

University of Montana

## ScholarWorks at University of Montana

---

Graduate Student Theses, Dissertations, &  
Professional Papers

Graduate School

---

2009

### Ren Leadership: An Interpretive Biography of Bai Fangli

Jin Zhou

*The University of Montana*

Follow this and additional works at: <https://scholarworks.umt.edu/etd>

**Let us know how access to this document benefits you.**

---

#### Recommended Citation

Zhou, Jin, "Ren Leadership: An Interpretive Biography of Bai Fangli" (2009). *Graduate Student Theses, Dissertations, & Professional Papers*. 1300.  
<https://scholarworks.umt.edu/etd/1300>

This Dissertation is brought to you for free and open access by the Graduate School at ScholarWorks at University of Montana. It has been accepted for inclusion in Graduate Student Theses, Dissertations, & Professional Papers by an authorized administrator of ScholarWorks at University of Montana. For more information, please contact [scholarworks@mso.umt.edu](mailto:scholarworks@mso.umt.edu).

REN LEADERSHIP: AN INTERPRETIVE BIOGRAPHY OF BAI FANGLI

By

Jin Zhou

B.A., The University of Montana, Missoula, MT, 2002  
M.Ed., The University of Montana, Missoula, MT, 2003  
M.P.A., The University of Montana, Missoula, MT, 2004

Dissertation

Presented in partial fulfillment of the requirements  
for the degree of

Doctor of Education

The University of Montana  
Missoula, MT

June 2009

Approved by:

Perry Brown, Associate Provost for Graduate Education  
Graduate School

William P. McCaw, Chair  
Department of Educational Leadership

Roberta D. Evans  
Department of Educational Leadership

Rhea Ashmore  
Department of Curriculum and Instruction

John Matt  
Department of Educational Leadership

Zhen Cao  
Department of Modern & Classical Languages and Literatures

## Ren Leadership: An Interpretive Biography of Bai Fangli

Chairman: William P. McCaw, Ed. D.

The purpose of this qualitative interpretive biographical study was to enhance our understanding of leadership by exploring the life of Bai Fangli through the lens of Confucian virtues. This study followed Denzin's (1989a) qualitative design of interpretive biography by exploring Bai's epiphanies to offer multiple perspectives on the significance of the epiphanies and their impact on Bai's life and his influence as a modern Chinese leader. This study was guided by the central question: What is the essence of the life and leadership of Bai Fangli as explored through the lens of Confucian virtues? In order to answer this study's central question, Denzin's data analysis procedures were applied for this study. Incorporating Denzin's data analysis procedures, this study applied three phases of data analysis: (a) document analysis, (b) interview analysis, and (c) combined the analysis of the documents and interviews.

Data from documents were gathered from 91 online newspaper articles, 43 photographs, and 8 videoclips. Interview data were gathered during open-ended interviews with 12 purposefully selected participants. An internet-based audio video system, emails, and phone were utilized in this study. Four themes and seven sub virtue themes were combined from these documents and interviews. The lens of Confucian virtues was articulated based on seven sub virtue themes and how they are aligned with the literature review. Bai Fangli's interpretive biography was then reconstructed and the major themes that have shaped his life were identified.

This study enhances our understanding of leadership by articulating Ren Leadership, a universal leadership. Since Bai's actions demonstrated both Eastern virtues of benevolence and great love [*ren ai*], righteousness [*yi*], rituals [*li*], wisdom [*zhi*], trustworthiness [*xin*], fortitude [*yong*], and frugality [*jian*] and Western virtues of prudence, justice, fortitude, and temperance, the second finding recognized that moral leadership is applicable to both Eastern and Western world views. The third finding describes an example of a moral leader in China who blended both Eastern and Western virtues. Finally, this study revealed the feasibility of the return of the traditional Confucian virtues in contemporary China.

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Writing this dissertation has been the most arduous, magnificent, and unforgettable time in my life. During this period, many people enlightened and helped me in many ways. I would like to express my deepest gratitude and thankfulness to the following individuals:

First and foremost is the inspiration and support given to me by my parents. Their constant support and encouragement motivated me to fulfill this research journey with passion and enjoyment. Without them, this research journey would have been more difficult.

Special thanks to my Dissertation Committee Chair, Professor Bill McCaw for his guidance, direction, encouragement, and positive affirmations. His rigorous research attitude and meticulous working style deeply influenced me. During this research process, Dr. McCaw constantly opened my mind and elevated my research capabilities.

Many thanks to my Dissertation Committee members: Dean Bobbie Evans for her encouragement and critical support. Her encouragement increases my confidence. Dr. Rhea Ashmore for her kind and patient guidance. Dr. Merle Farrier for his guidance and direction. Dr. Zhen Cao for his support, interest, and guidance. Dr. John Matt for his time and commitment.

Many thanks to my interviewees: Bai Guofu, Bai Jinfeng, Xu Xiuqin, Bai Song, Bai Huanyi, Bai Guoran, Bai Xiqian, Li Li, Li Jialun, Sun Yuying, Xu Qiming, and Chen Zhaoxiang for their information, support, and motivation.

And lastly, my deep appreciation to William Wang for his constant support, guidance, and encouragement.

June 2, 2009  
Missoula, Montana

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION TO THE STUDY .....	1
Statement of the Problem.....	5
Purpose of the Study .....	7
Research Questions.....	7
Definitions of Terms .....	8
Delimitations of the Study .....	14
Limitations of the Study.....	15
Significance of the Study .....	15
Summary .....	16
 CHAPTER TWO: REVIEW OF THE LITERATURE .....	 18
Introduction.....	18
Contemporary Chinese Issues Related to the Loss of Confucian Moral Values.....	 19
The Symptoms of the Moral Belief Crisis .....	20
The Loss of Moral Ideals, Goals and Ethics .....	20
The Loss of Moral Emotions .....	20
The Distortion of Moral Motivation .....	21
The Origins of the Moral Belief Crisis .....	22
Official Corruption.....	23
Fake and Shoddy Goods .....	24
Reversing the Nature of Good and Evil.....	25
Contemporary Chinese Issues Calling for Confucian Moral Values.....	 26
Governmental Officials Calling for the Traditional Confucian Moral Values.....	 27
Scholars Calling for the Traditional Confucian Moral Values .....	28
Confucianism, Taoism, & Buddhism.....	29
Historical Review of Confucianism, Taoism, & Buddhism .....	29
Neo-Confucianism .....	30
Confucius (551-479 BCE) .....	32
Mencius (370-290 BC) .....	33
Taoism.....	34
Laozi (604-471 BCE).....	34
Buddhism .....	35
Buddha (563-483 BCE) .....	36
Eastern and Western Virtues.....	38
Eastern Virtues.....	38
Benevolence ( <i>Ren</i> ) .....	38
Righteousness ( <i>Yi</i> ) .....	39
Propriety or Rites ( <i>Li</i> ) .....	39
Wisdom ( <i>Zhi</i> ) .....	40
Trustworthiness ( <i>Xin</i> ) .....	41

Western Virtues .....	42
Prudence.....	42
Justice.....	42
Fortitude.....	43
Temperance.....	44
Doctrine of the Mean .....	44
Eastern and Western Leadership Theories.....	46
Eastern Leadership Theories.....	46
Paternalistic Leadership.....	47
Confucian Moral Leadership .....	50
Western Leadership Theories .....	52
Leader-Member Exchange Theory .....	53
Transactional Leadership.....	54
Charismatic Leadership .....	54
Servant Leadership.....	55
Transformational Leadership.....	60
Moral Leadership.....	65
Power and Influence .....	70
Referent Power.....	71
Presencing and Theory U.....	73
Formal and Informal Leadership .....	75
Summary of the Literature Review.....	78
CHAPTER THREE: METHODOLOGY .....	81
Research Design.....	81
Interpretive Biography .....	82
The Epiphany .....	83
Research Questions .....	83
Data Collection .....	84
Participants.....	86
Data Collection Procedures.....	87
Accuracy/Trustworthiness and Verification .....	89
Generalizability/Transferability .....	89
The Role of the Researcher.....	90
Summary.....	92
CHAPTER FOUR: FINDINGS FROM THE QUALITATIVE INQUIRY .....	93
Introduction.....	93
Data Analysis .....	93
Document Analysis.....	94
Interview Analysis .....	101
Demographic Information.....	104
Emerging Themes .....	105
Document Themes .....	106
Interview Themes.....	109
Selected Responses from Interviews with 12 Subjects.....	110

Combined Analysis .....	114
Lens of Confucian Virtues .....	115
Bai's Virtues .....	116
Righteousness [ <i>Dayi</i> ] .....	116
Wisdom [ <i>Zhi</i> ] .....	118
Fortitude [ <i>Yong</i> ] .....	122
Trustworthiness [ <i>Xin</i> ] .....	125
Rituals [ <i>Li</i> ] .....	128
Benevolence [ <i>Ren Ai</i> ] .....	130
Frugality [ <i>Jian</i> ] .....	134
Bai's Influence .....	139
The Material and Spiritual Asset - Pedicab .....	150
Moral Example .....	153
Interpretive Biography .....	157
Epiphany .....	157
Major Epiphany .....	158
Minor Epiphany .....	161
First Representative Epiphany .....	161
Second Representative Epiphany .....	163
Third Representative Epiphany .....	165
Summary .....	166
 CHAPTER FIVE: CONCLUSIONS, FINDINGS, AND IMPLICATIONS .....	168
Introduction .....	168
Summation of the Central Question and Sub-questions .....	168
Sub-Question One: How did Bai Fangli Blend his Life and Leadership? .....	169
Sub-Question Two: How did Bai Fangli's Leadership Impact the Lives of Other Individuals? .....	170
Sub-Question Three: How did Bai Fangli's Epiphanies Influence his actions? .....	172
Sub-Question Four: Where did Bai Fangli's Influence Come From? .....	174
Sub-Question Five: What was Bai Fangli's Belief Structure? .....	176
Central Question Summation .....	177
Findings .....	181
Implications .....	184
Implications for Leaders .....	184
Implications for Further Studies .....	185
 References .....	187
 APPENDICES .....	224
Appendix A	
Consent Form .....	225
Appendix B	
Interview Protocol .....	230

Appendix C	
Field Memo .....	251
Appendix D	
Interview Codes .....	253
Appendix E	
Chronology of Bai Fangli .....	255
Appendix F	
Document References Pertaining to Bai Fangli.....	257
Appendix G	
Data Analysis Tables .....	263
Appendix H	
Document and Audiovisual Material Protocols .....	295



## LIST OF TABLES

Table	Page
Table Example 4-1	97
A Sample of the Beginning Codes for the Document Analysis .....	97
Table Example 4-2	98
A Sample of Synthesis of Data from 91 Online Newspaper Articles .....	98
Table Example 4-3	100
A Sample of Synthesis of Data from 43 Photographs .....	100
Table Example 4-4	101
A Sample of Synthesis of Data from Eight Videoclips .....	101
Table Example 4-5	102
A Sample of Interview Codes for Individuals Not Close to Bai Fangli.....	102
Table Example 4-6	102
A Sample of Interview Codes for Individuals Close to Bai Fangli.....	102
Table Example 4-7	104
A Sample of Synthesis of Data Extracted from Selected Responses of 12 Participants .....	104
Table Example 4-8	109
A Sample of Emerging Interview Themes and Sub Virtue Themes from Each Participant .....	109
Table Example 4-9	109
A Sample of Emerging Interview Themes and Sub Virtue Themes from Each Interview Question .....	109
Table 4-1	264
The Beginning Codes for the Document Analysis .....	264
Table 4-2	265
A Synthesis of Data from 91 Online Newspaper Articles .....	265
Table 4-3	274
A Synthesis of Data from 43 Photographs.....	274
Table 4-4	282
A Synthesis of Data from Eight Videoclips.....	282
Table 4-5	284
An Illustration of Interview Codes for Individuals Not Close to Bai Fangli.....	284
Table 4-6	286
An Illustration of Interview Codes for Individuals Close to Bai Fangli.....	286
Table 4-7	105
Demographic Information of the Participants.....	105
Table 4-8	106
The Emerging Themes from 91 newspaper articles .....	106

Table 4-9	Four Emerging Document Themes from 91 Online Newspaper Articles, 43 Photographs, and Eight Videoclips .....	107
Table 4-10	Seven Combined Sub Virtue Themes from 91 Online Newspaper Articles, 43 Photographs, and Eight Videoclips .....	108
Table 4-11	Emerging Interview Themes and Sub Virtue Themes from Each Participant.....	289
Table 4-12	Emerging Interview Themes and Sub Virtue Themes from Each Interview Question .....	290
Table 4-13	Four Emerging Interview Themes from Interviews with 12 Subjects.....	293
Table 4-14	Seven Emerging Sub Virtue Themes from Interviews with 12 Subjects.....	295
Table 4-15	Four Combined Themes from Documents and Interview Analysis.....	115
Table 4-16	Seven Combined Sub Virtue Themes from Documents and Interview Analysis .....	115

## CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION TO THE STUDY

### Introduction

Transformational leadership is widely studied by many scholars, and it occupies a vital place in leadership research (Northouse, 2007). Yukl (2002) indicated that transformational leadership was recognized as the most highly valued contemporary Western leadership theory. Burns (1978), Bass (1985a), and Howell and Avolio (1992), among others, have scrutinized the moral component of transformational leadership. In his early work, Bass (1985a) posited that values play vital roles for transformational leadership, and later Howell and Avolio (1992) indicated that true transformational leaders are socialized leaders with concern for the common good. Burns (1978) believed that transformational leaders engage with their followers and lift them to higher levels of motivation and morality.

U.S. business and education have been recognizing moral leadership. Bass (1998a) supported Burns' (1978) view on the moral dimension of transformational leadership and indicated that authentic transformational leadership must be grounded in moral foundations and that transformational leaders "set examples to be emulated by their followers" (Bass & Steidlmeier, 1999, p. 182). Lemieux (2005) stated that moral leadership embraces transformational leadership theories depicted by Burns (1978). In addition, moral leadership has been adopted by many writers in education such as Etzioni, 1993; Green, 2009; Greenfield, 1986; Hodgkinson, 1991, 1996; Sergiovanni, 1992, 1996, 2009; and Wong, 1998. Hodgkinson (1991) asserted that since education influences others and offers teachers, administrators, and leaders subtle moral responsibilities, educational leadership is both moral and unique. Sergiovanni (1992, 2009) depicted

moral leadership as the heart, head, and hand of leadership. Furthermore, Wong (1998) stated that “moral leadership could be both a motivating and stabilizing factor in sustaining the performance of schools” (p. 122).

Notwithstanding U.S. business and education acknowledging moral leadership, China, since Confucius’ time, has had a long history of preparing leaders on moral grounds (Wong, 1998, 2001). Both Chinese and Western scholars agree that Confucianism has been the predominant cultural inheritance for the Chinese people (Bond & Hwang, 1986; Fairbank & Reischauer, 1973; Pye, 1988; Tu, 1985). Confucianism believes that “human nature is intrinsically good with an ‘innate ability’ to do good. It seeks to build moral social order in life” (Wong, 2001, p. 311). Confucianism stresses human dignity, a sense of the transcendent, a commitment to human attainment, and a concern for standards of “rightness” in human moral conduct (Camilleri, 2007; Muzaffar, 1999). Similar to Confucianism, the transformational leader pays personal attention to followers based on the individual followers’ needs for attainment and growth (Avolio & Bass, 2002).

Confucius (551-479 BCE) and Mencius (372-289 BCE), the two founding fathers of Confucianism, underlined moral training of character and the restoration of the ancient rites (Chen & Lee, 2008; Wong, 2001). Confucius was the first one who advocated “education without discrimination” and carried out school education among ordinary people, which “used to be a privilege of the ruling class” (Yang, Peng, & Lee, 2008, p. 32). He and other Confucians taught ordinary people cardinal virtues: benevolence or humanness [*ren*], righteousness [*yi*], etiquette or rituals [*li*], wisdom [*zhi*], trustworthiness [*xin*], faithfulness [*zhong*], altruism [*shu*], and filial piety [*xiao*] (Bass & Steidlmeier,

1999; Xin, 1994; Yan & Sorenson, 2004; Yang et al., 2008). In light of Confucius, learning is not only to cultivate oneself, but to help others as well. Essentially learning holds two aims: to learn to be an upright, moral person or the gentleman [*junzi*] and to serve the people (Wong, 2001).

When the Chinese gradually adopted Western models of social and political organizations for modernization in the last century, little by little traditional Confucian values have been discarded or accepted into hybrids by the Chinese (Wong, 1998). In 1915, the New Cultural Movement began. During the May Fourth Movement in 1919, the Chinese intellectual, Chen Duxiu (1879-1942) closed Confucian shops (Fairbank & Goldman, 2006; Hsu, 1995; Wong, 2001; Xu, 2007; Yuan, 2002). As a result, the influence of Confucian values has been diminishing among the Chinese intellectuals due to the New Cultural Movement (Fairbank & Goldman, 2006; Hsu, 1995; Wong, 2001). During the “Cultural Revolution” (1966-1976), the leaders of the Chinese Communist Party (CCP) wanted to banish the Confucian ethics from the Chinese citizens as a belief system. Since the 1970s, the influence of Confucian values has been diminishing, and the Confucian tradition is gradually fading. According to Shi (2006), this is the historical reason that may have caused the loss of Confucian values in China today.

In addition, many Chinese intellectuals and Western scholars recognized that the recent social situation may be the cause for the loss of the Confucian moral values or a moral belief crisis [*daode xinyang wei ji*] in China (Fan, 2007; Farrer, 2002; Gao, 2001; Ge, 2001; Han, 2005; Hu, 2007; Jing, 1999; Shi, 2006; Tang, 2006; Wei, 2004; Xu, 2000). It is imperative to note that Confucian moral values are the foundation of the traditional Chinese moral belief system.

Bai Fangli, a modern Chinese leader, was discovered around the same time when Chinese government officials and scholars were calling for the return of Confucian moral values due to a moral belief crisis in China (Gao, 2001; Jing, 2007; Wei, 2004). Although he was illiterate, Bai Fangli was fond of knowledge and people with knowledge. He cared deeply about education in China. Bai Fangli pedaled his pedicab for 56 years, and the earnings from his efforts supported education for 14 years. During this time, he helped more than 300 college students with their tuition and living expenses. Bai persisted in earning money to support students by efforts almost exceeding life's limitations. Every cent he sent to the students was earned by physically pedaling his pedicab from the time Bai Fangli was 74 years old until he was 87 years old. The distance Bai Fangli rode his pedicab for 14 years is the equivalent of 18 trips around the earth's equator.

Besides Bai's monetary support to students in Tianjin, his leadership and inspiration have influenced many students. These students not only worked hard to complete their studies but were admitted to famous Chinese universities. Also, Bai's deeds have inspired people in the Chinese society. More and more people contribute their love to help the poor and needy as a result of Bai Fangli's actions (*Tianjin Daily*, 2005). In addition, Bai Fangli's old pedicab symbolized Bai's spirit and became the mascot of assisting educational practice for the next generation. At the Interactive Charitable Night at the Great Hall of People in Beijing, the first display auctioned was the pedicab. The Shandong University won the right to display Bai's pedicab for the first year in 2006. Bai Fangli's old pedicab was the only treasure auctioned with the 1-year right to display. All the funds earned from the auction were used to establish the New Great Wall Bai Fangli Fund to help college students in need. Furthermore, to carry out the spirit of Bai Fangli,

the Tianjin Education Committee and the Tianjin Branch Red Cross Society jointly established a scholarship that translates into English as Bai Fangli's Love.

#### Statement of the Problem

In the money-first ethos that prevailed since the early 1980s in mainland China (Link, 1993; Shi, 2006), people started placing more emphasis on material comfort than anything else (Wei, 2004). However, Confucianism alleges that virtues are the most important human qualities (Koehn, 2001). Some sectors of the Chinese society have lost moral control; the boundaries between right and wrong, good and evil, beauty and ugliness are obscured; money worship [*paijin zhuyi*] and extreme individualism [*jidian geren zhuyi*] are rising; people violate moral grounds for the purpose of seeking benefits; and dishonesty, cheating, and fraud have become social evils (Koehn, 2001; Qiang & Fairbrother, 2006; Shi, 2006; Wei, 2004). Widespread official corruption, the rise of crime and violence, and an altered set of winners and losers make ordinary Chinese citizens confused about the traditional Confucian moral values (Wei, 2004). Hence, the traditional Confucian moral values as the groundwork of the Chinese moral belief system are receding (Han, 2005; Shi, 2006; Tu, 1996; Wei, 2004). Some traditional Chinese ways of behaving are being challenged, and many behaviors regarded as inappropriate before are now being practiced and accepted (Fu, Peng, Kennedy, & Yukl, 2004).

China is obviously having an economic boom, and, unfortunately, it is also entering a "moral vacuum" and "belief vacuum" (Ni, 2004; Shi, 2006; Wei, 2004). Tu Wei-ming (1996) posited that the core of Chinese identity has been challenged by the economic boom and the moral belief system that supports it. Chinese intellectuals speak of today as an era of a moral belief crisis [*daode xinyang weiji*] (Fan, 2007; Farrer, 2002;

Gao, 2001; Han, 2005; Hu, 2007; Jing, 1999; Shi, 2006; Tang, 2006; Wei, 2004; Xu, 2000).

Both Chinese and Western researchers noted that moral education in Chinese schools has become a serious problem (Bakken, 1991, 2000; Li, 1997; Meyer, 1990; Price, 1992; Shao, 1996). In addition, some researchers think that the problems of moral education are closely associated with the quandaries that exist in contemporary Chinese society (Li, 1997; Ma, 2004). For instance, Li posited that “moral education was suffering from a moral crisis at the present time” (as cited in Nie, 2005, p. 4).

Moral leaders have been greatly respected throughout Chinese history, and moral leadership behaviors are considered vital for leadership effectiveness in contemporary China due to the legal system and institutional norms that are still developing (Lau, Liu, & Fu, 2007). In the absence of codified rules and regulations and effective enforcement mechanisms, Chinese leaders have to depend heavily on a value influence process (Lau et al., 2007). Although in recent decades corruption and other immoral behaviors are shaking Chinese confidence and trust in their leaders, moral leadership is highly needed (Lin, 2008). The Chinese President Hu Jintao posited that the influences of moral leaders are infinite (*Xinhua Net*, 2007). Also, moral leaders play important roles in Confucianism. For instance, in the *Analects*, Confucius depicted “见贤思齐” as seeing a leader with exalted morality; people will be inspired by him and want to look at him as a moral model. However, there are very few examples of contemporary moral leaders in China (*People's Daily*, 2007). Thus, there is a lack of contemporary moral leaders in the Chinese citizens' real lives. If there are very few examples of contemporary moral leaders in China, people may feel that the characteristic of the moral leader appears to be



unattainable. If moral leadership appears to be unattainable, people may not care for morality and may think that some immoral behaviors are acceptable. Gradually, the concept of morality and moral leadership becomes abstract and hollow. If the concept becomes abstract, people do not know what moral leadership looks like, and it will be easier for them to turn away from moral leadership. By turning away from moral leadership, people will gradually lose Confucian moral values. At present, China is confronting the loss of the traditional Confucian virtues; in what many are calling a moral belief crisis.

### Purpose of the Study

The purpose of this interpretive biographical study was to enhance our understanding of leadership by exploring the life of Bai Fangli through the lens of Confucian moral values. This study followed Denzin's (1989a, 1989b) qualitative design of interpretive biography by exploring Bai's epiphanies to offer multiple perspectives on the significance of the epiphanies and their impact on Bai's life and his influence as a modern Chinese leader. Through this exploration, threads of leadership were depicted to embrace the life experience of this one individual. Meaning was ascribed to stories, narratives, and turning-points in his life. By employing a qualitative interpretive biographical research method, the researcher discovered the insights that helped answer this study's central question.

### Research Questions

Creswell (1998) suggested qualitative researchers to posit the broadest question they could possibly pose about their studies. In writing a biography, Denzin (1989b) proposed that research questions follow an interpretive format and be formulated into a

single statement, starting with one's own personal history and building on other information. For biographers, Creswell (1998) posited that the central question can be inferred from the purpose of the study. Based on the previously articulated purpose, this study was guided by the following central question: What is the essence of the life and leadership of Bai Fangli as explored through the lens of Confucian virtues?

### Definitions of Terms

For the purpose of this study, the following terms and definitions were used:

#### *Belief Structure*

Belief comes from “be” meaning “to be” and lief, which traces back to “love.” Belief means to be in love. Love is dependent upon truth in order to exist, therefore, to believe is to elevate truth to a higher level, to love. Thus, a belief structure refers to one's opinion, conviction, intertwined morality and core values, and deep-seated values must consist of truths (Hong, 2007).

#### *Benevolence (Ren)*

In Chinese, the pronunciation of human and benevolence (or humaneness) is the same, namely *ren*, and the word for benevolence is composed of two morphemes meaning two people. Literarily and philosophically, Confucius and Mencius believed that being human is being benevolent and that to be benevolent is to “be human” (*ren zhe ren ye*) and is to love humans (*ren zhe ai ren*). Confucius defined benevolence as the virtue of all virtues (*Analects*, 1994).

### *Buddhism (Fo Jiao)*

Buddhism is a philosophy and religion involving the teaching of Buddha.

Buddhism was originally from India, yet it is recognized mainly with China (Ozmon & Craver, 2008).

### *Cardinal Virtues*

The three moral virtues, justice, courage, and temperance, plus the intellectual virtue of prudence are often referred to as the four cardinal virtues because they address the whole person (*Nicomachean Ethics*, 2002).

### *Chinese Traditional Culture*

The core of Chinese traditional culture comprises Confucianism (*Ru Xue*), Buddhism (*Fo Jiao*), and Taoism (*Dao Jiao*) (Fan, 2000).

### *Confucian Cardinal Virtues (De)*

Moral qualities such as benevolence [*ren*], righteousness [*yi*], rituals [*li*], wisdom [*zhi*], and trustworthiness [*xin*] are Confucian cardinal virtues (Yang et al., 2008).

### *Confucianism (Ru Xue)*

Confucianism is a moral ideology or social tradition fathered by the Chinese philosopher Confucius and his disciples in the sixth and fifth centuries B.C. It is concerned with the principles of civil conduct, common sense, right and wrong, and proper social relationships (World of Sociology, 2001).

### *Culture*

Culture is defined as “the learned beliefs, values, rules, norms, symbols, and traditions that are common to a group of people. It is these shared qualities of a group that make them unique” (Northhouse, 2007, p. 302).

### *Fortitude*

Fortitude refers to the strength of mind that enables one to endure adversity with courage (Princeton University WorldNet 3.0, 2006).

### *Intellectual Virtue*

Intellectual virtue is the strength and exercise of the capacity that orders human actions to a good end in mind. Intellectual virtues include prudence (practical wisdom) and speculative wisdom (*Nicomachean Ethics*, 2002).

### *Interpretive Biography*

An interpretive biography stands for “creating literary, narrative, accounts and representations of lived experiences. Telling and inscribing stories” (Denzin, 1989a, p. 11).

### *Junzi*

*Junzi* means gentleman, the superior man or the nobleman (Chan, 1963).

### *Justice*

Justice is a quality of being just or fair (Princeton University WorldNet 3.0, 2006).

### *Leader*

Adapted from Northhouse (2007), a person engages others to act for common good.

### *Leadership (Operational Definition)*

Leadership is a virtuous process whereby an individual influences others to attain a common goal (*Nicomachean Ethics*, 2002; Northhouse, 2007).

### *Leadership Style*

Northhouse (2007) stated that leadership style emphasizes “the behavior of the leader and it focuses exclusively on what leaders do and how they act” (p. 69).

### *Moral*

Moral refers to principles of right and wrong established by objective standards of human behavior and character (Princeton University WorldNet 3.0, 2006).

### *Moral Belief (Daode Xinyang)*

The concept of moral belief refers to the moral foundation of metaphysics. Moral belief has two implications: (a) Spiritual foundation of the formation of morality; and (b) highest goals and highest realms of morality (Wei, 2004).

### *Moral Belief Crisis (Daode Xinyang Weiji)*

A moral belief crisis first shows that one doubts, fluctuates, and negates at some moral ideals and goals, as well as the spiritual foundation (Dong, 2005; Gao, 2001; Wei, 2004). At the same time, new moral ideals and goals have not been established. Therefore, a moral belief crisis is a deep spiritual crisis (Gao, 2001; Wei, 2004).

### *Moral Leadership*

Burns (1978) defined moral leadership as:

Moral leadership “emerges from, and always returns to, the fundamental wants and needs, aspirations, and values of the followers. I mean the kind of leadership that can produce social change that will satisfy followers’ authentic needs” (p. 4).

### *Moral Virtues*

Moral virtue is the strength and exercise of the capacity that orders human actions to a good end in character. Moral virtues include justice, fortitude, temperance, and prudence (*Nicomachean Ethics*, 2002).

### *Prudence*

*Prudence* is often referred to as practical wisdom. Prudence is the quality characterized by rational, long-term judgment with respect to particular actions (*Nicomachean Ethics*, 2002).

### *Righteousness (Yi)*

Righteousness is one of the Confucian cardinal virtues referring to “living and acting according to moral principles” (Yang et al., 2008, p. 35).

### *Ritual Propriety (Li)*

Ritual propriety is one of Confucian cardinal virtues referring to “the observation of appropriate rituals and rules of conduct, which are social norms rather than formal laws and regulations” (Yang et al., 2008, p. 35).

### *Taoism (Dao Jiao)*

Taoism is a Chinese system of thought stressing the nature of the universe and human existence (Lee, Han, Byron, & Fan, 2008).

### *Temperance*

Temperance governs one’s appetite for pleasure. Temperance does not restrain one from the pleasures that are reasonable, but from those that are contrary to one’s own reason (*Nicomachean Ethics*, 2002).

### *Transformational Leadership*

Burns (1978) stated that transformational leadership occurs when leaders and followers raise one another to higher levels of motivation and morality.

Transformational leadership “becomes moral in that it raises the level of human conduct and ethical aspiration of both leader and led, and thus it has a transforming effect on both” (p. 20).

### *Trustworthiness (Xin)*

Trustworthiness is one of the Confucian cardinal virtues that “implies adherence and loyalty to moral principles” (Yang et al., 2008, p. 35).

### *Turning Points/ Epiphanies*

Denzin (1989a) defined the “turning points” or the “epiphanies” as “problematic experiences or moments of revelation in a person’s life” (p. 33).

### *Virtue*

Virtue literally means moral excellence. More thoroughly, virtue is the strength and exercise of the capacity that orders human actions to a good end in both character (moral virtue) and mind (intellectual virtue) (*Nicomachean Ethics*, 2002).

## *Wisdom*

The English word wisdom is derived from wis, meaning wise, dom, meaning woman. Wisdom is sometimes referred to speculative wisdom to distinguish from practical wisdom (*Nicomachean Ethics*, 2002). The term speculative denotes this form of wisdom is conceptual rather than applied. Speculative wisdom concerns itself with the nature of things while prudence, literally from “experience,” concerns particulars within a nature (*Nicomachean Ethics*, 2002). Mencius applied *zhi zhe wu huo* to define wisdom (*zhi*), one of the Confucian cardinal virtues. *Zhi zhe wu huo* translates as the wise is prudent and sensible to apply his practical knowledge to correctly understanding and grasping his life, the world, and real situations (Lau, 1970).

### Delimitations of the Study

Creswell (1998, 2003) suggested using delimitations as a means of establishing boundaries and narrowing the scope of the study. The participants for this study were purposefully selected. The participants were delimited to specific criteria. That was, the participants must be associated with Bai Fangli. They either had a close relationship with Bai Fangli or were able to provide pertinent information about him. Also, other documents such as archival material, photographs or videotapes, newspaper articles, as well as electronic messages, were delimited to Bai Fangli. In addition, the nature of articles not being primary sources was one of the delimitations of this study. Furthermore, the examination of Bai’s lived experience was delimited to his life and leadership as explored through the lens of Confucian virtues.



### Limitations of the Study

In a qualitative study, limitations identify potential weaknesses and reservations of the study (Creswell, 1998, 2003). The interview data were collected from Bai Fangli's son, daughter, relatives, and friends in China and based upon their recollections and perceptions, which may change over time. While there might be similarities within Bai Fangli's life and the lives of other dedicated people and while transferability was expected, this study was not generalizable to other people in China or other countries. Another limitation of this study was that "the findings may be subject to other interpretations" (Kunes, 1991, pp. 21-22). Interviews were conducted in Chinese, translated into English, and checked by Dissertation Committee member who is Chinese. In some cases, translation may not be clear due to the translation issues. The final limitation was that the researcher was not able to interview Bai Fangli since he passed away in 2005.

### Significance of the Study

This study applied a qualitative interpretive biographical research method to enhance our understanding of leadership by exploring the life of Bai Fangli through the lens of Confucian virtues. Because there is evidence that China is gradually losing the traditional Confucian virtues, this study revealed the feasibility of the return of the traditional Confucian virtues in contemporary China. Although Bai Fangli, a modern Chinese leader, has only been recognized in China, this study found that Bai Fangli blended both Confucian virtues of benevolence and great love [*ren ai*], righteousness [*yi*], rituals [*li*], wisdom [*zhi*], trustworthiness [*xin*], fortitude [*yong*], and frugality [*jian*] and Aristotelian virtues of prudence, justice, fortitude, and temperance through his action.

Thus, moral leadership is applicable to both Eastern and Western world views. Moral leadership is highly needed, and examples of moral leaders are pivotal in China because they have the potential to become exemplars to arouse ordinary people's moral consciousness. When morality becomes crystallized and vitalized, it is more likely to be accepted and practiced by ordinary people. The influences of moral leaders are infinite.

This study found an example of a moral leader in China who blended both Eastern and Western virtues. Most research has focused on formal leaders, those in a "position" of leadership (Pielstick, 2000). However, there is limited research on the role of the informal leader (Pescosolido, 2001). Thus, this research contributed to the study of Chinese informal leaders, of which Bai Fangli was one. Most importantly, this study found a new leadership model that transcends culture.

#### Summary

Transformational leadership is the most acknowledged Western leadership theory. Based on the works of Burns (1978) and later Bass (1985a, 1996, 1998), Sergiovanni (1992, 2009) described moral leadership as the heart, head, and hand of leadership. However, China, since Confucius' time, has had a long history of preparing leaders on moral grounds (Wong, 1998, 2001). Traditionally, the Chinese evaluate a leader based on five cardinal virtues: (a) benevolence [*ren*], (b) righteousness [*yi*], (c) rituals [*li*], (d) wisdom [*zhi*], and (e) trustworthiness [*xin*].

When the Chinese gradually adopted Western models of social and political organization in the last century, little by little, traditional Confucian moral values have been discarded or accepted into hybrids (Wong, 1998). During the "Cultural Revolution" (1966-1976), CCP leaders wanted to banish the Confucian ethics from the Chinese

citizens as a belief system. Since the 1970s, the influence of Confucian values has been diminishing and the Confucian tradition is gradually fading and dwindling. Many Chinese intellectuals and Western scholars claim that China is confronting a moral belief crisis [*daode xinyang weiji*] now.

When Chinese governmental officials and scholars called for the return of the traditional Confucian moral values, Bai Fangli was discovered. As a pedicab rider, Bai Fangli supported more than 300 college students with their tuition and living expenses. Also, Bai's leadership and inspiration have influenced many students whom he supported and people in the Chinese society. In addition, Bai Fangli's old pedicab became a mascot of assisting educational practice for the next generation. To carry out the leadership of Bai Fangli, several scholarship funds have been set up under his name, such as Bai Fangli's Love and the New Great Wall Bai Fangli Fund. The purpose of this interpretive biographical study was to enhance our understanding of leadership by exploring the life of Bai Fangli through the lens of Confucian virtues.

## CHAPTER TWO: REVIEW OF THE LITERATURE

### Introduction

The review of literature for this study provided the foundation to enhance our understanding of leadership and the life of Bai Fangli through the lens of Confucian virtues. This review of the literature is synthesized with five central sections: (a) Contemporary Chinese Issues Related to the Loss of Confucian Moral Values, (b) Contemporary Chinese Issues Calling for Confucian Moral Values, (c) Confucianism, Taoism, and Buddhism, (d) Eastern and Western Virtues, and (e) Eastern and Western Leadership.

The first section centers on contemporary Chinese issues related to the loss of the traditional Confucian moral values. Many of works discussed in this section were originally written in Mandarin and, therefore, have been translated. This section begins with defining the moral belief crisis, the symptoms of the moral belief crisis, and the origins of the moral belief crisis. Also, this section addresses the contemporary Chinese issues related to the loss of the traditional Confucian moral values. These contemporary Chinese issues include official corruption, fake and shoddy goods, and reversing the nature of good and evil.

The second section focuses on contemporary Chinese issues calling for Confucian moral values. Due to the moral belief crisis in contemporary China, governmental officials and Chinese scholars are calling for the return of Confucian moral values.

The third section of this literature review addresses three important philosophies in China: Confucianism, Taoism, and Buddhism. In addition, the founders of each philosophy are articulated.

The fourth section addresses Eastern and Western virtues. Essentially, Eastern virtues consist of the Confucian five cardinal virtues: (a) benevolence [*ren*], (b) righteousness [*yi*], (c) rituals [*li*], (d) wisdom [*zhi*], and (e) trustworthiness [*xin*]. The review of literature pertaining to Western virtues includes the Aristotelian four cardinal virtues: (a) prudence, (b) justice, (c) temperance, and (d) fortitude. In addition, the Doctrine of the Mean is articulated based on the views of Confucius and Aristotle.

The final section focuses on Eastern and Western leadership. Essentially, paternalistic leadership (benevolent leadership, authoritarian leadership) and Confucian moral leadership are the Eastern leadership theories. The review of the pertinent Western leadership theories is concentrated on delineating each Western leadership theory and how it aligns with Confucianism. Major Western leadership theories include: (a) Leader-Member Exchange Theory, (b) Transactional Leadership, (c) Charismatic Leadership, (d) Servant Leadership, (e) Transformational Leadership, (f) Moral Leadership, (g) Power and Influence, (h) Presencing and Theory U, and (i) Formal and Informal Leadership.

Confucian moral values are the foundation of the Chinese moral belief system. A moral belief crisis in China refers to the loss of Confucian moral values. The next section of the literature review focuses on contemporary Chinese issues related to the loss of Confucian moral values.

