

University of Montana

## ScholarWorks at University of Montana

---

Graduate Student Theses, Dissertations, &  
Professional Papers

Graduate School

---

2017

# FOSTERING INTERNATIONAL MINDEDNESS IN INTERNATIONAL BACCALAUREATE CLASSROOMS: A CASE STUDY OF TWO TEACHERS

Madiha Syeda  
*University of Montana, Missoula*

Follow this and additional works at: <https://scholarworks.umt.edu/etd>



Part of the Curriculum and Instruction Commons

## Let us know how access to this document benefits you.

---

### Recommended Citation

Syeda, Madiha, "FOSTERING INTERNATIONAL MINDEDNESS IN INTERNATIONAL BACCALAUREATE CLASSROOMS: A CASE STUDY OF TWO TEACHERS" (2017). *Graduate Student Theses, Dissertations, & Professional Papers*. 10939.

<https://scholarworks.umt.edu/etd/10939>

This Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by the Graduate School at ScholarWorks at University of Montana. It has been accepted for inclusion in Graduate Student Theses, Dissertations, & Professional Papers by an authorized administrator of ScholarWorks at University of Montana. For more information, please contact [scholarworks@mso.umt.edu](mailto:scholarworks@mso.umt.edu).

FOSTERING INTERNATIONAL MINDEDNESS IN INTERNATIONAL  
BACCALAUREATE CLASSROOMS: A CASE STUDY OF TWO TEACHERS

By

MADIHA MOHSIN SYEDA

Master of Arts in English Literature, The University of Punjab, Lahore, Pakistan, 1997

Thesis

presented in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of

Master of Arts  
in Education

The University of Montana  
Missoula, MT

Official Graduation Date: May 2017

Approved by:

Scott Whittenburg, Dean of the Graduate School  
Graduate School

Lucila T. Rudge, Chair  
Department of Teaching and Learning

Betsy W. Bach  
Department of Communication Studies

Morgan Alwell  
Department of Curriculum and Instruction

## Table of Contents

Chapter One: Introduction.....	1
Chapter Two: Literature Review.....	7
Chapter Three: Methods.....	23
Chapter Four: Findings.....	40
Chapter Five: Results and Discussions.....	59
References.....	75
Appendix A: Teachers’ Interview protocol.....	80
Appendix B: Verbal Explanation.....	82
Appendix C: IB Learner Profile.....	83

# Acknowledgement

This dedication will not be able to fully convey my gratitude to those who helped me to complete this work. I could not imagine to complete it without the help of those who encouraged me throughout the project. Their assistance meant a lot to me. I cannot list everyone, but a few deserve a special thanks.

I will never be able to repay my advisor and chair of committee, Lucila T. Rudge for her help. She offered her unconditional support throughout this brief journey. I will always be grateful for her driving me to reach my potential. In addition, I am grateful to my committee members, Dr. Betsy Bach and Dr. Alwell for their guidance and instructive comments. I have a special gratitude for Dr. Bach. She offered me support and intriguing insights that benefitted this work and future projects that spring out from it. Her ideas and suggestions were always helpful and my thesis is better for her presence in my committee.

I must also express my gratitude for the participants of this study. If I did not have their assistance, this study would be impossible. Lastly, I need to thank my children for their understanding and support. Without them being understanding of my study related obligations, I could have not perused this study. I am thankful to my sisters' optimism too. They encouraged me to move on despite my frequent disappointments. I have a special word for my friend, Leslie Lauren. She was that invisible guiding angel that patiently listened to my ideas and offered feedback. I will always be grateful for her.

Abstract

Chairperson: Lucila T. Rudge

International Mindedness is central to the mission of International Baccalaureate (IB) education and may be defined as a frame of mind enabling a person to get rid of prejudices of self and embrace a greater sense of the other. Through this study, I analyzed how International Mindedness (IM) is taught in a high school in the Western U.S. and prepared some suggestions for teachers in my country of origin (Pakistan). In this research, I studied three attributes of IM: multilingualism, intercultural understanding and global engagement. Studying IM was significant because it may address the problem of closed-mindedness in Pakistan and may cultivate in learners the ability to belong to the whole world and respect the whole of humanity as they respect themselves. In my study, I have followed qualitative case study design to understand how two IB teachers incorporated the idea of IM in their pedagogy. Qualitative case study design was an appropriate method for this study because it permitted an in-depth focus on issues to understand participants' perspectives. Participants were selected based on purposeful, convenient sampling in order to gather data from teachers in an IB school. Thematic analysis was done with the qualitative data. Deductive data analysis was followed to identify an educational process and attribute meaning to the texts. Results were generated after triangulation of data gathered through observations, semi-structured interviews, and teaching materials from teachers A and B. Through the findings, it is highlighted that teachers consider global engagement, intercultural understanding, and multilingualism closely associated with fostering IM in their classes.

*Key Words: qualitative research, International Mindedness, pedagogical implication*

## Chapter One

### **Introduction**

The UN general assembly adopted the Sustainable Development Goals (SDG) in 2015 (United Nations, 2015). Out of those, goal number 4 is related to education. This goal stresses the importance of inclusive and equitable quality education and promotion of lifelong learning opportunities for all (Fosu, 2013). This is a considerable advancement in the goals of education with the emphasis that education is a never-ending process to which people of all ages and backgrounds should have access. There is also a focus on universal and global education for all.

In accordance with the United Nations goals, it is required by the constitution of Pakistan (my country of origin) that free and mandatory education be provided to all children between the ages of 5 and 16. The constitution says “The state shall provide free and compulsory education to all children of the age of five to sixteen years....” (Constitution of Pakistan, 1973, as amended by the Parliament from time to time). As mandated by constitutional requirements and international commitments, the education system in Pakistan conducts continuous reforms in terms of curriculum revisions, regional disparities in educational standards among provinces, gender discrimination, and poverty reduction, as a result of improved educational standards and for the realization of quality education for all.

During my program of studies in the U.S., I have been thinking about what I can contribute to improve the education system globally and specifically in Pakistan. I want to mitigate some issues that arise due to the lack of resources, like the small number of colleges in the area, economic pressures, and expensive books; advocate for an appropriate approach to education; and work to remove obstacles to improving literacy levels. Seeking suggestions for how to improve the quality of education, I joined the International Baccalaureate (IB) Educator

Certificate in Teaching and Learning Program at the University of Montana as part of my Master's Degree plan. The program introduced me to new horizons of pedagogy and uncovered a ray of hope, and perhaps a possible solution to address my concerns with respect to learning.

The International Baccalaureate Organization (IBO) describes the International Baccalaureate Program:

The International Baccalaureate offers a unique educational experience to students from age 3 to 19 through international education programs that challenge and motivate students, academically and personally. IB programs inspire a lifelong quest for learning, infused with enthusiasm and empathy. In addition to supporting cognitive development, IB programs address social, emotional, and physical well-being and encourage students to become active, compassionate, lifelong learners. (International Baccalaureate Organization [IBO], 2009b)

The International Baccalaureate program integrates four programs: the Primary Years Program (PYP), the Middle Years Program (MYP), the Diploma Program (DP), and the Career-related Program (CP). I am getting my IB certification in the Diploma Program. IBDP is a two-year educational program primarily aimed at students aged 16–19. The program provides an internationally accepted qualification for entry into higher education and is recognized by many universities worldwide. The IBDP combines the strengths of a traditional liberal arts curriculum with the important additional features and a unique approach to the teaching and learning (IBO, 2009).

One of the constructs at the heart of the IB programs is the concept of International Mindedness (IM). IM may be defined as a frame of mind or a philosophy for living. This philosophy for living or frame of mind “enables and empowers persons with the ability to

perceive the world in a manner that disregards the ‘self’ and its prejudices while accepting a greater sense of the ‘other’” (Singh & Jing, 2013). Education for IM is essentially social in character and, therefore, provides a basis for collaborative action which is directed at sharable present knowledge and the generation of new knowledge. The idea of knowledge refers to the concepts, metaphors and images that students are capable of approaching and reworking into valuable educational resources (Singh & Jing, 2013).

There is an impression in education sectors around the world that IB programs have grown only from western intellectual traditions. However, controverting this impression, the IB acknowledges that non-Western knowledge, which encompasses a wealth of concepts, metaphors and images, has been neither engaged in the task of internationalizing contemporary education nor sufficiently elaborated upon to be educationally useful (IBO, 2009b, p.2).

In Pakistan, students come to college after passing a 10<sup>th</sup> grade national examination. Before going for a University degree, they are required to spend two years in college and pass the Intermediate Examination. The Intermediate degree does not qualify them for prestigious jobs but allows them to enter a University to study for higher education or join some professional institute for a technical diploma. Students are mandated to take two yearly national exams for their two-year Intermediate degree. Through my experience as a teacher in Pakistan, I noticed that almost half of my students did not continue their education after they took the first national examination in grade 11. I discovered there were many reasons why they did not pursue their studies, like economic pressure, gender discrimination for female students, small numbers of colleges in the area, old curricula in use, and lack of choices for subject selection. One further issue, especially relevant to this study, was closed-mindedness on the part of the students. Many students drop out at the Intermediate level because they find the courses uninteresting or, as I see



it, because they are being influenced by manipulated religious doctrines which result in a perception that curricula are too focused on the Western educational system. Students have no idea that the world existing outside their regional and religious boundaries can be good, and if they do have some such idea, they are not inclined to explore it. Their thoughts and feelings are small and subject to a lack of exposure to the broader world of which they are also a part. Some religious teachings make students look at their learning as an outcome that will eventually lead them towards irreligiousness. There is a need to bring students out of their stereotypes, region, country and continent. Students need to look, see, and find for themselves that they are not living on an island that encapsulates and separates them from the surrounding world. There is a need for them to develop global-mindedness and to think of the whole world, all religions, and, above all, all human beings as a part of the world in which they are living. They should be able to learn to respect others in order to have respect for themselves. I believe it is necessary to develop an internationally-minded attitude to embrace modern educational challenges.

A 21st-century world, and especially the situation of Pakistan, as discussed above, mandates a reorientation of international-mindedness. Education systems should embrace an international approach to cover the whole world. This means using education to the level required by those who approve instruction (teachers, communities, and legislators) and enhancing its utility for all parts of the world, including developing countries in South Asia like Pakistan. I believe IB education can offer a possible solution because it embraces a wealth of knowledge practices. Its diversity and flexibility serve to redeem educational procedures and make up for deficiencies.

Considering the needs of students in Pakistan and my desire to prepare teachers to teach students to see themselves as a part of the international learning community, I decided to conduct

research in a high school in the Western region of the United States. My goal was to observe and investigate how IBDP teachers incorporate the concept of IM in their pedagogy. My explicit purpose was to learn how teachers foster IM in their classrooms, so that I could bring this knowledge into my own classrooms in Pakistan. I selected two IBDP teachers to conduct my research, an English Language A teacher and a Theory of Knowledge teacher (TOK). The Language A course introduces students to the analysis of authentic literary texts and translated texts from other languages to enhance understanding of global cultures and society. Theory of Knowledge asks students to reflect on the nature of knowledge, and on how we know what we claim to know. English Language A and TOK are both part of the International Baccalaureate Diploma Program core, and are mandatory for all students.

In this research, I have used qualitative case study methodology (Merriam, 1998). Data for the study are drawn from two classrooms where IBDP has been successfully taught for two years. I have two research questions in my study:

Research Question 1: How do IBDP teachers teaching Theory of Knowledge and English Language in the Diploma Program conceptualize and foster International Mindedness in their classroom?

and

Research Question 2: How does the IB coordinator conceptualize IM?

Data for this study include: teaching materials from both classrooms, non-participant observer field notes from 110 hours of observation, and interviews with both teachers and the IB coordinator of the high school. The conceptualization of IM developed by Castro, Lundgren and Wooden (2013) informed the data collection and data analysis. Castro, Lundgren and Wooden

define IM as conceptualization of three attributes: multilingualism, intercultural understanding and global engagement.

In conclusion, through this case study research, I have investigated how teachers conceptualize IM, blend the concept into their regular pedagogical practices, and foster it in their classrooms. The knowledge gained from this study will inform teachers in general and my own educational practices in Pakistan.

## Chapter Two

### **Literature Review**

A literature review should set the broad context for the study and have theoretical and methodological sophistication. Research must be cumulative to be meaningful and beneficial (Boote & Beile, 2005). The literature review of this study introduces the concept of International mindedness, its emergence in pedagogy and variety of literature that covers the topic under study.

International mindedness embraces an active, intercultural engagement with local and global issues and a self-reflexive awareness about other societies and customs. International Mindedness is being used as a cross curricular perspective in International Baccalaureate (IB) school programmes across the world (Sriprakash, Singh & Jing, 2014). International Baccalaureate Organization (n. d), defines that education for international mindedness aims to develop global citizens who, “recognizing their common humanity and shared guardianship of the planet, help to create a better and more peaceful world” (IBO, 2008, p. 5). This chapter summarizes current literature on International Mindedness (IM) in International Baccalaureate (IB) education, creates a framework for the study and covers an extensive variety of literature on the concept of IM as it exists in IB and in general education.

#### **The International Baccalaureate Program**

The International Baccalaureate Organization (IBO) offers to a worldwide community of schools educational programs known as International Baccalaureate Education (IBE). IBE teaches students to become inquiring, knowledgeable and caring young people who help to create a better and more peaceful world through intercultural understanding and respect. The IB program is divided in three phases of schooling: a Primary Year Program (PYP), a Middle Year

Program (MYP) and a Diploma Program (DP). The International Baccalaureate Diploma Program (IBDP) is a two-year educational program aimed at students between the ages of 16 and 19. The program provides an internationally accepted qualification for entry into higher education.

The International Baccalaureate Organization (n. d.) describes that diploma program curriculum sets out the requirements for study of the DP as following:

IB students are required to study a curriculum that is made up of the DP core and six subject groups. Consisting of three required components, the DP core aims to broaden students' educational experience and challenge them to apply their knowledge and skills. The three core elements are:

- Theory of knowledge**, in which students reflect on the nature of knowledge and on how we know what we claim to know.
- The extended essay**, which is an independent, self-directed piece of research, finishing with a 4,000-word paper.
- Creativity, activity, service**, in which students complete a project related to those three concepts.

The six subject groups, each incorporating different courses, are:

- Studies in language and literature
- Language acquisition
- Individuals and societies
- Sciences
- Mathematics
- The arts

Students can choose full admission in IBDP, and if they want to study any subject from IBDP, they can make a selection of the subject. However, only those that enroll full-time in IB courses will earn the full IB diploma; other students who have taken IB courses will still graduate from their original high school.

