehigh Preserve. For more information, please contact preserve@lehigh.edu.

SparOptLib – A Testing Library of Sparse Solution Recovery Problems

by

Ana-Iulia Alexandrescu

A Thesis

Presented to the Graduate and Research Committee

of Lehigh University

in Candidacy for the Degree of

Master of Science

in

Industrial and Systems Engineering

Lehigh University

January 2012

Certification of Approval

This thesis is accepted and approved in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the Master of Science degree.

Date

Thesis Advisor

Chairperson of Department

Acknowledgments

This thesis represents a joint work with Dr. Katya Scheinberg , thesis advisor, and Bai Xi, colleague and Doctoral Candidate, both from the Department of Industrial and Systems Engineering.

Table of Contents

| | |
|---|-----|
| Certification of Approval..... | ii |
| Acknowledgments..... | iii |
| Abstract..... | 1 |
| Introduction..... | 2 |
| The Sparse Solution Recovery Problem | 4 |
| Convex Relaxations | 5 |
| Review of Algorithms and Solution Approach..... | 6 |
| SparOptLib – a Collection of Sparse Solution Recovery Problems | 8 |
| SparOptLib – A Testing Environment for Sparse Solution Recovery Algorithms..... | 11 |
| User’s Guide | 14 |
| Download..... | 14 |
| Instance format..... | 14 |
| Matrix vs. Function Handle | 15 |
| References..... | 16 |
| Appendix A: Instance Structure..... | 18 |
| Appendix B: SparOptLib Catalog..... | 19 |
| Appendix C: SparOptLib Poster | 27 |
| Vita..... | 28 |

Abstract

The Sparse Solution Recovery (SSR) problem arises in a very large number of practical applications, of which some of the most notable are compressed sensing, image and signal processing, seismic data recovery, gene sequencing, feature selection in machine learning. Given this wide array of applications that rely on effective recovery of sparse solutions from large underdetermined linear systems, developing efficient algorithms to solve the SSR problem is of paramount importance. Last ten years have witnessed an explosion of algorithms that aim to solve the SSR, most of which use a variety of different convex relaxations of the original formulation. The absence of a reference test set of problems and a proposed method to quantify the quality of the solution reached by any of these solvers prevents researchers from estimating which problems are hard and under what conditions some approaches lead to faster convergence than others. Through SparOptLib, we aim to provide researchers in the field with a collection of problems and a framework for testing sparse solution recovery algorithms. The problems are drawn from a variety of applications, including compressed sensing and signal processing, and cover a wide range of size, difficulty, and sparsity. The current version of the library contains over 300 instances provided in a standard format, which includes suggested target accuracy for optimization. It is our hope that SparOptLib will provide a universal testing framework and will enable researchers to develop improved algorithms for this class of problems.

Introduction

The Sparse Solution Recovery (SSR) problem arises in a number of practical applications. Most notably, compressed sensing and signal processing, machine learning, seismic data recovery and gene sequencing rely on recovering sparse solutions to linear underdetermined systems. Recently, there has been an explosion of interest in this special class of optimization problems, mainly because of an increased interest in machine learning and the development of efficient algorithms for machine learning. These circumstances led to a very active research interest in developing efficient algorithms for recovering sparse solutions, and a number of software packages exist today.

Collections of test problems exist in various areas of optimization, including NETLIB for linear programming problems, CUTER for nonlinear optimization, SDPLIB for semi-definite programming, and MIPLIB for mixed-integer linear programming problems. These collections have become standard for testing algorithms, benchmarking and calibrating parameters to improve algorithm robustness and convergence speed and for providing a wide spectrum of problems in their respective areas. In turn, this has led to the development of improved algorithms and has provided insight into problem structures that can be leveraged for better algorithmic convergence.

Through SparOptLib, we aim to provide researchers with a similar collection of problems and testing framework in the area of SSR. Currently, the library contains over 300 instances drawn from a variety of applications and sources. The problems reflect a wide range of difficulty and size and we hope they provide a complex enough environment for testing the robustness of different solvers and solution approaches. The following paper provides a background on the SSR problem and its convex relaxations, a short inventory of the solver packages available to

solve SSR, a detailed description of the library and a user's manual that we hope will enable researchers to benefit from SparOptLib.

The Sparse Solution Recovery Problem

The motivation behind sparse optimization is simple: sometimes, simple approximate solutions that can be easily obtainable are preferable to exact solutions that are computationally prohibitive (S. Wright 2009). This may arise because simple solutions are far easier to obtain or more robust, or because completely accurate cannot be obtained because of noise levels. In the context of large, full-rank underdetermined linear systems of the type

$$Ax = b$$

we have an infinity of solutions, but we are interested in finding sparse solutions x that satisfy the equations. In particular, if our aim is to find the sparsest solution, the sparse solution recovery problem can be modeled as follows:

$$\min \|x\|_0$$

$$s. t. Ax = b$$

where $x \in R^n$ represents the signal we are trying to recover, A is an $m - by - n$ matrix, and $b \in R^m$ represents the vector of observations. By $\|x\|_0$ we mean the 0-norm of vector x , defined as the number of non-zero components in the signal.

Convex Relaxations

The zero-norm integer formulation of the SSR problem was proved to be NP-hard by Davis et al., and thus is rarely solved in practice. Instead, convex relaxations that replace the zero-norm with the L1-norm are used. Additionally, since most solvers focus on solving the L1-relaxations, obtaining a perfectly feasible solution is often impractical, and thus we are often times satisfied with just *approximately* complying with the feasibility constraints $Ax = b$ and we use instead $\|Ax - b\|_p \leq \varepsilon_b, \varepsilon_b \geq 0$.

There are three L1-relaxations that are most recurring in the literature and are widely used in solver packages (S. Wright 2009):

1. Basis-Pursuit De-Noising (BPDN)

$$\min \|x\|_1$$

$$s. t. \|Ax - b\|_2 \leq \varepsilon_b$$

2. Lagrangian relaxation of the BPDN formulation (LAG)

$$\min \frac{1}{2} \|Ax - b\|_2^2 + \rho \|x\|_1$$

3. Least Absolute Shrinkage and Selection Operator (LASSO)

$$\min \frac{1}{2} \|Ax - b\|_2^2$$

$$s. t. \|x\|_1 \leq \sigma, \sigma > 0$$

Each of these formulations takes a different approach to solving the L1-relaxation of the SSR problem, and often reach different solution if applied to the same problem. The next section provides a brief overview of the solvers that exist currently for solving the SSR problem and the respective convex L1-reformulation each solver uses.

Review of Algorithms and Solution Approach

Following is a list of several SSR solvers, grouped by the formulation they approach. This list is by no means exhaustive – it groups several of the more popular solvers currently available.