#### Contemporary Chinese Issues Related to the Loss of Confucian Moral Values

A moral belief crisis takes place when people start doubting and negating their moral ideals and spiritual foundation (Gao, 2001; Wei, 2004). But at the same time, a new moral belief has not been established, whereas an old one has been destroyed (Wei, 2004). Thus, people encounter an empty state of mind (Gao, 2001; Wei, 2004). In terms

of the moral belief crisis, this section of the literature review focuses on (a) the symptoms of the moral belief crisis and (b) the origins of the moral belief crisis. Contemporary Chinese issues related to the loss of Confucian moral values focus on (a) official corruption, (b) fake and shoddy goods, and (c) reversing the nature of good and evil.

### *The Symptoms of the Moral Belief Crisis*

The symptoms of the moral belief crisis include: (a) the loss of moral ideals, goals, and ethics, (b) the loss of moral emotions, and (c) the distortion of moral motivation. Due to the moral belief crisis in China, recognizing these symptoms is pivotal. Finding the treatment for these symptoms is even more important to mitigate the moral belief crisis in China.

### *The Loss of Moral Ideals, Goals, and Ethics*

The loss of moral ideals and goals are closely associated with the loss of ethics because ethics is a moral requirement to attain moral ideals and goals and it represents code of conducts or norms (Gao, 2001; Wei, 2004). The loss of ethics is a social phenomenon (Gao, 2001). It refers to people suspecting, fluctuating, and negating the original meanings of existence, as well as ethical requirements in their social lives (Gao, 2001). But at the same time, a new moral value system and an ethical requirement have not been established to replace the original ones (Gao, 2001; Wei, 2004). At this stage, one may not discern clear standards of good and evil, right and wrong (Gao, 2001; Wei, 2004).

### *The Loss of Moral Emotions*

Moral emotions are strong emotions to respect, devotion, the desire for moral ideals, goals, and ethical systems (Gao, 2001; Wei, 2004). However, in the process of a

moral belief crisis, one's strong emotions are gradually reduced, disappear, and even move toward the opposite (Gao, 2001; Wei, 2004). One is perplexed, confused, hesitant, anxious, and even disillusioned since she loses the sense of esteem and holiness of the original moral value system (Gao, 2001; Wei, 2004).

### *The Distortion of Moral Motivation*

To people who encounter a moral belief crisis, their behavioral choices are not out of their moral obligations, but are out of their personal interests on the measures of advantages and disadvantages and gains and losses (Gao, 2001; Wei, 2004). This can also be called situational ethics. In an ethical situation, people are not willing to do things that cannot bring them actual benefits, albeit others and the community will gain great benefits. Individuals have two motives: (a) to obtain profits and (b) to avoid harm (Wei, 2004). These individuals do not have goodwill or have weak goodwill. They cannot resist the temptations such as money, power, and profit (Gao, 2001; Wei, 2004).

In addition, individuals who blindly worship power, money, and foreign living style cause the distortion of moral motivation (Wang, 2004). The characteristics of these worships represent the secularity and mediocrity of the adorer (Wang, 2004). Yearning for a happy life is a natural human instinct. But after individuals query and lose the original beliefs, unhealthy things enter into their belief systems (Wang, 2004). Thus, the consequence is severe (Wang, 2004). Specifically, money worship makes some people lose their own personal dignity and become the slaves of money and power (Wang, 2004). Hence, money and power turned out to be external forces to manipulate the human mind (Wang, 2004).

### *The Origins of the Moral Belief Crisis*

Historical origins may be the root of a moral belief crisis in China. Chinese intellectuals and Western scholars, writing about China, believe that social origins may also contribute to the loss of Confucian moral values or a moral belief crisis [*daode xinyang weiji*] in China (Fan, 2007; Farrer, 2002; Gao, 2001; Ge, 2001; Han, 2005; Hu, 2007; Jing, 1999; Shi, 2006; Tang, 2006; Wang, 2004; Wei, 2004; Xu, 2000).

The reversing of rewards and punishments has the potential to cause social unrest (Gao, 2001; Wei, 2004). People perform good deeds, but they are not rewarded. Thus, there are less superior men [*junzi*]. People perform evil things but they are not punished. Thus, there are more villains [*xiaoren*]. Accordingly, people have paid close attention to the issues of unification of virtues and happiness, as well as the related issues of rewarding good and punishing evil since the ancient times. These issues are important yardsticks or standards to appraise the quality of social system, social order, and social moral life (Gao, 2001; Wei, 2004).

For thousands of years, bad deeds, as well as good, may rebound upon the doer [善有善报，恶有恶报]. Good is rewarded, evil is punished [有善必赏，有恶必罚] becomes a supporting point or a moral belief for virtuous ordinary people in China (Wei, 2004; Xu, 2000). The Chinese contemporary scholar Xu Youyu (2000) pointed out that China is facing a serious social problem: some people have done bad things, but they have never confessed. If bad deeds, as well as good, may rebound upon the doer [善有善报，恶有恶报], and good is rewarded, evil is punished [有善必赏，有恶必罚] is no longer at work in ordinary peoples' lives, they do not know how to perform.



## *Official Corruption*

Official corruption is one of the contemporary issues related to the loss of Confucian moral values (Bao & Wang, 2001). Transparency International, an international organization, evaluated China as one of the most corrupt countries in the world in 2002 (Levy, 2002). There continues to be evidence that corruption in China continues since the Transparency International evaluation. Chinese law and official policy regard almost all forms of official malfeasance by state and Party cadres as corruption (Ngo, 2008). Four types of corruption are defined by the Chinese official terminology. These types of corruption are:

(a) crimes (especially economic crimes) committed by government officials while on duty, (b) a variety of malpractices in government agencies where officials use public power for private gains, (c) extravagant use of public funds, and (d) immoral conduct by Party and government officials such as gambling and extra-marital affairs. (Zhu, 2008, p. 82)

The First-in-Command (FIC, or *yibashou*) is a special phrase in the political system of China. Ren and Du (2008) described FIC as “the top leaders of the government at different levels, namely the Secretary of a CCP committee” (p. 47). FIC corruption is most detrimental, threatening the social morality and the stability of the state (Ren & Du, 2008). Scholars agreed that “political power in China tends to concentrate into one position, thereby resulting in FIC corruption” (Ren & Du, 2008, p. 46). From the time period of 1998-2008, 4 FICs of the 31 provincial governments and 3 FICs of the 15 deputy-provincial governments were punished or investigated on corruption charges (Ren & Du, 2008). Thus, the FIC corruption is the most destructive one due to its damage to

the whole Communist Party.

Although for the past 25 years the Chinese government has waged a war against corruption (Wedeman, 2008), corruption has not been effectively controlled and is becoming even more pervasive in the 21<sup>st</sup> century (Zhu, 2008). According to Zhu (2008), corruption of this magnitude has consequences. First, corruption cases have been escalating with each passing year. Second, the amount of money involved in these corruption cases has been tremendous. Third, more high-ranking officials have participated in corruption. Fourth, organized crimes have increased. And fifth, corrupt activities to benefit government agencies at the expense of public interest have also been on the rise.

In addition, fake and shoddy goods are another concern in China. This is another contemporary issue related to the loss of Confucian moral values (Bao & Wang, 2001). Fake and shoddy goods are contrary traditional Confucian moral values. Confucianism states clear relations between righteousness [*yi*] and profit [*li*]. Mencius believed that the ideal of *yi* presupposed unparalleled significance. He was the first one to lift *yi* to the uppermost stage in moral values in Chinese history (Chan, 1963). He strongly objected to utility, benefit, and profit [*li*] (Chan, 1963).

#### *Fake and Shoddy Goods*

There are two incidents of fake and shoddy goods that stand out as examples of this current phenomenon in China. Contaminated food is a dangerous issue in China. Two scandalous food cases resulted in the deaths of infants and ordinary people in China. Evidently, these two cases overturned *yi* and *li*. First, inferior milk powder led to the so-called “big head baby syndrome” affecting hundreds of babies less than one year old and

caused many deaths from 2003 to 2004 (Lee, 2006; Watts, 2004). Second, counterfeit and toxic white liquor led to the deaths of 30 in Shanxi province in China (*People's Daily*, 1998).

According to Jiang (2004), poor quality soy milk poisoned a group of students. Other fake foods are: (a) “fake red heart eggs,” (b) poisonous leeks, (c) ammonia longkou bean threads, and (d) poisonous rice. Other poisonous food exposed by media included: (a) seasoning for chatty dish made by paraffin for coagulants, (b) the use of clenbuterol to increase the lean pork, (c) the use of methanol to pickle water delivered food, (d) poisonous ham, and (e) poisonous soy sauce.... These poisonous food quality issues came to the surface one after another (Jiang, 2004). Thus, fake and shoddy goods are contemporary issues related to the loss of Confucian moral values in China.

#### *Reversing the Nature of Good and Evil*

Reversing the nature of good and evil is the third issue related to the loss of Confucian moral values (Wei, 2004). Contemporary China is in the midst of labor pains due to social transformation (Wei, 2004). The origin of moral belief crisis is an interruption and confusion of the law of causation of good and evil (Wei, 2004).

In terms of the Confucian concepts of good and evil, Mencius defined goodness (善) with the innate human nature to be good (Chan, 1963; Wong, 2001). Mencius used the term “not being good” [不善] to describe the term evil. Thus, evil is explained in the terms of “failure,” an incapability to grow one’s own potential and be in harmony with *dao*, the Way (Scarpari, 2003).

The reversing good and evil [善恶颠倒] phenomenon becomes a serious moral issue in contemporary China (Wei, 2004). It overturns the traditional Confucian moral

values. The following two cases illustrate this point. The first case is a villager, Jin Youshu, jumped into the frozen water to rescue 19 passengers when a shuttle bus unintentionally fell into a five meter deep pond in the morning of October 23, 2004 (Guo, 2005). Jin contracted emphysema and was unable to pay the medical bill. He passed away on March 10, 2005. Confucianism emphasizes praising good, punishing evil; good is rewarded, evil is punished. In Jin's case, the opposite occurred: goodness received bad returns (Guo, 2005).

The second case is Peng Yu helped an old lady, Xu, who tripped not far from a bus station in 2006 (*Jin Ling Evening News*, 2006). When Xu found out that it might cost much money to change her tibial fracture to man-made femora, she sued Peng for negligence and asked for compensation. Gulou District Court of Nanjing at the first trial ruled that Peng was liable to compensate RMB 45,876 to Xu in September 2007. In Peng's case, goodness received bad returns; thus, it makes ordinary people hesitate to do good deeds (Guo, 2005).

China's moral belief crisis has prompted governmental officials to call for the return of the traditional Confucian moral values (Wang, 2006). Also, Chinese scholars pointed out that the return of the traditional Confucian moral values is important for the Chinese society (Li, 2006; Liu, 2005). The next section of this literature review addressed contemporary Chinese issues calling for Confucian moral values.

#### Contemporary Chinese Issues Calling for Confucian Moral Values

Chinese leaders acknowledge the seriousness of the moral belief crisis in China. Chinese scholars also realize that it is pivotal to carry forward the Confucian five cardinal virtues as the content of the traditional virtues in Contemporary China (Li, 2006; Liu,

2005). The Confucian five cardinal virtues are: (a) benevolence, (b) righteousness, (c) rituals, (d) wisdom, and (e) trustworthiness (Li, 2006; Liu, 2005).

*Government Officials Calling for the Traditional Confucian Moral Values*

The Chinese President Hu Jintao called on the whole nation to adopt the concept of “八荣八耻.” (Wang, 2006) Essentially, the concept of “八荣八耻” refers to:

(a) Love, do not harm the motherland, (b) serve, don't disserve the people, (c) uphold science; don't be ignorant and unenlightened, (d) work hard; don't be lazy and hate work, (e) be united and help each other; don't gain benefits at the expense of others, (f) be honest and trustworthy, not profit-mongering at the expense of your values, (g) be disciplined and law-abiding instead of chaotic and lawless, and (h) know plain living and hard struggle; do not wallow in luxuries and pleasures. (Associated Press, 2006)

According to Liu (2005), “八荣八耻.” is a perfect representation and incorporation of 儒家 “八德” [*Confucian eight cardinal virtues*]: (a) benevolence [*ren*], (b) righteousness [*yi*], (c) rituals [*li*], (d) wisdom [*zhi*], (e) trustworthiness [*xin*], (f) loyalty [*zhong*], (g) diligence [*qin*], and (h) thrift [*jian*] (Liu, 2005). Benevolence [*ren*] emphasizes the values of solidarity and altruism. Righteousness [*yi*] refers to the value of consciousness of serving the people. Rituals [*li*] refer to the value of rites and observation of the law. Wisdom [*zhi*] emphasizes the value of belief in science and education. Trustworthiness [*xin*] emphasizes the values of honesty and credibility. Loyalty [*zhong*] emphasizes the value of patriotism. And lastly, diligence [*qin*] and thrift [*jian*] emphasize the values of hard work and plain living.

Furthermore, Chinese State television started live broadcasts of the Confucius' birthday (September 28<sup>th</sup>) celebration in 2004. As the core of Qufu International Confucius Cultural Festival, the first “*Gong Ji*” was held by the provincial official to celebrate Confucius 2556<sup>th</sup> birthday in Qufu, Shandong Province (Zhang, 2006). For the first time after the People's Republic of China was established in 1949, the local government was involved in organizing this event (Zhang, 2006).

*Scholars Calling for the Traditional Confucian Moral Values*

The Chinese Political Party Communist Committee (CPPCC) National Committee member Professor Li Hanqiu (2006) contended that it goes against the stream to abandon the traditional culture, and the whole nation should vigorously carry forward the traditional five Confucian virtues: benevolence [*ren*], righteousness [*yi*], rituals [*li*], wisdom [*zhi*], and trustworthiness [*xin*]. He also proposed that the Ministry of Education bring these virtues into the school curriculum.

Tu-Weiming, professor of Chinese history and philosophy and Director of the Yenching Institute at Harvard University, noted that the Confucian businessman stresses the traditional values such as “honoring one's commitments” [*xin yong*], “maintaining one's credibility” [*xin yu*], and “committing oneself to doing what is right” [*xin yi*] (Yu & Lu, 2000, p. 384). He professed that these values would play an essential role in the market economy of contemporary China. In addition, Tang Engjia, the President of World Confucian Merchants Association pointed out that advocating and carrying forward the spirit of Confucian merchants are pivotal. The spirit of Confucian merchants mainly represents Confucius' benevolence, love, and credibility (Li & Dong, 2004).

## Confucianism, Taoism, and Buddhism

Three major philosophies dominate in China: Confucianism, Taoism, and Buddhism. These three philosophies represent Chinese culture and society (Oldstone-Moore, 2005; Saso, 1997). The three teachings of Confucianism, Buddhism, and Taoism are major contributors to regional lifestyles and are extremely embedded in all facets of human life in China and East Asia (Braudel, 1993; Nigosian, 1990; Smith, 1998; Tarling, 2001). Looking at the history of Confucianism, Taoism, and Buddhism in China is pivotal to understanding Chinese culture.

### *Historical Review of Confucianism, Taoism, and Buddhism*

For more than 2,500 years, Confucianism was the most significant force in Chinese life. It influenced education, government, and personal behavior (Ozmon & Craver, 2008). Confucianism did not show prominence until Han emperor Wu Di (156 BC-87 BC), who accepted the advice of a Confucian scholar, Dong Zhongshu, to adopt Confucianism as the leading ideology (Fairbank & Goldman, 2006; Yuan, 2002). Subsequently, Confucianism was privileged as orthodox thought, while other schools of thought such as Taoism were restricted and tolerated under state control (Kwong, 1999). Confucius became an image to be respected and worshipped. Temples and monuments for Confucius or his disciples grew rapidly throughout the country. Confucianism continued to show prominence in China until the early decades of the 20<sup>th</sup> century (Kwong, 1999). Kwong (1999) indicated that under the dominance of Confucianism, Taoist philosophy developed into a religion later during the Han dynasty (202 BC-220 AD).

The prominent status of Confucianism weakened due to collapse of the Han

Empire in 220 AD. During this era of chaos, Buddhism spread rapidly throughout South and North China. Confucianism was mainly overshadowed during the great age of Buddhism in the fifth to the ninth centuries in China (Kwong, 1999). Earlier than the first century CE, Buddhism had been brought to China by Buddhist monks. During the Tang Dynasty (618-907), the so-called golden age of Chinese Buddhism, the *Huayan* School, the *Faxiang* School, and the *Zen* School all flourished (Kwong, 1999).

### *Neo-Confucianism*

During the Song Dynasty (960-1279), Confucianism started to be revitalized as ritualism (Yuan, 2002). Neo-Confucianism, a new understanding of the classical Confucian doctrines in reply to the challenge from Buddhists and Taoists, was the result of this revival movement (Kwong, 1999). Neo-Confucianism might be regarded as a movement that combined the popularity of Taoism and Buddhism to create a movement that reverted back to the roots of Confucian inspiration (Ching, 1990). Neo-Confucianism's development applied Zhu Xi's (1130-1200) orthodox statement, commentaries on the four scriptures of Confucianism as a required study for the imperial civil service examinations (Kwong, 1999). Neo-Confucian's work not only oriented itself gradually more to metaphysical and spiritual questions, but incorporated much from Buddhist and Taoist ideas in its own discussions about the world and human psychology within its Neo-Confucian metaphysical and spiritual framework (Kwong, 1999). Ching (1990) stated that the focus of Neo-Confucian's work was searching for self transcendence in attaining sagehood attainment. "Since 1180, the orthodoxy of Confucianism dominated Chinese ways of government and politics until the fall of the Qing dynasty (1911 CE)" (Yang, Peng, & Lee, 2008, p. 33).



When the Chinese gradually adopted Western models of social and political organization for modernization in the last century, little by little the traditional Confucian values have been discarded or accepted into hybrids (Wong, 1998). In 1912, Cai Yuanpei (1863-1940), the first Education Ministry of the newly established civic government of the Republic of China, gave orders twice to abolish the reading of Confucian classics as a subject in any schools (Xu, 2007). In 1915, the New Cultural Movement began. Chen Duxiu (1879-1942), a fierce fighter and one of the founders of Chinese Community Party (CCP), closed Confucian shops during the May 4th Movement in 1919 (Fairbank & Goldman, 2006; Hsu, 1995; Wong, 2001; Yuan, 2002). As a supporter of CCP, Lu Xun (1881-1936), one of the most well-known writers in modern China, pointed out that all the Confucian doctrines can be summarized in only two Chinese characters: “吃人” meaning cannibalism (Xu, 2007). As a result, the influence of Confucian values has been diminishing among the Chinese intellectuals due to the New Cultural Movement (Fairbank & Goldman, 2006; Hsu, 1995; Wong, 2001).

After the Chinese Communist Party (CCP) took over China and founded the People’s Republic of China (PRC) in 1949, the CCP leader Mao Zedong (1893-1976) treated the traditional Confucian culture and values as feudalism and firmly rejected them. During the “Cultural Revolution” (1966-1976), the Confucian moral ethics and values were denounced as the superstructure of feudalism. The influence of Confucian values has been diminishing since the “Cultural Revolution” (Link, 1993; Shi, 2006). In the 1970s, CCP leaders wanted to banish the traditional Confucian ethics as a belief system from Chinese citizens. Since the 1970s, the influence of Confucian values has been diminishing, and the Confucian tradition is fading and dwindling gradually.

In the 1980s, after Deng Xiaoping's (1904-1997) reform, the revival of Confucianism helped resolve the contemporary ethical and political crisis. A signal of this resurgence has been the recovery of the open competitive examination for the conscription of cadres for government service. The competitive examination is an important Confucian heritage (Wang, 1995).

In 1994, the former Chinese President Jiang Zemin offered open support for the formation of the International Confucian Association, and some high-ranking government officials even became members of this association (Tong, 1995). Recently, the Chinese President Hu Jintao first launched the concept of "harmonious socialist society" at the 16th Communist Party of China (CPC) (*Xinhua Net*, 2006). Hu also called on the whole nation to adopt the "social concept of disgrace" also known as "eight honors, eight disgraces."

Confucianism, Buddhism, and Taoism epitomize Chinese culture and society (Oldstone-Moore, 2005; Saso, 1997). Even though Confucianism alone may not represent traditional Chinese culture, which consists of other value systems such as Taoism and Buddhism, it is perhaps the most influential philosophy (Lin, 2008). Confucius (551-479 BCE) and Mencius (370-290 BC) are two founding fathers of Confucianism. These two important figures in Confucianism have greatly impacted Eastern people and culture.

#### *Confucius (551-479 BCE)*

Confucius is a Latinized form of Kongfuzi or Master Kong (Renard, 2002; Yang et al., 2008). He was perhaps the greatest and most dominant thinker, educator, philosopher, and political advocate in the Chinese history (Smith, 1998; Yan & Sorenson, 2004; Yang et al., 2008). Confucius developed humanism into the most powerful force in

Chinese philosophy (Chan, 1963). Confucius believed that man can make the Way (*Dao*) great, and not that the Way can make man great, he placed the emphasis on man (*Analects* 15:28). His chief concern was a good society based on good government and harmonious human relations (Chan, 1963; Oldstone-Moore, 1998). Confucius was concerned with righteousness (*yi*) but rejected profit. He stressed filial piety (*xiao*) for the family and proper conduct or rites (*li*) for the society (Chan, 1963; Fingarette, 1972).

More importantly, Confucius noted the concept of *junzi* or superior man. The term appears 107 times in the *Analects* (Chan, 1963). Confucius applied *junzi* to symbolize a morally superior man (Chan, 1963). In addition, Confucius depicted five fundamental concepts: the rectification of names, the Mean, the Way, Heaven, and humanity (Chan, 1963).

#### *Mencius (370-290 BC)*

Mencius was a professional teacher, having studied under the students of the grandson of Confucius (Chan, 1963). He worshiped the legendary sage-emperors and lived in a period of political struggle, moral disorder, and intellectual conflicts. He travelled for 40 years from about 354 BC or earlier, to offer advice to rulers (Chan, 1963).

Essentially, Mencius's teachings were originated from Confucius (Chan, 1963). Mencius upheld that every individual had four germs: (a) the heart of sympathy that nourished the germ of benevolence; (b) the heart of shame that guide to the germ of duty; (c) the heart of courtesy and modesty that cause the observance of rites; and (d) the heart of knowing right from wrong that was the germ of wisdom (Berthrong, 1998).

Mencius claimed that love or kindness is an innate moral quality (Chan, 1963). The Chinese word for kindness is a symbol of a woman and child. Mencius posited that

the practice of love or kindness must begin with the family. Mencius often believed that humanity [*ren*, love] was needed to “bind people together” and righteousness [*yi*] was needed to “make distinctions” (Chan, 1963, p. 50). He felt that righteousness [*yi*] presumed extraordinary importance. Mencius was the first one to lift righteousness [*yi*] to the highest level in moral values in Chinese history (Chan, 1963). He was against utility, benefits, and profit. In short, Mencius embraced a conventional Confucianism, matured along an idealistic thread.

### *Taoism*

Besides Confucianism, Taoism is a vital philosophy and religion in China. It has influenced Chinese culture and people tremendously. The naturalist view of Taoist philosophy has also influenced the Western world. Taoism is a philosophical way to understand human existence and the meaning of the universe concerning human existence (Lee et al., 2008). As a religious tradition, Taoism emerged around the second century BC and whose significance continued into the 20<sup>th</sup> century (Chan, 1963). Taoism depicts an ideal human condition as freedom from craving and an easy straightforwardness attained by following the “Tao,” a natural, eternal, spontaneous, nameless, and indescribable way or path shown by the natural events in the universe (Chan, 1963; Fairbank & Goldman, 2006; Ozmon & Craver, 2008). Taoist philosophy in China has been greatly impacted by Laozi, who is regarded as the founder or father of Taoism (Lee et al., 2008).

#### *Laozi (604-471 BCE)*

Laozi was born around 604 BCE, and therefore was older than Confucius. The *Records of the Historian* [*Shiji*] indicated that Laozi was a native of Chu (in modern

Hunan Province), that his family name was Li, that he was a custodian of the imperial archives, and that he retired to the West of China at old age, and wrote more than 5,000 words on the Way and its virtue (Chan, 1963).

Laozi believed in synthetic and dialectical thinking but opposed abstract thinking. He frequently used arguments in contradictory phrases: “To yield is to be preserved whole,” “To bend is to become straight,” “To be empty is to be full; ... to have little is to possess,” “... because he does not compete, the world cannot compete with him” (Wong, 1998, p. 109). Laozi highlighted living in harmony with nature, not in understanding it (Wong, 1998).

Laozi believed that one should not revolt against the ultimate laws of the universe. The term *wu wei*, meaning “action by inaction” or “effortlessness,” is the prominent order of Taoists (Fairbank & Goldman, 2006). This took the form of *laissez-faire*, of “following one’s irrationalized inner nature and accepting without struggle the experience of life” (Fairbank & Goldman, 2006, p. 54). *Wu wei* does not mean “doing nothing at all but doing nothing that is unnatural or not spontaneous” (Ozmon & Craver, 2008, p. 95). Most notably, one should not struggle or strive after anything but let things come in a natural way. Therefore, Taoists embrace naturalistic views of lives.

### *Buddhism*

Although Buddhism did not originate in China, it has influenced Chinese culture and people since it was introduced at the end of Han Dynasty (202 BC-220 AD) (Wong, 2001). Buddhism embodies more sophisticated analytical reasoning than Taoism (Wong, 2001). The Buddha examined the nature of his mind and the world and attained a state recognized as nirvana or enlightenment. In his first sermon, the *Sermon on the Turning of*

*the Wheel of the Law*, the Buddha set forth the Four Noble Truths and the Noble Eightfold Path:

(a) Life is suffering, (b) the cause of this suffering is desire, (c) suffering can be eliminated when desire is extinguished, and (d) desire can be eliminated through the eightfold path, consisting of: (1) *Right understanding*—understanding things as they are and having knowledge of where one is and where one wants to go, (2) *right speech*—not telling lies, backbiting, slandering, engaging in foolish gossip or harsh and abusive language..., (3) *right conduct*—avoiding destruction to life and property..., (4) *right vocation*—desiring to follow the correct path and to put knowledge into practice, (5) *right effort*—directing one’s energies toward wholesome states of mind, (6) *right mindfulness*—having a vigilant attitude toward desire, anger, hope, and fear, (7) *right concentration*—disregarding passionate desires and evil thoughts and developing spiritual awareness, and (8) *right thought*—maintaining a selfless renunciation and detachment, with thoughts of love and nonviolence. (Ozmon & Craver 2008, p. 88)

The Buddha has been recognized as the founder of Buddhism. He has greatly impacted Buddhist philosophy in India, China, and other Asian countries. The Buddha was not only a great teacher but a great counselor providing good advices to his disciples.

*Buddha (563-483 BCE)*

Siddhartha Gautama or the Buddha was born within the present boundaries of Nepal (Ozmon & Craver, 2008). The Buddha was born a prince, the son of wealthy Hindu raja, and was ordained to be a ruler (Ozmon & Craver, 2008). When he was 29, the Buddha had four visions: (a) a wrinkled and toothless old man bent over a stick, (b) a

diseased man with fever, (c) a corpse wrapped in cloth being carried in procession to the funeral pyre, and (d) a wandering holy man who convinced him that he should leave his wife and son and seek enlightenment (Ozmon & Craver, 2008). The first three aforementioned of four visions from the Buddha brought him to search for tranquility in the face of the evils of existence: old age, sickness, and death. He believed that enlightenment would free him from life's sufferings (Ozmon & Craver, 2008).

Buddhism stresses discovering the meaning of life and suffering. The Buddha thought that one could find release from suffering in *nirvana*, a state of absolute contentment and tranquility. To attain nirvana, one had to free himself from longings for worldly things. He thought that personal satisfaction is the origin and cause of suffering in the world (Ozmon & Craver, 2008). The Buddha was against mystery, speculation, and the concept of a personal God (Ozmon & Craver, 2008). He avoided worship and never prayed, albeit he was worshiped and will continue to be worshiped by millions of his followers (Ozmon & Craver, 2008).

Confucianism, Taoism, and Buddhism typify the Chinese culture. Cultural values are essential to an individual culture. They can deeply influence individuals' attitudes, behavior, and performance (Adler, 1983; Hofstede, 1983; House, Wright & Aditya, 1997; Schwartz, 1994). Aristotle and Confucius emphasized virtue and the necessity of training to cultivate virtue (Sim, 2007). Aristotle depicted virtue as a disposition to attain a mean between extremes, a middle path between an excess and a defect in the possibilities of action and emotion (Sim, 2007). Confucius stressed the same idea and categorized it using the term harmony (Sim, 2007).

## Eastern and Western Virtues

### *Eastern Virtues*

Confucian virtues play important roles in Eastern virtues. They have influenced the social interaction of people in Eastern and Southeastern Asian countries for more than 25 centuries (Yan & Sorenson, 2004). Confucian cardinal virtues are fundamental to recognize socio-relationships among individuals in China and other Asian countries (Mackerras, 2000; Wright, 1962; Yan & Sorenson, 2004). Essentially, they consist of benevolence [*ren*], righteousness [*yi*], propriety [*li*], wisdom [*zhi*], and trustworthiness [*xin*]. The following section articulates each Confucian cardinal virtue.

#### *Benevolence (Ren)*

Confucius was the first to articulate the concept of *ren* as a central thought in Chinese philosophy (Chan, 1963; Yuan, 2002). In the well-known Confucian classic, the *Analects*, the word of *ren* appears 109 times (Chan, 1963; Yang et al., 2008; Yuan, 2002). Confucius transformed *ren* into a general virtue as the summation of all the virtues, in the sense of “Perfect Goodness” (*Analects*). *Ren* refers to love or benevolence as a specific virtue (Chan, 1963; Smith, 2004).

In the *Analects*, *ren* emphasized two kinds of elucidations: one focusing on man of *ren* [loving man] and the other on *ren* as overcoming oneself and restoring *li* [rites] (Feng, 1948; Fingarette, 1972; Li, 1990; Tu, 1985). Confucius’ own words from the *Analects* may validate both of these explanations (Yuan, 2002). When his best disciple Yen Yuan asked about what *ren* is, Confucius responded, “He who can submit himself to *li* is *ren*” (*Analects* 12:1). When asked, what is the nature of *ren* itself? Confucius said:

A man of humanity, wishing to establish his own character, also establishes the



character of others, and wishing to be prominent himself, also helps others to be prominent. To be able to judge others by what is near to ourselves may be called the method of realizing humanity. (*Analects* 6:30)

As Mencius indicated, “Try your best to treat others as you would wish to be treated yourself, and you will find this the shortest way to benevolence” (Lau, 1970, p. 82).

#### *Righteousness (Yi)*

Righteousness (*Yi*) is one of the Confucian cardinal virtues referring to “living and acting according to moral principles” (Yang et al., 2008, p. 35). *Yi* and personal profit are opposite values. One does what one has to do, just because it is morally right to do it, and not for any concern of personal profit. One pursues his or her obligation despite the external success or failure of his or her action (Fernandez, 2004). Confucius believed that the gentleman [*junzi*] knows what is right; the small-minded person [*xiaoren*] knows what is profitable. The Master said, “*Junzi* in making their way in the world are neither bend on nor against anything; rather, they do with what is *yi*” (*Analects* 4:10). In addition, *yi* is often strongly linked with propriety [*li*], sincerity [*xin*], and conscientiousness [*zhong*] (*Analects* 1:13, 12:10, 13:4).

#### *Propriety or Rites (Li)*

Propriety or Rites (*Li*) is one of the Confucian cardinal virtues referring to “the observation of appropriate rituals and rules of conduct, which are social norms rather than formal laws and regulations” (Yang et al., 2008, p. 35). Smith (1998) described *li* as the bonding element in Chinese society, with its emphases on ritual and moral character. According to Confucianism, *li* is a multi-faceted principle and consists of the following elements: (a) the rectification of names (*Cheng Ming*), (b) the doctrine of the mean

(*Zhong Yong*), (c) the relationship orientation, and (d) deference to age (Chan, 1963; Hill, 2006).

The rectification of names was a hint to all of the prevalent social order of society, and was centered on the rituals of proper titles and appropriate behaviors. The doctrine of the mean was centered on attaining harmony and balance between extremes, particularly of behaviors (Smith, 1998). *Li* is vital to manage social relationships because it governs human interaction and places the groundwork for social relationships (Fingarette, 1972; Schwartz, 1985; Shun, 1993, 1997). Essentially, the five cardinal relationships (*wu lun*) were developed to adjust all important human interactions, specifically those between: parent and child; husband and wife; elder and younger brothers; elder and junior friend; and ruler and subject (Fu et al., 2004; Fu & Tsui, 2003; Smith, 1973; Smith, 1998; Tsui, Wang, Xin, Zhang, & Fu, 2004; Yan & Sorenson, 2004; Yang, 1993). The five cardinal relationships were regarded as the foundation for all moral and intellectual development in Chinese society (Oldstone-Moore, 2005). Smith (1998) also depicted *li* as a pattern of deference and compliance towards seniority still evident in today's China and over much of East Asia.

#### *Wisdom (Zhi)*

The English word wisdom is derived from *wis*, meaning wise, *dom*, meaning woman. Mencius applied *zhi zhe wu huo* to define wisdom (*zhi*), one of the Confucian cardinal virtues. *Zhi zhe wu huo* translates as the wise is prudent and sensible to apply his practical knowledge to correctly understanding and grasping his life, the world, and real situations (Lau, 1970). According to Bahm (1992), wisdom comprises the following elements: (a) understanding *yi*, i.e., that the best way of doing things is acting naturally,

(b) possessing *ren*, i.e., exemplifying true benevolence, and (c) understanding and carefully practicing *li*, i.e., acting in a manner which always properly displays to one's internal attitudes.

In the *Analects*, sometimes *zhi* is linked with *yi*. Here is an example. When Fan Chih, a disciple, asked about the nature of wisdom, Confucius said: "Devote yourself earnestly to the duties due to men; respect spiritual beings but keep them at a distance. This may be called wisdom" (Chan, 1963, p. 30).

#### *Trustworthiness (Xin)*

Trustworthiness (*Xin*) is one of the Confucian cardinal virtues that "implies adherence and loyalty to moral principles" (Yang et al., 2008, p. 35). Trust or being trustworthy, plays an important role in Confucian ethic (Koehn, 2001; Romar, 2004). Confucius believed that virtue of trustworthiness is more crucial than trust by itself (Koehn, 2001). Confucius asserted that one should not waste his or her energy to blame those of not showing trustworthiness, but rather his or her own lack of capabilities (*Analects* 14:29). Confucian ethic views the value of trust but always leads one's attention back to his or her own performance and attitudes. When there is a dilemma, one should look inward (*Analects* 14:7) and maintain self-examination, instead of blaming or scapegoating others (*Analects* 5:26). Confucius pointed out that conscientious self-examination is needed if one does not want to make mistakes. Engaging in routine self-examination, one would hold more trustworthiness. With more trust, one would be capable of educating each other better, thus "increasing the level of trustworthiness and engendering still more trust" (Koehn, 2001, p. 417).

In terms of Western Virtues, the following section emphasizes the Aristotelian

four cardinal virtues: (a) prudence, (b) justice, (c) temperance, and (d) fortitude. In addition, the Doctrine of the Mean is articulated based on the views of Confucius and Aristotle. Following Western Virtues, the literature review describes the Aristotelian four cardinal virtues.

### *Western Virtues*

#### *Prudence*

According to Aristotle, prudence is the most important of the four cardinal virtues. The most crucial part of prudence is knowledge. The shortest definition of prudence is *recta ratio agibilium* - right reason about things to be done. Prudence is not scientific knowledge or an art but practical knowledge. Prudence is a disposition with true reason and ability for actions concerning human goods. Prudence takes time to acquire because it is learned from experience. Prudence makes the means right. To be good a man must act by intention and for the sake of the things done. A man cannot be prudent if he is not good. However, without prudence there is no virtue. When prudence exists in the complete sense, all the other virtues are present. Prudence is the virtue that allows one to judge correctly what is right and what is wrong in any given situation. When one mistakes the evil for the good, she is not exercising prudence—in fact, she is showing the opposite.

#### *Justice*

According to Aristotle, justice itself is a perfect general virtue, not in itself but in relation to another. For this reason, justice seems to be the most important among the virtues. Aristotle claimed that one must give her attention to justice and injustice so as to determine what is the nature of the actions done, what is the mean of justice, and between

what extremes the just action is a mean. Sometimes, a state of character can be recognized by its effects or by the effects of its opposite. So, one can recognize that a person is unhealthy because she has the characteristics that are the opposite of healthy characteristics. The lawless person is unjust and the greedy man is unjust. The just person must therefore be the person who follows the law and who seeks her fair share.

In addition, Aristotle depicted three types of justice as (a) legal justice, (b) distributive justice, and (c) commutative justice. Aristotle professed that legal justice is perfect because one who has this virtue can exercise it in relation to another and not in relation to herself alone. Distributive justice is concerned with the distribution of honor, money, and other common goods that are to be apportioned to people sharing in social community, for in these matters one man as compared with another may have an equal or unequal share. Commutative justice governs personal transactions between individuals, whether mutually agreeable (voluntary), such as selling and buying, or forced upon a particular party (involuntary), such as theft and poisoning.

### *Fortitude*

According to *Nicomachean Ethics* (2002), the virtue of fortitude is commonly called courage or bravery. Fortitude allows one to overcome fear and to remain steady in one's will in the face of obstacles, but it is always reasoned and reasonable; the person exercising fortitude does not seek danger for danger's sake. Prudence and justice are the virtues through which one decides what needs to be done; fortitude gives one the strength to get it done.

The vices opposed to fortitude are cowardice as the defect, and fearlessness and recklessness are both defects. Perseverance or standing firm is the most necessary and

common part of fortitude (*Nicomachean Ethics*, 2002). According to Aristotle, perseverance is undermined by a soft life. The person who indulges in pleasure and always avoids discomfort will be unwilling to put up with the sadness she must experience if she is to stand firm in difficulty.

### *Temperance*

According to *Nicomachean Ethics* (2002), the virtue of temperance governs our appetites for pleasure. Temperance does not restrain one from the pleasures that are reasonable, but from those that are contrary to one's own reason. Temperance does not act against one's natural human inclinations, but works with them. The virtue of temperance also requires one to prepare herself. All human beings are required to develop the virtue of temperance and govern their desire for pleasure by reason, and so all must take the necessary steps to prepare themselves (Aquinas, 1920).

A lack of temperance undermines prudence, and if prudence is destroyed, all the virtues are undermined. Temperance itself needs to be nurtured, and this is part of the role of culture. While temperance primarily concerns tactile pleasures, it also concerns one's emotions. Part of temperance is to control one's anger and govern one's sexual desire. In addition, temperance concerns one's desire for knowledge. The right measure is called studiousness, which is the disciplined search for the truth.