### **Definition of International Mindedness**

At the heart of IB education is the concept of International Mindedness (IM). IM is an overarching concept that covers all content areas in IB at all levels. IM is the ability to think from different perspectives and an attitude for being open-minded, empathetic, and reflective. These are the attributes everyone with an IB education should possess. As such, IM is the key to having a better understanding and appreciation of one another. IM is a tool for individual gain, an orientation towards shared understanding, and a way to push the boundaries of human imagination and encounters for change (Sriprakash, Singh & Qing, 2014).

### **The International Baccalaureate Organization (IBO) View of IM**

The IBO has a mission statement for its partner schools. In this mission statement, the IBO defines IB education as embracing a vision of educating young people to make the world a better place. The IB learner profile contains expected outcomes of IB education and outlines the attributes that enable IB students to engage with this vision. In IB, this philosophy is most commonly referred to as international mindedness (Davy, 2011, p.3). The International Baccalaureate Organization (n. d.) specifically states, “Education for international mindedness values the world as the broadest context for learning, develops conceptual understanding across a range of subjects and offers opportunities to inquire, act and reflect” (p.6). The stated mission of the IBO is to develop inquiring, knowledgeable and caring young people who help to create a better and more peaceful world through intercultural understanding and respect for the whole

world community (IBO, 2009c). IB's definition tries to promote "intercultural understanding and respect, not as an alternative to a sense of cultural and national identity, but as an essential part of life in the 21st century".

One of the unique components of the IB program is the Learner Profile (Singh & Jing 2013). This profile translates the IB mission statement into a set of attributes that express the values and mission of IB. The 10 attributes focus on student outcomes, and include descriptions that promote students as inquirers, knowledgeable persons, thinkers, communicators, risk-takers, and people who are principled, open-minded, caring, balanced, and reflective. The IBO characterizes the learner profile as a "portrait of a lifelong learner who engages in active, responsible citizenship" (Sriprakash, Singh & Jing, 2014). In connection to the application of learner's profile attributes, I believe internationally-minded people are those who "possess an ecological world view, believe in the unity of humankind and the interdependence of humanity, support universal human rights, have loyalties that extend beyond national borders, and are futurists" (Hett, 1993, p. 9).

Bunnell discusses the status of international education in IB (2008b). International education through international schools is still relatively under-researched. The rapid growth in the last four decades both in size and diversity of these schools has added to the emergence of an unconnected industry of education. This aspect of international education now seems to be undergoing a 'second phase' which is characterized by a desire to exercise more guidance. He also fleshes out the framework for conceptualizing the multifaceted nature and ambition of this 'second phase' of teaching international mindedness in the schools, and a preliminary stage for the future evaluation of its overall efficacy.

Bullock (2011) provides a comprehensive analysis of the theories that frame teaching and

learning in an IB program. The IB learner profile provides an important indication of the characteristics that internationally-minded individuals are likely to possess. Further analysis of the documents attaches those values, attitudes, knowledge, and understanding that are manifested in multilingualism, intercultural understanding and global engagement. An internationally-minded learner is above all a competent communicator, open-minded and knowledgeable (Bullock 2011, p.15). Bullock also discusses the theoretical background that supports the IB learner profile. According to him, theory supports all teaching and learning practices in IB. For developing internationally-minded learners, teachers are required to cultivate multilingualism, intercultural understanding and global engagement. Learning this helps learners to be open-minded to national and international diversity.

### **The IB Learner Profile and the IBO**

The IB learner profile is linked with the core element of IM, and embedded in the approaches to teaching and learning. It is also related to one's ability to see oneself as a responsible member of the community where one lives as a global citizen (Hill, 2007). Global citizenship is linked with an awareness that the world is much larger than the community in which we live. The concept of IM is also attached to respect and understanding for the whole of humanity. It improves self image by developing the concept of global nationality (IBO, 2013).

Castro (2015) reflects on IM as a core component of IB used across the whole range of local and global contexts (2015). He engages in a critical analysis of IB official documents and offers a literature review of concepts related to this term and shows important differences in the interpretations of IM. Assuming that it is impossible to universalize and generalize the concept of IM, he emphasizes the need for the re-interpretation of the concept at a local level. However,



he concludes that promotion of dialogue and reflection are helpful in promotion of IM in the schools.

Wells (2011) offers an analytical overview of the way that the IBDP promotes international education and IM through the IB Learner Profile. Through his study, however, he notices the insufficiency of topics related to the teaching and learning of international education in IB texts. By analyzing the IB documents and guidelines for incorporating IM in IB pedagogy, he concludes that IB is in the process of providing support for schools in their transfer of the Learner Profile and its related concepts; his research is an attempt to facilitate this task.

### **Definitions of IM in General Literature**

Researchers discuss the concept of IM as an important feature to be learned in life and a mandatory part of learning in schools. Walker (2010) sees borders weakening and the world changing rapidly. He notices the flux in the world population and, focusing on international migration, concludes that now it is common for people to have multiple citizenships (Walker 2010: 69). Globalization has become a central contemporary issue and it will define the world inherited by the next generation (Suarez-Orozco & Qin-Hilliard, 2004, p. ix).

As globalization redefines the world, educators are responding to these new realities:

The scope of Education for Global Citizenship is wider than a single scheme of work or subject. It is more than simply the international scale in Citizenship, or teaching about a distant locality in Geography. It is relevant to all areas of the curriculum, all abilities and all age ranges. Ideally it encompasses the whole school — for it is a perspective on the world shared within an institution, and is explicit not only in what is taught and learned in the classroom, but in the school's ethos (Oxfam, 2006, p. 2).

IM in education is a multi-faceted concept not easily defined. Some researchers define the concept of IM as synonymous with another concept, global/world mindedness. Sampson and Smith (1957) introduce both international mindedness and world mindedness, and they identify these terms as separate entities suggesting different perceptions in education. They explain the difference between the two concepts as orientation or frame of reference, separating it from interests in international relations.

Being internationally minded is an attitude and a way of thinking and being. It is accepting others' ways of thinking and doing as as valid as one's own. Global mindedness is a worldview in which one sees oneself as connected to the global community and feels a sense of responsibility to its members. This commitment is reflected in the individual's attitudes, beliefs, and behaviors. (Hett, 1991, p. 1)

IM and global mindedness are regarded as separate concepts in some works, but Stagg abridges both the concepts and considers them interchangeable implying a meaning of having a truly global mindset (Stagg, 2013 as in Gunesch, 2014). Elaborating on the idea of IM, he says that the concept of IM provides the “international community of students, parents, and educators with a much longed-for effort to come to grips with the meaning of having a truly global mindset” (Stagg, 2013, as cited in Gunesch, 2014, p. 250), making both concepts synonymous and interchangeable to embrace a global mindset.

Another view of IM, presented by Haywood (2007) within the field of education, comprises an understanding that people of different backgrounds hold different views, and education should provide opportunities to examine the origins of those beliefs. These opportunities lead to understanding and respecting various viewpoints. According to Haywood, IM has five characteristics that all children need:

- (a) a curiosity and interest in the human and physical geography of earth,
- (b) an openness to different cultural approaches (tolerance),
- (c) a scientific understanding that the earth is valuable and common to everyone,
- (d) awareness that people are interrelated, and
- (e) respect for differing cultural backgrounds.

According to Haywood (2007), cultural exposure during school years and multicultural content are powerful tools in the development of IM (p. 80-82).

### **The Concept of IM Outside the Field of Education**

Outside the field of education, IM is portrayed as a growing inclination towards the importance of diversity, empathy for those who are different, while having pride in one's own identity, "a belief in the value of pluralism, the understanding for balancing interdependence with independence, and an understanding that individuals can change and improve the world by accepting the responsibility to take the action" (Hallinger & Walker, 2012, p. 665). There are many other reasons why the global awareness agenda is important. I believe promotion of tolerance and an appreciation of different beliefs, cultures and backgrounds gives people an understanding of emerging opportunities for potential future leaders.

Considering the evolution of the term in education, a few names emerge pioneering the use of the IM. William James (1910) took an anti-war stance. Mead (1929) coined the words national mindedness and international mindedness and he analyzed James's stance on war. Opposing the war strategy for causing hegemony in the world, Mead developed an approach to oppose war. The approach developed by Mead was the promulgation of the concept of international-mindedness to escape war "or we all shall die" (p. 355). Fischer (2008) analyzed Mead's (1929) conceptions of nationalism and the international mind, and examined how the two

terms rose within discussions among some Anglo-American thinkers. Analyzing Mead, Fischer demonstrated that Mead did not postulate these concepts. He extracted the meaning of these terms from William James' (1910) conversations rather than generating their meaning from his own hypothesizing. Fischer further established that Mead's discussion of internationalism should be read in the historical context of the WWI era (Fischer, 2008).

Sampson and Smith trace the history of IM from the post-World War II period (1957, p. 99). According to them, "world mindedness is a frame of reference, a knowledge about, or interest in international relations" (1957, p. 99). It is important to note that the concept of IM was very familiar to sociologists before it was integrated in education.

Hill (2012) sketched the history of IM starting from the 17<sup>th</sup> century until the present. Through the latter half of the 20<sup>th</sup> century, improvements in communication enlarged the human imagination and people tried to discover everything they could about the whole world (Hill, 2012). From the beginning of the 21<sup>st</sup> century, the internet and free international communication became a reality for the world and necessitated the education of global citizenship (Hill, 2012). The practice of IM was evident through student exchanges across the globe, continuing into the rise of international schools during the first half of the 20<sup>th</sup> century. This was the incentive during the 1960s for the development of the first internationally-minded program to assist those schools: The International Baccalaureate Diploma (Hill, 2012).

The the history of IM demonstrates that the concept of IM evolved as a necessity to make a better world, Kieran James, maintains a counterargument. He explores the rationale, aims, and values supporting "international education" (2005). Highlighting the characteristic features of "world-mindedness" and "international understanding", he studies whether these goals were achieved through the study of international curricula. He further examines the term "international

education” and its field in light of the current, post-9/11 socio-political settings in a number of countries. Conclusively, he maintains that few values adopted in the name of international education were exclusively internationalist in character, or universally accepted. He concludes that the term IM is misleading for advocating all of these values, and that it may, therefore, be reaching the end of its useful life. James’ stance might be correct to some extent when he said that the term IM cannot ensure good teaching of all its professed and acclaimed virtues. However, it may not be right to claim that IM will soon die out as a useless component of the IB curriculum.

Goh (2012) asserts the “inexorable requirement” for intercultural competence in character and citizenship education. He investigates the match between the theory and practice of cultural intelligence and citizenship education and offers instances to show how teachers can teach with cultural intelligence and develop culturally intelligent students who will become multiculturally educated and internationally engaged citizens. He also reflects on teaching practices required to develop culturally competent citizens through education. He maintains that developing multiculturally educated citizens is imperative for the 21<sup>st</sup> century. In connection to Goh’s (2012) study it is important to note that education for IM is the study of issues which have application beyond national borders and to which competencies such as critical thinking and collaboration are applied. This must be done in order to shape attitudes leading to action which will be conducive to intercultural understanding, peaceful co-existence and global sustainable development for the future of the human race.

### **Theoretical Framework**

As discussed earlier, IM is a multi-faceted concept that allows multiple interpretations. For the purpose of this study, I focus on Castro, Lundgren and Wooden’s (2013) definition of IM

and use their conceptualization of IM as the theoretical framework for this research. These scholars define the concept of IM in terms of three attributes: multilingualism, intercultural understanding and global engagement. These core components are closely connected and interrelated. These themes are defined as follows:

### **Multilingualism**

Castro, Lundgren and Wooden describe multilingualism in terms of speaking and learning more than one language, including languages for academic purposes. A learner's mother tongue is considerably important to multilingual abilities, as it is linked to the learner's identity. The mother tongue is also used as a support for learning the second language(s). English as a second language is given importance as a lingua franca of the world and the language of the 21<sup>st</sup> century. A multilingual person is defined as a person who can speak at least two languages (2013, p. 23). The IB defines multilingualism as "a reconfiguration of mindset that takes into account the complex linguistic realities of millions of people in diverse sociocultural contexts" (Language and Learning in IB programmes, as cited in Castro, Lundgren & Wooden, 2013, p. 25).

Multilingualism in terms of one person speaking more than one language is quite common in the world. Language learning is identified as an activity that is "positioned largely outside the learner, as opposed to leading to internal change in perspectives for the learner" (Castro, Lundgren & Wooden, 2013, p. 30). Multilingualism is further linked with plurilingualism, which is connected to the subcategories of personal development, knowledge and competence in several languages, and positive attitude to language plurality. Multicultural citizenship may be connected to equal opportunity, respect for all and commitment to social justice (Castro, Lundgren & Wooden, 2013, p. 30)

The IB documents reflect a recognition that multilingualism is clearly related to one's

identity. The potential of multilingualism is to connect people with other cultures and identities. Learning a second language is a central part of the ability of IB program because IB learners are reflective people who respect others' mother tongues as they respect their own. Furthermore, they are trained to appreciate otherness through language learning. By learning a second language, IB learners are also able to gain deeper understanding of multiple points of view and demonstrate understanding of the concept of culture through comparisons of the culture and study on their own.

Learning a language is one of the best ways of learning to recognize the world and to see how others and otherness inhabit it. It is an education in difference and a step towards global citizenship. It also opens doors to accumulated knowledge and experienced histories and wisdom of other countries, to knowing a variety of languages, perspectives and approaches to the “development of knowledge base about cultural ‘others’, often as representative of broader language/national group” (Castro, Lundgren & Wooden, 2013, p. 30).

### **Intercultural Understanding**

Castro, Lundgren, and Wooden (2013) define intercultural understanding as a “focus on the knowledge, skills and attitudes which a person might have or be able to draw upon in an intercultural encounter” (p. 30). Intercultural understanding is closely linked to language learning, and “developing knowledge of other cultural groups, appreciation of different ways of being and behaving, and developing positive attitudes to others” (Castro, Lundgren & Wooden, 2013, p.6). There is, however, little attention to the questioning of one's own values, or de-centering one's own perspective to learn about other cultures and languages.

The IB documents recognize diversity as a wealth of knowledge and an excellent starting point for developing a transformative critical intercultural approach. Further intercultural

understanding is linked with intercultural competence and intercultural citizenship that is enlarged to connect with the knowledge of self and the other; with interaction; with skills to interpret and relate, discover or interact; with the attitudes of curiosity and openness, readiness to suspend disbeliefs about other cultures and beliefs about one's own; with critical cultural awareness and competent action-taking (Castro, Lundgren & Wooden, 2013, p. 30).

The multilingual and multicultural nature of IB schools is a potential resource for curriculum planning around intercultural awareness and intercultural understanding. Learners can seek motivation from instructional content which has the potential to enable them to develop personal connections with the curriculum.

