THE MANAGEMENT OF SUSTAINABLE ACTION PLANS AT SELECTED NATURE-BASED ATTRACTIONS IN BOTSWANA.

By

THEMBELIHLE NYAMANDI

Submitted in accordance with the requirements for

the degree of

MASTER OF COMMERCE

in the subject

TOURISM MANAGEMENT

at the

UNIVERSITY OF SOUTH AFRICA

SUPERVISOR: PROF MARIOS SOTIRIADIS CO-SUPERVISOR: PROF CINA VAN ZYL

JANUARY 2019

Declaration

Name: Thembelihle Nyamandi

Student number: 53288734

Degree: Master in Commerce (Tourism Management)

Exact wording of the title of the dissertation as appearing on the copies submitted for examination:

THE MANAGEMENT OF SUSTAINABLE ACTION PLANS AT SELECTED

NATURE-BASED ATTRACTIONS IN BOTSWANA.

I declare that the above dissertation is my own work and that all the sources that I have used or quoted have been indicated and acknowledged by means of complete references.

yamad

7 JANUARY 2019 DATE

SIGNATURE

Abstract

Tourism generates foreign currency and employment, and proper planning and management benefits the community and environment upon which tourism depends. The study investigated the management of sustainable action plans at selected nature-based attractions in Botswana, namely; Gaborone Game Reserve, Khutse Game Reserves, and Mokolodi Nature Reserve. Purposive, convenience and snowball sampling yielded 25 respondents for semi-structured interviews. Findings highlighted that sustainable action plans, like recycling and engaging local labour, were managed and implemented to a small extent. The conclusions were that the full potential of sustainable action plans management needed to be fully explored.

The study recommends government enforcement of policies, master plans and strategies for management of sustainable action plans in nature-based attractions; and decentralisation of public nature-based attractions to allow managers full management of sustainable action plans. Government and private sector should fund management of all nine sustainable action plans, and implement a holistic tourism strategy to retain the quality of tourists' experiences.

Key Words: Botswana, Community, Government, Management, Nature-based attractions, Sustainable action plans, Sustainable tourism, Sustainable tourism development, Tourist, Tourism.

OKUCATSHANGIWE

UKUPHATHWA KWEZINHLELO ZOKUSEBENZA EZISIMEME EZIKHETHIWE ZOKUKHANGISWA KWEMVELO EBOTSWANA

Ezokuvakasha zidala imali yangaphandle kanye nomsebenzi, nokuhlelwa kahle nokuphathwa kahle komphakathi kanye nemvelo lapho ezokuvakasha zincike khona. Ucwaningo lucwaninge ukuphathwa kwezinhlelo zokusebenza ezisimeme ezikhethiwe zokukhangiswa kwemvelo e-Botswana, okuyiSiqiwi iGaborone, iSiqiwi iKhutse, nokuGcinwa kweMvelo iMokolodi. Imibonakaliso ekhethwe ngokusekelwe ezilinganisweni zabantu kanye nenhloso yocwaningo (*purposive sampling*), indlela yokubala nokudweba idatha emele ngokukhetha abantu ngenxa yokukhululeka kokuzithandela kwabo (*convenience sampling*) kanye nabacwaningi bezokucwaninga abathatha abanye abahlanganyeli ukuze banze ucwaningo (*snowball sampling*) inikeza abaphenduli abangu-25 ngemibuzo ehleliwe. Okutholakele kubonise ukuthi izinhlelo zokusebenza ezisimeme, njengokuvuselela kabusha nokubandakanya abasebenzi basekhaya, zaphathwa futhi zenziwa ngendlela encane. Isiphetho sasiwukuthi amandla aphelele okuphathwa ezinhlelo zokusebenza ezisimeme kufanele ahlolwe.

Ucwaningo luphakamisa ukuqiniswa kwezinqubomgomo kuhulumeni, izinhlelo ezinhle kanye namasu okuphathwa kwezinhlelo zokusebenza ezisimeme ezikhethiwe zokukhangiswa kwemvelo; kanye nokwabiwa kwamandla okukhangayo okusekelwe emphakathini ukuvumela abaphathi ukuphatha ngokugcwele kwalezi zinhlelo. Uhulumeni kanye nezimboni ezizimele kufanele baxhase ukuphathwa kwazo zonke izinhlelo zokusebenza ezisimeme eziyisishiyagalolunye, futhi basebenzise uhlelo lwezokuvakasha oluphelele ukugcina isipiliyoni sabavakashi sisezingeni.

Amagama asemqoka: Botswana: iBotswana Community: umphakathi Government: uhulumeni Management:

DIE BESTUUR VAN VOLHOUBARE AKSIEPLANNE BY GESELEKTEERDE NATUURGEBASEERDE BESIENSWAARDIGHEDE IN BOTSWANA

(THEMBELIHLE NYAMANDI)

Abstrak

Toerisme genereer buitelandse valuta en werkverskaffing, en behoorlike beplanning en bestuur is tot voordeel van die gemeenskap en omgewing waarop toerisme staatmaak. Die studie het die bestuur van volhoubare aksieplanne by geselekteerde natuurgebaseerde besienswaardighede in Botswana, naamlik die Gaborone, Khutse en Mokolodi Natuurreservate, ondersoek. Doelbewuste, gerief- en sneeubalsteekproefneming het 25 respondente vir semigestruktureerde onderhoude opgelewer. Volgens die bevindings, is volhoubare aksieplanne soos herwinning en die gebruik van plaaslike arbeid, tot 'n mate bestuur en geïmplementeer. Die gevolgtrekking was dat die volle potensiaal van volhoubare aksieplanbestuur verken moet word.

Die studie het regeringstoepassing van beleide, meesterplanne en strategieë aanbeveel vir die bestuur van volhoubare aksieplanne in natuurgebaseerde besienswaardighede; en die desentralisasie van openbare natuurgebaseerde besienswaardighede om bestuurders toe te laat om hierdie planne ten volle te bestuur. Die regering en die privaat sektor behoort die bestuur van al nege die volhoubare aksieplanne te befonds, en 'n holistiese toerismestrategie te implementeer om die gehalte van toeriste-ervarings te behou.

Sleutelwoorde: Botswana, gemeenskap, regering, bestuur, natuurgebaseerde besienswaardighede, volhoubare aksieplanne, volhoubare toerisme, volhoubare toerismeontwikkeling, toeris, toerisme.

Acknowledgements

A distinct credit is due to management and workers of Gaborone Game Reserve, Khutse Game Reserve and Mokolodi Nature Reserve for their assistance in the data collection stage of this study. I am also grateful for the direction and support I got from my supervisors Prof Marios Sotiriadis and Prof Cina van Zyl. I would like to also thank my husband Moris for his encouragement throughout the studies and my family for their moral support. I am thankful to all these people who helped me while I was doing this research but are not listed above. I could not have succeeded without your various contributions. May the Lord guide you through all your endeavours. Finally, my greatest appreciation goes to the Almighty for the health, wisdom and guidance throughout this project.

List of acronyms and abbreviations

BECS	Botswana Eco-Certification System
BTDP	Botswana Tourism Development Policy
BTO	Botswana Tourism Organisation
DWNP	Department of Wildlife and National Park
EI	Environmental Impacts
EMS	Environmental Management Systems
EPI	Environment Performance Indicators
GSTC	Global Sustainable Tourism Council
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
IUCN	International Union for the Conservation of Nature
KGR	Khutse Game Reserve
MNR	Mokolodi Nature Reserve
NBAs	Nature-Based Attractions
ONS	Office for National Statistics
SPSS	Statistical Package for the Social Sciences
SAPs	Sustainable Action Plans
STM	Sustainable Tourism Management
UNISA	University of South Africa
TBL	Triple Bottom Line
TIES	The International Eco-Tourism Society
UNWTO	United Nations World Tourism Organisation
WTTC	World Travel and Tourism Council

Table of Contents	
Declaration	i
Abstract	ii
Acknowledgements	iii
List of acronyms and abbreviations	vi
List of tables	xi
List of figures	xii
CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION AND PROBLEM STATEMENT	1
1.1 Introduction	1
1.3 Research problem	5
1.4 Research purpose and objective	7
1.4.1 The purpose of the study	7
1.4.2 The research questions	7
1.4.3 The objectives of the study	8
1.5 Research design	8
1.5.1 Primary research	9
1.5.1 Secondary research	9
1.6 Definition of key terms	10
1.7 Outline of chapters	12
CHAPTER 2 – SUSTAINABLE TOURISM AND NATURE-BASED ATTRACTIONS	14
2.1 Introduction	14
2.2 The concept of sustainability	16
2.3 The triple bottom line	22
2.3.1 Environmental sustainability	24
2.3.2 Socio-cultural sustainability	25
2.3.3 Economic sustainability	26
2.4 Sustainable tourism	16
2.5 Sustainable tourism principles	17
2.6 Nature-based tourism	19
2.7 Nature-based attractions (NBAs)	19
2.8 Sustainable nature-based tourism operations	21
2.9 Application of sustainable tourism principles	22
2.9.1 Holistic and strategic approach of planning	22
2.9.2 Preserve ecology and biodiversity	22
2.9.3 Protect and conserve culture, human heritage and biodiversity	28
2.9.4 Continuous long-term development and growth	29
	vii

2.9.5 Reducing negative impact of tourism	29
2.9.6 Local control and well-being of community	30
2.9.7 Provide more pleasant experiences for tourists	31
2.9.8 Focus on local, national, regional economic growth	31
2.9.9 Educate and inform tourists	32
2.9.10 Benefits from operating sustainably	32
2.10 Tourist experiences at NBAs	33
2.11 Conclusion	36
CHAPTER 3: SUSTAINABILITY IN PRACTICE: BEST PRACTICES IN THE FIELD OF	
NBAs.	37
3.1 Introduction	37
3.2 Key stakeholders in NBAs management	39
3.3 Functions of NBAs management	42
3.3.1 Declaration	44
3.3.2 Plan	44
3.3.3 Implementation	45
3.3.4 Revise or rectify plan	46
3.4 Sustainable action plans	47
3.4.1 Water	47
3.4.2 Energy	48
3.4.3 Waste	48
3.4.4 Green buildings	49
3.4.5 Green meetings	50
3.4.6 Pollution	51
3.4.7 Tourist education	51
3.4.8 Employee engagement	52
3.4.9 Procurement and purchasing	53
3.5 International best practices in the management of SAPs	54
3.5.1 Australia	54
3.5.2 Kenya	55
3.5.3 Bolivia	56
3.5.4 China	57
3.5.5 Finland	58
3.5.6 Canada	59
3.6 Conclusion	60
CHAPTER 4: RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY	61
4.1 Introduction	61
4.2 Study area	63
	viii

4.2.1 Gaborone Game Reserve	64
4.2.2 Mokolodi Nature Reserve	65
4.2.3 Khutse Game Reserve	66
4.3 Research design.	66
4.3.1 Method of data collection	67
4.3.2 Population and sample	67
4.3.3 Research instrument	68
4.4 Data reliability and validity	71
4.5 Research ethics	72
4.6 Conclusion	72
CHAPTER 5: DATA PRESENTATION AND ANALYSIS	74
5.1 Introduction	74
5.2 Response rate	74
5.3 Demographics of respondents	74
5.3.1 Job position of respondents	74
5.3.2 Age of respondents	75
5.3.3 Respondents' level of education	75
5.3.4 Working experience at the NBAs	76
5.4 Findings of the study	76
5.4.1 Operations of tourism businesses	76
5.4.1.1 Continuous and sustained sustainable growth	77
5.4.1.2 Reduce the negative impacts of tourism	78
5.4.1.3 Protection of biodiversity	79
5.4.1.4 Community control and well-being	80
5.4.1.5 Educate and inform stakeholders	81
5.4.2 Sustainable action plans which nature-based attractions can manage	82
5.4.3 Management of sustainable action plans.	82
5.4.3.1 Water	82
5.4.3.2 Energy	83
5.4.3.3 Waste	84
5.4.3.4 Green Buildings	84
5.4.3.5 Green Meetings	85
5.4.3.6 Pollution	86
5.4.3.7 Information and education of tourists	87
5.4.3.8 Employee Relations	87
5.4.3.9 Procurement and Purchasing	88
5.4.4 Best practices of sustainable action plans	89

0
1
2
2
2
3
3
4
5
5
9
9
1
1
ł.
3
5
7

List of tables

Table 1.1 Indicative list of previous research done on sustainable tourism	6
Table 2.1 Key benefits for sustainable operations	29
Table 2.2 Nature-based attractions	32
Table 4.1 Previous research benchmarking interview schedule construction	62

List of figures

Figure 1.1 Timeline of sustainable development	4
Figure 1.2 Chapters of the dissertation	18
Figure 2.1 Layout of chapter 2	17
Figure 2.2 The pillars of sustainability	18
Figure 2.3 TBL and the associated benefits	22
Figure 2.4 Experience pyramid	36
Figure 3.1 Layout of chapter 3	40
Figure 3.2 Key stakeholders	42
Figure 3.3 Holistic Conservation Conceptual Framework	45
Figure 4.1 Layout of chapter 4	61
Figure 4.2 Botswana map showing location of GGR, KGR and MNR	62
Figure 5.1 Respondents job titles	67
Figure 5.2 Age of respondents	75
Figure 5.3 Level of education	76
Figure 5.4 Working experience of respondents	77

CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION AND PROBLEM STATEMENT. 1.1 Introduction

Tourism is the world's greatest and most diverse service industry (Ghobadi & Verdian, 2016:529), generating approximately 10.4 % of the global gross domestic product (GDP) per year (WTTC (World Travel and Tourism Council), 2018:1). The tourism industry has a variety of destinations worldwide, such as the Great Barrier Reef in Australia, Victoria Falls in Zimbabwe, as well as the Okavango Delta in Botswana (Grundey, 2008:119; Mbaiwa 2003:447). Destinations comprise a combination of unique tourism offerings which include accommodation, accessibility, activities, ancillary services and attractions (Page & Connell, 2009:197). Attractions are the primary elements for tourism which add to the appeal of the destination and are the real energizers for tourism in an area (Fletcher, Fyall, Gilbreth & Wanhill, 2013:314). Since most tourists live in urban areas, there is higher preference for nature-based attractions (hereafter referred to as NBAs) due to the atmosphere of safety, tranquillity and comfort; and also, because tourists seek the change, novelty, difference and extraordinary experiences exhibited by NBAs (Silva, Kastenholz, & Abrantes, 2013:18; Engelbretch, 2011:1; Du Plessis, 2010:1).

The increasing number of tourists visiting NBAs has subsequently led to an increase in undesirable effects of tourism on the NBAs such as trampling, disturbance, vandalism, overcrowding, pollution and introduction of invasive species, thereby making the NBAs vulnerable (Freytag & Vietze, 2013:16; Borges, Carbone, Bushell & Jaeger, 2011:8; Kepe, 2001:1). As a result, protected areas for NBAs, such as national parks, forest reserves, controlled hunting areas, wildlife management areas, game reserves, and nature reserves, have been established to preserve, as well as to safeguard the unique resources of national and international value; and thus, mitigate the negative impact of tourism (Vanderpost, 2007:555; Spenceley, Rey de Assis & Shurland, n.d:7). In order to diminish and eliminate the undesirable effects of tourism, sustainable tourism management (hereafter referred to as STM) is essential at NBAs (Pratt, Rivera & Bien, 2011:416).

Sustainable tourism management has emerged as a crucial and inevitable task for the managers of NBAs, and it involves considering the environment, the needs of current and imminent generations, and the economy; and ensuring that all the needs of the three are met (Scott & Hunter, 2008:280; Pratt

et al., 2011:416). The natural resources are conserved and replenished at a rate faster or equal to that of their consumption, thereby prolonging the natural resource for as long as is essential (Erdogan & Tosun, 2009:4). Managers of NBAs need to engage in STM to guarantee that all tourism activities are well prearranged and accomplished, and that tourism does not degrade or over-exploit resources (Twining-Ward, 2015:2; Prayag, Dookhony-Ramphul & Maryeven, 2010:698; Okello & Yenan, 2009:605). When the environment is being damaged or has the potential to be damaged due to tourism, as is the case with NBAs, the application of STM is critical (Okello & Yenan, 2009:605).

Sustainable tourism management in NBAs takes a precise form in practice by implementing sustainable action plans (SAPs) such as policy instruments, green initiatives, waste water management systems, and solid waste recycling programmes (Scott, 2011a:17; Spier Hotels, n.d:4). SAPs promote environmentally friendly practices leading to the maximization of positive outcomes at the NBAs, which ensure continuous appeal, value and uniqueness of the NBAs, as well as enhance the publicity and marketing opportunities (Madikwe Game Reserve, 2015:1; Silva *et al.*, 2013:20).

The management and application of SAPs has led to internationally renowned best practices which have become focal points wherever sustainable tourism practices are mentioned. Best practices for implementing SAPs include Kakadu National Park in Australia, Madikwe Game Reserve in South Africa, Fulufjallet National Park in Sweden, as well as the Barbados in the Caribbean (Parks Australia, 2015:1; Madikwe Game Reserve, 2015; Cottrell & Cutumisu, 2006:155; Mycoo, 2006:507). Chapter 3 of the study elaborate more on the best practices in the management of SAPs.

Despite the existence of best practices of management of SAPs, the management of SAPs has been largely unsuccessful due to challenges and barriers such as the difficulty of stakeholder involvement in decision making, and lack of funds; which need to be overcome by the managers of NBAs in order to be listed among the internationally renowned best practises of managing SAPs (Drexhage & Murphy, 2010:12).

This study focuses on Khutse Game Reserve (KGR), Gaborone Game Reserve (GGR) and Mokolodi Nature Reserve (MNR), as case studies. The aim is to assess the management of SAPs in NBAs of Botswana. All the three above mentioned NBAs depend highly on the natural resources and

environment for continued attractiveness and success, and the more sustainable the NBAs are, the greater the improvement in services and products (Baker & Mearn, n.d:2).

This chapter discusses the background to the problem, followed by the problem statement, and thereafter, the goals and objectives of the study. The identification of the study objectives is followed by the explanation of the research methodology adopted for the study. Also discussed in the chapter are the limitations, recommendations, research ethics, definition of key terms and the chapter classification. The next section focuses on the background of the management of SAPs in NBAs.

1.2 Background of the problem

The tourism industry first articulated demands for ecologically delicate practices in the 1960s. This led to a series of global events, conferences and initiatives for conserving and protecting resources worldwide as shown in Figure 1.1 below (Fletcher *et al.*, 2013:225; Drexhage & Murphy, 2010:7; Aabo, 2006:4). The popularity and attention given to sustainable development internationally, led to the tourism industry also following the global institutionalisation of sustainable development resulting in the formation of sustainable tourism (Johnston, 2014:198; Drexhage & Murphy, 2010:8; Cottrell and Cutumisu, 2006:151).



Figure 1.1 Evolution of the concept sustainable development

Source: ISciences; 2012:4

As a result of the demands for environmentally sensitive environment, the UNWTO promoted sustainable tourism from the 1990s, stating that the use of SAPs is critical for policy planning and management of NBAs, for measuring how resources are being used, for evaluating the condition of the natural environment, as well as for helping in identifying the negative impact of tourism on NBAs (Zeppel, 2015:188; Pereira & Mykletun, 2012:77; Bramwell & Lane, 2011:414; Swarbrooke, 2009:300; Catibog- Sinha & Wen, 2008:147; Scott & Hunter, 2008:280). Botswana as an NBAs, is affected by negative impact of tourism such as depletion of water, rangeland degradation, decrease in some species, as well as poor sanitation and poor waste management. This makes it imperative for management in Botswana NBAs to engage in SAPs to protect the environment and natural resources from depletion, and to ensure they remain appealing to tourists (Maxim, 2015:38).

Managers of NBAs need to realise that continued success depends on management of SAPs which yield benefits, such as tourist loyalty; and which appeal to investors (Yuksel, Yuksel & Culha, 2012:515; Bojanic, 2011:992; Bohdnowicz *et al.*, 2011:798; Khairat & Maher, 2010:5; Lee, Hsu, Han & Kim, 2010:9029). It is clear that the development and management of SAPs, is crucial for the success of NBAs (Zeppel, 2015: 188).

It is imperative to ascertain how NBAs, such as MNR, GGR and KGR, are managing SAPs. This study therefore, scrutinised the management of SAPs at the NBAs. The next section focuses on the research problem.

1.3 Research problem

Tourism has been recognised as a significant sector which can generate employment, alleviate poverty, bring in foreign currency, as well as conserve the environment in NBAs. However, tourism can also have negative impact such as overcrowding, overuse of scarce resources and water pollution (Maungasame & McKecher, 2014:2, Twining-Ward, 2015:2; Iied & Khanya, n.d:1). Tourism has not succeeded in protecting the natural environment, hence; the need to adopt efficient policies and measures for environmental protection in tourism development (Asadzadeh & Mousavi, 2017:1). SAPs strive to manage and reduce negative tourism impact, and determine the sustainability status of NBAs (Du Plessis, 2010:2; Zhang, Liu & Li, 2008: 19).

It is still a challenge to manage SAPs as some NBAs managers are ignorant of the use of SAPs, do not have required technology/equipment, are not trained, and do not have adequate funds (mostly the case in developing nations) to use for managing the SAPs, which limits the adoption of SAPs (Maxim, 2015:37; Spenceley *et al.*, n.d:8; Catibog-Sinha & Wen, 2008:146; Buckley, 2011:397). The use of SAPs is still voluntary worldwide, as in Botswana, leading to some NBAs not abiding by SAPs (Prayag *et al.*, 2010:699; Schloegel, 2007:250). At international and national levels, there are generally insufficient regulations enforcing the use of SAPs, or where present, the enforcement is weak (Spenceley *et al.*, n.d:7). The tourism industry still lags behind other industries such as forestry and food industries, which have made sustainability a management norm (Twining-Ward, 2015:2). Consequently, there is limited evidence of successful management and practical application of SAPs at NBAs in Botswana (Landorf, 2009:66; Buckley, 2012:537).

It is therefore, imperative to conduct empirical research to identify how the managers of MNR, GGR and KGR are managing SAPs. Various research has been conducted in various areas of sustainable tourism in NBAs as shown in Table 1.1. This list is just an indicative list and is not exhaustive.

Year	Author	Title	Main findings
2008	Blackstock, K.L., White, V& McGrum, G.	Measuring responsibility: An appraisal of a Scottish National Park's sustainable tourism indicators.	The principles of responsible tourism have to be linked with SAPs developed and implemented at a nature-based attraction.
2011	Park, D & Yoon, Y	Developing sustainable rural tourism evaluation indicators.	SAPs are critical for future planning in nature-based attractions. Thirty-three SAPs were identified, divided into four dimensions namely service quality, management system, facilities and outcome.
2011	Keitumetse, S.	Sustainable development and cultural heritage management in Botswana: Towards sustainable communities.	Successful sustainable tourism involves the participation of all stakeholders in decision making.
2013	Petrovic, M. D & Markovic, J. J	Sustainable tourism as a part of Comprehensive Environmental Monitoring: A study of Serbia.	Sustainable tourism should be based on internationally recognised Code of Conduct with emphasis on using resources sparingly, respecting all stakeholders and increasing awareness of tourist.

Table 1.1 Indicative list of the previous research conducted on sustainable tourism.

2013	Duval, M &	Rock	art	tourism	in	the	Only	SAPs	can	alleviate	negative
	Smith, B.	uKhah	lamba	a / D	rakens	sberg	enviro	onmenta	l impa	acts on nat	ure-based
		World	Herit	age Site	: obst	acles	touris	m attrac	tion		
		to t	he	develop	ment	of					
		sustain	able t	ourism.							

Scarce research has been conducted, specifically on the management of SAPs at NBAs. Research neglects processes that lead to the management or lack of management of SAPs in NBAs (Bramwell & Lane, 2012:5). Many authors have highlighted that there is still a large discrepancy between policy endorsement and the reality of managing SAPs (Maxim, 2015:38).

According to Mogobo 2011:30, research trends tend to be limited to larger and more popular NBAS. Past research in Botswana has been based on popular NBAs like the Okavango Delta and Chobe National Park, which are located in northern part of Botswana (Harrison, 2011; Mbaiwa 2005; Mbaiwa & Stronza, 2010) neglecting smaller and less popular NBAs like MNR, GGR and KGR. The problem therefore, is how SAPs are being managed at MNR, GGR and KGR. To address this problem, the purpose and objectives of the study are identified and discussed in the next session.

1.4 Research purpose and objective

This section focuses on the purpose and objectives of the study.

1.4.1 The purpose of the study

The main purpose of the study was to investigate the management of SAPs at selected NBAs in Botswana. To achieve the main purpose, the study sought after answers to the following research questions.

1.4.2 The research questions

This section identified the questions which the researcher sought to answer in order to realise the purpose of the study. The questions guiding the study were:

- What are the principles of sustainable tourism?
- How are the principles of sustainable tourism being used in the tourism businesses?
- Which SAPs can be managed at NBAs?

- How are the SAPs being managed at MNR, GGR and KGR?
- Which NBAs have successfully managed SAPs?

In order to find the responses to the research questions, the researcher was guided by the objectives which follow.

1.4.3 The objectives of the study

The objectives of the study were directed towards the achievement of the purpose of the study and were as follows:

- to highlight how managers of tourism businesses have adopted the principles of sustainable tourism in the daily operations of tourism businesses,
- to determine the SAPs which can be developed for management at NBAs,
- to identify the best practices and international experiences of successful management of SAPs in NBAs,
- to analyse and assess the management of SAPs at 3 selected NBAs and
- to make conclusions and prescribe recommendations to managers of NBAs and naturebased tourism business in general.

Having outlined the aim, research objectives and research questions, it was critical to review the literature on which the management of SAPs in NBAs is based. Therefore, Chapter 2 and Chapter 3 of this study focused on literature review in detail, before the next section focused on the research design.

1.5 Research design

Research design denotes the strategy that specifies all the decisions made regarding the collection of data, the methods and measures for data collection, as well as the strategy for scrutinising and interpreting the data (Zikmund, Babin, Carr & Griffin, 2013:64; Saunders, Lewis & Thornhill, 2007:6). The study engaged both primary research and secondary research. Primary research will be discussed in the next section.

1.5.1 Primary research

Primary research involved the collection of new data of SAPs at GGR, KGR and MNR (Abdullah, 2009:2; Dawson, 2009:46). The advantages of primary research were that current and realistic information was obtained, and the findings were specific to GGR, KGR and MNR and not general, as is the case with secondary research. Qualitative research method, by means of empirical survey design, was used to emphasise the measurement and analysis of relationships among the SAPs, as well as generate statistics on the management of SAPs (Dawson, 2009:15).

The case study method was used, based on research by Stone, 2013:105, Bohdnowicz *et al.*, 2011:797, Engelbrecht, 2010:8, and Van der Merwe & Saayman, 2008:155 who conducted surveys on NBAs. The case study sought to examine how the SAPs are being managed, to establish the fundamental SAPs for NBAS, and to explore and observe the correlations which exist amongst the SAPs managed at each NBAS (Leedy & Ormrod, 2010:265). Purposive sampling, convenience sampling and snowball sampling were used to select the managers and workers enthusiastic to partake in semi-structured interviews. Thereafter, all the responses were analysed and discussed (Leedy & Ormrod, 2010:260). The next section focuses on secondary research conducted.

1.5.2 Secondary research

Secondary research refers to past research that was conducted and which can be used to draw correlations and make further recommendations on SAPs (Cooper & Schindler, 2008:103; Neuman, 2007:69). Academic accredited search engines such as EBSCOhost, websites of NBAS and tourism organisations, books and journal articles on sustainable tourism and research methods, as well as annual reports and tourism-related magazines, were used (Dawson, 2009:46).

Secondary data provided a clear perspective on sustainability, sustainable tourism, as well as SAPs. It was an economic way of obtaining data, allowing for comparisons, and provided an unobtrusive measure, especially where the situation was sensitive. The limitations of secondary data were the difficulty of accrediting the worthiness of the source, lack of control on data collection and data quality, and the possibility of data being biased (Abdullah, 2009:1). Definition of key terms are given in the next section.

1.5.3 Research methodology

Exploratory qualitative research was used in the study. The 3 NBAs were selected due to that they were located in the less popular, south eastern district of Botswana but are the busiest and operate throughout the year (BTDP, 2002:4; Zambezi Society, 2017:1). Using the 3 NBAs would allow the study to come up with indepth information about the management of SAPs in Botswana's NBAs (). Purposive and convenience sampling was used to select the manager who willingly participated in the semi-structured interviews. The managers engaged snowballing sampling to select the workers who were also interviewed (Dawson, 2009:27-37). Past research, literature and the research objectives were used to draft the interview schedule used during the semi-structured interviews. The researcher conducted all the semi structured interviews on the 25 participants and manually transcribed the data (Dawson, 2009:27-37). Coding and thematic data analysis was then done on the raw data (Leedy & Ormrod, 2010:260). Demography of the participants and the findings of the study where presented in themes linked to the research objectives.

1.6 Definition of key terms

This segment operationally explains terms which are frequently used in the dissertation.

Botswana

Botswana is land locked country in Southern Africa, bordered by Namibia, South Africa, Zimbabwe and Zambia. The country has an area of 582 000 square kilometres and is sparsely populated with approximately 2.4 million people (BTDP 2002:20, United Nations, 2018:1).

Management

Management is a set of activities focused on organisation's resources with the aim of achieving goals in an effective and efficient manner (Griffin, 2014:4). The activities involve planning, organizing, leading and controlling of the organisation's resources such as finance and labor (Page, 2015:39).

Nature-based Attraction (NBAs)

Nature-based Attractions are tourism organisations based on natural resources, mostly in the original state, which tourists visit to enjoy and experience nature (Gisolf, n.d:1; Dean, King & Bauer, 2002:423). There are various types of NBAs unique to certain areas in the world. The NBAs are ideal

for regions high in natural amenities. The study focuses on two game reserves and a nature reserve as NBAs.