### *Doctrine of the Mean*

*The Doctrine of the Mean* is a philosophical work, maybe the most philosophical in the whole body of ancient Confucian writing (Chan, 1963). The *Doctrine of the Mean* is called *Zhongyong* in Chinese. In the *Analects*, *zhongyong*, often translated as the Mean towards center, refers to moderation and universal moral order (Chan, 1963). *Zhong*

literally means what is central and *yong* means what is universal and harmonious (Chan, 1963). According to Cheng Hsuan (127-200), a Confucian Commentator, *yong* means the ordinary and *zhongyong* refers to using the mean as the ordinary way (Chan, 1963). Zhu Xi (1130-1200), another Confucian Commentator professed that *zhongyong* refers to neither one-sided nor extreme but the ordinary principle of the mean (Chan, 1963). Confucius noted that the *junzi* [the one with exemplary virtue] acts according to the mean, *xiaoren* [petty person] the opposite (*Zhongyong*). This mean consists in acts that are neither too much nor too little, but not equal for all, but justice for all (Sim, 2007).

Aristotle defined virtue as a disposition to achieve a mean between extremes, a middle path between an excess and a defect in the possibilities of action and emotion. Aristotle clarified that virtues of character such as courage and temperance are concerned with feelings and actions that admit of excess, deficiency, and a mean or intermediate state (*Nicomachean Ethics*, 2002). He claimed that the best way to have these appetites or feelings is the mean, and the habit of choosing the intermediate state is virtue (*Nicomachean Ethics*, 2002). Thus, the Aristotelian mean is a state of having appropriate feelings and appetites (i.e., having them neither too much or too little, toward the right people, in the right way, in the right circumstances, and for the right end) (Sim, 2007).

For both the *Zhongyong* and *Nicomachean Ethics*, the way to the mean is a process of self-cultivation or habituation. For both thinkers, this starts from the individual's own family (Sim, 2007). Aristotle's view on familial responsibility sounds very similar to the Confucian filial piety [*xiao*], and his talk of amity (*philia*, standardly translated as "friendship") sounds similar to the Confucian *ren* (the highest virtue of humanity, achieved by extending love by degrees from one's family to others)

(*Zhongyong*). *Ren* issues from *li* [ritual propriety], which starts with the family, telling one what degree of love is appropriate to others and the proper amount of honor to accord another based on her worth. The recognition of another's worth and the appropriate amount of honor to accord another culminate in the virtue *yi* (appropriateness or righteousness) (Sim, 2007).

Leadership has drawn a considerable amount of scholarly attention from across disciplines (Lin, 2008). However, most research and theory contributions are centered on leadership practices in the West (Littrell, 2002). Therefore, it is pivotal to understand the unique features of Eastern leadership, as well as those characteristics which are similar to Western models of leadership (Lin, 2008; Sarros & Santora, 2001; Smith et al., 1997).

#### Eastern & Western Leadership Theories

A review of the scholarly studies on leadership illustrates that there are a wide variety of different theoretical approaches to explain the complexities of the leadership process (e.g., Bass, 1990; Bryman, 1992; Mumford, 2006). Some researchers defined leadership as a trait or as a behavior. However, others viewed leadership from a relational standpoint (Northhouse, 2007). Studies show that cultural values can deeply influence individuals' attitudes, behavior, and performance (Hofstede, 1983; Schwartz, 1994). Therefore, both Eastern and Western leadership theories are reviewed.

#### *Eastern Leadership Theories*

Leadership studies have rationalized the need for clarification of the ethics of Chinese leadership by Chinese leaders' in global business (Selmer, 2000). A broad review of Eastern leadership studies and theories suggested that Eastern leadership theories consist of paternalistic leadership (authoritarian leadership and benevolent



leadership) (Pellegrini & Scandura, 2008) and Confucian moral leadership (Lin, 2008; Wong, 1998, 2001).

### *Paternalistic Leadership*

Paternalistic Leadership is a thriving research area in management literature, but there is substantial difference among authors regarding the description and effectiveness of paternalistic practices (Pellegrini & Scandura, 2008). Although a growing body of literature on paternalistic leadership in the past two decades has emerged, empirical research on paternalism is limited (Pellegrini & Scandura, 2008).

Different authors proposed distinctive definitions across time and cultures. Cheng, Chou, Wu, Huang, and Farh (2004) stated that paternalistic leadership involves an obvious and strong authority that reveals “consideration for subordinates with moral leadership” (p. 90). Sinha (1990) proposed that the coexistence of benevolence and authority in paternalistic leadership comes from values in traditional societies pertaining to the father figure, who is not only nurturing, caring, and reliable but authoritative, demanding, and a rigorous disciplinarian. Gelfand, Erez, and Aycan (2007) stressed that paternalistic leaders lead their subordinates’ professional and personal lives in a manner just like a father. However, in the Western management literature, paternalism has received a negative depiction such as “benevolent dictatorship” (Northhouse, 1997, p. 39). Some Western scholars doubted the benevolent intent in paternalistic leadership, which is revealed in metaphors on paternalism such as “anachronism” (Padavic & Earnest, 1994, p. 389) and “noncoercive exploitation” (Goodell, 1985, p. 252).

Silin (1976) conducted a study in Taiwan and found that the leadership concepts and behavioral styles of business owner/managers were greatly different from those in the

West. Subsequent to Silin's study on a large business in Taiwan, Redding (1990) and Cheng (1995a) also adopted an indigenous approach to investigate medium-and high-level leadership issues within Chinese family businesses (CFB) throughout Hong Kong, Indonesia, Singapore, and Taiwan. Redding found one distinct component of paternalistic leadership: benevolent leadership. He suggested that the leader's authoritarianism and benevolence may not be applied to all subordinates consistently but to different subordinates in differing levels.

Westwood (1997) proposed that paternalistic leadership is successful in the Chinese business context because it fits the "twin requirements" (compliance and harmony) of successful leadership. Cheng (1995a, 1995b, 1995c, & 1997) conducted a series of case studies, in-depth interviews, and quantitative data analysis to investigate leadership in Taiwan's family businesses, high-tech industry, schools, and army. Cheng confirmed that paternalistic leadership is widespread in a variety of business organizations.

In an empirical study, Farh and Cheng (2000) delineated paternalistic leadership as comprising three vital components: (a) authoritarianism, (b) benevolence, and (c) moral leadership. Authoritarianism refers to leader behaviors that stress authority and control and require unquestioning obedience from subordinates (Pellegrini & Scandura, 2008). Benevolence refers to leader behaviors that show strong considerations for the personal and family welfare of subordinates (Pellegrini & Scandura, 2008). Moral leadership refers to a leader's behavior that reveals superior personal values, self-discipline, and selflessness (Cheng et al., 2004). Cheng et al.'s definition of moral leadership was consistent with Confucian moral leadership. Nevertheless, subsequent

research on authoritarianism repeatedly showed negative correlations to benevolence and morality, as well as subordinate outcomes. Farh, Chen, Chou, & Chou (2006) found that authoritarianism showed a positive correlation to subordinates' fear of their supervisors but showed a negative correlation to organizational commitment. On the contrary, benevolence and morality showed positive correlations to satisfaction with a team's leader, commitment to the team (Cheng, Huang, & Chou, 2002), organizational commitment (Farh et al., 2006), loyalty toward leaders, trust in leaders, organizational citizenship behavior (Cheng, Shieh, & Chou, 2002), identification, compliance without dissent, and gratitude (Cheng et al., 2004).

A number of studies also investigated the cultural roots of paternalistic leadership in Eastern countries. Farh and Cheng (2000) suggested that authoritarian leadership comes from the cultural tradition of Confucianism. First and foremost is the father-son cardinal relationship under the influence of Confucianism. Cheng, Chou, and Farh (2000) stated that a father has authority over his children and all other family members and holds absolute power and legitimacy in a father-son relationship under Confucian ethics. The cultural roots of benevolent leadership are derived from the Confucian ideal of the five cardinal relationships and the norm of reciprocity (Cheng et al., 2004). Moral leadership emphasizes subordinates' welfare (Cheng et al., 2004).

Paternalistic leadership and transformational leadership have differences. For example, a paternalistic leader showed authority, manipulation, and image building (Farh & Cheng, 2000), whereas a transformational leader displayed personal charisma and intellectual stimulation (Bass, 1985a). In addition, transformational leaders depicted modeling as the concept of leading by example (Parry & Proctor-Thomson, 2002). On the

contrary, paternalistic leaders define modeling as emphasizing selfish behavior, including using power for one's own good, and not taking personal revenge in the name of public interest (Cheng et al., 2004).

However, paternalistic leadership and transformational leadership have similarities. Transformational leadership consists of a component of individualized consideration resembling benevolent leadership. Essentially, individualized consideration refers to the transformational leader paying personal attention to followers on the basis of the individual followers' needs for attainment and growth (Avolio & Bass, 2002). Also, the exhibition of morality by transformational leaders is close to moral leadership (Parry & Proctor-Thomson, 2002).

#### *Confucian Moral Leadership*

Confucian values remain a major cultural force underlying leadership practices in Chinese, as well as other East Asian societies (Cang, 1987; Cheung & Chan, 2005; DiCicco, 2003; Fernandez, 2004; Fu & Tsui, 2003; Javidan, Dorfman, Sullyde Luque, & House, 2006; Tsui et al., 2004; Wong, 2001). The Chinese style of leadership is depicted as ethocracy (i.e., ruling by ethical values), which stresses moral practice of leaders (Jin & Liu, 1992; Ren, 1999). Thus, the Confucian virtues of benevolence, righteousness, loyalty, forgiveness, and trustworthiness are crucial guidelines for Chinese leadership (Romar, 2002).

Chao (1990) discovered that primary Confucian values assisted the leadership success of Chinese work organizations in Taiwan. Similarly, Cheung and Chan (2005) discovered that some renowned Chinese business leaders in Hong Kong supported Confucian leadership based on the following moral values: benevolence as evident in

paternalism, sympathy, forgiveness, friendliness, trust and need fulfillment, harmony, learning, loyalty, righteousness, and humility. Likewise, Fu and Tsui (2003) indicated that the Chinese government is still strengthening such Confucian values as *Wu Lun* (Five Codes of Ethics), obedience, Doctrine of the Mean, and benevolence and righteousness.

China, since Confucius' time, has had a long history of preparing and evaluating leaders on moral grounds (Wong, 1998, 2001). In terms of moral preparations for leaders between China and the West, the West has been primarily concentrated on theories and abstract ideas to understand the nature of morality and to define "good," "right," "ought," and "obligation" (Wong, 1998, 2001). However, Chinese philosophers put their emphasis on the practical aspects of morality, and spend more time on developing ways of doing good (Lo, 1996). Since the Zhou Dynasty (1111-249 BC), "the Mandate of Heaven" (Chan, 1963, p. 3), a moral law whose constant factor was virtue, replaced the spiritual-like force of ethical humanism (Chan, 1963). Hence, man's destiny is linked to his own good words and deeds (Wong, 1998, 2001).

Confucius taught us that the main function of learning is to cultivate one's character: learning to be faithful [*zhong*] and altruistic [*shu*] (Chan, 1963). Confucius advocated that Man of ethical humanity must also practice what he has learned (Wong, 2001). When man wishes to institute himself, he must also institute the others, and when he wishes to be outstanding, man must also assist others to be outstanding (*Analects*). Confucian's Golden Rule is to empower and serve the people. Confucius posited that learning holds two purposes: (a) learn to be an upright and moral person or the superior man [*junzi*], and (b) apply what has been learned to serve the people via the state (Chan, 1963; Song, 2002). Being a moral person [*junzi*], the scholar needs to obtain benevolence,

duty, observance of rituals, wisdom, courage, and trustworthiness (Lau, 1992). After obtaining these attributes, the superior man [*junzi*] practices leadership by serving as a role model to his or her followers (Fernandez, 2004; Wong, 2001).

In addition, two examples from the *Analects* demonstrate the importance of moral leadership of those in authority: “Advance the upright and set aside the crooked, then the people will submit. Advance the crooked and set aside the upright, then the people will not submit” (*Analects* 2:11). The Master said, “The superior man seeks to perfect the admirable qualities of men, and does not seek to perfect their bad qualities” (*Analects* 12:16).

Confucians understand moral leadership on two levels. The first level is an individual level in which moral leaders are needed because a fair and benevolent society needs them (Romar, 2004). Thus, leaders are expected to behave morally. On the second level, Confucians recognize that for an organization to obtain the greatest opportunity to be moral, leaders must act morally and expect moral conduct from subordinates (Romar, 2004). Hence, it is vital for leaders to become moral examples and manage their lives according to the Way (Tao). Consequently, leaders may apply managerial tools to craft ethical organizations (Romar, 2004).

### *Western Leadership Theories*

Behavioral scientists have tried to investigate what traits, abilities, behaviors, sources of power, or facets of situation decide how well a leader is capable of influencing followers and fulfilling group objectives (Aronson, 2001). Yukl (2002) asserted that leadership effectiveness is the main foci of leadership researchers. This section reviews nine pertinent Western leadership theories focusing on describing each Western

leadership theory and how it aligns with Confucianism. Pertinent Western leadership theories consist of: (a) Leader-Member Exchange Theory, (b) Transactional Leadership, (c) Charismatic Leadership, (d) Servant Leadership, (e) Transformational Leadership, (f) Moral Leadership, (g) Power and Influence, (h) Presencing and Theory U, and (i) Formal and Informal leadership.

#### *Leader-Member Exchange Theory*

Leader-member Exchange (LMX) Theory is a leadership model that puts emphasis on the interactions between leaders and followers (Northhouse, 2007). In the early studies of LMX theory (Dansereau, Graen, & Haga, 1975; Graen & Cashman, 1975; Graen, 1976), a leader's relationship to the entire work unit was seen as vertical dyads, labeled as the leader's in-group and out-group. The leader's in-group is focused on expanded role relationships, whereas the leader's out-group is focused on formal job descriptions.

Researchers of later studies of LMX theory found that high quality leader-member exchanges create less employee turnover, more vigorous performance evaluations, and higher frequency of promotions (Graen & Uhl-Bien, 1995; Liden, Wayne, & Stilwell, 1993). One of the strengths of LMX theory is that this approach clarifies how leaders utilize in-group members more than out-group members to successfully attain organizational goals (Northhouse, 2007). However, the recognized disparities between in-group members and out-group members may hurt feelings, attitudes, and behaviors of out-group members in the organization (Northhouse, 2007). From the above description, LMX theory was aligned with Confucianism because Confucianism with its roots in traditional doctrines of humanness gives special attention

to leader-member interactions (Graen & Uhl-Bien, 1995; Romar, 2002).

### *Transactional Leadership*

Transactional Leadership may be understood as reciprocity occurring between leaders and their followers (Northhouse, 2007). According to Burns (1978) and later Sergiovanni (1995, 2009), transactional leadership theory acknowledges that leaders and followers exchange needs and services to attain their own goals. The leader supervises a follower's performance and takes corrective actions when needed (Bass, 1996; Burns, 1978; Graen & Cashman, 1975; Graen & Scandura, 1987; Hollander, 1993; Yukl, 2002). The chief goal of transactional leaders is to push the organization through a continuous sequence of negotiated steps. When a crisis takes place, the leader interferes and negotiates a resolution. The organization is temporarily delayed, then moves forward (Calabrese, 2002).

Transactional leadership is based on identifying needs, allocating clear tasks, compensating congruent behavior, and having a command-and-control mentality. "Followers are willing to trust the leader because they need to have problems solved, and they believe the leader can solve them" (Cunningham & Cordeiro, 2000, p. 185). Transactional leadership is aligned with Confucianism because Confucianism emphasizes reciprocity in the five cardinal relationships (*wu lun*) between: father and son, ruler and ruled, husband and wife, elder and younger brothers, and friend and friend (Fu et al., 2004; Fu & Tsui, 2003; Smith, 1973; Smith, 1998; Tsui et al., 2004; Yan & Sorenson, 2004).

### *Charismatic Leadership*

Weber (1947) defined charisma as an exceptional personality characteristic that



grants a person superhuman or exceptional powers, is withheld for a few, is of divine origin, and results in the person being treated as a leader. Weber also acknowledged the followers' significant role played in authenticating charisma in these leaders (Bryman, 1992; House, 1976). Charismatic leadership is based on the exceptional qualities of a leader who motivates and directs followers by establishing their commitment to a shared vision and values (Conger & Kanungo, 1998; Hellriegel, Slocum, & Woodman, 2001). House (1976) stressed that charismatic leaders work in distinctive ways that have specific charming impacts on their followers. House further indicated that the personal characteristics of a charismatic leader consist of: (a) being dominant, (b) having a strong desire to influence others, (c) being self-confident, and (d) having a strong sense of one's own moral values.

Graham (1991) conducted a study to compare Weberian charismatic authority, personal celebrity charisma, transformational leadership, and servant leadership and contended that charismatic leadership is the theoretical foundation for transformational leadership and servant leadership models. In short, charismatic leadership succeeds because it bonds followers and their self-concepts to the organizational identity (Northhouse, 2007). From the above description, charismatic leadership is not aligned with Confucianism because charisma does not guarantee moral qualities of the leader, whereas Confucianism stresses the leader's good moral qualities (Wong, 1998, 2001).

### *Servant Leadership*

Robert Greenleaf (1977, 2002) first coined the servant leadership theory into his essay entitled, *The Servant as Leader*. Greenleaf (1977) asserted that the servant leader "begins with the natural feeling that one wants to serve, to serve first. Then conscious

choice brings one to aspire to lead” (p. 13). At its heart, the nature of servant leadership is serving, not leading (De Pree, 1989). Servant leaders seek to transform their followers to “grow healthier, wiser, freer, more autonomous, and more likely themselves to become servants” (Greenleaf, 1977, pp. 13-14). In defining servant leadership, Greenleaf (2002) stressed, “If one is a servant, either leader or follower, one is always searching, listening, expecting that a better wheel for these times is making” (p. 23).

Historically, servant leaders have been depicted as religious leaders such as Jesus Christ and others who have revealed higher levels of self-sacrifice (Sendjaya & Sarros, 2002). Also, servant leadership has found support from other religious and non-religious beliefs such as Hindu, Islam, Taoism, and Buddhism (Fry, 2003; Hicks, 2002; Kurth, 2003). Nair (1994) posited that “the importance of service to leadership has been acknowledged and practiced for over a thousand years” (p. 59).

Although the idea of servant leadership has been recognized in the leadership literature since Greenleaf’s (1977) publications, the theory has gained impetus in the early 21<sup>st</sup> century (Sendjaya & Sarros, 2002). Bowman (1997) contended that there is only anecdotal evidence to support servant leadership. However, the energetic conceptual relationships and fulfilling roles between servanthood and leadership have drawn the attention of many leadership scholars and practitioners (Bowman, 1997; Choi & Mai-Dalton, 1998; De Pree, 1989; Farling, Stone, & Winston, 1999; Graham, 1991; Russell, 2001; Senge, 1990, 1995; Spears, 1995). Bass (2000) and earlier Northouse (1997) posited that, as a concept, servant leadership theory entails well-designed and published empirical research. It is pivotal to note that the research on servant leadership has focused mostly on the comparison of the servant leadership concept to other leadership models

and on the definition of particular attributes of servant leadership (Patterson, 2003; Russell & Stone, 2002).

Beazley and Beggs (2002) indicated that Greenleaf's servant leadership theory is a form of transformational leadership that is in accord with other leadership models such as stewardship, systems thinking, and the learning organization. At its heart, servant leadership is "a long-term, transformational approach to life and work, essentially, a way of being that has the potential to create positive change throughout our society" (Spears, 1995, p. 4).

Jame Laub (1999) conducted a study of servant leadership to identify particular attributes of the servant leadership theory through a measurable instrument. His research authenticates the role of values as the foundation for servant leadership. Nevertheless, he stated that additional empirical research is needed to fully understand the relationship between values and servant leadership.

Farling et al. (1999) presented a servant leadership model on the basis of the variables of vision, influence, credibility, trust, and service defined in the academic and popular press literature. They concluded that servant leaders find the source of their values in a spiritual base. Furthermore, servant leadership goes beyond transformational leadership in selecting the needs of others as it's the highest priority (Bass, 2000). Farling et al. (1999) emphasized that the examination of each of the five variables needs far more empirical research.

Russell and Stone (2002) developed a practical model of servant leadership. They combined 20 attributes of servant leadership on Greenleaf's (1977) writings and other writers on servant leadership. These attributes consist of: (a) vision, (b) honesty, (c)

integrity, (d) trust, (e) service, (f) modeling, (g) pioneering, (h) appreciation of others, (i) empowerment, (j) communication, (k) credibility, (l) competence, (m) stewardship, (n) visibility, (o) influence, (p) persuasion, (q) listening, (r) encouragement, (s) teaching, and (t) delegation. These authors concluded that the 20 attributes serve as the underpinning for a basic model of servant leadership. The “working model” is valuable because it serves as a foundation for understanding, applying, researching, and developing the servant leadership theory (Russell & Stone, 2002). However, they stressed that these 20 attributes need to be validated by empirical research.

Patterson (2003) stressed that servant leaders are directed by seven virtuous constructs that may shape a leader’s attitudes, characteristics, and behaviors. These seven constructs summarize that the servant leader: (a) exhibits agapao love (moral love), (b) acts with humility, (c) is altruistic, (d) has visions (e) is trusting, (f) empowers followers, and (g) is serving. Patterson indicated that the fundamental relationship between the servant leader and follower is agapao love. Agapao love defines love in a social or moral sense that comprises “embracing the judgment and the deliberate assent of the will as a matter of principle, duty, and propriety (Winston, 2002, p. 5). Crom (1998) emphasized that servant leaders care for others by heart and concern about the lives of followers. For the servant leaders, love is unconditional (Russell & Stone, 2002).

The third virtuous construct in Patterson’s (2003) servant leadership model is altruism. In a general term, Patterson (2003) defined altruism as helping others just for the sake of helping. Monroe (1994) indicated that altruism is interested in other’s well-being. Similarly, Eisenberg (1986) explained altruistic behavior as “voluntary behavior that is intended to benefit another and is not motivated by the expectation of external

reward” (p. 1).

The fourth virtuous construct in Patterson’s (2003) servant leadership model is vision. Blanchard (2000) identified vision as “a picture of the future that produces passion” (p. 5). Kouzes and Posner (1995) defined vision as a perfect and exceptional image of the future. Greenleaf (1977) applied the terms foresight and conceptualizing to describe vision. Bennis and Nanus (1985) stressed that “Vision animates, inspires, and transforms purpose into action” (p. 29). According to Patterson, in servant leadership theory, vision may be understood as the idea that the leader “looks forward and sees the person as a viable and worthy person, believes in the future state for each individual, and seeks to assist each one in reaching that state” (p. 18).

A number of servant leadership models refer to one of the servant leadership attributes as service (Farling et al., 1999; Patterson, 2003; Russel & Stone, 2002). Service defines the core of servant leadership (Greenleaf, 1977; Russell & Stone, 2002). Service in leadership has a “moral imperative” (Nair, 1994, p. 71). Greenleaf (2002) stressed that leaders must have a sense of responsibility to serve others. Many writers who study leaders and leadership emphasized the importance of serving others is one of the essential motivations of leadership (Bennis & Nanus, 1985; Greenleaf, 1977; Kouzes & Posner, 1993; Lee & Zemke, 1995; Nanus, 1989; Senge, 1995; Snyder, Dowd, & Houghton, 1994). Servant leaders view themselves not only in the role of servant, but also the nature of a servant, which is demonstrated by their total commitment to serve other people (Jaworski, 1997).

In Alexandre Havard’s (2007) recent book *Virtuous Leadership: An Agenda for Personal Excellence*, he posited that leadership is service and service is virtue in action.

The natural virtues are developed through an act of will. Developing virtue molds character and forms a leader. The authority of a true leader stems from the character they display which gives rise to trust. The natural tension between leaders and followers dissolves because followers know that their leader has their best interests at heart and they recognize in the leader a role model for their own character development (Wruck, 2008).

Servant leadership is aligned with Confucianism because Confucianism emphasizes cardinal Confucian moral values such as love [*ai*] and altruism [*shu*]. Also, Confucianism advocates that leaders have responsibilities [*yi*] to act as public servants (Chau, 1996). In addition, Confucian's golden rule is to empower and serve the people (Wong, 2001). When he wishes to institute himself, he must also institute the others. When he wishes to be outstanding, he must also assist others to be outstanding (*Analects*).

### *Transformational Leadership*

The term transformational leadership was first proposed by Downton (1973); but its emergence as a leadership approach gained popularity with Burns' (1978) classic work entitled *Leadership* and later by Bass (1985a). Bennis and Nanus (1985) and Kouzes and Posner (1995) also conducted leadership studies on transformational leadership. Bass (1990b) stressed that transformational leaders perform out of deeply held personal value systems that are not negotiable. Transformational leaders serve as exemplars, support optimism and encourage commitment, as well as center on the follower's needs for growth (Bass, 1996; Bass & Avolio, 1988, 1994a, 1994b). Bass (1990b) explained that transformational leadership occurs:

When leaders broaden and elevate the interests of their employees, when they

generate awareness and acceptance of the purpose and mission of the group, and when they stir their employees to look beyond their own self-interest for the good of the group. (p. 21)

Bass (1990) specified that this transcending goes beyond self-interest and instead focuses upon the “group, organization, or society” (p. 53). Essentially, transformational leadership is a process of establishing obligation to organizational objectives and then empowering followers to fulfill those objectives (Yukl, 2002). Transformational leadership may take place when there is an emotional attachment of followers to the leader and stimulation of followers as an outcome of the leader’s behavior (House, Woycke, & Fodor, 1988; Leithwood & Duke, 1999; Yukl, 2002). The goal of transformational leadership is to “transform people, in a literal sense, to change them in mind and heart and bring about changes that are permanent, self-perpetuating, and momentum building” (Covey, 1991, p. 87).

In addition, transformational leadership theory comprises four dimensions: (a) idealized influence (charisma), (b) inspirational motivation, (c) intellectual stimulation, and (d) individualized consideration (Avolio, Waldman, & Yammarino, 1991; Bass, 1985a, 1996; Bass & Avolio, 1994a, 1994b). Idealized influence is the charismatic component of transformational leadership. It refers to leaders becoming admired, respected, and emulated role models (Avolio & Bass, 2002; Bass, 1998; Bass & Avolio, 1994a, 1994b). Thus, followers reveal a high level of trust in such leaders (Bass, 1990b; Jung & Avolio, 2000). Transformational leadership guides others to observe the futuristic state and align personal values and interests to the collective interest of the group’s purposes (Avolio & Bass, 2002; Bass, 1990b, 1998; Jung & Avolio, 2000).

Inspirational motivation refers to transformational leaders inspiring and stimulating their followers by “providing meaning and challenge to their followers’ work” (Avolio & Bass, 2002, p. 2). The spirit of the team is “aroused” while “enthusiasm and optimism are displayed” (Bass, 1998, p. 5). The transformational leader develops relationships with followers through effective communication, which forms a cultural bond between the leader and the led and guides to a shifting of personal values by both parties toward common goals. The leader motivates followers to view the future state, while communicating expectations and showing a commitment to goals and a shared vision. Idealized influence and inspirational motivation are united to form charismatic-inspirational leadership (Bass, 1998).

Intellectual stimulation refers to transformational leaders stimulating their followers’ efforts “to be innovative and creative by questioning assumptions, reframing problems, and approaching old situations in new ways” (Avolio & Bass, 2002, p. 2). Followers’ mistakes are not publicly judged, and creativity is openly invited. Transformational leaders ask for their followers’ ideas and creative solutions in problem solving. The leader welcomes followers to test new approaches but stresses rationality (Bass, 1990b).

Individualized consideration refers to the transformational leader paying personal attention to followers based on the individual followers’ needs for attainment and growth (Avolio & Bass, 2002). To do this, the leader works as a mentor or coach, develops followers in an inviting atmosphere to “higher levels of potential” (Bass, 1998, p. 6). In terms of needs and desires, the thoughtful leader acknowledges the followers’ individual disparities. By doing this, the transformational leader enhances effective communication



through empathetic listening (Avolio & Bass, 2002; Bass, 1998). The transformational leader cultivates followers by assigning tasks and then checks those tasks to ensure if additional support or direction is needed. The ultimate effect of individualized consideration and other transformational leadership dimensions is to empower followers (Behling & McFillen, 1996).

Burns (1978) acknowledged transformational leadership as a mutual interaction and relationship between the leader and the led that eventually changes or transforms both. The values and morals of both the leader and the led are raised through the relationship; both parties become activated, inspired, and uplifted. It is only this form of leadership, he said, that has the capacity to influence groups, organizations, even societies to pursue higher purposes. In explaining this moral dimension of transforming leadership, Burns noted:

Transformational leadership is elevating. It is moral but not moralistic. Leaders engage with followers but from higher levels of morality; in the enmeshing of goals and values both leaders and followers are raised to more principled levels of judgment.... Much of this kind of elevating leadership asks *sacrifices* from followers rather than merely promising them goods. (p. 455)

Burns' (1978) work challenged others to rethink vital questions of values and morality in the transformational leadership process (Denhardt & Campbell, 2006). In examining the literature on transformational leadership following Burn's publication in 1978, numerous empirical studies were focused on transformation as change (Wart, 2003), but very few studies emphasized the morality and values of transformational leadership (Denhardt & Campbell, 2006). Although Bass and Avolio (1993) developed

their Multifactor Leadership Questionnaire (MLQ) to further empirical research on the topic of leadership, they failed to consider morality or values in their empirical study (Denhardt & Campbell, 2006). There is partial empirical evidence that leaders possessing higher moral reasoning skills exhibit more transformational behaviors than those with lesser moral reasoning (Turner, Barling, Epitropaki, Butcher, & Milner, 2002).

Furthermore, Burns (1998) elucidated his stance on the normative basis of leadership when he wrote the foreword to *Ethics, the Heart of Leadership*. He distinguished three types of leadership values: ethical, modal, and end. Ethical values are “‘old fashioned character test’ such as sobriety, chastity, abstention, kindness, altruism, and other ‘Ten Commandments’ rules of personal conduct” (p. x). Burns suggested that these values are associated with status quo leaders who find themselves in steady organizational environment and want to maintain good relationships among community members. Modal values consist of integrity, honesty, and accountability. Transactional leaders may need these values because they rely on others to achieve promises, contracts, or agreements. Burns (1978) clarified that transformational leadership is focused on *end-values*, such as liberty, justice, equality. These end-values actualize and motivate transformational leaders. Transformational leaders uplift their followers through levels of morality. Hence, transformational leadership has “moral implications” (Burns, 1978, p. 426).

Transformational leaders are desirable throughout organizations, and they may have a pivotal influence in any area (Tucker & Russell, 2004). However, transformational leadership can carry the “dark side” of leadership (Bass & Steidlmeier, 1999; Conger & Kanungo, 1998). For example, “pseudo-transformational leadership” (Bass & Steidlmeier,

1999, p. 184) may occur when leaders try to practice transformational leadership without depending on a strong ethical and moral basis. In addition, personal factors such as abuse of power may cause a danger for the transformational leader. In order to manage the potential danger of negative characteristics of transformational leaders, Bass and Steidlmeier (1999) and Covey (1991) suggested that transformational leaders must focus on personal growth, maintain accountability, sacrifice pride, share their power, and develop humility.

From the above literature review, transformational leadership is aligned with Confucianism. First, Confucianism emphasizes that leaders act as role models for their followers (Chau, 1996; Chen & Lee, 2008; Romar, 2004). Second, Confucianism stresses relationship building between the leader and follower (Chen & Lee, 2008). Third, Confucianism emphasizes that leaders should shape the character of followers by demonstrating Confucian cardinal virtues of benevolence, righteousness, rituals, wisdom, and trustworthiness (Chen & Lee, 2008; Yang et al., 2008).

### *Moral Leadership*

U.S. business and education have recognized the importance of moral leadership. Bass (1998a) supported Burns' (1978) view regarding the moral dimension of transformational leadership and indicated that authentic transformational leadership must be grounded in moral foundations and that transformational leaders "set examples to be emulated by their followers" (Bass & Steidlmeier, 1999, p. 182). Lemieux (2005) stated that moral leadership embraces transformational leadership theories depicted by Burns (1978). In addition, moral leadership has been espoused by many writers in education (Etzioni, 1993; Green, 2009; Greenfield, 1986; Hodgkinson, 1991, 1996; Sergiovanni,

1992, 1996, 2009). There are numerous influential writers who contended that 21<sup>st</sup> century school leaders must be ready to deal with moral dilemmas that will take place in schools (Fullan, 1999; Goodlad, 1994; Sergiovanni, 1992; Strike, Haller, & Soltis, 2005). School leaders should be moral agents who emphasize equal respect and maximize benefits (Green, 2009).

Sergiovanni (1992, 2009) delineated moral leadership as the heart, head, hand of leadership. He claimed that the heart of leadership is committed to—an individual's personal vision. The head of leadership refers to an individual's reflective process, defined as an individual's ability to reflect on the situations one faces according to the theories of practice one has developed over time. An individual's personal vision incorporates with one's reflective process developing into the foundation of one's strategies and actions. Ultimately, the hand of leadership becomes institutionalized in the form of school programs, policies, and procedures, defined as the actions an individual takes, the decisions an individual makes, and the leadership and management behaviors an individual uses as his or her strategies (Sergiovanni, 1992, 2009). Sergiovanni (1992, 2009) further explained that each principal must find his or her way, advance his or her approach, and apply the heart, head, and hand of leadership in the form of successful principal practice.

In his influential book *Moral Leadership*, Sergiovanni (1992) posited five sources of authority: (a) bureaucratic, (b) psychological, (c) technical-rational, (d) professional, and (e) moral. Bureaucratic authority embodies mandates, rules, regulations, job descriptions, expectations, and outcomes as a means of supervising and controlling staff and students (Sergionvanni, 1992). Hence, bureaucratic leadership engages the lowest

phase of moral development (Wong, 1998). Psychological authority draws its authority from motivation and human relations skills, like transactional leadership (Wong, 1998). Technical-rational authority is originated from logic and scientific research. Both professional authority and moral authority are based on leadership practice. Professional authority may be expressed in the form of seasoned craft knowledge, personal expertise, as well as what comprises “best educational practice or scientific findings from educational research” (Sergiovanni, 2009, p. 15). Moral authority is based on normative rationality that places everyone in compliance with shared values, ideas, and ideals, and invites them to take moral actions by performing their duties, meeting their obligations, and acknowledging their responsibilities (Sergiovanni, 2009).

Based on his own research and others (e.g., Blumberg, 1989; Etzioni, 1988; Johnson, 1990; Lewis, 1990; Lortie, 1975; Mintzberg, 1987), Sergiovanni (1992, 1996) proposed that people by nature are morally responsive and are able to respond to duties and obligations beyond their own self-interest. Sergiovanni (2009) emphasized leadership based on moral authority will “transform schools into communities and inspire the kind of commitment, devotion, and service that will make our schools unequalled among society’s institutions” (p. 16).

The concept of Sergiovanni’s moral leadership carries dual implications: (a) the leader must motivate his followers to have a sense of righteousness, obligation, and goodness for action and work, and (b) the leader must possess his own moral qualities such as righteousness, obligation, and goodness (Wong, 1998). Therefore, moral standing of the leader is significant in order to motivate followers to follow a moral path (Wong, 1998).

Sergiovanni (2009) suggested recognizing the difference between normative rationality (rationality based on what we believe and what we consider to be good) and technical rationality (rationality based on what is effective and efficient). Principals want what is good and effective for their schools, and the moral choice should be considered first. Normative rationality offers the foundation for moral leadership (Sergiovanni, 2009). To pass the normative rationality test, Sergiovanni (2009) stressed that the school as a learning community must share the group's values and purposes to form the sacred covenant that bond people in the school together.

Lashway (2006) noted that each moral leader is a moral person, and the principal has the potential to be a moral leader. Murphy (2002) used the term "a moral steward" to describe the principal: "Virtue comes from consciously trying to live one's life in a certain way, striving to do the right thing even when tempted to do otherwise" (p. 132). Lashway further provided a list of virtues for leaders that included: honesty, loyalty, courage, respect, justice, and grace. However, it is vital to know where the principal's moral force comes from. Starratt (1994) contended that a leader's moral force originates from something much deeper:

It will be found in the narrative of that person's life—in the influences of parents, role models, and heroes; in the lessons learned from a multitude of positive as well as painful experiences; from reflection on the commentaries of historians, poets, and novelists. Such moral force comes from a lifetime's search for meaning and purpose in human existence. (pp. 101-102)

Some of these virtues including stewardship, altruism, and servant leadership may come from moral leaders' innate abilities and practice because virtue is a habit and,

according to Aristotle (Sergiovanni, 2009), people become virtuous by practicing virtue. Stewardship embodies the involvement of oneself in service to ideas and ideals and to others who are committed to their accomplishment (Sergiovanni, 1992, 2000). Kanungo and Mendonca (1996) defined altruism as a person being motivated by a concern for others, when their actions are guided by the benefit to others. Sergiovanni (1992, 2009) indicated that principals possess a servant leadership style because they are responsible for administering to the needs of the schools they serve. As Greenleaf (1977) stressed, people “will freely respond only to individuals who are chosen as leaders because they are proven and trusted as servants” (p. 10). Principals administer by being servants to parents, teachers, and students. They also administer by underlining and defending values of the school.

There is a strong link between servant leadership and moral authority. Moral authority depends heavily on persuasion (Sergiovanni, 2009). At the core of persuasion are ideas, values, substance, and content that identify group purposes and core values together (Sergiovanni, 2009). Servant leadership practices by serving others, but its final aim is to “place oneself, and others for whom one has responsibility, in the service of ideals” (Sergiovanni, 1992, p. 138). In sum, with servant leadership, moral authority should be the heart of one’s overall leadership practice. When moral authority fosters leadership practice, the principal plays various roles such as a leader of leaders, follower of ideas, minister of values, and servant to the followership (Sergiovanni, 2009).

Bass (1998) and Collins (2001) conducted studies to define a number of traits that are consistently connected with successful leadership. Also, the Interstate School Leaders Licensure Consortium (ISLLC) Standards delineate a list of traits or skills for

effective school leadership. For instance, in his well-known book, *From Good to Great*, Collins (2001) found that Level Five Leaders have the traits of humility, drive, and professional will. The term Level Five refers to the highest level in a hierarchy of executive capabilities that Collins identified in his research. The ISLLC Standards (note Standard Five) also define attributes that are common among effective school leaders (Green, 2009). Essentially, Standard Five is the ethical standards for school administrators. According to ISLLC Standard Five (1996), these traits consist of: “vision, knowledge, integrity, fairness, dignity, respect, accepting responsibility, being ethical, caring, and accepting consequences (pp. 18-19).