BPDN

- TFOCS – Templates for First-Order Conic Solvers (Becker, Candès and Grant 2011)
- NESTA – Nesterov’s Algorithm (Becker, Bobin and Candès 2009)
- SALSA – Split Augmented Lagrangian Shrinkage Algorithm(Afonso, Bioucas-Dias and Figueiredo 2009)
- SPGL1 – Spectral-Projected Gradient Algorithm (Berg and Friedlander 2010)
- YALL1 – Your Algorithm for L1(Yang and Zhang 2009)

LAG

- TFOCS
- NESTA
- SALSA
- SPGL1
- YALL1
- IST – Iterative Shrinking Threshold(Daubechies, Defrise and Mol 2004)
- TwIST – Two Step Iterative Shrinkage/Thresholding(Bioucas-Dias and Figueiredo 2007)
- FISTA – Fast Iterative Shrinkage/ Thresholding Algorithm (Beck and Teboulle 2009)
- FPC – Fixed-Point Continuation scheme (Hale, Yin and Zhang 2007)

- GPSR – Gradient Projection for Sparse Reconstruction (Figueiredo, Nowak and Wright 2007)
- SpaRSA – Sparse Reconstructions by Separable Approximation (Wright, Nowak and Figueiredo 2008)
- ALM – Augmented Lagrangian Method (Yang, et al. 2010)
- FALM – First-order Augmented Lagrangian Method (Aybat and Iyengar 2010)

LASSO

- SPGL1 – Spectral-Projected Gradient Algorithm
- YALL1 – Your Algorithm for L1
- IST – Iterative Shrinkage/Thresholding

It is worth reiterating that this is a very brief list and it is by no means exhaustive.

Specifically, all solvers listed above use first-order methods for solving SSR. There are other convex optimization-based solvers that use interior-point methods, as well as non-optimization-based solvers (“greedy” algorithms). S. Becker’s webpage (List of sparse and Low-rank recovery algorithms) offers a more comprehensive review of the algorithms.

SparOptLib – a Collection of Sparse Solution Recovery Problems

The wide array of solvers available, the various formulations and relaxations that they tackle, and the lack of a standardized reference problem set create issues in assessing the relative difficulty of a problem and the solver performance, as well as in improving the robustness of the algorithms. We created SparOptLib to provide a standardized format for sparse solution recovery instances, which we found to be compatible with most of the solvers we came across.

Each instance represents a structure p with the following fields:

- A – m -by- n matrix of the system
- rhs –right-hand side vector of observations
- sol –true solution (provided by the authors of the problem)
- m, n –size of A (also referred to as the size of the problem)
- $noise$ –noise level
- $info$ –instance documentation

SparOptLib currently contains over 300 instances of varying size and difficulty. These problems can be grouped according to their origin, into three categories.

The first contributions came from A. Nemirovski, who provided the four problems that contain his name. Not much other information is available on these problems.

Next, some 30+ instances were generated using the Sparco Toolbox(2007). Sparco represents a collection of sparse signal recovery problems and an environment to create new problems using

the suite of linear operators provided. For these instances, several problems provided in Sparco were selected to illustrate a varied range of applications. However, we restricted ourselves to the use of those problems for which a solution was provided, as this was needed to establish a reference for the target accuracy for optimization to be strived for by the solvers. In addition, we created three sizes for each instance: a “small” instance, which was the original problem provided by Sparco; a “medium”-sized version, which made each of the dimensions of the problem five times bigger than in the “small” version, and thus the problem grew in size 25 times; a “large” version, which similarly increased each of the dimensions tenfold and thus led to an instance 100 times bigger than its “small” counterpart. This procedure allowed us to introduce size variability, which has been documented to significantly impact solver performance. The naming convention kept the original Sparco ID of the problem and appended the relative size as a one-letter suffix (ex. `sparco1s`, `sparco1m` and `sparco1l` represent three instances of different sizes of the same problem, which has the Sparco ID 1). For readers interested in learning more about Sparco, we recommend referring to the project’s website maintained at the Computer Science Department at the University of British Columbia and to the technical report released with the toolbox, listed under the references page. A note should be made that Sparco provides the matrix A as a function handle rather than in matrix form. While this is strictly an implementation consideration and provides no different behavior in solvers, the additional use of a suite of linear operators to recover A and provide the input to the solver is needed. Please, refer below to the user’s guide for directions on how to get these operators.

The third and largest category of problems was obtained from the Sparse Exact and Approximate Recovery (SPEAR) project (2011). This project is a collaboration between the Institute for Mathematical Optimization and the Institute for Analysis and Algebra from

Technische Universität Braunschweig and it aims to develop a better understanding of the conditions under which sparse solution recovery is possible. 273 problems adapted from the L1-Test Set developed as part of the SPEAR project we re-cast in the standard format proposed and included in SparOptLib, contributing a very large proportion of the library. For the readers interested in reading more about the SPEAR project, please refer to the project website and the technical report that accompanied the L1 Test set, cited in the references.

All problems taken together provide a wide variety, which can be traced on several axes. Some of those that have been demonstrated to affect the solver behavior are listed below and provided for each problem in the “library catalog” in Appendix B and on the library webpage:

- Problem size, given by the size of the system matrix A
- Solution sparsity, provided both as the number of the non-zero components (the zero-norm) and as the relative ratio of the number of non-zero components to the size of the solution (the sparsity ratio)
- Dynamic range, defined as the ratio of the largest to the smallest non-zero components of the solution (recorded in absolute value)

Thus, it is our hope that the SparOptLib collection covers a varied enough range of problems that would render it useful for researchers developing sparse recovery algorithms.

SparOptLib – A Testing Environment for Sparse Solution Recovery

Algorithms

Through SparOptLib, we aim to provide both a test set to be used as a reference, and a method to assess solution quality and/or solver performance. The difficulty in the latter comes mainly from the wide array of approaches taken to solve the problem. Not only are there multiple possible relaxations to the original sparse solution recovery problem, but there are also many solvers, each with a different approach to solving varying relaxations of the problem. Thus, it becomes difficult to evaluate whether a problem is more difficult than another, or to characterize circumstances under which a particular solution approach is better than another one. We propose a framework through which such evaluations can be more easily made, which is captured in the instances by two parameters, ε_b and ε_x , given in three respective pairs. Intuitively, ε_b measures relative “distance from feasibility” for the current solution, while ε_x represents a reasonable target accuracy for optimization. A good solution x satisfies the following relationships with respect to the solution provided, x^* :

$$\|x\|_1 \leq (1 + \varepsilon_x)\|x^*\|_1$$

$$\|Ax - b\|_p \leq \|Ax^* - b\|_p + \varepsilon_b\|b\|_p$$

The first relationship places the solution provided by the solver x within a required radius of “sparsity” with respect to the sparse solution provided with the problem x^* , while the second relationship controls the feasibility of the solution. Thus, the two parameters we introduce model relative tolerance with respect to the tradeoff between sparsity and accuracy/feasibility.

For each problem, three pairs of ε_x and ε_b are provided. The procedure to obtain the three pairs was the following: three values were selected for the parameter ε_b , and with those, the Spectral Projected Gradient Algorithm (SPGL1) solver package developed by M. Friedlander and E. van den Berg was used to obtain corresponding values for ε_x . The values are given in two arrays, ε_b and ε_x , with entries at matching indices corresponding to the same instance. With this additional information, the quality of a solution can be measured by how small the corresponding ε -values are. For example, for a pair value $\varepsilon_b = 10^{-8}$ and $\varepsilon_x = 10^{-4}$ for a particular problem p and using the 2-norm, we mean that within the feasible set

$$\|Ax - b\|_2 \leq \sigma = \|Ax^* - b\|_2 + 10^{-8}\|b\|_2$$

SPGL1 can reach a solution within

$$\|x\|_1 \leq (1 + 10^{-4})\|x^*\|_1$$

L1-accuracy from the solution provided with the problem.