Sustainability

Sustainable action plans (SAPs)

These are activities of tourism businesses officially chosen for systematic use to measure fluctuations and issues important for tourism development and planning (UNWTO, 2004:1), as well as to encourage the preservation and safety of tourism resources. These actions lead to great change and sustain the environment, ensuring long term viability as well as communal, fiscal and ecological benefits. In the study, SAPs refer to the nature-friendly activities which GGR, MNR and KGR engage in.

Sustainable tourism

Butler, 1987 and the WTO, 2014 define sustainable tourism as 'tourism established and preserved in a zone in a way and degree that stays practical over unlimited period without changing or degrading the environment in which it exists, leading to effective improvement and safety of other deeds and procedures. Such tourism has to be fully accountable for all current and future impacts whilst addressing needs of the hosts, visitors as well as industry (UNEP & UNWTO, 2005:11-12).

Sustainable tourism development

Sustainable tourism development involves balance which involves interchange of concepts amid the participants to control the destination activities sustainably, community benefits, and the businesses contribution in relation to the market request for tourism and visitor satisfaction (Ramsar Convention & UNWTO, 2012:37).

Tourist

A tourist (domestic, inbound *or* outbound) is denoted as a person whose trip includes an overnight stay, mainly for pleasure, and stays in paid accommodation for a period less than a year (UNWTO, 2014; Kumar, 2010:340; Page & Connell, 2009:11). Excursionists are people who travel for tourism purposes for less than 24 hours. This excludes the travellers in transit to other destinations (Page &

Connell, 2009:16). For this research, the term tourist will include excursionists as well as both the domestic and international tourists who visit the nature-based attractions.

Tourism

Tourism is the act of leaving one's usual place of residence for a period of between 24 hours and 1 year. The same term can also be used to refer to the business of providing services to people on holiday such as the hotels, restaurants, car rentals and trips (Collins Dictionary, 2019:1).

Having defined the key terms of the study, the next section explains the outline of the chapters of the study.

1.7 Outline of chapters

The dissertation comprises six chapters, namely; Introduction; Sustainable tourism: Fundamentals, sustainable operations and nature-based attractions; Sustainability in practice: sustainable management of tourism operations, sustainable action plans and international experiences – best practices in the field of NBAs; Research methodology; Research findings; and Conclusions, recommendations and propositions for future research. The chapters are illustrated in Figure 1.3.

Chapter one discussed the introduction of the study, the background of the problem, problem statement, research aim and research objectives. This was followed by a brief discussion of research methodology, explaining the primary and secondary research conducted in the study. The key terms used in the dissertation were explained. Chapter two and chapter three focus on the review of literature for the study. Chapter two focuses on sustainable tourism, principles of sustainable tourism, as well as steps towards sustainable tourism. Chapter three focuses on the sustainable tourism initiatives which NBAs can implement.



Figure 1.3 Chapters of the dissertation

The research methodology is discussed in chapter four. A detailed explanation is given on how the primary research was conducted. The research design, sample plan, research instrument, pilot test, data collection, data processing and data analysis methods that were used are discussed in detail. In chapter five, the results of the analysis of data collected on the SAPs being managed at GGR, MNR and KGR, are discussed. Chapter six draws conclusions, makes recommendations to NBA managers on the management of SAPs at NBAs. Also, the propositions for future research are made for academic researchers or scholars.

CHAPTER 2 – SUSTAINABLE TOURISM AND NATURE-BASED ATTRACTIONS. 2.1 Introduction

The world is recognising tourism as a significant contributor to environmental protection and economic opportunity. Therefore, promoting sustainable tourism and the adoption of sustainable action plans (SAPs) as tools for evaluating the success of sustainable management at nature-based attractions is essential (Twining-Ward, 2015:2; Education Bureau, 2013:15). So as to understand sustainable tourism and subsequently SAPs, there is need to understand the concept of sustainability first.

This chapter explores the literature on the concept of sustainability, the triple bottom line (TBL) pillars of sustainability leading to sustainable tourism. Thereafter, the principles of sustainable tourism are discussed together with nature-based tourism, leading to sustainable nature-based tourism operations. Thereafter, literature on the nature-based attractions as well the tourist experiences at NBAs is reviewed and the chapter concluded. This chapter pursues to identify the principles of sustainable tourism. The layout of the chapter is shown in figure 2.1 however table 2.1 is not exhaustive of all discussions made in the chapter.



Fig 2.1 Outline of chapter 2

Source: Author's own elaboration

2.2 The concept of sustainability

Sustainability was first used in the early 1980s, initially as a new line of thought aiming at decreasing negative impact on natural environment. It has now been developed for protecting and preserving the world's natural environment (Dumbrăveanu, n.d:77). The concept of sustainability has been identified as a key aspect of development but is defined, interpreted and imagined differently and vaguely among various stakeholders in tourism (Mowforth & Munt, 2016:22; Giovanni & Fabietti, 2014:22).

There are varying levels of sustainability leading to what has come to be known as the sustainability continuum which distinguishes between strong or comprehensive sustainability and weak or minimal sustainability levels (Giovanni & Fabietti, 2014:22; Jovicic, 2014:299). Strong sustainability requires 'upholding a constantly increasing standard of financial resources into the unspecified future' and allows 'unhindered substitution' among natural and artificial types of resources (Norton, 2005:307). Whether weak or strong, the key to sustainability is to integrate the socio-cultural, economic, as well as environmental concerns in decision making, which is the key differentiating factor of sustainability from other policies (Emas, 2015:3). However, it is critical to understand that sustainability is not static but is a transitional goal and a learning process. In reality, sustainability is not about perfection, but rather, it is a continuing balancing act of the economic and environmental aspects by means of socio-cultural, economic and environmental integration (Emas, 2015:2). The next section explains the concept of the triple bottom line.

2.4 Sustainable tourism

Butler (1987) and the WTO (2014) define sustainable tourism as 'tourism established and preserved in an zone in a way and degree that stays practical over unlimited period without changing or degrading the environment in which it exists, leading to effective improvement and safety of other deeds and procedures. Sustainable tourism refers to the procedures, practices and programmes in a tourism organisation that identify tourist expectations of responsible natural resources management, and the society and host community needs supporting or affected by tourism projects and the environment (Machnik, 2013:76; Newsome, Moore & Dowling, 2013:12). Sustainable tourism thus, seeks to guarantee that tourism related activities and services preserve the unique attractiveness of the NBAs, as well as conserve the original appeal of the NBAs (Khairat & Maher, 2010:2). Sustainable tourism emanates from responsible tourism, dating back to 1965, which emphasised four key areas. The four key areas are minimising impact on the natural environment, respecting culture, maximising local participation and growing satisfaction from tourism (Machnik, 2013:79). There is greater environmental awareness leading to the need for sustainable tourism development (Education Bureau, 2013:15).

The crucial characteristic of sustainable tourism is appropriate and effective forecasting, such as; addressing consequences and impact of tourism on environment, community and economy (Borges, Carbone, Bushell & Jaeger, 2011:17). The UNWTO, in 2004, stated that sustainable tourism must make paramount use of all the ecological resources, respect the socio-cultural uniqueness of the community, as well as ensure that all financial operations are long term, viable and are of benefit to all the stakeholders (Borges, n.d:4).

Sustainable tourism aims to achieve social equity, environmental purity, local prosperity, economic viability, visitor fulfilment, community wellbeing, cultural richness, local control, physical integrity, biological diversity, and resource efficiency (UNWTO, 2007:27). Tourism in Botswana is in harmony with international standards of sustainable tourism as most of Botswana's frameworks, (such as Botswana Tourism Master Plan), seek attain sustainable tourism progress in Botswana (Stone *et al.*, 2017:61).

Having looked at the definition and subsequently aims of sustainable tourism, the next section focuses on sustainable tourism principles.

2.5 Sustainable tourism principles

Sustainable tourism is governed by principles which include:

a holistic approach to planning and strategic planning at NBAs, involving all stakeholders, i.e. tourists, employees, suppliers, investors and local community. Integration is the principle which underlies all other principles (Emas, 2015:3). Sustainable tourism is an exhaustive approach which needs the integration of all the environmental, economic and socio-cultural

operations at NBAs. (Bohdnowicz, Zientara & Novotna, 2011:801; Scott & Hunter, 2008:277; Spenceley, 2008:305; Catibog-Sinha & Wen, 2008:146);

- continuous and sustained sustainable tourism development. NBAs should plan for growth and also incorporate ways of sustaining the growth (Landorf, 2009:54);
- preservation of essential ecological processes and raising ecological awareness (Bohdnowicz *et al.*, 2011:811; Spenceley, 2008:287) to the stakeholders such as the local community, employees and tourists at NBAs;
- protection of human heritage and biodiversity to avoid the extinction and conserve the local culture at NBAs (Borges *et al.*, 2011:7; Spenceley, Rey de Assis and Shurland, n.d:4); diminishing the negative financial, ecological and communal impact of tourism to the public (Mbaiwa, 2010; Dumbrăveanu, 2004:78),
- creation of better economic benefits and control for resident people and improve the wellbeing of host communities, better working environments and access to the tourism industry (Mbaiwa, 2010:7; Dumbrăveanu, 2004:9),
- improving the well-being of host communities, improvement of working conditions and allowing the local people to control and access the tourism industry (Mbaiwa, 2010:7, Dumbrăveanu, 2004:79),
- provision of more enjoyable experiences for tourists through more organised contacts with local people and better consideration of local, cultural, social and environmental issues (Mbaiwa, 2010:7),
- distribution of local, regional and national natural economic growth fairly (Mbaiwa, 2010:7).
- education of tourists about the impact tourists make to the environment whilst visiting the area so as to improve the social attitude and reduce the negative impact (Dumbrăveanu, 2004:79).

The above-mentioned principles guide NBAs to function in a more environmentally friendly way. NBAs making use of websites to display green achievements are becoming more popular as tourists' concern for the environment grows making NBAs more sustainable tourism operations (Scott, 2011b:29). Tourists are now informed about changes in climate and the effects of tourism on the environment and therefore, are becoming more concerned about sustainability, and expect NBAs to

implement sustainable action plans (SAPs) (Lee *et al.*, 2010:902; Khairat & Maher, 2010:2). Naturebased tourism is discussed next.

2.6 Nature-based tourism

Demand for more sustainable forms of tourism lead to nature-based travel (Moore, Rodger & Taplin, 2015:667). Nature-based Tourism (NBT) has been explained in a numerous ways. However, all definitions involve nature, preservation of nature, as well as tourists (Kafle, 2014:6). Any tourism which involves interactions with nature (Wood, Guerry, Silver & Lacayo, 2013:1) such as wilderness tourism, green tourism, ecotourism, sustainable tourism and adventure tourism, with principles of increasing knowledge about nature, conserving nature and travel in nature, are all forms of NBT (Kafle, 2014:6). NBT has become a popular leisure activity as well as a substantial conservation issue whereby tourists become loyal to nature and advocate support and protection of natural areas (Geoffroy, Samia, Bessas & Blamstein, 2015:760; Moore *et al*, 2015:668). As a result, tourists mostly visit natural areas to make connections with nature, which is the essence of NBT (Newsome *et al.*, 2013:1; Wood *et al.*, 2013:1).

NBT is undergoing explosive growth as a part of the tourism industry, and if managed, planned and developed responsibly, can change both the natural area and tourism itself. (Newsome *et al.*, 2013:2). NBAs need to be managed to provide excellent memorable experiences to tourists in order to gain sustainable advantage (Chandralal & Valenzuela, 2013:178). The environment is central in affecting choices of the destinations where the tourist will go. Therefore, NBAs need to be aware of the need to sustain the natural resource which entices the tourists (Alexakis & Rice, 2016:6). There is need for management at NBAs to ensure that the negative impacts are minimised through actions such as regulating water flows, protecting cultural diversity, and protecting unknown number of species (Balmor, 2015:1).

Having discussed nature-based tourism, the next section will focus on the nature-based attractions.

2.7 Nature-based attractions (NBAs)

NBAs are relatively undeveloped areas with natural resources, mostly in the original state, which tourists visit to enjoy and experience nature (Gisolf, n.d:1; Dean, King & Bauer, 2002:423). The NBAs relate to natural allure in a geographic area such as topography, vegetation, water, weather and the

available animal life, as well as to the culture and heritage (Batman & Zencirkiran, 2016:650; Kapan, 2016:702). Table 2.2 highlights the examples of main NBAs, the types of NBT they represent, as well as examples of actual attractions.

Table 2.2 Nature-based	attractions
------------------------	-------------

Nature	Examples activities of NBT	Examples of NBAs
Wildlife	Bird watching- High bird population areas	Makgadikgadi Pans in Botswana
	Game drives	Sabi Game Reserve
Water	Scuba diving -Clear water, good water temperatures, diverse mammal life.	Galapagos Islands
	Waterfalls- free falling water mass	Victoria falls
Vegetation	Geoparks	Hongkong Geopark
	Nature cure centre	Madha Pradesh in India
	Watching scenery	Pruhonise Park in Czech Republic
Topography	Mountain Climbing- Mountainous landscape	Haffner Creek in Canada

	Trekking	Himalayas
Weather	Skiing and winter sports	Lake Salda in Turkey
	Sea, sand, sun- clear, sunny weather and beach	Cape town

Source: Batman & Zencirkiran, 2016:560; Leung, Spenceley, Hvenegaard, Buckley, 2014:34, 48, 154; Ghodeswa 2013:15; Spotlight on Sustainable Tourism (SOST), 2013:23).

The next section elaborates on sustainable nature-based tourism operations.

2.8 Sustainable nature-based tourism operations

Sustainable business operations involve the use of sustainable tourism principles to all tourism activities and destinations where tourism occurs, local and national government, and to tourists themselves, not just to companies (Ramsar Convention & UNWTO, 2012: 24). Businesses exclusively concentrating on lessening the environmental impact are denoted as 'green businesses', whereas a sustainable business would emphasise on the triple bottom line, intertwining the interdependent relations among socio-cultural, economic and environmental aspects of a business (Green Hotel, 2017:1). Sustainable business operations reflect a bigger, broader movement towards greater corporate social responsibility whereby businesses operate in various ways which include eco-efficiency, increased resource productivity, going beyond the traditional greening, waste reduction, transition to renewable energy sources, buying green, green meetings, and green buildings (Ghodeswa 2013:14, Green Hotels, UNWEP, Sustainable Scale, n.d:1; Ramsar Convention & UNWTO, 2012:1).

The next section discusses the application of sustainable tourism principles at the NBAs.

2.9 Application of sustainable tourism principles

As discussed in section 2.5, there are ten principles of sustainable tourism. Each principle is discussed briefly and examples given as to how managers of tourism businesses have applied the principle in the operations. Holistic and strategic approach to planning will be the first principle to be discussed.

2.9.1 Holistic and strategic approach of planning

Management needs to involve stakeholders in the procedure of forecasting and calculated scheduling in order to be sustainable. The growth of 'bogshoe' walks at Soomaa National Park (SNP) in Estonia shows managers and tourism providers coming together to provide tourism activities that deliver great experiences whilst protecting wetlands. SNP has many specially designed boardwalks which allow tourists admission to SNP's bogs and forests without harming the natural environment. However, tour operators sought to provide variety to the tourists and therefore worked together with SNP to come up with innovative tours that availed wilderness experiences to the tourists whilst protecting the site's fragile habitats and wildlife.

As a result, guided 'bogshoe' walks using snowshoes were developed, allowing tourists to walk over the soft and delicate swamp vegetation without harming it. This activity is carefully monitored, adhering to maximum numbers, and constant checks to ascertain that no harm is instigated to the swamps and their flora and fauna. This activity led to more tourists travelling around more remote areas of the SNP thereby both differentiate the kinds of tourism activities- offered by the SNP, as well as deliver a virtually exceptional experience that enticed tourists and helped uphold the SNP and its tourism, with benefits for local tour operators and other businesses (The Ramsar Convention & UNWTO, 2012:46). The second principle to be discussed is preserve ecology and biodiversity.

2.3 The triple bottom line

The concept of sustainability has been linked to financial, ecological and communal aspects which are sometimes referred to as the three 'p's, namely; planet, people and profit/ prosperity (Page & Connell, 2009:446). The three pillars have been denoted under numerous headings for example, dimensions, discourses, spheres, components, systems and pillars, just to mention a few (Giovanni & Fabietti, 2014:37; Drexhage &Murphy, 2010:6; Seghezzo, 2009:539; Page & Connell, 2009:446). For the purpose of this study, the term pillars is used.

The triple bottom line (TBL) conceptualises sustainability using the three pillars of sustainability (Plummer & Fennell, 2009:119; Spenceley, 2008:286). For sustainability to be achieved in the tourism industry, the industry has to be environmentally sensitive, economically viable, and socially appropriate (Deere, 2011:23). The TBL states that nature-based attractions (NBAs) need to focus on environmental and socio-cultural sustainability strategies as well, rather than solely focusing on economic strategies (Stoddard, Pollard & Evans, 2012:233; Dwyer & Faux, 2010:3). The TBL emphasises on taking full advantage of the helpful effects of tourism and minimising the undesirable impact for the benefit of all the stakeholders of tourism at NBAs (Responsible Tourism Tanzania, 2013:2; Khairat & Maher, 2010:2).

Sustainability is a synergistic process which aims to balance the social, environmental and economic considerations at NBAs such that the present stakeholders are content without compromising the capability of the future stakeholders to fulfil the same requirements using the same resources (O'Neil & Lee, 2004:2; WCED 1987:8). For tourism to contribute effectively towards sustainability, the three pillars should be applied together in a balanced manner (Kapan, 2016:701; Kibert ,2016:15). The main remit for sustainability is therefore, to keep the three pillars in equilibrium during the operation of the NBAs, as shown by the intersecting circles in Figure 2.2, so as to maintain the value of the NBAs as it is passed on to future generations (Kapan, 2016:701). The first pillar of sustainability to be discussed will be environmental sustainability.


Figure 2.2: The pillars of sustainability

Source: Adapted from UNEDP & UNWTO, 2005:11-12.

2.3.1 Environmental sustainability

The environmental pillar on sustainability encompasses conservation and managing resources (Hall, *et al.*, 2015:27). NBAs are based on the natural and biological environment which also supplies the organisation with heat, power, shelter, food, laundry services, sanitation and water. It is therefore, critical to guarantee that the adverse effects of tourism are reduced at all costs (UNESCO, 2015:4). The status of the environment will influence the nature and scale of activities at the NBAs (Engelbrecht, 2011:13). Overuse, misuse and abuse of the resources can lead to pollution of the environment, as well as trekking, trampling, careless fire, hazardous waste production and exceeding the carrying capacity of the destination (Plummer & Fennell, 2009:13; Buhalis & Costa, 2006:153). If the environment deteriorates, there is a high chance of losing some tourists to competing destinations (Eagles, Bowman & Tao, 2001:24).

Positive environmental impact includes the formation of national parks and wildlife parks such as the Yellowstone Park in United States of America, reuse and recycling of water, ecological management of tracks and paths such as is done at the New Forest in the United Kingdom (Spier, n.d:4; Erdogan & Tosun, 2009:4). An example of an area engaging in environmental sustainability is the Dja Faunal

Reserve, located at the Congo Basin. The reserve is a World Heritage Site which has the largest and best protected African rainforest (UNESCO, 2015:1). The reserve ensures that the community is well educated on preservation, anti-poaching, and sustainable hunting in order to preserve the environmental heritage of the Baka Pygmies who are the community, and who recognise the area as a place of cultural value (UNESCO, 2015:4). The next section elaborates more on socio-cultural sustainability.

2.3.2 Socio-cultural sustainability

To be sustainable, a tourism development strategy for NBAs must also respect human rights, present equal opportunities for all in the community, which should be reflected in the NBAs' vision and goals (Hall, Gossling & Scott, 2015:27). The socio-cultural sustainability seeks to safeguard that the non-renewable social resources are kept safe within the tourism process (Henry & Jackson, 1996:18). Tourism thrives on socio-cultural exchange between host and tourist, leading to people understanding each other better worldwide, as well as inculcating respect, awareness, sympathy, admiration and appreciation for the different cultures (Fletcher *et al.*, 2013:216).

It is critical that the ratio of tourists to locals, and residents' attitude towards tourists is managed with reference to the Irridex Model (Buhalis & Costa, 2006:153). The Irridex Model highlights four stages showing a trend between the levels of tourism development and host community attitudes. The stages are euphoria, apathy, irritation, and antagonism. The community is first pleased by hosting tourists, then tourists are perceived as income generators till there is saturation of services and facilities leading to the community becoming hostile and blaming tourists for all the negative impacts brought about by tourism (Zaidan & Kovac, 2017).

Socio-cultural impact is both positive and negative. Therefore, sustainability in tourism seeks to minimise negative impact factors such as overcrowding, prostitution, sell of culture, and loss of pride in culture; and to ensure that the positive impact factors are maximised (Zaei, 2013:15).

Tourism provides better and improved facilities such as sanitation, health, water supply, sewage treatment, food and nutrition, and education (GSTC, 2015:1; Fletcher *et al.*, 2013:216). Sustainability in tourism has also brought about peace among communities, hence; the existence of the International Institute for Peace through Tourism established in 1986 (Fletcher *et al.*, 2013:216).

Beijing is famous for efforts made to conserve the socio-cultural heritage through the use of Hutong tours which allowed tourists to visit residential homes and ride in bicycles through the narrow lanes within the community, thus experiencing the life of ancient Beijing people whilst leaving as little negative impact as possible (Johnston, 2014:196). Clearly socio-cultural sustainability in tourism is important as a tool of socio-cultural conservation and has led to the long existence of the Hutong neighbourhoods (Johnston, 2014: 202). Economic sustainability is discussed next.

2.3.3 Economic sustainability

The economic pillar of sustainability emphasises that profit is generated at all the various ranks of the society and it addresses cost effectiveness of all the economic accomplishments (Hall, Gossling & Scott, 2015:27). It is paramount that the profit is distributed fairly and such indications as a percentage of foreign workers versus locals, as well as economic leakage, are put in place to ensure economic sustainability of the NBAs (Buhalis & Costa, 2006:153).

Generally, the NBAs should support locals with employment, which is backed up by legislation. The legislation should protect the locals against seasonal work, low pay, child labour and equity in opportunities and gender. In this way, there was improved quality of services and higher levels of education for the local communities around NBAs (Bhandari, 2014:460). The Spier Hotel located in the Cape Winelands is known for its commitment towards sustainability, always emphasising community and environmental responsibility. It employs locals and supports a couple of schools within the community (Spier, n.d:10).

The financial performance of the NBAs has to be good too. The community should attract and retain business, talented people, as well as have partnerships and business relationships with the outside world. The NBA has to work towards the development of the resident economy using means such as hiring local labour, local supply of products or raw materials, and improving the management of waste, water and energy (Prat *et al.*, 2011:414). There should be a link and balance with the other industries such as agriculture, transport, and telecommunications in the destination, in order for tourism to be a success and to avoid overdependence on tourism and allow the NBAs to be maintained over a long time (Naturefriends International, 2011:7).

Effective implementation of all types of sustainability will result in the NBAs business realising the benefits of TBL as shown in Figure 2.3.

OPERATIONAL & ENVIRONMENTAL PERFORMANCE

- Regulatory compliance
- Decrease water consumption
- •Decrease impacts on water quality
- •Energy consumption & upsurge energy efficiency
- •Escalate use of renewable energy
- •Lessen waste landfill disposal
- Decrease resource consumption
- •Decrease GHG & air emissions
- Protect & restore habitats & ecosystems

SOCIAL & COMMUNITY PERFORMANCE

- Deliver high level customer service
- Effectively engage and communicate with stakeholders
- Hire diverse workforce & employ a culture of inclusion
 Offer employee training &
- career development
- Follow health & safety protocols
 Offer support to small business enterprises
- Control orders, noise & other nuisance issues for the community
- Help communities grow

FINANCIAL & RISK PERFORMANCE

- Create capital investments to meet current & future demnads
- Keep costs low
- Acquire best return on investment
- •Maintain high bond ratings
- Accomplish finances wisely
- Manage assets & operations
- Contribute to local economic development
- Partner with other organisations
- Provide jobs & job training

Figure 2.3 Triple Bottom Line and the associated benefits for the NBAs business

Source: George, 2010:1

There is no format for implementing TBL therefore, the TBL allows NBAs to be free to apply the concept in a manner that is suitable for their specific needs (Stoddard *et al.*, 2012:234). Interest in sustainability has grown in all industries, including tourism, resulting in the formation of sustainable tourism (McCool & Moisey, 2001:106). The next section focuses on sustainable tourism.

2.9.2 Preserve ecology and biodiversity

There is need for tourism managers to ensure tourism preserves resources so as to maintain the uniqueness of the attractions (CEC, 2002:1). Frégate Island Private (FIP) in Seychelles established in 1998, was revived using a systematic process to accommodate wild rats, cats, and mynah birds. A conservation partnership was set up with Durrell Wildlife Conservation Trust to preserve the giant Aldabra tortoises and sea turtles through efforts such as:

- building a nursery to shield and safeguard the growth of young tortoises. Tortoises' numbers increased from 150 to 2,000 in 20 years, showing the outcome of the conservation efforts, and
- observing and protecting some nests during the breeding season from October to January annually.

The birdlife and vegetation, as well as resources were conserved through:

- alliance with 'Birdlife International',
- ensuring that the island is free of pesticides, mice and rodents for birds to 'breed without harm on the ground,'
- repairing of the habitats through reforestation of native trees,
- helping cultivate 'healthy and stable populations' for four other islands of Seychelles,
- formation of a large plant market for endangered vegetation to help improve ecological balance,
- planting different types of local vegetation some with national value, some sweet-scented spices and also some for feeding some the animals,
- improving energy use through promoting lunar power energy and recycling culinary fats, and
- collection of rainwater; prohibiting the importation of bottled water, 100% reutilizing of all water, and using 'old water' for landscaping and agriculture.

As a result of this conservation partnership, the community enjoyed economic benefits such as 41% of FIP staff being locals (Wei, 2013:17). To protect and conserve culture, human heritage and biodiversity is the third principle of sustainable tourism to be discussed.

2.9.3 Protect and conserve culture, human heritage and biodiversity

Tourism leads to an influx of people to the tourist attraction. There is therefore, need to manage the sociocultural impact, as well as the biodiversity of the area. The blue yonder was established in 2009 to help people conserve culture, lifestyle, livelihood and future of community. There was need to engage in sustainable tourism development in the area along Nila in Kerala, India. There has been active eco-restoration and sustainable waste management through the planting of a variety of native trees. The next section focuses on the fourth principle of sustainable tourism which is continuous long-term development and growth.

2.9.4 Continuous long-term development and growth

There is need for tourism in NBAs to be continuous and sustained over a long term. NBAs should plan for growth and also incorporate ways of sustaining the growth (Landorf, 2009:54). Chumbe Island is an isolated aquatic park situated in the Indian Ocean off the shoreline of Zanzibar, Tanzania; gazetted as an endangered area in 1994 by the government of Tanzania. The park is focussed on a deserted island enclosed by a very substantial coral rag forest and encircled by a coral reef of extraordinary biodiversity and exquisiteness. The tourism facilities include accommodation for 14 guests, day trips to 12 more visitors per day, as well as excursions for scholars for conservational education purposes. The Chumbe Island expansion has shown futuristic consideration in the longterm vision and in the selection of objectives and in planning.

The project is over 10years operating successfully and this has been attributed to local people involvement in all facets of the development and the engaging of local people in park jobs so as minimise destructive activities to the reef ecosystem. Also, there was increase of green considerations in the design and construction of the tourism facilities resulting in minimal negative environmental impact during construction and during operation. There was also the repair of the natural woodland and the retrieval of the breeding bird populations significantly, due the complete removal of rats. The tourism project undertook the protection of the universally substantial coral reef whilst the national government gazetted the first aquatic reserve in the country and formed the national law which allow for the private management of conservation areas. As a result of the Chumbe island expansion there was a noticeably increase in representing part of the Zanzibar and Tanzanian cultural heritage.

The Chumbe Island Coral Park was voted as conqueror of the 1999 British Airways Tourism for Tomorrow Award as the finest case of sustainable tourism worldwide (Chumbe Island, 2017:30). The fifth principle of sustainable tourism, to reduce negative impact of tourism, is discussed in the next section.

2.9.5 Reducing negative impact of tourism

The Islands of the Pacific are popular destinations for tourists in search of isolated coastlines, original culture, and striking natural surroundings. Tourists increase pressure on the already limited supply of

resources such as food, water and energy, resulting in additional reliance on imported goods and surplus waste creation. Transportation of imported goods increases carbon emissions, aggravating the climate change effects to which small islands are predominantly susceptible. Although the Pacific Islands suffer from the negative effects, tourism still has the potential to reverse the negative effects and benefit the local community. The Pacific Sustainable Tourism Alliance was formed in 2015 to fast track sustainability in the region through:

- collaborating with local stakeholders and identifying common problems hindering sustainability,
- training and educating hotel managers to be aware of sustainable practices, and implementing the sustainable practices, and
- installing the sustainability management system at hotels to monitor the consumption of the critical resources, and to access the application of sustainable practices.

The islands hope to lessen consumption of non-renewable resources, lessen waste and pollution, inspire local sourcing of food and other raw materials, decrease carbon emissions, upturn awareness and appreciation of local culture, and mostly increase tourism related jobs and income opportunities for the local community (Boyle, 2015:1). There is, therefore, need for all tourism operations to work together based on principles of sustainable tourism management. The next section focuses on local control and well-being of community as the sixth principle of sustainable tourism.