Moral leadership is aligned with Confucianism because Confucianism emphasizes collectivism and community building of social relationships (Fu et al., 2004; Hofstede, 2001; Wright, 1962; Yan & Sorenson, 2004). Also, Confucianism is concentrated on virtues such as benevolence [*ren*], righteousness [*yi*], rituals [*li*], wisdom [*zhi*], and trustworthiness [*xin*] (Chan, 1963; Wong, 1998, 2001; Yang et al., 2008). In addition, Confucianism emphasizes that being a moral person or [*junzi*], the scholar needs to obtain benevolence, duty, observance of rituals, wisdom, courage, and trustworthiness (Lau, 1992). After obtaining these attributes, the superior man [*junzi*] practices leadership by serving as a role model to his or her followers (Fernandez, 2004; Wong, 2001).

### *Power and Influence*

The concept of power is helpful for understanding how people are capable of influencing each other in organizations (Mintzberg, 1983; Pfeffer, 1981, 1992). Power is the capacity to exercise some amount of control over others. It links with authority and may be coercive in its effects (Bass, 2008). According to Yukl (2006), power involves



the capacity of one party (the agent) to influence another party (the target). Sometimes power refers to potential influence over things or events as well as attitudes and behaviors (Yukl, 2006).

According to French and Raven (1959), five bases of power are common and important. These five bases of power are: (a) reward power, (b) coercive power, (c) legitimate power, (d) referent power, and (e) expert power. Reward power is described as power whose basis is the ability to reward. Others comply because they want the rewards the power holder can offer. Coercive power is based on an individual's capacity to punish. Others comply because they are afraid of being punished. Legitimate power is based on an individual having a formal position. Others comply because they accept the power holder's legitimate position. Referent power is based on an individual's attractiveness to and friendship with others. Others comply because they admire and are fond of the power holder. Expert power is based on an individual's knowledge, expertise, and information in a specific area. Others comply because they believe in the power holder's expertise and competence.

Among these five sources of power, legitimate power, reward power, and coercive power are positional sources of power. Referent and expert power are personal sources of power (Bass, 1960; Davis, Schoorman, & Donaldson, 1997; Etzioni, 1961). Nahavandi (2003) indicated that "the respect and friendship comes on top of other considerable sources of power" (p. 102). In other words, referent power comes on top of other considerable sources of power.

*Referent power.* "Liked, respected, and esteemed leaders have referent power" (Bass, 2008, p. 274). Referent power is derived from the desire of others to please an

agent toward whom they have strong feelings of love, respect, and faithfulness (French & Raven, 1959). According to French and Raven (1959), referent power is usually greater for someone who is friendly, attractive, delightful, and reliable. Reference power is increased by displaying concern for the needs and feelings of others, demonstrating trust and respect, and treating people fairly (Yukl, 2006). Another way to apply referent power is by setting an example (Yukl, 2006). A person who is well loved and respected may have great influence over others by setting an example of appropriate and desirable behavior for others to emulate. For example, referent power is evidently seen “when a charismatic relationship exists between the leader and the follower, since what binds the follower to the leader is the desire to identify with the leader” (Bass, 2008, p. 274).

Bell (1975) defined influence as the process of utilizing persuasion to have an influence on other people in a relationship. Yukl (2006) stated that influence is “the essence of leadership” (p. 145). For example, Rost (1993) posited that leadership is an influence relationship. Influence requires that “coercion not be applied, at least as a regular and patterned form of behavior” (Rost, 1993, p. 150). Also, influence relationships are multidirectional. Yukl (2006) indicated that “the strongest form of referent power involves the influence process called personal identification” (p. 153).

Referent power and influence are aligned with Confucianism because Confucius said, “A man of virtue can never be isolated. He is sure to have many companions” (*Analects 4:25*). In other words, leaders who possess virtues are sure to have many followers. Thus, they become liked, respected, and esteemed leaders who obtain referent power to influence their followers through actions.

### *Presencing and Theory U*

Scharmer (2007, p. 1) introduced Theory U and practice of the U process, based on a concept he calls “presencing.” A blend of the words “presence” and “sensing,” presencing “signifies a heightened state of attention that allows individuals and groups to shift the inner place from which they function” (p. 1). When that shift occurs, individuals start to operate from a future space of possibility that they feel wants to emerge. The essence of leadership, according to Scharmer, is being able to facilitate that shift.

According to Scharmer (2008), the cause of collective failure of leadership is people who are blind to the deeper dimension of leadership and transformational change. This “blind spot” exists not only in one’s collective leadership but also in one’s everyday social interactions (Scharmer, 2008, p. 52). People may know much about what leaders do and how they do things. However, they may know very little about the inner place, the source from which they operate (Scharmer, 2008). Scharmer (2008) noted:

Successful leadership depends on the quality of attention and intention that the leader brings to any situation. Two leaders in the same circumstances doing the same thing can bring about completely different outcomes, depending on the inner place from which each operates. (p. 52)

Over more than a decade of observing people’s interactions in organizations, Scharmer (2008) mentioned four different types of listening: (a) downloading, (b) factual, (c) empathic, and (d) generative. Downloading is a type of listening by reconfirming one’s habits of thought. Factual listening disconfirms what one already knows and notices what is new out there. Factual listening is the essential mode of good science. Empathic listening is a deeper level of listening, and it requires an open heart.

Generative listening moves beyond the current field and connects one to an even deeper source of knowing. Generative listening requires one to access one's open will—one's capacity to connect to the highest future possibility that can emerge.

To be effective leaders, according to Scharmer (2007), one must first understand the field, or inner space, from which one is operating. Theory U identifies four such "field structures of attention" (p. 4) which result in four different ways of operating: (a) Field 1: operating from the old me-world; (b) Field 2: operating from the current it-world; (c) Field 3: operating from current you-world; and (d) Field 4: operating from the highest future possibility that is wanting to emerge. On all four levels—individual, group, institutional, and global—shifting from reactive responses and quick fixes on a symptoms level (Fields 1 and 2) to generative responses that address the systemic root issues (Fields 3 and 4) is the single most important leadership challenge of one's time.

Based on his interview with Brian Arthur and his own theory, Scharmer (2007) delineated Theory U as one process with five movements. These five movements include:

(a) Co-initiating: build common intent. Stop and listen to others and to what life calls one to do; (b) co-sensing: observe, observe, observe. Go to the places of most potential and listen with your mind and heart wide open; (c) presencing: connect to the source of inspiration and common will. Go to the place of silence and allow the inner knowing to emerge; (d) co-creating: prototype the new in living examples to explore the future by doing; and (e) co-evolving: embody the new in ecosystems that facilitate seeing and acting from the whole. (p. 8)

In addition, Scharmer (2007) claimed that the U the road is less travelled in institutions because it requires an inner journey and hard work. The capacity to move

through the U as a team or an organization or a system requires a new social technology.

The social technology of presencing is on the basis of seven crucial leadership capacities:

(a) Holding the space: listen to what life calls you to do; (b) observing: attend with your mind wide open; (c) sensing: connect with your heart; (d) presencing: connect to the deepest source of your self and will; (e) crystallizing: access the power of intention; (f) prototyping: integrating head, heart, and hand; (g) performing: playing the macro violin. (p. 11)

To conclude, without the cultivation of these seven crucial leadership capacities, the five movements of Theory U will not deliver the desired results (Scharmer, 2007).

Presencing and Theory U are aligned with Confucianism because Confucianism emphasizes that human nature is intrinsically good and with the innate ability to do good. The concept of presencing is to explore the inner space of an individual or a group. Also, Confucianism emphasizes that leaders should cultivate their good moral characters by practicing Confucian cardinal virtues such as benevolence [*ren*], righteousness [*yi*], rituals [*li*], wisdom [*zhi*], and trustworthiness [*xin*]. Likewise, presencing requires an individual or a group to cultivate seven essential leadership capacities such as generative listening, and integrating head, heart, and hand.

#### *Formal and Informal Leadership*

People who embrace formal and informal leadership positions offer leadership in organizations (Salvaggio, 2003). Managers, directors, principals, or superintendents offer formal leadership in organizations (Salvaggio, 2003). Kanter (1977) defined the formal leaders as:

[Individuals] who are thought to have power already and to be well placed in

hierarchies of prestige and status may also be more influential and more effective in getting the people around them to do things and feel satisfied about it.

(p. 168)

In organizations, senior authority generally comprises the power to manage the organizational culture and climate, direct attention and resources, collect and influence the flow of information, constitute the terms of debate, disperse responsibility, manage conflict and distress, and structure decision processes (Heifetz, 1994).

According to Salvaggio (2003), all groups have at least one informal leader whose essential role is to establish social relationships with employees. In defining informal leaders, Schneier and Goktepe (1983) posited that informal leaders are those who exert influence over other group members. Wheelan and Johnston (1996) indicated that an informal leader comes from the team and is selected by the team. In addition, Pescosolido (2001) pointed out that the informal leader does not receive special compensation or rewards and that the informal leader does not hold the power of hiring and firing. Nevertheless, the informal leader has the influence to increase group and organizational efficacy (Pescosolido, 2001).

As a single individual, it is challenging to demonstrate all the skills, values, characteristics, actions, and relationships assessed by the measures applied in different theoretical approaches of leadership (Antonakis, Cianciol, & Sternberg, 2004). Pielstick (2000) conducted a comparative study between formal and informal leadership. He posited that informal leaders are more likely to embrace a moral and inspiring purpose, provide for the common good, and create meaning. The shared vision of informal leaders is more likely to be based on shared needs, values, and beliefs than the vision of formal

leaders (Pielstick, 2000). Pielstick's study also recognized differences in character between formal and informal leaders. Informal leaders had a tendency to be more humble, fair, and altruistic. They had a tendency to be acknowledged as servant leaders and emphasized service above self (Pielstick, 2000). They seemed to be motivated by a higher purpose, more likely to have a sense of humor, and more likely to have fun, including encouraging imagination and creativity (Pielstick, 2000).

Most research is conducted on formal leaders, those in a "position" of leadership (Pielstick, 2000). However, there is very little research on the role of the informal group leader, the characteristics of an effective informal leader, and the behaviors and mechanisms used by informal leaders to affect change within a group (Pescosolido, 2001). Studies do show that informal leaders have a strong influence on group processes, norms, and outcomes (Bass, 1990; Wheelan & Johnston, 1996). Nevertheless, little is known about their particular methods of influence (i.e., their leadership behaviors) or the effect of these methods on the group (Pescosolido, 2001).

Leadership in organizations needs both formal and informal leadership (Smart, 2005). Informal leadership has been recognized as an important factor in organizational behavior (Bass, 1990a; Carter, 2001; Doloff, 1999; Pielstick, 2000; Salvaggio, 2003; Smart, 2005; Wheelan & Johnston, 1996). Formal and informal leaders influence the efficacy of organizations (Pescosolido, 2001). Informal leadership is evidently a social phenomenon, tied to making organizations work and closely involved in managing the social fabric (Carter, 2001). Leadership can also be regarded as a combination of many human processes including the exercise of influence, persuasion, power relation, and communication (Smart, 2005). Leaders and leadership are pivotal because they serve as

anchors, provide guidance in times of change, and are responsible for organizational effectiveness (Hoy & Miskel, 2005).

From the above description, formal leadership is aligned with Confucianism because Confucianism emphasizes hierarchical relationships between father and son, ruler and ruled, older brother and younger brother, husband and wife, and senior friend and junior friend (Fu et al., 2004; Fu & Tsui, 2003; Hofstede & Hofstede, 2005).

Informal leadership was also aligned with Confucianism because Confucianism stresses cultivating Confucian cardinal virtues such as benevolence, righteousness, rituals, wisdom, and trustworthiness (Yan & Sorenson, 2004). Confucianism believes that everyone should build his or her own character to sustain harmony in the society (Yan & Sorenson, 2004).

#### Summary of the Literature Review

Due to historical and social reasons, the loss of the traditional Confucian moral values fosters a moral belief crisis in contemporary China. The moral belief crisis is a deep spiritual crisis, which shows that one doubts and negates some moral ideals and goals, as well as the spiritual foundation. Several issues were related to the loss of the traditional Confucian moral values. Official corruption is the most important issue (Bao & Wang, 2001). Fake and inferior goods are another concern in China. In addition, reversing the nature of good and evil becomes a vital issue related to the loss of the traditional Confucian moral values.

In order to alleviate the moral belief crisis in contemporary China, government officials and Chinese scholars are calling for the return of the traditional Confucian moral values. President Hu called on the whole nation to adopt the concept of “八荣八耻”



which is “*Eight Honors and Eight Disgraces*.” In addition, Chinese scholars believed that it is pivotal to carry forward the Confucian five cardinal virtues as the content of the traditional virtues in contemporary China.

Confucianism, Taoism, and Buddhism are three major philosophies in China. Confucianism is based on the virtues of trust, honesty, and benevolence and is relational and hierarchical. Taoism is viewed as a philosophy about nature, individual life, and tranquility. Buddhism emphasizes discovering the meaning of life and suffering.

Confucian virtues play important roles in Eastern virtues. Essentially, Confucianism applies five cardinal virtues including (a) benevolence [*ren*], (b) righteousness [*yi*], (c) propriety [*li*], (d) wisdom [*zhi*], and (e) trustworthiness [*xin*] to identify relationships among individuals. In terms of Western virtues, Aristotelian four cardinal virtues include: (a) prudence, (b) justice, (c) temperance, and (d) fortitude are articulated. In addition, the Doctrine of the Mean is articulated based on the views of Confucius and Aristotle.

Most research and theory contributions on leadership practices are centered in the West. Therefore, understanding the unique features of Eastern leadership, as well as those characteristics that are similar to Western models of leadership, is pivotal. A broad review of Eastern leadership studies and theories suggests that Eastern leadership theories comprise paternalistic leadership (authoritarian leadership and benevolent leadership) and Confucian moral leadership. Many Western leadership theories are aligned with Confucianism, and these leadership theories are: (a) Leader-member Exchange Theory, (b) Transactional Leadership, (c) Servant Leadership, (d) Transformational Leadership, (e) Moral Leadership, (f) Power and Influence, (g) Presencing and Theory U, and (h) Formal

and Informal Leadership.

The literature review offers a scholarly foundation and a cultural background to assist the researcher in understanding Bai Fangli's life and leadership as explored through the lens of Confucian virtues. The following chapters address methodology, the findings, and the conclusions of this study. The findings of this study provide new knowledge for better understanding Bai Fangli's life and leadership.

## CHAPTER THREE: METHODOLOGY

### Research Design

Qualitative research is an investigative process that gradually makes sense of a social phenomenon by contrasting, comparing, replicating, cataloging, and classifying the object of the study (Miles & Huberman, 1994). Denzin and Lincoln (2005) stated that “qualitative research involves an interpretive, naturalistic approach to the world” (p. 3). Furthermore, Denzin and Lincoln (2005) noted:

Qualitative research involves the studied use and collection of a variety of empirical materials—case study; personal experience; introspection; life story; interview; artifacts; cultural texts and productions; observational, historical, interactional, and visual texts—that describe routine and problematic moments and meanings in individual’s lives. (pp. 3-4)

Creswell (1998) indicated that “the qualitative researcher builds a complex, holistic picture, analyzes words, reports detailed views of informants, and conducts the study in a natural setting” (p. 15).

The utilization of qualitative methods was most appropriate for this study because language is a better way of understanding the human condition and existence than quantitative methods (Piantanida & Garman, 1999). The purpose of this interpretive biographical study was to enhance our understanding of leadership by exploring the life of Bai Fangli through the lens of Confucian moral values. According to Confucius, essentially, Confucian moral values refer to Confucian cardinal virtues: benevolence [*ren*], righteousness [*yi*], rituals [*li*], wisdom [*zhi*], and trustworthiness [*xin*]. Furthermore, Confucius transformed *ren* into a general virtue as the summation of all the virtues, in the

sense of “Perfect Goodness” (Smith, 2004). *Ren* refers to love or benevolence as a specific virtue (Chan, 1963; Smith, 2004). In this study, the researcher explored the life of Bai Fangli through the lens of Confucian cardinal virtues such as benevolence [*ren*] and righteousness [*yi*].

Denzin (1989a, 1989b) suggested relying less on social science theories and turning to the meaning of experiences by the persons who experience them. In this study, the research focused on a single individual, Bai Fangli. This study utilized the life and leadership of Bai Fangli, situated the stories and epiphanies within a broader context, and evoked the presence of this researcher. Bai Fangli was chosen for this study because he was a modern Chinese leader who appeared to have modeled Confucian moral values that are difficult to find in China today.

#### *Interpretive Biography*

Creswell (1998) noted the interpretive approach by Denzin (1989a), “acknowledging the postmodern concern about the role of the researcher in interpreting a study, rather than the traditional, theory-oriented classical approach” (p. 7). In a biographical study, the life story of an individual is written by someone other than the individual being studied using archival documents and records. Subjects of biographies may be living or deceased (Denzin, 1989a). Denzin described the interpretive biographical method as the studied use and collection of personal-life documents that narrate and depict turning-point moments in an individual’s life. “The subject matter of the biographical method is the life experiences of a person” (Denzin, 1989a, p. 13). In other words, the turning points or epiphanies in an individual’s life are essential narratives and stories to portray a lived experience of this individual.

### *The Epiphany*

Denzin (1989a) depicted epiphanies as “interactional moments and experiences which leave marks on people’s lives” (p. 70). Denzin (1989a) further differentiated four types of an epiphany: (a) the major event that touches the fabric of a person’s life; (b) the cumulative or representative event that shows eruptions or reactions to experiences that continue for a long period of time; (c) the minor event that signifies a moment in a person’s life; and (d) the relived epiphany that symbolizes reliving the experience. The major epiphany, three representative epiphanies, and the minor epiphany were used in this study.

### Research Questions

Creswell (1998) recommended that a researcher condenses her entire study to a single, overarching central question. He further suggested that qualitative researchers posit the broadest central question they could possibly pose about their studies. Essentially, the central question is open-ended, evolving, and restates the purpose of the study more specifically. Also, it can be encoded with the language of a specific tradition of inquiry (Creswell, 1998). Creswell (1998) suggested presenting a small number of sub questions that support the central question. This study was guided by the following central question:

What is the essence of the life and leadership of Bai Fangli as explored through the lens of Confucian moral values?

The central question was supported by the following five sub-questions:

1. How did Bai Fangli blend his life and leadership?
2. How did Bai Fangli’s leadership impact the lives of other individuals?

3. How did Bai Fangli's epiphanies influence his actions?
4. Where did Bai Fangli's influence come from?
5. What was Bai Fangli's belief structure?

The findings of these research questions enhance our understanding of leadership by exploring the life of Bai Fangli through the lens of Confucian moral values (Note that in Appendix B each sub-question is supported with specific interview prompts for participants with varying relationships with Bai Fangli.)

#### Data Collection

Creswell (1998) indicated that there are four basic types of qualitative data collection: (a) observations (ranging from nonparticipant to participant), (b) interviews (ranging from semi-structured to open-ended), (c) documents (ranging from private to public), and (d) audio-visual materials (comprising materials such as photographs, compact disks, videotapes). In recent years, new forms of data collection consist of journaling in narrative story writing, utilizing text from email messages, and observation through videotapes and photographs (Creswell, 1998). In addition, Denzin and Lincoln (2005) suggested data collection using techniques such as the analysis of artifacts and cultural records, the use of visual materials, and the use of personal experience. For instance, a biography, the portrait of an individual's life, is made from documents, interviews, and possible observations (Creswell, 1998). Plummer (1983) asserted that the foundation for life history writing is the unstructured, open-ended interviews, with a "mixture of participant observation and almost casual chatting with notes taken" (p. 95).

Data for this study were gathered during unstructured and open-ended individual interviews with Bai Fangli's son, daughters, friends, and others. An internet-based video

system was set up to conduct these interviews. Telephone interviews were conducted if the participants did not have the Internet connections at their sites. Permission to participate in the study was obtained following the procedures delineated by the Institutional Review Board at The University of Montana. The participants interacted with the researcher in Chinese through an internet-based video system with an audio system and a webcam at a pre arranged location in Tianjin, China. At the same time, the researcher talked to the participants in Chinese through an internet-based video system with an audio system and a webcam at a pre arranged location in Missoula, Montana, USA.

This study utilized 12 participants who participated in the interviews. Three interviews were conducted via Windows Live Messenger. During the interview, both the researcher and participant could see each other through a webcam. The researcher was able to see the setting via webcam. The voice of the participant was clear. Seven interviews were conducted via phone. Six telephone interviews went well. However, one of the participants was ill when the telephone interview was conducted. Therefore, his voice was lower than other participants. Two interviews were conducted via email. One of the advantages of the email interviews is that the response of the interview questions is in the transcript. However, the participant may delay in responding to the email. One of the participants responded to the email two weeks after receiving the initial prompt. All ten interviews were tape-recorded and transcribed in Chinese. Since the participants agreed to use their names and identities in this study, confidentiality was not an issue. Their records were not kept confidential.

According to McCracken (1998), the researcher in a qualitative study is

considered the primary research instrument. In this study the researcher followed the appropriate procedures, in accordance with the Institutional Review Board of The University of Montana, to secure permission and establish potential participants of Bai Fangli's son, daughter, relatives, and friends. The interview process was organized by the researcher with the researcher transcribing and analyzing all the data gathered from the interviews. Since the interviews were conducted in Chinese, all the data from interviews were translated into English by the researcher.

### *Participants*

According to Creswell (1998), in a biographical study, one needs to find an individual to study, "an individual who is accessible, willing to provide information, and distinctive for his accomplishments and ordinariness or who sheds light on a specific phenomenon or issue being explored" (p. 111). Plummer (1983) indicated that one might define a "marginal person" who lives in conflicting cultures or an 'ordinary person' who provides an example of a large population. Creswell (1998) pointed out that "the purposeful selection of participants represents a key decision point in a qualitative study" (p. 118). In a biographical study, the individual may be "convenient" to study, may be a "politically important case," or may be a "typical" case (Creswell, 1998).

In this study, purposeful sampling was utilized. Bai Fangli was purposefully selected for this study because he was an ordinary person who did extraordinary things. He cared deeply about Chinese education and worked throughout his life to support low-economic students. He was unique in his accomplishments and has influenced other Chinese to support education and do good deeds for the Chinese society. Therefore, a deliberate decision to study Bai Fangli was made.



Creswell (1998, p. 118) recommended that “qualitative researchers, regardless of tradition, examine the typology of 16 strategies for purposeful sampling advanced by Miles and Huberman (1994).” One of the 16 strategies for purposeful sampling is a snowballing technique that was utilized in this study. Essentially, the purpose of a snowballing strategy is to identify “cases of interest from people who know people who know what cases are information-rich” (Creswell, 1998, p. 119). Each participant was asked if they knew anyone else who could add to the data on Bai Fangli. Thus, the researcher sought to expand the number of participants reaching data saturation. One of the participants gave contact information for five potential participants to the researcher. From these five participants, two eventually were included in this study. Therefore, the participants for this study were purposefully selected. They either had close relationships with Bai Fangli or had an association with the life Bai Fangli. These principal participants were Bai Fangli’s son, daughters, friends, and others.

#### *Data Collection Procedures*

Prior to any contact with the participants for this study, the researcher obtained approval to conduct the study by The University of Montana Institutional Review Board (IRB). Specific procedures were followed to secure accurate permission. For participation in this study, a personal contact at *Tianjin Daily* was asked to assist in finding and contacting purposefully selected participants since the researcher lives in the United States and is not able to find them by herself. Once the contact gave participant information to the researcher, participants were contacted via phone or email to obtain their permission to participate in the study. If individuals agreed to participate in this study, in order to build rapport, the researcher let them know the purpose of the study,

how data would be gathered, and what they could expect in return for their participation (Eisner, 1991).

The initial contacts for this study were Bai Fangli's son, daughters, friends, and others who could contribute to understanding Bai Fangli's life and leadership. These participants were provided an electronic consent form prior to the interviews being conducted. The consent form and all subsequent written material sent to the participants were translated into Chinese. At the beginning of the interview, the researcher reviewed the consent form with each participant ensuring that the individual understood the contents of the consent form, thereby checking for any misunderstandings due to translation issues. As part of the consent form, the potential participant was informed that he could stop the interview at any time if he so desired. If the individual agreed to participate, the interview proceeded. If for any reason one chose to either not participate or at any time stop the interview, the data collection procedures were terminated for that particular individual. The participants all continued with the interview in this study.

Other data were collected through documents and audiovisual materials. Documents consisted of archival material, newspaper articles, and e-mail discussions. Audiovisual materials included photographs, videotapes, or any forms of sound (Creswell, 2003). Archival material and documents for this study were obtained through the interlibrary loan, Google Scholar, *Tianjin Daily*, international library resources, and online newspaper articles. A working reference of these documents is found in Appendix F.

### *Accuracy/Trustworthiness and Verification*

Many authors pointed out the need to address the construct of verification in qualitative studies (Babbie, 1999; Creswell, 1994, 1998; Patton, 1980). Creswell (1994) emphasized that the importance of verification and suggested a need “to frame these concepts within the procedure that have emerged from qualitative writings” (p. 158). Creswell (1998) noted that at least two verification methods should be applied in a qualitative study. Exceeding Creswell’s suggestion, five verification methods were used in this study.

Triangulation—comparing data from interviews, documents, audio-visual materials in search of common themes— was used to support the validity of this study’s findings and keep the accuracy of information. In addition, rich, thick description was used to enhance the transferability of the study. Furthermore, external auditors such as this researcher’s dissertation chair and dissertation committee members were used to examine the process and findings, assessing accuracy and believability. Moreover, member checks were used with the participants during the interviews for clarification purposes. Additionally, this researcher’s past experience, bias, and orientations were clarified to shape the interpretation of the study.

### *Generalizability/Transferability*

The generalizability of a qualitative study’s findings has been associated with the transference of knowledge. Eisner (1991) acknowledged this relationship and believed that most transferences of knowledge are generalizations “derived from life itself” (p. 202). Based upon the work of Bruner (1973), Eisner (1991) further described generalizing “not only as going beyond the information given (Bruner, 1973), but also as

transferring what has been learned from one situation or task to another” (p. 198).

Merriam (1988) suggested that the process of applying detailed information in the form of “rich, thick description” to assist in the transferability of the findings.

Transferability has particular effects regarding the generalization of qualitative findings.

It is important to note the use of generalizability in a quantitative study. However, this study has no generalizability but it does have transferability. Synthesizing the works of others (Lincoln & Guba, 1985; Merriam, 1988), Creswell (1998) highlighted:

Rich, thick description allows the reader to make decisions regarding transferability because the writer describes in detail the participants or setting under study. With such detailed description, the researcher enables readers to transfer information to other settings and to determine whether the findings can be transferred “because of shared characteristics.” (p. 203)

One of the verification methods that the researcher applied was to describe detailed information in the form of the “rich, thick description” (Merriam, 1988) to enhance the transferability of the findings. This verification method permits the reader to make a decision about transferability because detailed information regarding Bai Fangli’s life and leadership were described. With such detailed depiction, the reader is afforded the opportunity to decide whether the findings of this study can be transferred to other situations.

### The Role of the Researcher

Because this methodology is interpretive, the possibility of bias must be addressed (Creswell, 1998). Schwandt (1997) posited that bias has been viewed as a criticism of qualitative research. Babbie (1999) indicated that the qualitative researcher must be

aware of the potentiality for misrepresentation of information through personal bias. These authors suggested that a written explanation of the concerns will raise the researcher's personal awareness and make her realize her potential areas of bias. To bracket for personal bias, this researcher recognized three areas of possible concern. Each of the three areas was related with roles in the life of this researcher (a) a native Chinese, (b) a doctoral student in educational leadership, and (c) an admirer of Bai Fangli.

This researcher is a native Chinese who knows Chinese culture, history, and contemporary China well. Also, Confucius and Confucian virtues have influenced her tremendously. This researcher has lived in China for over 20 years before she studied in the United States. She has visited China three times since she came to the United States. In addition, this researcher is saddened about the status quo of demoralization in China. However, she misses the traditional Confucian virtues demonstrated by Bai Fangli. Therefore, she entered this study with a bias that she might show an idealistic view when she interpreted the data.

The second role of the researcher is that she is a doctoral student in educational leadership. This researcher has been studying educational leadership for more than five years. She has her own interpretation of leadership, in general, and educational leadership, specifically. This may be a bias when she interpreted Bai Fangli's leadership.

The third role of this researcher is that she is an admirer of Bai Fangli. Bai's stories have profoundly touched her heart. She enters this study with a bias that she may show some personal feelings when she interpreted Bai Fangli's data.

Gay and Airasian (2003) listed several strategies to reduce researcher bias and enhance the study's credibility. This researcher applied several strategies to reduce her

bias in this study. She used verbatim accounts of interviews by collecting and recording data with tape recordings or detailed field notes, including quotes. She also recorded her own reflections, concerns, and uncertainties in a journal during the study and referred to them when examining the data collected. In addition, she used member checking and external audits by her dissertation chair and dissertation committee.

### Summary

The methodology for this study utilized the qualitative research paradigm. It followed the structure of the interpretive biographical tradition. An interpretive biographical method was the best qualitative paradigm for the purpose of this study because it created narratives and stories and represents the lived experiences, focusing on one individual, Bai Fangli. The information was gathered through interviews with participants who knew Bai Fangli well and could provide pertinent information about his life. The participants interacted with the researcher through an internet-based video system with an audio and a webcam at pre arranged locations in Tianjin, China. This researcher simultaneously talked to the participants through an internet based video system with an audio and a webcam at pre arranged location in Missoula, Montana, USA.

The interviews were tape-recorded and notes were taken by this researcher. The translation of Chinese was conducted when the themes were identified. During interviews, this researcher asked member checks for clarification purposes. Other data were collected through documents such as online newspaper articles, photographs, video clips, as well as electronic messages. The discovery of this interpretive biographical study is presented in a reconstructed biography in CHAPTER FOUR. The results of this study are reported in CHAPTER FIVE, Findings from the Qualitative Inquiry.

## CHAPTER FOUR: FINDINGS FROM THE QUALITATIVE INQUIRY

### Introduction

The purpose of this study was to enhance our understanding of leadership by exploring the life of Bai Fangli through the lens of Confucian virtues. This study was guided by the central question: What is the essence of the life and leadership of Bai Fangli as explored through the lens of Confucian virtues? Data pertaining to this central question and the analyses of that data are reported in this chapter.

The information in this chapter is divided into four parts: (a) the description of the specific qualitative tradition's analysis procedure, (b) the demographic overview of the participants, (c) the description/explanation of the emerging themes, and (d) a reconstructed interpretive biography. The chapter closes with a summary of the findings for this interpretive biographical study.

### Data Analysis

Denzin (1989a) developed five procedures for the analysis of data in an interpretive biography. Denzin's data analysis procedures were applied for this interpretive biographical study:

- A. Beginning with an objective set of experiences in Bai Fangli's life, an individual journal was prepared to sketch Bai's life. In this sketch, Bai Fangli's life stages or life course experiences were explored (e.g. childhood, middle age, and senior life) to develop a chronology of his life.
- B. Stories and epiphanies emerged from this journal or from interviews with Bai Fangli's son, daughter, friends, and former employees. Bai Fangli's data were gathered from interviews, photographs, online newspaper articles, and audiovisual materials. Since data from documents and interviews were gathered and analyzed

in Chinese, the direct quotes from the interviewees and newspaper articles needed to be translated into English. Every attempt was made to provide the English translations as accurately as possible and then as grammatically correct without losing any of the essence of the original data.

- C. Bai Fangli's son and daughter were asked to expand on various sections of the stories to describe Bai Fangli's life and leadership through the lens of Confucian virtues such as benevolence [*ren*] and righteousness [*yi*].
- D. Subsequently, narrative segments and categories within the interview-story were isolated, and larger patterns and meanings were determined.
- E. This data were used to answer this study's central and sub-questions. Bai Fangli's biography was reconstructed, and the major themes that had shaped his life identified. This led to the writing of an analytic abstraction of the case that underlines (1) the structural processes in Bai Fangli's life, (2) the different kinds of theories that related to these life experiences, and (3) the unique and general features of his life.

Incorporating Denzin's five procedures for the data analysis in an interpretive biography, this study applied three phases of data analysis. The first phase of data analysis was documents analysis. The second phase of data analysis analyzed the interviews. The third phase of data analysis combined the analysis of documents and interviews.

#### *Document Analysis*

Data from documents were gathered from 91 online newspaper articles, 43 photographs, and eight audiovisual materials. Altheide's (1996) developed a 12 step



process model involving five stages of qualitative document analysis which were followed in this study: (a) documents, (b) protocol development and data collection, (c) data coding and organization, (d) data analysis, and (e) final report. The details of these 12 steps include:

Step 1: pursue a specific problem to be investigated. Step 2: become familiar with the process and context of the information source. Explore possible documents of information. Step 3: Select a unit of analysis. Step 4: list several items to guide data collection and draft a protocol. Step 5: test the protocol by collecting data from several documents. Step 6: revise the protocol and select several additional cases to further refine the protocol. Step 7: arrive at a theoretical sampling rationale and strategy. Step 8: collect the data, using preset codes, if appropriate, and many descriptive examples. Keep the data with the original documents, but also enter data in a computer-text-word processing format for easier search-find and text coding. Make appropriate adjustments to other data. Complete data collection. Step 9: perform data analysis, including conceptual refinement and data coding. Read notes and data repeatedly and thoroughly. Step 10: compare and contrast “extremes” and “key differences” within each category or item. Make textual notes. Write brief summaries or overviews of data for each category. Step 11: Combine the brief summaries with an example of the typical case as well as the extremes. Illustrate with materials from the protocols for each case. Step 12: Integrate the findings with your interpretation and key concepts in another draft. (pp. 23-44)

Documents from online newspaper articles were analyzed using Altheide’s (1996)

12 step five stage model. The first stage (steps one to three) was to find online newspaper articles based on the questions designed for documents analysis. This involved selecting a unit of analysis (e.g. each article). In terms of sources of information being used in this study, 19 articles were primary sources, 54 articles were secondary sources, and 34 articles were tertiary sources. According to Merriam (1998), primary sources are “those in which the originator of the document is recounting firsthand experience with the phenomenon of interest. The best primary sources are those recorded closest in time and place to the phenomenon by a qualified person” (p. 122). Secondary sources are reports of a phenomenon by those who have not directly experienced the phenomenon of interest; these are often compiled at a later date (Merriam, 1998). Interestingly, the same article could be categorized as primary or secondary or tertiary depending upon the purpose of the study (Merriam, 1998). Tertiary sources comprise information which is distillation and collection of primary and secondary sources (*University of Maryland Libraries*, 2008).

The second stage (steps four to six) was to list several items to guide data collection and draft a protocol. Miles and Huberman’s (1994) document summary form was used to develop the protocol. Based on the uniqueness of this study, other items such as emerging themes, Confucian virtues, and important quotations were added to the protocol. Then, the protocol was tested by collecting data from several documents, and revising the protocol and selecting several additional documents to further refine the protocol (see Appendix H).

The third stage (steps seven to eight) included data coding and organization. In this stage, it involved collecting the data, using preset codes (Miles & Huberman, 1994),

keeping the data with the original documents, but also entering data in a table format for easier search-find and text coding. Table Example 4-1 is the beginning codes for the document analysis based on the document analysis questions (see Appendix G for the complete Table 4-1). On the left column of Table Example 4-1, a code was given to each document question and each sub code was given based upon each document question code. For example, the sub code for blending life and leadership is BLL, and the sub code for Mr. Bai is MB. On the right column, a number was given to each document question. For example, number 1 was given to the first document question and 1.1 was given to the first document sub-question. Color coding was used during this stage. For example, all data that could be categorized as Bai’s virtues theme were coded blue (see Table Example 4-2). A midpoint analysis was conducted about halfway to two thirds through the documents to permit emergence, refinement, or collapsing of additional themes.

Table Example 4-1 A Sample of the beginning codes for the document analysis

DOCUMENT QUESTION CODE	SUB CODE	DOCUMENT QUESTION #
BLENDING LIFE AND LEADERSHIP	BLL	1
BLL: MR. BAI	BLL: MB	1.1
BLL: MR. BAI’S DEEDS	BLL: MBDS	1.2
BLL: MR. BAI’S INFLUENCE	BLL: MBINF	1.3
BLL: MR. BAI’S LEADERSHIP	BLL: MBLEAD	1.4
BLL: QUOTES OF BLENDING LIFE AND LEADERSHIP	BLL: QUOBLL	1.5

The fourth stage (steps nine to eleven) included conceptual refinement and data coding. Notes and data were reviewed thoroughly three times. Ninety-one online newspaper articles, totaling 135 pages were reviewed. In this stage, comparisons and contrasts were conducted on the “extremes” and “key differences” within each category

or item. Textual notes and brief summaries or overviews were made on the data for each category. The last stage (step 12) was to integrate the findings with the researcher's interpretation and key concepts. Table Example 4-2 is a sample of synthesis of data from 91 online newspaper articles (see Appendix G for the complete Table 4-2).

Table Example 4-2 A Sample of Synthesis of Data from 91 Online Newspaper Articles

Document protocol	Source	Author or media name	Subquestions	Emerging Themes	Confucian Virtues	Date and Website
1	Primary Secondary	Zhang Mingqi <i>Tianjin Daily</i>	1.1, 3.1, 3.2, 5.2	1. Bai's virtues 3. Moral example 4. Material and spiritual asset- pedicab	1. Ren ai 2. Dayi 3. Yong 4. Jian 5. Xin 6. Zhi 7. Li	Retrieved March 6, 2009, from <a href="http://news.sohu.com/20050924/n227046178shtml">http://news.sohu.com/20050924/n227046178shtml</a>

Creswell (1998) indicated that one type of qualitative data collection includes audio-visual materials comprising materials such as photographs and videotapes. Visual documents are records of events that have occurred in the past (Barthes, 1981). It has also been noted that photographs and videos speak a language of emotion and meaning (Denzin, 2004). According to Denzin (2004), four narratives or meaning structures exist in any set of photographs and videos. These four meaning structures are:

- (a) The visual text, (b) the audio text, including what photographers say about their photographs, (c) the narrative that links the visual and audio text into a coherent story, or framework, and (d) the interpretations and meanings the viewer bring to the visual, audio, and narrative texts. (p. 240)

Denzin (2004, p. 240) further indicated that a picture can be read as having meaning at two different levels. The first is a literal, or 'realist', level; such as, this is a picture of 'X'. A realist reading takes a visual representation on 'face value'. The second level of meaning is the one that is below the surface. Readings at this level are called subversive.