### **Global Engagement**

Global engagement is conceptualized under the themes of citizenship and global education in a broad sense (Castro, Lundgren & Wooden, 2013, p. 39). The theme of citizenship education contains “the interlinking of local, national, and global aspects of citizenship” (Trotta, Jacott & Lundgren, 2008, as cited in Castro, Lundgren & Wooden, 2013, p. 39). For example, taking responsible decisions concerning immediate society, state and country is a part of citizenship education and taking respectable decisions about the whole world is a part of global education. Global engagement is also described in terms of “undertaking activity outside of schools, in the local community and/or other foreign communities” (Castro, Lundgren & Wooden, 2013, p. 39). Global engagement is not closely linked to multilingualism, but there is some reference to intercultural understanding leading to global citizenship. Global engagement also involves global citizenship that is taking social and moral responsibility for community service not only locally but internationally as well. It is imperative for the students of the 21<sup>st</sup> century to develop an understanding of the interdependence among nations, cultivate positive attitudes towards other



nations, and foster a reflective identification with the world community.

Global engagement is closely linked with the idea of making the world a better place. This idea does not include position-taking in relation to social justice action. IB learners need to know about rights and responsibilities, multiple identities and perspectives, but they are not necessarily expected to be engaged in action. Some areas of study (like science) demonstrate commitment to making a difference outside the school through taking account of ethical issues (Castro, Lundgren & Wooden, 2013, p.58).

### **A Review of Studies Investigating the Promotion of IM in Diploma Programs**

Though much has been said about the concept of IM as it exists in IB and in general literature, very few studies research how the concept can be cultivated across the curriculum. There is very limited published research focusing on the promotion of IM in IBDP. I was able to find just two studies that are similar to my topic of promoting IM in IB schools in the U.S.

In one of the studies, the researcher Gigliotti-Labay (2010) investigates two issues in IB schools: if IB teachers include IM and global themes in their curriculum; and to what extent schools integrate these themes in their school culture. Surveys, interviews, document analysis, and facilitated group discussion compose the data indicating IM. The results of this qualitative study demonstrate that teachers and administrators understand what IM is, but it is only superficially implemented in the schools. The more teaching experience a teacher has, the more understanding of IM the teacher shows. Through an analysis of the IBO documents, the researcher demonstrates that IBO's conceptualization is not thoroughly defined for partner schools and there is little accountability for institutions for implementation of international mindedness. IM appears to be a concept that is not fully developed in the IB program. The researcher suggests IM as a model for global education reform. She further reflects that IM is an

abstract concept in IBO. It is further suggested that IBO should provide a concrete working definition for partner schools and a clear guideline of how to implement IM. There is also a need to develop accountability among member schools to ensure implementation of IM in schools. IM-specific workshops and professional growth opportunities are also required to further teachers' understanding of IM. There is also a need to incorporate religious tolerance and multilingualism in education. Internationalizing teachers' preparation and school environment at the high school level is presented to be of great importance (Gigliotti-Labay, 2010).

In the second piece of research similar to my study, the researchers Lai, Shum and Zhang (2014) examine the enactment of IM in IB Diploma Programs. They study nine Chinese teachers in six IB schools. The research studies the internal challenges (including their educational experience, pedagogical beliefs, and interpretations of the concept of IM in teaching), and external challenges (the curriculum and the teaching contexts) that teachers face while teaching the concept of IM. Teachers and schools utilize several approaches in order to enhance the acknowledged compatibility and application of IM in the curriculum. Strategies include harmonizing educational approaches and curriculum demands, augmenting communication with the school community around IM, and providing school-based on-site training and monitoring. The researchers emphasize the need to take a localized approach which centers on supporting schools and teachers to pinpoint different models and instructions that are appropriate for their particular teaching contexts.

In this study, I investigate the teaching of IM in an IB school. Like the other two studies, I have also observed how teachers teach the concept of IM in their classes. However, I remain non-evaluative in my study. I do not assess the success of their teaching practices. I have made transcriptions to inform how IM could possibly be taught in any area around the world,

especially in Pakistan, my country of origin. As such, my study will offer a contribution to help mediate the lack of research in this area. I address IM as an overarching concept, with no curriculum of its own, which is embedded across all programs in IB education. I consider it as an approach embodying the values of the IB philosophy that can be incorporated across all fields of education. The fostering of IM requires adapting to a great deal that is new. It demands much of teachers' and students' involvement. It is highly encouraged among teachers and schools to integrate an internationally-minded approach in all that they do to develop a future generation that intends to be globally-minded when it comes to solving problems faced by humanity.

### **Summary**

The aim of all IB programs is to develop internationally-minded people who are able to identify common humanity and share guardianship of the planet to help to create a better and more peaceful world (Singh & Jing, 2013). IM is a contested, multi-faceted concept that has varied implications for thinking, being and doing (Sriprakash, Singh & Jing, 2014). Teaching IM to IB students ensures learners are taught to make connections between life in school, life at home, and life in the wider world. Students are able to find for themselves that learning is connected to life, and a strong foundation for future learning is established. IM is fundamental to the character and philosophy of an IB education, focusing on the development of multilingualism, intercultural understanding and global engagement in the classroom and beyond (Castro, Lundgren & Wooden, 2013, p. xi).

## Chapter Three

### **Methods**

In this chapter, I discuss methodology for a single case study, looking at how International Mindedness (IM) is fostered in the school through the perspectives of two teachers and the viewpoint of the IB coordinator regarding teaching of IM in the school as a whole. My study follows recommendations of Merriam (2009), because in her view, the epistemology that should accommodate qualitative case study is constructivism. She argues “the key philosophical assumption upon which all types of qualitative research are based is the view that reality is constructed by individuals interacting with their social worlds” (Merriam, 1998, p. 6). As such, her epistemological philosophy is that reality is constructed by individuals interacting with their social world. Following qualitative research design, this chapter describes the research design, the context of the study, the purpose of the study, the central question, the sample, the participants and settings, and data collection.

### **Purpose of the Study**

My purpose through this research study was to observe how IM was conceptualized by the two teachers and the IB coordinator of the school. My second purpose was to observe how these teachers foster IM in their classrooms while teaching their content area subjects. The research surrounding IM and its related themes was also explored to get a deeper understanding of the concept and its implementation in the classroom. This study will help inform the practices of teaching and learning in Pakistan, my country of origin.

## **Research Questions**

Question 1: How do two IB teachers teaching Theory of Knowledge and English Language in the Diploma Program conceptualize and foster International Mindedness in their classrooms?

Question 2: How does the IB coordinator conceptualize IM?

## **Research Design**

I have followed the recommendations of Merriam (2009) for qualitative case study, namely collection, analysis and interpretation of comprehensive narrative and visual data to gain insights into a particular phenomenon of interest (Mills & Gay, 2015, p. 7). The purpose of qualitative inquiry is to “to probe deeply into the research setting to obtain in-depth understandings about the way things are, why they are that way and how the participants in the context perceive them” (Mills & Gay, 2015, p.13). The qualitative research methods provide an understanding of a setting or activity as viewed from the perspectives of the research participants.

This study was intended to observe an educational phenomenon using case study research design as proposed by Merriam (1998). According to her, “case study is an examination of a specific phenomenon, such as a program, an event, a person, a process, an instruction, an instance from a class or a social group” (p.19). A case study seeks holistic descriptions and explanations. “A case study design is employed to gain an in-depth understanding of the situation and meanings for those involved” (Merriam, 1998, p.19). Yin (2014) observes case study as a design particularly suited to situations where it is impossible to separate the phenomenon’s variables from their context. Aligning with Merriam and Yin, it was important for me not to separate context (a school where IM is a part of the daily teaching routine) in my study

from my inquiry (how IM is taught across content areas). Further discussing the case study questions, Yin (2014) states, “‘how’ and ‘why’ questions are more explanatory and likely to lead to the use of a case study... as the preferred research method” (p.10). Following the epistemology of case study research, my research question focuses on “how” IM is fostered in IB classrooms.

Case study research begins with the identification of a specific case (Yin, 2009). It involves the study of a case within a real-life contemporary context or setting – “a case within a bounded system that is bounded by time and place” (Denzin & Lincoln, 2005, Merriam, 1998, Yin, 2009). The case my study examines involves the intricacies of teaching practices in a high school in the Western U.S.

A case study may be inductive, exploratory and develop theory, or it may be hypothetical and deductive, testing theory based on the fact how a researcher defines a problem. Case study design can be used in either mode of inquiry (Merriam, 1998). Merriam (1998) characterizes case study in terms of three distinctive features: particularistic, descriptive and heuristic. A particularistic case study studies a particular situation, event or phenomenon (p. 29); descriptive study produces rich, “thick” descriptions of the phenomenon under study and heuristic study illumines reader’s understanding of a phenomenon under study. In my study, I have followed Merriam’s descriptive case study design (1998, p.38). Descriptive case study investigates a phenomenon in its real-life context (Merriam, 1998, Yin, 1994). It contains rich, thick descriptions. The “descriptive data is used to develop conceptual categories or ... support theoretical assumptions held before gathering data.” (Merriam, 1998, p. 63). Supporting the qualitative hypothetical-deductive case study research design, Glaser states:

In deductive qualitative research, the analyst first reads the literature of the fullest coverage possible, from which he synthesizes a framework, usually theoretical to study and verify in his research.... He then collects the data according to the concepts of the framework.... Because of his initial scholarship and deductions, his findings are directly woven into the literature of the field (1978, p.31 as in Merriam, 1989, p. 52). Thus references to relevant literature can be placed in the report when describing the problem (Merriam, 1989, p. 197).

For my study, I read the related literature to develop a theoretical framework. I collected data using that theoretical framework as a lens to look at the participants and settings. This enabled me to to blend my observations and analysis with the literature in the field of IM.

### **Context of the Study**

#### **The School**

The context of this case study is Blue Star High School,<sup>1</sup> which is situated in a small city in the Western U.S. According to United States Census Bureau, the city's population is 71,022. The city population is 92.1% White, 5% African American, 2.8% Native American, 1.2% Asian, 0.1% Pacific Islander and 3.35% from other races. The city school district has four high schools. Blue Star High School, founded in 1980, is among the prominent schools in the area with an 82 % graduation rate. The school has a mission to create a positive school climate, promote interdisciplinary learning, explore careers and future opportunities, partner with parents and community, and connect all students to Blue Star High School. Blue Star School has been teaching the IB Program for the last two years.

According to demographics published in the building profile of the school in 2016, the school has a total number of 1,060 students. The student body makeup is 51% male and 49%

---

<sup>1</sup> All names are pseudonyms

female. The majority population of the school is White, that is 87%, and the total minority enrollment is 13%, comprised of 4% Hispanic, 6% American Indian, 2% Asian, and 1% Black or African American. Blue Star High School is 1 of 4 high schools in this Western U.S. School District. 55% of the school population belongs to low income families and qualifies for free and reduced lunch. 16% of the school population has IEPs, with 1% having 504 plans. 2% of the school's students are studying with gifted education plans and 1% are ELL learners.

I gained entry to the school through the principal's permission. Prior to gaining entry to the school, I got a letter of permission from the school principal. A follow-up letter was sent to the related teachers. Before I started my observations, I showed the Institutional Review Board-issued approval to the observed teachers and some articles related to my research topic were handed over to make them familiar with the research topic. I started my observations when I felt they were comfortable with my study. It took me a full month to go through the procedure to enter the school.

Blue Star High School has a 90 minutes block for a single class in each subject on alternate days. On my observation days, I stayed in the school for four and half hours to observe 2 classes, join a one-hour lunch break, and remained for half an hour to discuss the contents the teacher planned to teach in the next class. Seeing my observed teachers doing different school-related work increased my understanding for their perception of professional responsibilities. I was able to notice that while eating their lunch, Ms. Hallmark and Mr. Haroon were constantly engaged with students. Both of them provided extra help to those students who needed it, and counseled those who were having any problems allocating time to studies. I also attended a few staff meetings in the school with them. I made myself a part of the school during my observation period.



## Settings and Participants

Ms. Hallmark teaches IB English to learners for whom English is their first language. Her subject of teaching comprises teaching how language develops in specific contexts, how meaning is determined by context and how people express their identities through language. The course offers a broad range of texts, and students grow to appreciate a language's complexity, wealth and subtleties in a variety of contexts. I selected an IB teacher teaching English, Ms. Hallmark, on purpose. I also teach English, but as a second language. By selecting her to observe, I wanted to give depth to my observations because the courses that I teach in Pakistan are based on teaching a second language through literary texts. This also made my observations more meaningful for me.

I chose the IB subject Theory of Knowledge (TOK) because it is not only a subject but an all-encompassing concept, embracing the whole IB teaching and learning philosophy. TOK is a subject that helps students to think critically and reflect on the nature of knowledge, and on how we know what we claim to know. TOK is part of the IB Diploma Program core, and is mandatory for all students. I observed this class with an intention of finding more instances of teaching about my study topic.

I observed these teachers teaching different subjects to the same level students. The English Language 1A: Language and Literature class had 65 students, out of which 29 were taking their high school diploma exam. 11 students were attempting the whole IB diploma and 21 students were taking only the English 1A IB class, and they will appear in the standard high school diploma exam. Students can take full admission in IBDP, or, if they want to study any subject from IBDP, they can select the single subject. However, only those that enroll in full IB

courses will get a full IB diploma; other students who have taken some IB subjects will graduate from the original high school in which they are studying.

The Theory of Knowledge class had 34 students, out of which 17 were taking the high school diploma exam and 11 students will be appearing in the IB diploma exam this year. In Blue Star High School, there are 11 total IB Diploma candidates for the year 2016-17, out of which two are male students and nine are female. I observed for a total period of 111 hours, spending 57 hours in the English 1A class and 36 hours in the TOK class. I spent 12 hours seeing various celebratory occasions and student performances, extra-curricular activities, and attending staff and student/teacher meetings in the school. My interviews and after-interview conversations took six hours. This made my total stay in the school more than 111 hours.

### **Ms. Hallmark's Classroom**

Ms. Hallmark's classroom was well organized. Chairs, charts, reflection corners: every detail was ordered. She liked to "teach" students and she wanted "business" in her class. Students were made to revise lessons and assignments until they were at a satisfactory level. Meaningful participation from each student was compulsory. The class was well-lit, conveying the message that it was meant for neat and clean professional work. I really liked the authority Ms. Hallmark had in her class, with a subtle ease of behavior where every student felt free to ask questions and study most comfortably. She was particularly expert in bringing the whole world into her class through student discussion. She used my presence whenever she wanted to take my world-views and relate them to IM in her class discussions. Her students also loved to hear what the world is like from Skype and internet conversations.