2.9.6 Local control and well-being of community

There is need for local people to govern tourism as this helps boost the happiness of host people, improves working conditions, and accords access to the attractions (Mbaiwa, 2010:7, Dumbrăveanu, n.d:7). At Tubbataha Reefs National Park (Philippines), part of the conservation admission fees is used to for livelihood initiatives in communities in the region. Similarly, pay the Parc Nacional das Quirimbas (Mozambique), also allocates some of the collected fees towards the sustenance of public activities, and at the Ibera Marshes in Argentina, the development of striking conservation-based tourism activities has rejuvenated the economy of Colonia Carlos Pellegrini, near the Ramsar Convention Site 'Lagunas y Esteros del Iberá'. Employment has been created, livelihood prospects increased thereby dropping outward migration in search of jobs (The Ramsar Convention & UNWTO, 2012:28). The seventh principle of sustainable tourism, to provide more pleasant experiences for tourists, is elaborated on in the next section.

2.9.7 Provide more pleasant experiences for tourists

Central India houses Madhya Pradesh, a nature-based attraction where tourists can appreciate ecotourism activities and facilities such as countryside camps (camping sites in natural surroundings), ecological lodging, hiking and countryside, wildlife watching and river cruise, adventure sports, angling, herbal ecotourism, city ecotourism through eco-parks, and preservation education. This has enlarged the region's tourism arrivals as eco-tourism and wildlife watching have also developed with a continual upsurge of tourists' numbers going to see parts of Rajasthan. Tourists can also interrelate with local artists, and craftsmen supporting tourism in Rajasthan through song and dance, handiworks (pottery, metal craft, wooden artefacts, leather ware), stone art, and nature therapy centres (Ghodeswa, 2013:16). The next section discusses the focus on local, national, regional, economic growth as the eight principle of sustainable tourism.

2.9.8 Focus on local, national, regional economic growth

Tourism at NBAs should speed up national economic growth as well as provincial and resident economic development. This progression must be shared fairly across the social continuum (Mbaiwa, 2010:7). The Mexico Melipona Honey Project is a five-year project started in January 2009, with finance and backing from the Co-operative Travel and Thomas Cook in Mexico. The Melipona bee is a unusual type of stingless bee prevalent in Southern Mexico and Guatemala. The Mush Meyer honey group engages in Melipona bee keeping in Benito Juarez (inland from the Riviera Maya).

The project commenced with 10 bee colonies which produced honey which was sold locally. Products were expanded to produce value-added products such as the new product line, Much Kaab, which was launched at the Green Expo, leading to more support pledges from several hotels and NGOs selling soap, honey and other bee products. For example, the Grand Palladium Riviera Maya Resort and Spa, offered a 'local produce corner' in the hotel gift shop, whilst a local NGO, Aldea Verde, pledged to provide training in organic (worm) composting to help increase flowering of plants that the bees feed on, and as an organic fertiliser for herbs used to make soaps. This helped create more awareness of the products and, it is hoped, more products were sold nationally, regionally as well as internationally (Spotlight on Sustainable Tourism (SOST); 2013:7-9). The next section discusses the ninth principle pf sustainable tourism; educating and informing tourists.

2.9.9 Educate and inform tourists

Tourists generally indicate a solid wish to understand the areas they are visiting (Rainforest Alliance, n.d:57). In the Bukovina region in Romania, the locals were trained to work in tourism as escorts, mentors and employees, in accordance with moral practices and nature preservation. The locals, who intermingle directly with tourists, have an important influence on the tourists in terms of encouraging the protection of the surrounding nature, culture and heritage. Thus, after the training, there was promotion of environmentally responsible behaviour among tourists, as the tourists were now educated and informed about the environment of the region, as well as about why nature conservation is critical at all times. In addition, sustainable development was also promoted as well as ecological behaviour (*Nastate, Scutariu, Chaşovschi,* 2013:58).

The tenth and last principle of sustainable tourism is discussed in the next section.

2.9.10 Benefits from operating sustainably

Studies have shown that there are benefits gained through the implementation of sustainable operations and SAPs (Yuksel, Yuksel & Culha, 2012:515; Bojanic, 2011:992; Bohdnowicz *et al.*, 2011:798; Khairat & Maher, 2010:5; Lee, Hsu, Han & Kim, 2010:902; Ayuso, 2007:146; Spier Hotels, n.d:4). The key benefits are shown in Table 2.1.

Table 2.1 Key benefits for sustainable operations

Key benefits	
•	Ethical bearing (altruistic or personal concern for the environment)
•	Improved tourist care
•	Improved image and marketing advantages
•	Improved tourist product and services
•	Financial advantage (decreasing operating costs or increasing
	effectiveness)
•	Well trained, well informed, and highly motivated employees
•	Tourist loyalty
•	Appeal to investors

• Providing source of income for conservation

Sources: (Yuksel, Yuksel & Culha, 2012:515; Bojanic, 2011:992; Bohdnowicz *et al.*, 2011:798; Khairat & Maher, 2010:5; Lee, Hsu, Han & Kim, 2010:902; Ayuso, 2007:146; Spier Hotels, n.d:4).

It is imperative that NBAs managers ensure that other stakeholders fully benefit from sustainability. The community was able to fully participate in tourism decisions, improve the well-being of the community members, as well as gain respect for the values and rights. The tourists enjoyed good services considerate of sustainability, which also empowered locals and benefited them to keep enjoying positive experiences, and allowed access to fragile and unique environments, characteristic of nature-based tourism (Parks Canada, n.d:1).

Having discussed how the principles of sustainable tourism are being put to practise in NBAs, the next section focuses on the tourist experiences at the NBAs.

2.10 Tourist experiences at NBAs

There is need for management of NBAS to appreciate the significance of experience created by tourism offerings (Shresta, 2014:4). Tourist experience is defined as how the tourist engages in the intangible tourism service or product in an effort to create memorable personal events (Kafle, 2014:24). Management has to ensure that the NBA is giving an experience which is satisfactory to the tourist as that is essential to the success of the NBAs (Kafle, 2014:23). It is important that the management recognise that a meaningful tourist experience is interconnected with cultural, individual, natural and environmental characteristics of the NBAs, and is affected by the anticipations or needs of the tourists, the activities or services at the NBAs, and the remembrances created at the NBAs (Kafle, 2014:24; Shresta, 2014:4).

A high level of meaningful tourist experiences leads to continuation of the tourism services or product, repeat business, and to referral business (Shresta, 2014:4). Low levels of meaningful experiences will lead to improvement of the services and further development of the tourism product. (Shresta, 2014:4). Management needs to employ tools to measure tourist experiences in order to fully understand the tourist experiences. The Experience Pyramid (EP) was developed by Tarssanen and Kylänen in 2006 to help evaluate the tourism product or service, and discover means to improve the tourism product

and service, in addition to designing a tourism product service that provides tourists with a true meaningful experience (Shresta, 2014:24).



Figure 2.4 Experience Pyramid

Source: (Tarssanen 2009:11 in Shresta, 2014:24).

E.P analyses tourism services from two aspects namely; tourism product and service specific components, on the basis of the E.P and customers' own experiences on the height of the E.P (Shresta, 2014:26). The tourism product or service specific components are:

- Individuality the ability of the tourism merchandise or service to be customised to suit the tourists' requirements. The uniqueness of product compared to similar products.
- Authenticity the level of originality of the tourism product or service as seen.
- Story and theme social significance of the tourism product or service. How tourism product or service was consumed and in which order the tourist will experience the product.
- Multi-sensory perception the way in which the tourism product or service engrosses the five senses in an attempt to create an everlasting impression and experience to the tourist.

- Contrast aspect of the tourism product or service which is unique, new, different from the tourist's normal lifestyle; which will create a new, exotic and exceptional experience for the tourist.
- Interaction and good communication amongst the stakeholders (fellow tourists, community, producers, and service providers) to give tourists a sense of belonging as experience is shared amongst the stakeholders (Kafle, 2014:28; Shresta, 2014:26).

The tourist experiences, at the height of the EP, move from one level to the next, unlike the product or service characteristics, which work together simultaneously for a tourist to get meaningful experiences. The level of experience begins with motivation of the tourists. At this state, the initial interest to travel is awakened by awareness and knowledge about the particular tourist product or service. Next, the tourist has to accomplish the physical level as tourists, in the flesh, come into interaction with the tourist product or service, participating using the senses to feel and experience the positive effects of the tourist product or service in an ideally harmless and pleasurable atmosphere (Kafle, 2014:29; Shresta, 2014:27).

After experiencing the tourism product or service physically, the tourist engages at an intellectual level whereby after unknowingly or knowingly learning, the tourist decides whether satisfaction has been reached or not. Next, the tourist experiences the emotional level based on the first three levels whereby the tourist decides if the product or service was authentic, exciting, romantic, adventurous, life changing, boring, or sad. At this level, the tourist service or product providers loose complete control of the tourist and cannot predict the outcome as tourists experiencing the same product or service can exhibit different emotions towards the product or service. Lastly, the tourist experiences the product at the mental level whereby experiencing the tourist forever, such as changes in lifestyle for example, engaging in reduce, reuse, recycle in day to day operations (Kafle, 2014:29; Shresta, 2014:27).

Being aware of the experience of tourists helps the NBAs management to have ideas on future product development, build image of the NBAs, as well as come up with new business and marketing strategies (Kafle, 2014:24). However, the basic experience a tourist gets from NBAs is natural

environment, which is mixed with other products or services as highlighted in the following examples (Balmor, 2015:1).

Polwaththa Eco lodges in Sri Lanka offer unique and authentic experiences of nature, culture and tradition. The Ecolodge is situated in an estate covered with coconut trees amongst other lavish indigenous trees which give the place a green forest feeling, all year round. The jungle has a large variety of wildlife and over 60 bird species. Tourists can experience monkeys, squirrels and barking deer during the day, and at night, the flying squirrels, bats, wild boar and owls roaming around the estate (SOST, 2013:35).

The Wadi El-Hitan-Valley of the Whales World Heritage Site in Egypt exhibits the evolution of Eocene-aged whales from land animals to marine animals. Tourists can access the site through five alternative routes. The core fossil areas are enclosed in limestone blocks which fit in with the local environment. The site enhances tourists' experiences further by providing shade, orientation area, interpretation stations, parking washrooms, a cafeteria, onsite transportation, craft shop and camping facilities. The management limits tourist numbers in a bid to enrich experience as well as avoid overcrowding, which would lead to more negative impact, which reduces the level of satisfaction and engender negative experiences (Leung *et al.*, 2014:165). The next section concludes this chapter.

2.11 Conclusion

This chapter is the first part of the literature review for the study. In the chapter, it was established that sustainable tourism emanates from sustainability, a concept which came to being over three decades ago, aiming at preserving and protecting the natural environment. Although the levels of sustainability differ from organisation to organisation, sustainability comprises of three pillars namely; environmental, economic and sociocultural pillars. The pillars need to be given equal attention to attain sustainable tourism.

Sustainable tourism is governed by principles which, when applied to nature-based tourism, results in sustainable operations at the nature-based attractions. The nature-based tourism and nature-based attractions highlight the need to create a memorable tourist experience at all times. The next chapter focuses on the implementation of sustainability and how the principles of sustainability are put into

practice at selected NBAs, in a bid to create meaningful and memorable experiences for the tourists worldwide.

CHAPTER 3: SUSTAINABILITY IN PRACTICE: BEST PRACTICES IN THE FIELD OF NBAS.

3.1 Introduction

Effective management of NBAs is important for the tourism industry and this has to be a combined effort of both the private and the public sector (Enea, Enea & Grigorescu, 2012:500). Managing tourism at all levels is becoming a challenge and requires continuous strategic thinking as the numerous elements are co-ordinated simultaneously (Bosnic, Tubic & Stanisic, 2014:154). There is need to apply modern management in daily tourism practice through the basic elements and functions of management (Bosnic *et al.*, 2014:156). NBAs management involves a long-term process which puts in place, programmes and strategies to invite more tourists, reduce negative impact of tourism, promote and market the NBAs, and enhance tourism for the region (Bosnic *et al.*, 2014:156).

This chapter focuses on the SAPs which can be developed for management at NBAs, and explores the best international experiences in NBAs. NBAs are managed in conjunction with various stakeholders therefore; the chapter begins with a brief discussion of the importance of stakeholders in the management of NBAs, followed by the Holistic Conceptual Conservation Framework (HCCF) of sustainable management, highlighting how the key functions of tourism management are stimulated for the success of NBAs. Thereafter, the SAPs which managers can make use of at NBAs are discussed, leading to the best international experiences in NBAs management. Figure 3.1 shows the outline of the chapter.

management



Fig 3.1 Layout of the chapter

Source: Author's own elaboration.

The next section discusses the key stakeholders in NBAs management.

3.2 Key stakeholders in NBAs management

Freeman in 1984 pioneered the stakeholder management approach stating that all organisations are characterised by associations among several groups and people who are either affected or affect the attainment of the organisation's goals (Freeman 1984:46). Stakeholders are therefore, individuals or groups who have genuine concern in the organisation's accomplishments, have the influence to change the organisation's routine, and have a stake in the organisation's performance (Sautter & Leistern, 1999:313).

The stakeholders differ with each organisation, and with the geographic location of organisations (Dabphet, 2012:1). Swarbrooke (2001) in Dabphet (2012:1) identifies stakeholders in NBAs as the government, tourist, host community, tourism business and other industries; whereas the UNWTO recognises the stakeholders in NBAs as tourism experts, public establishments, as well as journalists and other mass media.

Sustainable tourism development (STD) can be hindered by lack of understanding of who the stakeholders of an organisation are, and the differing interests of the key stakeholders (Dabphet, 2012:1). Successful tourism management seeks to balance the needs of stakeholders, and address challenges of integrating the needs of all tourism stakeholders (Eagles *et al.*, 2001:28). Sustainable tourism development encompasses balance which involves interchange of concepts amid the participants to control the destination activities sustainably, community benefits, and the businesses contribution in relation to the market request for tourism and visitor satisfaction (Ramsar Convention & UNWTO, 2012:37). For the purpose of this study, the key stakeholders in the NBAs include management, employees (both managers and workers), community, local authorities and tourists as shown in Figure 3.2 (Tourism and Transport Australia, 2004:14).



Figure 3.2 Key stakeholders in NBAs

Source: Adapted from Botswana, 2009:69; Conradie, 2009:43; Tourism and Transport Australia, 2004:14.

There is need for proficiency building for all stakeholders through training, youth participation, creating environmental awareness, bringing together the environmental, economic, and socio-cultural resources, as well as through stakeholder partnerships in developing and operating amenities of NBT (Ghodeswa, 2013:1).

Employees are important stakeholders in NBAs, hence; the need to train and educate employees on sustainability issues. For the purposes of the study, employees mean both workers and managers whilst workers refer to the subordinates of the manager. SAPs can fail if employees do not understand what is being done and why it is being done, and the implications it has on conservation and the NBAs as a whole. NBAs managers also perform the key function of staffing in the NBAs, involving both technical (scheduling, job analysis, performance assessment as well reimbursement and welfares) and social functions (teaching, upgrade, psychotherapy) (Kurt, n.d:11). There is need for motivated,

skilled and qualified employees (Enea *et al.*, 2012:500). NBAs managers have to put in place programs to acquire, maintain, retain and train workers, and educate tourists (Kurt, n.d:11).

The community is another crucial stakeholder in NBAs, as the community takes ownership of the environment through its deep knowledge of the ecosystem, culture, endangered species, and economic motivation to balance the livelihoods from the natural resources (Ghodeswa, 2013:1). It is critical that managers of NBAs ensure that the community is involved in planning and development of SAPs as the community can influence decisions and guarantee all the other stakeholders a fair distribution of benefits associated with SAPs at the NBAs (Park & Yoon, 2010:413). Local authority can help control tourism development in the area and ensure it is within the carrying capacity (Ruhanen, n.d:24). Tourists are pivotal to sustainable tourism as they are responsible for nature, and develop special, unique and even personal bonds, especially if the tourists have been involved in decision making (Machnik, 2013:83).

NBAs managers should be able to initiate action towards the implementation of SAPs, motivate all efforts towards implementation of SAPs and communicate with stakeholders on all issues concerning SAPs (Kurt, n.d:11, Carpenter *et al.*, 2012:34). It is critical that the managers sustain and have correlated leadership of all stakeholders (Enea *et al.*, 2012:501). This can be formal or informal depending on the situation (Carpenter *et al.*, 2012:34). NBAs managers should be able to differentiate leadership styles with situations in order to achieve the planned tasks (Kurt, n.d:11, Carpenter *et al.*, 2012:34). Management in NBAs should incorporate and co-ordinate perceptions of all stakeholders towards strategic consistency for the successful development of STD within the organisation, to ensure peace, friendship, continuity and success at the NBAs (Dabphet, 2012:1; Ghodeswa, 2013:1).

The stakeholder management approach is a process for managing, monitoring and maintaining relationships with the stakeholders by influencing their expectation of gain (Business Dictionary, 2017:1). Effective stakeholder management approach reduces conflicts as all parties are involved in shaping the tourism development. The approach of stakeholder management is a very useful way to handle and address the challenges of sustainable operations in NBAs. The key issue is to adopt and properly implement the functions of general management. The next section focuses on the functions of managers.

3.3 Functions of NBAs management

The management of NBAs consists of a number of roles or tasks that are interwoven and complement each other for the success of the NBAS. The basic functions of management are planning, organising, leading and monitoring or control (Page 2015:30; Bosnic *et al.*, 2014:156; Enea *et al.*, 2012:502). NBAs managers need to be organised in certain ways and have a mechanism to plan and decide activities, allocate tasks to employees, motivate individuals who are to attempt the tasks, co-ordinate and control the efforts towards attaining the goal, and make strategic decisions (Page, 2015:30; Carpenter, Bauer & Erdogan, 2012:32; Kurt, n.d:12).

The study adopts and implements Alexakis and Rice's (2016) Holistic Conceptual Conservation Framework (HCCF) for sustainable tourism management. The framework is ideal as it aims for sustainable planning, development and processes, followed by continual implementation and reliable ongoing evaluation of the NBAs operations (Alexakis & Rice, 2016:11). The HCCF is divided into two parts. The first part is mainly for NBAs seeking higher levels of sustainability within the NBAs, whereas the second part is for macro environment dealing with the external stakeholders of the NBAs in the implementation of sustainability to the tourism industry as a whole (Alexakis & Rice, 2016:13). The study, however, is based on the first part of the model, which deals with the internal operations of the NBAs.



Fig 3.3 Holistic Conservation Conceptual Framework (HCCF)

Source: Alexakis & Rice, 2016:4.

The first part of the HCCF enforces the need for the NBAs to follow a four-step process described below.

3.3.1 Declaration

The HCCF highlights that, for any NBAs to be managed effectively and efficiently. The first step is to make declarations through various statements on the SAPs of the NBAs. As such, the statements should advance and advocate sustainability at all costs. Some NBAs managers have developed statements that show their commitment to environmental conservation ranging from a phrase to as much as a full booklet (Page & Connell, 2009:452). The NBAs has to have a clear vision statement, mission statement, code of ethics, goals and objectives, as well as philosophy statement. Care should be taken to include all stakeholders when the statements are drafted, as well as to ensure the statements are aligned to the local, national and regional sustainability statements (Alexakis & Rice, 2016:5). Tourist demand for green businesses and will search for destinations who declare and publicise the sustainable practises to the public (Kibert, 2016:2). Environment fears are imperative when tourist is making travel choices thereby making declaration statements about sustainability is critical for destination competitiveness. The next section discusses the second function of managers.

3.3.2 Plan

The HCCF considers planning as the second step in the process, whereby there is need for a clear map of action on which, how, when and why the SAPs was implemented (Alexakis & Rice, 2016:5). The vital characteristic of sustainable tourism is accurate and operational forecasting ahead, as well as addressing implications and impacts of tourism on environment, community and economy (Borges, Carborne, Bushell & Jaeger, 2011:17). It is a critical function of management to establish the existence of a sustainable tourism strategy for the future of the NBAs, as well as the sequences of action to achieve the plan (Asadzadeh & Mousavi, 2017:1). Planning is recognised as the first function of management which lays the foundation for all the other functions, and as critical in identifying the goals and alternatives (Plunket, 2013:10; Kurt n.d:11).

Planning is seen as a permanent and dynamic process of the NBAs managers to set out goals and identify the ways through which the targets are achieved (Bosnic *et al.*, 2014:157). Integration of the premeditated activities is important for NBAs managers, considering the natural, social, economic, ecological and infrastructural aspects of the environment. An organisational structure has to be designed and followed to accomplish the plans through the chain of command, thereby developing intentional patterns of relationships amongst employees (Carpenter *et al.*, 2012:33, Kurt; n.d:11). Managers have to ensure that the plan is broken down into achievable jobs within the abilities of the staff, taking into consideration job enrichment, job enlargement as well as teamwork (Carpenter *et al.*, 2012:34).

The major types of planning include strategic planning, tactical planning and operational planning (Bosnic *et al.*, 2014:156, Carpenter *et al.*, 2012:33). Strategic planning sets out the major goals and guidelines for the operation of the NBAs, such as mission statements, vision and goals. The operational planning in NBAs handle the policies and programmes as well as itemise the tasks to be done by individuals (Bosnic *et al.*, 2014:157). Tactical planning incorporates middle range planning that is envisioned to develop relatively concrete and comprehensive means to implement the strategic plan (Carpenter *et al.*, 2012:33). There are different levels of tourism planning, but the resident level planning must agree with the tactics and approach of tourism development at regional and national levels (Bosnic *et al.*, 2014:157).

Management has to execute the daily operational plans of the NBAs, which include operating sustainably. Sustainable long-term strategies are needed for continuity in nature-based tourism (Stone & Stone, 2017:111). Strategies and forecasting processes have to accordingly equate the purposes of economic development with concerns for the sustainable development of tourism. Planning is essential as tourism development without planning will lead to more social and environmental problems (Asadzadeh & Mousavi, 2017:1). Careful planning will ensure that the subtle and susceptible environment is not destroyed (Asadzadeh & Mousavi, 2017:31). The next section focuses on the third function of management; implementation.

3.3.3 Implementation

This is the stage whereby the management puts the plan into action, according to what was the final plan (Alexakis & Rice, 2016:6). The function is denoted as either monitoring or control, as it involves

observing the implementation of a plan (Bosnic *et al.*, 2014:159). The study uses the term monitoring to refer to the function which involves gathering information about what has to be done and ensuring that it is done correctly, as well as detecting problems (Enea *et al.*, 2012:502.) The monitoring system in tourism can translate sustainable tourism from a mere rhetoric or fuzzy concept, to a set of measurable and realistic plans involving regular assessment of issues in relation to plans, expectations and objectives of the NBAs (Miller & Twinning-Ward, 2006:52). SAPS are used to monitor progress towards sustainability in the NBAS development (Park & Yoon, 2011:404).

Monitoring comprises three steps namely;

- choosing performance standard,
- comparing and analysing performance with standards, and
- engaging in remedial action where necessary (Carpenter *et al.*, 2012:35; Kurt, n.d:12).

Managers can use monitoring as a means of making improved decision making, developing and prioritising plans, and improving and developing understanding of sustainable tourism amongst stakeholders such as tourists, employees and the community (Miller & Twinning-Ward, 2006:57). Whatever monitoring system an NBAs chooses, there is need for top-down expert input on how to maintain the monitoring system over time, for example, Tourism Optimisation Management Model (TOMM), which assists managers to carry out detailed audits of SAPs.

The last function of management is discussed next.

3.3.4 Revise or rectify plan

After the NBAs managers have developed a sustainable tourism plan, have declared the plan and put it to action, have informed and communicated with stakeholders about their sustainability, and are able to measure the satisfaction of tourists in the NBAS, there is need to analyse how the NBAs impact the surrounding environment and thereafter, implement the relevant SAPs. After that, any revisions or rectifications can be implemented to ensure full success of the SAPs. SAPs which can be managed at NBAs are discussed in the next section.

3.4 Sustainable action plans

Sustainability has been implemented in several areas around the world regardless of size, ownership and location of the NBA, resulting in the establishment of key SAPs. The key areas / fields in which SAPs are implemented and managed, are presented below. The SAP to be discussed first is water.

3.4.1 Water

Water tables are falling internationally in all water sources such as aquifers, dams, oceans and lakes, due to the water consumption that has tripled over the last 50 years (Gossling, Peeters, Hall, Dubois, Lehman & Scott, 2012:3). It is estimated that 50% of the water levels could be increased by just applying modest water preservation measures (Green Hotelier, 2017:1). Fresh water sources are under threat therefore it is essential that effective water management systems are instituted in tourism operations and activities (UNWTO, 2013b:1). Tourism is heavily reliant on water, and water usage in tourism is higher than domestic use due to tourists' attitudes (Gossling, *et al.*, 2012:22). Tourists need to be educated and made aware of the effects of careless water use, and ensure water saving devices and systems are implemented (Gossling, *et al.*, 2012:24).

The water saving devices and systems which can be implemented include:

- harvesting and using rainwater,
- using low flush toilets and low stream shower heads,
- reusing laundry and bath water,
- using drip irrigation, moisture sensors and sprinklers,
- engaging in environment friendly water purification systems,
- fixing leaks from all taps,
- installing leak detection instruments, and
- mulching and planting drought resistant crops (UNWTO, 2013b:1; Rainforest Alliance, n.d:122).

The NBAs managers ought to ensure security over water management issues as both tourists and residents need to have access to clean, safe and accessible water (UNWTO, 2013b:1; Goeldner & Ritchie, 2003:484). International water quality standards have to be adhered to as a means of ensuring drinking water of desired quality. It is of very crucial for the NBAs to have water audits in order to control consumption and a timely response system to water quality issues in case of problems or

emergencies (Spier, n.d: 3; GSTC, 2015:1). Waste water also needs sustainable management, and a proper and adequate water treatment plant has to be available and water from septic tanks has to be tested regularly (Spier, n.d:7). The law has to enforce the use and availability of water treatment systems in NBAs.

The next section discusses energy as the second SAP which can be managed at NBAs.

3.4.2 Energy

Energy use is critical, and energy saving devices and systems must be put in place to promote conservation (Goeldner & Ritchie, 2003:484; Spier, n.d:5). Policies and incentives for using renewable sources of energy have to be implemented by the NBAs management. Renewable energy will reduce carbon emissions, ensure clean air, reduce dependence on energy imports, and ensure sustainable supply of energy and climate protection (Bassam, n.d:2). NBAs need to measure, monitor, record and report energy consumption, and strive to lessen dependence on fossil fuels for energy (GSTC, 2015:1). Tracing utility bills as well as connecting energy-efficient tools such as machines, illumination and heating/cooling systems, can help NBAs monitor the success of the energy conservation SAPs, and yield cost savings on monthly utility bills (Green Hotelier, 2017:1).

There is continued reliance on old-style energy like coal, gas, electricity and limited use of modern renewable technology (Rosen, 2009:58). There should be change to energy such as biomass, wind, solar, hydro power and geothermal which are renewable, can provide a diverse pool of sustainable energy sources and can lasts a lifetime (Bassam, n.d :2). Ruby Falls, the first green attraction of the State of Tenners in the USA, houses an assortment of solar panels that produce solar electricity sufficient to light 250 bulbs of 60watt each as well as a computer-controlled lighting system which reduces yearly power consumption by more than 24% (Parsa & Navapareddy, 2015:136). Waste is another critical component and it is discussed next.

3.4.3 Waste

Most NBAs have a kitchen and offer accommodation. The kitchen and accommodation section of the NBAs produce almost 54% of the total solid waste which can be reused, reduced or recycled (Green Hotelier, 2017:1). Tourism development in any place causes an upsurge in waste creation (Ghobadi & Verdian, 2016:532) as tourists also throw waste carelessly around the attractions (Asadzadeh &

Mousavi, 2017:1). Uncollected waste, overflowing bins or badly positioned bins can also lead to pollution of the environment and nearby water sources (Ghobadi & Verdian, 2016:530). There is need for steady and methodical ways of waste collection and, safe and sustainable disposal of unusable and unrecyclable waste put in place by the NBAs management (GSTC, 2015:1). Waste management is also a vital process at NBAs and there is need to put in place measures to recycle, reuse, compost and resell the solid waste (Green Hotelier, 2017:1). Management should strive towards reducing waste production by means of promoting the use of biodegradable materials and recycling and reusing (Goeldner & Ritchie, 2003:484). Improving waste management will enhance the attractiveness of the NBAs, which makes it imperative that the relevant SAPS be implemented at NBAs (Pratt *et al.*, 2011:414).

Wilderness Safari in Botswana reduced waste by changing from the use of bottled water for their guests to giving guests aluminium water bottles which can be refilled from the osmosis infiltration plants scattered around the camps. This led to the reduction of costs and time for transportation, waste produced, as number of containers collected at the camps reduced from 100 000 to 40 000, and there was also a reduction in carbon emissions (Clean Botswana, 2012:101). Not to be outdone is the Khama Rhino Sanctuary which collects waste around the sanctuary and locks it away from the wildlife. The refuse is then collected on a weekly basis by refuse trucks which go on to sort and recycle the waste (Clean Botswana, 2012:53). Another critical component is green buildings and it is discussed in the next section.

3.4.4 Green buildings

Between 2012 and 2015, there was a 60 % increase in businesses going green, triggered by client demand, need to lower operational costs, and branding or public relations (Kibert, 2016:2). Green building tendences are gradually being implemented in both fresh and refurbished areas in tourism, primarily to improve resources efficiency, and to diminish creation of harmful waste (Green Hotelier, 2017). Green buildings take into account the occupants' health, minimise waste during and after construction, engage the community, use home-grown construction supplies, study the ecological effects of tourism, and seek to positively impact the environment (Kibert, 2016:15).

There is need to plan ahead with experienced personnel on how buildings in NBAs are constructed. The planning has to consider the fragile environment, to allow tourists to have peaceful time in accordance with seasonal variations, as well as enhance the native, cultural practices, materials, designs and customs (Kibert, 2016:15; Crosswater Ecolodge, n.d:1). The Kingfisher Bay Resort on Fraser Island, Queensland in Australia, is a extensive, sensitively-designed, isolated ecotourism resort established to incorporate the surrounding environment. The award winning resort has extensive landscaping which complements and includes the natural Australian plants, buildings below treeline, as well as the exposed verandas with bent tin roofs, makes the resort to fit into the natural environment of the Fraser Island (Fraser Island Barges, 2017:1). The next section discusses green meetings as the fifth SAP which can be managed at NBAs.