They “challenge, go beneath, and go beyond the surface, literal interpretations of a text” (Denzin, 2004, p. 240). Denzin (2004) suggested that any text should be read both ways as there is never a correct reading of a visual text. There are only multiple interpretations.

Documents from photographs and videoclips were analyzed using Collier and Collier’s (1986) principles of critical analysis of visual documents. As Collier and Collier suggested, these guidelines are provisional, and should fit to the needs of the researcher.

Collier and Collier listed the following guidelines:

Phase One: “Looking and feeling:” (a) Observe the visual documents as a totality. (b) Look and listen to the materials. Let them talk to you. Feel their effects on you. Record these feelings and impressions. And (c) Write down questions that occur to you. Note patterns of meaning. Phase Two: “What question are you asking?” (a) State your research question. (b) What questions does the text claim to answer? (c) How does it represent and define key cultural values? And (d) Inventory the evidence, note key scenes and images. Phase Three: “Structured Microanalysis:” (a) Do a scene by scene, microanalysis, transcribe discourse, describe scenes, and take quotes from the text. (b) Form and find patterns and sequences. (c) Write detailed descriptions. (d) How does the text represent objective reality, handle facts, represent experience, and dramatize truth? (e) Keep a focus on the research question. (f) Identify major moments in the film/text when conflicts over values occur. And (g) Detail how the film/text/image takes a position on these values. Phase Four: “Search for patterns:” (a) Return to the complete record, (b) Lay out all the photographs, or view the film in its entirety, (c) Return to the research question. How do these documents speak to and answer

your question? (d) Contrast realist and subversive reading of the text. (e) Write an interpretation, based on the principles of interpretation discussed above. (pp. 178-179)

Based on Collier and Collier’s guidelines, 43 photographs of Bai Fangli were reviewed, and went through four phases of the critical analysis of visual documents.

Table Example 4-3 is a sample of synthesis of data from 43 photographs (see Appendix G for the complete Table 4-3).

Table Example 4-3 A Sample of Synthesis of Data from 43 Photographs

Photo #	Caption of the photograph	Questions asked	Virtues	Subversive reading or Theme	Subquestions and date of analyzing	Source
1	Summer is coming. Bai Fangli is still wearing a long sleeve shirt and pant. His vision is to earn more money for these students in need of support.	How did the photo describe Mr. Bai? What Confucian moral values did you see in the photo? Why did Mr. Bai pedal again when he was the age of 74?	1. Ren ai 2. Dayi 3. Jian 4. Xin 5. Yong 6. Qin 7. Zhi	A monument carried on the wheels of a pedicab 1. Bai’s virtues 4. moral example	1.1, 3.4, 5.2 09/24/2005 Tianjin Daily Analyzed 03/25/09	Memorize Bai Fangli Retrieved March 20, 2009, from <a href="http://news.sohu.com/20050924/n227046178.shtml">http://news.sohu.com/20050924/n227046178.shtml</a>

In terms of audiovisual material for this study, eight videoclips of Bai Fangli were reviewed. A protocol was developed to help collect and analyze the eight videoclips (see Appendix H). Four phases of the critical analysis of the visual documents were also conducted. Table Example 4-4 is a sample of synthesis of data from eight videoclips (see Appendix G for the complete Table 4-4).

Table Example 4-4 A Sample of Synthesis of Data from Eight Videoclips

Videoclip #	Name or Description of the Video	Questions Asked	Virtues	Subversive Reading or Theme	Important quotes or contents	Subquestions and date of analyzing	Source
1	Selfless dedication of Bai Fangli: A monument carried on the wheels of a pedicab	What honors did the video show? What his records for supporting education did the video show? What photographs did you see in the video?	1. Ren ai 2. Jian 4. Yong	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence 4. Moral Example	Bai Fangli's honors and his records to support education	1.1, 1.2, 1.3, 4.1, 4.2, 4.3, 5.2  Analyzed 03/29/09	<a href="http://v.youku.com/v_show/id_cb00XMTI3ODY5ODA.html">http://v.youku.com/v_show/id_cb00XMTI3ODY5ODA.html</a>

### *Interview Analysis*

Interview data were gathered during unstructured and open-ended interviews with Bai Fangli's son, daughters, friends, and other individuals who had information that could contribute to this study. A Windows Live Messenger with webcam was set up to conduct these interviews. Among 12 interviews, seven interviews were conducted via phone because the participants did not have the Internet connections at their sites. Bai Fangli's son and daughters were asked to expand on various sections of the stories to describe Bai Fangli's life and leadership through the lens of Confucian virtues such as benevolence [*ren*] and righteousness [*yi*]. Creswell (2009) developed six steps as a process of qualitative interview analysis. These six steps include:

Step 1: Organize and prepare the data for analysis. Step 2: Read through all the data. Step 3: Begin detailed analysis with a coding process. Step 4: Use the coding process to generate a description of the setting or people as well as themes for analysis. Step 5: Advance how the description and themes will be represented in the qualitative narrative. Step 6: A final step in data analysis involves making an interpretation or meaning of the data. (pp. 185-189)

Interviews were analyzed using Creswell (2009) six steps as a process of qualitative interview analysis. The first step involved transcribing interviews in Chinese, optically scanning material, typing up field notes, and sorting and arranging the data depending on the sources of information. The second step involved reading through all the data. Notes were written in margins and general thoughts about the data at this stage were noted. The translation from Chinese took place when the interview data were transcribed and the themes were identified. Table Example 4-5 and Table Example 4-6 are a sample of interview codes for individuals not close to Bai Fangli, and individuals close to Bai Fangli based on interview questions (see Appendix G for the complete Table 4-5 & 4-6).

Table Example 4-5 A Sample of Interview Codes for Individuals Not Close to Bai Fangli

INTERVIEW QUESTION CODE	SUB CODE	INTERVIEW QUESTION #
BLENDING LIFE AND LEADERSHIP	BLL	1
BLL: LEARN ABOUT MR. BAI	BLL: LENMB	1.1
BLL: YOUR RELATIONSHIP WITH MR. BAI	BLL: YOURELWMB	1.2

Table Example 4-6 A Sample of Interview Codes for Individuals Close to Bai Fangli

INTERVIEW QUESTION CODE	SUB CODE	INTERVIEW QUESTION #
BLENDING LIFE AND LEADERSHIP	BLL	1
BLL: YOUR RELATIONSHIP WITH MR. BAI	BLL: YOURELWMB	1.1
BLL: TELL ME ABOUT MR. BAI	BLL: TELMEMB	1.2

The third step involved beginning detailed analysis with a coding process. According to Rossman and Rallis (1998), coding is the process of “organizing the material into chunks or segments of text before bringing meaning to information” (p.



171). A color coding system was used in this stage. For example, all data that could be categorized as Bai's influence were coded purple.

The fourth step involved using the coding process to generate a small number of themes. These themes displayed "multiple perspectives from individuals and be supported by diverse quotations and specific evidence" (Creswell, 2009, p. 189). The fifth step involved using a narrative passage to convey the findings of the analysis. In this stage, following to Denzin's (1989a) suggestions, narrative segments and categories within the interview-story were isolated and larger patterns and meanings were determined. This data were used to answer this study's central and sub-questions. Bai Fangli's biography was then reconstructed and the major themes that had shaped his life identified. This led to the writing of an analytic abstraction of the case that underlines (1) the structural processes in Bai Fangli's life, (2) the different kinds of theories that relate to these life experiences, and (3) the unique and general features of his life. A final step in data analysis involved making an interpretation or meaning of the data. Table Example 4-7 is a sample of synthesis of data extracted from selected responses of 12 participants to the interview questions.

Table Example 4-7 A Sample of Synthesis of Data Extracted from Selected Responses of 12 Participants

Participant's Statements	Researcher's Reflections
Li Jialun said, "I was moved by Bai's deeds."	Bai's influence to Li Jialun
Li Jialun said, "I want to learn from Bai."	moral example
Bai Guofu said, "My father liked people with knowledge."	zhi, show benevolence and great love
Chen Zhaoxiang said, "Bai Fangli influenced me to help people in need of support."	Bai's influence
Bai Xiqian said, "Bai is my moral example, and his life influenced my life."	moral example

#### Demographic Information

General information about the participants is provided in Table 4-7. Information in Table 4-7 includes: (a) participant name, (b) the relationship with Bai Fangli, (c) gender, (d) profession, and (e) affiliation. It should be noted that the participants in this study were given the option of using a fictitious name, but all chose to be identified with their real name.

Table 4-7 Demographic Information of the Participants

Participant Name	Relationship with Bai Fangli	Gender	Profession	Affiliation
Bai Guofu	Son	Male	Secretary of Workshop	Tianjin 6443 Factory
Bai Jinfeng	Daughter	Female	Quality Inspection Person	Tianjin No. 2 Knitting Factory
Xu Xiuqin	Daughter -in-Law	Female	Quality Inspection Person of Workshop	Tianjin No. 8 Coloring and Knitting Factory
Bai Huanyi	Daughter	Female	Former Vice President	Cangzhou Finance School
Bai Guoran	Nephew	Male	Engineer	Foushan Shibe Chemical Plant
Bai Song	Grandson	Male	Teacher	Xinhua Elementary School
Sun Yuying	Friend	Female	Former Chairman of the Labor Union	Hongguang High School
Xu Qiming	Friend	Male	Teacher of Moral Education Section	Yaohua High School
Li Jialun	Other	Male	General Manager	Tianjin Aimei Film and Cultural Development, Inc.
Bai Xiqian	Other	Male	Principal	Bai Fangli Elementary School
Li Li	Other	Male	Vice President	China Foundation for Poverty Alleviation
Chen Zhaoxiang	Other	Male	Taxi Driver	Tianjin Huisheng Taxi Company

### Emerging Themes

Denzin (1989b, p. 67) indicated that the researcher studies “meaning structures” to find the emerging themes from stories and pivotal events of an individual’s life in an interpretive biographical study. Emerging themes included document themes, interview themes, and combined themes in this study. Document themes emerged from 91 online newspaper articles, 43 photographs, and eight videoclips. Interview themes emerged from interviews with 12 participants. Combined themes emerged from a synthesis of document

and interview themes.

*Document Themes*

Four document themes from 91 online newspaper articles, 43 photographs, and 8 videoclips were combined: (a) Bai’s virtues, (b) Bai’s influence, (c) moral example, and (d) material and spiritual asset - pedicab. In terms of Bai’s virtues, seven sub virtue themes were combined: (a) Benevolence [*ren ai*], (b) righteousness [*dayi*], (c) fortitude [*yong*], (d) frugality [*jian*], (e) trustworthiness [*xin*], (f) wisdom [*zhi*], and (g) rituals [*li*]. The emerging themes from 91 newspaper articles are presented in Table 4-8. Four themes were displayed in Table 4-8: (a) Bai’s virtues, (b) Bai’s influence, (c) moral example, and (d) Bai’s pedicab. In terms of Bai’s virtues, seven sub themes were included: (a) Ren ai, (b) Yi, (c) Yong, (d) Jian, (e) Xin, (f) Li, and (g) Zhi. The four combined document themes are presented in Table 4-9 and the seven combined sub virtue themes are presented in Table 4-10.

Table 4-8 The Emerging Themes from 91 newspaper articles

Themes	Sub-theme 1	Sub-theme 2	Sub-theme 3	Sub-theme 4	Sub-theme 5	Sub-theme 6	Sub-theme 7
Bai’s virtues	Ren ai	Yi	Yong	Jian	Xin	Li	Zhi
Bai’s influence	Love returns for Bai	His action moved others and his children	Bai Fangli moved China				
Moral example	Bai Fangli’s honors	Bai’s monument and statue					
Bai Fangli’s pedicab	Bai Fangli’s spiritual assets	Bai Fangli’s material asset					

Table 4-9 Four Emerging Document Themes from 91 Online Newspaper Articles, 43 Photographs, and 8 Videoclips

Protocol	Photographs	Videoclips	Combined Themes
Protocol 1-3, 5-78, 80-90	Photo 1-43	Videoclip 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8	1. Bai's virtues
Protocol 2-6, 8-19, 25-37, 40-47, 51-54, 56, 59, 60, 62, 63, 66, 67, 69-72, 74, 76, 77, 78, 81, 83-86, 88, 90	Photo 6, 10, 15, 24, 25, 26, 27, 28, 29, 30, 31, 32, 33, 34, 36, 37, 38, 39, 40, 41, 42	Videoclip 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8	2. Bai's influence
Protocol 1-5, 7, 8, 11, 13, 19, 23, 31-35, 40-45, 50, 59, 66, 68, 71, 72, 74, 76, 78, 83, 85	Photo 1, 12, 15, 22, 37	Videoclip 1, 2, 6	3. Moral example
Protocol 1-7, 9, 13, 24, 26, 48, 49, 50, 59, 64, 68	Photo 7, 9, 21	Videoclip 6	4. Material and spiritual asset-pedicab

Table 4-10 Seven Combined Sub Virtue Themes from 91 Online Newspaper Articles, 43 Photographs, and 8 Videoclips

Protocol	Photographs	Videoclips	Combined Sub Virtue Themes
Protocol 1-3, 5-45, 47-62, 64, 65, 67-78, 80-82, 84-87, 89, 90, 91	Photo 1, 2, 3, 5, 6, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 20, 22, 23, 24, 25, 26, 27, 28, 29, 30, 31, 32, 33, 34, 35, 36, 37, 38, 39, 40, 41, 42, 43	Videoclip 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8	1. Ren ai
Protocol 1, 2, 3, 5, 6, 7, 9, 12, 13, 14, 18, 19, 20, 21, 24, 25, 27, 28, 29, 30, 31, 32, 33, 34, 38, 39, 40, 41, 44, 48, 50, 55, 56, 57, 58, 59, 60, 64, 65, 66, 67, 68, 69, 71, 73, 76, 82, 85, 86, 90, 91	Photo 1, 3, 4, 11, 12, 15, 16, 20, 22, 23, 24, 25	Videoclip 2, 3, 7	2. Dayi
Protocol 1, 2, 3, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 12, 13, 14, 15, 16, 18, 19, 20, 21, 24, 25, 27, 28, 29, 30, 32, 33, 34, 35, 40, 48, 50, 56, 57, 58, 59, 60, 67, 68, 71, 73, 82, 85, 86, 90, 91	Photo 1, 2, 4, 7, 15, 16, 24	Videoclip 1, 2, 3	3. Yong
Protocol 1, 2, 3, 5, 7, 8, 9, 10, 13, 14, 15, 18, 19, 21, 23, 24, 27, 28, 29, 30, 33, 35, 38, 40, 41, 44, 50, 56, 58, 60, 64, 66, 68, 73, 75, 82, 83, 85, 86, 89, 90, 91	Photo 1, 2, 7, 8, 9, 11, 15, 16, 21, 24	Videoclip 1, 2, 3, 6	4. Jian
Protocol 1, 2, 3, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 12, 13, 14, 16, 18, 19, 20, 21, 24, 25, 27, 28, 29, 30, 32, 33, 34, 40, 48, 50, 56, 57, 58, 59, 60, 65, 67, 68, 71, 73, 86, 90, 91	Photo 1, 2, 3, 4, 7, 8, 15, 24, 35	Videoclip 2, 3	5. Xin
Protocol 1, 2, 3, 5, 6, 7, 9, 13, 18, 19, 20, 21, 24, 25, 27, 28, 29, 30, 32, 33, 34, 40, 50, 56, 65, 67, 68, 71, 73, 86, 90, 91	Photo 1, 3, 8, 15	Videoclip 2, 3	6. Zhi
Protocol 1, 2, 5, 7, 9, 13, 25, 27, 28, 32, 37, 42, 43, 46, 50, 57, 58, 59, 63, 64, 68, 69, 70, 71, 72, 75, 76, 84, 85, 88, 91	Photo 3, 16, 19, 38	Videoclip 2	7. Li

### *Interview Themes*

Four interview themes emerged from interviews with 12 subjects. These themes include: (a) Bai’s virtues, (b) Bai’s influence, (c) moral example, and (d) material and spiritual asset - pedicab. In terms of Bai’s virtues, seven sub virtue themes emerged: (a) Benevolence [*ren ai*], (b) wisdom [*zhi*], (c) frugality [*jian*], (d) righteousness [*dayi*], (e) trustworthiness [*xin*], (f) rituals [*li*], and (g) fortitude [*yong*]. A sample of the emerging interview themes and seven sub virtue themes from each participant are presented in Table Example 4-8. A sample of the researcher’s emerging interview themes and seven sub virtue themes from each interview question are presented in Table Example 4-9. Then the researcher narrowed down to four emerging themes (see Appendix G for the complete Table 4-11, Table 4-12). The four emerging interview themes and the seven emerging sub virtue themes are presented in Table 4-13 and Table 4-14 (see Appendix G).

Table Example 4-8 A Sample of Emerging Interview Themes and Sub Virtue Themes from Each Participant

Subject Code	Subject Name	Themes	Sub Virtue Themes
QLBFLS0901D	Bai Guofu	Support education, benevolent father, Bai’s influence, material assets	Ren ai, Qin, xin, zhi, Jian, Li

Table Example 4-9 A Sample of Emerging Interview Themes and Sub Virtue Themes from Each Interview Question

Interview Question Sub Code	Emerging Themes from 12 Participants	Emerging Virtues from 12 Participants
BLL: LENMB	1. Bai’s virtues 2. Bai’s influence 3. Moral example	1. Ren ai 2. Zhi 3. Jian 4. Dayi 5. Xin 6. Li

### *Selected Responses from Interviews with 12 Participants*

The selected responses were interview questions answered by 12 participants, some who were close to Bai Fangli and some were not close to Bai Fangli. These data were important to help answer this study's Central and Sub-questions. These data were also important to enhance our understanding of leadership by exploring the life of Bai Fangli through the lens of Confucian virtues.

*How Bai Fangli blended his life and leadership.* When asked what they can tell the researcher about Bai Fangli, the participants said that Bai Fangli was a simple and noble worker, a benevolent and frugal person, a great old man, a person who sacrificed his own interests for the sake of others, a patriot, a moral example, and a person who contributed his love to others. When asked how their perceptions of Bai Fangli changed since his death, 11 subjects said that their perceptions of Bai Fangli did not change since his death. Xu Qiming, a teacher of Moral Education Section at Tianjin Yaohua High School said, "Bai Fangli was always a moral example, a hero, and a courageous and diligent person." Li Li, the Vice President of China Poverty Alleviation Foundation said, "Bai Fangli was a moral example. He cautioned us to realize that many people have desires to pursue ideal moral qualities." Li Jialun, the film producer of *Bai Fangli* said, "Before Bai's death, I thought that he would leave some money for his funeral. I cannot believe that his personal bank account was zero."

*How Bai Fangli's leadership impacted the lives of other individuals.* When asked how Bai Fangli changed his personal philosophy and values, Xu Qiming said, "Bai's actions as a mirror illuminated the positive part of the human nature, and made others to take actions, and find their happiness." Li Jialun said:



When I thought of Bai, he lived frugally [*jian*], and worked from dawn to night to obtain earnings by pedaling his pedicab not for himself, but for those impoverished students. Speaking profoundly, for the prosperous of his country, Bai used his last strength to help those students in need of support. When I compare myself with Bai, I feel ashamed.

Bai Guoran, Bai Fangli's nephew said, "Knowledge or speculative wisdom [*zhi*] is your own property, and nobody can take away from you. Family breaking up and living apart will not take your knowledge. My uncle's words changed my destiny." Bai Huanyi, Bai's eldest daughter said, "I am strict with myself and get along with others well. My father taught us to live frugally [*jian*]. Therefore, our family keeps a simple and frugal [*jian*] tradition." Bai Xiqian, the Principal of the Bai Fangli Elementary School said, "The completion of Bai Fangli Memorial will be the most significant matter in my life. Bai's virtues and leadership are the motivations of my job. Bai Fangli's life influenced my life." Chen Zhaoxiang said, "Bai Fangli is my moral example. I will carry on Bai Fangli's virtues and leadership." Bai Song said, "My grandpa influenced me to select a teaching career. Therefore, I become an elementary teacher."

When asked how they would compare Bai's actions with those of a Confucian sage, only two subjects were able to answer this question. Xu Qiming said:

A Confucian sage is based on the virtues of benevolence and great love [*ren ai*]. Bai's actions embraced the love to his country, and the love to the young people, the country's hope. Speaking of morality, both of them represent good; Chinese culture and humanism.

Li Li said:

Although Bai Fangli had never attended school, he inherited and carried on the traditional Confucian virtues. He applied his actions to embody the traditional Confucian virtues. Millionaires and government officials all feel that Bai Fangli is respectful. He completed his brilliant life journey by himself.

When asked how Bai Fangli's leadership impacted the lives of other individuals, Xu Qiming said that Bai Fangli applied his actions to carry out the nobility in the human nature. His actions made others feel that one can help others, and make contributions to the country as long as she has love in her heart. Li Jialun said, "As an old man, Bai Fangli relied on earnestly practicing what he advocated. He made 18 trips around the earth's equator by pedaling his pedicab."

*How Bai Fangli's epiphanies influenced his actions.* The major epiphany took place when Bai Fangli was 74. He could have said good-bye to his pedicab, and spent the rest of his cozy life just like other old people. However, his visit to his hometown changed his life. During this visit, Bai was saddened after he learned that many children in his hometown could not attend school due to poverty. He immediately decided to contribute his entire pension of RMB 5,000 to Bai Jia Village Elementary School to set up The Bai Fangli Education Foundation. When he went back to Tianjin, he decided to pedal his pedicab again to help students in need of support in order to receive a good education. Accordingly, Bai's life became extraordinary after his age of 74. He contributed his benevolence and great love [*ren ai*] to education, and to those students in need of support.

*Where Bai Fangli's influence came from.* When asked why they think that Bai had this drive to assist students in need of support, the participants said that Bai had not

attended school due to poverty. He deeply understood that education can free oneself from poverty, and make the country prosperous. Therefore, he supported those impoverished students to afford them the opportunity to become educated and thereby realize his dream.

When asked how they would describe Bai Fangli's influence, the subjects said that they hope that everyone should care for education and those people in need of support. Xu Qiming said:

Although Bai Fangli did ordinary things, these things may teach everyone. As long as one has love in her heart, it will make us to evoke conscience, increase our responsibility, strive for harmony, and pursue the goal of common wealth.

When asked what Bai Fangli's vision was, the participants said that Bai's vision was to let each student receive a good education and become a knowledgeable person who keeps up with the development of the world.

When asked how they have been influenced by Bai Fangli, Sun Yuying, the former Chairman of the Labor Union at Tianjin Hongguang High School, said that she took 200 RMB each month from her salary to support four impoverished students at her school until they were admitted into the university. She also contributed 600 RMB to *Bai Fangli's Love Scholarship*. Bai Guoran said that his uncle had influenced him a lot because he taught him to make many friends, and treat friends with righteousness [*yi*], trustworthiness [*xin*], and selflessness [*ren*]. His uncle also taught him to be frugal [*jian*]. Bai Xiqian said, "I feel that it is my responsibility to carry forward Bai Fangli's virtues and leadership." Bai Song said when his grandpa supported education, he was in high school. He did not know why his grandpa sent money to support education. After he

became a teacher, he feels that education is a great and a sacred career. He feels the responsibility to contribute his love to teach students and carry on his grandpa's virtues and leadership.

*Bai Fangli's belief structure.* When asked what type of the traditional Confucian virtues that Bai Fangli demonstrated, the participants said that benevolence and great love [*ren ai*], frugality [*jian*], righteousness [*yi*], trustworthiness [*xin*], and fortitude [*yong*] were the traditional Confucian virtues that Bai Fangli demonstrated. When asked what were the moral characteristics that they admire the most about Bai Fangli, the participants said that selfless contribution, altruism, frugality [*jian*], perseverance, and wisdom [*zhi*] were the moral characteristics that they admired the most about Bai Fangli.

#### *Combined Analysis*

The third phase of data analysis was to combine the analysis of documents and interviews. Four themes emerged from these combined documents and interviews. These themes include: (a) Bai's virtues, (b) Bai's influence, (c) moral example, and (d) material and spiritual asset – pedicab. Also, seven sub virtue themes emerged from documents and interviews. They include: (a) benevolence [*ren ai*], (b) righteousness [*dayi*], (c) fortitude [*yong*], (d) frugality [*jian*], (e) trustworthiness [*xin*], (f) wisdom [*zhi*], and (g) rituals [*li*]. The four combined themes are presented in Table 4-15, and the seven combined sub virtue themes are presented in Table 4-16. The following is description of each theme and each sub virtue theme in this study.

Table 4-15 Four Combined Themes from Documents and Interview Analysis

Document Themes	Interview Themes	Combined Themes
1. Bai's virtues	1. Bai's virtues	1. Bai's virtues
2. Bai's influence	2. Bai's influence	2. Bai's influence
3. Moral example	3. Moral example	3. Moral example
4. Material and spiritual asset-pedicab	4. Material and spiritual asset-pedicab	4. Material and spiritual asset-pedicab

Table 4-16 Seven Combined Sub Virtue Themes from Documents and Interview Analysis

Emerging Sub Virtue Themes from Documents	Emerging Sub Virtue Themes from Interviews	Combined Sub Virtue Themes
1. Ren ai	1. Ren ai	1. Ren ai
2. Dayi	2. Zhi	2. Dayi
3. Yong	3. Jian	3. Yong
4. Jian	4. Dayi	4. Jian
5. Xin	5. Xin	5. Xin
6. Zhi	6. Li	6. Zhi
7. Li	7. Yong	7. Li

*Lens of Confucian Virtues*

Seven Confucian virtues were evident through the life and leadership of Bai Fangli. These seven virtues included: (a) righteousness [*yi*], (b) wisdom [*zhi*], (c) fortitude [*yong*], (d) trustworthiness [*xin*], (e) rituals [*li*], (f) benevolence and great love [*ren ai*] and (g) frugality [*jian*]. This section is concentrated on articulating each Confucian virtue and how it is aligned with the literature review.

### *Bai's Virtues*

Bai's virtues evolved as an important theme in this study. Seven sub virtue themes comprise this theme. The description of each sub virtue theme helps the understanding of the theme of Bai's virtues. The following is the description of righteousness [*dayi*], the first sub virtue theme.

#### *Righteousness [Dayi]*

*Bai came from a place with knightly heroes.* Bai Fangli was born on June 17, 1913 in Baijia Village, Cang County, Hebei Province. Bai's hometown had been very poor since ancient times. Many villagers starved to death due to disasters or chaos caused by war from the 1930s to 1940s. His hometown was in the central area of Yan and Zhao Kingdoms since ancient times. The land there was barren, and, so, the crops were scarce. However, countless knightly heroes had appeared from ancient times to the present. Han Yu, one of the eminent writers in Tang Dynasty once noted that numerous heroes came forth in Yan and Zhao Kingdoms. Su Shi, an eminent writer in Song Dynasty also indicated that countless knightly heroes emerged in Yan Kingdom since ancient times, and their names were shown in the historical record.

*Bai was a patriot.* Xu Xiuqin said that his father-in-law was a patriot, trying to support the country. Bai told his children not to count on him to leave some assets for them. He always said to them, "To me, I will always put the country first, and the family second." Every time when Bai tried to teach them again, they would repeat his words. Xu Qiming said, "Bai was a patriot." Li Jialun said that Bai showed his patriotism to his country and people.

*Bai was selfless.* Xu Xiuqin said that his father-in-law taught them to think of

others more than themselves. Bai knew that there were impoverished students in every school. Initially, all the schools that Bai made contributions to were schools that he saw while riding his pedicab. He often saw a school on the road, and immediately sent money to that school. Bai put money at the reception desk, and said that this money was for students in need of support. When people asked him to leave his name, Bai said no. When people wanted to give him receipts, he also said no. Hence, in the early years when Bai made contributions to support education, those impoverished students whom Bai supported did not know their contributor was an old man riding a pedicab. Later on, they knew who their contributor was when the media covered Bai's deeds. Su Yuying recalled that when her students received Bai's contributions, many students held Bai's money in both hands and cried.

When Bai established his Bai Fangli Support Education Company, Bai Jinfeng, Bai's youngest daughter, just lost her job. She could not find employment anywhere. She had to ask her father if she could work for him. Bai Fangli said to his daughter, "My company is a company to support education, not Bai's family company. My company is for public good, not for private benefits. I am sorry that you cannot work here." Bai Jinfeng said, "Dad, you invested in this company, and you are the CEO. Others can work here and why cannot I?" Bai said, "You should find a job by yourself." Bai Jinfeng cried and said, "Other parents always put their children's needs first. You always put other children's needs first, and put the country's needs first. When you are old, your children will take care of you." Bai said, "I cannot offer you a job. So, you'd better find your own way." Bai Jinfeng left in tears.

### *Righteousness [Yi] and the Literature Review*

The subjects in this study perceived Bai as a righteous person. According to Yang et al. (2008), Yi is based on the moral principles, not self interest and material gains. Yi and personal profit are opposite values. Bai Fangli told Bai Jinfeng that his company's profits were for education, not for self interest. Thus, he did not allow Bai Jinfeng to work for his company. Confucius said, "*Junzi* in making their way in the world are neither bend on nor against anything; rather they do with what is *yi*" (*Analects* 4: 10). Xu Xiuqin said that her father-in-law was a patriot. As a patriot, Bai's concept of righteousness [*yi*] was to work for the best interests of the country by helping students in need of his support.

### *Wisdom [Zhi]*

*Stories of knightly heroes became initial teaching materials in Bai's life.* During his childhood, Bai was frequently told by his villagers the stories of these knightly heroes. These stories became initial teaching materials in his life. Bai was eager for knowledge. However, his family was poor. They often starved. There was no such money to support his education.

There was a private school in his village. Whenever he passed it, Bai always stopped and listened to the recitation from inside the wall. Although he did not understand the *Analects*, which those children recited, it was pleasant for Bai to listen to. The school children's voice was in front of him, but they seemed far away from him. He always had the dream to enter the private school, and recite loudly with other children. Bai told his nephew, Bai Guoran, "I do not like listening to songs, listening to play, but I like listening to the loud recitation of children. I have to admit that I am not fortunate



enough to become a knowledgeable person.”

*Knowledge is personal property, and is different from the inherited property.* Bai said to Bai Guoran, “The family breaking up and living apart may keep your property, but your learned knowledge belongs only to you, and no one can take it away from you.” Bai’s words become a motto for Bai Guoran, inspiring him to study hard, and changed his fate. Bai Guoran was the only one who was admitted into the university from Baijia Village, Cang County at that time.

Bai had a sad story behind what he had said to Bai Guoran. Although Bai was born in a remote and backward place, his family had been quite rich in the local area until he was born. His father was remarried after the death of his first wife. Bai’s mother was the second wife. His two elder half brothers wanted to divide their family properties because they were worried Bai’s mother might have more sons. Thus, Bai’s family properties were divided among the three sons: Bai only obtained approximately 200 acres of land under his name. Shortly after their family properties were divided, Bai’s mother gave birth to another boy, Bai Guoran’s father. When Bai’s parents asked for a portion of their family properties for a new born son, his two half brothers rejected. Dividing their family properties, siblings became enemies. From then on, Bai’s two elder half brothers were no longer caring for him and his little brother.

Normally, 200 acres of land under Bai’s name was ample enough to feed the entire family. However, Bai’s father got used to having a wealthy life, and he did not want to work hard for his sons. So he started gradually selling Bai’s land piece by piece. Bai’s land became smaller and smaller. When Bai was five, his father sold his land entirely. Peasants rely on the land completely. Without land, there is no way to survive.

Bai at the school age was unable to attend school because his family's financial situation got worse. Bai's sister became a widow when she was 20. She could not bear her brothers' sufferings, and came back to live with them, and feed them. When his sister begged in order to feed his two younger brothers, Bai told her, "I will buy more delicious food for you when I grow up." When Bai was eight, his sister made steam bread at home and asked her brothers to sell them at the market. When Bai handed the first coin that he earned in his life to his sister, she cried.

*Bai advocated education, and liked people with knowledge.* Bai Guoran said, "My uncle was eager to learn knowledge, and according to him, education is the most worthy thing to do in his life." However, Bai did not have an opportunity to pursue education due to poverty. Therefore, he paid close attention to his children's education. Bai Guoran recalled that he was admitted into Tianjin University in 1962. Before starting school, he visited his uncle in Tianjin for the first time. At that time, his uncle was repairing his pedicab. When Bai Guoran told him that he came to Tianjin to attend Tianjin University, he was cheerful. He immediately rushed to the house and shouted twice, "Guoran was admitted into Tianjin University." Then, Bai taught his children to learn from Bai Guoran, and study hard to be admitted to the college. Bai Guofu said, "My father advocated education, and liked people with knowledge."

*The importance of education.* Bai Fangli told his children, "I will earn more for you if you go to school." Bai Fangli kept his word. In spite of paying tuitions or buying stationeries, Bai granted whatever his children requested for educational expenses. Nevertheless, if they requested other expenses that had nothing to do with their studies, it was impossible to get a penny from his father. Bai Huanyi, Bai's elder daughter, was

admitted to Tianjin Normal University. Bai was very happy and gave her a pile of coins to pay her tuition. However, when she was homesick, and wanted to come back and visit, Bai ordered her not to come back because it cost two cents to pay the bus fee. Bai provided for his three children by pedaling his pedicab, and two of them finished college.

*Bai's prudence.* Bai told his son, Bai Guofu, “If children have no education, how will the country become stronger?” Behind Bai’s simple words was his abiding belief, which was imprinted on the wheels of his pedicab by his sweat for 17 years. Thus, *the country’s future is in her children, and children’s future is in education* became Bai’s abiding belief and his vision. Therefore, he contributed his benevolence and great love [*ren ai*] to children and society.

At the same time, he worked for his country, and for the future of his country (i.e. he showed his righteousness [*yi*] to the greatest extent to his country). In fact, Bai contributed his love to children, and his righteousness [*yi*] to his country. Bai even noted “*No eating and drinking, I have to support education*” when he had an interview with the Chinese Central Television. Li Li, the Vice President of China Poverty Alleviation Foundation, said, “Bai Fangli is a man of great wisdom. He is a man who obtained an eternal value. Therefore, he is also a man with happiness.”

#### *Wisdom [Zhi] and the Literature Review*

The participants in this study perceived Bai as a wise and prudent person. According to Aristotle, wisdom is sometimes referred to as speculative wisdom to distinguish from practical wisdom. The term speculative denotes this form of wisdom as conceptual rather than applied. Speculative wisdom concerns itself with the nature of things while prudence, literally from “experience,” concerns particulars within a nature

*(Nicomachean Ethics, 2002).*

Although Bai Fangli was illiterate, his love for education and people with knowledge showed that he was eager for speculative wisdom. However, he did not have an opportunity to learn his knowledge at school because of poverty. Mencius applied *zhi zhe wu huo* to define wisdom (*zhi*), one of the Confucian cardinal virtues. *Zhi zhe wu huo* translates as the wise is prudent and sensible to apply his practical knowledge to correctly understanding and grasping his life, the world, and real situations (Lau, 1970). Bai Fangli was prudent because he had a right reason to support education and help students in need of support. His right reason was learned from his experience. Hence, Bai Fangli was the wise who was prudent and sensible in applying his practical knowledge to correctly understand and grasp his life, the world, and real situations.

*Fortitude [Yong]*

*Bai was a perseverant child.* At the age of 13, during a severe winter, Bai pushed a wheel barrow and brought his younger brother to sell salt by the sea. On his way to the sea, Bai was perky and filled with lofty sentiments. He felt that he was eventually growing up and may face the world independently and feed his family as a masculine young man.

Bai and his brother pushed the wheel barrow day after day. When they were hungry, they nibbled at their cold and dry solid food. One night, when they were tired and sleepy, they slept in a grinding room. The grinding room had only a roof covered with hay, and no walls. Bai was awake because the temperature was freezing cold. He quickly woke up his younger brother, and they got up and exerted all their strengths to push the grind. When they felt that their bodies became warmer, they slept again. When they woke

up because of the coldness, they pushed the grind again to keep themselves warm. They lost track of the number of times they had to repeat this during the night. Bai Guoran said:

Why my uncle can face and accept his life's hardship with his smile? I think after he encountered such hardship in his childhood, other hardships were no longer a hardship for him. Even he treated hardship as happiness. For him, the most regrettable thing in his life was not enduring hardship, but not attending school.

*As an old man, Bai continued to persevere.* Bai Jinfeng said that in order to earn more money for those impoverished students, her father used his entire strength. She recalled that her father did not come back by midnight one day. She was worried, and tried to find him everywhere. Bai came back after midnight, and was very happy as if he had picked a golden nugget. My father said, "I delivered some goods to Wuqing for a guest. Because it is far away, I earned a lot." Bai was 80 years old at that time. Bai Jinfeng looked at him, and felt distressed, and cried. She said to Bai, "Dad, why do you work so late? You should care about yourself." Bai said to her, "Why do I? Today's earnings can feed 30 impoverished students for a day."

The following was a report from *Xinhua News* and demonstrates Bai's personal sacrifices to continue his support of those students in need:

In order to work conveniently and look after the Bai Fangli Support Education Company, Bai set up a shack in an area of three square meters nearby his company. He used bricks to add a wooden board as a bed, and one can see the sky through the gap in the roof. In the summer, the temperature is about 40 degrees celsius in the shack (105 F). In the winter, hot water turns into ice cubes immediately. Bai has slept in the shack for five years. (Zhang & Li, 2005)

*Bai was perseverant and diligent.* Bai Guofu said, “I rarely saw my father from my childhood till I had my own family. At sunrise, when I was still in the dream, my father was gone; until late at night, then, when I was asleep, my father came back.” In the summer, Bai’s sweat resembled rain from head to toe under the burning sun. In the winter, Bai’s eyebrows and beard were full of frost and snow. Bai Jinfeng recalled that her father did not come home until late every night. When he came back, he would count a pile of coins that he earned for a day before having his supper. When he finished counting, he wrote the number on his little notebook. Bai Jinfeng said, “My father assigned a daily goal for himself. If he did not reach the goal, he would not come back.”

Bai Guofu said that people might think that his father was the CEO of Bai Fangli Support Education Company, and he could put down the pedicab. However, he hired a manager to manage the sales booth, and he still pedaled his pedicab daily as before. Furthermore, Bai had a goal to earn RMB 30-40 per day, and earn above RMB 1,000 per month. Bai Fangli said to Bai Guofu, “My daily earning can feed more than 10 children for a day.” This was Bai Fangli’s spiritual world. His perseverance showed his love to those students in need of support.