Intuitively, one can see a tradeoff between the two parameters: allowing for larger violations on feasibility has the potential to yield more accurate solutions, and vice-versa, relaxing the requirements on accuracy can produce solutions within the original feasible set.

A few remarks:

The parameter choice one makes for the solver influences its performance. To reach the values provided, we used an “out-of-the-box” version of SPGL1 – no parameter tweaking took place. It is also expected that for some applications, different values for ε_x and ε_b may be appropriate. Thus, rather than an objective reference for solution quality, the ε_x and ε_b pairs provide a way to capture the tradeoff between sparsity and feasibility, which is illustrated on a

“case study” of SPGL1 that resulted in the particular values provided in the library. We leave it up to the researchers to define criteria for optimal performance and to achieve it by calibrate their solvers on the SparOptLib test set.

User's Guide

Download

The problems in SparOptLib are available for download at coral.ie.lehigh.edu/SPAROPTLIB.

Several options for download are available:

- The zip file of the entire library (approx.2.5GB)
- Corresponding subsets of problems grouped by origin or
- Individual instances

A library catalog documenting several features of the problems is provided to help users characterize and locate relevant problems for their use. These features include the size of the instance and the size of the file, the sparsity of the given solution and the dynamic range of the coordinates in the solution provided. All this information is provided with the instance as well.

Instance format

Each instance is organized in a .mat file, in a standard format using the following structure:

- A – m -by- n matrix of the system, given as a matrix or function handle
- rhs –right-hand side vector of observations
- sol –true solution (provided by the authors of the problem)
- m, n –size of A
- $\epsilon_b \in 10^{-8}, 10^{-4}, 10^{-2}$
- $\epsilon_x \in \epsilon_{1,2}, \epsilon_3$, a reasonable accuracy for an estimated signal from the true solution
- $noise$ –noise level

- *info* –instance documentation (includes all the original information supplied with the problem, and additional fields such as sparsity, sparsity ratio and dynamic range of the solution)

This structure provides the input to the sparse solution recovery algorithms to be used. While some pre-processing may be required for individual inputs depending on the solver setup, we found that this structure complies with most of the solvers available. A file demonstrating the use of an instance with the `spg11` package is included for reference.

Matrix vs. Function Handle

A quick note should be made about the problems generated using the Sparco Toolbox. Sparco represents an environment for creating sparse signal reconstruction problems using a suite of linear operators provided. In the current version, all problems that contain “sparco” in the file name have been created using the toolbox. These problems store the information contained in ‘A’ as a function handle, rather than a matrix. In order to recover the information in A and comply with solver input setups, the user needs to download and install the Sparco Toolbox or the Spotbox (a lightweight version of Sparco that consists only of the linear operators needed to recover ‘A’ from the handle). The Spotbox is provided for download with the rest of the SparOptLib. The Sparco Toolbox is available for download on the project website(SPARCO: A toolbox for testing sparse reconstruction algorithms).

References

- Afonso, Manya V., Jose M. Bioucas-Dias, and Mario A. T. Figueiredo. "An Augmented Lagrangian Approach to the constrained optimization formulation of imaging inverse problems." *IEEE Transactions on Image Processing*, December 2009.
- Aybat, Necdet Serhat, and Garud Iyengar. "A First-Order Augmented Lagrangian Method for Compressed Sensing." *Optimization Online*, 2010.
- Beck, Amir, and Marc Teboulle. "A Fast Iterative Shrinkage-Thresholding Algorithm for Linear Inverse Problems." *SIAM Journal on Imaging Sciences*, 2009.
- Becker, S. *List of sparse and Low-rank recovery algorithms*.
<http://www.ugcs.caltech.edu/~srbecker/algorithms.shtml> (accessed 2011).
- Becker, S., E. J. Candès, and M. Grant. *Templates for convex cone problems with applications to sparse signal recovery*. Technical Report, Stanford University, 2011.
- Becker, S., J. Bobin, and E. J. Candès. "NESTA: A fast and accurate first-order method for sparse recovery." *SIAM Journal on Imaging Sciences*, 2009.
- Berg, E. van den, and M. P. Friedlander. *Sparse Optimization with least-squares constraints*. Technical Report, Dep. of Computer Science, Univ. of British Columbia, 2010.
- Berg, E. van den, M. P. Friedlander, G. Hennenfent, F. Herrmann, R. Saab, and O. Yilmaz. *SPARCO: A toolbox for testing sparse reconstruction algorithms*.
<http://www.cs.ubc.ca/labs/scl/sparco/> (accessed 2011).
- Bioucas-Dias, J., and M. Figueiredo. "A new TwIST: two-step iterative shrinkage/thresholding algorithms for image restoration." *IEEE Transactions on Image Processing* (IEEE Transactions on Image Processing), 2007.
- Daubechies, Ingrid, Michel Defrise, and Christine De Mol. "An iterative thresholding algorithm for linear inverse problems with a sparsity constraint." *Communications on Pure and Applied Mathematics*, 2004.
- Figueiredo, Mario A. T., Robert D. Nowak, and Stephen J. Wright. "Gradient Projection for Sparse Reconstruction: application to compressed sensing and other inverse problems." *IEEE Journal of Selected Topics in Signal Processing: Special Issue on Convex Optimization Methods for Signal Processing*, 2007.
- Hale, E. T., W. Yin, and Y. Zhang. *A Fixed-Point Continuation Method for l_1 -Regularized Minimization with Applications to Compressed Sensing*. Technical Report, Houston: Department of Computational and Applied Mathematics, Rice University, 2007.

Lorenz, Dirk A. "Constructing test instances for Basis Pursuit Denoising." Technical Report, 2011.

Wright, Stephen J., Robert D. Nowak, and Mario A. T. Figueiredo. "Sparse Reconstruction by Separable Approximation." *IEEE International Conference on Acoustics, Speech and Signal Processing*. 2008.

Wright, Stephen. "Sparse Optimization Methods." *Conference on Advanced Methods and Perspectives in Nonlinear Optimization and Control*. Toulouse, 2009.

Yang, Allen Y., Arvind Ganesh, Zihan Zhou, S. Shankar Sastry, and Yi Ma. "A Review of Fast l_1 -Minimization Algorithms for Robust Face Recognition." *SIAM Journal on Imaging Sciences*, 2010.

Yang, Junfeng, and Yin Zhang. *Alternating direction algorithms for l_1 problems in compressive sensing*. Technical Report, Department of Computational and Applied Mathematics, 2009.

Yilmaz, E. {van den} Berg and M. P. Friedlander and G. Hennenfent and F. Herrmann and R. Saab and O. *Sparco: A testing framework for sparse reconstruction*. Technical, Vancouver: University of British Columbia, Department of Computer Science, 2007.