3.4.5 Green meetings

Meetings, Incentives, Conferences and Exhibitions (MICE) are some of the reasons for tourism, therefore; have to incorporate sustainability. Green meeting is a meeting which incorporates sustainability practices or facilities (Mykletun, Bartkeviciute & Puchkova, 2014:211). Most companies now highlight commitment to the environment as part of their mission statement, thereby request for meeting amenities that also replicate sustainable practices is increasing. The meeting planner has to design and endorse a session that mirrors sustainable practices from the suppliers, products and services, venue, and transportation although the green meetings are less attractive than normal meetings (Mykletun, Bartkeviciute & Puchkova, 2014:211).

Green meetings are known to reduce paper use by such means as forming a seminar web site, using automated registration and validation, and marketing via the web and/or electronic mail and other digital newspapers. Reducing distances travelled by presenters and delegates by selecting a location that is nearby to as many delegates as possible, selecting a location and accommodation close to the airport and within walking distance otherwise encourages mass transportation, carpooling, walking, and cycling. Greening all features of the meeting ranges from nil waste and carbon balancing options, to greening services such as compostable and biodegradable products (the latter includes writing materials), using ecological products such as porcelain and linen napkins, concentrating on eco-tours of surrounding areas, and locally obtained, seasonal, organic cuisine is pivotal. To warrant that meetings are sustainable, programmes such as the Fairmont Eco-Meet program are created to address the requirements of the 'green' corporate clients (Fairmont, 2002).

The next section discusses pollution as the sixth SAP which can be managed at NBAs.

3.4.6 Pollution

Tourists are attracted to nice, clean, pollution-free destinations (Asadzadeh & Mousavi, 2017:1). Tourism is accompanied by air, water, sound, soil and environmental pollution, and waste build-up which needs to be stopped to evade irreversible harm (Ghobadi & Verdian, 2016:534). Poor designs, ill-designed plans, inadequate facilities, large and ugly adverts blocking views for tourists, are some examples of visual pollution (Asadzadeh & Mousavi, 2017:1). Air can also be polluted by carbon dioxide from tour buses and there can be noise from tourists, aircraft and the attraction itself (Education Bureau, 2013:192). Water can be polluted by improper disposal of waste or sewage, and river or dam of groundwater contamination by tourism services (Asadzadeh & Mousavi, 2017:1).

However, there is greater concern about infection and effluence of water and the associated biotic impact (Tonge, Moore, Hockings, Worboys, & Bridle, 2005:6). Environment pollution can occur as a result of use of chemicals and pesticides, overcrowding tourists, overhunting or overfishing and deforestation (Asadzadeh & Mousavi, 2017:1). The managers of the NBAs have to co-ordinate efforts towards minimising all forms of pollution at NBAs to avoid disturbing the wildlife as well as the local community (Education Bureau, 2013:193). It is very crucial for NBA managers to comprehend and appreciate the connection between tourism and the environment, especially the sensitivity and vulnerability of the resources, and understand and appreciate the effects of human interference on the environment (Asadzadeh & Mousavi, 2017:1).

The next section discusses tourist education as the seventh SAP which can be managed at NBAs.

3.4.7 Tourist education

Tourists have to be made aware of the benefits of sustainable practices in tourism (Rosen, 2009:58). Tourists are habitually unconscious of the impact they have on the surroundings during the trip, and so, it is imperative to help the tourist understand and appreciate in what way to minimise the impact (Green Hotelier, 2017:1). It is vital for tourists to be informed and made conscious of the core values of the NBAs and how the stakeholders intend to protect the values and conserve the attractions, in advance, through the various channels of communication (Metsahallitus Parks and Wildlife Finland, 2016:1).

NBAs should also educate the tourists on general travel requirements, culture, as well as legal rules and laws of the destination area. Instructions need to be given to tourists on conduct and expected behaviour at the NBAs such as no loud music or littering (Dr Malra, 2015:103). There are numerous means to inform and educate the tourist like providing information on the websites of the attractions, using tour operators, availing informative signs in open areas of the destinations, and in bedrooms, conference rooms, camp sites, whichever is applicable (Gossling, *et al.*, 2012 21). It is of paramount importance that the tourists are encouraged to:

- use environmentally friendly transportation at all times,
- save, conserve and responsibly use energy,
- avoid using private transport as they travel to both the NBAs and within the NBAs,
- not offer food and drinks to wildlife,
- desist from hunting or fishing outside designated times and areas,
- respect and follow trails and pathways within the NBAs,
- save water through various measures as fewer linen changes and taking shorter showers, and
- reduce, reuse, repair and recycle as much as possible (Borges *et al.*, 2011:9; Page & Connell, 2009:453; Rainforest Alliance, n.d:44).

The next section discusses employee engagement as the eight SAP which can be managed at NBAs.

3.4.8 Employee engagement

Employees are a critical factor in the implementation of SAPs. It is important that the employees be properly trained for the effective implementation of the SAPs. Employee engagement by means of informative prospects, location visits, competitions and bulletins can encourage employees to understand the concept or concepts of SAPs themselves before the employees can inform the tourists about the SAPs of the NBAs (Green Hotelier, 2017:1; Rainforest alliance n.d:137). Employees who are good at certain SAPs can be used to train and motivate fellow employees. Managers can engage in in-house surveys of the tourists in order to identify areas needing more training, as well as to measure the effectiveness of the SAPs and the training efforts (Rainforest alliance n.d:137). Walt Disney Parks and Resorts communicate information about SAPs to the tourists as the employees are engaged in environmental education and social improvement efforts (Willard InterContinental Hotel Washington D.C., 2009:1).

It is critical that all employees are treated well, paid a fair remuneration, and have decent working conditions which adhere to the host country's legislation. Local residents should be employed and further trained in both operational and managerial roles for motivation. Consequently, motivated staff members will provide better-quality services to tourists and good working practices will assist to recruit and retain top employees. Suitable and detailed education and training of employees is core for improving a company's overall sustainability performance (Green Hotelier, 2017:1).

The next section focuses on procurement and purchasing as the ninth and last SAP which can be managed at NBAs.

3.4.9 Procurement and purchasing

Procurement and purchasing of stationery, food and beverages, cleaning products, furnishings to be used in the NBAs, has to be sustainable. Sustainable means of procurement and purchasing at NBAs include buying locally, buying from empowerment programmes and hiring or sub-contracting local businesses (Spier, n.d:3). Procurement from local suppliers has multiplier effect within the area as well. Engaging local skills preserves the traditional techniques and methods unique to the local industries, and these can be transmitted to future generations (Green Hotelier 2017:1). NBAs are encouraged to purchase from wholesale and to sway the merchant to deliver less wrapping and use more environmentally responsive materials.

Some countries such as Austria and Finland entail merchants to collect and reprocess or reutilize their wrapper waste as well as procurement and use of biodegradable cleaning products and specialised organic produce and products. In Indonesia, Damai Lovina Villas in Bali, condensed expenses by lessening waste produced and energy usage. The resort associates with a resident research centre that offers environmentally safe agricultural and household produces, with 80% of the food coming from the organic garden and resident farms. It comes from sustainable farming practices, like using permaculture to lessen water usage and upsurge produce health, and composting instead of using chemical fertilizers. Crop production costs reduced by 90% whilst crop production improved by 20% (Ernst and Young, 2008 in Green Hotelier 2017:1).

Having discussed all the nine SAPs which can be managed at NBAs, the next section focuses on the destinations which have put the SAPs to best use in the tourism operations.

3.5 International best practices in the management of SAPs

Nature-based tourism is one of the quickest budding tourism segments (Machnik, 2013:81). Therefore, there has been pressure to accommodate tourism growth through long term public protection of public parks (Mitchel, Woliscroft & Higham, 2013:697). SAPs can be applied in all areas and activities of NBAs, such as the campsites, restaurants and game drives (UNWTO, 2013a; Landorf, 2009:55). Rio+20 reviewed the implementation of sustainable tourism in NBAs (Jovicic, 2014:297) and many destinations seemed to be heading towards sustainable tourism. However, the actual process of implementing sustainable tourism is difficult as there are several action plans to choose from (Jovicic 2014:299). A visit to nature-based areas lightens the mood, enhances the psychological well-being as well as helps in recovering from stress (Metsahallitus, 2017:4). It is important therefore, to explore how attractions in the world continue to create best experiences through the management of SAPs.

Six case studies have been chosen based on the destinations most popularly known as international best practices of successful management of SAPs in NBAs. Three destinations are from the southern hemisphere and the other three destinations are from the northern hemisphere. This ensures all geographical areas and ecosystems are represented. Australia is discussed as the first destination displaying best practices of SAPs management.

3.5.1 Australia

In Australia, the tourism industry is involved in development and delivery of sustainable tourism plans which consider the natural environment as a momentous part of the tourism appeal of the nation (Australia Government, n.d:4). Some nature-based attractions such as reserves are affected by environmental and cultural stress. As a result, there is a dire prerequisite for a sustainable approach to tourism development and management (Director of National Parks, 2011:3). As a tourism destination, Australia strives to offer tourists a high quality, green and sustainable tourism product which exceeds the tourist expectations (Director of National Parks, 2011:3; Australia Government, n.d:13).

The National Long-Term Tourism strategy facilitates greater harmony and a strictly natural approach to ensuring sustainable initiatives. Tourism in Australia is viewed as an effective way of conserving, managing and protecting the nature reserves (Director of National Parks, 2011:3). Kakadu National

Park (KNP) in Australia is governed by the sustainable approach to tourism which is guided by the four objectives namely;

- to provide high quality experiences,
- to minimise tourist effects on both natural and social resources,
- to achieve environmental, communal and financial benefits, and
- to achieve social and economic benefits for the locals.

In a bid to achieve the objectives at KNP, the following principles were established:

- combined management of the national park by park managers and community leaders;
- engaging in strategic planned tourism activities;
- providing high quality tourist experiences resulting in economic, environmental and sociocultural benefits;
- supplying tourist information which motivates appreciation of the national park and the resources; and
- providing efficient management of tourist amenities and services to reflect the status of the National Park. (UNESCO World Heritage Centre, 2015:1; Director of National Parks, 2011:3).

It is vital for the guiding principles of sustainable tourism at NBAs to be based on the management of resources, environmental and economic aspects, and integrate culture so that in the long-run, tourism development does not harm the environment or compromise the economical and socio-cultural aspects (Page & Connell, 2015:8). The next section focuses on Kenya.

3.5.2 Kenya

Kenya is one of the foremost nature-based tourism destinations in sub-Saharan Africa (Kariuki-Muriithi, 2016:1). Known for its safari and wildlife, the country is rich in a variety of natural resources such as mountains, gorges and rivers; with nature tourism accounting for over 80% of total tourism in Kenya (Kariuki-Muriithi, 2016:1). This has therefore, led to the need to change from mass tourism to sustainable tourism in order to save and keep the natural resources (Kariuki-Muriithi, 2016:1). The Masai Mara Game Reserve (MMGR) is one of the 29 national parks and 22 game reserves managed by the Kenyan Tourism Board (KTB) and is the most protected area (The International Eco-Tourism Society (TIES) (2017:1).

There has been extensive use of sustainable energy at the Great Amboseli and Masai Mara area. At Basecamp Camping and lodges, lunar energy is being used for charging, heat and lighting. The area is making briquettes from agricultural waste and biomass waste and thereafter using the briquettes for cooking and heating at the lodges. Kitchen waste and biodegradable waste is changed into composite manure for the tree planting project. The tree planting project is an accomplishment as a woodland is now emerging near the lodge. This has effectively reduced carbon emissions into the environment. The use of dry compost toilets has led to the separation of hard and fluid human waste.

The lodge hires locals who were unskilled but are trained and now competent and knowledgeable about key issues such as conservation, environmental awareness and tour guiding. Guides use skills and knowledge to enlighten and inform tourists about how their behaviour and attitude can positively or negatively affect the environment. Tour operators are encouraged to disseminate information about environmental conservation and biodiversity conservation to tourists. The lodge promotes local industry through selling the local crafts abroad to international tourists (Kariuki-Muriithi, 2016:1). The Masai Mara area has survived from degradation through involving the community, ploughing back into the community, in line with the policies from KTB (Hatcher 2013:1; Ecotourism Kenya, 2015:18). Bolivia is discussed in the next section.

3.5.3 Bolivia

North West Bolivia houses the Madrid National Park covering 19 000 square kilometres in the upper Amazon River basin (Bolivian life, 2017:1). Identified as the top tourist attraction in Bolivia, the park houses 100 most threatened species, wildlife as well as 10% of the birdlife in the world (Bolivian life, 2017:1; Main, 2017:1). Topography in the park varies from rugged terrain to steep slopes and flowing rivers, shared with the 46 indigenous communities from 6 tribes still practising ancient amazon traditions (Bolivian life, 2017:1). The park has two lodges; Chalalan Ecolodge and San Miguel del Bala Ecolodge, which are both managed in conjunction with the locals (Pastor, 2012:1). The communities are aware of the possible dangers the tourism development can bring to the natural environment, which they heavily depend on, and are therefore, striving to protect the vulnerable nature of the Bolivian Amazon (Main, 2017:1; Bolivian life, 2017:1).

Families are benefiting from the Ecolodges as well as the park, through health and education offered from the profits made from the establishments (Pastor, 2012:1). Employment has been created for the locals, reducing migration out of the area. Tourism services, forest management programmes, environmental guidance, and marketing have since developed in the region. As a result, Bolivia won the 2011, TO DO! Socially Responsible Tourism Award after a series of communal, financial and ecological evaluations of the park and its surrounding areas. Bolivia is now a promising front for sustainability in Latin América. The next section highlights how China has managed SAPs.

3.5.4 China

Going north of Australia into China, the Crosswater Ecolodge is not to be outdone. Being the first Ecolodge to be established in 2007 in the Nankun Mountain Reserve in southern China, the Ecolodge has set precedence for future environmental awareness and promotion of ecotourism (Tourism Review, 2014:1). The Ecolodge set out its operations based on the quadruple bottom line of sustainability which highlights the need to:

- guard and improve the current forest biodiversity,
- include and assist residents to gain from the growth,
- invest the wealth to resident economy and make income, and
- admire and enhance the essence of the place through elusive sustainable planning and design (Crosswater Ecolodge, n.d:1).

Being located in the midst of a community with over 5000 people, it was imperative that consultations be done with the community before any construction could begin (Tourism Review, 2014:1). Intensive onsite analyses were conducted during all the seasons to ensure that all aspects are taken into consideration before construction. Also, observations and research were done to ensure minimal negative impact on the environment. Once all things were in place, the site for construction was further surveyed to ensure that the construction would be at the optimum location with the natural landscape.

Construction involved local designers and local contractors working with a few experts from out of the community, thereby boosting the local economy. From design to operation, all aspects respect tradition, values and practices of the Keija Community. The bamboo was used as the main building material and was harvested sustainably at a rate at which it could replenish itself. However, only sustainable and green building materials were used necessitating much recycling. Local purchasing

was done to source materials for the construction. Even after construction was done, most furnishings such as towels, sheets and furniture, were bought locally (Crosswater Ecolodge, n.d:2).

The Ecolodge has great surroundings which blend well with the natural environment of the reserve. All the seven gardens of the Ecolodge boast of only exotic plants and species which are unique to the forest. The gardens have over 1300 plants, large variety of bamboo, and a variety of bird species and butterfly, all to the marvel of the tourist. The Eco lodge has thrived in its aim of raising awareness on sustainability in the community, as well as enhancing the economic development of the community. Tourists are treated to nature walks, community visits, and Chinese cuisine; all courtesy of the local workforce (Crosswater Ecolodge, n. d:2). The next section focuses on Finland.

3.5.5 Finland

The Metsahallitus Parks and Wildlife (MPW) manages 39 national parks on state owned land around Finland which covers over 4million hectares, and hosts over 1 million visitors per annum (Hogmander & Leivo, 2004:336). In Finland, the tourism sector is outgrowing other sectors with nature-based tourism being the fastest growing element of tourism (Oian, Fredman, Sandell, Saeporsdottir, Tryvainen & Jensen, 2018:21). Sustainability is not a new practice in Finland. As such, in 2004, MWP developed principles for sustainable tourism meant to guide sustainable operations in protected nature areas (Oian, *et al.*, 2018:31). The principles were then updated in 2016, and they advocated the following:

- cooperation agreements with local companies to monitor sustainability of the companies' activities;
- increased knowledge of sustainable tourism in both tourists and companies by means of constantly communicating to tourists about the values of the sites, collecting feedback to improve services at the sites, as well as engaging the guides, workers and operators about sustainable tourism and encouraging commitment towards sustainability;
- reduced load on the environment through implementing low emissions in public transport, encouraging tourists to use public transport, promoting extended and longer vacations, and the competent use of capitals such as energy and water;
- use of tourism to improve health and good fortune of the community. This has been accomplished through providing quality nature sites which are safe and have the potential

to improve the livelihood of locals. Also, the promotion of the sites using various means such as sponsoring campaigns for sustainable tourism;

- ensuring the growth of the local economy through guides and operators with knowledge
 of culture, experiences and local conditions. This ensures that the tourism product
 delivered to tourists at the sites is of high quality and increases the tourists' experience.
 Consultation of tourists and locals is critical to the successful management and progress of
 the site's economy;
- communicating the values and services of the nature areas to all stakeholders (tourists, companies, locals, workers). This helps the stakeholders to be aware of the importance of the attraction as a reason why tourist travel to the area. There is need to inform stakeholders of the value of the attraction and need to protect it. Encouragement of responsible behaviour, respect for the carrying capacity of the sites, and building in support of the natural environment, and
- preservation and protection of sites' valuable features through informing the tourists of sustainable action plans as well as encouraging the tourists to act responsively. Having demand and supply of services at the site should match, and be within acceptable range so as to avoid compromising the natural and cultural values, and to prevent harmful impact. Onsite construction and design should always be in harmony with nature and consider the local natural and cultural values (Metsahallitus Parks and Wildlife Finland, 2016:1-3).

The NBAs managed by the MWP include Ancylus Lake in Luppovaara, Tervola which features rocky shoreline with quartzite over 2,200 million years old. At Pallas-Yllastunturi National Park, the tourists can experience the cleanest air in the Fells of Finnish Lapland, as well as hiking, skiing and scenic views of the Pahakuru Gorges and forests. Locals live sustainably in harmony with the unique natural settings at Kvarken Archipelago, whereas tourists experience canoeing, fishing as well as birdwatching (Metsahallitus, 2018). The next section focuses on Canada, as the sixth destination with best practices for the management of SAPs.

3.5.6 Canada

The Canadian Rocky Mountains comprise a series of parks namely the Banff, Jasper, Yoho and Kootenay national parks, and the Hamber provincial parks, Mount Robson and Mount Assiniboine
(UNESCO, 2017:1). The mountains are spectacular with peaks, meadows, lakes, virgin forest, gigantic waterfalls and ample wildlife. Activities include hiking, biking, skiing, skating and fishing, all surrounded by the most spectacular background (Travel Alberta 2017:1). The Canadian Code of Global Ethics for Sustainable tourism is applied in the strategic management of the Rocky Mountains, and this has kept the scenic surroundings intact. The area is the largest protected area in North America and is one of the most popular destinations in Canada (CEC Network: n.d:1). This has raised the need for continuous application of the code of ethics. Focus at The Canadian Rocky Mountains is on full participation for sustainability, balance of economic objectives and safeguarding integrity, as well as the sensitive appreciation and enjoyment of the Rocky Mountains (Parks Canada: n.d:10). Having highlighted the six international best practises in the management of SAPs in NBAs, the next section therefore, concludes the chapter.

3.6 Conclusion

This chapter discussed and highlighted the need for NBAs managers to know and identify the key stakeholders for the NBAs, who were identified as the local authorities, tourists, and park management. The HCCF was also adopted as a management framework which allows the managers to manage the internal factors for the best execution of SAPs at NBAs. Thereafter the SAPs which can be managed at NBAs, such as educating tourists, waste management, and pollution management were discussed, leading to the best practices in the application of SAPs across the world.

Six NBAs from the world were presented in an effort to show the successful cases of the management of SAPs in different geographical locations, communities and economies. Clearly, the concept of sustainability is universal and can be a reality if all tourism organisations and nations at large, manage the SAPs in the daily operations as is the case in the examples mentioned in this chapter. With this chapter, the review of literature has been completed. There is a need to investigate how an African country performs in this field. This necessitates the investigation of the NBAs in Botswana, an emerging tourism destination focusing mainly on nature-based tourism. The chapter that follows discusses the methodological decisions that this study took to investigate the management of SAPs in NBAs in Botswana.

CHAPTER 4: RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY. 4.1 Introduction

Research design refers to the plan that specifies all the decisions made regarding the collection of data, the methods and actions for collecting data, and the data analysis and data interpretation plan (Zikmund, *et al*, 2013:64; Saunders, Lewis & Thornhill, 2007:6). This chapter presents and analyses in detail, the research methodology chosen and implemented to address the aim and objectives of the study. The outline of the chapter is shown in figure 4.1.



Figure 4.1 Outline of the chapter

Source: Author's own elaboration

The next section elaborates more on the study area.

4.2 Study area

Botswana is a non-coastal nation in Southern Africa, enclosed by Namibia, South Africa, Zimbabwe and Zambia, and inhabiting an area of 582 000 square kilometres (BTDP 2002:20). The country has a semiarid climate and is sparsely populated with about 2.333.201 million people (United Nations, 2018:1). Tourism is an assert to Botswana which needs to be sustainably exploited (Stone & Stone, 2017:98). Tourism has helped diversify Botswana's economy from its traditional sources like beef and mining and has led to positive benefits like economic development and job creation for various and versatile skills (Leechor, n.d:5; Makochekanwa, 2013:43). In 2017, tourism contributed about 3,8% (BWP 7,129.6million) of the total Gross Domestic Product (GDP) and created about 76 000 jobs, both directly and indirectly in Botswana and is anticipated to create up to 11.7% jobs in 2028 (WTTC, 2018:1). The country has always specialised in high cost, low volume tourism as a conservation strategy for the natural resources which attract tourists, as well as to differentiate itself from the neighbouring tourist countries like Zimbabwe and Zambia, who engage in mass tourism (Leechor, n.d:18). The tourism industry in Botswana has long been established and has high levels of good services and minimal tourist numbers in the main parks (Morupisi & Mokgalo, 2017:4).

Botswana has 45 percent of the land reserved as protected areas for tourism, of which 17 percent designated for national parks, game reserves with zero utilisation by communities (BTDP, 2002:4). Protected areas in Botswana are divided into two systems, namely: the slightly wet northern part of the country which houses the famous Okavango Delta, Chobe National Park and the Central Kalahari Game Reserve; and the semi-arid southern part which is less popular (BTDP, 2002:4). The study focuses on game reserves located in the less popular south-eastern part of Botswana namely; Gaborone Game Reserve and Khutse Game Reserve (KGR), both state-owned reserves, and Mokolodi Nature Reserve (MNR), a privately-owned reserve. The reserves were chosen due to the reserves being the busiest NBAs in the south-eastern part of Botswana, fully operational throughout the year, as well as for having a lot of flora and fauna (BTDP, 2002:4; Zambezi Society, 2017:1). Game reserves depend highly on their natural resources and environment for continued attractiveness and success, therefore; the more sustainable the game reserves are, the greater the improvement in services and products (BTDP, 2002:4; Spenceley *et al.*, n.d:3; Discover Botswana, 2013:10; Prayag *et al.*, 2010:700; Spenceley, 2008:287). Figure 4.2 below shows the map of Botswana and the location of the GGR, KGR and MNR.



Fig 4.2 Botswana map showing location of GGR, KGR and GGR

Source: Safari Patrol Botswana, 2009:1

Having looked at Botswana tourism in general, the next section elaborates more on Gaborone Game Reserve as one of the case studies of the research.

4.2.1 Gaborone Game Reserve

Hailed to be the third busiest reserve in Botswana, the Gaborone Game Reserve (GGR) is located in the periphery of Gaborone in the south eastern part of Botswana on the valley of Ngotwane river (Kaunda, Matlhaku, Mapolelo and Mokgosi, 2011:64). The fenced conservation area has an area of only 5 square kilometres and is under the jurisdiction of the Department of National Parks and Wildlife (Kaunda *et al.*, 2011:64). The GGR was gazetted in 1978 and was set up by the Kalahari Conservation

Society in 1988 with the primary aim of educating, both citizens and tourists, about Botswana's flora and fauna (Jumia Travel, 2018:1; Kaunda *et al.*, 2011:64). The savannah tree, rock outcrop terrain is well stocked with a variety of wildlife which include eland, kudu and impala; intermittently gemsbok, zebra and red hartebeest; and has no large predators (BTO, 2013:1; Kaunda *et al.*, 2011:64). Bird watchers can enjoy both the resident and migrant birdlife which comprises snake eagle, purple gallinule, and the lumirscent which are best viewed from the small dam. Tourists can enjoy birdwatching, game viewing, education centre and picnics at the GGR.

The second case study, MNR is discussed in the next section.

4.2.2 Mokolodi Nature Reserve

The non-profit making organisation, located about 15 kilometres from Gaborone, covering an area of 3700 hectares of donated land, was established in 1994 (Mokolodi, 2017:1). The main aim was to enable the children of Botswana to learn about nature conservation and the environment, therefore, MNR specialises in environmental and conservation education (Mokolodi, 2017:1). Other activities at MNR include a rhino and reptile conservation project, rhino tracking and giraffe tracking, as well as a sanctuary which cares for ill and or orphaned animals. The nature reserve is also home to a variety of mammals which include rare and endangered species such as cheetahs, a diverse array of reptiles, amphibian and birds (Botswana Tourism, 2013:1). To preserve and conserve the natural resources and environment, MNR has water recycling units, repairs equipment regularly, and uses solar energy (The Mokolodi Wildlife Foundation Annual Report, 2011-2012; Botswana Tourism Organisation (BTO), 2013:1).

MNR also runs a bush encroachment and erosion project, where focus is on areas that have negative change in amount of soil reclamation and increase in grass productivity. The nature reserve is also known for the outdoor classroom at the education centre. The results of numerous projects of soil reclamation and regeneration of natural landscapes are displayed and shown at the education centre. MNR operates on educational policies which are constantly reviewed to ensure that the issues affecting Botswana as a country, and environment and nature conservation, are incorporated in education and learning. The policies have to be in support of the Botswana school syllabus, be entertaining, informative and involving to the children, to enable children of all age groups to apply and relate to what is taught to them (The Mokolodi Wildlife Foundation Annual Report, 2014-2015).

The next section discusses the third and last case study, Khutse Game Reserve.

4.2.3 Khutse Game Reserve

KGR is located 240 kilometres from Gaborone and has abundant wildlife and six campsites (BTO, 2013:1; DWNP, 2013:1). Conservation and protection of the natural environment is a crucial factor in the KGR, and tourists are strictly required to adhere to the set rules and regulations. (DWNP, 2013:1). The 2500 square kilometres reserve is an extension of the southern boundary of the CKGR. KGR is a remote reserve with low population, especially from Sundays to Thursday. However, its proximity to Gaborone makes it one of the ideal weekend excursions to tourists from Gaborone.

The reserve is best known for wildlife viewing and has numerous well monitored trails, leading to clay pans where wildlife can be viewed drinking water. Wildlife at KGR includes leopards, lions, gemsboks, and giraffes. The Khutse pan is located near the entrance and attracts a lot of giraffes, leopards and gemsboks. It is a good site to view the sunset and sunrise due to the elevation it has. To the west of KGR is the west pan which is also a fairly active area. The pan has artificial waterholes and is thus, also ideal for wildlife watching. Lions are popular in the area which has Kalahari grasslands. The pans stretch for almost 62 kilometres and pass the Tropic of Capricorn. There, pans to the north of Khutse are small and numerous and lead to the great CKGR. The biggest and most active is the Khwankwe pan, which is rare due to its Kalahari immersion. However, due to being far from the main entrance, these pans receive relatively few visitors who are usually in transit to CKGR, thereby keeping the areas fairly untampered with.

Internet search engines shows no information about the management of SAPs at the three NBAs. The next section focuses on the research design.

4.3 Research design.

Exploratory qualitative research method employing case study design was used for this study. The case study allows the researcher to remember the all-inclusive and expressive characteristics of the actual management processes at GGR, KGR and MNR (Yin, 2003:1). The case study method was used based on research by Stone, 2013:105; Bohdnowicz *et al.*, 2011:797; Engelbrecht, 2011:8 and Van der Merwe & Saayman 2008:155, who conducted surveys on NBAs for their studies. Case study

method is best when attempting to answer research questions which start with how and why questions as shown in section 1.4.3; and is applicable to either single or multiple cases (Yin, 2003:3). The case studies sought to examine how the SAPs were being managed, the application of the sustainable tourism principles at NBAs, and the extent to which the NBAs managers had knowledge about sustainable tourism (Leedy & Ormrod, 2010:265). Participating managers and participating workers at GGR, MNR and KGR were interviewed and all the responses analysed then discussed (Leedy & Ormrod, 2010:260). Method of data collection is the focus of the next section.

4.3.1 Method of data collection

There are basically two approaches of gathering data; quantitative research and qualitative research. Data for the study was collected using qualitative methods. Qualitative research is frequently used to provide richness and depth of data from relatively few cases. This method provides a unique appreciation of the reality of the management of SAPs in NBAs (Raderbauer, 2011:41). Qualitative research also allows for learning and analysing a subject from the experts, and is ideal for obtaining specific data about a value or opinion of certain people (Gustul, 2011:45). It allowed the researcher to learn and analyse information from the managers and workers of the NBAs concerning the management (and implementation) of SAPs.

The next section discusses population and sampling methods used in the study.