The following was a 2005 report regarding Bai Fangli’s perseverance from Xinhua, the most authoritative news agency in China:

He worked for 365 days, and did not even take a day off. He passed out from his pedicab in a hot summer day, fell in the ditch in a cold winter, and fell asleep while riding his pedicab because of excess in fatigue. He had a fever time after time over 39 degrees Celsius. He swallowed medicine while pedaling his pedicab. Since he was old, he could not control his urine, and his cotton pant was always

wet.

### *Fortitude [Yong] and the Literature Review*

The subjects in this study perceived Bai as a courageous person. Aristotle's view on fortitude is compatible with the Confucian view. According to Aristotle, fortitude allows one to overcome fear and to remain steady in one's will in the face of obstacles, but it is always reasoned and reasonable; the person exercising fortitude does not seek danger for danger's sake (*Nicomachean Ethics*, 2002). When Bai Fangli was 13, in order to survive, he was courageous enough to sell salt by sea and to endure the ensuing hardship, and this event was reasonable because Bai overcame fear and remained steady in his will in the face of obstacles.

Since the age of 74, in order to support education and the students in need of support, Bai Fangli was courageous enough to endure numerous hardships, and these hardships were also reasonable given the circumstances and Bai's wishes. Prudence and justice are the virtues through which one decides what needs to be done; fortitude gives one the strength to get it done (*Nicomachean Ethics*, 2002). Bai Fangli was courageous and this courage gave him the strength to support education, and to help students in need of support.

Perseverance is the most necessary and common part of fortitude (*Nicomachean Ethics*, 2002). Bai Fangli was perseverant because he diligently worked for 365 days a year without stopping in order to support students in need of support. He overcame many obstacles including business decisions and personal health matters.

### *Trustworthiness [Xin]*

*Bai was trustworthy.* Bai Guoran said, "My uncle is a trustworthy person." He

remembered when he was studying at Tianjin University, his uncle gave him an allowance each week. He often visited his uncle during the weekends. If Bai Guoran was unable to go home for some weekends, Bai rode his pedicab and delivered the allowance to him. Bai Guoran said that he was quite rich during his college years because his uncle kept his word to give him an allowance each week.

Sun Yuying said that she still remembered Bai sending his last contribution to her school. A rubber band wrapped a pile of small change. Bai's last contribution seemed extremely heavy on Sun's hands. Bai said, "My health condition is not good now, and my earnings are less now. I can only give you that much. As long as I can ride my pedicab, I will still send money to you." Sun said, "Bai moved me again, and I cried." Bai kept his word because he continuously sent the same amount to the Tibetan students at Hongguang High School for eight years. Trustworthiness [*xin*] is an important Confucian cardinal virtue. Bai's actions showed that he was trustworthy [*xin*].

When his company was closed, Bai's source of income was still his pedicab earnings. In order to keep his word to those needy students, Bai visited Bai Huanyi, his elder daughter, at Cangzhou before the Chinese New Year. Bai Huanyi recalled:

We were very happy to see my father, and we thought that he came for the Chinese New Year. However, when we learned that my father came to borrow money to keep his word to those impoverished students, we were shocked.

Bai said to Bai Huanyi, "My company was closed, and I have not reached my goal this year. Those children are waiting for my money. I came here to borrow money, and you have to lend me RMB 5,000." Bai Huanyi said to her father, "Dad, our salaries are low, and do you know how long we can save for RMB 5,000." Bai was unhappy, and said to



his daughter:

I promise that I will pay the amount back to you. If you do not lend money to me, I cannot keep my word to those students in need of support. Then, I become an untrustworthy and unrighteous person. If you do not loan me this money, you are no longer my daughter, and I do not want to see you anymore.

Bai Huanyi cried, and said, “Dad, please don’t say that, I will give you the money.” Bai Huanyi gathered RMB 10,000, and gave it to her father. When Bai held his daughter’s money, he was very happy. He went back to Tianjin immediately to fulfill his promise to those needy students. Although Bai was unable to pay back his daughter’s money, he kept his word to those needy students, and thereby kept his trustworthiness [*xin*].

#### *Trustworthiness [Xin] and the Literature Review*

The subjects in this study perceived Bai as a trustworthy person. Being trustworthy plays an important role in Confucian ethic (Koehn, 2001; Romar, 2004). Tu-Weiming, a professor of Chinese history and philosophy and Director of the Yenching Institute at Harvard University noted that the Confucian businessmen stress the traditional values as “honoring one’s commitment” [*xin yong*], “maintaining one’s credibility” [*xin yu*], and “committing oneself to doing what is right” [*xin yi*] (Yu and Lu, 2000, p. 384). According to Confucius, these traditional values such as “honoring one’s commitment” [*xin yong*] and “committing oneself to doing what is right” [*xin yi*] apply to anyone in the Chinese culture.

Bai Fangli stressed the traditional Confucian virtues of trustworthiness [*xin*] by his actions. In order to keep his word to the students in need of support, he pedaled his pedicab to obtain earnings until he was no longer able to pedal anymore. Even when he

was out of money, he borrowed money from his family so that he could continue to support students as he had promised. In addition, Bai Fangli's belief was that education can make the country stronger and can change one's fate. Since he had this abiding belief, Bai strove to assist those students in need of support.

*Rituals [Li]*

*Bai had dignity as a father.* "My father was very strict to us. We were all afraid of him when we were young," Bai Huanyi recalled. "My father had an absolute authority in our family. When he made a decision, we had to obey," Bai Guofu said. Xu Xiuqin recalled that when her father-in-law was awake before his death, he could not speak. Bai held her hands, and Xu tried to read from his lips. Xu said to him, "Do you want to say that you did not leave anything for your children?" Bai nodded. Xu said, "You left too much for your children, and the society. The spiritual assets that you left for us will carry on forever." The corners of Bai's mouth had a little smile.

In the traditional Chinese culture, parents have responsibilities to leave some material assets such as the house property or money to their children. As a father, Bai felt sorry for his children because he did not leave any material assets to them. However, Bai left many spiritual assets to his family. Bai Guofu said, "My father's virtues are our family's cherished tradition."

*Bai showed respect to his elder sister and villagers.* Bai supported his sister who was a widow since she was 20. Bai did send money to her each month until her death. In addition, Bai supported Bai Guoran until he finished college. Furthermore, he still remembered his impoverished Baijia Village's relatives and friends sending them a pile of new hats and clothes each year. If his village's relatives wrote a letter to him and asked

for help, Bai would immediately send them money.

*Bai showed his respect to elders and pedicab passengers.* While Bai pedaled his pedicab to support education, when the festivals came, Bai sent money to the Tianjin Elders Home. The old people said to Bai, “You are older than us, and you still send your earnings to us. We are embarrassed.” Bai said to them, “As long as I am healthy, I will send money to you again.” Mencius said, “Honor the aged of other family as we honor our own; Care for the children of other family as we care for our own” (*Mencius*). Bai Fangli scrupulously abided by ritual propriety [*li*], the traditional Confucian virtue.

A little red flag on Bai’s pedicab looked especially vivid. The words on the little red flag translate: *the old, weak, sick, and disabled are free, and soldier’s dependents and members of martyr’s family pay half price.* Xu Xiuqin, Bai’s daughter-in-law, recalled that she made the red flag for her father-in-law. The red flag on Bai’s pedicab was unique among other pedicabs.

Passengers liked taking Bai’s pedicab, and his business was better than other pedicab riders. Other pedicab riders were very jealous. Accordingly, Bai’s tires were stabbed, and his red flag was constantly broken, but he did not care. He repaired tires, and asked Xu to make another red flag for him. Passengers liked sitting on Bai’s pedicab. Xu said, “I made a large pile of red flags for my father-in-law every time. From then on, the red flag that was hung on my father-in-law’s pedicab was constantly new.” Only when Bai fell, would the red flag fall.

#### *Ritual Propriety [Li] and the Literature Review*

The participants in this study perceived Bai as a person emphasizing ritual propriety. Propriety or Rites (*Li*) is one of the Confucian cardinal virtues referring to “the

observation of appropriate rituals and rules of conduct, which are social norms rather than formal laws and regulations” (Yang et al., 2008, p. 35). Essentially, the five cardinal relationships (*wu lun*) were developed to adjust all important human interactions, specifically those between: (a) parent and child; (b) husband and wife; (c) elder and younger brothers; (d) elder and junior friend; and (e) ruler and subject (Fu et al., 2004; Fu & Tsui, 2003; Smith, 1973; Smith, 1998; Tsui, Wang, Xin, Zhang, & Fu, 2004; Yan & Sorenson, 2004; Yang, 1993).

As a father, Bai Fangli demonstrated his absolute authority in his family. His children were afraid of him, and showed respect to him. As a husband, Bai’s wife was obedient to him. As an elder brother, he took care of his younger brother and sister. To elders, Bai showed his filial piety to them. As the CEO of Bai Fangli Support Education Company, Bai told his employees that except for the money needed for their salaries, the profits of his company would be sent to those students in need of support.

*Benevolence [Ren ai]*

*Bai showed his benevolence and great love to those students in need of support.*

As a witness of Bai’s last contribution, Xu Qiming, a teacher at the Moral Education Section at Tianjin Yaohua High School recalled:

We thought that Bai was no longer pedaling his pedicab, and he would not be able to send money to those students in need of support. However, in November 2001, on a windy and snowy morning, Bai came to our school.

Bai gave Xu a dozen bills of money from his pocket, and said to him, “This is my retirement fund that I collected for months. Please give it to those students in need.”

When Xu looked at him, Bai’s whole body was covered with thick snow. His eyebrows

and moustache were covered with ice. Bai looked like a Santa Claus. Xu did not have the heart to take Bai's retirement fund, and said to him, "We really cannot take your money anymore." Bai's body was very weak, and he coughed and said to Xu, "Please accept my last contribution." Facing such a great old man, Xu had to accept Bai's benevolence and great love [*ren ai*].

The following was a report from *Metro Express*, a branch of *Tianjin Daily*:

Yang Junyu, Bai's old friend recalled that Bai Fangli showed his benevolence and great love [*ren ai*] to support education for many years. In his late years, he relied on sugar to alleviate his hunger, and still insisted on sending money to those students in need of support. In order to support education, he contributed his entire energy.

Xu Xiuqin recalled that her father-in-law wanted to leave the hospital by himself. He said to Xu, "I have to leave the hospital right now. I feel bad that I have spent all the money. I want to leave the remaining money to needy students." When her father-in-law passed away, according to his will, they established a scholarship, which translates as *Bai Fangli's Love Scholarship*. "My father-in-law left the ultimate love to this world." Xu said.

*Bai showed his benevolence to the Tibetan students.* In 1992, Sun Yuying was the Chairman of the Labor Union at Hongguang High School. She collected a folder carefully for many years. The folder recorded the applicants for the scholarship, and the amount of the scholarship for each successful applicant. This folder clearly recorded Bai's benevolence and great love [*ren ai*] to those Tibetan students.

Hongguang High School is the only school accepting Tibetan students in Tianjin.

Sun recalled that the first time she saw Bai was in 1992. When her school's Tibetan students were volunteering at the Tianjin Northern Train Station, Bai came and talked to them. "Are you Tibetan students? Do you have difficulty living in Tianjin?" Bai asked. A Tibetan student answered, "We come from impoverished families."

Shortly after the conversation that Bai had with one of the Tibetan students, Bai rode his pedicab to Hongguang High School. He introduced himself to the principal. The principal called Sun to come. When Bai took out a pile of coins and dimes in total of RMB 900 from his pocket, Sun and others were shocked. Bai said, "I will send RMB 900 to the Tibetan students every month."

From then on, Bai sent money to Hongguang High School each month. Sun recalled that when Bai sent money each month, the school arranged a class meeting to let students report their studies to him. Sun said, "I teach my students to learn from Grandpa Bai's [grandpa is a term used in China to note that elders need to be respected based on Confucian five cardinal relationships] virtues of benevolence and great love [*ren ai*]."

Grandpa Bai inspired the Tibetan students to study hard, and he became a practical teaching symbol for their curriculum. When Bai left, these Tibetan students followed him to the gates of the school, and they were not willing to leave. From 1993 to the time when Bai was taken down with an illness in 2000, he supported 200 Tibetan students at Hongguang High School. Bai rode his pedicab, and sent a stipend to them month in and month out. In the end, Bai contributed RMB 40,000 to the Tibetan students.

*Helping others is my happiness.* Bai Jinfeng, Bai Fangli's daughter, said, "The happiest thing for my father was to count coins and put them into his little wooden box after dinner. The happiest day each month for my father was to ride his pedicab, and

make his contributions to the schools.” In Bai Jinfeng’s impression, her father felt that helping others was his happiness. Bai Fangli sent his benevolence and great love [*ren ai*] to many students in need of support. He gained paramount happiness because his selfless act touched these students and nourished their minds.

Bai’s contributions to those students in need of support mostly passed on from the schools to the students. Bai had never asked about the names of those students. People tried to get the list of names for those students whom Bai supported. However, they only found a group photo. This was the only group photo that Bai took with several students whom he supported. Bai never met the 300 students whom he supported, and he did not know their names. He had never thought about pay-back in any form from them. Li Jialun said that the happiest thing for Bai was helping others.

*Bai showed his benevolence to others.* Xu Xiuqin recalled when her father-in-law had his own company, and his small shack, he no longer returned home. Xu sent supper to him every night. When the Chinese New Year came, Bai did not go home. Xu sent Chinese New Year Eve dinner to him. She found that Bai’s shack was cold and dirty, and his bed was like an ice cube. Xu knew that it was hard to persuade him into going home. So, she made a new quilt for her father-in-law. Bai told Xu that the quilt was very warm. When Xu returned to the shack, the quilt was gone. Bai said to her, “I gave my quilt to a worker who looks after the building.”

Xu brought snow boots, down quilts, and down coats to Bai. When she came to visit him the next time, Bai had given them to those impoverished students. Even Bai’s hands and his snot froze, but he still sent his love to others. Xu Xiuqin sighed and said, “As an ordinary person, who could endure my father-in-law’s hardship? As an ordinary

person, who can be as benevolent as my father-in-law?”

Hao Maishou (2004), a professor at Tianjin Social Science Institute said:

Although Bai Fangli was illiterate, his virtues of benevolence and great love [*ren ai*] illuminates China like a sun. His virtue of benevolence and great love will have a far-reaching impact on the reconstruction of morality and return of the traditional moral values in China. His virtue of benevolence and great love will exist with the mountains and rivers, and shine with the sun and moon.

#### *Benevolence and Great Love [Ren Ai] and the Literature Review*

The participants in this study perceived Bai as a person who showed his benevolence to others. In Chinese, the pronunciation of human and benevolence (or humaneness) is the same, namely *ren*. The word for benevolence is composed of two morphemes meaning two people. Literarily and philosophically, Confucius and Mencius believed that being human is being benevolent and that to be benevolent is to “be human” (*ren zhe ren ye*) and is to love humans (*ren zhe ai ren*). Confucius defined benevolence as the virtue of all virtues (*Analects*).

Bai Fangli showed his benevolence and great love [*ren ai*] to those impoverished students whom he supported including the Tibetan students. In addition, Bai was a benevolent person and there exists countless examples of his benevolence. It was from his benevolence that he found happiness. Bai Fangli said, “Helping others is my happiness.” He gained paramount happiness because his selfless act touched these students, and nourished their minds.

#### *Frugality [Jian]*

*Bai's frugality in his daily life.* Speaking about Bai Fangli's frugality, Xu Xiuqin



said:

My father in law always wore unmatched clothes, shoes, and a hat from head to toe all the year round. These clothes, shoes, and caps were picked from the street and garbage cans. He was very happy and said to others, "I have never bought new clothes. These shirts, pants, and caps are all picked from the garbage can." When my father-in-law's clothes were torn, I would mend them for him. When his clothes were torn again, I would mend them again. His clothes looked like a monk's clothes with 100 patches.

Besides not buying new clothes, Bai's diet was very simple. He often had two pieces of steam bread, a bottle of water, and a few pickles. His delicacy was to add some soy sauce to the hot water. His overall preparation before sleep was that he put a newspaper on the floor, and a brick was used as a pillow. He would cover his face with a hat.

Bai's diet at home was very simple, too. He had no more than a piece of pork or an egg for each meal. His children asked him to eat more, but he declined. When he wanted to indulge himself occasionally, he kept a little pork in his mouth, and savored its flavor slowly before going to sleep. Bai was so frugal that he would not empty used water after washing his face in the morning. He used the same water from the morning and added to it a little more hot water to wash his face again in the evening. Only then he would dispose of the water.

Xu said that the raw ingredients had to be weighted when she made a meal. Things she bought and used required recording. For example, a flavor or a match had to be recorded in the book. She ate porridge most of the times, and when she was boiling

porridge, in order to save some gas, she had to put a rack on the top of the porridge to warm steam bread at the same time. The steamed bread was almost soaked in the porridge, and it became tasteless. However, Bai ate it with keen pleasure. When Xu was hungry in the evening, she reported eating her son's crackers on the sneak.

When Bai's family made dumplings, Bai made it a rule to allow each person to only have nine dumplings. Bai ate his dumplings with a lot of soup. He would be full even before he finished nine dumplings. However, when Xu finished nine dumplings, and she wanted to eat more, Bai would tell her to eat more dumpling soup. Left over porridge added with some noodle soup would often serve as supper. Once Xu was in a daze at her supper, and Bai asked her to eat. She told Bai that she could not swallow. Bai said to Xu:

I don't want you to have a high demand on your material comfort such as food and clothes. Many people's lives are not as good as ours. We can help others more if we save some. Isn't that great?

Xu had to eat her supper in tears.

Xu recalled that people sold fresh fruit everywhere on the street during the hot summer. However, her father-in-law never bought any fresh fruit. He always picked fruit from the garbage can by the fruit vendor's stand. One day, he brought a rotten water melon home. He cut the good part and let her eat it, and then he ate the rotten part himself. He said to her, "The taste of the rotten water melon is good."

*Bai's frugality assisted his support of education.* Bai Guofu said that his father told him a story regarding his contribution at Nankai University. The school wanted to give him a ride, but Bai said that the gas fee could be saved to buy books for the students. He rode his pedicab to Nankai University. At the endowment ceremony, when the teacher

told the story of Bai's frugality to the students, they were moved. Many students held Bai's endowment in both hands, and their hands were shaking.

Bai Jinfeng said, "My father loves pork. However, when he started supporting education, he barely ate pork. In order to save more money, he had to eat vegetables instead." Bai's contributions to those impoverished students were not easy because he had to live frugally. Bai Guofu said:

Many people would not believe that my father had never had a meal at a restaurant in his lifetime. Tianjin is the capital of delicious food, and restaurants with distinct flavors are spread all over many avenues and alleys. My father had to pass many restaurants while pedaling his pedicab. When he nibbled at cold steam bread and drank cold water, didn't he think of having a hot meal and a hot soup in a cozy restaurant? As a son, when I think of this every time, I want to cry.

Sun Yuying and Bai had a friendship with Bai Fangli even though they were of different generations. She remembered that she brought a few Tibetan students to visit Bai during in a hot summer. She could not believe that Bai actually lived in such a small room with the area of three square meters. Bai was sitting by the table to have lunch. Bai's lunch included steam bread and soy sauce soup. Sun felt sad and distressed. Sun told her students, "Grandpa Bai's pedicab earnings are hard to attain. You must remember that Grandpa Bai's money is more precious than the real gold."

*Bai was frugal even after his death.* According to the Chinese tradition, when people die, their funerals and mourning halls cost much money. Bai Guofu said when he was alive, his father told him several times to keep his mourning hall very simple. His

father had a frugal life. After his death, Bai did not allow his children to be extravagant and wasteful. In his mourning hall, no incense or candles were allowed.

#### *Frugality [Jian] and the Literature Review*

The participants in this study perceived Bai as a frugal and temperate person. Confucius believed that frugality is an important virtue. Confucius said, “Seldom does a man who regulates his behavior according to the rites make mistakes” (*Analects 4:23*). Confucius also said, “Just as lavishness leads easily to arrogance, so frugality leads easily to shabbiness. However, the latter is better than the former” (*Analects 7:36*).

According to Aristotle, the virtue of temperance governs our appetites for pleasure. Temperance does not restrain one from the pleasures that are reasonable, but from those that are contrary to one’s own reason. The virtue of temperance also requires one to prepare herself. All human beings are required to develop the virtue of temperance and govern their desire for pleasure by reason, and so all must take the necessary steps to prepare themselves (St. Thomas Aquinas, 1920). A lack of temperance undermines prudence, and if prudence is destroyed, all the virtues are undermined (*Nicomachean Ethics*, 2002).

The concept of Confucius’ virtue of frugality is compatible with Aristotle’s virtue of temperance. Bai demonstrated his frugality in his daily life including the food he ate, the clothes he wore, water he reused, and the place he lived. Bai developed the virtue of temperance and governed his desire for material comfort by reason. In order to support education and those impoverished students, Bai made a conscious choice to live his life, and even forced his family to live frugally.

### *Bai's Influence*

Besides Bai's virtues, Bai's influence is the second theme in this study. This theme is closely connected with Bai's virtues, life, and leadership. The following focuses on how others and the Chinese society acted as a result of Bai's influence, as well as his referent power.

#### *Bai Had Positive Influences on his Adult Descendants*

After an earthquake took place in Wenchuan, Sichuan, China in 2008, Bai Jinfeng thought of her father. Bai Jinfeng asked herself, "If my father were still alive, what would he do?" When she recalled that her father selflessly contributed his love to his country and people, Bai Jinfeng was in tears. She donated RMB 200 to the earthquake victims. The receptionist persuaded her not to make donations because Bai Jinfeng had a difficult life. Bai Jinfeng said, "I can only give you that much this time. I hate myself for not being courageous like my father." Bai Huanyi, Bai Fangli's elder daughter said, "My profession as a teacher was influenced by my father because he liked people with knowledge." Bai Song, Bai Fangli's grandson said, "My grandpa wanted me to be a teacher. Therefore, I chose to be an elementary teacher as my educational career."

#### *Bai Changed Actions of Others as a Result of his Influence*

When the media reported more and more of Bai's deeds, the pedicab riders at Tianjin railway station became aware of Bai Fangli. They started showing respect to him, and eventually came to love him dearly. They gave light and short distance work to Bai. Sujin, an author who met Bai Fangli once at the Tianjin railway station, experienced Bai's referent power. Su recalled an example of Bai's influence in his article *My Memory of Old Man, Bai Fangli*:

On a summer day, when I was at the exit of the Tianjin railway station, I saw that three pedicab riders wanted to be the first to lift a female passenger's luggage. They shouted, "Grandpa Bai, Binjiang Road." Not being far away, Bai happily pushed his pedicab over. The woman saw a skinny old man, and she was unhappy, and said, "Do you have the strength to ride the pedicab?" Bai said, "I have." Bai smiled and put the luggage on his pedicab. The three pedicab riders said to the woman, "Don't look down on him. He is pretty strong." The woman sat on Bai's pedicab, and they left. At this time a young couple at the back of the line murmured, "Perhaps they want to cheat the woman, and she may be out of luck today." The three pedicab riders overheard the young couple's words, and said, "Do you know who that old man is? Have you heard about Bai Fangli? Bai contributed more than you have earned..." They lectured the young couple for about two hours. The young couple was embarrassed and apologized.

In 1998, Ma Zhuang, whom Bai supported via the Bai Fangli's Love Scholarship, said, "When I was a sophomore in the high school, my father got laid off, and my mother was ill. Our family had only 700 RMB income, and our expenses included my mother's medical bills." During this difficult time, Grandpa Bai reached him with his benevolent hands. When Ma showed his admission letter from Nan Kai University to Bai, Bai smiled happily. However, he cried on Bai's shoulder. Ma recalled, "Without Grandpa Bai's help, I probably would have discontinued my study. Grandpa Bai influenced me tremendously. Now, I would like to help others as Grandpa Bai helped me."

Zhang, a pedicab rider who did not know that Bai's deeds went to support needy students, stabbed Bai's tires. After he discovered that Bai's deeds supported education, he

showed respect to Bai and confessed what he had done to him. Lei Fengyu, a reporter at *Tonight Evening News*, saw Zhang visiting Bai at the hospital. He held Bai's hands and said to him, "Grandpa Bai, I pulled your pedicab's air valve core out. Do you still remember me?" Bai shook his head, and his old face was expressionless.

Zhang told Lei about Grandpa Bai's hardship and his encountered misunderstandings:

Zhang met Bai when he was engaged in the passenger transport of pedicab at Tianjin railway station 16 years ago. Other pedicab riders were making money to feed their families. However, Bai contributed all his pedicab earnings to philanthropy. He also gave discounted price to some passengers. Other pedicab riders were not happy with that. They stabbed his tires, and broke his little red flag on his pedicab. (Lei, 2004)

Zhang recalled that he blew Bai's tire off when Bai was present. Bai was not angry, and he smiled as he inflated his pedicab's tires. Bai's clemency made Zhang feel ashamed. He told the story to other pedicab riders. They all said, "Bai is an extraordinary old man, and we should not make things difficult for him." Confucius said that a benevolent person has no enemies (*Analects*). Bai showed his benevolence to other pedicab riders, and they were moved by him and no longer considered him as an enemy.

According to a 2007 report from Tianjin TV Station, the influence of Bai Fangli's virtue of benevolence and great love [*ren ai*] cannot be measured accurately by statistical data. However, a survey of 17 people who were supported by Bai Fangli showed the following results: Among 17 people, 100% made contributions to philanthropy; 80% supported other impoverished students and the families with difficulties; and 60%

worked as volunteers for the Chinese society. Therefore, Bai Fangli's virtue of benevolence and great love [*ren ai*] influenced and transferred to others.

Li Jialun, a wedding photographer, changed his profession to be a film producer because of his admiration of Bai Fangli. "My aspiration was to show Grandpa Bai's deeds on the silver screen," Li said. When Bai was alive, Li contacted him several times. He was moved by Bai's virtues. So, he decided to make a movie for Bai Fangli. Li said:

The investment of a movie was quite a lot. In order to make a movie for Bai Fangli, I sold my house and car, and my family of three had to move into the office of my company. Afterwards, when I found out that the fund for making a movie was still not enough, I sold my advertising company, and my family of three had to rent a place.

Chu Xingyuan, a composer who learned how to use the Internet in December 2007, read Bai's deeds and watched online videoclips pertaining to Bai. He was moved to tears. Aged and ill, Chu used his trembling hands writing notes to eulogize Bai Fangli and his great love in the world. An impressive music titled *Tell* was born. When Li Jialun found *Tell* on the Internet, he asked Chu if Chu would allow him to use the music as the film's *Bai Fangli's* theme song. Chu told Li, "I will let you use it for free. I will not ask a penny for the copyright. I will support you in making Bai Fangli's movie."

In September 2008, after the anniversary of three years of Bai Fangli's death, the film *Bai Fangli* was shown at Yaohua High School in Tianjin and Bai Jia Village Elementary School. This movie will also be shown in 150 colleges, high schools, and middle schools in the upcoming five years throughout China. To Chinese students, this movie provides teaching material on the movie screen for moral education.



In order to carry on Bai's spirit of benevolence and great love [*ren ai*], people in Bai Jia Village made donations and raised RMB 300,000 to move and rebuild the Bai Jia Village Elementary School. As a result of this money, they built a roomy and comfortable school for their children. Furthermore, the teachers at the school raised an additional RMB 20,000 themselves to quickly build the first private multimedia classroom in the whole county. The teaching environment of the school became one of the best in China. The Bai Jia Village Elementary School is a model school for China.

Bai Fangli made contributions in a total of RMB 6,500 to the Bai Jia Village Elementary School. The school maintains Bai's contributions at its village's bank as The Bai Fangli Education Fund. The annual interest distribution rewards students of good character and scholarship. In November 2008, the film *Bai Fangli* was shown in Bai Jia Village. From that day on, the Bai Jia Village Elementary School was officially renamed the Bai Fangli Elementary School.

Bai Xiqian, the principal of Bai Fangli Elementary School, remarked on the importance of Bai in the minds of Cangzhou's people. He said when people realize that they are from the Bai Fangli Elementary School, they take the initiative to help the teachers and students with their difficulties. When the merchants recognize the name of Bai Fangli, they offer the school discounted prices. Some of them even give merchandise as donations.

Bai Xiqian proposed to do a sacred thing and build the Bai Fangli Memorial near the Bai Fangli Elementary School. When Bai Xiqian proposed his idea, it was approved by his hometown people. Many volunteered to be organizers and fund-raisers for the Bai Fangli Memorial. Bai Xiqian was very confident, and said:

When the Bai Fangli Memorial project is completed, I am sure that it will become a tourist attraction, a sacred place for benevolent education, which will attract people seeking a pilgrimage. When human beings become corrupt, people are eager for the appearance of a Saint. Also, people are eager to use the Saint's virtues to cleanse their souls. I believe that Bai Fangli is our Saint who can cleanse and purify the soul of the Chinese. But myself, as an admirer of Bai Fangli, my future work and life will also be closely connected with the name of Bai Fangli.

*Bai's Positive Influence on the Chinese Society*

On December 29, 2002, Li Li, the Vice President of China Foundation for Poverty Alleviation participated in a TV program to support impoverished college students. He invited Bai Fangli and Bai Guofu to China Central TV (CCTV) Studio as guests. In the golden period of the evening from 8:05 to 8:55, national audiences saw Bai Fangli on TV. Bai was quite weak. However, when Li Li put the Nationwide College's school badge on Bai's jacket, Bai stood up excitedly with tears. His benevolence and great love [*ren ai*] to those students in need of support lightened and moved audiences throughout China via this TV live broadcast.

Nearly 40 million people watched the program that evening. Telephones rang at both CCTV and the China Foundation for Poverty Alleviation five minutes after the program started until three hours after the program was over. Many people cried when they made phone calls. Li Li said, "First I heard people were sobbing." Bai Guofu said, "Dad, audiences were moved by you. Are you content?" Bai answered, "I am not content enough. I will pedal my pedicab to support education after I get better."

When Haier Group, one of the famous home electric manufacturers in China learned about Bai's deeds, they voluntarily sent a refrigerator to Bai's house. Bai Jinfeng recalled that they were very happy because they needed a refrigerator at that time. Bai lived on the fifth floor. Haier Group sent four people to deliver this refrigerator. When Bai came home, he said to them, "I do not need the refrigerator, and please take it back." People at the Haier Group said, "Grandpa Bai, you made a lot of contributions to the Chinese society, and we should show respect to you." Bai insisted on not accepting the refrigerator. So, Haier Group had to take it back. Bai Jinfeng said to her father, "Dad, if we have a refrigerator, you do not need to eat sour food. Why don't you accept the refrigerator?" Bai said, "Such a big refrigerator, how much does it cost for the electricity?" Bai Jinfeng suddenly realized that her father was concerned with the cost of the electricity taking away from money that could be used to support students in need.

#### *Bai's Referent Power*

When Bai was ill, people collected donations to help him pay medical bills to show their love to him. This was an example of the referent power that people gave Bai. In April 2004, Bai was hospitalized due to malnutrition and poor health. He was broke, and his children were unable to pay the medical bills. *The Tonight Evening News* reported Bai's dilemma and called on the whole nation:

Bai made great contributions to the Chinese society. His great and selfless moral quality awaked countless people's social conscience and the heart of benevolence and great love [*ren ai*]. Now it is the time to return our love to this great old man.

When the media reported Bai's illness to the Chinese society, the Chinese society responded overwhelmingly. Citizens and students visited Bai at the hospital in an endless

stream. Tonight Evening News, the government of Hebei District of Tianjin, and Tianjin Red Cross together sponsored an activity, which translates as Contribute Your Love to Bai Fangli. The entire Chinese society enthusiastically responded to the activity. People sent contributions and love to Grandpa Bai. For this reason, Tianjin Red Cross established a fund that translates as Bai Fangli Special Medical Treatment Foundation. This foundation received contributions in a total amount of RMB 114,948.55.

On the afternoon of May 13, 2005, Bai Fangli had difficulty breathing and a stuffy chest. He was sent to the Tianjin No. 3 Hospital immediately. The doctor at the hospital and other medical experts initially diagnosed Bai as suffering from lung cancer. When the students who Bai supported heard about his physical condition, they visited him at the hospital. Bai looked at them in tears, and said, “When I get better, I will pedal again to support you.” Then he signed, “How come I am not getting better?”

On July 6, 2005, Bai left the hospital and went home to rest. The nurse took him to the Tianjin Science and Technology Museum. Bai lay on the stretcher and visited the Bai Fangli’s Deeds to Support Education Exhibit. When the nurse pushed Bai’s stretcher by his pedicab, his eyes suddenly turned bright, and it was difficult for him to raise his hand. He touched his old pedicab, a companion for 60 years. He also touched the little red flag hanging in front of his pedicab, and his eyes dripped with tears.... However, Bai was unable to realize his dream.

Bai Fangli passed away on September 23, 2005 at 8:10 in the morning. When the students, citizens, and officials heard about Bai’s death, they visited to show their respect and condolences. This was yet another example of the influence that Bai had on people. The crowds’ sobbing could be heard everywhere from the mourning hall to the streets.

The wreaths and flower baskets converged into an ocean of flowers. Many people could not enter into Bai's house because his house was quite small, and too many people came to grieve. An old man about 80 years old with tears in front of Bai's portrait said, "Elder brother, you gained face for our generation. We are not as good as you." The words that reflected what many citizens said most were thank you Grandpa Bai on behalf of all the children.

The staff at the Section of Funeral and Interment carried Bai's remains to send it to the Tianjin No. 3 Hospital. Citizens came to see Bai off; tears held in their eyes. They looked on as the hearse drove away. Many people volunteered to make preparations for Bai's funeral. The officials of the Section of Funeral and Interment of Tianjin Civil and Administration Bureau used flowers and Bai's huge photo to decorate the auditorium for his memorial service. Public buses offered free rides for citizens to attend Bai's memorial ceremony. Bai's portrait, decorated with flowers, was hung in the front of the public buses. Many old employees said when their bus drove by the Tianjin railway station east, they saw Grandpa Bai's busy silhouette. That day, public bus employees brought their intentions, brought people who were moved by him, and accompanied him on his last journey. Chen Zhaoxiang, a taxi driver said, "I have contacted a few taxi drivers, and we will send citizens to Bai's memorial ceremony for free. We would like to do our best for Bai Fangli, our old-friend."

On the morning of September 24, 2005, Zhang Zhongkang, an old man over 70 years old from Qing County, Cangzhou City, Hebei Province, came to the funeral parlor. When Zhang entered the room, he fell on his knees. He faced Bai's portrait and did the highest level of the ritual propriety for the funeral. Such a classical ritual propriety was

hard to find in today's funerals.

Bai's remains were kept in the Tianjin No. 3 Hospital. Before his hearse was to leave, the crowds had already swarmed both sides of the street to see Bai off. When the hearse came out, the crowds were almost out of control. Many citizens embraced the hearse, and they tried to have the last look of Bai. The hearse took approximately half an hour to leave the hospital. A nearby resident told the reporter that he had not seen this many people congregate for an ordinary person's funeral for years. However, the majority of people whom Bai had never met before attended his funeral. Bai's reputation, respect, and referent power increased after his death because people were moved by his example—his examples of a Confucian moral leader. Thus, people wanted to return love to him.

The route that Bai's hearse traveled was arranged by the officials of the Section of Funeral and Interment. According to the regular route, his hearse should directly head for the funeral parlor. However, Bai's hearse was allowed to make a big circle in the city, starting from the hospital, then switching to Bai's home, and slowly driving along the route, where Bai pedaled his pedicab to support education for so many years.

In the Chinese culture, the traditional funereal procession is characterized by piping and drumming, and burning paper and spreading paper money. Bai's funereal procession was different from the traditional one. It was focused on spreading colorful leaves instead of spreading paper money. Bai's children, friends, students, and citizens spread the multicolored leaves at various designated places, such as in front of Bai's house and at the doorways of the hospital and funeral parlor. The colorful leaves were dropped in front of Bai's portrait and on people's heads and their bodies. The flowers

symbolized Bai's noble-minded sentiment and his selfless feelings. Bai Guofu said, "Spreading colorful leaves were the most exquisite thing for my father's funeral affairs."

Thousands of people attended Bai's funeral. Mourners for Bai Fangli included those who stood quietly on the street and those who cried and gasped in admiration. This was a baptism of sorts, as the traditional Confucian virtues were revived in the Chinese mind. Nevertheless, the mixture of both the funeral and the baptism was Bai Fangli, an ordinary man who had never attended school and pedaled his pedicab to support needy students and education for 14 years.

### *Bai's International Influence*

Tianjin Red Cross received the first donation for the Bai Fangli's Love Scholarship from York University in Great Britain. The remitter was Gu Lei, a student studying abroad. Gu wrote in a letter, "I am trying hard to let my British friends know about Bai Fangli. We will collect more donations for the scholarship."

When she returned to Tianjin to visit her family for winter vacation, Gu learned that Bai used his pedicab earnings to help 300 students in need of support. After she went back to Great Britain, Gu and her classmates formed an organization, which translates as the Campus Charity Volunteers Organization. They volunteered to help others after school. They also collected donations for the Bai Fangli's Love Scholarship. Gu Lei said, "Grandpa Bai is China's pride. His deeds not only moved Chinese, but British friends as well."

Lei Fengyu, a reporter from *The Tonight Evening News* said that to the best of his knowledge, Bai Fangli's influence spread from China to abroad. When the Chairman of the Association of Engineers at San Jose, California, traveled to Tianjin to visit his family,

Bai's deeds deeply moved him. When he returned to the United States, he organized a large fund-raising activity to collect donations to support impoverished children in China. He has supported more than 20 students at Ji County, Tianjin. In addition, he has supported hundreds of impoverished students in the Western part of China. Many foreigners, led by him, made contributions to children in need of support in Western China.

*The Material and Spiritual Asset-The Pedicab*

In 1944, The World Anti-Fascism War was in its last stage. The Japanese invaders were involved in the last period of their occupation in China. They grabbed the Chinese to help them dig a trench and construct fortifications. Bai was not willing to work for the Japanese, so he fled his hometown to Tianjin, and became a pedicab rider. From then on, his life and dreams all relied on that pedicab. From stepping on the pedicab when he was 31 to the time when he was no longer able to ride it at the age of 90, he pedaled it for nearly 60 years. The pedicab became a part of Bai's body.

Xu Xiuqin recalled, "There is no place to put my father-in-law's pedicab. So, we had to put it downstairs." The principal of 78 Middle School came to visit Bai and said:

Our school would like to keep Bai's pedicab, if possible. We often teach students about Bai's deeds, and need it as a practical teaching aid. We will put it in a special display room and will clean it on a regular basis.