### **Mr. Haroon's Classroom**

Mr. Haroon's classroom had no particular seating pattern. Students sat wherever they liked. Class was discussion-based, so students were allowed to play music, sit in groups and ask as many questions as they wanted. TOK is the most challenging subject in IB. In order to address students' anxiety associated with the subject, the class environment was deliberately made relaxed. Most of the class time was specified for Socratic seminars and students' presentations where they were expected to challenge "knowledge claims" (subject-related prompts for discussion). The lights of the room were dim and students felt at home in class. There was a wall clock in the class that had its hands upside down. It was a symbol for the students that they were required to challenge accepted knowledge in order to discover their own meanings of knowledge. My experience of Mr. Haroon's class was very relaxing. I was able to write my reflections along with my observations because every class member, including me, could easily have personal time while still doing their class work.

### **The IB Coordinator**

I also interviewed the IB coordinator of the high school. The IB coordinator of Blue Star High School, Mr. Saloon, had 12 years' experience teaching History to IB students across the globe. He has studied, visited and taught in many parts of the world and the U.S. Interviewing him gave me a different perspective of pedagogy related to my research topic. My after-interview conversation with him was very productive. We talked for more than an hour about the problems the world faces now and what could be the role of an IB teacher across different content areas. I made notes of the after-interview conversation when I came home.

### **Sampling**

The concept of purposeful sampling is used in qualitative research (Creswell, 2013). I have used the concept of purposeful sampling (Creswell, 2013; Merriam, 1998, p. 61) in this

qualitative research. Purposeful sampling enables the researcher to choose the individuals and the site because they can purposefully inform an understanding of the research problem (Creswell, 2012) and “one can specify for each element of the population the probability that it will be included in the sample” (Chein, 1981 as cited in Merriam, 1998, p. 61). The purposeful sampling is based on the assumption that one wants to “discover, understand, gain insight; therefore, one needs to select a sample from which one can learn the most” (Merriam, 1998, p. 61).

There are two reasons I selected my sample. One is “convenience” and the other is “purpose.” I was placed in the English class to meet the requirements of my International Baccalaureate Educators’ Certificate (IBEC) certification. I selected that class on the basis of convenience. However, I selected TOK because of its central role in the DP. Secondly, I could identify with both the teachers because like me, before gaining an IB certification in teaching, they both had general certifications for teaching English Language and Literature to the Diploma Students. I felt it would be easy for me to understand their teaching philosophy, as they have backgrounds that are similar to mine and I could learn most by observing their classes. My selected sample not only facilitated my observations but I was also able to put in place foundations for great friendship.

### **Data Collection**

Data are ordinary bits and pieces of information found in the environment. Qualitative data are conveyed through words and case studies, making extensive use of data (Merriam, 1998). The depth of qualitative data can be had by “getting close” (Lofland & Lofland, 1980) to the subjects of the research. In order to collect data for my study, I used multiple resources like interviews, observing teachers and collecting their teaching materials. According to Merriam

(1998), “that reality is not an objective entity; rather, there are multiple interpretations of reality” (p. 22). Therefore, adopting this philosophical assumption, my primary interest as a qualitative researcher was to understand the meaning or knowledge constructed by people. The multiple resources like observations, semi-structured interviews and class teaching materials used to collect data in this study complement each other.

I observed 2<sup>nd</sup>, 3<sup>rd</sup> and 4<sup>th</sup> periods of English 1A; and 7<sup>th</sup> and 8<sup>th</sup> periods of Theory of Knowledge Diploma senior classes. I interviewed the IB coordinator of the high school to learn about his conceptualization and perspective of incorporating IM in the school’s pedagogies. I stayed for extensive time periods in the school to give depth to my observations, “get close” to my subjects, and make people around me comfortable in the observed environment. The teaching materials used by Ms. Hallmark and Mr. Haroon were also collected to fortify facts recorded through observations. My data collection procedures are detailed as follows:

### **Observations**

Observational data represents a first hand encounter with the phenomenon of interest (Merriam, 1998). In order to get close to the subject of interest “by means of direct observation and their access to subject matter” (Bromley, 1986, as cited in Merriam, 1998, p. 23), I observed teachers for three consecutive months, two times each week. I stayed for four and a half hours each day I went to the school so that I was able to observe teachers and students during class time and during their one-hour lunch break. I studied classes of my observed teachers for 93 hours. I started my observations in November and continued until the middle of February.

For making my observations, I followed guidelines provided by Merriam (1998). According to her, conceptual framework defines what to observe (p. 96). Several writers (Goetz & Le Compte, 1984; Borg & Gal, 1989; Bogdan & Biken, 1992; Patton, 1990; Tylor & Bogdan,

1984, as cited in Merriam, 1998) provide lists of things to observe in a bounded system. Following the recommendations provided by the aforementioned scholars, I observed the *physical setting* (p.97) of the school, noticing what the physical environment was like, what kinds of behavior the setting was designed for, how space was allocated to the samples, the school building structure, the administration offices and the behavior with the visitors at the reception office.

I also observed the whole class, including students, although they were not the sample of my study. My intent was to describe who was in the scene. Students were the indirect *participants* (p.97) of the study. I also observed in detail the *activities* (p.97) in the school and attended three functions in the school to specifically observe the school environment and student teacher *interactions* (p.97). I made written records of the *conversational* (p. 98) chunks between students communicating with the observed teacher and observed teachers communicating with their colleagues. I also noticed *subtle factors* (p.98) and observed informal and unplanned activities, non-verbal communication and physical clues. I also recorded my own feelings when I was in the bounded system. This helped me to reflect on the site with a check on myself whether I was disruptive, facilitative or neutral to the observed site (Merriam, 1998).

Though I limited my role to that of an observer, I developed a cordial relationship with the observed teachers and assisted them by teaching their students research skills and guiding them for presentation skills in formal and informal ways. I deliberately tried not to make my presence intimidating in their routine class procedures.

I also collected teaching materials to understand how the teachers were building the concept of IM through their syllabi. Teaching materials gave me an idea what conceptualization of IM teachers had while designing and selecting teaching materials. I detailed class activities

during observation time and set aside 40 to 60 minutes in each observation day to write reflections on the observation. I made separate notes for reflections and these notes were longer than the observational details.

### **Interviews**

An interview is “a conversation with a purpose” (Dexter, 1970, as cited in Merriam, 1998). With an intention to capture the teachers’ conceptualizations of the concept of IM, I conducted semi-structured interviews with the observed teachers. According to Merriam, semi-structured interview formats assume that individual respondents define the world in unique ways, and are deemed ideal for investigating where researchers are seeking individual interpretations and responses (1998). I interviewed the observed teachers and the IB coordinator of the high school to understand their perspectives regarding IM. My semi-structured interviews were intended to approach subjects’ thoughts, feelings, and desires regarding teaching IM in their classes.

My interview questions contained two sections: section one was related to the teacher’s conceptualization of IM and the second part was related to the conceptualization of IM at the school level (interview questions attached in Appendix A). Questions were open-ended and required teachers to express their views in detail about the class, school environment, and parents’ support. Teachers were comfortable while sharing their views because I was not a stranger to them. I intentionally decided to take interviews at the end of observation period so that my observed teachers and the IB coordinator could feel relaxed in sharing their thoughts with me. We chatted in a relaxed way after the interviews when they saw that the recording button was off. I made notes of the after-interview chats when I came home.

For interviews, I verbally conveyed the research topic and the possibility of minimal risks associated with the interview questions (verbal explanation of interviews and observations attached in Appendix B). I gave my subjects consent forms to sign, permitting my recording the interviews. I recorded interviews and took notes about non-verbal details related to the participants when they were expressing their thoughts while responding to the interview questions. A thank-you note was sent to each subject.

### **Data Analysis**

No consensus exists in qualitative research for data analysis (Creswell, 2012). There is no standard format for reporting case study research (Merriam, 1988, p. 193). “The key philosophical assumption upon which all types of qualitative research are based is the view that reality is constructed by individuals interacting with their social worlds” (Merriam, 1998, p. 6). Gathering and analyzing qualitative data is one way to interpret reality through the researcher’s lens.

Data analysis is “the process of making sense out of the data. And making sense out of data involves consolidating, reducing, and interpreting what people have said and what the researcher has seen and read – it is the process of making meaning” (Merriam, 1998, p. 178). In this case study, “the researcher is the primary instrument of data collection and analysis” (Merriam, 1998, p. 34). Data gathered through observations, interviews and teaching materials were analyzed by “relying on theoretical propositions” (Yin, 2013, p. 136).

Data for this study came from multiple sources like interviews, observations and teaching materials. Denzin (2000) calls multiple methods of collecting data “triangulation” (p.301), using more than one method to collect data on the same topic. This is a way of assuring the validity of research through the use of a variety of methods, which involves different types of samples as



well as methods of data collection. The principle of triangulation comes from navigation through the resources of data collection, where the intersection of three different reference points is used to calculate the precise location of an object. In qualitative research, the principle pertains to the goal of seeking at least three ways of verifying or corroborating a particular event, description, or fact reported by a study. Such corroboration serves as another way of strengthening the validity of a study (Yin, 2016). I developed codes and categories to sort data into themes to be analyzed. I generated results for this study after triangulation of data. I cross-verified my findings with three sources, like observations, interviews and teaching materials.

I have done thematic analysis with my qualitative data. Thematic analysis is one of the most common forms of analysis in qualitative research. It emphasizes pinpointing, examining, and recording themes within data (Braun & Clarke, 2006). Themes are patterns across data sets or abstract constructs that are important to the description of a phenomenon and are associated with a specific research question (Dally & Gliksman, 1997). The themes become the categories for analysis (Feredy & Muir, 2006). Thematic analysis is performed through the process of coding certain phases to create established, meaningful patterns (Braun & Clarke, 2006).

There are different ways thematic analysis can be approached. In the inductive method, coding and theme are directed by the content of the data. In the deductive method, coding and theme development is directed by existing concepts or ideas (Punch & Oancea, 2014). A deductive data analysis approach begins with a conceptual framework that helps researchers identify the social process and attribute meanings to their texts (Glaser and Strauss, 1967). For my research, I have identified a theoretical framework for the study and approached themes through deductive analysis of codes emerging through open and focused coding (Strauss and Corbin, 1998; Merriam, 1998).

A code in qualitative inquiry is often “a word or a short phrase that symbolically assigns a summative, salient, essence capturing... attribute for a portion of language based or visual data (Saldaña, 2009, p. 3). Codes are tags or labels for assigning units of meanings to the descriptive information compiled during a study (Miles and Huberman, 1994, p. 94). Through coding, researchers make connections between ideas and concepts (Corbin and Strauss, 1998). “Open coding constitutes a first level of conceptual analysis with the data” (Punch & Oancea, 2014, p. 183). It clarifies the substantive codes. The purpose of open coding is to open up the theoretical possibilities in the data and generate abstract conceptual categories (Tracy, 2013; Punch & Oancea, 2014, p. 183). Open codes involve a close examination of data to identify conceptual categories. Focused coding is the second operation in qualitative theory analysis (p. 186) where the main categories that have emerged from open coding are interconnected with each other for theoretical coding. This is to interrelate the substantive categories that open coding has developed (Tracy, 2013; Punch & Oancea, 2014, p. 186).

My research question, “how do two IB teachers foster International Mindedness in their classrooms?”, required me to study the concept of IM as it is present in the existing literature and previous research. I was able to identify a few allied features of the concept to narrow down my focus and to look for specific codes/titles from the observational write-ups, in-depth interviews, and teaching materials of the observed teachers. I have selected the lens developed by Castro, Lundgren, and Wooden (2013) to examine my case. The authors define the concept of IM in terms of three attributes: multilingualism, intercultural understanding and global engagement. These core components of IM are closely connected and interrelated. I have studied IM and its sub-concepts as foundational themes to observe how two teachers were teaching IM in their classes. The main categories of the concept have also served as titles of the codes I used to define

how the teachers are using the concept in their pedagogical routines and as a part of their lessons.

For my analysis, I have followed Merriam's (1998) deductive data analysis techniques and procedures. In the first cycle of coding, I used open coding to break the data apart and delineate concepts to stand for blocks for raw data (Corbin and Strauss, 2008). In the second phase of coding, I used "focused coding," that is, the process of relating categories to their sub categories (Emerson, Fretz & Shaw, 2011) to add depth and structure to the data. My goal at this stage was to systematically develop and generate categories.

### **Criteria for Trustworthiness**

As a researcher, my number one goal was to be impartial and balanced through the entire process and conduct this study in an ethical manner. To ensure this happened, I used triangulation throughout the research. This means that I used a variety of data collection strategies and sources. I used interviews, observational field notes, studied books that my observed teachers were teaching, and collected teaching materials my observed teachers used. Along with these data collection strategies, I also used audio recordings during the interviews with the consent of the participants. I transcribed all the interviews and used responses to corroborate my findings. Along with triangulation, I used prolonged engagement as well as persistent observation, which means my observations took place over a period of 110 hours. I also collected sufficient data. I have 87 pages of rich/thick descriptions of field notes. My reflections on these field notes are for 26 pages. I have 27 pages of transcribed interviews and three pages of non-verbal details about the interviews.

### **Summary**

The methods chapter defined the design and methodology of this study in order to

understand how two IB teachers were teaching while incorporating the idea of IM in their pedagogy. The qualitative case study approach was an appropriate method for this study because it permitted the me to focus on an issue in-depth to understand the participants' perspectives. Participants were selected based on purposeful convenient sampling in order to gather data from teachers who were teaching in an IB school. The teaching materials of the teachers observed were also utilized for additional understanding of the concept of IM. I used some strategies like triangulation of data to enhance the validity of my study. I combined multiple sources of data to confirm my findings (Merriam, 1998, p.204). I have been in the field for a long period and my research is peer-examined.

## Chapter 4

### **Findings**

The purpose of this study was to investigate how teachers conceptualize International Mindedness (IM), blend the concept into their regular pedagogical practices, and foster it in their classrooms. The conceptual model that I used for this study is composed of a set of ideas and concepts derived from the literature I reviewed. I have used this model to do pattern matching and explore new areas of understanding. In pattern matching, I used the conceptual model as a screen to place over my data (Campbell, 1979). I then compared the categories of my conceptual model with the patterns of the findings I constructed from the data.