4.3.2 Population and sample

A population is a large case of elements from which a researcher draws a sample, whereas a sample is a subdivision of the population nominated for studying and coming up with generalisations which should be representative of the population (Neuman, 2006:224; Cooper & Schindler, 2004:145). The population for the study were all the nature-based attractions in Botswana. The target population for the study were the managers and workers of GGR, MNR and KGR. A total of 25 participants took part in the study of these participants, 7 were managers and the 18 were workers. The 7 managers were selected using purposive sampling and convenience sampling, to collect in-depth information about how the SAPs are being managed at the NBAs, from people with experience and knowledge (managers in this case) (Dawson, 2009:27-37). This technique was ideal as it did not prescribe the number of participants needed for the data to be rendered reliable (Tongco, 2007:152). Snowball

sampling was used to gain more insight by asking the managers to identify the workers who were knowledgeable in the implementation of the SAPs (Tongco, 2007:152). The research was conducted from March 2018 to May 2018, simultaneously at all NBAs, allowing managers and the workers to set meeting appointments best suitable for the work schedules. In order for these interviews to be undertaken, there was need to come up with the research instrument for the study. The research instrument used for the study is discussed next.

4.3.3 Research instrument

The research instrument is the means through which data was collected. To collect primary data for the research, semi-structured interviews were used (Dawson, 2009:27-37). The instrument which needed to be developed for data collection was the interview schedule. The interview schedule contains a list of guiding questions to be used during the interview. The list of questions in the interview schedule were constructed in line with the research objectives, literature review and the past research specific to NBAs, issues of sustainable tourism, and management of SAPs. The interview schedule was divided into 4 sections as shown in the interview schedule attached as Appendix 1. Table 4.1 below highlights the general structure and sections of the interview guide and the supporting literature.

Constructs	Items	Suggested, supported, indicated by Author, study/journal
Begin interview	Consent for interviews	 Tshipala & Coetzee. 2012. A sustainable adventure tourism development framework for Thateondo. Raderbauer, 2011. Importance of sustainable business practices in the Viennese accommodation industry.
Fundamentals of sustainability and	- Understanding of sustainability	-Global Sustainable Tourism Criteria (GSTC), 2015.

Table 4.1. Previous research benchmarking interview schedule construction.

sustainable	-Understanding of	- Hall, et al. 2015. The Routledge Handbook of
tourism (ST)	sustainable tourism	Tourism and Sustainability.
	-Application of sustainable tourism principles	-Bhandari, M. 2014. Is tourism always beneficial? A case study from Masai Mara National Reserve.
	-Define NBT in your own words - Key stakeholders for NBAs	-Tshipala & Coetzee. 2012, A sustainable adventure tourism development framework for Thateondo.
Management of	How do you manage SAPs	-Green Hotelier, 2017. Best practises.
SAPs	 in the following fields? Water Waste Energy Energy Pollution Green buildings Green meetings Green meetings Tourist education Employee engagement Procurement and purchasing 	 Pratt, <i>et al.</i> 2011. Tourism investing in energy and resource efficiency. Alexakis, G. and Rice, L., 2016. Applying the Holistic Conceptual Conservation Framework for Sustainable Tourism.
Personal	-Age	
information	- Education level -Experience	
End of interview	Thank you for participating	

The interview schedule included open-ended questions divided into sections which are closely linked to the research objectives (Okello & Yenan, 2009:610; Khairat & Maher, 2009:8).

After coming up with the interview guide, a experimental study was carried out. An experimental study/ pre-test/ pilot study is an integral part of research instrument construction which is carried out on a smaller and similar population to that of the study sample (Kumar 2005:22; Woken n.d:1). The pilot study was undertaken at Gaborone dam, which is a smaller nature-based attraction based in Gaborone (Trip Advisor, 2017:1). The feasibility of the study, evaluation of the planned statistical and planned analytical procedures, as well as the redesign of other parts of the interview schedule to overcome difficulties of conducting the main study, were achieved when the pilot study was conducted (Saunders *et al.*, 2007:19; Woken n.d:1; Manjunatha, n.d:2). However, disadvantages of conducting a pilot study are that results may vary with the main study, information from the pilot study may be limited as Gaborone dam is relatively small compared to the NBAs, and the pilot study was carried out with relevant members of population who will not be the actual participants for the final study (Manjunatha, n.d:8).

The pilot study was conducted for one week employing in-depth semi-structured interview with the manager and workers of Gaborone Dam. After the experimental study, the relevant changes were made to the interview guide leading to the development of the ultimate research instrument which was used to gather the data. The changes included adding the section for any other information, separation of ages into the relevant age groups, adding and eventually coming up with a questionnaire without general NBA background information especially designed for *the workers only*.

4.4 Data collection

The researcher collected the data herself, manually transcribing and coding the data (Raderbauer, 2011:43). Data was collected from managers who fitted the purposive and convenience sampling and workers whom the managers had identified using the snowballing sampling technique. The reseacher first introduced herself and informed participants of the tittle of the study and the objectives of the study. The ethical issues were also outlined to the participants and the right to stop midway through the interview was also highlighted. Thereafter the rules of the interview were outlined then consent forms were signed by the participants. Semi-structured interviews were then undertaken to collect data from the NBAs managers and workers. No names were used to label the interview scripts due to

ethical considerations, only codes were used. Semi-structured interviews were chosen as it is flexible, allowed for further explanations or questioning, and encouraged the respondents to talk and express themselves (Raderbauer, 2011:41). The semi-structured interviews had open ended questions based on the interview guide which was prepared, ensuring that the major research questions and research objectives were addressed (Chandralal & Valenzuela, 2013:177).

All the interviews were transcribed and manually coded by the researcher who ensured that there were no errors and omissions in the data collection. Thereafter the interview scripts were grouped into managers and workers and then kept for analysis. The next section will discuss data analysis

4.5 Data Analysis

Leedy (2001:278) defines data analysis as "the process of systematically searching and arranging the completed questionnaires, interview transcripts, field notes and other materials accumulated to increase the understanding of them and to enable the researchers to presenting what has been discovered to others". All the 25 scripts from the interviews were analysed and first separated into workers and managers. The coding process allowed for the arranging of the data, and enabled information about the data to be edified. The study made use of descriptive coding, topic coding and analytic coding to allow for processing of information and identification of material through themes and the development of concepts from the interviews (Morse and Richards, 2002). Interrelationships among the themes were analysed and grouped according to the research objectives. Personal information of the participants was also analysed to come up with the demographics of the participants. Findings of the interviews are discussed in detail in chapter 5.

The next section elaborates data reliability and validity of the study.

4.6 Data reliability and validity

It is vital for a research instrument to be effective and dependable so to make proper decisions from the information (Leedy & Ormrod, 2010:91). For validity and reliability of the data, there is need to study the content analysis and the statistical evidence (Cooper & Schindler, 2008:288). To ensure validity, the interview guide was grounded on the research questions and objectives. The instrument was pilot tested to ensure the collection of the required data, reliably measure and truthfully represent,

information (Saunders *et al.*, 2007:19; Zikmund *et al.*, 2013:304). The interview guide had to produce consistent and stable results when different attempts were made using same characteristics (Zikmund *et al.*, 2013:304; Leedy & Ormrod, 2010:93). To ensure reliability, the researcher conducted all interviews with the managers and workers who were willing to participate, and further explained to the respondents any concepts which they did not understand. The study took into account some ethical considerations which the next section discusses.

4.7 Research ethics

Ethics is a code of behaviour considered correct or appropriate for a particular place and time. The researcher requested permission to conduct the survey from the management of the NBAs (Denscombe, 2007:157). Ethical clearance was sought after the research methodology section was completed and the ethical clearance certificate was issued. The ethical clearance certificate is attached as Appendix B. The researcher assured participants at GGR, MNR and KGR of their rights to confidentiality and privacy. All the participants were allocated code names and participation in the research was voluntary. The signed informed consent forms were kept as proof of voluntary participation (Leedy & Ormrod, 2010:101; Dawson, 2009:153, Antonius, 2003:6).

The interviews took place in the offices/ lounges or other inaudible seating areas of the NBAs. Preceding to the interview, the participants were made aware of the purpose of the research, the need to manually write down some notes during the interview, their right to privacy and to withdraw at any stage of the interview. The approximate duration for the interviews was communicated. The participants were told that the information would be protected by being kept in a lockable cabinet and findings would not be tempered with (Mouton, 2004:240), made public or discussed with third parties without the consent of the University of South Africa (UNISA), GGR, MNR and KGR (Dawson, 2009:154). Upon completing the research, the researcher would avail a copy of the research to GGR, MNR and KGR for their own internal use. The research remained the property of UNISA. The next section concludes this chapter.

4.8 Conclusion

The chapter described the way the empirical study was conducted. The population of the study were the managers and workers of the NBAs, and non-probability sampling was engaged to select 25

participants for the study. Purposive sampling, convenience sampling and snowballing sampling were found to be the most appropriate as there was need to collect data from individuals rich in both expertise and experience in the management of SAPs. Data was collected over a period of three months using semi structured interviews and was encoded and transcribed to allow for further analysis under different themes. Ethical considerations were taken to ensure the study was not harmful to any participants. Thereafter, the results of the data collected was analysed and discussed, permitting the researcher to draw suppositions and recommendations on the management of SAPs in NBAs.

CHAPTER 5: DATA PRESENTATION AND ANALYSIS. 5.1 Introduction

This chapter presents, analyses and discusses the findings from the empirical study. The study sought to find answers to the research questions outlined in section 1.4.2 which stem from the objectives of the study which were listed in section 1.4.3. Qualitative data was analysed using thematic approach where the researcher read and familiarised with the data, coded important features and then categorised the data (Bengtsson, 2016:16). Thereafter, themes were developed and reviewed to generate relevant and convincing narrative. The chapter will present the response rate, demographics of the participants before analysing the data which was coded in themes under the research objectives. The next section focuses on the response rate.

5.2 Response rate

The response rate is identified as the completion rate or return rate, and is the amount of people who responded the survey, questionnaire or interview, divided by the number of people in the sample expected by the researcher (Curtin, Presser and Singer; 2005:92). The initial required number of respondents was thirty-six, however, only twenty-five respondents participated in the study. The response rate of 64% was good therefore, data analysis was possible (Baruch, 1999:423). Having determined the response rate of the study, demographics are discussed in the next section in order to understand the participants better.

5.3 Demographics of respondents

Respondents were from three nature-based attractions, namely; Mokolodi Nature Reserve, Khutse Game Reserve, and Gaborone Game Reserve. The demographics of the respondents to be discussed include the job position, age, experience at the NBA, and the level of education. The first aspect of demography to be discussed is the job positions of respondents.

5.3.1 Job position of respondents

The twenty-five respondents participated in the study and of theses respondents, seven were managers and eighteen staff members. Of these, three managers and seven workers were from MNR; two managers and six workers were from GGR, while two managers and five workers were from KGR.

Of these eighteen staff members, five were gate men, seven were game guides, two were receptionists, two were security guards, one was a bedroom hand, and one was a volunteer worker.

In this analysis, the seven respondents from management were labelled as manager A, B, C, D, E, F and G and other eighteen respondents from workers are referred as Worker A to M for anonymity reasons. Having respondents from different areas of the NBAs was good for the study and reflected on how the different SAPs are implemented at the different areas of the NBAs. This enabled the researcher to obtain a holistic approach towards the implementation of the SAPs at the NBAs, and also to be able to triangulate and ensure reliability and credibility of the research results. This also proves the point that tourism industry provides different career paths for different people (Centre for Economics and Business Research (CEBR), 2014:9). The next factor of demography to be discussed is the age of the respondents.

5.3.2 Age of respondents

The age-group for most of the respondents was less than 30 15 respondents), those aged 31 to 40 years old were 8, whilst there were 2 aged between 41 to 50 years, and no one aged above 50 years old.

The tourism industry employs youthful age-groups due to its long hours which are mostly spent standing and need fit individuals. Different age-groups are good for the research to give mixed and balanced feedback from the different age-groups. CEBR (2014:16) and Office for National Statistics (ONS) (2013:3) correspond with the study by stating that the tourism industry is an important source of employment for the young people as a high proportion of the workers are under the age of 30. The next section focuses on the respondent's level of education.

5.3.3 Respondents' level of education

The study revealed that from the 25 respondents, only 2 respondents had a Master degree, while 4 respondents had Bachelor's degrees, 5 respondents had diplomas and the rest of the 14 respondents had Form 5 level or below.

The study shows that very few people held higher degree qualifications which may be indicative of NBAs lacking educated workers who can implement and manage the SAPs at the NBAs. The tourism industry usually has less educated workers due to the low wages, as well as the seasonality and

instability of the work. However, this is supportive to workers who are expanding, adding or still attaining the qualifications (CEBR), 2014:4.

5.3.4 Working experience at the NBAs

Experience matters in the implementation and management of the SAPs at the NBAs. The respondents who had between 0 to 2 years of experience were 14. The second group was for respondents with 2 to 4 years of experience which were 6 respondents. The least was a group of 4 years and above which had 5 respondents.

The study shows that NBAs do not have many people with experience in the tourism industry which may be a challenge to implement and manage SAPs at the NBAs. The lack of experience may be costly and time consuming as managers need to keep training and informing new staff about the sustainable practices of the NBAs. The Hospitality International Labour Organisation (HILO) (2010:50) observes that workers who are qualified, experienced and satisfied will produce better results in terms of performance and social and environmental issues. Industry familiarity is a crucial pre-requisite for effective performance within the industry (ASEAN, 2012:9).

After the demographics have been established to understand the respondents better, the study findings are presented in line with the study research objectives. One of the objectives of the study was to highlight how managers of tourism businesses have adopted the principles of sustainable tourism in the daily operations of tourism businesses. The next section focuses on the operations of the NBAs.

5.4 Findings of the study

The results of the study are presented according to themes which are research objectives to ensure that the purpose of the study is met and also to respond to the research questions. The first objective to be discussed is that of highlighting how managers of tourism businesses have adopted the principles of sustainable tourism in the daily operations of tourism businesses.

5.4.1 Operations of tourism businesses

This section seeks to highlight how managers of tourism businesses have adopted the principles of sustainable tourism in the daily operations of tourism businesses. The researcher saw it fit to first

check if the respondents agreed to the given definition of the term 'sustainability'. Findings from the study showed that all respondents agreed with the definition. Manager A stated that, "the definition incorporates all aspects of sustainability". Worker A also agreed stating that, "sustainability is a present and future issue". Workers B, Workers J and Workers M all mentioned that, for sustainability to be a success, all stakeholders need to be involved. The concept of sustainability was clearly familiar to all respondents. This meant that the NBAs are clearly aware of sustainability and sustainable tourism. The discoveries of the study are consistent with the definition of sustainability according to O'Neil & Lee, 2004:2 and WCED 1987:8 which states that, 'Sustainability is a synergistic process which aims to balance the social, environmental and economic considerations at NBAs such that the requirements of the current stakeholders are met without conceding the competence of the future stakeholders to fulfil the same requirements using the same resources.

Having established a common ground on the definition of sustainability, the researcher then had to concentrate on the principles of sustainable tourism which the NBAs made use of in the day to day operations. The next section focuses on how the NBAs ensured continuous and sustainable growth in the operations.

5.4.1.1 Continuous and sustained sustainable growth

One of the principles of sustainable tourism is to ensure that tourism development is continuous and has sustainable growth. All the respondents mentioned that operations at the NBA have to be considerate of the future to succeed. According to Manager B, "future generations should enjoy the same from the NBAs as the current tourists". Manager D stated that:

For tourism to be considered sustainable, the organisation has to safeguard that the needs of the present tourists are met without depleting the resources for future use.

Manager E also concurred with the statement saying, "at all times the NBAs have to make sure resources are saved for the future". Worker K highlighted that at all times all activities have to be done taking in mind the future of the NBAs. Worker A, Worker D and Worker M also mentioned "how the resources have to be used properly for the future".

All respondents spoke of the need to think of the future in any of the activities conducted by the NBAs. This brings out the importance of the future and continuity in sustainable tourism. This entails that there is need for tourism in NBAs to be continuous and sustained over a long term, NBAs should plan for growth and also incorporate ways of sustaining the growth (Landorf, 2009:54). In order for tourism to exist in the future, all operations of the NBAs have to be within the carrying capacity. The next section discusses reducing the negative impacts of tourism as one of the key principles of sustainable tourism applied in the operations of the NBAs.

5.4.1.2 Reduce the negative impacts of tourism

Dropping undesirable effects of tourism is an essential element of sustainable tourism and it was identified as a key theme in the study. Most managers highlighted the need for considering the impact of the NBAs as it is difficult to reverse the damages caused. Manager E emphasised the necessity for tourists to pre-book the visits, especially during weekends and other peak times, to avoid overcrowding and noise at the NBAs. Manager A agreed by stating that, the NBAs do not allow too many tourists at camp sites at one time and therefore, there is need to manage and limit numbers at different sites at all times.

The workers also validated the importance of reducing negative impacts in the operations at the NBAs. Worker A, Worker B, Worker G, Worker J and Worker M concurred with the statement through highlighting that controlling tourists' numbers and maintaining the carrying capacity is very crucial for the success of sustainable tourism at NBAs. Worker C added on by emphasising that overcrowding will strain all resources which include labour force, quality of air and accommodation; thereby compromising the quality of experience for the tourist and diminishing the chances of repeat or referral business. Manager D stated that:

Planning of all activities at the NBA is essential to avoid negative impacts of tourism and to ensure sustainability. This will avoid issues of soil erosion, deforestation, crime and disturbances to the ecosystem of wildlife.

Manager C mentioned that "the NBAs always ensures that all forms of pollution are avoided. The locals remain proud of the culture and heritage, and benefit from tourism at the NBAs".

The NBAs respect all types of carrying capacity and at all times avoid overload or strain on any of the resources beyond the maximum carrying capacity. The true wilderness experience should be protected at all costs to ensure the continued attractiveness of the NBAs (Leechor, n.d:10). The above statements

validate that misuse and abuse of the resources can lead to negative impacts of tourism at the NBAs (Plummer & Fennel, 2009:13, Buhalis & Costa, 2006:153). Respecting all the carrying capacities at NBAs is vital as it safeguards the ecological factors and service quality at the NBAs, without which the tourist numbers will reduce and the activities at the NBAs will be less attractive (Jin & Lui, 2017:2). Findings concur with Asadzadeh and Mousavi's (2017:1) observation that, "managers who understand and respect the sensitivity and vulnerability between tourism and the environment, will put in place welfare systems which will help reduce negative impacts of tourism. The next section discusses the protection of biodiversity as one of the key elements identified in the operations of the NBAs.

5.4.1.3 Protection of biodiversity

One of the crucial elements in the operations of the NBAs was the protection of biodiversity. The respondents noted that it was fundamental for the NBAs to protect the resources. Manager A concurred and had this to say; "the protection of wildlife, plants and other vegetation is one of the reasons why the NBAs exist." All the workers highlighted that the mandate of the NBAs was to protect the environment, flora, fauna and wildlife from getting extinct.

According to Manager D, "protecting the natural state of the NBAs and also protecting the wildlife will ensure tourists keep coming to the NBAs therefore the NBAs keeps being a benefit to all stakeholders". Worker M specifically mentioned that, "all NBAs should just maintain and protect the flora and fauna of the region". Worker M had this to say:

In all my years working at the NBAs, I have realised that the resources take long to recover if they are not protected. Therefore, it is imperative that an eye is kept on the numbers of animals, vegetation, as well as activities to ensure resources are really being protected at all times.

The respondents all mentioned that they believed that sustainable tourism goes together with the protection of resources at all areas of the NBAs. This is a crucial aspect of NBAs as protecting the biodiversity is part of the reason and mandate for the formation and subsequent critical success factor of any NBAs.

There is need for tourism managers to ensure tourism preserves resources in a bid to uphold the worthiness of the attractions (CEC, 2002:1). Adhikani and Kandel, 2017:1 agree with the findings by stating that "approximately 40% of the global tourism economy relies on biodiversity thereby making biodiversity a valuable asset to sustain the NBAs". Undoubtedly, biodiversity protection is the thrust towards the growth of NBAs (Jin & Lui, 2017:2). Likewise, continuous engagement of tour operators and local community on nature conservation with guaranteed benefits can result in successful biodiversity conservation (Adhikani & Kandel, 2017:1).

The next section focuses on community control and well-being one of the principles of sustainable tourism which NBAs implement in the day to day operations.

5.4.1.4 Community control and well-being

Community control and well-being is critical in sustainable tourism. All respondents highlighted that the NBAs need the support of the community and to be in harmony with the community in order to succeed. Worker D mentioned that, "if the community is happy and fully accepts the NBAs, then everything will go well at the NBAs". Manager C stated that, "the community gives us the labour we need, most of the raw materials, entertainment, as well as the curios and paintings we display around the NBAs." Manager D had this to say:

The support of the community is important and makes the operation of the NBAs to be peaceful and easy for us managers. We always make sure the community leaders are aware of any big events and we involve the leaders in decision makings regarding such events.

According to Manager E:

The NBAs ensures the community makes an income with what they know best. This includes the culture, dances, building skills, cooking, pottery and paintings. As a result, the community feels part and parcel of the NBAs and they see the value of tourism as they also participate and benefit from tourism.

Findings showed out that the community is an essential part for the success of the NBAs. All the NBAs made sure the community was involved and benefited from the operations of the NBAs. To be sustainable, a tourism development strategy for NBAs must also respect human rights, present equal opportunities for all in the community, and should reflect that in the NBAs' vision and goals (Hall, *et*

al, 2015:27). Adhikani and Kandel, 2017:1 concurs with the above by stating that if tourism planning and development isolates the community in the conceptualisation and implementation phases, then the tourism venture is dangerous to the community. Another key element of sustainable tourism is educating the stakeholders. The next section therefore, focuses the educating the stakeholders.

5.4.1.5 Educate and inform stakeholders

Many people are involved in order for the NBAs to operate successfully. These include the tourist, community members, community leader, workers, the government and managers. These people are collectively referred to as stakeholders. Manager D highlighted that the stakeholders should be consulted and well informed about issues of sustainability at the NBAs. Manager E supported the idea and said, "if the tourists, the workers, the government as well as the community are all educated about sustainability, then sustainable tourism in the NBAs will be a long term and successful practice". Workers F, K and L all highlighted the importance of education centres at the NBAs and stated that:

The education centres at NBAs focus on empowering the tourists, community and workers with information on matters of the attraction, conservation of both flora and fauna, global issues affection tourism at NBAs as well as how to behave and the expected conduct when one is in the NBAs.

NBAs clearly prioritise informing and educating the stakeholders, especially the tourist and employees. The tourists and employees are taken repeatedly through the policies, principles, rules and regulations of the NBAs to ensure that all efforts are put towards sustainability of the NBAs. It is crucial for NBAs to keep communicating, raising ecological awareness and educating the stakeholders about the importance of every little sustainable action, as this collectively goes a long way towards the goal of sustainable tourism (Lootah, 2018:30; Spenceley, 2008:287). The NBAs have to ensure that the community is well educated on preservation of tourism resources, anti-poaching, and sustainable hunting, in order to preserve the environmental heritage (UNESCO, 2015:4).

In summary of section 5.3.1, it can be noted that the NBAs have a good understanding of the principles of sustainable tourism and make use of the principles in their day to day operations. The findings of this section answered the question of how the principles of sustainable tourism are being used in the tourism businesses? The next section focuses on the objective to identify sustainable action plans which NBAs can manage.

5.4.2 Sustainable action plans which nature-based attractions can manage.

Another objective of the study was to identify the particular SAPs which can be managed at the NBAs. The workers seemed to be less knowledgeable about identifying the SAPs and the researcher had to further explain what the term SAPs meant in order to get the responses. All workers mentioned only water, pollution and employee relations as the SAPs to be managed at NBAs. However, all the managers mentioned nine SAPs namely; pollution, water, waste, meetings, buildings, purchasing and procurement, energy, information and education of tourists, and employee relations. Findings showed that all the SAPs mentioned by the managers were relevant to the SAPs identified by literature in section 3.4 the next section focuses on the objective to analyse and assess the management of the SAPs at the NBAs.

5.4.3 Management of sustainable action plans.

The study sought to analyse and assess the management of SAPs at the NBAs. All respondents highlighted that there were some SAPs which were being managed at all the three NBAs. The SAPs being managed at the NBAs were categorised into nine themes as presented below. Findings from the first SAP, namely water, will be discussed in the next section

5.4.3.1 Water

Most respondents highlighted the need to always save and conserve water. The respondents mentioned that the NBAs have boreholes which supply the water to the water points. Manager C said, "Regular pumping is done from the borehole, especially during the dry season to ensure constant supply of water". According to the workers, all the water points are cleaned once a week and every time there is mud build up. Manager A mentioned that:

One of the most important resources to manage at NBAs is water. Water is essential for the existence of the plants, wildlife and the well-being of tourists and workers. It is critical to make sure the water is safe for drinking or use for cooking at all times.

In order to save and ensure everything on water consumption was on track, managers at the NBAs highlighted that they monitored and checked how many times the water was refilled in the tank as well as the water bills monthly to ensure consumption of outsourced water was constant or within range. On water conservation, Worker C said:

Water harvesting is done during the rainfall season and is kept in the water tanks for washing cars, watering plants and also for cleaning purposes. We understand that water is precious and that every drop counts so we use water sparingly.

Most workers mentioned that they recycled water and used the water for watering plants, cleaning purposes, as well as washing vehicles.

Water is one of the precious and scarce resources in Botswana due to the semi-arid climate. Findings showed that the NBAs had few water management systems in place. Findings were consistent with UNWTO, 2013a:1 report which state that tourism businesses have to engage environmentally friendly, innovative solutions and effective management of water aimed at reducing water consumption and water pollution. However, from the findings, it could not be confirmed if the NBAs had the desired quality of water and safe water for drinking. International water quality standards are not always adhered to at NBAs as a means of ensuring drinking water of desired quality, and the NBAs may lack timely response system to water quality issues in case of problems or emergencies (Spier, n.d: 3; GSTC, 2015:1). Having discussed water as an SAP, the second SAP to be discussed, is energy.

5.4.3.2 Energy

None of the respondents mentioned any use of renewable energy at the NBAs. Respondents all mentioned that the NBAs used electricity for power supply. The electricity used at the NBAs was purchased in tokens. At all the NBAs, appliances such as computers, fridges and air-conditioning used electricity. To save energy, the appliances were switched off when not in use and when staff knocked off. However, the workers highlighted that for cooking purposes, gas was also used. For things such as bush braais, firewood or charcoal was used. Worker M, had this to say:

Tourists are encouraged to buy firewood from the locals at the entrance of the NBAs. This is because collection of firewood within the NBA is prohibited. The firewood is mostly used for braai or to make campfires at the NBA.

Findings showed that the NBAs were clearly not doing enough to make use of sustainable energy. The managers needed to take initiative and explore the usage of renewable sources of energy such as solar and wind energy, which are cheaper sources of energy and are available in abundance in Botswana due to the dessert-like climate (Rosen, 2009:1). High cost of electricity or gas and increasing

price of fuel leads to increase in operational costs and thereby reducing profit margins for the NBAs. Mensah ,2013:1 and Rosen, 2009:1 both concur with findings of the study by highlighting that there is a requirement for longstanding renewable energy programmes, creation of consciousness on the paybacks of renewable energy, attitudinal change and environmentally responsible behaviour from all stakeholders. The next section focuses on waste as the third SAP to be managed at NBAs.

5.4.3.3 Waste

All managers stated that sewers or human waste collection was connected to the city municipality lines. Workers highlighted that they ensured that litter was transported to the landfill when there was need. Some waste was taken to the skip or bins around the NBAs. Worker B mentioned that there was need for follow up to ensure that there was regular collection of litter every week. Worker M also said, "as part of waste management, I have to ensure that the skip is collected and bins are cleaned thereafter."

The findings showed that the NBAs have basic waste management measures in place although more can be done. There is no evidence of waste separation, reducing or recycling of waste materials at any of the NBAs. Waste management is also a vital process at NBAs as there is need to put in place measures to recycle, reuse, compost and resell the solid waste (Green Hotelier, 2017:1). Steady and methodical waste collection and safe and sustainable disposal of unusable and unrecyclable waste have to be put in place by the NBAs management since carbon releases and food misuse continue to be part of the major blockades to handling sustainable tourism (GSTC, 2015:1; Lootah, 2018:29).

The next section discusses the findings from analysing and assessing green buildings as the fourth SAP being managed at NBAs.

5.4.3.4 Green Buildings

The managers and workers from the government owned NBAs highlighted that all construction was co-ordinated by the development team at head office based on the demand of the NBAs. It is therefore, difficult to establish whether the buildings were sustainably constructed or not. For the private NBAs, the Manager D had this to say, "all buildings have to be constructed using raw materials which can match with environment." The workers highlighted that most buildings were built by construction companies which came from outside the local community, and cared less about the environment. Worker M mentioned that:

All these buildings were built using materials brought in by the construction companies, and sometimes they left a lot of the trees cut down reducing shade and habitats for some animals.

Worker D also mentioned that construction at the NBA was poorly planned, and left a lot of waste which reduced the attractiveness of the NBAs. However, Worker D was quick to add that, "the colours of paint used on the buildings as well as most roofing materials matched with the natural environment."

The findings showed that most buildings at the private NBAs were built to match with the natural environment although there was no strategic planning towards this. Also, the actual construction was done by companies from other areas with little or no knowledge about the natural environment. The government plans construction and renovations of buildings in public NBAs therefore public NBAs have little or no control over the construction or refurbishment of buildings. Green building considers the characteristics of the NBAs' natural environment, involves innovation and exhibits benefits such as more natural light, improved ventilation, use of less poisonous substances like sealants and paints, decreased operational and maintenance costs, and conversely, increased efficiency (Esmaeilifar & Shafiei, 2015:655). The fifth SAP, namely green meetings, is discussed next.