Bai agreed. He took out a small copper bell that he had removed from the pedicab, and gave it to the principal. Bai bought it from a second hand market a long time ago. The dulcet ring accompanied him a great part of his life. The principal said, "I will not throw



the bell away, and will keep it in a safe box.” Hence, Bai’s pedicab left him and became the practical teaching aide for moral education in 78 Middle School.

As a symbol of lofty virtues, Bai Fangli’s pedicab was on a touring show again in China. Li Li, the Vice President of China Poverty Alleviation Foundation said when his foundation sponsored an opening ceremony for “扶贫中国行,” which translates as Tour in China for Poverty Alleviation at the Great Hall of People in Beijing, people suggested finding a mascot. Li first thought of Bai Fangli’s pedicab. He immediately came to Tianjin, and Bai Fangli’s descendants and Tianjin 78 Middle School consented to give the pedicab to Li’s foundation. When the pedicab left Tianjin 78 Middle School, thousands of people saw it off. Li recalled:

When Bai’s descendants gave the pedicab to us, they cried. Many people were present, and they all cried. On our way to Beijing, we saw more than ten thousand people run with the pedicab, and they did not want to leave. We were moved by the scene. In the people’s eyes, Bai’s pedicab became a holy thing.

On January 10, 2006, Bai’s pedicab was pushed into the Great Hall of People in Beijing. The Interactive Charitable Night of China Tour for Poverty Alleviation was jointly sponsored by both the China Poverty Alleviation Foundation and the Chinese Central Television. Several auctions including Yaoming’s autographed basketball and Bai Fangli’s pedicab were auctioned in the evening party.

The evening party started at seven thirty. The emcee excitedly told the stories of Bai Fangli, Bai’s kind face with wrinkles were displayed on the big screen. The screen showed many classical pictures of Bai. When the screen flashed every picture of Bai, the applause continued. Subsequently, when Ma Zhuang, whom Bai supported, pushed Bai’s

pedicab gradually onto the stage, many in the audience stood up one after another and gazed at the pedicab, and many were in tears.

The first display auctioned was the pedicab, and its base price was RMB 5,000. Several colleges and enterprises participated in the auction. The Shandong University won the right to display Bai's pedicab for the first year in 2006. Chen Xin, who is in charge of Student Affairs at The Shandong University, said, "Bai Fangli's pedicab became a sign and a symbol of Bai Fangli's spirit. When I see the pedicab, I just feel that Bai Fangli is in front of me." Therefore, he was trying his best to win the right to display Bai's pedicab on behalf of The Shandong University. He hoped that more students and teachers at his university would know Bai Fangli and understand his deeds through displaying Bai's pedicab. He also hoped that Bai's name and his spirit would live on in everyone's mind.

An old man who came to the auction from the rural area of Anhui Province said, "I specially came to see the auction of Bai's pedicab. Thank you for your understanding of Bai's selfless dedication to others and society. I will save money to see him at The Shandong University." He said these words in tears.

Bai Guofu attended the auction for the 1-year right to display the pedicab. When he saw the pedicab, Bai Guofu felt that he saw his father. He hoped that his father's pedicab would travel to every corner in China, and his father's spirit of benevolence and great love [*ren ai*] would carry on in China. All the funds earned from the auction established the New Great Wall Bai Fangli Fund to help college students in need. This pedicab, which accompanied Bai for 60 years, was full of Bai's sweat and toil and entrusted all his expectations and dreams to his family, his country, and his life.

### *Moral Example*

As an example of how others viewed Bai Fangli as a moral leader, Bai won many honors such as the *National Role Model of Support Education* and *National Elite for the Old*. Two months after Bai's death, a monument in Bai's honor titled *The Monument of Bai Fangli's Selfless Dedication* and his bronze statue were completed in Tianjin. As a result of this national attention, Bai became many people's moral example.

### *Bai's Honors*

Bai did not desire any awards and medals before his death. His children collected his medals carefully. The following was an incomplete record of Bai's honors provided by Bai's son, Bai Guofu:

National Role Model of Support Education, National Elite for the Old, Civilized Small Business of the City of Tianjin, National Moral Example of Workers and Professionals, National Role Model of Respect Teachers and Support Education, The Dedicatory Prize of China Poverty Alleviation Award, The Title of Benevolent Old Man of Tianjin, National Role Model of Working Committee of Concerning the Next Generation, Role Model of the Individual Worker of the City of Tianjin, Hardworking Role Model of the City of Tianjin, Role Model of the Established Activity of Spiritual Civilization of the City of Tianjin, and The First of the Internet Media of China.

One year after Bai's death, The Second China Poverty Alleviation Award sponsored by the China Poverty Alleviation Foundation presented the dedicatory prize to Bai Fangli, a respectful old man. Bai's benevolence and great love [*ren ai*] moved people in China. Bai was rewarded at *The First China Poverty Alleviation Award*. A new medal

added in front of his portrait.

### *Bai's Monument and Statue*

Two months after Bai's death, Bai Fangli's monument titled *The Monument of Bai Fangli's Selfless Dedication* and his bronze statue were completed in Tianjin. Bai's monument was established about 10 meters away from the entrance of Tianjin Cemetery. The area of the cemetery is about 10 square meters. The stone of the monument to Bai Fangli translates as *Black Mongolia*, and it was specifically sent from Inner Mongolia. The stone appears dignified and is meant to reveal Bai's frugality and profound love. Using white ceramic letters to enchase the name of the monument, Bai's name and his date of birth are written on the monument. A photo indicating Bai's diligence and fortitude is photocopied on the monument to recognize his hardwork to support education. Bai's epitaph, written in gold characters, narrates his heroic undertaking, which Bai did his best to support education in his lifetime. Bai's monument and his bronze statue are integrated, and the theme translates as *selfless love*. Bai and his wife's ashes were buried in a grave under the monument.

Liu Xin, a famous sculptor in Tianjin, volunteered to create Bai Fangli's sculpture. He explored substantial materials, and worked tirelessly. Liu felt a strong reverence when he created Bai's sculpture. He said, "Bai's benevolence and great love [*ren ai*] to the society are worth remembering by all the people."

### *The Infinite Power of Moral Example*

Ai Xin, an admirer of Bai Fangli said, "Bai Fangli is always my moral example. I would like to hold Bai's baton to help people in need of support." When Ai Xin saw a reporter from *Metro Express*, Ai immediately gave the reporter his saving's account book

with RMB 5,000, and asked him to set up an account for him, which translates as *Love Account*. Ai withdrew his savings and borrowed money from his relatives, and collected a total of RMB 5,000 to set up the *Love Account*.

With Ai's permission, *Metro Express* sent funding from the *Love Account* to seven impoverished students at Shang He Elementary School at Ji County, Tianjin. Chen Lipeng, the principal at Shang He Elementary School immediately created a special account for these seven impoverished students and a person specially assigned for managing the *Love Account*. During an interview with a reporter from *Metro Express*, Ai repeatedly refused to tell his real name to the reporter. He said that he would like to do things to truly support others as Bai Fangli did. He said to the reporter, "When the *Love Account* is drained, I will earn and keep it full. I will continue the *Love Account* forever."

Gong Yingjie, a disabled person, is also a pedicab driver whose life relies on pedicab earnings like Bai Fangli. Gong once lost his confidence in life due to his disability and impoverished life. After he saw the scene of Bai's funeral, Gong was deeply moved. He said, "Living in this way is great. I know that is how I should live." He decided to take Bai as his moral example, and hung a sign in front of his pedicab. *Yingjie's Ren ai Hotline* was written on the sign. He also put his home phone number on the sign. Accordingly, after Bai Fangli, another pedicab with love was on the street. If an old person gives Gong a call, he will immediately ride his pedicab and take him to requested places.

Having experienced Bai's influence, Chen Zhaoxiang said, "I was surprised that a human being can have a vivid life in this way, and have a vivid death in this way." He

desired to embrace Bai Fangli's luster. Hence, he drove his taxi to help many disabled people in need of support. Since Bai's death, he was rewarded twice as a moral example at Nan Kai District, Tianjin. At the Tomb-sweeping Day this year, he paid a special visit to Bai's cemetery and held a memorial ceremony for Bai Fangli. He noted:

I am only 49 years old this year. I will follow Bai Fangli's footsteps to do good deeds for the people and the society until I cannot move anymore. I will strive for being elected as a moral example each year.

After Qi Xianxiong, a 22-year-old college student from Hua Zhong Normal University, learned about Bai's deeds during the summer vacation, he spent 14 days riding his bicycle to cross over five provinces to go to Bai Jia Village, Bai Fangli's hometown, which is a sacred place in Qi's mind. Ma Yumei, a reporter from Cangzhou Evening News interviewed Qi, who said, "I feel that I am on my way to pilgrimage. My mind has Grandpa Bai's silhouette at all times. I feel that his pedicab accompanies me by my side at all times." When Qi stopped and took a rest, he told the stories of Bai's benevolence and great love [*ren ai*] to strangers. People provided free food and lodging, and volunteered to serve as a road guide for him because they were moved by Bai's deeds and Qi's perseverance. Bai Fangwen, Bai Fangli's 89-year-old younger brother and his sons and grandsons welcomed Qi as a guest. When he left Bai Jia Village, Qi gave his bicycle, which accompanied him for his trip of 2,000 miles, to Bai Xibo, an impoverished student at Bai Fangli Elementary School.

Li Jialun said, "Bai is my moral example. I want to learn from him." Xu Qiming said, "When I learned about Bai's frugality and hardship, I wanted to help him and learn from him." Li Li said, "Bai Fangli is a moral example. We should carry on his virtues of

benevolence and great love.” Sun Yuying added to this sentiment by saying, “As a moral example, Bai encouraged our students to work hard.” Bai Jinfeng noted, “My father is my moral example. I want to learn from him.” As a moral example, Bai influenced many people including his adult descendants, friends, and others.

## Interpretive Biography

### *Epiphany*

Writing and composing a reconstructed biography brings the entire study together (Creswell, 1998; Denzin, 1989a). According to Denzin (1989b), making sense of an individual’s life using a progressive-regressive method whereby the biographer begins with a key event in the subject’s life and then works forward and backward from that event is necessary. Thus, an interpretive biography was reconstructed and based on the key events in Bai’s life; then a progressive-regressive method was applied to find the minor epiphany and representative epiphanies in his life. The following section is a reconstructed interpretive biography of Bai Fangli.

Denzin (1989b) described the key event or the epiphany, as “interactional moments and experiences which leave marks on people’s lives” (p. 70). Denzin further differentiated four types of epiphany: (a) the major event that touches the fabric of a person’s life; (b) the cumulative or representative event that shows eruptions or reactions to experiences that continue for a long period of time; (c) the minor event that signifies a moment in a person’s life; and (d) the relived epiphany that symbolizes reliving the experience. The Major Epiphany, the Minor Epiphany, the First Representative Epiphany, the Second Representative Epiphany, and the Third Representative Epiphany were used in this study. These epiphanies are important because they are interactional moments and

experiences that left marks on Bai's life.

### *Major Epiphany*

In 1987, at the age of 74, Bai planned to retire. From 1944 to 1987, Bai pedaled his pedicab for 43 years. All of his children were married and had their own families. Bai did not need to worry about them anymore. His sister had passed away and, therefore, he did not need to support her anymore. Bai felt that the mission of his life was accomplished, and he could take a rest. Bai said good-bye to his pedicab, and went to Baijia Village, his hometown for a visit. This was the most relaxing time in his life. Bai visited his old friends and relatives and pondered his memories of the past. He even took a special trip to see the crops in the fields. Bai wanted to know what types of crops were in the same fields where he worked in his childhood.

Bai saw a group of children working in the field, and asked, "Why do you not attend school during the day?" They told him that their parents did not allow them to go to school. Bai was angry and said, "How can they do this? Let me talk to your parents." He found and rebuked their parents, "Your children should attend school at the school age. Why not let them?" The parents replied that farmers like them could not afford to let their children attend school. Bai listened and felt heavy-hearted, as if filled with lead. He went to the school and asked the principal, "How much does a child pay tuition to attend school?" The principal forced a smile and said, "RMB 80 or 100 a year. But we have no teachers to teach them." Bai could not understand and asked, "Why are there no teachers?" The principal answered, "Teachers are hard to retain because they are not paid enough." Bai sighed and understood. He remembered that he also left for Tianjin because of poverty. Now, decades later, his hometown was still impoverished.



As soon as he returned to Tianjin, Bai called for a family meeting. In the summer of 1987, Bai held the most important family meeting in his life. His children knew that their father had made a significant decision when they saw Bai's majestic face. Bai told them about his visit to his hometown and announced, "I would like to donate my entire pension of RMB 5,000 to aid education in Baijia Village." Bai's children were surprised; no one had expected their father to make such a decision. Bai Jinfeng said, "But the entire pension is your pedicab earnings for your whole life." Bai stared at her, and said, "You may not provide care when I am aged, but I must help those children in need of support. Whether you agree or not, I have made the decision." When Bai finished his talking, his children immersed themselves in silence. Bai's family maintained the traditional Chinese ritual proprieties [*li*], and as a father, Bai had absolute authority. Bai's children obeyed his decisions.

Next, Bai announced another decision which also surprised his children. He said to his children, "I heard that many children need support in the city. I cannot retire. From now on, I will ride my pedicab to earn money for them." His children did not have the heart to let Bai go back to his labor-intensive work at the age of 74. Bai Guofu said, "We do not object to your donating your entire pension. But you are so old, and have sons and daughters. Why don't you stay home enjoying a relaxing life since you have worked so hard and have not had an easy life until now?" Bai Jinfeng tried to persuade her father, "Absolutely. You are so old and still want to make money. Others may think that we are not filial enough to you." Bai said to them, "If you are filial, you should support me." Bai's children knew that they were unable to persuade their stubborn father. So, they said, "We will let you do it if you feel happy. If you are happy, we are also happy." Bai smiled

and said, “Now you are right.”

Bai Guofu recalled that his father withdrew the entire pension of 5,000 RMB and gave it to the head of the Baijia Village, who did not want to take Bai’s pension, and said, “We will be embarrassed to take your pension. Your pension is your pedicab earnings in your entire life. We cannot take your pension.” Bai went to the principal of Baijia Village Elementary School, and said to him, “I want to use my pension to set up the Bai Fangli Education Fund to pay kids’ tuition.” The principal said, “I cannot take your pension. You have worked so hard and have had a tough life. As your junior friend, I should show filial to you.” Bai tried to persuade them again to take his pension, but he could not convince them to take his earnings.

Bai was upset because he was unable to contribute his pension. He called Bai Guoran for help. Bai Guoran recalled that at this time, his uncle gave him 300 RMB to ask him to treat the head of the Baijia Village and the principal of Baijia Village Elementary School to a dinner, and then asked them to take his pension. Bai Guoran smiled and said:

Uncle, you want to contribute your pension, but they do not want to take your pension. Now, you want me to treat them to a dinner and ask them to take your pension. Such a good person like you is hard to find in this world.

Bai Guoran went to Baijia Village, and told the head of the Bai Jia Village and the principal of Baijia Village Elementary School about his uncle intentions regarding the pension. Both of them were moved and said, “We understand your uncle’s benevolence [ren], and we will accept his pension to set up the *Bai Fangli Education Fund* for students at Baijia Village Elementary School. Bai Guofu said, “My father’s entire

pension is equivalent to 10 years of my salary at that time.” In order to appreciate Bai’s righteous act undertaken for the public good [*yi ju*], the villagers sent a big plaque, which translates as Saint, to Bai’s house.

From then on, Bai pedaled his pedicab once again. Bai’s children again prepared a bottle of water, a towel, and two pieces of steam bread for him before Bai left every morning, as they had done in the past. They watched their father leave at the end of the street every morning. To Bai, everything was so familiar to him, the same old pedicab, the same road, but he had one more thing driving his actions now and that was to support education.

#### *Minor Epiphany*

Bai Guofu recalled that in the beginning, his father only knew that many children in Tianjin were poor, and they had difficulties continuing their schooling. But he did not know how to reach them. On a hot summer day, his father rode his pedicab by Huang Wei Lu Elementary School, and he saw the burning sun on a student through the classroom window. He quickly went home, took out a box of coins, and bought many window coverings. He also paid a professional to install them on the classroom windows. Bai Guofu said, “This was the first contribution that my father made after he pedaled his pedicab again to support education at his age of 74.”

#### *First Representative Epiphany*

In 1994, Bai was 81 years old. One day, he sent to a school 3,000 RMB, which he had collected during the winter. The principal said to him, “I salute you on behalf of 300 impoverished students in our school.” When Bai heard the principal’s words, he suddenly felt heavy-hearted. Bai said to himself, “Three hundred students need support in

the school. How many children need support nowadays? How many students can I support just by pedaling my pedicab?”

Bai pondered on this the entire night. The next morning he knocked at his daughter’s door and called for a family meeting. Bai said to his children, “I am planning to sell two old houses in my hometown and make a loan to establish a company to support education. The company will be called the Bai Fangli Support Education Company. Bai’s children looked at each other, and they knew that nobody could change their father’s decision. Bai Guofu said, “Dad, I support you if you feel comfortable.” Bai Jinfeng said, “I am just worried about your health.” Bai said, “Your support is more meaningful than buying me some malt milk.”

Bai sold his two old houses, his exclusive house properties for only 20,000 RMB because he was in a hurry to sell them. After selling his real estate, Bai’s only personal remaining asset was his pedicab. The Mayor of Tianjin was moved by Bai’s righteous act undertaken for the public good [*yi ju*]. He allocated a small area, which was adjacent to the Tianjin railway station, to Bai’s business. Then, Bai built a sales booth himself in an area of 10 square meters. Hence, the Bai Fangli Support Education Company, the first and only support education company in China, was established. Bai Fangli became the Chief Executive Officer (CEO) of his company. On the opening day, Bai said to his employees:

Our company’s earnings do not belong to Bai, but belong to education. Therefore, we must contribute our company’s profits to education, except for your wages. The company will strike a balance once each month. The profits will be sent to these students in need of support each month.

Bai's words showed his virtue of righteousness [yi].

The Bai Fangli Support Education Company was only a small sales booth in an area of 10 square meters. Nankai University gave a plague to Bai that was hung on the sales booth. The main business for the company was to sell cakes, tea, cigarettes, candies, and supplies for tourists. The company's business was prosperous because it was close to the Tianjin railway station. Bai Guofu said that in the best times the company's monthly profits were about RMB 10,000 after employees' salaries, costs, and taxes. The profits were sent to these impoverished students of various schools each month. More than 20 employees received their wages on schedule. However, as the CEO of the company, Bai did not take a penny. Bai's actions showed his virtue of righteousness [yi].

After the Bai Fangli Support Education Company was established, Bai sent considerable amounts of contributions to colleges, high schools, middle schools, and elementary schools in Tianjin. In fact these contributions were his company's profits after taxes. Liu Weizhen, a teacher at the Department of Student Affairs at Nankai University, recalled that Bai Fangli contributed 1,000 RMB to Nankai University each month from the beginning of 1996, in a total of 34,000 RMB. He supported more than 200 impoverished students at Nankai University. Furthermore, Bai sent different amounts of contributions to Tianjin University and Tianjin Normal University.

### *Second Representative Epiphany*

In 1999, Bai was 86 years old. Just when his company's business was prosperous, the City Government of Tianjin decided to renovate the area of the Tianjin railway station. Sales booths had to be removed. Bai said, "I have to obey the government's decision." Bai thought that the government represents the country. As a patriot, his concept of

righteousness [yi] was to work for the best interests of the country.

Bai was the first one to remove his company. Bai said to himself, “I am getting older and older. If I have no more strength to pedal my pedicab, what options do I have to support those impoverished students afterwards?” Bai sold his company’s assets in a total of 20,000, and sent it to several schools. As a result, Bai Fangli Support Education Company, the only company for support education in China, was closed.

Yang Junyu, Bai’s old friend, recalled that one day when he was near the Tianjin railway station, he heard a voice from the back. When he turned, he saw a skinny old man. To Yang, Bai was too skinny to be recognized at a glance. Bai said to Yang, “My company was closed, and I have not eaten for several days. I cannot send money to these students in need of support. I do not want to live anymore.” Bai’s words deeply shocked him. Yang brought Bai to his home and comforted him, saying:

Your support of education is right, and the removal of your company is also right in response to the City of Government of Tianjin. I totally support you. I will find reporters to report your deeds, and let others learn from you. You are a moral example to others and must live to be more than 100 years old.

Bai said to him, “I have to live longer because I have not reached my goal this year.” He left Yang’s house and pedaled his pedicab to the Tianjin railway station.

Bai’s children wanted to bring him back home when they knew that Bai’s company was closed. Bai Jinfeng said to her father, “Dad, your company was closed. You have not been home for several years. Now, you should come back home.” Bai was still stubborn and said, “Don’t worry about me. I have found a new place to stay.” Bai pointed to an alley by the railway station. His children saw a small shack, which was

supported by a plastic mesh bag and four wooden poles. When they looked inside, they saw the only quilt was soaked in the rain. They all cried. Bai Guofu said, “Dad, we know that it is hard to persuade you. We are sad as your children. We cannot eat well and sleep well because we know that you do not sleep well or eat well.” Bai said that his goal had not been reached yet this year, and he could not go home. Bai was a trustworthy person because he kept his word to support education.

### *Third Representative Epiphany*

In 2000, Bai Fangli was 87 years old. Bai Jinfeng recalled, “My father fell from the pedicab and hurt his arm. He endured the pain to continue riding his pedicab.” Several days later, Bai Jinfeng visited him, and she saw his arm had turned red. Her father was in pain. She brought him to the hospital. The doctor said that Bai’s arm was fractured. Bai’s arm was no longer functioning due to the delay for treatment and his aged bones. He was unable to pedal his pedicab again. Hence, his pedicab, a loyal companion with Bai for 60 years was retired.

Bai was unwilling to give up, and he subsequently found a new means of subsistence: Helping people look after bicycles. Bai crouched in the bicycle shed by the railway station. He ceaselessly looked after bicycles coming and going day and night. Bai used a lunch box to collect all the coins from his income. At that time, Bai’s physical power and vision declined considerably. Bai could not read coins in the lunch box. In the end, he asked transient elementary school students to help count the coins.

Bai waited until his lunch box was finally filled with 500 RMB. On a snowy day, he pedaled his pedicab to Tianjin Yaohua Middle School to make contributions. The students and teachers saw that Bai’s hair and moustache were covered with snow, and his

clothes were wet. Bai gave his lunch box filled with 500 RMB to the teacher and said sadly, "I am not able to pedal my pedicab. This is my last contribution to give to your school's impoverished students." The teachers and students cried.

At the end of 2000, Bai Jinfeng picked her father up at his small shack by the Tianjin railway station. Bai Fangli was willing to go home this time. In Bai Jinfeng's memory, her father was always a valiant image. When she looked at her father's weak appearance, Bai Jinfeng knew that he had used his last strength. Therefore, Bai's lifetime hard work in his lifetime was over.

### Summary

Denzin's (1989a) data analysis procedures were utilized for this interpretive biographical study. Incorporating Denzin's five procedures for the data analysis in an interpretive biography, this study applied three phases of data analysis: (a) document analysis, (b) interview analysis, and (c) combined analysis of the documents and interviews.

Data from documents were gathered from online newspaper articles, photographs, and audiovisual materials. Documents from online newspaper articles were analyzed using Altheide's (1996) 12 steps as a process involving five stages of qualitative document analysis. Documents from photographs and videoclips were analyzed using Collier and Collier's (1986) principles of critical analysis of visual documents. Four themes and seven sub virtue themes emerged from analyzing 91 newspaper articles, 43 photographs, and 8 videoclips.

Interview data were gathered during unstructured and open-ended interviews with Bai Fangli's son, daughters, friends, and others. A Windows Live Messenger with



webcam was set up to conduct these interviews. Telephone interviews were conducted if the participants did not have the Internet connections at their sites. Interviews were analyzed using Creswell's (2009) six steps as a process of qualitative interview analysis. Combined themes in this study emerged from documents and interview analysis. The four themes and seven sub virtue themes emerged from the analysis of all data sources.

The lens of Confucian virtues was articulated based upon seven sub virtue themes. Bai Fangli's interpretive biography was then reconstructed, and the major themes that shaped his life were identified. This led to the writing of an analytic abstraction of the case that underlines (a) the structural processes in Bai Fangli's life, (b) the different theories that relate to these life experiences, and (c) the unique and general features of his life.

In the next chapter, Chapter Five, the findings from this study are articulated. Chapter Five includes the findings from the document, interview, and combined analyses. The findings were examined to answer the central question that guided this study: What is the essence of the life and leadership of Bai Fangli as explored through the lens of Confucian virtues?

## CHAPTER FIVE: CONCLUSIONS, FINDINGS, AND IMPLICATIONS

### Introduction

Denzin's (1989a) process of interpretive biographical data analysis was applied to the data in order to answer the central and sub-questions of this study. As a result of this analysis, an exploration of Bai Fangli's life through childhood, middle age, and senior life was conducted in order to develop a chronology of his life. This chronology assisted in identifying emerging stories and epiphanies from Bai's life. Data were collected through interviews with Bai Fangli's son, daughters, and friends. Bai Fangli's son and daughters were asked to expand on various sections of the stories and to describe Bai Fangli's life and leadership through the lens of Confucian virtues such as benevolence [*ren*] and righteousness [*yi*]. Subsequently, narrative segments and themes within the interview-story were isolated, and larger patterns and meanings were determined. Bai Fangli's biography was reconstructed, and the major themes that had shaped his life identified. This led to the writing of an analytic abstraction of the case that underlines (a) the structural processes in Bai Fangli's life, (b) the different kinds of theories that relate to these life experiences, and (c) the unique and general features of his life. Finally, this data were used to answer this study's central and sub-questions.

### Summation of the Central Question and Sub-questions

This interpretive biographical study was guided by the following central question: What is the essence of the life and leadership of Bai Fangli as explored through the lens of Confucian virtues? In order to better understand the central question, five sub-questions were designed to help answer the central question. Interview questions were then developed that addressed each sub-question. The data gathered during unstructured

and open-ended interviews were analyzed with the five sub-questions as a guide. An overview of the data relative to the five sub-questions follows which inform the answer to the central question.

*Sub-question One: How Did Bai Fangli Blend his Life and Leadership?*

Bai Fangli's leadership came from his life. He was an ordinary man who did not have positional power and was not a scholar. He relied on his behavior and actions to move and influence others. Bai Fangli could be considered a moral leader. According to Sergiovanni (1992, 2009), the concept of moral leadership carries dual implications: (a) the leader must motivate their followers to have a sense of righteousness, obligation, and goodness for action and work, and (b) the leader must possess his moral qualities such as righteousness, obligation, and goodness.

Using Sergiovanni's criteria, Bai Fangli was a moral leader because he motivated people who followed his ways to have a sense of righteousness, obligation, and goodness for action and work. Also, Bai Fangli possessed the moral qualities such as benevolence [*ren*] and righteousness [*yi*]. For example, Bai Jinfeng donated RMB 200 to the earthquake victims because of her memory of her father as a selfless person contributing his love to his country and people. Moved by Bai's virtues of benevolence and great love [*ren ai*], Li Jialun voluntarily sold his house to make a movie about Bai Fangli. Furthermore, Bai led as a moral example, and as a result, many people become his followers.

Burns (1978), Bass (1985a), and Howell and Avolio (1992) among others, have scrutinized the moral component of transformational leadership. Burns (1978) believed that transformational leaders engage with their followers and lift them to higher levels of

motivation and morality. Bass (1998a) supported Burns (1978) view on the moral dimension of transformational leadership and indicated that the authentic transformational leadership must be grounded in moral foundations and that transformational leaders “set examples to be emulated by their followers” (Bass and Steidlmeier, 1999, p. 182). Li Jialun said: “Bai is my moral example. I want to learn from him.” Xu Qiming said: “When I learned about Bai’s frugality and hardship, I wanted to help him, and learn from him.” Li Li said: “Bai Fangli is a moral example. We should carry on his virtues of benevolence and great love.”

Moreover, Bai’s leadership grew up spontaneously from his life. The Tibetan students whom Bai supported at Hongguang High School wanted to know the life of Bai, such as the place he lived and food he ate. So, they decided to visit Bai. When their teacher brought them to visit Bai in a hot summer, they saw that Bai actually lived in such a small room with an area of three square meters. Bai’s lunch was nothing but steam bread and soy sauce soup. They could not believe that their contributor was such a frugal person. He selflessly contributed his money and love to them. They were moved to tears and decided to learn from Grandpa Bai. Thus, Bai became their moral example. Bai Fangli gained respect and admiration by others because he demonstrated his virtues of benevolence and great love [*ren ai*] through his actions and leadership. To conclude, Bai Fangli’s life itself embodied his leadership.

*Sub-question Two:*

*How Did Bai Fangli’s Leadership Impact the Lives of Other Individuals?*

Bai Fangli’s servant leadership inspired many people who realized that one can help others and make contributions to the country as long as she has love in her heart.

Crom (1998) stressed that servant leaders care for others by acting as servants. For the servant leader, love is unconditional (Russel & Stone, 2002). For example, Gong Yingjie, a disabled person and pedicab rider, lost his confidence in life once due to his disability and impoverished life. He was deeply moved after he saw the scene of Bai's funeral. He said, "Living in this way is great. I know that is how I should live." He took Bai as his moral example and showed his love to the elders in need of support.

In addition, Bai was altruistic because he selflessly contributed his entire pension of RMB 5,000 to support education in his hometown. Bai did not leave any material assets for his family, and his bank account balance was zero at the time of his death. Patterson (2003) defined altruism as helping others for the sake of helping. Eisenberg (1986) explained altruistic behavior as "voluntary behavior that is intended to benefit another and is not motivated by the expectation of external reward" (p. 1). For example, Ai Xin withdrew all his savings and borrowed money from his relatives and collected a total of RMB 5,000 to set up the *Love Account* to support seven impoverished students at Shang He Elementary School at Ji County, Tianjin.

Furthermore, Bai's examples of servant leadership (Greenleaf, 2002) showed that he had a sense of responsibility to serve others. Service defines the core of servant leadership (Greenleaf, 1977; Russell & Stone, 2002). Many writers who study leaders and leadership emphasized that the importance of serving others is one of the essential motivations of leadership (Bennis & Nanus, 1985; Senge, 1985; Synder, Dowd, & Houghton, 1994). According to a 2007 report from Tianjin TV Station, a survey of 17 people supported by Bai Fangli showed these findings: Among 17 people, 100% made contributions to philanthropy; 80% supported other impoverished students and families

with difficulties; and 60% worked as volunteers for the Chinese society. Therefore, Bai's servant leadership motivated others to selflessly contribute their benevolence and great love [*ren ai*] to the country and people.

*Sub-question Three: How Did Bai Fangli's Epiphanies Influence his Actions?*

Bai Fangli encountered several epiphanies in his life: (a) the major epiphany, (b) the minor epiphany, and (c) three representative epiphanies. The major epiphany was that when he visited his hometown at the age of 74, Bai found that many children in his hometown could not attend school due to poverty. He immediately decided to contribute his entire pension of RMB 5,000 to set up the Bai Fangli Education Foundation to award students with good academic achievements whose families were having financial difficulties at Bai Jia Village Elementary School. This event touched the fabric of Bai's life and triggered him to support education throughout his remaining 14 years of life.

The minor epiphany was that when Bai rode his pedicab by Huang Wei Lu Elementary School, he saw the burning sun light on a student through the classroom window on a hot summer day. Bai quickly went home, took out a box of small coins, and bought many window shades. He also paid a professional to install them on all the classroom windows. Bai Guofu said, "This was the first contribution that my father made at the age of 74, after he donated his pension and then began riding his pedicab to fund students in need." The minor epiphany was when Bai recognized a specific need for his earnings from the pedicab. This event signified the moment of Bai's life when he stepped forward to support education.

The first representative epiphany was that Bai sent 3,000 RMB to a school, which he collected during the winter when he was 81 years old. The principal saluted him on

behalf of 300 impoverished students. Bai said, “Three hundred students in need of support in a school. How many children need support nowadays? How many students can I support just by pedaling my pedicab?”

He decided to sell his two old houses in his hometown to establish the Bai Fangli Support Education Company. Hence, the Bai Fangli Support Education Company, the first and only company in China to support education, was established. Bai Fangli became the Chief Executive Officer (CEO) of his company and, therefore, made sure that the profits of the company were sent to those impoverished students of various schools each month. However, as the CEO of the Company, Bai did not take any salary. This showed that Bai, by focusing his efforts and monetary gains, could support more impoverished students to give them equal educational opportunities, as well as realize his ideal of making the country stronger through education.

The second representative epiphany was that Bai’s company was forced to close because the City Government of Tianjin decided to renovate the area surrounding the Tianjin railway station. Bai said, “I am 86 years old now. If I have no more strength to pedal my pedicab, what options do I have to support those impoverished students afterwards?”

Bai sold his company’s assets in a total of 20,000, and sent it to several schools. Bai said to Yang Junyu, his old friend, that his company was closed and he could not send money to those students in need of support. He did not want to live anymore. Yang persuaded him to live longer because his support of education was the right thing to do. Bai’s children tried to persuade him to go home, but he insisted on staying at his small shack in order to continue his focus on helping students in need. This event showed that

Bai was frustrated because his company was closed. However, he still wanted to support education.

The third representative epiphany was that Bai fell from the pedicab and injured his arm. He was no longer able to pedal his pedicab to send money to those impoverished students. Bai was unwilling to give up. He found a new means of subsistence: Looking after people's bicycles. Bai waited until his lunch box was finally filled with 500 RMB. He pedaled his pedicab to Tianjin Yaohua Middle School to make his last contribution. When Bai gave his lunch box filled with 500 RMB to the teacher, the teachers and students cried. This event showed that Bai was so focused on supporting students in need that even when he could no longer pedal his pedicab, he found another way, even in his old age and injury to fund his cause.

At the age of 74, Bai had a new starting point in life. From age 74 till he was no longer pedaling his pedicab, Bai used his last strength for students whom he had never met before, and supporting education. If one compares Bai to a candle, he illuminated his family and children before he was 74 years old. After the age of 74, Bai illuminated society, youth, and the country's hope. He also illuminated benevolence and great love [*ren ai*], the most brilliant human quality, and the traditional Confucian virtues that are hidden by selfish desire.

*Sub-question Four: Where Did Bai Fangli's Influence Come From?*

Bai Fangli's influence came from his dedication to education, his selfless and great love to the people and the country, the traditional Confucian virtues he demonstrated, and his perseverance. Bai's dedication to education represented two aspects. First, he gave financial support to more than 300 impoverished students. Second,



he acted as an example for Chinese moral education. For instance, Bai's pedicab became a teaching symbol for Chinese moral education. In addition, Bai Fangli was selfless and showed his great love to the people and the country. Bai contributed his entire pension of RMB 5,000 to support education in his hometown when he learned that children were unable to go to school. When Bai established his Bai Fangli Support Education Company, he sent all his company's profits to various schools in Tianjin, but he did not take a penny for himself. As she needed money, he refused his daughter's plea to join his company. Upon his death, he did not leave any material assets for his family, and his bank account was zero. Furthermore, through his actions, Bai Fangli demonstrated the traditional Confucian virtues of benevolence and great love [*ren ai*], righteousness [*yi*], rituals [*li*], wisdom [*zhi*], trustworthiness [*xin*], fortitude [*yong*], and frugality [*jian*].

Yang, Junyu, Bai's old friend, recalled that Bai was a benevolent person. In his late years, he relied on sugar to allay his hunger, and still insisted on sending money to those students. Bai was righteous or selfless because he did not allow Bai Jinfeng to work at the Bai Fangli Support Education Company. Bai told her that his company was a company to support education, not his own family. It was for public good, not for private benefits.

Bai maintained good ritual propriety. For example, he showed respect to his elder sister who was a widow since 20 by sending her an allowance each month. In addition, Bai was eager for knowledge and loved people with knowledge. He was wise to tell Bai Guoran that knowledge belonged to him and nobody could take it away from him. Bai was a trustworthy person. In order to keep his promise, Bai borrowed money from his daughter to support needy students. Bai was courageous because he worked for 365 days,

and did not take a day off. He lived in the shack for five years. In the summer, the temperature was about 40 degrees celsius. In the winter, hot water turned into ice cubes immediately. Bai was frugal in his life, including the food he ate, the clothes he wore, the place he lived, and the water in which he washed his face.

The traditional Confucian virtues are gradually being lost in contemporary China. Many Chinese intellectuals and Western scholars recognize that the recent social situation may be the cause for the loss of the Confucian virtues or a moral belief crisis in China (Fan, 2007; Farrer, 2002, Gao, 2001; Ge, 2001; Han, 2005; Hu, 2007; Jing, 1999; Shi, 2006; Tang, 2006; Wei, 2004; Xu, 2000). The traditional virtues that Bai Fangli demonstrated, such as benevolence and great love [*ren ai*], appear to be difficult to find even though they are valued in contemporary China. People treasure the traditional Confucian virtues because they are valuable (Li, 2006; Yu & Lu, 2000).

Moreover, Bai Fangli was perseverant because he consistently pedaled his pedicab to support education for 14 years. The distance that Bai rode his pedicab for 14 years is the equivalent of 18 trips around the earth's equator. Bai was so committed to supporting needy students that he continued to pedal his pedicab regardless of his medical conditions, day in and day out, everyday of the year. Bai did not stop supporting education until he was 88 years old. In conclusion, it is not so difficult to do good deeds or act as a benevolent person every once in a while, but it is hard to do good deeds or act as a benevolent person consistently throughout one's lifetime.

*Sub-question Five: What was Bai Fangli's Belief Structure?*

As a person who embraced the traditional Chinese culture, Bai Fangli's belief structure appeared to be connected with the traditional Confucian virtues. Confucianism

emphasizes that a leader must possess moral qualities such as benevolence [*ren*], righteousness [*yi*], rituals [*li*], wisdom [*zhi*], and trustworthiness [*xin*]. As a moral leader, Bai possessed the traditional Confucian virtues such as benevolence [*ren*], righteousness [*yi*], rituals [*li*], wisdom [*zhi*], trustworthiness [*xin*], fortitude [*yong*], and frugality [*jian*]. In addition, Confucius was the first one who advocated “education without discrimination” (Yang, Peng, & Lee, 2008, p. 32). Bai supported his three children to attend school, and two of them finished college. Bai also supported his nephew to complete the college. Furthermore, Bai financially supported more than 300 impoverished students to attend school. He advocated education and admired people with knowledge. He spent 14 years supporting education.