Appendix A: Instance Structure

Each instance is provided in a standard format in a .mat file. The following structure is used:

- A – m -by- n matrix of the system, given as a matrix or function handle
- rhs –right-hand side vector of observations
- sol –true solution (provided by the authors of the problem)
- m, n –size of A
- $\epsilon_b \in 10^{-8}, 10^{-4}, 10^{-2}$
- $\epsilon_x \in \epsilon_1, \epsilon_2, \epsilon_3$, a reasonable accuracy for an estimated signal from the true solution
- $noise$ –noise level
- $info$ –instance documentation (includes all the original information supplied with the problem)

Appendix B: SparOptLib Catalog

Table 1: SparOptLib Catalog

| name | m | n | sparsity | sparsity_ratio | dyn_range | file_size |
|--------------------|----------|----------|-----------------|-----------------------|------------------|------------------|
| nemirovski1 | 1036 | 1036 | 16 | 0.0154 | 5.9915 | 8228022 |
| nemirovski2 | 2062 | 2062 | 23 | 0.0112 | 7.5365 | 32589781 |
| nemirovski3 | 2062 | 2062 | 23 | 0.0112 | 17.1223 | 32590114 |
| nemirovski4 | 2062 | 4124 | 16 | 0.0039 | 0.0511 | 45559808 |
| sparco10l | 10240 | 10240 | 16 | 0.0016 | 0.4643 | 2623 |
| sparco10m | 5120 | 5120 | 16 | 0.0031 | 0.4643 | 2297 |
| sparco10s | 1024 | 1024 | 12 | 0.0117 | 0.8138 | 1912 |
| sparco11m | 1280 | 5120 | 32 | 0.0063 | 1.3108 | 101005129 |
| sparco11s | 256 | 1024 | 32 | 0.0313 | 1.3108 | 4044011 |
| sparco1l | 20480 | 40960 | 20483 | 0.5001 | 1.84E+20 | 462383 |
| sparco1m | 10240 | 20480 | 10243 | 0.5001 | 1.18E+20 | 230028 |
| sparco1s | 2048 | 4096 | 2050 | 0.5005 | 1.01E+19 | 45395 |
| sparco2m | 5120 | 5120 | 198 | 0.0387 | 2.6000 | 2881 |
| sparco2s | 1024 | 1024 | 77 | 0.0752 | 3.9091 | 2322 |
| sparco3l | 20480 | 40960 | 122 | 0.0030 | 183.7930 | 152398 |
| sparco3m | 10240 | 20480 | 122 | 0.0060 | 129.9610 | 74778 |
| sparco3s | 2048 | 4096 | 122 | 0.0298 | 58.1205 | 13017 |
| sparco4l | 20480 | 40960 | 20600 | 0.5029 | 9.64E+19 | 616163 |
| sparco4m | 10240 | 20480 | 10360 | 0.5059 | 2.38E+19 | 305595 |
| sparco4s | 2048 | 4096 | 2168 | 0.5293 | 6.75E+18 | 57541 |
| sparco5m | 1500 | 20480 | 63 | 0.0031 | 3.0000 | 236095776 |
| sparco5s | 300 | 4096 | 63 | 0.0154 | 3.0000 | 9446890 |
| sparco6m | 3000 | 10240 | 9658 | 0.9432 | 1.0713 | 123832 |
| sparco6s | 600 | 2048 | 1917 | 0.9360 | 1.3599 | 28823 |
| sparco7m | 3000 | 12800 | 20 | 0.0016 | 1.0000 | 590243641 |
| sparco7s | 600 | 2560 | 20 | 0.0078 | 1.0000 | 23615049 |
| sparco8m | 3000 | 12800 | 20 | 0.0016 | 1.0000 | 590268590 |
| sparco8s | 600 | 2560 | 20 | 0.0078 | 1.0000 | 23618987 |
| sparco902l | 2000 | 10000 | 3 | 0.0003 | 1.9941 | 25863 |
| sparco902m | 1000 | 5000 | 3 | 0.0006 | 1.9941 | 14454 |
| sparco902s | 200 | 1000 | 3 | 0.0030 | 1.9941 | 4635 |
| sparco903s | 1024 | 1024 | 12 | 0.0117 | 1.0320 | 71792 |
| sparco9l | 1280 | 1280 | 16 | 0.0125 | 0.5000 | 1852 |
| sparco9m | 640 | 640 | 16 | 0.0250 | 0.5000 | 1755 |
| sparco9s | 128 | 128 | 12 | 0.0938 | 0.8600 | 1617 |
| spear1 | 512 | 1024 | 8 | 0.0078 | 3.2782 | 206800 |
| spear10 | 512 | 1024 | 18 | 0.0176 | 2.3133 | 743914 |
| spear100 | 1024 | 3072 | 22 | 0.0072 | 6.8040 | 10557151 |

| | | | | | | |
|-----------------|------|------|----|--------|---------|----------|
| spear101 | 1024 | 3072 | 11 | 0.0036 | 2.7045 | 1170671 |
| spear102 | 1024 | 3072 | 13 | 0.0042 | 0.6990 | 1171638 |
| spear103 | 1024 | 3072 | 9 | 0.0029 | 0.1138 | 547577 |
| spear104 | 1024 | 3072 | 14 | 0.0046 | 1.1371 | 552094 |
| spear105 | 1024 | 3072 | 7 | 0.0023 | 0.3924 | 2601208 |
| spear106 | 1024 | 3072 | 36 | 0.0117 | 1.2936 | 2599132 |
| spear107 | 1024 | 3072 | 13 | 0.0042 | 1.2284 | 10617302 |
| spear108 | 1024 | 3072 | 15 | 0.0049 | 0.4652 | 10617335 |
| spear109 | 1024 | 3072 | 26 | 0.0085 | 1.9015 | 4064484 |
| spear11 | 512 | 1024 | 26 | 0.0254 | 4.0145 | 177889 |
| spear110 | 1024 | 3072 | 27 | 0.0088 | 0.4315 | 4064503 |
| spear111 | 1024 | 3072 | 33 | 0.0107 | 0.0895 | 1019617 |
| spear112 | 1024 | 3072 | 34 | 0.0111 | 0.6143 | 1019635 |
| spear113 | 1024 | 3072 | 33 | 0.0107 | 1.2845 | 12954888 |
| spear114 | 1024 | 3072 | 33 | 0.0107 | 0.8868 | 12954897 |
| spear115 | 1024 | 3072 | 27 | 0.0088 | 10.5576 | 1020641 |
| spear116 | 1024 | 3072 | 27 | 0.0088 | 0.5648 | 1020727 |
| spear117 | 1024 | 3072 | 26 | 0.0085 | 0.7848 | 1644463 |
| spear118 | 1024 | 3072 | 27 | 0.0088 | 1.0710 | 1644471 |
| spear119 | 1024 | 3072 | 33 | 0.0107 | 1.0093 | 24181444 |
| spear12 | 512 | 1024 | 27 | 0.0264 | 0.3385 | 177910 |
| spear120 | 1024 | 3072 | 33 | 0.0107 | 4.7446 | 24181440 |
| spear121 | 1024 | 3072 | 26 | 0.0085 | 0.8330 | 24181188 |
| spear122 | 1024 | 3072 | 27 | 0.0088 | 0.9370 | 24181193 |
| spear123 | 1024 | 4096 | 15 | 0.0037 | 1.4816 | 648028 |
| spear124 | 1024 | 4096 | 23 | 0.0056 | 7.4313 | 648271 |
| spear125 | 1024 | 4096 | 11 | 0.0027 | 0.4447 | 433200 |
| spear126 | 1024 | 4096 | 25 | 0.0061 | 1.5292 | 434274 |
| spear127 | 1024 | 4096 | 11 | 0.0027 | 0.4986 | 1559269 |
| spear128 | 1024 | 4096 | 11 | 0.0027 | 0.2149 | 1559258 |
| spear129 | 1024 | 4096 | 8 | 0.0020 | 1.3032 | 8709779 |
| spear13 | 512 | 1024 | 26 | 0.0254 | 0.4850 | 2060523 |
| spear130 | 1024 | 4096 | 11 | 0.0027 | 0.7262 | 8709779 |
| spear131 | 1024 | 4096 | 9 | 0.0022 | 0.0185 | 10655874 |
| spear132 | 1024 | 4096 | 29 | 0.0071 | 1.4022 | 10656072 |
| spear133 | 1024 | 4096 | 26 | 0.0063 | 1.7313 | 5416001 |
| spear134 | 1024 | 4096 | 27 | 0.0066 | 0.0059 | 5416004 |
| spear135 | 1024 | 4096 | 31 | 0.0076 | 6.7643 | 1356534 |
| spear136 | 1024 | 4096 | 31 | 0.0076 | 0.9842 | 1356527 |
| spear137 | 1024 | 4096 | 30 | 0.0073 | 17.0804 | 21385030 |
| spear138 | 1024 | 4096 | 30 | 0.0073 | 0.8304 | 21385037 |
| spear139 | 1024 | 4096 | 26 | 0.0063 | 2.2113 | 1357206 |
| spear14 | 512 | 1024 | 26 | 0.0254 | 19.7935 | 2060531 |