I first analyzed data for this study through primary coding (Tracy, 2013, p. 189) or open coding (Saldaña, 2009). This type of coding was chosen to examine, compare and search for similarities and differences throughout the data, and as Charmaz (2006) contextualizes, “...to remain open to all possible theoretical directions indicated by your readings of the data” (p.46). The second level of coding chosen was focused coding (Saldaña, 2009). Focused coding offered a basis to explain major themes underneath the segments of the data. Patterns in teaching IM to the IB seniors, the explanations for the themes drawn through the conceptual framework, the platform to construct information regarding teaching implications of IM in Pakistan, and, finally, triangulation of these patterns and themes, created new areas of understanding using the existing lens. By reviewing the interviews, observations and teaching materials in a descriptive analysis along with the two levels of coding (Saldaña, 2009), I was able to discover the methods these teachers are using to blend the concept of IM in their pedagogy.

## **Validation Strategies**

There is a general consensus that qualitative inquirers need to demonstrate that their studies are credible. To this end, several authors identify common procedures for establishing validity in qualitative projects (e.g., Lincoln & Guba, 1985; Maxwell, 1996; Merriam, 1998 as cited in Creswell & Miller). I used some strategies like triangulation of data, rich, thick descriptions, and peer review to enhance the validity of my study. For triangulation, I combined multiple sources of data to confirm my findings (Merriam, 1998, p. 204). Along with triangulation, I used prolonged engagement as well as persistent observation, which means my observation took place over a period of 110 hours. I also had sufficient data. I have 87 pages of rich, thick descriptions in field notes. My reflections on these field notes extend for 26 pages. I have 27 pages of transcribed interviews and three pages of non-verbal details about the interviews.

## **Deviant Cases**

I have stored my entire collection of data. Some of the data were not relevant. I plan to use this extra data for another study. With the data that were not related to my study and the data that I use here, collecting them both, I intend to conduct a separate report to interpret the concept of IM as it is present in IB schools. I am also planning to do inductive analysis with the data that I have to see if I am able to find new themes and categories.

## **Research Questions**

Through this research the goal was to answer the following questions:

Question 1: How do two IB teachers teaching Theory of Knowledge and English Language in the Diploma Program conceptualize and foster International Mindedness in their classrooms?

Question 2: How does the IB coordinator conceptualize IM?

### **Findings**

There are three attributes related to IM that I used to code my data at the first level: multilingualism, intercultural understanding and global engagement (Castro, Lundgren, & Wooden, 2013). I initially open coded all data that were related to the aforementioned categories, then I recoded these data segments through focused coding with the main theme of this study, “teaching International Mindedness.”

As I was analyzing my data, three categories constantly unfolded in my observational field notes, interview data, and teaching materials from my observed teachers. All materials were searched for themes related to the three categories that constructed my lens for observing IM in the IB classes. Both the teachers and the IB coordinator emphasized the importance of each of the three categories: global engagement, intercultural understanding, and multilingualism. They conceptualize them to be related concepts with pedagogical implications while teaching IM. These themes are discussed in the hierarchy of importance in which my observed teachers placed them.

#### **Category 1: Global Engagement**

Castro, Lundgren, and Wooden (2013) define global engagement as an active commitment to the world which all living beings have in common and for which all humans must take responsibility (p. 39). It is a holistic approach based on the assumption that there is only one humankind and that global problems require global solutions (Trotta, Jaccott, & Lundgren, 2008). My observed teachers used the concept of global engagement in their pedagogical practices.

Mr. Haroon, while planning and teaching a lesson for Theory of Knowledge, considered global engagement a necessary discussion to come up in each class. His students in Theory of Knowledge (TOK) are assessed through an oral presentation and a 1,600-word essay. The students are required to reflect on the nature of knowledge, and on how we know what we claim to know. TOK is part of the International Baccalaureate (IB) Diploma Programme (DP) core, and is mandatory for all students. Throughout the semester, students were engaged in discussions and making presentations on the discussion outcomes to challenge established knowledge claims. I observed that the teacher was able to bring out the discussion topics from the boundaries of the class to relate them to the national and international horizons.

In one class, one student presented on the topic “the media portrayal of female characters.” The presenter discussed what the situation was in the twentieth century and how it is the same now in the U.S. Mr. Haroon asked students to reflect on the role of women in media in some other parts of the world. Students started brainstorming, browsed through various websites and came up with marvelous information. Mr. Haroon further scattered the conversation in comparison of various time periods in various parts of the world.

While I was interviewing Mr. Haroon, reflecting on the conceptualization of IM, he expressed his belief in taking the topics outside the boundaries of the class, region and country and engaging students globally. He said:

Whether we are discussing this text, which is relating to some international issues, like we are reading text which is related to Holocaust issues. It is important to find examples related to not just what has happened in Germany but also what is happening in the world now. It’s important for students to learn its relevancy and application for students, and I think International Mindedness is still away from students until they try to begin to



understand the experiences of other cultures. For me as teaching TOK and IB, it's always like challenging students to move away from their ethnocentric experiences and to see the world from a different perspective.

Further discussing the text selection for his class, he said "...choosing text that invites students to think from a different perspective is something that I always want to do." Therefore, when it comes to subject selection, he enjoys the liberty to select texts that stimulate thought process and promote discussion in the class. He believes in the pedagogical power of discussion in IB classes. He said "My discussion is to promote discussion in students. Students of today are quite receptive."

According to him, for teaching global competence, it is indispensable for students to challenge their stereotypes. In the interview, when I asked him the question: Do you face any resistance from your students when you teach global competence in your class? he replied in affirmation. However, he also expressed his belief in the learning power of students. He said:

I think there is a malleability with younger students; the time for students in high school. You are not able to perceive and understand stereotypes. There are prejudices because they are still receptive and not open minded to those ideas of diversity.

It is important for Mr. Haroon to broaden and free his students' minds from stereotypes and prejudices. It also offers a significant opportunity for the students when instructors include content and practices necessary to involve students in global engagement. Freeing students from their prejudices will make them more open to new ideas of constructing knowledge that are unbiased and free from stereotypes.

While planning his lessons, Mr. Haroon included some points where discussion can embrace some broader global themes. The narrative of his lesson plan ran as following:

Students will begin to examine how historical knowledge is constructed. This will include an examination of what individuals and societies across the world deem as evidence of history and how one measures significance in history. Students will examine how history can create identity and enriches our understanding of human nature. The theory of social constructivism is reinforced through dialogical inquiry.

My second observed teacher, Ms. Hallmark, also introduced global engagement in all the classes that I observed her teaching. Ms. Hallmark teaches English Language A to the IB seniors. The Language A: Language and Literature course introduces the critical study and interpretation of written and spoken texts from a wide range of literary and non-literary genres. The course is organized into four parts, each focused on the study of texts. Together, the four parts of the course allow the student to explore Language A through its cultural development and use, its media forms and functions, and its literature. Students develop skills of literary and textual analysis, and also the ability to present their ideas effectively.

In one of her classes, while students were reading the book *How to Read Literature Like a Professor* by Thomas C. Foster, students were demonstrating the importance of reading about literary texts from different parts of the world. They merged in the contextual histories of the text they were studying. When they were presenting their lessons on their chosen chapters from the book, they seemed knowledgeable of global issues. They were familiar with the geographical location, cultural context, political canvas, and the first language in which their selected piece of literature was written. Students were wearing the clothes of the region from the selected chapter of the book and they were also speaking some small chunks of the language in which their selected text chapter was originally written.

Creativity, activity, service (CAS) is one of the three essential elements of the IB education that every student must complete as part of the Diploma Program (DP). Students study CAS throughout the diploma program. It aims to provide a “counterbalance” to the academic rigor of the educational program. It involves students in a range of activities along with their academic studies. Students are expected to have two CAS activities for each CAS category and they are required to prove that they are participating in CAS activities on a weekly basis. CAS is not assessed for a final grade but students are required to provide evidence of achieving the learning outcomes for CAS.

For CAS, one student in Ms. Hallmark’s class raised funds to be collected by the fellow students. These donations were meant for treatment of female patients in Africa who were afflicted with a deadly disease associated with childbirth. Ms. Hallmark also initiated students’ action by donating first herself. The purpose of this activity and teaching episode was to raise students’ awareness about the world around them and its existing problems. CAS activity linked students’ knowledge gained through academic activities to the practical world.

While teaching the novel *Animal Farm*, written by George Orwell, Ms. Hallmark was keen that her students be able to study a comparison of socialism, communism, capitalism, totalitarianism, fascism and dictatorship. One of her class lesson plans was dedicated to the discussion of various systems around the globe, and students were expected to write a page about these social systems. Through dialogue and inquiry, students not only constructed knowledge for themselves but also contributed to their global engagement through this class.

Ms. Hallmark considers global engagement a crucial component in the IB pedagogy. During the interview, when I asked her a question about her understanding of International

Mindedness, she expressed her faith in global engagement as a necessary component of the IB philosophy of teaching. She said:

It [International Mindedness] is an absolutely crucial skill to continue in living in the world today. The idea that everyone can live in just their own population is completely foolhardy. But I think it's a very easy delusion to fall into, especially when you never get to travel and you never go outside of your own sphere.

It was evident through her selection of class materials that she struggled with the selection of materials to include IM through a global perspective in her pedagogy. She expressed herself in the interview:

... it also takes me sitting down and thinking about creative ways to bring that creative IM in areas where students don't expect to see it. I try to do it in little small ways... when I teach a novel, or an aspect and instead of thinking like how am I going to make a global minded connection here.

She knew the importance of bringing in the global perspective in her classes through her selection of teaching materials. Discussing her material selection for the class in the interview for this study, she said:

we just finished *Narrative of the Life of Frederick Douglass*, and onwards we are starting Edgar Allan Poe, we are really talking a lot about the history of those two time periods, 18th and 19th century. And really trying to get to know them to understand globally, what was going on during those time periods and getting helping them to understand to know the Napoleonic war, religious persecution and all of those types of things.

So for her, it is important to bring in worldviews, historical perspectives and world issues of the past and present to teach global engagement to her students.

Studying my research question two, to analyze the conceptualization of the IB coordinator of the school, Mr. Saloon, I planned to interview him with slightly different open-ended interview questions. Mr. Saloon has been serving at Blue Star School for the last 12 years. He currently teaches two sections of History of the Americas and two sections of 20th Century World History (IB), and is the IB Coordinator for the Blue Star High School as well. Through the interview and the after-interview conversation, he provided me an overall picture of the school's methods regarding the teaching of IM. He shared his some of his concerns and some of the steps the school has taken to develop global engagement among students.

We do have foreign exchange students but those are from typically European countries. Some Spanish speaking countries. For the most part it is pretty standard kind of thought. Anglo Saxon, Anglo European kind of focus. So we are very kind of Western in that way.... We are trying to find materials [to teach and involve students in global assignment]. There should be something that doesn't shut students off but it shows them kind of mistakes from the past and how they can be critical and that is challenging so again we have tons of materials available but we are trying to present it in a way that doesn't shut students off; it is hard [to select materials and incorporate global engagement without being biased].

During the interview, when I asked him the question: What do you think is the role of International Mindedness in the IB curriculum? he replied by highlighting the importance of global engagement for teaching IM. He said:

It really seems like giving kids the rules to begin feeling empathetic to see the world in a different way and break down the walls around other countries, religions, ethnicities and cultures. And to approach human beings in a human way that recognizes that we are all

humans and we have unique characteristics, religions, ethnicities and cultural practices, and at the end of the day, we are global community.

While answering the question: Is there any opportunity in your school to encourage teachers to undertake projects of a global nature? he responded that there is room for teachers to take the initiative if they want to. He mentioned that a couple of teachers in the school are using technology to bring the world into their classes. He said:

So there is room in the curriculum. We have a Spanish teacher who is very consistent in connecting students via Skype, with other world places like Mexico and through all central America. Or even in South America. We had a program for bringing teachers from a variety of places to work here with our students and teachers to see how we work and teach in certain content areas; and that includes teachers from Afghanistan, European countries, just all over the world.

Studying his responses to the interview questions, I can conclude that he assigns considerable importance to global engagement while planning activities related to school as an IB coordinator. He believes in empowering students to develop empathy for the peoples of the world through arranging for global encounters through school celebrations, teaching materials selection across content areas, and in-class interactions via Skype and other channels.

### **Summary**

It seemed evident that teachers presented certain aspects of IM as synonymous with global engagement. For instance, they think it is imperative for their students' educational and intellectual growth to become engaged with issues of global significance. When students were involved in linking the classroom discussion with the world, they were also in the process of promoting positive thinking about the world as a community. They were engaged in a thinking

process taking into account the whole world as a single community across all time periods. It is also evident that my cooperating teachers selected materials that invited students to think from a different perspective and challenge their own stereotypes and biases. Additionally, strong teacher initiative is required and appreciated for teaching IM across the content areas.

### **Category 2: Intercultural Understanding**

Castro, Lundgren, and Wooden (2013) define intercultural understanding as “developing knowledge for other cultural groups, appreciation of different ways of being and behaving, and developing a positive attitude for others” (p. 06). The term intercultural competence focuses on the knowledge, skills and attitudes which a person might have or be able to draw upon in an intercultural encounter. Intercultural orientation “seeks the transformation of student’s identities in the act of learning” (Scarino, 2010, as cited in Castro, Lundgren, and Wooden, 2013, p. 31).

As I was observing my cooperating teachers, I was able to see many instances when my observed teachers showed their perception of IM in terms of intercultural understanding and sought to transform students’ perception of cultures around the world through pedagogical practices.

Mr. Haroon, while teaching the idea of co-construction of knowledge, brought in the discussion on other cultures, defending common American norms and looking at various norms of other cultures. Mr. Haroon kept asking questions from time to time so that students would continue with their discussion. He concluded that class with “identifying TOK with real life challenges,” which is the application aspect of the class discussion where students think and suggest where and how they can challenge established knowledge claims to create positive change in their lives.

He quite frequently mentioned cultures and the shallow differences that lead to cultural differences in the world. Discussing indigenous cultures in the United States, in one of his classes, he introduced the claim of some early English visitors that indigenous culture was not worthy of being promoted. After a discussion, there always was something which students agreed was a new and positive knowledge claim, but it was also open for further discussion if students were not satisfied. Culture and cultural variation in various parts of the world has always been a dominant topic in his Theory of Knowledge class.

Students in his classes frequently had discussions on world cultures, cultures of wars in the U.S and in the world, and knowledge systems in the world, including spiritual and religious knowledge system and their authority in the lives of those who follow it and established areas of knowledge. Usually a discussion was followed by a written one-page assignment reflecting on the conclusion of the discussion.

During the interview, when I asked Mr. Haroon what his understanding of IM was, he replied:

[to infuse content in the curriculum] where students are able to understand different cultures and perspectives as it relates to how they understand different cultures and relate it to what they know in schools. This is my perception of IM.