5.4.3.5 Green Meetings

Findings from the study showed that most workers did not seem to know much about green meetings. Manager A and Manager F highlighted the need to reduce waste and energy consumption at the conference rooms. Manager C had this to say:

We make sure the meetings are conducted in an energy efficient way. We advise the clients to make meetings during the day and use as much sunlight as possible, instead of using artificial lighting.

Manager E also supported this by saying:

At the meeting rooms we encourage use of natural light and more outdoor and day events to save energy. The staff is advised to wash the linen periodically and only when dirty.

Workers highlighted that the NBAs still made use of disposable tableware and individual water bottles during meetings.

The findings showed that NBAs were not doing much towards green meetings. There were still unsustainable practices during the meetings such as delegates commuting to the venue daily using individual cars and staying out of the NBA. The workers were not knowledgeable about green meetings. Green meetings help NBAs to integrate sustainable practices into the management and operations of meetings whilst pursuing benefits such as image enhancement, reduced costs and the consciousness for environmental issues (Ranchader & Probstl-Haider 2014:121). The next section discusses findings on analysing and assessing pollution as the sixth SAP being managed at NBAs.

5.4.3.6 Pollution

The findings of the study showed that managers and workers at the NBAs all agreed that pollution had to be controlled and managed at the NBAs. The managers mentioned that the types of pollution addressed at the NBAs included water pollution, overuse of chemicals, overcrowding, poor design and infrastructural planning, and poor drainage. All the managers mentioned the need for clear and well–written signs in the NBAs informing the tourists to desist from littering, feeding animals and to exercise noise control. Tourists are educated about the different types of pollution through adverts and education. Noise pollution is curbed by controlling number of tourists entering the NBAs as well as prohibiting the playing of loud music. At all the NBAs, Worker C stated that, 'it is very important for the workers to ensure that the tourists are aware of the rules against pollution.' Worker E highlighted that, 'congestion is controlled by ensuring that all tourists book prior to coming to the NBAs.' In a bid to reduce litter, bins are put strategically near the campsites, reception, and restaurant as well as at the main gates. Worker C, also added that:

We encourage the tourists not to throw litter around. We also ensure that there are no bins over-spilling or staying uncollected for too long. We look out for damages around the campsites and buildings, and repair immediately. The NBA has to look presentable at all times.

Findings clearly showed that different forms of pollution were managed at the NBAs. The managers highlighted that they made sure that the water sources were kept clean and managed to avoid contamination from litter or human waste or animal waste. The managers of the NBAs had to co-ordinate efforts towards minimising all forms of pollution at NBAs, and to avoid disturbing the wildlife as well as local community (Education Bureau, 2013:193). Findings showed that the NBAs concur with literature which states that proper disposal of waste should be practised, tourists should

be given instructions on how to behave at the NBAs, hunting or fishing and felling of trees should be reduced or forbidden to reduce pollution (Dr Malra, 2015:103; Asadzadeh & Mousavi, 2017:1).

The seventh SAP to be discussed is information and education of tourists.

5.4.3.7 Information and education of tourists

Manager B stated that, "the information centre of the NBAs ensures that tourists are informed and educated about the activities and operation of the NBAs". Worker G and Worker M also stressed the importance of giving tourists flyers, adverts, and information sheets at the gate, and to also explain the terms and conditions of the NBAs to the tourists as bookings and payments are being made. Worker E said:

Visiting groups are also briefed on the operations of the NBAs at the beginning of every tour or visit to ensure that we are on the same page with regards to behaviour and conduct whilst at the NBAs.

The findings clearly showed that the tourists were being informed and educated about the sustainability issues at the NBAs and how to conduct themselves in order to ensure the success of sustainable tourism. This concurs with the SSTDI's (2013:1) observation that, it is important that the tourists are educated, knowledgeable and informed about sustainability issues affecting the NBAs, in order to avoid negligent and careless behaviour.

The next section discusses findings on employee relations as the eight SAP being managed at NBAs.

5.4.3.8 Employee Relations

The public owned NBAs highlighted that the head office co-ordinated all the activities of the employees. However, both the management and workers highlighted that remuneration, training and appointments were done fairly in a systematic manner. At the private NBAs, managers highlighted that there were decent and fair wages for the workers. Manager D stated that:

We ensure we hire locals, train employees regularly, and offer fair and decent remuneration and benefits to keep our staff motivated.

The employees were trained periodically and briefings were held daily to ensure that the workers were competent and up to date with the operations of the NBAs. The workers confirmed this and stated that

there were daily briefings and regular trainings on current issues and trends affecting the NBAs. Worker D mentioned that if there was a vacancy, the management first notified the workers and asked the workers to apply or to suggest or refer locals who qualified for the vacancy. Worker M echoed the same sentiments and went on to add that:

This makes us really feel like an important part of the organisation and motivates team work amongst us as workers at the NBA. We really feel like we are more of family than co-workers.

Managers at the NBA showed understanding that employees are a critical factor in the implementation of SAPs and that the employee relations needed to be kept good at all times. The NBA showed that the employment practices must be decent, include collective bargaining, ensure the right to; information and consultation, fair wages as well as equal opportunities (International Labour Organisation (ILO), 2016:1; HILO, 2010:53; Build Abroad, 2017:1).

Procurement and purchasing is the ninth and last SAP discussed in the next section.

5.4.3.9 Procurement and Purchasing

The managers and workers of the public NBAs all highlighted that the purchasing and procurement of materials was centralised at the head office, and therefore, could not comment further on the issue. The private NBAs managers said, "we get our supplies from the local people or in Gaborone". Another manager added on by saying:

We usually want to make orders from suppliers around the NBAs, but if the commodity cannot be found locally then we order in bulk from Gaborone. This reduces packaging materials which are just a wastage as they are thrown away.

All the workers also cited raw materials used at the NBAs as mostly coming from the local market or from Gaborone. Worker H mentioned that:

We order from nearby suppliers to get products fresh, faster and at a cheaper cost. Suppliers who are far will lead to more cost especially for transportation.

This clearly illustrates that the NBAs bought local and regional products at all times, thereby practicing sustainable tourism that supported the local economy and encourages purchasing

sustainably. Procurement and purchasing of stationery, food and beverages, cleaning products, furnishings to be used in the NBAs has to be sustainable.

Findings confirmed that NBAs used sustainable means of procurement and purchasing which included buying locally, buying from empowerment programs and hiring or sub-contracting local businesses (Spier, n.d:3). Procurement of indigenous products helps upkeep the community and diminishes carbon footprints. This, in turn, helps to offset the social glitches from absence of employment and helps to create a sense of self-respect, positions local people in charge of their livelihoods, rather than relying on assistance (SSTDI, 2013:1; Build Abroad, 2017:1).

Having presented the findings of how all the nine SAPs were being managed at the NBAs, the next section will focus on the next objective which was to identify the best practices and international experiences of successful management of SAPs in NBAs.

5.4.4 Best practices of sustainable action plans

This section sought to identify the best practices and international experiences of successful management of SAPs in NBAs. Literature reviewed six international attractions that exhibited best practices on the management of SAPs (section 3.5). The managers from the NBAs mentioned that there are some local attractions which they emulate. All the attractions mentioned by the managers are in northern side of Botswana, which is well known compared to the south eastern side where the NBAs are located. Manager A said:

"We are working very hard to be of benefit to our local communities. We want to be like the Okavango Delta which has benefited and improved life of the locals. All the activities are done in harmony and in consultation with the community. We closely follow up on the activities of eco-tourism projects and try to emulate."

Manager D, added that:

We follow up on big and well-known attractions such as the Okavango Delta, Chobe National Park and Khama Rhino Sanctuary to copy one or two things from them. Of late, we also host school children whom we teach conservation and environmental awareness as is done at KRS. We ensure we collect and dispose of waste and keep areas smart and tidy as is done at Okavango Delta".

Manager F highlighted that all the big and successful NBAs at the north of Botswana seemed to be controlling tourist numbers entering the park, restricting picking of firewood and encouraging tourists to use designated roads and trails, which is what the NBA was also emulating in its operations.

Workers highlighted that the aim was to operate like the big attraction of Botswana in order to stay in business, be up to date and be competitive. Most workers were aware that the NBAs benchmarked their practices with those at the Okavango delta, Khama Rhino Sanctuary and Chobe National Park, although the workers could not mention what exactly it is that they bench marked.

Findings showed that there were many best practises in the management of SAPs at NBAs internationally. It is important for the NBA managers to choose one NBA with best practises and use the particular NBA to benchmark operations. The managers of NBAs needed to clearly inform the workers about the NBA they were benchmarking their operations with, so as to ensure everyone is aware of what to do. It would also be ideal to have communication and flow of ideas between the two NBAs.

5.4.5 Conclusions and recommendations

The respondents were also asked to make commendations and suppositions based on the issues discussed during the meetings. Most of the workers highlighted that they recommended management to engage them fully in sustainability issues, and also wanted to be aware of all plans towards sustainability at the NBAs. Worker M highlighted that the interview had made him realise how the decisions made on a day to day basis affected tourism. He added on to say, "we all need to refocus and ensure that all our actions support sustainability". Worker C stated that, "it is clear that we have to work harder to protect the resources otherwise if the resources are destroyed then there won't be any work for us in the nearby future."

Managers all echoed the same sentiments about going back to the drawing board and strategically planning for all activities at the NBAs. Manager A, concluded by saying, "this interview has been an eye opener, and one needs to work very hard to update and be on track in terms of sustainability at the NBA."

The conclusions and recommendations made by the respondents clearly showed that the respondents agreed with the notion that tourism success is conditional and ultimately dependant on healthy,

attractive and pleasant environment. All the findings were discussed in accordance with the research objectives, and the next section concludes the chapter.

5.5 Conclusion

This chapter analysed primary data which was collected using semi-structured interview guide. The findings were discussed based on the demographics, and thereafter, the research objectives. Findings from the study showed that:

- the respondents were management and workers all aged below 50 years with the majority aged under 30 years. Most of the respondents highlighted that they had less than a year of working experience at the NBAs and were educated up to form 5 or below;
- from the ten principles of sustainable tourism revealed by literature, the NBAs had only made use of five sustainable tourism principles in their day to day operations;
- there were nine sustainable action plans which NBAs could make use of. These are water, waste, energy, pollution, green meetings, green buildings, employee relations, purchasing and procurement and informing and educating tourists;
- the NBAs are aware of all the SAPs but have a minimalist approach towards the SAPs and have the potential to do better than what is currently happening;
- and all the respondents were enlightened on the issue of SAPs and were willing to fully engage themselves in order to realise the full potential of SAPs in the NBAs in order to receive and enjoy the benefits of SAPs.

NBAs managers need to fully explore the SAPs individually and engage all mechanisms to ensure sustainability at its best. Having presented the study findings, the following chapter concentrates on summarising the findings of the study, drawing conclusions from the study, and also making some recommendations based on the findings of the study and based on the objectives.

CHAPTER 6: CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE STUDY. 6.1 Introduction

The previous chapter discussed data presentation and analyses of primary data on the management of SAPs at GGR, KGR and MNR. The data collected answered research questions on how the SAPs are being managed at MNR, GGR and KGR. This chapter focusses on the summary of the findings, summary of the study conclusions and also insights from the study. Conclusions are grounded on the research findings and the study recommendations on SAPs management and implementation.

6.2 Overview of the study

Sustainable tourism has increased fame because tourists are more knowledgeable about the possible negative impact tourism can bring to the community and only want to bring positive change to places visited. By applying the roles and principles of sustainable tourism, tourism can advance the positive contributions tourism makes to the community. Botswana is one such nation needing to fully benefit from tourism and to apply sustainability fully in economic, environmental and sociocultural pillars of sustainability. By so doing the country will enjoy the paybacks of sustainable tourism which include formation of jobs, conservation of biodiversity, and increases in profit margins from tourism. NBA managers also highlighted the benefits that sustainability can bring to the NBAs such as motivated workforce, reduced expenses and beautiful natural surroundings.

A research gap in the management of SAPs in the NBAs of Botswana was identified. The purpose of the study was to investigate how the SAPs are managed at selected NBAs in Botswana. The information from the research would help NBA managers, the public, the Botswana government and other general tourism businesses in Botswana to have an appreciation of how SAPs are managed in NBAs in Botswana. After conducting purposive sampling, convenience sampling and snowball sampling, the study engaged 25 participants in face to face semi-structured interviews.

The data was collected at GGR, KGR and MNR over a period of 3 months from March 2018 to May 2018. Thereafter, a thematic analysis was used to analyse and present the data findings. This chapter makes conclusions and recommendations based on the data findings.

The next section discusses the conclusions drawn from the findings of the study based on the objectives of the study.

6.3 Conclusions drawn from data analysis

This section presents the summary of the findings of the study in relation to the demographics as well as the objectives of the study. The objectives of the study were as follows:

- to highlight how managers of tourism businesses have adopted the principles of sustainable tourism in the daily operations of tourism businesses;
- to determine the SAPs which can be developed for management at NBAs;
- to analyse and assess the management of SAPs at 3 selected NBAs;
- to identify the best practices and international experiences of successful management of SAPs in NBAs; and
- to make conclusions and prescribe recommendations to managers of NBAs and naturebased tourism business in general.

The conclusion from demographics are discussed first.

6.3.1 Demographics

In relation to biographic details of the respondents (refer to section 5.3), 60% of the respondents were less than 30 years old. Only 12% of the respondents had degrees for educational qualifications whilst 76% had form five or below. This was consistent with Mwana & Mwana (2014:5897) who highlighted that the tourism industry's labour-intensive nature, enables the underprivileged members of the community with very little official training like the youth to be employed. Most of the respondents had little experience working at the NBAs with 56% of the respondents having 0 to 2 years' experience. This was due to the fact that most people take tourism jobs as part-time whilst they are studying or just to get some extra income. This might mean the NBAs need to continually train and inform its workforce about SAPs to ensure that all workers understand, appreciate and are aware of SAPs. The government can review and upgrade the recommended salary structures to entice graduates to join the sector.

The next section focuses on the first objective which was to highlight how managers of tourism businesses have adopted the principles of sustainable tourism in the day to day operation of tourism business.

6.3.2 Operations of tourism business.

The literature review of the study identified ten principles of sustainable tourism which NBAs have adopted (see section 2.5). However, findings from the interviews showed that NBAs are not making use of all the sustainable tourism principles (see section 5.3), but rather only effectively use five of the principles. Employees of NBAs all highlighted that NBA activities are done with consideration for the future. Consideration of the future were ensured through use of the long-term planning of activities in the NBAs. In this way, long term sustainable growth and continuity of the NBAs was guaranteed. The managers advocate for the saving of resources, respect of carrying capacities to ensure continuity of activities at the NBAs.

All the NBAs involve the surrounding committee for the smooth running of activities. Community support has led to the good tourist experiences at the NBAs. The labour, entertainment, decoration items and crafts at the NBAs are sourced form the community. NBAs strive to create jobs and opportunities for the locals who are well informed about their community and surroundings, and provide knowledge and skills about the local environment which is essential in giving tourists exceptional and personal experiences. It is evident that the communities are benefiting from the NBAs and support the NBAs therefore there is reduced hostility and resentment of the NBAs by the community.

Reducing negative impacts of tourism was identified as key in giving the tourist a unique and beautiful experience at the NBAs. Managers emphasised on respecting the carrying capacity of the resources so as to avoid straining the resources. Other means of reducing negative impacts at the NBAs include controlling the tourist numbers at NBAs, and planning all tourist activities in order to reduce crime, soil erosion, pollution, disturbing ecosystem and deforestation.

Educating and informing the stakeholders is another principle of sustainable tourism which the NBAs make use of. All stakeholders at the NBA need to be educated and informed about the sustainable action plans of the NBAs, conservation of biodiversity, expected behaviour at the NBAs, the culture and heritage of the community, as well as rules and laws which govern the attraction and destination as a whole. The NBAs use signs and posts around the NBA to inform tourist of the expected behaviour. General rules and regulations of the NBAs are usually displayed at entrance points. The workers who work directly with tourists also emphasise to the tourist on the expected behaviour at the NBAs. The education centres at the NBAs provide education on conservation of the ecosystem to the tourists. The

next section discusses the objective to determine the SAPs which can be developed for management at the NBAs.

6.3.3 Sustainable action plans which nature-based attractions can manage.

One of the objectives of the study was to identify the SAPs which can be developed for management at the NBAs. In section 3.4, the study identified nine SAPs which NBAs managers can implement in the NBAs. The nine SAPs were water, waste, energy, pollution, purchasing and procurement, green buildings, green meetings, and employee relations.

The workers had no idea of what the SAPs are whilst the managers were fully aware of all nine SAPs. This showed that the managers were not fully informing the workers about the SAPs but just task the workers who implement the SAPs without knowing the name SAP. Managers of NBAs need to ensure that all the nine SAPs determined by the study are equally managed, and that adequate resources are allocated to ensure successful implementation of all the SAPs. The next section discusses the study findings on the objective of how the SAPs are being managed at GGR, KGR and MNR

6.3.4 Management of sustainable action plans.

Section 3.4 of the study identified nine objectives which can be managed at NBAs which are waste, water, pollution, energy, procurement and purchasing, employee relations, tourist education, green buildings and green meetings as discussed in section 6.3.3 above. Section 5.4.3 presented the findings from the management of SAPs at NBAs. This section draws conclusion based on the findings.

All the NBAs had general water conservation measures in place such as low flow toilets, low flow showers, rainwater collection and recycling of bathroom and kitchen water. Water audits are done with the aim to know and understand consumption patterns and even plan on how to meet perceived high demand for water at NBAs. Tourists have to be involved in water conservation and informative signs on water conservation have to be erected in NBAs. Innovative solutions which motivate good tourist behaviour towards awareness of importance of water are needed. A simple sign encouraging tourists to close taps while brushing their teeth can save 11.300 litres of water annually (UNWTO, 2013b:1). There is need to also take into account the indirect water uses of tourism, and to ensure that
water management measures are implemented and managed, especially in dry regions like Botswana (Gossling *et al.*, 2012:18). The next section will discuss energy.

Energy used in all the NBAs is mostly electricity for running the equipment and lighting whilst sometimes gas and firewood for cooking purposes and braai respectively. Gas, oil and electricity are limited and expensive sources of energy (Bassam, n.d :2) therefore, there is need for the NBAs to consider using alternative energy sources like solar, bio thermal and wind. The NBAs save energy by ensuring that all appliances are switched off when not in use. Energy sustainability is now a global issue and there is need to have an overall sustainable energy system (Rosen, 2009:55). This will reduce the other concerns such as pollution, waste, job creations and ozone depletion (Rosen, 2009:57; Bassam, n.d:1). However, the renewable energy sources offer a chance to reduce carbon emissions, clean the air, and ensure sustainable energy supply which aids in protecting the climate (Bassam, n.d:2). The sources of alternative and clean energy such as wind and solar are available in abundance in Botswana, therefore, the NBAs need to take advantage of that. For example, NBAs are encouraged to place solar panels in areas with highest solar radiation (Sharma, Behl, Sindhu & Kumar, nd:37). Waste will be discussed next.

Findings highlighted that waste management at the three NBAs was linked with the local municipality. Waste is put in skip bins and collected by the local municipality for disposal. There was no evidence of waste separation at all the three NBAs. The NBAs needed to practise waste separation. Different bins should be allocated for different types of waste such as paper, food, plastic, bottles and metals. Managers have to put in place measures for recycling and reusing some of the waste materials. Arrangements should be made to donate reusable waste to companies who recycle waste to make other products like writing pads, tissue paper, ornaments and plastic bottles. There was no mention of any waste water management systems, which is critical in order to avoid contamination of water. Pollution is discussed next.

Pollution is managed to a lesser extent at the NBAs. Managers highlighted that water pollution, overuse of chemicals, overcrowding, poor design and infrastructural planning, and poor drainage are types of pollution which need proper management at the NBAs. Care is taken to keep NBAs tidy and clean from litter, and waste is cleared and disposed of properly. Sign posts are constantly repaired, buildings are kept clean and tidy and refurbished as need arises. Managers need to avail information about pollution prevention at the NBAs in websites, flyers at the entrances, adverts in various media

as well as poster or signpost strategically located in specific areas of the NBAs so that all stakeholders become aware. Green meetings are discussed hereafter.

All managers of the NBAs need to seriously inform and educate the workers about green meetings. Findings highlighted that the workers were not knowledgeable in this regard. Awareness is key and first step towards sustainability and it is critical for workers to be aware of all issues of sustainability through periodic environmental training and education (Ghobadi & Verdian, 2016:534). Conference rooms at the NBAs are making use of bottled water for individuals, green meetings disposable cutlery and tableware, and a lot of paper waste is generated by the meetings. Use of soft copy presentations should be encouraged to reduce, recycle and reuse paper used for conference literature (Mykletun, Bartkeviciute & Puchkova, 2014:211). NBAs make use of natural lighting and ventilation especially for daytime events. Delegates should be encouraged to stay at the same hotel hosting the meeting and eat the local food (Rittichainuwat & Mair, 2012:147). It is critical that NBA managers ensure that all the aspects of the meetings adopt environmental practices, follow guidelines and environmental codes of conduct (Mykletun, *et al*, 2014:211).

The public NBAs, GGR and KGR have centralised management of the buildings, employee relations and, purchasing and procurement from the head office of the Department of National Parks and Wildlife. The employees of the public NBAs therefore have no say in the management of the above mentioned SAPs. The study showed that centralising the management of some SAPs limits the control that the manager of the NBAs can have over the sustainability of the particular SAPs.

Procurement and purchasing at the MNR is done systematically, buying from the local residents and also buying goods made within the country. Only a few exotic products are ordered from neighbouring countries. MNR also to purchases in bulk in order to reduce the carbon footprints as well as packaging materials. The managers at MNR ensure that the employees have good working conditions and that recruitment is done locally in the region. Most construction at MNR were done by outsourced construction companies who knew nothing about the nature and landscape of the reserve. MNR managers should consider engaging local companies, using local building materials, and erecting easy to configure and reuse structures which are energy efficient. In so doing, the local skills and labour force will be supported, energy and resources will be efficiently and effectively used (Kibert, 2016:15). Furniture and fittings, decorative ornaments and curios were bought mostly from the local

craftsmen. MNR clearly supports the local arts and crafts industry and has helped improve the livelihood of the local craftspeople.

Information and education of tourists is the backbone of all SAPs. The SAPs ensure that awareness of how the NBAs operate is created. It is not only the tourists who need the education, but also the community and the government, both key stakeholders in NBAs (section 3.2), and workers too. The most important thing is to ensure that stakeholders are informed about all the SAPs managed at the NBAs. Information about water management, waste management, pollution, energy use and conservation, green buildings, green meetings, procurement and purchasing as well as employee relations at the NBAs should be known by everyone to ensure smooth and successful implementation and management of SAPs. Social media has been upgraded to play a major role in infirming tourists about destination and activities at NBAs. NBAs should use social media, websites, word of mouth, magazines, tour operators and signage to spread the awareness about SAPs (Oian *et al*, 2018:16).

To conclude section 6.3, the NBAs are managing SAPs, however, more resources should be put towards attaining full sustainability in the NBAs. There is a lot of room for improvement for each and every SAP. The NBAs have a minimalist approach towards the management of SAPs and are just managing the basics of each NBA, and not really going all out as is done by the NBAs offering best experiences in the management of SAPs. This leads to limited benefits which NBAs can have from the SAPs. Constraints in the implementation of sustainable development are usually linked to lack of finances, knowledge and the diverse political and economic goals worldwide (Klarin, 2018:87). The NBAs have to develop education programs for workers to upgrade their academic qualifications, as well as develop skills and expertise needed for the implementation of the SAPs (Gossling *et al.*, 2012:21). The NBAs need to adapt to inevitable changes in the management of SAPs and put in place the following:

- compliance to policies and regulations affecting NBA management according to the Botswana laws and regulations,
- research and development on how the resources of NBAs can be managed sustainably, and
- aggressive education, behavioural change and awareness campaigns targeting all stakeholders (Gossling *et al.*, 2012:24).

The study showed that the policies and plans which have provided the frameworks for development of NBAs have no practical implementation and monitoring. Therefore, the government needs to effectively enforce the implementation of the policies for SAPs to be effectively managed (Stone *et al*, 2017:6). Urgent government action is primarily required for sustainability to be successfully implemented in any nation (Oian, *et al.*, 2018:330)

The next section discusses the findings for the objective of identifying the best practices and international experiences of successful management of SAPs in NBAs.

6.3.5 Best practices of sustainable action plans.

The study revealed that most NBAs across the world are managing SAPs in their daily operations. Six NBAs from each of the continents of the world were identified and presented as offering the best practices and international experiences of successful management of SAPs (section3.5). This highlighted that there are successful cases of the management of SAPs regardless of different geographical locations, communities and economies. This shows that sustainability in NBAs can be a reality worldwide if every NBAs fully manages the SAPs. The respondents only highlighted the local attractions as the best practises they follow. There is need for the managers to explore and benchmark practices with international destinations such as the ones mentioned in section 3.5. The best practises being benchmarked at the NBAs have to be known by all stakeholders to ensure unity of purpose. NBAs have to be aware of the best practices and successful management of SAPs in order to emulate and follow how the NBAs manage to overcome common obstacles in implementing SAPs. Establishing communication with managers of successful NBAs can allow for exchange of ideas on how to manage SAPs.

The next objective discussed relates to recommendations on management of SAPs in NBAs and any tourism business in general.

6.3.6 Recommendations on the management of sustainable action plans.

 NBAs are encouraged to make use of energy saving devices and systems, and renewable sources of energy such as wind power, solar power, water power, biomass and geothermal power is critical for energy conservation and has to be encouraged to divert from the traditional sources of energy.

- NBAs must install motion sensor lighting that goes off when there is no one in sight.
- NBAs must install solar panels for generating solar energy for heat and lighting.
- NBAs need to measure, monitor, record and report energy consumption in order to identify the areas where energy use can be reduced as well as to monitor the success of the energy conservation.
- NBAs need to engage in waste separation to aloe for proper reuse, recycling, reduction and disposal of waste.
- All NBAs need to clearly communicate using websites, fliers, sign post to their stakeholders regarding pollution and measures to be taken against polluters in the NBAs
- The Department of Tourism and Wildlife has to decentralise all departments in NBAs to allow tailor-made, holistic approach and control towards sustainability in NBAs.
- NBAs need to decentralise all activities such as human resourcing, purchasing and procurement as well as infrastructure management so as to deal with issues in manners best suitable for their unique set-ups.
- Government and private NBAs need to allocate a budget to use for the management of SAPs. Training, devices and equipment used in the management of SAPs need to be paid for and maintained.
- NBAs need to plan and engage in periodic training of the workers to ensure that the workers are well informed about trends affecting the industry.
- NBA managers need to be mentored or benchmarked with NBAs from local, regional and international levels in order to receive tips, tricks as well as motivation to reach perfection and realise all possible benefits of SAPs.
- The government of Botswana has to put down strict rules and regulations on the management of SAPs in all attractions.
- The government of Botswana has to encourage the ecotourism certification of all NBAs facilities with the aim to persuade NBAs to improve their environmental management practices through a system of competitive benefits and rewards.
- The government of Botswana has to assign a regulatory body responsible for monitoring the actual management and implementation of SAPs in all attractions in Botswana to ensure that the policies, master plans and legislation towards

The next section discusses the limitations of the study.

6.4 Limitations of the study

In conducting the study there were some limitations that were met and the limitation are as follows:

- The major limitation of the study was that of time. The study was conducted over a period of 3 months. More time could allow for better analysis of how SAPs are managed during different seasons at the NBAs.
- The interview schedule was long and this made the interview to have a longer duration as a result some possible participants refused to participate in the study.
- The study only focused on the south east region of Botswana, therefore, the results of the study cannot be generalised.

Having highlighted the limitations of the study, the next section will discuss the recommendations for future research.

6.5 Recommendations on future research

The following recommendations are made with respect to future research:

- Research can be done to measure the management of SAPs in the other types of attractions in Botswana.
- This study forms a basis for the research on the management of SAPs in the south eastern part of Botswana. More research can still be conducted on management of SAPs in NBAs in other regions of Botswana.
- The study identified nine SAPs which can be managed at NBAs. Further studies can be conducted to intensively measure the management of each of the nine SAPs in NBAs.
- The study can be conducted over a period of a year or two years to identify the trends and challenges which apply to the management of SAPs at different seasons.
- Research can be conducted to assess the importance of the management of SAPs to ecotourists.

• Future research can be conducted to analyse the benefits derived from engaging in the management of SAPs versus the actual benefits gained from the management of SAPs in the NBAs.

6.6. Significance of the study

The study offered ideas which will widen the breadth and depth of knowledge on the management of SAPs in the NBAs to academics. The study contributed to literature on SAPs and their management at different NBAs in Botswana. The recommendations on the challenges faced in management of SAPs in NBAs will help the tourism sector in coming up with solutions which will ensure that in the future NBAs will be managed successfully. The study also helped the researcher to develop research skills, techniques and the ability to interpret data.

REFERENCES

Aobo, D. 2006. Sustainable Tourism Realities: Case for Adventure service Tourism. *School of International Training in Brattleboro*. Vermont, USA

Asadzadeh, A & Mousavi, M.S.S. 2017. The role of tourism on the environment and its governing law. *Electronic Journal of Biology*, 13(1).

Ayuso, S. 2007. Comparing voluntary policy instruments for sustainable tourism: the experience of Spanish hotel sector. *Journal of Sustainable Tourism*, 15(2):144-159.

Baker, M. S. P & Mearn, K. n.d. *Applying sustainable tourism indicators to measure the sustainable performance of two tourism lodges in the Namib dessert*. University of South Africa.

Baruch, Y. 1999. Response rate in academic studies- a comparative analysis. *Human Relations*. 52(4), 421-438.