| | | | | | | |
|-----------------|------|-------|-----|--------|----------|----------|
| spear140 | 1024 | 4096 | 26 | 0.0063 | 13.5399 | 1357182 |
| spear141 | 1024 | 4096 | 25 | 0.0061 | 0.3975 | 2191588 |
| spear142 | 1024 | 4096 | 26 | 0.0063 | 0.6167 | 2191603 |
| spear143 | 1024 | 4096 | 30 | 0.0073 | 0.4676 | 32238665 |
| spear144 | 1024 | 4096 | 31 | 0.0076 | 1.1337 | 32238677 |
| spear145 | 1024 | 4096 | 26 | 0.0063 | 0.8963 | 32238878 |
| spear146 | 1024 | 4096 | 26 | 0.0063 | 0.9506 | 32238867 |
| spear147 | 1024 | 8192 | 9 | 0.0011 | 1.2450 | 11438708 |
| spear148 | 1024 | 8192 | 20 | 0.0024 | 1.4967 | 11438831 |
| spear149 | 2048 | 4096 | 8 | 0.0020 | 7.5037 | 283643 |
| spear15 | 512 | 1024 | 28 | 0.0273 | 5.6510 | 2522199 |
| spear150 | 2048 | 4096 | 9 | 0.0022 | 0.1078 | 283732 |
| spear151 | 2048 | 4096 | 58 | 0.0142 | 0.7877 | 88849 |
| spear152 | 2048 | 4096 | 71 | 0.0173 | 0.9430 | 89805 |
| spear153 | 2048 | 4096 | 8 | 0.0020 | 4.8569 | 27546 |
| spear154 | 2048 | 4096 | 224 | 0.0547 | 0.9753 | 38127 |
| spear155 | 2048 | 4096 | 9 | 0.0022 | 0.6817 | 23977 |
| spear156 | 2048 | 4096 | 264 | 0.0645 | 0.9493 | 26903 |
| spear157 | 2048 | 6144 | 11 | 0.0018 | 9.3580 | 179134 |
| spear158 | 2048 | 6144 | 110 | 0.0179 | 1.1108 | 184698 |
| spear159 | 2048 | 6144 | 9 | 0.0015 | 0.9363 | 99698 |
| spear16 | 512 | 1024 | 29 | 0.0283 | 4.9360 | 2522227 |
| spear160 | 2048 | 6144 | 208 | 0.0339 | 0.9774 | 102025 |
| spear161 | 2048 | 6144 | 12 | 0.0020 | 0.2006 | 221302 |
| spear162 | 2048 | 6144 | 11 | 0.0018 | 0.7236 | 221150 |
| spear163 | 2048 | 6144 | 11 | 0.0018 | 149.7670 | 33562 |
| spear164 | 2048 | 6144 | 440 | 0.0716 | 1.0413 | 42344 |
| spear165 | 2048 | 8192 | 11 | 0.0013 | 192.2050 | 188278 |
| spear166 | 2048 | 8192 | 142 | 0.0173 | 1.0333 | 195916 |
| spear167 | 2048 | 8192 | 14 | 0.0017 | 0.1597 | 309098 |
| spear168 | 2048 | 8192 | 284 | 0.0347 | 1.0005 | 319014 |
| spear169 | 2048 | 8192 | 10 | 0.0012 | 25.2401 | 306485 |
| spear17 | 512 | 1024 | 18 | 0.0176 | 9.4087 | 177890 |
| spear170 | 2048 | 8192 | 139 | 0.0170 | 1.1669 | 308098 |
| spear171 | 2048 | 8192 | 10 | 0.0012 | 0.4744 | 109021 |
| spear172 | 2048 | 8192 | 216 | 0.0264 | 1.0408 | 112710 |
| spear173 | 2048 | 12288 | 11 | 0.0009 | 36.5289 | 400885 |
| spear174 | 2048 | 12288 | 148 | 0.0120 | 1.0318 | 404845 |
| spear175 | 8192 | 16384 | 7 | 0.0004 | 16.0282 | 1950941 |
| spear176 | 8192 | 16384 | 11 | 0.0007 | 4.9828 | 1951580 |
| spear177 | 8192 | 16384 | 113 | 0.0069 | 1.2017 | 1172551 |
| spear178 | 8192 | 16384 | 121 | 0.0074 | 1.0379 | 1173269 |
| spear18 | 512 | 1024 | 19 | 0.0186 | 0.8017 | 177889 |