When it comes to material selection for teaching IM, he believes in selecting materials with “some sort of cultural consideration with any thing they are talking about. What I will use in class to have some cultural sort of things.” He believes that a teacher cannot teach International Mindedness “until [students] try to begin to understand the experiences of other cultures.” What he was trying to do showed that he “[liked] challenging students to move away from their ethnocentric experiences and to see the culture from a different perspective.” For him it is



equally important for an IB teacher to work on the “misinformation students [have been] subjected to through media and through culture.”

For Mr. Haroon, just teaching about other cultures is not enough to truly teach IM. Challenging students’ biases is one of the aspects he sees as important. During the interview, he said “It’s a constant challenge to disabuse students from constant pervasive stereotypes regarding other cultures.” He knew that he has to deal with this issue “with delicacy so it does not shut students off from being open minded or international minded.” He considers intercultural understanding “the most important perspective is as far as it goes.” As for how he was able to incorporate intercultural understanding, he replied to an interview question: “I spent a lot of time in inviting students to think about how would you think in another culture. For me, how would some other person in another culture would think about this knowledge claim [is equally thought provoking].”

According to Mr. Haroon, teaching IM has several important components, not just one. When he talks about intercultural understanding, he thinks of the influences his students have and how he can promote a positive image of people living in other cultures. He is able to do it through material selection, class discussions and persuading them to come out of their pre-meditated concepts.

In her class while teaching English Language A, Ms. Hallmark used her subject to cross barriers between different cultures. A writer, as discussed in the class, was not only an author of a text, but also was a harbinger of new cultural context, a protagonist of another culture introducing students to a new ethnic context. Ms. Hallmark was adept in using the context of the text to shape teaching and learning. While teaching stylistic features of English, she knew she had to brief students about where this feature was borrowed from. This discussion was enough

for students to awaken necessary respect for the other cultures that had had this knowledge before it shifted to the English language.

During the interview for this study, Ms. Hallmark expressed her understanding of International Mindedness in terms of intercultural understanding. When I asked about her perception of IM, she replied:

[for me, teaching IM is to foster an understanding of] different ethnicities, different races, different cultures etc.; and I think that helping [students] to understand similarities between their own lives and cultures is a nice place to start because I think it humanizes people and a kind of takes that feeling of foreignness and feeling a little bit more attuned to delivering more in it if they find a similar connection and then from there getting to know what is similar first and then what those differences are.

She also had faith in teaching all about all the cultures around the world, not only the ideal or superficial pictures of peoples. She thought it was a good starting point to start from one's own culture. Sharing her experience of teaching a novel, Ms. Hallmark said:

We were doing Frederick Douglass, which is a study of life in slavery in the Civil War era, and I learned a lot because I was under the assumption that kids need a way more education about American slavery than they have. It was pretty clear very quickly that the education that they had was very sanitized, very partial.

She also mentioned the exchange program in the school that offered her students an opportunity to get a first hand peek at some other culture. Talking about the school cultural exchange program, she said “[the culture exchange program is] about culture and helping kids to understand different cultures and different ideas and about our exchange students.” She liked her students knowing the complete picture of the world with negative and positive sides.

For finding evidence for research question two, I interviewed the IB coordinator, Mr. Saloon. He expressed his understanding of IM as closely related with the theme of intercultural understanding. He expressed his belief that in order foster IM in schools, students should have intercultural experiences. He articulated his appreciation for intercultural understanding as an important theme in fostering IM. In order to promote IM in the classes where he teaches as a history teacher, and in the school as IB coordinator, he believes it is important for students to have intercultural understanding through “[interaction] or travel internationally all that often so [students] ... see a lot of different cultures.” He acknowledges the importance of diversity in the school so that he is able to get his students acquainted with the intercultural themes to teach IM. During the interview for this study, he expressed his faith in intercultural understanding in the following words:

we have some diversity which is the small in number but when we see the class population, we see that there are a couple of Native American students, a Hmong student, a Belarusian student. Sometimes we have international students to observe us teaching from the university. That has reinforced and have a lot of support to the idea on IM in the school. It is one of the things that we have to constantly maintain or I think we cannot lose focus from it.

He also discussed some opportunities that the school offered to students for intercultural experiences. He believed these intercultural experiences are imperative for his students to be internationally-minded and embrace all the world as their own. According to him, intercultural experiences enlarge a person’s involvement in the world with the right amount of positivity for the peoples of the world. Students’ intercultural experiences broaden their thoughts and enlarge their minds to embrace a greater image of the cultures around the world.

I also attended a Native American cultural program at Blue Star High School. This function was a manifestation of intercultural understanding at the school level. There were a few guest speakers and some student speakers. They talked about cultural plurality and how it adds richness to a community. All students enjoyed this function, and some took part in performing tribal dance and music. My observed teachers also attended this function and mandated it for their students to attend. The purpose behind mandating attendance at this function was to foster understanding of another culture through direct introduction with some cultural manifestations through speakers and representations of specific events.

### **Summary**

Overall, viewing the fostering of intercultural understanding, my observed teachers credit intercultural understanding as an often-occurring component while fostering IM. They discuss it in terms of diversity, cultural interaction, and respect for other cultures as one respects one's own. The teachers perceive intercultural experiences to be important for their students and categorize how students can have them while still in high school, that is, through selection of classroom teaching materials, intercultural experiences through student exchange and some other programs, and through fellow diverse students.

### **Category 3: Multilingualism**

Multilingualism can be described in terms of speaking and learning languages, including languages for learning purposes (Castro, Lundgren, & Wooden, 2013, p. 6). A learner's mother tongue is considerably important in relation to learning another language because it is closely associated with a learner's identity. Language is given status as something that we use instead of something that we have, but learning another language can provide insight and awareness, and can develop intimate connections between languages and how learners feel about the world. The

IB positions a learner as a reflective person who respects others' mother tongues and their right to be listened to, and someone who understands and appreciates otherness through language learning (Castro, Lundgren, and Wooden, 2013, p. 26). As I was making my observations, taking and transcribing recorded interviews, and analyzing teaching materials from my observed teachers, I deduced that my observed teachers cultivate an attitude importance and respect for other languages to foster IM among students.

In Mr. Haroon's class, Theory of Knowledge, there were frequent discussions on the importance of knowing more than one language. When students discussed the importance of other cultures around the globe, they also discussed the languages of the different areas of the world and how these languages have the capacity to capture noble communication media. Students were able to find out through teacher-guided discussion that literature produced in America was equally eloquent as that produced in other parts of the world.

In one of his lesson plans, while planning to teach "indigenous knowledge systems," his heading ran "making sense of the world through oral traditions" and the activity ran "invite one of the elders from one of the local tribes to discuss oral traditions and connect with indigenous tribes of Bolivia, Peru, or Ecuador via Skype." In each of his classes that I observed, there was an activity that related teaching TOK to the other language speaking communities in the world.

During the interview for this study, Mr. Haroon expressed his own language biases while selecting a text for TOK, as he knows only one language (English). So he is biased to select only those texts written in or translated into English. Discussing the efforts of the school, and some of the good things their school introduced while going to the IB World School was introduction of a foreign language. One of those good things was "I mean other than reading English only,

because we are already teaching translated texts. Students are reading [now] Russian, Latin American and Spanish languages.”

Ms. Hallmark, in her English class, fostered the concept that literature produced in one part of the world is respected across the whole world as it is respected in its region of origin. While discussing the stylistic features of the translated texts, she introduced how all languages share the same patterns across the globe. She believed that all languages are a noble medium of communication and this purpose of communication is further highlighted while combined with the teaching of literature-based text. I was able to observe in her classes that students were engaged in discussions on rich literature produced in various parts of the world. In her interview for this study, she expressed her satisfaction over the introduction of foreign languages through the IB program.

All DP students are required to take on foreign language in their program. It is a mandatory for all DP students to study a foreign language as a part of their diploma. The IB coordinator of the Blue Star High School, Mr. Saloon, while being interviewed for this research, spoke about his belief in the importance of learning more than one language to develop internationally-minded learners in the school. He favored this aspect of IB education. He also mentioned how some of the language teachers are using Skype and other technology to bring into their classes other languages in a real-life context.

### **Summary**

My cooperating teachers understand the importance of learning more than one language and sharing the same respect for other languages as students have for their mother tongue. Literatures of all the languages in the world are revered as rich pieces of a living language and these pieces of language must be respected as one respects one’s own language. For studying

research question two, the IB coordinator spoke about his perception of IM closely linked with learning more than one language and abridging the communication gap among students in the world. He encourages IB teachers in the school to connect with other students of the IB schools to foster global mindset while learning a second language.

### **Conclusion**

This chapter discussed data gathered through observational field notes, open-ended interviews and by looking at the teaching materials observed teachers used. Corroboration was proven in the data analysis through the process of triangulation with data. Three categories derived through literature review were used to code themes found at the initial level in the data through primary-level coding. Focused coding was used to analyze the relationships between the themes resulting from the primary-level coding and find relevance with the main theme under study.

## Chapter 5

### **Results and Discussion**

The purpose of this study was to determine ways teachers incorporate International Mindedness (IM) in their routine pedagogical practices while teaching International Baccalaureate (IB) Diploma students, and to study how the IB coordinator of the school perceives IM should be fostered in the school. I focused on observations of teachers when they were busy teaching their subjects, open-ended interviews with the teachers and the IB coordinator, and teaching materials my observed teachers used while teaching and planning to teach in their classes. I analyzed my data to examine how these teachers foster IM while teaching their content areas.

During this study, I explored the following research questions:

How do two International Baccalaureate teachers teaching Theory of Knowledge and English Language in the Diploma Program foster International Mindedness in their classrooms?

And

How does the IB coordinator conceptualize IM?

In this chapter, I discuss the results of the research I conducted. I will relate my findings to my descriptive framework and determine what understanding I reached by observing, interviewing and then by examining my observed teacher's classroom teaching materials. I elaborate on the conceptualization of IM by the IB coordinator and describe the ways in which my own teaching may be impacted as a result of this study. The results of this study may serve as guidelines for my colleagues in Pakistan (my country of origin), and for other teachers teaching in an IB or general high schools, because they can learn from this study how my observed teachers were fostering IM in their classes.



## **Results**

When I was coding my data with the categories of my descriptive framework, I was able to see that IM is manifested in the components of multilingualism, intercultural understanding, and global engagement (Castro, Lundgren, and Wooden, 2013). The category I found occurring most frequently was teachers' understanding of International Mindedness as synonymous with "global engagement." Teachers also stressed the importance of knowing about other cultures around the world as an important part of IB pedagogy, hence giving importance to "intercultural awareness." Learning more than one language is compulsory for IB learners and my observed teachers regarded it as a necessary component while fostering IM in their classes. These themes are discussed in the hierarchy of importance in which my observed teachers placed them.

### **Global Engagement**

My observed teachers and the IB coordinator found "global engagement" the most relevant category while fostering IM in their classes. Mr. Haroon considered globally engaged discussions necessary for his IB Theory of Knowledge (TOK) classes. He used to scatter his discussions across various countries, different communities, and areas of the world. Relating the class discussion to world communities and areas is helpful in building global engagement. Global engagement is defined as "a concept of action, signifying ways of thinking and living within multiple crosscutting communities— cities, regions, states and nations" (Schattle, 2011, as in Castro, Lundgren, and Wooden, 2013). As such, by connecting the class discussion to various communities, cities, and areas, he was fostering in students a concept of action associated with IM and broadening the borders of students' nationalities.

In one instance, one of the students in TOK was presenting on "the media portrayal of female characters." The presenter discussed what the situation was in the twentieth century and

how it is the same now in the U.S. Mr. Haroon asked students to reflect on the role of women in media in some other parts of the world. Students brainstormed, browsed through various websites and came up with marvelous information. I was able to see that students were thinking about themselves as global citizens and using this class for developing global citizenship (Davies and Reid, 2005, as in Castro, Lundgren, & Wooden, 2013). Mr. Haroon as a teacher was creating the context for shaping the “delivery” of global citizenship education (Castro, Lundgren, & Wooden, 2013, p.39).

During the interview, Mr. Haroon discussed how he as a teacher wants his students to discuss and relate their discussions with the whole world around them, not just the city in which they live or their country. While planning his lessons, Mr. Haroon included some points where discussion can embrace some broader global themes. Boix, Mansilla and Gardner (2011, as cited in Castro, Lundgren, & Wooden, 2013) recognize that the role of the teacher is paramount in developing global competencies (p.40). Sharing experiences and examining local and global issues can lead students to engage globally (p.42). Further discussing the text selection for his TOK classes, Mr. Haroon said that he chooses texts that invite students to think from a different perspective and understand others’ point of view. “Understanding different people, finding commonalities and differences, and concluding that acceptance of differences in the world is a key point for the IB in relation to becoming a global citizen” (Boix, Mansilla, & Gardner, 2011, as cited in Castro, Lundgren, & Wooden, 2013, p. 42).

Observing Mr. Haroon in his class, conducting his interview, and seeing his classroom teaching materials, I am able to sum up that his perception of IM is closely linked to the teaching of global engagement. He seems to perceive that in order to foster IM in his TOK classes, he needs to develop a global mindset among his students. He wants to explore that niche in the

hearts and minds of students where students may ponder on their own identity and link it to the identity of other peoples around the globe through dialogical inquiry to construct knowledge about the world (IBO, 2011, p. 25). It certainly adds global dimensions to his teaching practices.

Ms. Hallmark also introduced global engagement in all the classes that I observed her teaching. While teaching the book *How to Read Literature Like a Professor* by Thomas C. Foster, she was incorporating the idea of global engagement in her classes. Students were adopting the concept of “universal ethos” (Castro, Lundgren, & Wooden, 2013, p. 6) to renew common identity with other peoples of the world.

When Ms. Hallmark encouraged one of her students to get engaged in fund-raising for ailing women in Africa, she, in a way, invited all her students to engage and empathize with those who need help or feel weak. She was globally engaging her students to feel for those who need support and take sensible steps to help them. Global engagement is linked to responsible action taking (Castro, Lundgren, & Wooden, 2013, p. 42). Here she encouraged her students to take a responsible action to alleviate misery. Castro, Lundgren, and Wooden (2013) say that along with the knowledge and values students gain from learning about global issues, they need to be equipped with the necessary skills to give them the ability and confidence to be proactive in making a positive difference in the world. The overarching goal should be to equip young people and adults for life in a global society and work in a global economy (p. 41). Her encouragement to her students was an attempt to equip her students for life in a global society.

While teaching the novel, *Animal Farm*, written by George Orwell, Ms. Hallmark was teaching her students a comparison of socialism, communism, capitalism, totalitarianism, fascism and dictatorship. Through dialogue and inquiry in that class, students constructed knowledge about various prevailing social systems around the world. They were engaged in

socio-economic preferences around the world. They were also questioning the idea of social justice in various social systems of the world. Asking students to brainstorm through class activities and material selection is a good plan to engage students in a global perspective of social justice. Social justice is a necessary element of global engagement (Castro, Lundgren, & Wooden, 2013, p. 42).