Bassam, N. E. L. n.d. options of renewable energy technologies in restructuring the future energy generation and supply in the regional and global context. Retrieved from: <u>http://www.ified.org/pdf/media/Book_Renewable-enegry-sources-and - their-Applications.pdf</u> [Accessed 14 September 2018].

Batman, Z.P & Zencirkiran, M. 2016. Investigating nature-based tourism possibilities in Bursa Waterfall. *Global Issues and Trends in Tourism*. St Kliment Ohridski University Press. Sofia.

Bengtsson, M. 2016. How to plan and perform a qualitative study using content analysis. *Nursing Plus Open* 2:8-14. Elsevier.

Bhandari, M. 2014. Is tourism always beneficial? A case study from Masai Mara National Reserve, Narok, Kenya. Akami University.

Blackstock, K.L., White, V., McCrum, Scott, A. & Hunter, C. 2008. Measuring Responsibility: An appraisal of Scottish National Parks' sustainable tourism indicators. *Journal of Sustainable Tourism*, 16(3):276-297.

Bohdnowicz, P., Zientara, P & Novotna, E. 2011. International hotel chains and environmental protection: An analysis of Hilton's We Care! Programme (Europe, 2006-2008). *Journal of Sustainable Tourism*, 19(7):797-816.

Bojanic, D. 2011. Using a tourism importance–performance typology to investigate environmental sustainability on a global level. *Journal of Sustainable Tourism*. 19(8):989-1003.

Borges, M.A., Carbone, G., Bushell, R. & Jaeger, T. 2011. *Sustainable tourism and natural world heritage: Priorities for action.* Gland, Switzerland, IUCN

Bosnic, I, Tubic, D & Stanisic, J. 2014. Role of destination management in strengthening competitiveness of Croatia tourism. *Econoviews*, 153-170.

Botswana Safari Guide, 2010. Retrieved From: Botswana Tourism, 2013. Tourism in Botswana.

Bramwell, B. & Lane, B. 2011. Critical research on the governance of tourism and sustainability. *Journal of Sustainable Tourism*.19:45, 411-421.

Bramwell, B. & Lane, B. 2012. Towards innovation in sustainable tourism research? *Journal of Sustainable Tourism*. 20(1):1-7.

BTDP (Botswana Tourism Development Program) - Tourism Master Plan. 2000. *Tourism Master Plan*. Ministry of Commerce and Industry. Department of Tourism. Gaborone. Botswana.

BTO (Botswana Tourism Organisation). 2013. Botswana tourism and attractions. Retrieved from: http://www.botswanatourism.co.bw/botswanatourismboard.php [Accessed 15 June 2014]

Buckley, R. 2012. Sustainable tourism: research and reality. *Annals of Tourism Research*. 31(2): 528-546.

Buhalis, D & Costa C. 2006. *Tourism management dynamics, trends, management and Tools*. Elsevier Butterworth. Heinemann.

BuildAbroad.2017.Sustainabletourism.RetrievedFromhttp://buildabroad.org/2017/02/25/sustaianable-tourism [Accessed 5 June 2018].

Carpenter, M, Bauer, T & Erdogan, B. 2012. *Management principles*. v11. Retrieved From: http://2012books.lardbucket.org/ [Accessed 20 June 2016].

Catibog-Sinha, C & Wen, J. 2008. Sustainable tourism planning and management mode; for protected natural areas: Xishuangbanna Biosphere Reserve, South China. *Asia Pacific Journal of Tourism Research*. 13:2, 145-162.

CEBR (Centre for Economics and Business Research). 2014. Understanding the travel and tourism labour market: A report for association of British travel agents.

CECNETWORK.2002.Retrievedfrom:www.studycanada.ca/english/enzine_canada_tourism_sustainable.html[Accessed 26 July 2017]

Chandralal, L & Valenzuela, F. 2013. Exploring memorable tourism experiences: antecedents and behavioural outcomes. *Journal of Economics, Business Management*, 1:2.

Chumbe Island, 2017. Retrieved From: <u>http://www.chumbeisland.com/</u> [Accessed 20 March 2016] Clean Botswana, 2012. *Top Sustainable Companies*. Volume 1.

Collins Dictionary, 2019. *Definition of 'tourism'*. Retrieved From: https://www.collinsdictionary.com/dictionary/english/tourism [Accessed 9 June 2019]

Conradie, N. 2010. International market potential of Avi-tourism in South Africa. MComm Dissertation. *Pretoria: University of South Africa*.

Cooper, D.R & Schindler, A.S. 2008. Business Research Methods. McGraw Hill Higher Education.

Cottrell, S.P & Cutumisu, N. 2006. Sustainable tourism development strategy in WWF Pan Parks: Case of a Swedish and Romanian National Park. *Scandinavian Journal of Hospitality and Tourism*, 6(2).

Crosswater Ecolodge. Nankun Mountain Reserve, Guangdong Province China.

Curtin, R; Presser, S and Singe, E. 2005. Changes in telephone survey non-response over the past quarter century. *Public Opinion Quarterly*, 69(1): 87-98.

Dabphet, S., 2012. The key stakeholders in the implementation of sustainable tourism development in two rural towns of Thailand. *In the International Conference on Tourism, Transport and Logistics challenges and opportunities of increasing global connectivity, Paris.* Retrieved From: http://www. ijbts-journal. com/images/main_1366796758/0029-siripen. Pdf. [Accessed 18 June 2017].

Dawson, C. 2009. Introduction to research methods: A practical guide to anyone undertaking a research proposal. 4th Ed. British Cataloguing in Data.

Deale, C, S. 2013. Focusing on hospitality, tourism, and travel. The Journal of Sustainable Education.

Dean, King & Bauer. 2002. Evaluating natural attractions for tourism. *Annals of Tourism Research*, 29(2): 422-438.

Deere. N. J. 2011. Exploitation or conservation? Can the hunting tourism industry in Africa be sustainable? *Environment: Science and Policy for Sustainable Development*, 53(4), 20-32.

Denscombe, M. 2007. *The Good Research Guide: For Small-Scale Social Research Projects*. 3rd Ed, Maidenhead. Open University Press.

Department of Wildlife and National Parks. 2013.retrieved from http://www.cbd.int/doc/world/bw/bw-nbsap-powpa-en.pdf

Department of Wildlife and National Parks. 2015. Retrieved from <u>http://www.mewt.gov.bw</u> [Accessed 13 January 2015].

Dictionaries, C., 2009. Collins English Dictionary. HarperCollins Publishers.

Dr Malra, R. 2015. Environmental impact of tourism: case study of Mussoorie. *Zenith International Journal of Multi-disciplinary research*, 5(1) ISSN22312-5780.

Drexhage, J & Murphy D. (2010). Sustainable Development: From Brundtland to Rio 2012. Background.

Du Plessis, L. 2010. *Tourists' perceptions of tourism impacts on the environment: The case of South African National Parks*. M Comm Dissertation. Potchefstroom: North-West University.

Dumbrăveanu, D. 2004. Principles and practices of sustainable tourism planning. *Partial publication in Strategia De Ecotourism a Romanei: Cadru Theoretic De Dezvoltare.*

Duval, M & Smith, B. 2013. Rock art tourism in the Ukhahlamba / Drakensberg world heritage site: Obstacles to the development of sustainable tourism.

Dwyer, T & Faux, V. 2010. Triple bottom line reporting of tourism organisations to support sustainable development. Goodfellow Publishers Limited, Woodeaton, Oxford.
Eagles, P.F.J, Bowman, M.E & Tao, C.T. 2001. Guidelines for tourism in parks and protected areas of East Asia. *IUCN. The World Conservation Union*.

Ecotourism Kenya .2015. Sustainable tourism practises in Kenya. Naturals, Issue 6.

Education Bureau, 2013. Introduction to tourism. Hong Kong.

Emas, R. 2015. The concept of sustainable development: Definition and defining principles. Retrieved from:<u>https://sustaiunabledevelopment.un.org/content/documents/5839gsdr%202015_sd_concept_de</u> finition_rev_pdf. [Accessed 10 July 2016].

Enea, C., Enea, C & Grigorescu G. 2012. Management of the tourism sector in Targu Jui. Constantin Brancusi *University of Targu-Jui*, Eroilor Blvd.

Engelbrecht, W.H. 2011. Critical success factors for managing the visitor experience at the Kruger National Park. Mcomm Dissertation. Potchefstroom: *North-West University*.

Erdogan, N. & Tosun, C. (2009). Environmental performance of tourism accommodations in the protected areas: case of Goreme Historical National Park. *International Journal of Hospitality Management*, 28(3): 406-414.

Esmaeilifar, R, Mirzaei, N.F & Shafiei, M. W. M. 2015. Green building innovations are a competitive advantage for hotels in tourism industry. World applied sciences journal. 33(4):651-658.

Esmaeilifar, R, Mirzaei, N.F & Shafiei, M. W. M. 2015. Green building innovations are a competitive advantage for hotels in tourism industry. *World Applied Sciences Journal*, 33(4):651-658.

Fletcher, J., Fyall, A., Gilbreth, D. & Wanhill, S. 2013. *Principles and practices*. 5th Edition, Pearson Education Limited. UK.

Fraser Island Barges. 2017. Kingfisher Bay Resort. Retrieved from: http://www.fraserislandferry.com.au/fraser-island-accommodation/kingfisher-bay-resort.html Accessed 10 June 2017.

Freeman, R.E., 1984. Stakeholder management: framework and philosophy. Pitman, Mansfield, MA.

Freytag, A. & Vietze, C. 2013. Can nature promote development? The role of sustainable tourism for economic growth. *Journal of Environmental Economics and Policy*, 2(1):16-44

Ghobadi, G. J & Verdian, M.S. 2016. The environmental effects of tourism development in Noushahr. *Open Journal of Ecology*, (6): 529-536.

Ghodeswa, B.M., 2013. Stakeholder participation approach to ecotourism in India. In *International Conference on Tourism, Transport and Logistics (ICTTL 2013)* (Pp. 14-16).

Giovanni, E & Fabietti, G. 2014. What is sustainability? A review of the concept and its applications.

Springer. Retrieved from: http://www.springer.com/978-3-319-02167-6 [Accessed 18 June 2016].

Gisolf, M. n.d. *Tourism Theories*. Retrieved from: www.tourismtheories.org/? page id=172 [Accessed 15 May 2015].

Global Sustainable Tourism Criteria (GSTC), 2015. Accessed Online 15 May 2015. www.gstcouncil.org/sustainable-tourism-gstc-criteria/criteria-for-destinations.html.

Global Sustainable Tourism Criteria (GSTC), 2015. Retrieved from: www.gstcouncil.org/sustainable-tourism-gstc-criteria/criteria-for-destinations.html [Accessed 15 May 2015].

Goeldner, C.R & Ritchie, J.R.B. 2003. *Tourism: Principles, Practices, Philosophies*. Library of Congress Cataloguing-In-Publication Data.

Gossling, S., Peeter, P., Michael Hall, C., Jean Paul, C., Dubois, G., Lehmann, L.V & Scott, D. 2012. Tourism and water use: Supply, demand and security- An international review. Tourism management, 33(1):1-15. Retrieved from: http://www.studycanada.ca/english/enzine_canada_tourism_sustainable.html [Accessed 26 July 2017].

http://www.academia.edu/538132/Tourism_and_water_use_Supply_demand_and_security_____An_international_review [Accessed 15 august 2018].

Green Hotelier, 2017. Retrieved from: <u>http://green.hotelscombined.com/gyh-best-practices.php</u> [Accessed 25 February 2017].

Griffin, R.W. 2014. Fundamentals of management. 7th Edition. Cengage Learning.

Grundey, D. 2008. Managing tourism in Lithuania: Dream or reality. *Baltic Journal on Sustainability*, 14(2):118-129.

Gustul, D. 2011. Strategic analysis of domestic tourism development in Ukraine.

Hall, M.C, Gossling, G & Scott. D. 2015. The Routledge handbook of tourism and sustainability. *Taylor and Francis*.

Harrison, P.A. 2011. Impact of tourism on agriculture in the Okavango Delta. *Journal of Sustainable Tourism*.

Hatcher, J. 2013. Masai Mara it won't be long, before it's gone. *The Guardian*. Retrieved from: <u>https://www.theguardian.com/travel/2013/aug/23/masai-mara-tourism-politics</u> [Accessed 13 June 2018].

Henry, I.P. & Jackson. 1996. Sustainability of management processes and tourism products and contexts. *Journal of Sustainable Tourism*.4(1):17-28.

Hospitality International Labour Organisation (Hilo), 2010. Sustainable tourism and social dialogue.Retrievedfrom:http//:nscopolteksby.ac.id/ebook/files/ebook/hospitality/international%20labour%20organisation%20(2010)/5%20-%20sustaianble%20tourism%20and social%20dialogue.pdf [Accessed 23 May 2018].

Iied, D.R & Khaya, P.U. n.d. Pro-Poor tourism: Harnessing the world's largest industry for the world's poor. Retrieved from: <u>http://pubs.iied.org/pdfs/11007iied.pdf</u>. [Accessed 18 February 2016].

ILO (International Labour Organisation). 2016. Retrieved from : http://www.ilo.org/global/about-the-idroom/news/wcms_480824/lang--en/index.htm.

ISciences. 2012. Road to Rio+20. UN Conference of Sustainable Development 2012. Retrieved from: https://www.slideshare.net/ISciences/road-to-rio20-un-conference-on-sustainable-development-2012/4-Background_Timeline_19722012_1972_1992 [Accessed 15 October 2018].

Jin, S & Lui, T. 2017. Study on tourist carrying capacity of sustainable tourism by taking Qingliang Mountain in the South Eastern China as an example. *International Symposium on Resources Exploitation and Environmental Science*.

Johnston, C.S. 2014. Towards a theory of sustainability, sustainable development and sustainable tourism: Beijing's hutong neighbourhoods and sustainable tourism, *Journal of Sustainable Tourism*, 22(2):195-213

Jovicic, D.Z. 2014. Key issues in implementation of sustainable tourism. *Current Issues in Tourism Letter*.17(4):297-302.

Jumia Travel. 2018. GGR. Retrieved from: http://travel.jumia.com/en-gb/destinations/gaborone-game-reserve-10018454 [Accessed 10 October 2018].

Kafle, N. 2014. *Nature-based tourism and visitor experiences in Chitwan National Park*. Lapland University of Applied Sciences.

Kapan, K., 2016. Development in Lake Salda and its environs. *Global Issues and Trends in Tourism*, p.700.

Kaunda, K.K.S., Matlhaku, K., Mapolelo, M.M & Mokgosi, J. 2011. Shoot Production by Acacia Tortilis Under Different Browsing Regimes in South East Botswana. *The African Journal of Plant Science and Biotechnology*. Global Science Books.

Keitumetse, S. 2011. Sustainable Development and Cultural Heritage Management in Botswana: Towards Sustainable Communities. *Sustainable Development*, 19(1): 49-59.

Kepe, 2001. *Tourism, protected areas and development in South Africa: views of visitors to Mkambati Nature Reserve.* South African Journal of Wildlife Research, 31(3&4):155-159 Khairat, G. & Maher, Z. 2010. Integrating Sustainability into Tour Operator Business: An Innovative Approach in Sustainable Tourism.

Kibert, C.J., 2016. Sustainable construction: green building design and delivery. John Wiley & Sons.

Klarin, T. 2018. The concept of sustainable development: from its beginning to contemporary issues. *Zagreb International Review of Economics & Business*, 21(1), 67-94.

Kumar, P. 2010. Marketing for Hospitality and Tourism Services. Tata McGraw Hill.

Kumar, R. 2005. Research Methodology; a step by step guide for beginners. 5th Edition. Pearson education. Australia

Kurt, D. n.d. *Introduction to Management and Leadership Concepts, Principles and Practices*. Jones and Bartlett Learning.

Lal Mukherjee, Abir (2013): Impact of tourism in coastal areas: need of sustainable tourism strategy. Retrieved from: http://www.coastalwiki.org/wiki/impact_of_tourism_in_coastal_areas:_need_of_sustainable_touris m_strategy [Accessed 20 March 2016].

Landorf, C. 2009. Managing for sustainable tourism: a review of six world heritage sites. *Journal of Sustainable Tourism*, 17(1):53-70.

Lee, J., Hsu, L. J, Han, H & Kim, Y. 2010. Understanding how customers view green hotels: how a hotel's green image can influence behavioural intentions. *Journal of Sustainable Tourism*, 18(7):901-914.

Leechor, C. n.d. *Developing tourism in Botswana: progress and challenges*. World Bank-Botswana Institute for Development Policy Analysis (BIDPA). Botswana Export Diversification Study.

Leedy, P.D. & Ormrod, J.E. 2010. *Practical research: planning and design*. 9th Ed. Boston: Pearson Education International.

Leung, Y., Spenceley, A., Hvenegaard, G & Buckley, R. 2014. *visitor management in protected areas, guidelines for sustainability*. IUCN Park Congress.

Lootah, Y. 2018. *Waste management in Dubai sustainable tourism*. Government of Dubai. Tourism Development and Investment, 19(29-30).

Machnik, A. 2013. Nature-based tourism as an introduction to ecotourism experience - A new approach. *Journal of Tourism Challenges and Trends*. Vi (1): 75-96.

MadikweGameReserve.Retrievedfrom:http://www.madikwegamereserve.com [Accessed 23 October 2013].Retrievedfrom:

Magobo, A. 2011. *The growth of the accommodation sector in post-independence Malawi*. School of Tourism and Hospitality. Johannesburg. South Africa.

Main, R.D. 2017. Bolivian Park declared one of the most diverse place on earth. Retrieved from: www.livescience.com/23144-bolivian-park-most-diverse.html [Accessed 15April 2018].

Makochekanwa, A. 2013. An analysis of tourism contribution to economic growth in SADC countries. *Botswana Journal of Economics*. 11(15):42-56.

Manjunatha.N.D.PilotStudy.Retrievedfrom:uni-mysore.ac.in/courseworklisc/pdf/ppt/manjunatha%20sr.ppt[Accessed 28 February 2016].

Maungasame. K & McKercher. 2014. The challenge of implementing sustainable tourism policy: a 360degree assessment of Thailand's,''7 greens, sustainable tourism policy''. *Journal of Sustainable Tourism*, 1 (22).

Maxim, C.2015. Drivers of success in implementing sustainable tourism policies in urban areas. *Tourism Planning and Development*, 12(1): 37-47.

Mbaiwa, J. E. 2005. The socio-cultural impacts of tourism development in the Okavango delta, Botswana. *Journal of Tourism and Cultural Change*, 2(3):163-185, doi: 10.1080/1766820508668662.

Mbaiwa, J.E. & Stronza, A.L. 2010. Effects of tourism development on rural livelihood in Okavango delta, Botswana. *Journal of Sustainable Tourism*, 18(5):635-656.

Mbaiwa, J.E. 2003. The socio-economic and environmental impacts of tourism development on the Okavango delta, north-western Botswana. *Journal of Arid Environments*, (54) 447–467.

McCool, S & Moisey, R. 2001. *Tourism, recreational and sustainability linking culture and environment.* Cabi Publishing. New York.

Mensah, I. 2013. Hotel energy efficiency towards sustainable tourism. *Journal of Hotel and Business Management*. 3:11.

Metsahallitus Parks and Wildlife Finland. 2016. *Principles of sustainable tourism: National Parks, Nature Sites, Historic Sites, and World Heritage Sites.* UNESCO World Heritage in Finland. Retrieved from:

Metsahallitus. 2018. *National parks in Finland*. Metsahallitus. Retrieved from <u>https://julkaisut.metsa.fi/assets/pdf/lp/Esitteet/principles-of-sustainable-tourism.pdf</u> [Accessed 10 June 2018].

Miller, G. and Twining-Ward, L., 2006. Monitoring as an approach to sustainable tourism. *Tourism management dynamics: Trends, management, and tools*. Heinemann, pp.51-57.

Mitchel, R, Woliscroft, B & Higham, J.E, S. 2013. Applying sustainability in national parks management: balancing public and private interests using a sustainable market orientation model. *Journal of Sustainable Tourism*, 21(5):695-715.

Mokolodi Wildlife Foundation Annual Report. 2012. Retrieved from: <u>http://www.mokolodi.com</u> [Accessed 23 October 13].

Mokolodi Wildlife Foundation Annual Report. 2015. Retrieved from: <u>http://www.mokolodi.com</u> [Accessed 15 July17].

Moore, S. A, Rodge, K & Taplin, R.2015. Moving beyond visitor satisfaction to loyalty in naturebased tourism: A review and research agenda. *Current Issues in Tourism* .18(7): 667-683.

Morse, J. and Richards, L., 2002. The integrity of qualitative research. *Morse J, Richards L. Read me first for a user's guide to qualitative method.* California: Sage, (23-41).

Morupisi, P & Mokgalo, L. 2017. Domestic tourism challenges in Botswana: A stakeholder's perspective. Cogent Social Sciences, (3):1298171.

Mouton, J. 2004. *How to succeed in your masters and doctoral studies. A South African guide and resource book.* Van Schaik.

Mowforth, M & Munt, I. 2016. *Tourism and sustainability: Development, globalisation and new tourism in third world*. 4th Edition. Routledge.

Mthembu, M.B.J. 2012. Rural tourism development: A viable formula for poverty alleviation. *Inkanyiso: Journal of Human and Social Science*. 4(1):63-74.

Mycoo, M. 2006. Sustainable tourism using regulation, market mechanisms and green certification: A case study of Barbados. *Journal of Sustainable Tourism*, 14(5):489-511.

Mykletun, R.J, Bartkeviciute, M. & Puchkova, Y. 2014. Green meetings- Do they matter to their closest stakeholders? *Scandinavian Journal of Hospitality and Tourism*. 14(3), 211-233.

Nastase, C, Scutariu, L, Chaşovschi, C. 2013. *Educating and informing tourism consumers in the context of sustainable development*. "Ştefan Cel Mare" University, Suceava, Romania.

Neuman, W. 2007. *Basics of social research; Qualitative and quantitative approaches*. 2nd Ed. Boston; London: Pearson, Ally and Bacon.

Neuman, W.L., 2006. Qualitative and quantitative research designs. *Social Research Methods*, 6th Ed. Pearson, Toronto, 149-178.

Newsome, D, Moore, S.A & Dowling R.K. 2013. Natural area tourism: Ecology, impacts and management. *Aspects of Tourism*.

Norton, B.G., 2005. *Sustainability: A philosophy of adaptive ecosystem management*. University of Chicago Press.

Oian, H., Fredman, P., Sandell, K., Saeporsdottir, A., Tryvainen, L & Jensen, F.S. 2018. Tourism, nature, sustainability: A review of policy instruments in the Nordic countries. *Nordic Council of Ministers*.

Okello, M.M. & Yenan, S. 2009. Tourist satisfaction in relation to attractions and implications for conservation in the protected areas of the Northern Circuit, Tanzania. *Journal of Sustainable Tourism*, 17(5):605-625.

O'Neill, F., Barnard, S. and Lee, D., 2004. *Best practice and interpretation in tourist/wildlife encounters: A wild dolphin swim tour example.*

Page, S. J. & Connell, J. 2009. *Tourism A Modern Synthesis*. 3rd Ed. South-Western Cengage Learning.

Page, S.J. 2015. Tourism Management. South-Western Cengage Learning.

Pal, K. N.D. Management concepts and organizational behaviour. Retrieved from: www.ddegjust.ac.in/studymaterial/mcom/mc-101.pdf [Accessed 20 June 2016].

Park, D & Yoon, Y. 2011. Developing sustainable rural tourism evaluation indicators. *International Journal of Tourism Research*, 13(5):401-415.

ParksAustralia,2015.KakaduNationalPark.Accessedonline01/03/2015http://www.environment.gov.au/topics/national-parks/kakadu-national-park01/03/201501/03/2015

Parks Canada. n.d. Retrieved from: http://www.tourismvi.ca/wp-content/uploads/2014/01/ctc-sustainabletourism.pdf [Accessed 01 July 2017].

Parsa, H.G. and Narapareddy, V.V. eds., 2015. *Sustainability, Social Responsibility, and Innovations in the Hospitality Industry*. CRC Press.

Pastor, C. 2012. Bolivian Ecolodges lead the way for sustainable tourism. 2018 Conservation International Retrieved from: Bolivian-ecolodges-lead-the-way-for-sustainable-tourism [Accessed 28 June 2018]

Pereira, E.M. and Mykletun, R.J., 2012. Guides as contributors to sustainable tourism? A case study from the Amazon. *Scandinavian Journal of Hospitality and Tourism*, *12*(1), 74-94.

Petrovic, M. D & Markovic, J.J. 2013. Sustainable tourism as a part of comprehensive environmental monitoring: A study of Serbia.

Plummer, R. & Fennell, D.A. 2009. Managing protected areas for sustainable tourism: prospectus for adaptive co-management. *Journal of Sustainable Tourism*, 17(2):149-168.

Pratt, L., Riveria, L & Bien, A. 2011. Tourism investing in energy and resource efficiency. *United Nations Environment Programme*.

Prayag, G., Dookhony-Ramphul, K. & Maryeven, M. 2010. Hotel development and tourism impact in Mauritius: hoteliers' perceptive of sustainable tourism. *Development Southern Africa*, 27(5):697-712.

Raderbauer, M. 2011. Importance of sustainable business practices in the Viennese accommodation industry. *University of Exeiter*.

Rainforest Alliance, n.d. *Guide for Sustainable tourism best practices*. Retrieved from: https://www.rainforest-alliance.org/business/tourism/documents/tourism_practices_guide.pdf

Ramsar Convention & UNWTO, 2012. Destination wetlands: Supporting sustainable tourism. 2012. *Convention on wetlands, Gland, Switzerland, & World Tourism Organization* (UNWTO), Madrid, Spain.

Ranchader, L.U & Probstl-Haider, U. 2014. Green meetings: Eco-Certification of sustainable tourism event in conference and business tourism. *Transaction on Ecology and The Environment*. (87):212-131.

Responsible Tourism Tanzania. 2013. Retrieved from: http://www.rttz.org

Rittichainuwat, B. & Mair, J., 2012, July. An exploratory study of attendee perceptions of green meetings. In *Journal of Convention & Event Tourism*, 13(30):147-158. Taylor & Francis Group.

Rosen, M. 2009. Energy sustainability: A pragmatic approach and illustrations. *Sustainability*, *1*: 55-80. doi:10.3390/su1010055 Retrieved from: https://res.mdpi.com/sustainability/sustainability-01-

00055/article_deploy/sustainability-01-00055.pdf?filename=&attachment=1 [Accessed 15 June 2018].

Ruhanen, n.d. Strategic planning for local tourist destinations: An analysis of tourism plans.

Safari Patrol. 2010. *Botswana*. Retrieved from: http://www.safaripatrol.com/botswana.shtml/ [Accessed 20 July17].

Saunders, M., Lewis, P. & Thornhill, A. 2007. Research methods for business students. *Pearson Education Limited*.

Sautter, T.E. & Leistern B. 1999. Managing stakeholders: A tourism planning model. *Annals of Tourism Research*, 26(2), 312-328.

Schloegel, C. 2007. Sustainable tourism: Sustaining biodiversity? *Journal of Sustainable Forestry*, 25(3/4):247-264.

Scott, A & Hunter C. 2008. Measuring Responsibility: An Appraisal of a Scottish National Parks Sustainable Tourism Indicators. *Journal of Sustainable Tourism*, 16(3): 276-297.

Scott, D. 2011a. Why sustainable tourism must address climate change. *Journal of Sustainable Tourism*, 19(1):17-34.

Scott, S. 2011b. The greening of South African hotels: An exploratory analysis, *School of Tourism and Hospitality*. Johannesburg. South Africa.

Seghezzo, L. 2009. The Five Dimensions of Sustainability. Environmental Politics. 18:4,539-556.

Sharma, D. K, Behl, R.K, Sindhu, N & Kumar, K. n.d. New Vistas in renewable energy. *Renewable Energy Sources and their Applications* 52-59.

Shrestha, P. 2014. Visitor Experiences in Ghandruk Village, Nepal. Lapland University of Applied Sciences.

Silva, C., Kastenholz, E & Abrantes, J. 2013. Place attachment, destination image and impacts of tourism in mountain destination. *Anatolia: An International Journal of Tourism and Hospitality Research*, 2(1): 17-29.

SOST (Spotlight on Sustainable Tourism). 2013. Best practises in sustainable tourism. Issue 7.

Spenceley, A. 2008. Requirements for sustainable nature-based tourism in trans frontier conservation areas: A Southern African Delphi Consultation. *Tourism Geographies: An International Journal of Tourism Space, Place and Environment*, 10(3):285-311.

Spenceley, A., Rey De Assis H & Shurland D. n.d. *A regional sustainable tourism situational analysis: Southern Africa*. Retrieved from: http://www.unep.org/resourceefficiency/tourism. [Accessed 17 June 2014].

Spier Hotel. n.d. Spier Hotel. Stellenbosch. Western Cape. South Africa.

SSTDI (Society for Sustainable Tourism and Development Inclusive). 2013. Green Meetings. Retrieved from: http://sstdi.files.wordpress.com/2013/01/green meetings.jpg [Accessed 28 May 2018].

Stoddard, J. E, Pollard, C. E & Evans, M.N. 2012. Triple bottom line: A framework for sustainable tourism development. *International Journal of Hospitality and Tourism Administration*, 13(3): 233-258.

Stone, L.S, Stone. M.T & Mbaiwa, J.E. 2017. Tourism in Botswana in the last 50 years: A review. A special issue on environment, tourism and contemporary socio-economic issues in the Okavango Delta and others. *Botswana Notes and Records*, :(49).

Stone, L.S. & Stone, T.M. 2017.Domestic tourism in Botswana: an examination of nature -based tourism constraints. *Botswana journal of Business*, 10:(1),97-116.

Stone, M.T. 2013. Protected areas, tourism and rural community livelihoods in Botswana. Arizona State University.