| | | | | | | |
|-----------------|------|-------|------|--------|---------|---------|
| spear180 | 8192 | 16384 | 597 | 0.0364 | 1.1009 | 145249 |
| spear181 | 8192 | 16384 | 9 | 0.0005 | 0.0038 | 101171 |
| spear182 | 8192 | 16384 | 665 | 0.0406 | 1.0267 | 113726 |
| spear183 | 8192 | 24576 | 14 | 0.0006 | 2.1062 | 1536934 |
| spear184 | 8192 | 24576 | 10 | 0.0004 | 0.5184 | 1536760 |
| spear185 | 8192 | 24576 | 11 | 0.0004 | 4.0093 | 1221275 |
| spear186 | 8192 | 24576 | 183 | 0.0074 | 1.0253 | 1231989 |
| spear187 | 8192 | 24576 | 11 | 0.0004 | 4.8949 | 896265 |
| spear188 | 8192 | 24576 | 14 | 0.0006 | 1.0558 | 896243 |
| spear189 | 8192 | 24576 | 11 | 0.0004 | 5.5748 | 137871 |
| spear19 | 512 | 1024 | 18 | 0.0176 | 0.8077 | 289849 |
| spear190 | 8192 | 24576 | 1180 | 0.0480 | 0.9846 | 160809 |
| spear191 | 8192 | 32768 | 13 | 0.0004 | 0.1632 | 1573159 |
| spear192 | 8192 | 32768 | 323 | 0.0099 | 0.9006 | 1590835 |
| spear193 | 8192 | 32768 | 14 | 0.0004 | 9.0781 | 1230481 |
| spear194 | 8192 | 32768 | 1015 | 0.0310 | 1.0043 | 1263418 |
| spear195 | 8192 | 32768 | 9 | 0.0003 | 0.0316 | 2051773 |
| spear196 | 8192 | 32768 | 47 | 0.0014 | 0.4788 | 2052508 |
| spear197 | 8192 | 32768 | 13 | 0.0004 | 0.4797 | 1257638 |
| spear198 | 8192 | 32768 | 424 | 0.0129 | 1.0873 | 1266816 |
| spear199 | 8192 | 49152 | 11 | 0.0002 | 0.0983 | 2426522 |
| spear2 | 512 | 1024 | 9 | 0.0088 | 54.2664 | 207343 |
| spear20 | 512 | 1024 | 18 | 0.0176 | 1.4005 | 289843 |
| spear200 | 8192 | 49152 | 313 | 0.0064 | 0.9808 | 2438013 |
| spear201 | 512 | 1024 | 51 | 0.0498 | 0.6657 | 208839 |
| spear202 | 512 | 1024 | 50 | 0.0488 | 0.9805 | 52565 |
| spear203 | 512 | 1024 | 51 | 0.0498 | 0.3476 | 548538 |
| spear204 | 512 | 1024 | 51 | 0.0498 | 0.9910 | 47652 |
| spear205 | 512 | 1024 | 51 | 0.0498 | 0.8083 | 744223 |
| spear206 | 512 | 1024 | 51 | 0.0498 | 1.1588 | 178128 |
| spear207 | 512 | 1024 | 51 | 0.0498 | 1.1229 | 2060769 |
| spear208 | 512 | 1024 | 51 | 0.0498 | 0.4792 | 2522422 |
| spear209 | 512 | 1024 | 51 | 0.0498 | 1.4167 | 178217 |
| spear21 | 512 | 1024 | 27 | 0.0264 | 2.2016 | 4033091 |
| spear210 | 512 | 1024 | 51 | 0.0498 | 1.9500 | 290165 |
| spear211 | 512 | 1024 | 51 | 0.0498 | 2.6711 | 4033319 |
| spear212 | 512 | 1024 | 51 | 0.0498 | 0.5106 | 4033531 |
| spear213 | 512 | 1536 | 51 | 0.0332 | 0.4176 | 2560689 |
| spear214 | 512 | 1536 | 51 | 0.0332 | 1.1284 | 311791 |
| spear215 | 512 | 1536 | 51 | 0.0332 | 0.1350 | 149759 |
| spear216 | 512 | 1536 | 51 | 0.0332 | 1.2572 | 559343 |
| spear217 | 512 | 1536 | 51 | 0.0332 | 1.4920 | 2562232 |
| spear218 | 512 | 1536 | 51 | 0.0332 | 1.1442 | 1114206 |

| | | | | | | |
|-----------------|------|------|-----|--------|--------|----------|
| spear219 | 512 | 1536 | 51 | 0.0332 | 0.4727 | 264834 |
| spear22 | 512 | 1024 | 27 | 0.0264 | 0.8178 | 4033097 |
| spear220 | 512 | 1536 | 51 | 0.0332 | 0.7437 | 3164664 |
| spear221 | 512 | 1536 | 51 | 0.0332 | 0.8440 | 265109 |
| spear222 | 512 | 1536 | 51 | 0.0332 | 0.8660 | 433082 |
| spear223 | 512 | 1536 | 51 | 0.0332 | 2.9712 | 6047595 |
| spear224 | 512 | 1536 | 51 | 0.0332 | 0.7599 | 6047747 |
| spear225 | 512 | 2048 | 51 | 0.0249 | 1.0640 | 187733 |
| spear226 | 512 | 2048 | 51 | 0.0249 | 0.7605 | 157107 |
| spear227 | 512 | 2048 | 51 | 0.0249 | 1.1278 | 414075 |
| spear228 | 512 | 2048 | 51 | 0.0249 | 1.1132 | 2186201 |
| spear229 | 512 | 2048 | 51 | 0.0249 | 1.4674 | 2573036 |
| spear23 | 512 | 1024 | 18 | 0.0176 | 1.3513 | 4033213 |
| spear230 | 512 | 2048 | 51 | 0.0249 | 0.9409 | 1483120 |
| spear231 | 512 | 2048 | 51 | 0.0249 | 0.9105 | 351343 |
| spear232 | 512 | 2048 | 51 | 0.0249 | 0.9697 | 5243166 |
| spear233 | 512 | 2048 | 51 | 0.0249 | 1.1211 | 351578 |
| spear234 | 512 | 2048 | 51 | 0.0249 | 0.3291 | 575270 |
| spear235 | 512 | 2048 | 51 | 0.0249 | 0.4196 | 8061805 |
| spear236 | 512 | 2048 | 51 | 0.0249 | 1.0678 | 8061979 |
| spear237 | 512 | 4096 | 51 | 0.0125 | 0.6801 | 2817355 |
| spear238 | 1024 | 2048 | 102 | 0.0498 | 1.0080 | 784777 |
| spear239 | 1024 | 2048 | 84 | 0.0410 | 1.7338 | 205289 |
| spear24 | 512 | 1024 | 18 | 0.0176 | 0.4507 | 4033213 |
| spear240 | 1024 | 2048 | 102 | 0.0498 | 0.7628 | 2563403 |
| spear241 | 1024 | 2048 | 102 | 0.0498 | 0.7501 | 167406 |
| spear242 | 1024 | 2048 | 102 | 0.0498 | 0.9300 | 2713021 |
| spear243 | 1024 | 2048 | 102 | 0.0498 | 0.8910 | 683300 |
| spear244 | 1024 | 2048 | 102 | 0.0498 | 0.9573 | 8415015 |
| spear245 | 1024 | 2048 | 102 | 0.0498 | 1.1386 | 10455141 |
| spear246 | 1024 | 2048 | 102 | 0.0498 | 0.8476 | 683649 |
| spear247 | 1024 | 2048 | 102 | 0.0498 | 0.9758 | 1100891 |
| spear248 | 1024 | 2048 | 102 | 0.0498 | 0.7333 | 16124457 |
| spear249 | 1024 | 2048 | 102 | 0.0498 | 0.6899 | 16124426 |
| spear25 | 512 | 1536 | 14 | 0.0091 | 0.2562 | 2560316 |
| spear250 | 1024 | 3072 | 102 | 0.0332 | 1.9621 | 10557940 |
| spear251 | 1024 | 3072 | 102 | 0.0332 | 0.8580 | 1172889 |
| spear252 | 1024 | 3072 | 102 | 0.0332 | 0.7242 | 555218 |
| spear253 | 1024 | 3072 | 102 | 0.0332 | 1.1362 | 2602227 |
| spear254 | 1024 | 3072 | 102 | 0.0332 | 1.4274 | 10618195 |
| spear255 | 1024 | 3072 | 102 | 0.0332 | 1.1589 | 4065220 |
| spear256 | 1024 | 3072 | 102 | 0.0332 | 1.1529 | 1020295 |
| spear257 | 1024 | 3072 | 102 | 0.0332 | 1.0109 | 12955546 |