Overall, viewing Ms. Hallmark teaching lessons in her class, her lesson plans and teaching materials, and her interview responses, I am able to sum up that she considers global engagement a necessary product of her pedagogical practices while teaching English Language A. She considers IM to be a necessary component of IB teaching and uses various ways to incorporate the concept of global engagement in her routine teaching to conceptualize IM among her students.

The IB coordinator of the school, Mr. Saloon, talked about fostering IM in terms of teaching students to share guardianship of the world. He considers IM “embedded across all the programs” (Castro, Lundgren, & Wooden, 2013, p.5) in IB schools. He believes in “giving kids the rule to begin feeling empathetic to see the world in a different way and break down the walls around other countries, religions, ethnicities and cultures.” He talked about developing a true global mindset among students by fostering global engagement in all the subjects they are studying and the related activities they are doing. He discussed developing connections with communities around the world to develop global engagement. He also argued for presenting a true picture of world history to students. He wants his students to learn from past happenings and engage globally to develop a better world for generations ahead. Global engagement in making the world a better place is encouraged in the IB philosophy (Castro, Lundgren, & Wooden, 2013, p. 42).

## **Intercultural Understanding**

Teachers considered IM to be closely related to fostering intercultural understanding. Overall, viewing teachers' understanding and fostering of IM in their respective classes and school, I have learned that they all value intercultural understanding, a necessary component while fostering IM. I found that my observed teachers and the IB coordinator of the school consider "intercultural understanding" to be a construct that is closely associated with the concept of International Mindedness. Teachers continuously applied teaching strategies so that students developed an understanding of other cultures, an appreciation of different ways of being and behaving, and a positive attitude toward others (Castro, Lundgren, and Wooden, 2013, p. 6).

Mr. Haroon, while teaching the idea of co-construction of knowledge in his TOK classes, discussed other cultures, norms, and values that shape societies and cultural values around the world. When he mentioned other cultures in his class, his purpose was to promote knowledge, awareness and respect of other cultures and societies. Bredella (2003) argues for a model of intercultural understanding that allows us "to mediate between relativism and ethnocentrism and to develop a third position that transcends the values of the foreign culture and those of our own" (Bredella, 2003, p.46, as cited in Castro, Lundgren, & Wooden, 2013, p. 31). When Mr. Haroon was promoting discussion in his class on other societies and cultures, he was fostering a third position among his students so they could develop a respect for others' perspectives without undermining the values and norms of their own culture (Castro, Lundgren, & Wooden, 2013, p. 31).

When Mr. Haroon selected materials for his class, he selected with "some sort of cultural consideration." He considers it imperative to include some cultural components in his class teaching materials to foster IM. He believes that intercultural orientation seeks to transform

students' identities in the act of learning (Scarino, 2010, p. 324, as cited in Castro, Lundgren, & Wooden, 2013, p. 32).

In her English Language A classes, Ms. Hallmark skillfully brought in the topic of intercultural awareness through selected texts, class discussion and class assessments. She believes introduction of “different ethnicities, different races, different cultures” is vital to foster IM in her classes. She considers it to be a good point if one starts teaching intercultural awareness from one's own culture and cultivates the same respect for other cultures as one has for their own culture. Based on the IB mission statement, “intercultural understanding and respect” are aspects of IM and, therefore, a stated goal (Castro, Lundgren, & Wooden, 2013).

The IB coordinator, Mr. Saloon, expressed his understanding of IM as closely related to the theme of intercultural understanding. He liked his students to develop intercultural understanding first by having knowledge of diverse cultures in the school and community and then interacting directly with some members of other cultures in the world. He considers diverse students at Blue Star High School a rich source of diverse cultural introduction. The IB documents realize the wealth of diversity within the individual schools that could be developed as a resource of learning (Castro, Lundgren, & Wooden, 2013, p. 6).

### **Multilingualism**

Teachers acknowledge multilingualism as a necessary component for fostering IM. The least importance of the three concepts is given to “multilingualism” for fostering IM in the IB classes. However, my observed teachers acknowledged the importance of and respect for other languages as one respects one's own language. They felt vulnerable while discussing the importance of knowing more than one language as they were themselves monolingual and had language biases.

My observed teachers appreciated multilingualism and acknowledged the importance of speaking and learning more than one language (Castro, Lundgren, & Wooden, 2013, p. 6). While teaching in their classes, Mr. Haroon selected texts that were translated from other languages. Teaching a second language is not a part of TOK but he wants students to hypothesize that knowing about or learning a second language is like learning a new context because “language cannot be separated as an entity from those who are using it, the context in which they are using it, and the purpose for which they are using it.” He could select only the translated texts because he knows only English, and he felt it limited his selection of classroom teaching materials. However, he enjoys including a vast variety of translated texts, like theory from Latin. He also believes that “language, textual and linguistic, affects the ways in which people communicate and know the world around them” and that “language is a set of communicative system” that represent new thought systems associated with cultures around the world. Language for him is a “discourse in place” (Scollon & Scollon, 2003, as cited in Castro, Lundgren, and Wooden, 2013, p. 23), communicating about communities of the world.

Ms. Hallmark, on the other hand, selected texts from a wide variety of translated literature. Her purpose is to foster respect of literature produced in other parts of the world as her students’ respect the literature that is produced in the English language. She believes selecting a wide variety of literature produced in some other parts of the world reconfigures “how we think about the languages that takes into account the complex linguistic realities of millions of people in diverse sociocultural contexts” (Language and learning in IB programmes, p.8, as cited in Castro, Lundgren, & Wooden, 2013, p. 25). Literature selected from a variety of contexts and countries enriches students’ knowledge of those areas and regions where it was produced.

The IB coordinator of Blue Star High School, Mr. Saloon, gave importance to learning more than one language to develop internationally minded learners in the school. According to him, language is integral to one's identity and learning a second language "can provide 'insight and awareness', to build an intimate connection between languages and how learners feel about the world." He also acknowledged that "knowing a foreign language can promote intercultural perspectives" (Castro, Lundgren, & Wooden, 2013, p. 25). He appreciated his school's foreign language teachers for their effort to contact the real life context of the target language population by connecting with native speakers via Skype and other technology.

### **Discussions and Suggestions**

Although the teachers demonstrated several ways in which IM was fostered in their classrooms, I believe that there are ways to promote IM in a more comprehensive manner. I would also say that even though the IBO does not adequately flesh out the concept of IM for partner schools, it appears that simply having "the promotion of international mindedness" as one of the central tenets of the curriculum encourages a level of awareness and interest in teachers and administrators. Apparently, the conceptualization and implementation of IM is left to individual schools; independent administrators must figure out how the concept can fit into their school community and content areas. I have found little guidance and no accountability built into the system and, in my case, I found a strong interest on the part of IB teachers and administrator to effectively implement IM within their school.

I also uncovered through the analysis of data that my observed teachers liked to foster IM in their classes by focusing on creating a positive image of and respect for other cultures and communities in the world. Intercultural understanding and multicultural education is regarded as



closely relevant for fostering IM at the DP level. Multicultural education should be encouraged as a relevant theme for fostering IM in IB schools.

Seeing the relevance of International Mindedness in IB education, it should also be introduced as a separate subject at an early stage in IB education. Multicultural education may be a later stage of this subject which students reach when they are relatively mature. However, if these steps are not taken, this important concept in IB education will too easily be ignored by teachers.

IM should have an assessment system, and in some way, students should be mandated to provide evidence of learning in a certain learning outcome. Mandating IM with students' outcomes going towards final grades will make teachers focus more on this concept. IM in the IB curriculum does not have an accountability system. Hence, it may be ignored as a redundant component in IB education.

I believe that there should be more opportunities for students to visit other countries and explore their cultures and communities. There should be talent-based scholarships for those students who qualify to visit some other countries in the world and share their experiences in written, as well as in oral, forms with their fellow students. During interviews for this study, teachers and the IB coordinator discussed the need to promote such programs to familiarize students with other cultures.

I would also argue for more communication between IB schools worldwide. Technology has made communication feasible. By establishing connections with their peers in other IB schools worldwide, students will learn a lot about the world around them. It will also open more opportunities for CAS not only in their community but also throughout the world. It will make it easier for students to learn trends and aspirations among youth in other countries.

A teacher exchange program within IB schools should give a boost to fostering IM in IB schools. Seeing teachers who teach students their regular content with a diverse background will promote respect for the home countries of other teachers. This program can take many shapes: exchange between highly-performing schools and low-performing schools, exchange of teachers from different language communities, etc. This step will bring the world within the boundaries of the school and open many options for students to interactively discover the world.

I have also discovered through my observations that IB teachers are only trained in their content areas. There is a lack of training in terms of fostering IM in classes. This area can be highlighted, and good results can be expected from integrating the concept of IM. The IB coordinator and teachers should be provided with clear guidance about how to foster IM in school as well as in classes. Professional development workshops on a regular basis should be conducted in this regard.

There should also be more cultural events in the school. IB pedagogy is too focused on teaching, learning and assessments. By mandating celebration of some cultural and ethnic festivals celebrated worldwide, IB schools can certainly bring a mini-world into their schools. Exchange students, exchange teachers and some guest speakers can fill the void of distance by celebrating cultural events different from the culture in which students live. This will foster global engagement and enjoyment and respect for world communities among students.

It is also clear that the growth of IB education has provided avenues for the implementation of global education. Though IM is certainly an abstract concept within the IB curriculum, my study illustrates that it is something that teachers and the IB coordinator are aware of and working to address within their schools and classrooms. There are a number of ways in which the IBO can assist IB schools in more effectively implementing IM within the

curriculum. Most importantly, it would be beneficial if the IBO provided a more concrete, working definition of IM for member schools, and had professional development related to the implementation of IM.

Little IB literature exists, and my study is an attempt to fill the gap left by a lack of research in the field of fostering IM in IB schools. I have tested and found new materials that suggest the importance of the concept of IM in IB and general pedagogy. I can add to it that “multicultural education” is the emerging category through the analysis of my data that is most frequently referred to by my observed teachers as a helpful concept in fostering IM to the IBDP students.

### **Implications for Teaching**

#### **Students’ Involvement in Globally Engaged Tasks**

Through the analysis of data gathered for this study, I can conclude that it is helpful to globally engage students through class-related activities and discussions. Teaching material selection plays a pivotal role in global engagement. Small pieces of text produced in other parts of world can bring other communities and countries to a single classroom. This is also helpful to eliminate the monotony of overly-routine pedagogy in class.

#### **Introducing World Cultures Through Technology and Guest Speakers**

Introduction of world cultures is highly beneficial for inspiring respect for other communities. Use of modern technology is cheap and handy for low-budget schools like the ones common in Pakistan. When students are reading a text that belongs to some specific area of the world, bringing in small cultural chunks and guest speakers via Skype and other electronic media will be helpful to promote IM through the text and classroom activities.

#### **Celebrating World Festivals Along with Other Communities in the World**

Celebration of other communities' festivals and holidays will also inspire respect for those communities. Students can be encouraged to discover the spirit behind these celebrations and write something addressed to those who celebrate it. This will enhance students' engagement in the whole world and they will see that if any celebration is fun for them, how there may be other celebrations that can be enjoyable for others. Doing this will also address "small mindedness" of students who do not know anything about other cultures and religions in the world.

### **Focusing on Other Regions where My Students' Second Language Is the First Language**

English is mandated as a second language in Pakistani schools and colleges. However, there is very little information offered about the countries where English is the first language. Giving an introduction, a discussion of the area of origin, and a background to inspire respect for their second language will promote my multilingual students' global engagement and intercultural understanding.

### **Changing Content Students Are Studying**

This is the most essential step that I must take if I want to foster IM through various content areas. The syllabuses in use are old and are frequently based on religious biases. An effort is required to replace and modernize those curricula that foster only small-mindedness in the youth of Pakistan. There is a need for Pakistani students to have a global identity free from stereotypes and prejudices. A change in curriculum content across content areas can help eliminate these prejudices.

### **Promotion of Religious Tolerance Among Students**

Promotion of religious tolerance is a difficult goal in Pakistan, as it is in other parts of the world. The situation in Pakistan demands that immediate actions should be taken towards

cultivation of tolerance for other religions. I think schools should play a vital role for this. All religions in the world should be respected as one respects one's own religion, and above all, schools should try to foster respect and love for whole humanity. This can be done through class discussions. Small projects will also be helpful to foster global identity among my students in Pakistan.

### **Internationalization of Higher Education**

One large systemic goal is that higher education should be re-planned to meet international standards. Students should have frequent international visits and exchanges. Having an ability to imagine oneself in international education will help my students to foster international identity and more tolerance for people who are different from the people around them.

To sum up, I can suggest for myself and my colleagues that IM can be successfully fostered among students in Pakistan in non-IB, low-income schools by involving students in globally engaged tasks, introducing world cultures through technology and guest speakers, celebrating world festivals along with other communities in the world, focusing on other regions where my students' second language is the first language, promotion of religious tolerance, and changing content students are studying.

### **Limitations of Research**

During my study, I could not join and observe when students were busy doing Community Action and Service projects in the local community. This aspect of IB is closely related to fostering IM in students. If I had been able to join those students, I might have been able to see how students engaged in community service and link this service with the service of

humanity across the world. I also wanted to interview students to see how they perceived IM, but could not, thinking that it might connect an evaluative concept with the study.

Due to time constraints, I was unable to study teachers teaching in other schools to enrich my findings. I was also unable to interview the Principal of Blue Star High School, whom I thought would deepen my understanding of the teaching phenomena under study. I was also unable to see how students interacted with members of other communities via Skype and other media.

However, I was able to gather strong evidence of how my cooperating teachers foster IM while teaching their content areas. I was able to see how cultures are celebrated at the school level. I was also able to capture how contents of a subject are explored to foster IM in the schools. I also have the viewpoint of the IB coordinator; how he sees IM can be useful and fostered at the school level in other schools.

### **Final Thoughts**

Throughout the process of this study, I have learned a lot about conceptualization of International Mindedness as well as fostering of IM for diploma students. I have found that students do not easily grasp this concept through class discussions and teaching materials. Conceptualization of IM is a gradual process that requires time and effort. However, it can easily be ignored in regular classes because there are no measures to assess how much students have absorbed the idea and related thoughts. If there are measures created by schools or guidelines from the International Baccalaureate Organization, this highly beneficial concept should be introduced at an early stage as a separate content area with formal assessment counting as part of the final grade.