Sustainable Tourism for Development Guidebook. 2013. Enhancing capacities for Sustainable Tourism for development in developing countries. UNWTO. Retrieved from: http://whc.unesco.org/sustainabletourismtoolkit/sites/default/files/13.%20UNWTO%20%282013%2 9%20Sustainable%20Tourism%20for%20Development%20Guidebook.pdf [Accessed 13 June 2018].

Swarbrooke, J.2009. *The development and management of visitor attractions*. 2nd Ed, Butterworth-Heinemann.

TIES (The International Ecotourism Society). 2017. Retrieved from: www.ecotourism.org/kenya [Accessed 5 June 2017].

Tongco, M.D.C. 2007. Purposive sampling as a tool for informant selection. *Journal of Plant, People and Applied Research.*

Tonge, J., Moore, S., Hockings, M., Worboys, G & Bridle K. 2005. Developing industry for the sustainable management of visitor use of protected areas in Australia. *Sustainable Tourism Private Limited*.

Tourism and Transport Australia, 2004. Steps to sustainable tourism. *Department of Environment and Heritage*. Australia.

Tourism Review, 2014. Chinese Crosswater Ecolodge and Spa. Retrieved from: www.tourismreview.com/travel-tourism_magazine-china-crosswaters-ecolodge-amp-spa-is-built - in-the-middle -of-nature-article2536 [Accessed 3 June 17].

Travel Alberta. 2017. Canadian Rockies. Retrieved from: www.travelalberta.com/us/places/to-go/canadian-rockies [Accessed 20 July 17].

TripAdvisor,2017.GaboroneDam.Retrievedfrom:https://www.tripadvisor.com/attractions_g293767_activities_c57-+11_gaborone_south_east_district_html. [Accessed 05 June 2017].

Tshipala & Coetzee. 2012. A sustainable adventure tourism development framework for Thateondo. *Journal of Tourism Hospitality*.

Twinning-Ward, L. 2015. Sustainable Travel CEO: How tourism industry does better. Retrieved from: http://www.greenbiz.com/article/tourism-industry-does-better-doing-good [Accessed 15 February 2016].

UNEP (United Nations Education Programme) & UNWTO (United Nations World Tourism Organisation).2005. *Making Tourism More Sustainable - A Guide for Policy Makers*. Paris and Madrid. UNEP and UNWTO. Retrieved from: <u>http://sdt.unwto.org/content/about-us-5</u> [Accessed 8 June 2019].

UNESCO (United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation). 2015. Dja Faunal Reserve. Retrieved from: http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/407 [Accessed 17 June 2015].

UNESCO (United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation). 2016.

United Nations. 2018. Total Population by Countries. United Nations Population Division. Retrieved from: http://worldpopulationreviews.com/countries/ [Accessed 15 October 2018].

UNWTO (United Nations World Tourism Organisation). 2007. Sustainable Tourism Indicators and Destination Management. Department of Tourism. Philippines.

UNWTO (United Nations World Tourism Organisation). 2013a. Accessed Online 08 June 2014.

UNWTO (United Nations World Tourism Organisation). 2013b. Tourism and water. World tourism day. 27 September 2013. UN Water.

UNWTO (United Nations World Tourism Organisation). 2018. *Total population by country 2018*. UN population division. Retrieved from: <u>http://worldpopulationreview.com/countries/</u> [Accessed 18 December 2018]

Van Der Merwe, P. & Saayman, M., 2008. Travel motivations of tourists visiting Kruger National Park. *Koedoe*, *50*(1), 154-159.

Vanderpost, C. 2007. Protected Areas in Ngamiland, Botswana: Investigating Options for The Conservation Development Through Human Footprint Mapping. *International Journal of Environmental Sciences*. 64(5):555-570.

WCED (World Commission on Environment and Development). 1987. *The Bruntland Report- Our Common Future*. Oxford. Oxford University Press.

Wei, F. 2013. Compendium of best practices in sustainable tourism. United Nations Department ofEconomicandSocialAffairs.Retrievedfrom:https://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/content/documents/3322Compendium%20of%20Best%20Practices%20in%20Sustainable%20Tourism%20-%20F [Accessed 15 October 2018].

Wiki Travel, 2017. Botswana. Retrieved from: wikitravel.org/en/botswana [Accessed 13 July 2017].

Woken, M.D. n.d. Planning Research Papers. Centre for teaching and learning, University of Illinois at Springfield. Brookens Library.

WTTC (World Travel and Tourism Council), 2018. Travel & Tourism Economic Impact 2018 Botswana.

Yin, R.K. 2003. *Case study research: Design and methods*. 3rd Edition. Library of Congress Cataloguing- In-Publication Data.

Yuksel, A., Yuksel, F & Culha, O. 2012. Ministers' Statements: A Policy Implementation Instrument for Sustainable Tourism? *Journal of Sustainable Tourism*, 20(4):513-532.

Zaei, M.E. 2013. The impacts of tourism industry on host community. European Journal of Tourism Hospitality and Research, 1(2): 12-2.

Zaidan, E & Kovac, J.F. 2017. Residents attitudes towards tourists and tourism growth. a case study from the Middle East, Dubai in the United Arab Emirates. *European Journal of Sustainable Development*. 6(1):291-307.

Zeppel, H. 2015. *Indicators and benchmarking sustainable tourism development*. The Routledge Handbook of Tourism and Sustainability. British Library Cataloguing Publication Data.

Zikmund, W.G., Babin, B.J, Carr, J.C & Griffin, M. 2013. *Business Research Methods*. 9th Ed; South Western Cengage Learning; Canada.

Zhang, Z., Liu, L & Li, X. 2008. Ecotourism and nature reserve sustainability in environmentally fragile poor areas: The case of Ordos Relict Gull Reserve in China. *Sustainability: Science, Practice and Policy*. 4(2): 12-22.

APPENDIX 1-INTERVIEW SCHEDULE

Interview Schedule

Addressed to: Managers of Game Reserves/Nature Reserves (GR/NR)

Topic/Aim: The management of sustainable action plans at selected nature-based attractions in Botswana.

Section 1: Profile of NBA- General Information

- 1.1 NBA's name: _____
- 1.2 Respondent job position in company:
- 1.3 Type of attraction (Please select your answer with an 'x'):

Game reserve	Nature reserve	National park	
Other (specify)			

- 1.3 Location of attraction:
- 1.4 Year attraction opened: _____
- 1.5 Attraction status (Please select your answer with an 'x'):

Public	Private	Public & Private	
Other (specify)			

1.0								
1.7	Faciliti	es/Ameni	ities:					
1.8	Service	es off	ered:					
<u>SEC</u> 2.1 S	<u>CTION 2</u> Sustainat economic without c	: Fundam pility is the consider compromi	tentals of sust the synergist trations at nat taking the cap	stainability and ic process with ture-based attripability of the	d sustainable thich aims to left nactions such the future stake	tourism balance hat the nolders	<u>.</u> the social, en present stakeho to fulfil the sa	vironmental and olders are content me requirements
<u>SEC</u> 2.1 \$ 	CTION 2 Sustainal economic without c using the	: Fundam bility is the consider compromissame res	tentals of sust the synergist trations at nat asing the cap ources. Yes	stainability and ic process with ture-based attri- pability of the or No	d sustainable thich aims to left thich aims to left thick aims such the future stake	tourism balance hat the nolders	<u>the social</u> , en present stakeho to fulfil the sa	vironmental and olders are content me requirements
<u>SEC</u> 2.1 \$ 	CTION 2 Sustainate Conomic without c using the How	:: Fundam pility is the consider compromises same res	tourism	stainability and stainability and stainability and stainability and states with the state of the states activities activi	d sustainable thich aims to lead thich aims to lead thich aims to lead thick are such the future stake the future stake the st	tourism balance hat the holders	the social, en present stakeho to fulfil the sa sustainable	vironmental and olders are content me requirements development?

2.3 Why is it important to adopt and implement the principles of sustainable tourism in nature-based attractions?

2.4 How important are the principles of sustainable tourism to the game reserve/nature reserve? Provide more pleasant tourist experiences

Preserve ecology and biodiversity

Engage in holistic and strategic planning

Protect culture, human heritage and biodiversity

Ensure continuous long-term growth and development

Reduce negative impacts of tourism

Encourage local control and wellbeing

Focus on local, national and regional economic growth

Educate and inform tourist

2.5 Which are the key stakeholders for the successful management of the NBAs?

2.6 How is it fruitful to cooperate with stakeholders in education about sustainability?

SECTION 3: Management of Sustainable Action Plans (SAPs)

(The respondent is asked to substantiate his/her answers on the lines below each question)

3.1 SAPs are defined as "activities of tourism businesses formally selected for a regular use to measure changes and issues critical for tourism development and planning as well as promote the maintenance and protection of tourism resources". Yes or No. Explain your choice.

3.2 How are you managing (plan, implement, co-ordinate, control, and evaluate) SAPs in the following nine fields?

3.2.1 Water

Plan / design

Implement (put into practice)

Coordinate / direct

Control / monitor

Evaluate / assess the performance (against specific metrics / measures)

_
3.2.1.1 What specific SAPs are you implementing for in the field of water?

3.2.1.2 What measures are you using in evaluating of the GR / NR's performance in the field of water?

3.2.2 Energy

Are you managing (plan, implement, co-ordinate, control, and evaluate) SAPs in the field of energy? Plan / design

Implement (put into practice) Coordinate / direct

Control / monitor	
Evaluate / assess the performance (against specific metrics / measures)	

3.2.2.1 What specific SAPs are you implementing in the field of energy?

3.2.2.2 What measures are you using in evaluating the GR / NR's performance in the field of energy?

3.2.3 Waste

Are you managing (plan, implement, co-ordinate, control, and evaluate) SAPs in the field of waste?

Plan / design

Implement (put into practice)

Coordinate / direct

Control / monitor

Evaluate / assess the performance (against specific metrics / measures)

3.2.3.1 What specific SAPs are you implementing in the field of waste?

3.2.3.2 What measures are you using in evaluating of the GR / NR's performance in the field of waste?

3.2.4 Green Buildings

Are you managing (plan, implement, co-ordinate, control, and evaluate) SAPs in the field of buildings / construction?

Plan / design

Implement (put into practice)

Coordinate / direct

Control / monitor

Evaluate / assess the performance (against specific metrics / measures)

3.2.4.1 What specific SAPs are you implementing in the field of buildings / construction?

3.2.4.2 What measures are you using in evaluating of the GR / NR's performance in the field of buildings / construction?

Are you managing (plan, implement, co-ordinate, control, and evaluate) SAPs in the field of meetings and similar events?

Plan / design

Implement (put into practice)

Coordinate / direct

Control / monitor

Evaluate / assess the performance (against specific metrics / measures)

3.2.5.1 What specific SAPs are you implementing in the field of meetings and similar events?

3.2.5.2 What measures are you using in evaluating of the GR / NR's performance in the field of water?



Coordinate / direct

Control / monitor

Evaluate / assess the performance (against specific metrics / measures)

3.2.6.1 What specific SAPs are you implementing in the field of pollution?

3.2.6.2 What measures are you using in evaluating of the GR / NR's performance in the field of pollution?

3.2.7 Information and education of tourists

Are you managing (plan, implement, co-ordinate, control, and evaluate) SAPs in the field of information and education of tourists?

Plan / design

Implement (put into practice)

Coordinate / direct

Control / monitor

Evaluate / assess the performance (against specific metrics / measures)

3.2.7.1 What specific SAPs are you implementing in the field of information and education of tourists?

3.2.7.2 What measures are you using in evaluating of the GR / NR's performance in the field of information and education of tourists?

3.2.8 Employee engagement

Are you managing (plan, implement, co-ordinate, control, and evaluate) SAPs in the field employee engagement?

Plan / design

Implement (put into practice)

_

Coordinate / direct

Control / monitor

Evaluate / assess the performance (against specific metrics / measures)

3.2.8.1 What specific SAPs are you implementing in the field of employee engagement?

3.2.8.2 What measures are you using in evaluating of the GR / NR's performance in the field of employee engagement?

3.2.9 Procurement and purchasing

Are you managing (plan, implement, co-ordinate, control, and evaluate) SAPs in the field of procurement?

Plan / design

Implement (put into practice)

Coordinate / direct

Control / monitor

_

_

_

_

Evaluate / assess the performance (against specific metrics / measures)

3.2.9.1 What specific SAPs are you implementing in the field of procurement?

3.2.9.2 What measures are you using in evaluating of the GR / NR's performance in the field of procurement?

_

_

3.3 How do you assess the performance of your GR / NR in the field of SAPs?

3.4 What measures / indicators are you using?

SECTION 4: Comments / suggestions

Do you wish to add any further comment or suggestions? Please feel free to do so

SECTION 5: Some personal information

5.1 Age Less than 30____31-40____41-50___More than 51____

5.2 Highest Education level

Thank you for your time and cooperation.

Interview Schedule Addressed To: Workers of Game Reserves/Nature Reserves (GR/NR)

Topic: The management of sustainable action plans at selected nature-based attractions in Botswana.

Section 1: Profile of NBA - General Information

1.2 NBA's name: ______

1.2 Respondent job position in company:

SECTION 2: Fundamentals of sustainability and sustainable tourism.

2.5 Sustainability is the synergistic process which aims to balance the social, environmental and economic considerations at nature-based attractions such that the present stakeholders are content without compromising the capability of the future stakeholders to fulfil the same requirements using the same resources. Yes or no

2.6 How	should	tourism	activities	contribute	to	sustainable	development?

2.7 Why is it important to adopt and implement the principles of sustainable tourism in nature-based attractions?

2.8 How important are the principles of sustainable tourism to the game reserve/nature reserve? Provide more pleasant tourist experiences

Preserve ecology and biodiversity

Engage in holistic and strategic planning

Protect culture, human heritage and biodiversity

Ensure continuous long-term growth and development

Reduce negative impacts of tourism

Encourage local control and wellbeing

Focus on local, national and regional economic growth

Educate and inform tourist

SECTION 3: Implementation of Sustainable Action Plans (SAPs)

(The respondent is asked to substantiate his/her answers on the lines below each question)

3.1 SAPs are defined as "activities of tourism businesses formally selected for a regular use to measure changes and issues critical for tourism development and planning as well as promote the maintenance and protection of tourism resources". Yes or no. explain your choice. 3.2 How are you implementing SAPs in the following nine fields?

3.2.1 Water

What specific SAPs are you implementing for in the field of water?

What measures are you using in evaluating of the GR / NR's performance in the field of water?

3.2.2 Energy

What specific SAPs are you implementing for in the field of energy?

3.2.2.1 What measures are you using in evaluating of the GR / NR's performance in the field of energy?

3.2.3 Waste

What specific SAPs are you implementing for in the field of waste?

3.2.3.1 What measures are you using in evaluating of the GR / NR's performance in the field of waste?

_

3.2.4 Green Buildings

What specific SAPs are you implementing for in the field of buildings / construction?

3.2.4.1 What measures are you using in evaluating of the GR / NR's performance in the field of buildings / construction?

3.2.5 Green Meetings

What specific SAPs are you implementing for in the field of meetings and similar events?

3.2.5.1 What measures are you using in evaluating of the GR / NR's performance in the field of water?

3.2.6 Pollution

What specific SAPs are you implementing for in the field of pollution?

3.2.6.1 What measures are you using in evaluating of the GR / NR's performance in the field of pollution?

3.2.7 Information and education of tourists

What specific SAPs are you implementing for in the field of information and education of tourists?

3.2.7.1 What measures are you using in evaluating of the GR / NR's performance in the field of information and education of tourists?

3.2.8 Employee engagement

What	specific	SAPs	are	you	implementing	for	in	the	field	of	employee	engagement?
------	----------	------	-----	-----	--------------	-----	----	-----	-------	----	----------	-------------

3.2.8.1 What measures are you using in evaluating of the GR / NR's performance in the field of employee engagement?

3.2.9 Procurement and purchasing

What specific SAPs are you implementing for in the field of procurement?

3.2.9.1 What measures are you using in evaluating of the GR / NR's performance in the field of procurement?

SECTION 4: Comments / suggestions

Do you wish to add any further comment or suggestions? Please feel free to do so

SECTION 5: Some personal information
5.1 AGE ______
5.2 Highest Education level ______
5.3 Professional experience in General (in years) ______
in Tourism industry ______
in NBAs ______

Thank you for your time and cooperation.

APPENDIX 2-LETTER FROM ENGLISH EDITOR



Dr. J. Sibanda (Senior Lecturer: English) School of Education Private Bag X 5008, Kimberley, 8300 North Campus, Chapel Street, Kimberley E-mail: <u>Jabulani Sibanda@spu ac. za</u> jborbut@gmalcom Website: www.spu.ac.za Tel: 27534910142 Cell: 0845282087 26 November 2018

TO WHOM IT MAY CONCERN

I hereby confirm that I have proof read and edited the following Masters Dissertation using Windows 'Tracking' System to reflect my comments and suggested corrections for the author(s) to action:

- Full Name: Thembelihle Nyamandi
- Student Number: 53288734
- Title: The Management of Sustainable Action Plans at Selected Nature-Based Attractions in Botswana.
- Qualification: Master in Commerce (Tourism Management)
- Date: 26 November 2018

Although the greatest care was taken in the editing of this document, the final responsibility for the product rests with the author.

Sincerely

\$85.5-

26.11.2018

SIGNATURE

DATE

APPENDIX 3-ETHICAL CLEARANCE CERTIFICATE
UNISA XXX ETHICS REVIEW COMMITTEE Date: 26/02/2018 Dear Ms T Nyamandi Decision: Ethics Approval from March 2018 to February 2021 Researcher(s): Ms Thembelihle Nyamandi S3288734@mylife.unisa.ac.za +26775387256 Supervisor (s): Prof M Sotiriadis sotirm@unisa.ac.za 012 433 4659 Working title of research: The management of sustainable action plans at selected nature base in Botswana Qualification: Mcom Business Management (Tourism Management) Thank you for the application for research ethics clearance by the Unisa DESTT Committee for the above mentioned research. Ethics approval is granted for The low risk application was expedited by the DESTTL Ethics Review of 26/02/2018 in compliance with the Unisa Policy on Research Ethics and Operating Procedure on Research Ethics Risk Assessment. The decision will b next Committee meeting on 14 March 2018 for ratification				0		of south africa
Date: 26/02/2018 ERC Reference # : 2017, CEMS_ESTIL_018 Dear Ms T Nyamandi Name : Thembelihle Nyama Student #: 53288734 Decision: Ethics Approval from March 2018 to February 2021 Researcher(s): Ms Thembelihle Nyamandi 53288734@mylife.unisa.ac.za +26775387256 Supervisor (s): Prof M Sotiriadis sotirm@unisa.ac.za 012 433 4699 Working title of research: The management of sustainable action plans at selected nature base in Botswana Qualification: Mcom Business Management (Tourism Management) Thank you for the application for research ethics clearance by the Unisa DESTT Committee for the above mentioned research. Ethics approval is granted for The low risk application was expedited by the DESTTL Ethics Review 26/02/2018 in compliance with the Unisa Policy on Research Ethics and Operating Procedure on Research Ethics Risk Assessment. The decision will b			UNISA XXX E	HICS REVIEW CO	MMITTEE	
Dear Ms T Nyamandi Name : Thembelihle Nyama Student #: 53288734 Decision: Ethics Approval from March 2018 to February 2021 Researcher(s): Ms Thembelihle Nyamandi 53288734@mylife.unisa.ac.za +26775387256 Supervisor (s): Prof M Sotiriadis sotirm@unisa.ac.za 012 433 4699 Working title of research: The management of sustainable action plans at selected nature base in Botswana Qualification: Mcom Business Management (Tourism Management) Thank you for the application for research ethics clearance by the Unisa DESTT Committee for the above mentioned research. Ethics approval is granted for The low risk application was expedited by the DESTTL Ethics Review 26/02/2018 in compliance with the Unisa Policy on Research Ethics and Operating Procedure on Research Ethics Risk Assessment. The decision will b next Committee meeting on 14 March 2018 for ratification	D	ate: 26/02/2018		ERC Re 2017	ference # : IEMS_ESTTL_018	
Decision: Ethics Approval from March 2018 to February 2021 Researcher(s): Ms Thembelihle Nyamandi 53288734@mylife.unisa.ac.za +26775387256 Supervisor (s): Prof M Sotiriadis sotirm@unisa.ac.za 012 433 4699 Working title of research: The management of sustainable action plans at selected nature base in Botswana Qualification: Mcom Business Management (Tourism Management) Thank you for the application for research ethics clearance by the Unisa DESTT Committee for the above mentioned research. Ethics approval is granted for The low risk application was expedited by the DESTTL Ethics Review of 26/02/2018 in compliance with the Unisa Policy on Research Ethics and Operating Procedure on Research Ethics Risk Assessment. The decision will be next Committee meeting on 14 March 2018 for ratification	D	ear Ms T Nyamand	li	Name : Studen	Thembelihle Nyamandi t #: 53288734	
Ethics Approval from March 2018 to February 2021 Researcher(s): Ms Thembelihle Nyamandi 53288734@mylife.unisa.ac.za +26775387256 Supervisor (s): Prof M Sotiriadis sotirm@unisa.ac.za 012 433 4699 Working title of research: The management of sustainable action plans at selected nature base in Botswana Qualification: Mcom Business Management (Tourism Management) Thank you for the application for research ethics clearance by the Unisa DESTT Committee for the above mentioned research. Ethics approval is granted for The low risk application was expedited by the DESTTL Ethics Review 26/02/2018 in compliance with the Unisa Policy on Research Ethics and Operating Procedure on Research Ethics Risk Assessment. The decision will b next Committee meeting on 14 March 2018 for ratification	[]	Decision:]		
2018 to February 2021 Researcher(s): Ms Thembelihle Nyamandi 53288734@mylife.unisa.ac.za +26775387256 Supervisor (s): Prof M Sotiriadis sotirm@unisa.ac.za 012 433 4699 Working title of research: The management of sustainable action plans at selected nature base in Botswana Qualification: Mcom Business Management (Tourism Management) Thank you for the application for research ethics clearance by the Unisa DESTT Committee for the above mentioned research. Ethics approval is granted for The low risk application was expedited by the DESTTL Ethics Review 26/02/2018 in compliance with the Unisa Policy on Research Ethics and Operating Procedure on Research Ethics Risk Assessment. The decision will b next Committee meeting on 14 March 2018 for ratification		Ethics Approval f	rom March			
Researcher(s): Ms Thembelihle Nyamandi 53288734@mylife.unisa.ac.za +26775387256 Supervisor (s): Prof M Sotiriadis sotirm@unisa.ac.za 012 433 4699 Working title of research: The management of sustainable action plans at selected nature base in Botswana Qualification: Mcom Business Management (Tourism Management) Thank you for the application for research ethics clearance by the Unisa DESTT Committee for the above mentioned research. Ethics approval is granted for The low risk application was expedited by the DESTTL Ethics Review 26/02/2018 in compliance with the Unisa Policy on Research Ethics and Operating Procedure on Research Ethics Risk Assessment. The decision will b next Committee meeting on 14 March 2018 for ratification	:	2018 to February	2021			
Researcher(s): Ms Thembelihle Nyamandi 53288734@mylife.unisa.ac.za +26775387256 Supervisor (s): Prof M Sotiriadis sotirm@unisa.ac.za 012 433 4699 Working title of research: The management of sustainable action plans at selected nature base in Botswana Qualification: Mcom Business Management (Tourism Management) Thank you for the application for research ethics clearance by the Unisa DESTT Committee for the above mentioned research. Ethics approval is granted for The low risk application was expedited by the DESTTL Ethics Review in 26/02/2018 in compliance with the Unisa Policy on Research Ethics and Operating Procedure on Research Ethics Risk Assessment. The decision will be next Committee meeting on 14 March 2018 for ratification						
Supervisor (s): Prof M Sotiriadis sotirm@unisa.ac.za 012 433 4699 Working title of research: The management of sustainable action plans at selected nature base in Botswana Qualification: Mcom Business Management (Tourism Management) Thank you for the application for research ethics clearance by the Unisa DESTT Committee for the above mentioned research. Ethics approval is granted for The low risk application was expedited by the DESTTL Ethics Review of 26/02/2018 in compliance with the Unisa Policy on Research Ethics and Operating Procedure on Research Ethics Risk Assessment. The decision will be next Committee meeting on 14 March 2018 for ratification	R	esearcher(s):	Ms Thembelihle N 53288734@mylif +26775387256	yamandi e.unisa.ac.za		
Working title of research: The management of sustainable action plans at selected nature base in Botswana Qualification: Mcom Business Management (Tourism Management) Thank you for the application for research ethics clearance by the Unisa DESTT Committee for the above mentioned research. Ethics approval is granted for The low risk application was expedited by the DESTTL Ethics Review of 26/02/2018 in compliance with the Unisa Policy on Research Ethics and Operating Procedure on Research Ethics Risk Assessment. The decision will be next Committee meeting on 14 March 2018 for ratification	S	upervisor (s):	Prof M Sotiriadis sotirm@unisa.ac. 012 433 4699	za		
The management of sustainable action plans at selected nature base in Botswana Qualification: Mcom Business Management (Tourism Management) Thank you for the application for research ethics clearance by the Unisa DESTT Committee for the above mentioned research. Ethics approval is granted for The low risk application was expedited by the DESTTL Ethics Review 126/02/2018 in compliance with the Unisa Policy on Research Ethics and Operating Procedure on Research Ethics Risk Assessment. The decision will be next Committee meeting on 14 March 2018 for ratification	Г		Work	ng title of research	1	
Qualification: Mcom Business Management (Tourism Management) Thank you for the application for research ethics clearance by the Unisa DESTT Committee for the above mentioned research. Ethics approval is granted for The low risk application was expedited by the DESTTL Ethics Review 26/02/2018 in compliance with the Unisa Policy on Research Ethics and Operating Procedure on Research Ethics Risk Assessment. The decision will be next Committee meeting on 14 March 2018 for ratification	1	The management	t of sustainable a	ction plans at selec in Botswana	ted nature based a	ttraction
Thank you for the application for research ethics clearance by the Unisa DESTT Committee for the above mentioned research. Ethics approval is granted for The low risk application was expedited by the DESTTL Ethics Review 26/02/2018 in compliance with the Unisa Policy on Research Ethics and Operating Procedure on Research Ethics Risk Assessment. The decision will be next Committee meeting on 14 March 2018 for ratification	Q	ualification: Mcor	m Business Manag	ment (Tourism Mana	igement)	
Committee for the above mentioned research. Ethics approval is granted for The low risk application was expedited by the DESTTL Ethics Review 26/02/2018 in compliance with the Unisa Policy on Research Ethics and Operating Procedure on Research Ethics Risk Assessment. The decision will be next Committee meeting on 14 March 2018 for ratification	 TI	nank you for the ap	plication for resea	ch ethics clearance b	y the Unisa DESTTL Et	hics Revie
The low risk application was expedited by the DESTTL Ethics Review 26/02/2018 in compliance with the Unisa Policy on Research Ethics and Operating Procedure on Research Ethics Risk Assessment. The decision will be next Committee meeting on 14 March 2018 for ratification	Ci	ommittee for the a	bove mentioned re	search. Ethics appro	val is granted for 3 ye	ears.
26/02/2018 in compliance with the Unisa Policy on Research Ethics and Operating Procedure on Research Ethics Risk Assessment. The decision will be next Committee meeting on 14 March 2018 for ratification	[The low risk app	lication was exp	dited by the DEST	L Ethics Review Com	nmittee o
Operating Procedure on Research Ethics Risk Assessment. The decision will be next Committee meeting on 14 March 2018 for ratification	2	26/02/2018 in con	npliance with the	Unisa Policy on Res	earch Ethics and the	Standar
next Committee meeting on 14 March 2018 for ratification	(Operating Procedur	e on Research Eth	cs Risk Assessment.	The decision will be ta	bled at th
next commuted meeting on 14 match 2010 for fathcation.	t	next Committee me	eeting on 14 March	2018 for ratification		
The proposed research may now commence with the provisions that:	1	The proposed resea	arch may now com	mence with the provi	sions that:	
1. The researcher(s) will ensure that the research project adheres to t		1. The researc	her(s) will ensure	that the research pro	oject adheres to the v	alues an
principles expressed in the UNISA Policy on Research Ethics.		principles ex	kpressed in the UN	SA Policy on Researc	ch Ethics.	

- Any adverse circumstance arising in the undertaking of the research project that is relevant to the ethicality of the study should be communicated in writing to the XXX Committee.
- The researcher(s) will conduct the study according to the methods and procedures set out in the approved application.
- 4. Any changes that can affect the study-related risks for the research participants, particularly in terms of assurances made with regards to the protection of participants' privacy and the confidentiality of the data, should be reported to the Committee in writing, accompanied by a progress report.
- 5. The researcher will ensure that the research project adheres to any applicable national legislation, professional codes of conduct, institutional guidelines and scientific standards relevant to the specific field of study. Adherence to the following South African legislation is important, if applicable: Protection of Personal Information Act, no 4 of 2013; Children's act no 38 of 2005 and the National Health Act, no 61 of 2003.
- 6. Only de-identified research data may be used for secondary research purposes in future on condition that the research objectives are similar to those of the original research. Secondary use of identifiable human research data require additional ethics clearance.
- No field work activities may continue after the expiry date (xxx). Submission of a completed research ethics progress report will constitute an application for renewal of Ethics Research Committee approval.

Note:

The reference number **2018_CEMS_ESTTL_018** should be clearly indicated on all forms of communication with the intended research participants, as well as with the Committee. Yours sincerely,

Signature Chair of DESTTL-RERC: Mrs C Poole E-mail: <u>esttl-rerc@unisa.ac.za</u> Tel: (012) 433 4668

ature

Executive Dean: Prof MT Mogale E-mail: mogalmt@unisa.ac.za Tel: (012) 429 4419



University of South Africa Preller Street, Muckleneuk Ridge, City of Tshwane PO Box 392 UNISA 0003 South Africa Telephone: +27 12 429 3111 Facsimile: +27 12 429 4150 www.unisa.ac.za