| | | | | | | |
|-----------------|------|------|-----|--------|---------|----------|
| spear258 | 1024 | 3072 | 102 | 0.0332 | 0.9041 | 1021443 |
| spear259 | 1024 | 3072 | 102 | 0.0332 | 0.8995 | 1645188 |
| spear26 | 512 | 1536 | 16 | 0.0104 | 1.2646 | 2560345 |
| spear260 | 1024 | 3072 | 102 | 0.0332 | 1.2678 | 24182107 |
| spear261 | 1024 | 3072 | 102 | 0.0332 | 0.8998 | 24181910 |
| spear262 | 1024 | 4096 | 102 | 0.0249 | 1.5494 | 655554 |
| spear263 | 1024 | 4096 | 97 | 0.0237 | 1.0021 | 441516 |
| spear264 | 1024 | 4096 | 102 | 0.0249 | 1.9002 | 1561264 |
| spear265 | 1024 | 4096 | 102 | 0.0249 | 0.8890 | 8710738 |
| spear266 | 1024 | 4096 | 100 | 0.0244 | 2.0608 | 10656820 |
| spear267 | 1024 | 4096 | 102 | 0.0249 | 1.1091 | 5416737 |
| spear268 | 1024 | 4096 | 102 | 0.0249 | 0.6626 | 1357235 |
| spear269 | 1024 | 4096 | 102 | 0.0249 | 0.9564 | 21385743 |
| spear27 | 512 | 1536 | 9 | 0.0059 | 61.7803 | 310233 |
| spear270 | 1024 | 4096 | 102 | 0.0249 | 1.1172 | 1357945 |
| spear271 | 1024 | 4096 | 102 | 0.0249 | 1.1970 | 2192346 |
| spear272 | 1024 | 4096 | 102 | 0.0249 | 0.7919 | 32239361 |
| spear273 | 1024 | 4096 | 102 | 0.0249 | 0.8897 | 32239612 |
| spear274 | 1024 | 8192 | 101 | 0.0123 | 0.9317 | 11439704 |
| spear28 | 512 | 1536 | 9 | 0.0059 | 10.6386 | 310277 |
| spear29 | 512 | 1536 | 9 | 0.0059 | 0.5508 | 145972 |
| spear3 | 512 | 1024 | 6 | 0.0059 | 0.0001 | 51324 |
| spear30 | 512 | 1536 | 10 | 0.0065 | 2.8056 | 146941 |
| spear31 | 512 | 1536 | 9 | 0.0059 | 1.1289 | 556572 |
| spear32 | 512 | 1536 | 25 | 0.0163 | 0.0272 | 559060 |
| spear33 | 512 | 1536 | 10 | 0.0065 | 15.1530 | 2561797 |
| spear34 | 512 | 1536 | 11 | 0.0072 | 8.8127 | 2561829 |
| spear35 | 512 | 1536 | 17 | 0.0111 | 18.1778 | 1113852 |
| spear36 | 512 | 1536 | 18 | 0.0117 | 0.9098 | 1113876 |
| spear37 | 512 | 1536 | 22 | 0.0143 | 0.4134 | 264548 |
| spear38 | 512 | 1536 | 23 | 0.0150 | 2.0016 | 264550 |
| spear39 | 512 | 1536 | 22 | 0.0143 | 1.6941 | 3164386 |
| spear4 | 512 | 1024 | 106 | 0.1035 | 0.5887 | 52679 |
| spear40 | 512 | 1536 | 23 | 0.0150 | 4.3579 | 3164402 |
| spear41 | 512 | 1536 | 18 | 0.0117 | 5.6320 | 264774 |
| spear42 | 512 | 1536 | 18 | 0.0117 | 0.4907 | 264757 |
| spear43 | 512 | 1536 | 18 | 0.0117 | 0.0245 | 432748 |
| spear44 | 512 | 1536 | 18 | 0.0117 | 0.1728 | 432751 |
| spear45 | 512 | 1536 | 21 | 0.0137 | 0.1367 | 6047301 |
| spear46 | 512 | 1536 | 21 | 0.0137 | 2.0709 | 6047307 |
| spear47 | 512 | 1536 | 17 | 0.0111 | 0.6174 | 6047400 |
| spear48 | 512 | 1536 | 18 | 0.0117 | 2.9450 | 6047427 |
| spear49 | 512 | 2048 | 11 | 0.0054 | 8.4620 | 184154 |

| | | | | | | |
|----------------|------|------|-----|--------|---------|---------|
| spear5 | 512 | 1024 | 9 | 0.0088 | 61.9793 | 546166 |
| spear50 | 512 | 2048 | 14 | 0.0068 | 2.1178 | 183868 |
| spear51 | 512 | 2048 | 11 | 0.0054 | 0.0017 | 154079 |
| spear52 | 512 | 2048 | 14 | 0.0068 | 0.2895 | 154231 |
| spear53 | 512 | 2048 | 8 | 0.0039 | 0.0406 | 411874 |
| spear54 | 512 | 2048 | 9 | 0.0044 | 0.0115 | 412467 |
| spear55 | 512 | 2048 | 7 | 0.0034 | 5.6093 | 2182398 |
| spear56 | 512 | 2048 | 7 | 0.0034 | 12.3847 | 2185757 |
| spear57 | 512 | 2048 | 11 | 0.0054 | 0.0738 | 2572640 |
| spear58 | 512 | 2048 | 22 | 0.0107 | 1.3926 | 2572758 |
| spear59 | 512 | 2048 | 18 | 0.0088 | 1.6978 | 1482791 |
| spear6 | 512 | 1024 | 14 | 0.0137 | 1.9758 | 544467 |
| spear60 | 512 | 2048 | 18 | 0.0088 | 1.7958 | 1482781 |
| spear61 | 512 | 2048 | 20 | 0.0098 | 2.0007 | 351010 |
| spear62 | 512 | 2048 | 21 | 0.0103 | 2.4694 | 351048 |
| spear63 | 512 | 2048 | 20 | 0.0098 | 1.0683 | 5242878 |
| spear64 | 512 | 2048 | 20 | 0.0098 | 0.6231 | 5242868 |
| spear65 | 512 | 2048 | 17 | 0.0083 | 0.9928 | 351237 |
| spear66 | 512 | 2048 | 17 | 0.0083 | 2.0323 | 351238 |
| spear67 | 512 | 2048 | 17 | 0.0083 | 2.7142 | 574930 |
| spear68 | 512 | 2048 | 17 | 0.0083 | 0.1672 | 574934 |
| spear69 | 512 | 2048 | 20 | 0.0098 | 25.8108 | 8061509 |
| spear7 | 512 | 1024 | 34 | 0.0332 | 0.4546 | 47469 |
| spear70 | 512 | 2048 | 21 | 0.0103 | 0.0282 | 8061518 |
| spear71 | 512 | 2048 | 17 | 0.0083 | 0.6278 | 8061648 |
| spear72 | 512 | 2048 | 17 | 0.0083 | 2.5331 | 8061638 |
| spear73 | 512 | 4096 | 9 | 0.0022 | 0.1404 | 2813167 |
| spear74 | 512 | 4096 | 10 | 0.0024 | 19.8497 | 2816775 |
| spear75 | 1024 | 2048 | 12 | 0.0059 | 0.5362 | 783182 |
| spear76 | 1024 | 2048 | 12 | 0.0059 | 0.0126 | 783214 |
| spear77 | 1024 | 2048 | 5 | 0.0024 | 3.7962 | 202664 |
| spear78 | 1024 | 2048 | 169 | 0.0825 | 0.9796 | 205823 |
| spear79 | 1024 | 2048 | 11 | 0.0054 | 0.0056 | 2562480 |
| spear8 | 512 | 1024 | 34 | 0.0332 | 0.7321 | 47484 |
| spear80 | 1024 | 2048 | 17 | 0.0083 | 0.2453 | 2557757 |
| spear81 | 1024 | 2048 | 50 | 0.0244 | 2.2424 | 166927 |
| spear82 | 1024 | 2048 | 50 | 0.0244 | 2.2833 | 166926 |
| spear83 | 1024 | 2048 | 27 | 0.0132 | 14.4704 | 2712312 |
| spear84 | 1024 | 2048 | 28 | 0.0137 | 0.4834 | 2712306 |
| spear85 | 1024 | 2048 | 39 | 0.0190 | 0.6477 | 682708 |
| spear86 | 1024 | 2048 | 40 | 0.0195 | 0.5846 | 682709 |
| spear87 | 1024 | 2048 | 39 | 0.0190 | 1.8983 | 8414435 |
| spear88 | 1024 | 2048 | 40 | 0.0195 | 0.6513 | 8414443 |