### **Future Research Implications**

Fostering International Mindedness is an under-researched area. My research is a contribution in the field. I think more research is required to understand how assessment can be used to measure promotion of IM in IB curricula. There is also a requirement for longitudinal study in this field. Due to time constraints, my masters' thesis cannot capture all that I wanted to study.

It is also necessary to develop a clear-cut working definition and a plan to promote IM as provided to schools by IBO. More research is required in this area. I have realized that my cooperating teachers struggle with the concept and try to identify it with various practices not especially relevant to the promotion of IM in their classes.

I believe extensive observational research, like my study, but at a larger level, in individual IB schools would provide an invaluable illustration of the fostering of IM within individual classrooms and the school community at large. This kind of engagement into a school will pave the way for a systematic study of the implementation of IM in individual schools. Each school could provide a case study that would then be used to assist IB and non-IB schools in successful ways in which to internationalize their curriculum and schools.

An interesting follow-up study to my research would be to conduct the exact same study in a different region of the world to determine if the promotion of IM is more successful in other regions than it is in the United States. If this were the case, I think the explanation of the findings would lie largely within macro-level understandings of different cultures, tolerance of "The Other," and cultural biases. It would also help clarify how IM is interpreted in other parts of the world.

## References

- Aggarwal, R., & Goodell, J. W. (2016). Cultural intelligence and IB education. *Journal of Teaching in International Business*, 27, 1-3.
- Alawiye, O., & Williams, H. (2010). Disposition profile inventory: An assessment tool for measuring the professional attitudes and behaviors of teacher education candidates. *National Social Science Journal*, 34(2), 1-12.
- Boote, D. N., & Beile, P. (2005). Scholars before researchers: On the centrality of the dissertation literature review in research preparation. *Educational Researcher*, 34(6), 3-15.
- Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2006). Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative Research in Psychology*, 3(2), 77-101.
- Brooks, R. (2014). Book review: Youth transitions, international student mobility and spatial reflexivity. *Journal of Research in International Education*, 13(3), 248-250.
- Bullock, K. (2011). *International Baccalaureate learner profile: Literature review*. Cardiff, UK: International Baccalaureate Organization. Retrieved from the International Baccalaureate Organization website: [www. ibo.org/research/resources/documents/LPLitReview final. pdf](http://www.ibo.org/research/resources/documents/LPLitReview%20final.pdf).
- Bunnell, T. (2008b). International education and the 'second phase': A framework for conceptualizing its nature and for the future assessment of its effectiveness. *Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education*, 38(4), 415-426. 91.
- Castro, P. Lundgren, U. & Woodin, J. (2015). International mindedness through the looking glass: Reflections on a concept. *Journal of Research in International Education*, 14(3), 187-197.
- Castro, P. Lundgren, U. & Woodin, J. (2013). *Conceptualizing and assessing International Mindedness (IM): An exploratory study. Technical Report*. International Baccalaureate Organization. Geneva: IBO.
- Creswell, J. W. (2013). *Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five approaches*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage publications.
- Creswell, J. W., & Miller, D. L. (2000). *Determining validity in qualitative inquiry*. *Theory into Practice*, 39(3), 124-130.
- Corbin, J., & Strauss, A. (2008). *Basics of Qualitative Research: Techniques and Procedures for Developing Grounded Theory*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage. *Organizational Research Methods*, 12(3), 614-617.



- Daly, J, Kellehear, A., & Gliksman, M. (1997). *The public health researcher: A methodological approach*. Oxford University Press, Melbourne.
- Denzin, N. K. (2000). Interpretive ethnography. *Zeitschrift für Erziehungswissenschaft*, 3(3), 401-409.
- Diploma Programme. (n.d). Retrieved from: <http://www.ibo.org/programmes/diploma-programme/>
- Emerson, R. M., Fretz, R. I., & Shaw, L. L. (2011). *Writing ethnographic fieldnotes*. University of Chicago Press, Chicago.
- Fereday, J, & Muir-Cochrane, E. (2006). Demonstrating rigor using thematic analysis: A hybrid approach of inductive and deductive coding and theme development. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods*, 5(1), 80-92.
- Fischer, M. (2008). Mead and the International Mind. *Transactions of the Charles S. Peirce Society: A Quarterly Journal in American Philosophy*, 44(3), 508-531.
- Fosu, A. K. (2013). *Achieving development success: Strategies and lessons from the developing world*. Oxford University Press, Oxford.
- Glaser, B. G., & Strauss, A. (1967). *The discovery of ground theory*. New York, Alpine Publications.
- Goh, M. (2012): Teaching with cultural intelligence: developing multiculturally educated and globally engaged citizens. *Asia Pacific Journal of Education*, 32(4), 395-415.
- Gunesch, K. (2014). Book review: International mindedness: Global perspectives for learners and educators. *Journal of Research in International Education*, 13(3), 250-252.
- Hayden, M., Thompson, J., & Levy, J. (Eds.). (2007). *The Sage handbook of research in international education*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.
- Haywood, T. (2007). A simple typology of international-mindedness and its implications for education. *The Sage handbook of research in international education*, 79-89.
- Hett, E. J. (1991). *The development of an instrument to measure global-mindedness*. San Diego: University of San Diego Press.
- Hill, I. (2007). International education as developed by the International Baccalaureate Organization. *The SAGE Handbook of Research in International Education*, 25-37.
- Hill, I. (2012). Evolution of education for international mindedness. *Journal of Research in International Education*, 11(3), 245-261.

- International Baccalaureate Organization. (2008) Towards a Continuum of International Education. Cardiff, Wales, United Kingdom: International Baccalaureate Organization.
- International Baccalaureate Organization (2009). *Making the PYP happen: A curriculum framework for international primary education*. Chippenham, Wiltshire, United Kingdom: Antony Rowe Ltd.
- International Baccalaureate Organization (2009). The IB Learner Profile [Booklet].
- International Baccalaureate Organization. (2009). The Primary Years Programme: A basis for practice. Cardiff, Wales, United Kingdom: International Baccalaureate Organization.
- International Baccalaureate Organization. (2011). *MYP: From principles into practice*. Chippenham, Wiltshire, United Kingdom: Antony Rowe Ltd.
- International Baccalaureate Organization. (2013). IB conference of the Americas. [Blog post.] Retrieved from <http://blogs.ibo.org/blog/2013/04/10/ib-conference-of-the-americas/>
- James, K. (2005). International education: The concept, and its relationship to intercultural education. *Journal of Research in International Education*, 4(3), 313-332.
- James, W. (1911). Memories and studies. *The moral equivalent of war*. Longmans, Green, and Company.
- Lai, C. Shum, M. K. & Zhang, B. (2014). International Mindedness in an Asian context: The case of the International Baccalaureate in Hong Kong. *Educational Research*, 56(1), 77-96.
- Lee, M., Hallinger, P., & Walker, A. (2012). A distributed perspective on instructional leadership in International Baccalaureate (IB) schools. *Educational Administration Quarterly*, 48(4), 664-698.
- Mead, G. H. (1929). National-mindedness and international-mindedness. *International Journal of Ethics*, 39(4), 385-407.
- Mercer, N., & Edwards, D. (1987). *Common knowledge. The development of understanding in the classroom*. London: Wiley Blackwell Publisher.
- Merriam, S. B. (1998). *Qualitative research and case study applications in education*. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass Publication.
- Mills, G. E., & Gay, L. R. (2014). *Educational research: Competencies for analysis and applications*. United Kingdom: Pearson Education Limited.
- Miles, M. B, & Huberman, A. M. (1994). *Qualitative data analysis: An expanded sourcebook*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

- Oxfam. (2006.) *Education for Global Citizenship: A Guide for Schools*. [PDF document.] Retrieved from: <http://www.oxfam.org.uk/education/global-citizenship/global-citizenship-guides>
- Phillips, E. (2011). International mindedness and intercultural awareness in the MYP: A relationship reviewed. *Taking the MYP forward*, 33-45.
- Punch, K. F. & Oancea, A. (2014). *Introduction to research methods in education*. Los Angeles, CA: Sage Publications.
- Saldaña, J. (2009). *The coding manual for qualitative researchers*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.
- Sampson, D. L., & Smith, H. P. (1957). A scale to measure world-minded attitudes. *The Journal of Social Psychology*, 45(1), 99-106.
- Singh, M., & Jing, Q. (2013). *21st century international mindedness: An exploratory study of its conceptualization and assessment*. Sydney: University of Western Sydney.
- Sriprakash, A. Singh, M. & Jing, Q. (2014). *A comparative study of international mindedness in the IB Diploma Programme in Australia, China and India*. [PDF document.] Retrieved from <http://www.ibo.org/research/programme-impact-research/diploma-studies/>
- Strauss, A., & Corbin, J. (1998). *Basics of qualitative research*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.
- Suarez-Orozco, M. M. and Qin-Hilliard, D. B. (2004.) *Globalization, culture and education in the new millennium*. Berkeley, CA. University of California Press.
- The Constitution of Pakistan (1973). Article: *25A Right to Education*, Government of Pakistan.
- Tracy, S. J. (2013). *Qualitative research methods*. UK: Wiley-Blackwell.
- Trotta, M., Jacott, L., & Lundgren, U. (2008). Education for world citizenship: Preparing students to be agents of social change. *CiCe Guidelines on Citizenship Education in a global context*, (6).
- United Nations. (2015). The Global Goals for Sustainable Development: Goal 4-Education. Retrieved from <http://www.un.org/sustainabledevelopment/education/>
- Walker, G. (2010). East is east and west is west. [PDF document.] IB Position Paper. Retrieved from [http://blogs.ibo.org/positionpapers/2010/09/23/george\\_walker/](http://blogs.ibo.org/positionpapers/2010/09/23/george_walker/)
- Wells, J. (2011). International Education, Values and Attitudes: A Critical Analysis of the International Baccalaureate (IB) Learner Profile. *Journal of Research in International Education*, 10(2), 174-188.

Yin, R. K. (2013). *Case study research: Design and methods*. Los Angeles, CA: Sage Publications.

Yin, R. K. (2016). *Qualitative research from start to finish, second edition*. New York: The Guilford Press.

## Appendix A

### Teachers' Interview Protocol

Teacher's understanding of and commitment to fostering international mindedness in the classroom.

Classroom-level lead-off questions.

1. What is your understanding of International mindedness?
2. In what ways do you think you are fostering international mindedness in your classroom?
3. Do you see any challenges in promoting international mindedness in the classroom?
4. Do you find it difficult to select materials for your class?
5. Do you face any resistance from your students when you teach global competence in your class?
6. What do you think is the role of international mindedness in the IB curriculum? How much attention do you think it deserves?

School-level lead-off questions.

(any resistance from school, parents, coordinators, what kind of support) support from colleagues.

7. Tell me a little bit about your school. Is there anything special that reinforces the international themes in the school?
8. Can you think of some ways that your school can help you to introduce more international themes/ topics in your classes?
9. IM is a part of the IBO mission statement. Can you provide some examples of how your school helps teachers and students to fulfill that mission?

10. How does your school provide intercultural experiences to emphasize international mindedness in learners?
11. How does your school measure if a teacher can incorporate international content and issues in their instructions?
12. Do you think incorporating international themes in the class should be a part of a teacher's appraisal?
13. Is there any opportunity in your school to encourage teachers to undertake projects of global nature?
14. Are there any events in your school that may be multi-cultural in nature? Do you celebrate some other countries' ritualistic celebrations or days.
15. Do you have CAS (community, action, service) activities that are multi-cultural in nature?
16. Does your school have any opportunities for students to study abroad/ language exchange or other related experiences?

## Appendix B

### Verbal Explanation of Research

The purpose of this research study is to observe how International Mindedness is fostered in IB classrooms. This study will help inform the practices of teaching and learning in Pakistan, my country of origin. I would like to observe your classroom twice a week for a period of three months. During my observations, I would like to take notes and informally talk to you about the teaching practices related to International Mindedness in your classroom. In addition to the classroom observations, I also would like to look at some of your teaching materials to better understand how you foster this concept in your teaching. Finally, I would like to conduct an informal interview with you to learn about your perspectives of International Mindedness. With your permission, I would like to record the interview to make sure I capture your perspectives accurately. Once the the recording has been transcribed, the audio data will be destroyed. Participation in this study is voluntary and no names (yours and students) will be included in the study.


Madiha Mohsin Syeda

Student, M.A. Education

University of Montana.

## Appendix C

### IB Learner Profile




## IB learner profile

The aim of all IB programmes is to develop internationally minded people who, recognizing their common humanity and shared guardianship of the planet, help to create a better and more peaceful world.

As IB learners we strive to be:

<p><b>INQUIRERS</b> We nurture our curiosity, developing skills for inquiry and research. We know how to learn independently and with others. We learn with enthusiasm and sustain our love of learning throughout life.</p> <p><b>KNOWLEDGEABLE</b> We develop and use conceptual understanding, exploring knowledge across a range of disciplines. We engage with issues and ideas that have local and global significance.</p> <p><b>THINKERS</b> We use critical and creative thinking skills to analyse and take responsible action on complex problems. We exercise initiative in making reasoned, ethical decisions.</p> <p><b>COMMUNICATORS</b> We express ourselves confidently and creatively in more than one language and in many ways. We collaborate effectively, listening carefully to the perspectives of other individuals and groups.</p> <p><b>PRINCIPLED</b> We act with integrity and honesty, with a strong sense of fairness and justice, and with respect for the dignity and rights of people everywhere. We take responsibility for our actions and their consequences.</p>	<p><b>OPEN-MINDED</b> We critically appreciate our own cultures and personal histories, as well as the values and traditions of others. We seek and evaluate a range of points of view, and we are willing to grow from the experience.</p> <p><b>CARING</b> We show empathy, compassion and respect. We have a commitment to service, and we act to make a positive difference in the lives of others and in the world around us.</p> <p><b>RISK-TAKERS</b> We approach uncertainty with forethought and determination; we work independently and cooperatively to explore new ideas and innovative strategies. We are resourceful and resilient in the face of challenges and change.</p> <p><b>BALANCED</b> We understand the importance of balancing different aspects of our lives—intellectual, physical, and emotional—to achieve well-being for ourselves and others. We recognize our interdependence with other people and with the world in which we live.</p> <p><b>REFLECTIVE</b> We thoughtfully consider the world and our own ideas and experience. We work to understand our strengths and weaknesses in order to support our learning and personal development.</p>
--	---

The IB learner profile represents 10 attributes valued by IB World Schools. We believe these attributes, and others like them, can help individuals and groups become responsible members of local, national and global communities.

 International Baccalaureate  
Baccalauréat International  
Bachillerato Internacional

© International Baccalaureate Organization 2013  
International Baccalaureate® | Baccalauréat International® | Bachillerato Internacional®