| | | | | | | |
|----------------|------|------|----|--------|----------|----------|
| spear89 | 1024 | 2048 | 43 | 0.0210 | 0.8935 | 10454606 |
| spear9 | 512 | 1024 | 18 | 0.0176 | 0.6374 | 743907 |
| spear90 | 1024 | 2048 | 46 | 0.0225 | 0.8747 | 10454612 |
| spear91 | 1024 | 2048 | 27 | 0.0132 | 3.7895 | 682933 |
| spear92 | 1024 | 2048 | 27 | 0.0132 | 0.4532 | 682929 |
| spear93 | 1024 | 2048 | 27 | 0.0132 | 2.7565 | 1100177 |
| spear94 | 1024 | 2048 | 27 | 0.0132 | 3.2594 | 1100163 |
| spear95 | 1024 | 2048 | 39 | 0.0190 | 1.0291 | 16123851 |
| spear96 | 1024 | 2048 | 40 | 0.0195 | 1.4544 | 16123859 |
| spear97 | 1024 | 2048 | 27 | 0.0132 | 1.2995 | 16123701 |
| spear98 | 1024 | 2048 | 27 | 0.0132 | 0.1612 | 16123701 |
| spear99 | 1024 | 3072 | 18 | 0.0059 | 180.5720 | 10557103 |

Appendix C: SparOptLib Poster

SparOptLib – A Testing Library for Sparse Solution Recovery Problems

Ana-Iulia Alexandrescu, Department of Industrial and Systems Engineering, Lehigh University
Xi Bai, Department of Industrial and Systems Engineering, Lehigh University
Katya Scheinberg, Department of Industrial and Systems Engineering, Lehigh University

| | | | |
|---|---|--|--|
| <p>Goal</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> > Offer a rich collection of sparse solution recovery problems > Provide a uniform testing framework > Stimulate research to develop improved algorithms | <p>Convex Relaxations</p> <p>Basis-Pursuit De-Noising (BPDN)</p> $\min_x \ Ax - b\ _2 \leq \sigma$ <p>Solvers: TFOCS, NESTA, SALSA, SPGL1, YALL1</p> <p>Lagrangian form of BPDN (LAG)</p> $\min_x \frac{1}{2} \ Ax - b\ _2^2 + \rho \ x\ _1$ <p>Solvers: TFOCS, SALSA, SPGL1, YALL1, FPC-AS, TWIST, IST, FISTA, GPSR, SpARSA, ALM, FALM</p> <p>Least Abs. Shrinkage & Selection Op. (LASSO)</p> $\min \ Ax - b\ _2$ $\text{s.t. } \ x\ _1 \leq \gamma$ <p>Solvers: SPGL1, YALL1, IST, LARS</p> | <p>SparOptLib</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> > Collection of over 300 instances with different sizes, solution sparsity, solution dynamic range and difficulty adapted from <ul style="list-style-type: none"> > Nemirovski > Sparco Toolbox > SPEAR Project > Consistent (standard) format <ul style="list-style-type: none"> > A – $m \times n$ matrix > rhs – vector of observations > sol – true (sparse)solution > m, n – size of the problem > $\epsilon_p \in \{10^{-2}, 10^{-4}, 10^{-6}\}$ > $\epsilon_s \in \{\epsilon_1, \epsilon_2, \epsilon_3\}$ – reasonable target accuracy > $noise$ – noise level > $info$ – instance documentation > Suggested target accuracy for optimization <ul style="list-style-type: none"> > x – “good” solution: x^* – true solution > $\ x\ _1 \leq (1 + \epsilon_s) \ x^*\ _1$ > $\ Ax - b\ _p \leq \ Ax^* - b\ _p + \epsilon_p \ b\ _p$ > SparOptLib available at: coral.ie.lehigh.edu/projects/SPAROPTLIB | <p>Sparse Solution Recovery</p> $\min_x \ x\ _0$ $\text{s.t. } \ Ax - b\ _2 \leq \sigma$ <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • $\ x\ _0$ measures the sparsity of the unknown signal • A is an $m \times n$ matrix • b is a vector of observations • $\sigma \geq 0$ is the noise parameter > NP-hard > Varied applications <p>Compressed Sensing</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • image processing • seismic data recovery  <p>Other Applications</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Machine learning • Gene sequencing • Medical imaging  |
| <p>Impact and Future Work</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> > What SparOptLib offers <ul style="list-style-type: none"> > Vast collection of problems > Instances provided in standard format > Method for testing the quality of a solution > What we hope it will achieve <ul style="list-style-type: none"> > Support research efforts in the area of sparse solution recovery > Enable researchers to determine whether a given instance is “easy” or “hard” > Provide an environment for parameter calibration and improved algorithm robustness and convergence > Future work <ul style="list-style-type: none"> > Expand the library > Test and refine available algorithms | <p>Contact</p> <p>Ana-Iulia Alexandrescu – aiua210@lehigh.edu Xi Bai – xi5210@lehigh.edu Katya Scheinberg – katyas@lehigh.edu</p>  <p>Acknowledgments</p> <p>Sparco – E. van den Berg, M. P. Friedlander, G. Nemenko, S. J. Sherman, R. S. Scah, D. Visvak Nemirovski – A. Nemirovski, A. Juditsky, A. W. W. Rosch, Andreas Tillmann, Christian Kruschel Nemirovski, Akshai Wotawong</p> | | |

Figure 1: Poster Selected for the Final Round at INFORMS Annual Meeting, Charlotte, 2011

Vita

Ana-Iulia Alexandrescu is a graduate student in the Industrial and Systems Engineering Department at Lehigh University. Born and raised in Bucharest, Romania, she came to Lehigh as a Bostiber Scholar in 2006, where she enrolled in the Integrated Business and Engineering Honors Program. While an undergraduate, she pursued a major in Information and Systems Engineering and a minor in Applied Mathematics. She was awarded the Information and Systems Engineering Student of the Year title all three years she was in the program. In her junior year, Ana was selected to represent her department in the engineering honors and service society, the Rossin Junior Fellows, where she served as a secretary of the executive board and was twice awarded the recognition of Excellence in Service. The summer after her junior year, she spent ten weeks performing comparative field studies in sustainability, culture, and ethics and human rights in the Mediterranean space. Ana graduated with honors in September 2010 and continued on as a Presidential Scholar, pursuing her MS degree in Industrial and Systems Engineering. As a graduate student, she held the position of Vice President of the INFORMS Student Chapter at Lehigh for one year, and she is now acting as an advisor to the current executive board of the chapter.