Furthermore, Confucianism also stresses that one should love her country. Bai’s actions not only showed his benevolence and great love [*ren ai*] to those students in need of his support but also his patriotism. He said to his children, “If children have no education, how will the country be stronger?” Bai Guofu noted, “His father became a person who always put the country first not considering his own family.” In short, Bai’s words and deeds for 14 years showed that his belief structure was closely connected with traditional Confucian virtues.

#### *Central Question Summation*

This interpretive biographical study was guided by the following central question: What is the essence of the life and leadership of Bai Fangli as explored through the lens of Confucian virtues? By considering the answers to the five sub-questions, the answer to the central question is ascertained.

Confucius rode his coach for 14 years traveling to many kingdoms 2,500 years

ago. During these travels, he spread Confucian virtues throughout China. Bai Fangli pedaled his pedicab to support education for 14 years 2,500 years after Confucius' travels. Throughout Bai's travels, he acted from his heart to demonstrate the traditional Confucian virtues, Aristotelian virtues, and the power of these virtues through his actions.

Bai Fangli was not a government official or a philosopher. Thus, he led his followers by his personal source of power such as referent power (French & Raven, 1959) rather than by the more traditional positional power base (Bass, 1960; Etzioni, 1961). Bai Fangli became a respectful moral leader by practicing both the traditional Eastern Confucian virtues, as well as the Western Aristotelian virtues, through his actions in his life and leadership.

Essentially, Bai's actions demonstrated the Confucian virtues of benevolence and great love [*ren ai*], righteousness [*yi*], rituals [*li*], wisdom [*zhi*], trustworthiness [*xin*], fortitude [*yong*], and frugality [*jian*]. Also, he practiced the Aristotelian virtues of prudence, justice, fortitude, and temperance. Bai's abiding belief was connected with the traditional Confucian virtues, as well as Aristotelian virtues.

Bai Fangli stressed the traditional Confucian virtues of benevolence and great love [*ren ai*]. Bai Fangli regretted not having the opportunity to attend school in his life. When he saw children in his hometown who were impoverished and unable to attend school, he was saddened and did not want the tragedy that he experienced to repeat for them. Bai had sympathy for these students and tried his best to support them. Therefore, the virtues of benevolence and great love [*ren ai*] were demonstrated by his unending efforts that changed more than 300 students' lives.

The concept of the Confucian virtue of righteousness [*yi*] is compatible with the

Aristotelian virtue of justice. Bai Fangli stressed righteousness [*yi*] and justice by his actions. When the City Government of Tianjin decided to renovate the area of Tianjin railway station, sales booths had to be removed. Bai obeyed the government's decision, and he was the first one to remove his company. Bai thought that the government represents the country. As a just person, he followed the law to work for the best interests of the country.

Bai Fangli stressed the traditional Confucian virtue of rituals [*li*] by his actions. Bai's family maintains Confucian ritual propriety that is based on the five cardinal relationships (*wu lun*). As a father, Bai showed his absolute authority in his family. His children followed his wishes and showed filial to him. As a husband, Bai's wife was obedient to him. As an elder brother, he took care of his younger brother as well. To her elder sister, he sent an allowance to her each month. To elders, Bai showed his filial piety to them. As the CEO of the Bai Fangli Support Education Company, Bai told his employees that the profits of his company would be sent to those students in need of support.

The concept of the Confucian virtue of wisdom [*zhi*] is compatible with Aristotelian virtue of prudence. Bai said to Bai Guoran, "The family breaking up and living apart may divide your property, but your learned knowledge belongs only to you, and no one can take it away from you." Bai believed knowledge and education are important because they can change the people and the country's fate. Bai Fangli was prudent because he felt that he had a righteous reason to support education and help students in need of financial support. His commitment to continue was based upon his experience of helping needy students. Hence, Bai Fangli was prudent and sensible to

apply his leadership by demonstrating his virtue of wisdom through his actions.

Bai Fangli stressed the traditional Confucian virtue of trustworthiness [*xin*] throughout his daily life. In order to keep his word to the students in need of support, he pedaled his pedicab to obtain earnings until he was no longer able to pedal. In addition, Bai was trustworthy to his nephew. Bai Guoran recalled that his uncle gave him allowance each week. If he was unable to visit his uncle some weekends, Bai delivered allowance to him in person. Furthermore, Bai kept his word because for eight years he continuously sent money to the Tibetan students at Hongguang High School, as promised.

The concept of the Confucian virtue of fortitude [*yong*] is compatible with Aristotelian virtue of fortitude. Bai's actions demonstrated his virtue of fortitude [*yong*]. When Bai Fangli was 13, in order to survive, he was courageous enough to sell salt by sea and to endure the hardships that accompanied that journey. Since the age of 74, Bai had the fortitude to endure a life of physical hardship as he strove to reach his goals. For instance, Bai slept in the shack for five years in order to look after the Bai Fangli Support Education Company.

The concept of the Confucian virtue of frugality is compatible with Aristotle's virtue of temperance. Bai's actions demonstrated the Confucian virtue of frugality [*jian*] and Aristotelian virtue of temperance. Bai demonstrated his frugality in his daily life including the food he ate, the clothes he wore, water he reused, and the place he lived. Bai never bought new clothes and never ate at a restaurant in his life. Bai developed the virtue of temperance and governed his desire for material comfort by reason. In order to support education and those impoverished students, Bai governed his desire for pleasure by reason and dedication.

Bai's actions made others feel that they could help others, and make contributions to the country. He helped others realize that love can make life more meaningful, and one does not need to possess wealth or status to make a positive difference in the life of someone else. He influenced others by selflessly contributing his benevolence and great love [*ren ai*] to support education and those students in need of financial assistance. Throughout his life, Bai's words and actions provided a living example of a moral leader. Bai is a sage who went about his daily business in a virtuous manner, be Confucian and/or Aristotelian.

Confucius was recognized as a sage of culture and Bai Fangli as a sage of philanthropy (*Baidu Forum*, 2009). Confucius influenced the world through his philosophy and values. However, Bai Fangli influenced others through his actions. Bai Fangli was a contemporary sage who positively impacted many people in China by demonstrating Confucian virtues as he practiced as he practiced in his life and eventual leadership.

### Findings

Findings are extremely important because they are the researcher's contributions in the study. One of the findings in this study is that Bai Fangli demonstrated both Eastern and Western virtues through his actions. This study also discovered a new leadership: Ren Leadership. In addition, this study found an example of a moral leader in China who blended both Eastern and Western virtues. Furthermore, this study revealed the feasibility of the return of the traditional Confucian virtues in contemporary China.

This study found that Bai Fangli demonstrated both Eastern and Western virtues through his actions. Bai demonstrated seven Eastern virtues: (a) benevolence and great

love [*ren ai*], (b) righteousness [*yi*], (c) rituals [*li*], wisdom [*zhi*], trustworthiness [*xin*], fortitude [*yong*], and frugality [*jian*]. Bai also demonstrated the four Western virtues of: (a) prudence, (b) justice, (c) fortitude, and (d) temperance. Thus, Bai's actions blended both Eastern and Western virtues.

According to Confucius, being a moral person [*junzi*], the scholar needs to obtain benevolence [*ren*], righteousness [*yi*], rituals [*li*], wisdom [*zhi*], courage [*yong*], and trustworthiness [*xin*] (Lau, 1992). After obtaining these attributes, the superior man [*junzi*] practices leadership by serving as a role model to his or her followers (Fernandez, 2004; Wong, 2001). Similarly, the concept of Sergiovanni's moral leadership carries dual implications: (a) the leader must motivate her followers to have a sense of righteousness, obligation, and goodness for action and work, and (b) the leader must possess her own moral qualities such as righteousness, obligation, and goodness (Wong 1998). Thus, Eastern and Western virtues are not separate as their names imply, but rather are synonymous and compatible. Both Eastern and Western scholars posited that moral leaders must possess their own virtues such as benevolence [*ren*], rituals [*li*], trustworthiness [*xin*], fortitude [*yong*], wisdom [*zhi*] or prudence, frugality [*jian*] or temperance, and righteousness [*yi*] or justice (Fernandez, 2004; Wong, 1998, 2001). Since Bai Fangli blended both Eastern and Western virtues, moral leadership is applicable to both Eastern and Western world views. Therefore, both Eastern and Western moral leadership models are compatible.

This study uncovered a new leadership: Ren Leadership. Ren Leadership contains three examples of dualism: (a) Eastern and Western virtues, (b) leading and following, and (c) Eastern and Western leadership. According to Confucius (*Analects*,



1994), Ren refers to benevolent, love, and it is the virtue of all virtues. Specifically, Ren Leadership blends both Confucian virtues of benevolence and great love [*ren ai*], righteousness [*yi*], rituals [*li*], wisdom [*zhi*], trustworthiness [*xin*], fortitude [*yong*], and frugality [*jian*] and Aristotelian virtues of prudence, justice, fortitude, and temperance. In addition, Bai Fangli essentially embodied those characteristics of leading as noted in transformational leadership and following as articulated in servant leadership. Ren Leadership embraces the following characteristics: (a) the virtue of Ren (b) altruism, (c) unconditional love, (d) humanity, (e) positive impact on society, (f) referent power base, (g) role-modeling, (h) commitment to an inspiring vision, (i) actions of servitude, and (j) spontaneity.

Traditional leadership is based on leaders who have positional power. However, Ren Leadership is a universal leadership. It grew up spontaneously from Bai's life. Bai Fangli had no positional power, no wealth, and really no means. All he had was a just cause that he dedicated his life to helping through his servitude. Not only did he succeed in his goal, but because of the manner in which he went about living his mission, he inspired his country and the people. He gained respect and admiration by others because he showed his virtues of benevolence and great love [*ren ai*] through his actions and leadership. Thus, Bai Fangli never sought leadership in a formal or even informal manner. His power was based within his altruism. He demonstrated virtues and the power of virtues through his actions to influence others.

Bai Fangli had referent power because he demonstrated his virtues of benevolence [*ren*], righteousness [*yi*], rituals [*li*], wisdom [*zhi*], trustworthiness [*xin*], fortitude [*yong*], and frugality [*jian*] through his actions. He demonstrated his virtues and power of virtues

to influence others through his actions. He became a liked, respected, and esteemed leader who obtained referent power to influence his followers.

Bai Fangli was an informal leader because he did not have a formal title or possess formal power, as formal leaders do. Nevertheless, Bai Fangli's influence exceeded most formal leaders' positional influences. He had a moral and inspiring purpose to influence others to be altruistic, act as public servants, and do good deeds for the Chinese society.

Bai Fangli, a modern Chinese leader was discovered around the same time when Chinese government officials and scholars were calling for the return of Confucian virtues due to a moral belief crisis in China. This study found an example of a moral leader in China who blended both Eastern and Western virtues. This study revealed the feasibility of the return of the traditional Confucian virtues in contemporary China.

#### Implications

Findings from this study generated several implications. These implications are divided into two parts: Implications for Leaders, and Implications for Further Studies. The first section depicts implications for those wishing to apply the findings from this study to their current leadership positions.

##### *Implications for Leaders*

Reflecting upon the life and leadership of Bai Fangli, current leaders can examine their motives for leadership and determine if they align with the virtues of Confucian or Aristotle. The researcher believes that a person who obtains the realms of a happy life, wise life, moral life, and an eternal life may become a Ren leader. Bai Fangli was a Ren leader who completed his brilliant life journey by obtaining the realms of a happy life,

wise life, moral life, and, eventually, an eternal life. An eternal life is the pinnacle that one can hope to obtain. Although Bai Fangli's flesh might disappear, his beautiful and unconquerable soul still exists as people remember his actions, dedication, and reputation.

The memory of Bai sets an example to influence others. Bai Fangli completed his magnificent life journey by obtaining this pinnacle in his life. He also made life better for others in the process of his life journey. Therefore, anyone can be a Ren leader and complete her significant life journey. The question is how can she obtain the realms of a happy life, wise life, moral life, and an eternal life and in the process of this journey make life better for others?

Since this study has shown the blending of Confucian and Aristotelian virtues, it may apply to international leaders. International leaders are leaders who deal with employees from different cultures. Ren Leadership, being composed of Eastern and Western virtues, has the potential to transcend the cultural differences among people.

#### *Implications for Further Studies*

During the process of conducting this interpretative biography, several implications for future research emerged. Another study could examine the effect that financial support has on students. What do graduates do that embodies Ren Leadership? One could examine the characteristics of Ren Leadership and its impact on leadership effectiveness. Further studies may test the construct of Ren Leadership. Furthermore, a study may examine Ren Leadership and the alignment of the leader's personal values and organizational values. A study may survey students whom Bai supported to discern their contributions to philanthropy, their support to other needy students and families with difficulties, and their volunteer work for the Chinese society. A further study may

explore Confucian virtues and Aristotelian virtues.

All in all, Bai Fangli practiced the Confucian virtues of benevolence and great love [*ren ai*], righteousness [*yi*], rituals [*li*], wisdom [*zhi*], trustworthiness [*xin*], fortitude [*yong*], and frugality [*jian*]. Also, he practiced the Aristotelian virtues of prudence, justice, fortitude, and temperance. Bai's virtues were demonstrated through his actions in his life and leadership. Both Confucian and Western scholars posited that moral leaders must have their own virtues such as fortitude [*yong*], wisdom [*zhi*] or prudence, frugality [*jian*] or temperance, and righteousness [*yi*] or justice (Fernandez, 2004; Wong, 1998, 2001). Thus, both Eastern and Western forms of moral leaderships are compatible.

Since Bai Fangli blended both Eastern and Western virtues, this study found that moral leadership is applicable to both Eastern and Western world views. This study also found a new leadership: Ren Leadership. Ren Leadership is a universal leadership. According to Confucius, Ren refers to benevolent, love, kindness, and it is the virtue of all virtues.

Ren Leadership grew up naturally from Bai's life. Bai Fangli had no position power, but he helped those impoverished students and others for the pure sake of helping, not concerned with any benefits that might come his way as a result of his actions. He obtained respect and admiration by others because he displayed his virtues of benevolence and great love [*ren ai*] through his actions and leadership. Thus, Ren leaders demonstrate virtues and the power of virtues to influence others to go beyond themselves through their actions. Most importantly, Ren Leadership goes beyond any individual and has a positive impact on society. Everyone may become a leader who influences others, as well as society. Ren Leadership expands the current concept of leadership.

## References

- 爱心接过白芳礼的接力棒：“爱心账户”寄存希望 [Aixin takes Bai Fangli's baton: "Aixin Account" is hopeful]. (2005, October 9). *Metro Express*. Retrieved March 9, 2009, from <http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/10/09/001134821.shtml>
- “八荣八耻”的多种英语译文 [Multiple English translations of "Eight Honors & Eight Disgraces"]. (2006, April 19). *Associated Press*. Retrieved August 28, 2008, from <http://www.yfta.net/view.asp?xxid=623>
- 白芳礼：慈风善雨大爱无言铸就三百栋梁之才 [Bai Fangli: Benevolent and great love and cultivate three hundred students]. *Metro Express*. Retrieved April 21, 2009, from <http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055853.shtml>
- 白芳礼博爱奖学金 20 多天捐款逾 20 万 [Bai Fangli's Love Scholarship collected donations over RMB 200,000 in 20 days]. (2005, December 7). *Tianjin Daily*. Retrieved March 16, 2009, from <http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/12/07/001182253.shtml>
- 白芳礼老人感动了英国朋友 [Bai Fangli, an old man touched British friends]. (2005, November 17). *Tonight Evening News*. Retrieved May 5, 2009, from <http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2004/04/20/000771706.shtml>
- 白芳礼老人患肺癌住院病情稍缓解读者勿探望 [Bai Fangli diagnosed lung cancer to stay at hospital: His condition is getting better but no visits]. (2005, May 14). *Tonight Evening News*. Retrieved April 26, 2009, from <http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/05/15/001023559.shtml>

白芳礼追思会将举行 兴教助学更有来人[Bai Fangli's mourning ceremony will be held:

More people will support needy and poor for education]. (2005). *Tianjin Daily*

*Online*. Retrieved December 30, 2008, from

<http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/09/25/001127060.shtml>

白爷爷，爱我们，别走！ [Grandpa Bai, love us, don't go!]. (2005, September 25).

*Metro Express*. Retrieved April 23, 2009, from

<http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055565.shtml>

白爷爷事迹再次感动中国：三轮车首展权拍了 5 万 [Grandpa Bai's deeds moved

China again: The pedicab's first display right auctioned for 50,000]. (2006,

January 11). *Metro Express*. Retrieved March 25, 2009, from

<http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2006/01/11/001208473.shtml>

白爷爷用笑脸告别爱他的人 [Grandpa Bai said good-bye to people he loves with smile].

(2005, September 26). *Metro Express*. Retrieved April 21, 2009, from

<http://news.sohu.com/20050926/n227062410.shtml>

不法分子制售毒酒朔州 19 人中毒死亡主要犯罪嫌疑人已被公安机关抓获

[Unlawful person made and sold poisonous liquor, 19 people toxicated and

died at Shuozhou and main criminal suspects were caught by the Department of

Public Security]. (1998, February 6). *People's Daily Online*.

<http://www.people.com.cn/9802/06/current/newfiles/d1030.html>

侧记：天津市民自发吊唁白老家中灵堂人流不断 [Side note: Tianjin citizen

volunteered to show condolence to Bai Fangli]. (2005, September 24). *Meirixin*

*Bao*. Retrieved March 12, 2009, from

<http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/09/25/001127055.shtml>

感动白芳礼（天津报道） [Tianjin report: Bai Fangli moved people]. (2007, August 18).

*Tianjin TV Station News Point*. Retrieved April 30, 2009, from

<http://www.baifangli.cn/>

河北省沧州市白芳礼小学简介 [The introduction of Bai Fangli Elementary School].

(2008, November 8). *Bai Fangli Elementary School Website*. Retrieved March 21,

2009, from <http://221.195.33.4:8019/bflxx/Article/ShowArticle.asp?ArticleID=3>

红十字会表示：为老人治病白芳礼专项基金启动 [Red Cross indicated: Bai Fangli

Special Fund activated]. (2005, May 18). *Tonight Evening News*. Retrieved April

19, 2009, from <http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/05/19/001027144.shtml>

胡锦涛：以道德模范为榜样加强社会主义道德建设 [Hu Jintao: Strengthen socialist

moral construction as the exemplars of moral role-models]. (2007). *Xinhua Net*.

Retrieved August 28, 2008, from

[http://news.xinhuanet.com/newscenter/2007-09/18/content\\_6748471.htm](http://news.xinhuanet.com/newscenter/2007-09/18/content_6748471.htm)

来自“感到河北”颁奖现场的报道 [A report from “Moved Hebei” issuing reward

scene]. (2005, December 28). *Yanzhao Dushi Bao*. Retrieved April 26, 2009, from

<http://www.lf.gov.cn/pub/htm/newscenter/waididongtai/hebei/2005-12-28-3958.htm>

邻居们送白爷爷最后一程：明日举行追思会 [Neighbors see Grandpa Bai off at his

last journey: The funeral will conduct tomorrow]. (2005, September 24). *Metro*

*Express*. Retrieved April 15, 2009, from

<http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/09/24/001126822.shtml>

零钱凑的 900 元：白爷爷和藏族学生的真情故事[RMB 900 collected from small changes: True stories of Grandpa Bai and the Tibetan students]. (2005, May 17). *Metro Express*. Retrieved April 19, 2009, from <http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/05/19/001027144.shtml>

男子称扶摔倒老太反被告被判赔 4 万 [A man helped an old woman but was sued to compensate an old woman 40,000 Yuan]. (2007, September 6). *Jingling Evening News*. Retrieved August 28, 2008, from <http://news.163.com/07/0906/05/3NMDBNR600011229.html>

人民日报：崇尚道德模范提升道德水平 [People's Daily editorial: Advocating examples of moral leaders and elevating moral standards]. (2007, September 20). *People's Daily*. Retrieved September 24, 2008, from [http://news.xinhuanet.com/newscenter/2007-09/20/content\\_6757314.htm](http://news.xinhuanet.com/newscenter/2007-09/20/content_6757314.htm)

受助学子，别忘了白爷爷 [Students whom Bai supported: Don't forget Grandpa Bai]. (2004, April 20). *Enorth*. Retrieved March 23, 2009, from <http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2004/04/20/000771411.shtml>

推举白爷爷做中华民族的慈圣，大家同意吗？ [Elect Grandpa Bai as a sage of philanthropy, do you agree]? (2009, January 5). *Baidu Forum*. Retrieved May 18, 2009, from <http://tieba.baidu.com/f?kz=522731371>

我拔过您的气门芯----“白大爷，您能原谅我吗？” [I took your air valve core out: Grandpa Bai, can you forgive me]? (2004, April 20). *ENorth*. Retrieved March 22, 2009, from <http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/09/06/001112159.shtml>



- 无私奉献纪念碑揭幕：白芳礼半身铜像同时落成 [Selfless and dedicatory monument unveiled: Bai Fangli half-length bronze statue was completed simultaneously]. (2005, November 13). *Meirixin Bao*. Retrieved March 28, 2009, from <http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/11/14/001163714.shtml>
- 已故白芳礼老人再获得全国大奖 [Deceased old man Bai Fangli rewarded the national award again]. *Meirixin Bao*. (2006, October 14). Retrieved May 5, 2009, from <http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2004/04/20/000771706.shtml>
- 追忆白芳礼：坎坷一生大爱无言 [Retrospect Bai Fangli: Rough life and great love]. (2005, September 25). Retrieved April 21, 2009, from <http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055847.shtml>
- Adler, N. J. (1983). Cross-cultural management research: The Ostrich and the trend. *Academy of Management Review*, 8(2), 226-232.
- Altheide, D. L. (1996). Qualitative media analysis. *Qualitative Research Methods Series*, 38, Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Antonakis, J., Cianciolo, A., & Sternberg, R. (2004). *The nature of leadership*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Aquinas. (1920). *The Summa Theologica of St. Thomas Aquinas* (Fathers of the English Dominican Province Online Edition, Trans). (2<sup>nd</sup> and revised Ed.). Retrieved March 7, 2009, from <http://www.newadvent.org/summa/>
- Aristotle. (2000). *Nicomachean ethics* (W. D. Ross, Trans). Raleigh, NC: Alex Catalogue.
- Aronson, E. (2001). Integrating leadership styles and ethical perspectives. *Canadian Journal of Administrative Sciences*, 18(4), 244-256.

- Avolio, B. J., & Bass, B. M. (2002). *Developing potential across a full range of leadership cases on transactional and transformational leadership*. Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.
- Avolio, B. J., Waldman, D. A., & Yammarino, F. J. (1991). Leading in the 1990s: The four Is of transformational leadership. *Journal of European Industrial Training*, 15(4), 9-16.
- Babbie, E. (1999). *The basics of social research* (Rev ed.). Belmont, CA: Wadsworth (Original work published 1998).
- Bahm, A. J. (1992). *The heart of Confucius: Interpretations of genuine living and great wisdom*. Berkeley, CA: Asian Humanities Press.
- Bai Guofu: I hope the spirit of my father can pass on forever. (2007, January 25). *China Foundation for Poverty Alleviation*. Retrieved February 11, 2008, from <http://www.fupin.org.cn/en/volunteer/contentxf.asp?newsid=712181435231388>
- Bakken, B. (1991). Modernizing morality? Paradoxes of socialization in China during the 1980s. *East Asian History*, 1991-1992(2), 125-141.
- Bakken, B. (2000). *The exemplary society: Human improvement, social control, and the dangers of modernity in China*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Bao, C. W., & Wang, R. P. (2001, July 7). [Discussing moral exemplary effect on morality of officials]. *Workers Daily*. Retrieved July 20, 2008, from <http://njdj.longhoo.net/dj80/ca51873.htm>
- Bass, B. M. (1960). *Leadership, psychology, and organizational behavior*. New York: Harper.

- Bass, B. M. (1985a). *Leadership and performance beyond expectations*. New York: Free Press.
- Bass, B. M. (1985b). Leadership: Good, better, best. *Organizational Dynamics*, 13(3), 26-40.
- Bass, B. M. (1990). *Bass and Stogdill's handbook of leadership: A survey of theory and research*. New York: Free Press.
- Bass, B. M. (1990a). *Bass and Stogdill's handbook of leadership: Theory, research, and managerial applications* (3<sup>rd</sup> ed.). New York: Free Press.
- Bass, B. M. (1990b). From transactional to transformational leadership: Learning to share the vision. *Organizational Dynamics*, 18(3), 19-31.
- Bass, B. M. (1996). *New paradigm of leadership: An inquiry into transformational leadership*. Alexandria, VA: U.S. Army Research Institute for the Behavioral and Social Sciences.
- Bass, B. M. (1998). *Transformational leadership: Industrial, military, and educational impact*. Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum.
- Bass, B. M. (1998a). The ethics of transformational leadership. In J. Ciulla (Ed.), *Ethics, the heart of leadership* (pp. 169-192). Westport, CT: Praeger.
- Bass, B. M. (2000). The future of leadership in learning organizations. *Journal of Leadership Studies*, 7(3), 18-40.
- Bass, B. M. (2008). *The Bass handbook of leadership: Theory, research, & managerial applications* (4<sup>th</sup> ed.). New York: Free Press.

- Bass, B. M., & Avolio, B. J. (1988). Transformational leadership, Charisma, and beyond. In J. G. Hunt, B. R. Baliga, H. P. Dachler, & C. A. Schriesheim (Eds.), *Emerging leadership vistas*. (pp. 29-49). Lexington, MA: Lexington Books.
- Bass, B. M., & Avolio, B. J. (1993). Transformational leadership: A response to critiques. In M. M. Chemer & R. Ayman (Eds.), *Leadership theory and research: Perspectives and directions* (pp. 49-80). San Diego, CA: Academic Press.
- Bass, B. M., & Avolio, B. J. (1994a). *Improving organizational effectiveness through transformational leadership*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Bass, B. M., & Avolio, B. J. (1994b). Transformational leadership and organizational culture. *International Journal of Public Administration*, *17*(3/4), 541-552.
- Bass, B. M., & Steidlmeier, P. (1999). Ethics, character, and authentic transformational leadership behavior. *Leadership Quarterly*, *10*(2), 181-217.
- Beazley, H., & Beggs, J. (2002). Teaching servant leadership. In L. C. Spears & M. Lawrence (Eds.), *Focus on leadership: Servant leadership for the 21<sup>st</sup> century*. (pp. 53-63). New York: John Wiley & Sons.
- Behling, O., & McFillen, J. M. (1996). A syncretical model of charismatic/transformational leadership. *Group and Organizational Management*, *21*(2), 163-191.
- Bell, V. J. (1975). *Power, influence, and authority*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Bennis, W. G., & Nanus, B. (1985). *Leaders: The strategies for taking charge*. New York: Harper & Row.
- Berthrong, J. H. (1998). *Transformation of the Confucian way*. Boulder, CO: Westview Press.

- Blanchard, K. (2000). Leadership by the book. *Executive Excellence*, 17(3), 4-5.
- Blumberg, A. (1989). *School administration as craft*. Needham Heights, MA: Allyn & Bacon.
- Bond, M. H., & Hwang, K. K. (1986). The social psychology of Chinese people. In M. H. Bond (Ed.), *The psychology of the Chinese people* (pp. 213-267). New York: Oxford University Press.
- Bowman, M. A. (1997). Popular approaches to leadership. In P. G. Northouse (Ed.), *Leadership: Theory and practice*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Braudel, F. (1993). *A history of civilizations*. New York: Penguin Books.
- Bruner, J. (1973). *Beyond the information given: Studies in the psychology of knowing*. New York: W. W. Norton.
- Bryman, A. (1992). *Charisma and leadership in organizations*. London: Sage.
- Burns, J. M. (1978). *Leadership* (1<sup>st</sup> ed.). New York, NY: Harper & Row.
- Burns, J. M. (1998). Foreword. In J. B. Ciulla (Ed.), *Ethics, the heart of leadership* (pp. ix-xii). Westport, CT: Quorum.
- Calabrese, R. J. (2002). *The leadership assignment: Creating change*. Boston, MA: Allyn & Bacon.
- Camilleri, J. A. (2007, October). A path to conflict transformation. *Interreligious insight*, 5(4), 8-17.
- Cang, X. (1987). A cross-cultural study on the leadership behavior of Chinese and Japanese executives. *Asia Pacific Journal of Management*, 4, 203-209.

- Carter, M. J. (2001). Relational leadership: The role of the informal leader in the context of turbulent change. *Dissertation Abstracts International*, 62 (04), 1492 A. (UMI No. 3012619)
- Chan, W. T. (1963). *A source book in Chinese philosophy*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- Chan, W. T. (1963). The Doctrine of the Mean. In W. T. Chan (ed.), *A source book in Chinese philosophy* (pp. 97-114). Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- Chao, Y. T. (1990). Culture and work organization: The Chinese case. *International Journal of Psychology*, 25, 583-592.
- Chau, D. M. (1996, June). Administrative concepts in Confucianism and their influence on development in Confucian countries. *Asian Journal of Public Administration*, 18(1), 45-69.
- Chen, C. C., & Lee, Y. T. (2008). Introduction: The diversity and dynamism of Chinese philosophies on leadership. In C. C. Chen & Y. T. Lee (Eds.), *Leadership and management in China: Philosophies, theories, and practices* (pp. 1-27). New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Cheng, B. S. (1995a). Paternalistic authority and leadership: A case study of a Taiwanese CEO. *Bulletin of the Institute of Ethnology Academic Sinica*, 79, 119-173 (in Chinese).
- Cheng, B. S. (1995b). Hierarchical structure and Chinese organizational behavior. *Indigenous Psychological Research in Chinese Societies*, 3, 142-219 (in Chinese).

- Cheng, B. S. (1995c). *Authoritarian values and executive leadership: The case of Taiwanese family enterprises*. Report prepared for Taiwan's National Science Council. Taiwan, National Taiwan University (in Chinese).
- Cheng, B. S. (1997). *Paternalistic leadership and leader effectiveness: A preliminary investigation*. Report prepared for Taiwan's National Science Council. Taiwan, National Taiwan University (in Chinese).
- Cheng, B. S., Chou, L. F., & Farh, J. L. (2000). A triad model of paternalistic leadership: The constructs and measurement. *Indigenous Psychological Research in Chinese Societies, 14*, 3-64.
- Cheng, B. S., Chou, J. F., Wu, T. Y., Huang, M. P., & Farh, J. L. (2004). Paternalistic leadership and subordinate responses: Establishing a leadership model in Chinese organizations. *Asian Journal of Social Psychology, 7*, 89-117.
- Cheng, B. S., Huang, M. P., & Chou, L. F. (2002). Paternalistic leadership and its effectiveness: Evidence from Chinese organizational teams. *Journal of Psychology in Chinese Societies, 3*(1), 85-112.
- Cheng, B. S., Shieh, P. Y., & Chou, L. F. (2002). The principal's leadership, leader-member exchange quality, and the teacher's extra-role behavior: The effects of transformational and paternalistic leadership. *Indigenous Psychological Research in Chinese Societies, 17*, 105-161.
- Cheung, C., & Chan, A. C. (2005). Philosophical foundations of eminent Hong Kong Chinese CEO's leadership. *Journal of Business Ethics, 60*, 47-62.

- Ching, J. (1990). China's three religions. In L. Swidler & P. Mojzes (Eds.), *Attitude of religion and ideologies toward the outsider* (pp. 125-134). New York: The Edwin Mellen Press.
- Choi, Y., & Mai-Dalton, R. R. (1998). On the leadership function of self-sacrifice. *Leadership Quarterly*, 9(4), 475-501.
- Collier, J., Jr., & Collier, M. (1986). *Visual anthropology: Photography as a research method*. Albuquerque, NM: University of New Mexico Press.
- Collins, J. (2001). *Good to great: Why some companies make the leap... and others don't*. New York: HarperCollins.
- Confucianism. (2001). *World of Sociology*. Retrieved April 12, 2008, from <http://www.credoreference.com/entry/4785178>
- Conger, J. A., & Kanungo, R. N. (1998). *Charismatic leadership in organizations*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Covey, S. R. (1991). *Principle-centered leadership*. New York: Simon & Schuster.
- Creswell, J. W. (1994). *Research design qualitative and quantitative approaches*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Creswell, J. W. (1998). *Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five traditions*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Creswell, J. W. (2003). *Research design: Qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches* (2<sup>nd</sup> ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Creswell, J. W. (2009). *Research design: Qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches* (3<sup>rd</sup> ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Crom, M. (1998). The leader as servant. *Training*, 35(7), 6-10.



- Cunningham, W. G., & Cordeiro, P. A. (2000). *Educational administration: A problem-based approach*. Needham Heights, MA: Ally & Bacon, Inc.
- Dansereau, F., Graen, G. B., & Haga, W. (1975). A vertical dyad linkage approach to leadership in formal organizations. *Organizational Behavior and Human Performance*, 13, 46-78.
- Davis, J. H., Schoorman, F. D., & Donaldson, L. (1997). Toward a stewardship theory of management. *Academy of Management Review*, 22(1), 20-47.
- De Pree, M. (1989). *Leadership is an art*. New York: Dell Publishing.
- Denhardt, J. V., & Campbell, K. B. (2006, November). The role of democratic values in transformational leadership. *Administration & Society*, 38(5), 556-572.
- Denzin, N. K. (1989a). *Interpretive biography*. Newbury Park, CA: Sage.
- Denzin, N. K. (1989b). *Interpretive interactionism*. Newbury Park, CA: Sage.
- Denzin, N. K. (2004). Reading film: Using films and videos as empirical social science material. In U. Flick, E. V. Kardorff, and I. Steinke (ed.). *A companion to qualitative research*. London, Sage.
- Denzin, N. K., & Lincoln, Y. S. (2005). *Handbook of qualitative research* (3rd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- DiCicco, J. M. (2003). The development of leaders in ancient China, Rome, and Persia. *Public Administration Quarterly*, 27, 6-40.
- Doloff, P. G. (1999, February). Beyond the organization chart. *Across the Board*, 36(2), 43-47.
- Dong, Q. Q. (2005, January). 谈社会转型时期的信仰危机 [On belief crisis in the period of social transformation]. *Journal of Guangxi Youth Leaders College*, 15(1), 6-7.

- Downton, J. V. (1973). *Rebel leadership: Commitment and charisma in a revolutionary process*. New York: Free Press.
- Eisenberg, N. (1986). *Altruistic emotion, cognition, and behavior*. Arizona State University.
- Eisner, E. W. (1991). *The enlightened eye: Qualitative inquiry and the enhancement of educational practice*. New York: Macmillan.
- Etzioni, A. (1961). *A comparative analysis of complex organizations*. New York: Free Press.
- Etzioni, A. (1988). *The moral dimension toward a new theory of economics*. New York: Free Press.
- Etzioni, A. (1993). *The spirit of community: The reinvention of American society*. New York: Simon & Schuster.
- Fairbank, J. K., & Goldman, M. (2006). *China: A new history* (2<sup>nd</sup> enlarged ed.). Cambridge, MA: Belknap.
- Fairbank, J. K., & Reischauer, E. O. (1973). *China: Tradition and transformation*. Boston, MA: Houghton Mifflin.
- Fan, J. Z. (2007, July 25). 中国当代的信仰缺失与社会道德危机 [Contemporary belief loss and social moral crisis in China]. *Zaobao*. Retrieved August 29, 2008, from <http://www.wyxsx.com/Article/Class4/200707/21627.html>
- Fan, Y. (2000). A classification of Chinese culture. *Cross Cultural Management: An International Journal*, 7(2), 3-10.
- Farh, J. L., & Cheng, B. S. (2000). A cultural analysis of paternalistic leadership in Chinese organizations. In J. T. Li., A. S. Tsui, & E. Weldon (Eds.), *Management and organizations in the Chinese Context* (pp. 84-127). London: Macmillan.

- Farh, J. L., Cheng, B. S., Chou, L. F., & Chou, X. P. (2006). Authority and benevolence: Employees' responses to paternalistic leadership in China. In A. S. Tsui, Y. Bian, & L. Cheng (Eds.), *China's domestic private firms: Multidisciplinary perspectives on management and performance* (pp. 230-260). New York: Sharpe.
- Farling, M. L., Stone, A. G., & Winston, B. E. (1999). Servant leadership: Setting the stage for empirical research. *The Journal of Leadership Studies*, 6(1/2), 49-72.
- Farrer, J. (2002). *Opening up: Youth sex culture and market reform in Shanghai*. Chicago, IL: The University of Chicago Press.
- Feng, Y. L. (1948). *A short history of Chinese philosophy*. New York: Macmillan.
- Fernandez, J. A. (2004). The gentleman's code of Confucius: Leadership by values. *Organizational Dynamics*, 33, 21-31.
- Fingarette, H. (1972). *Confucius: The secular as sacred*. New York: Harper and Row.
- Fortitude. (2006). *WorldNet 3.0*. Princeton University. Retrieved March 4, 2009, from <http://wordnetweb.princeton.edu/perl/webwn?s=fortitude>
- French, J. P., & Raven, B. (1959). The bases of social power. In D. Cartwright (ed.), *Studies in social power* (pp. 150-167). Ann Arbor, MI: Institute for Social Research, The University of Michigan.
- Fry, L. W. (2003). Toward a theory of spiritual leadership. *Leadership Quarterly*, 14, 693-727.
- Fu, P. P., & Tsui, A. S. (2003). Utilizing printed media to understand desired leadership attributes in the People's Republic of China. *Asia Pacific Journal of Management*, 20, 423-446.

- Fu, P. P., Peng, T. K., Kennedy, J. C., & Yukl, G. (2004). Examining the preferences of influence tactics in Chinese societies: A comparison of Chinese managers in Hong Kong, Taiwan, and Mainland China. *Organizational Dynamics*, 33(1), 32-46.
- Fullan, M. G. (1999). *Change forces: The sequel*. New York: Falmer.
- Gao, Z. M. (2001). 论社会转型中的道德信仰危机 [The belief crisis during the social transformation]. *Zhejiang Social Sciences*, 1, 104-109.
- Gay, L. R., & Airasian, P. (2003). *Educational research: Competencies for analysis and applications* (7<sup>th</sup> ed.). Upper Saddle River, NJ: Merrill Prentice Hall.
- Ge, C. H. (2001). 建立道德奉献与道德回报机制 [Building mechanisms for moral dedications and moral returns]. *Morality and Civilization*, 3.
- Gelfand, M. J., Erez, M., & Aycan, Z. (2007). Cross-cultural organizational behavior. *Annual Review of Psychology*, 58, 479-514.
- Goodell, G. E. (1985). Paternalism, patronage, and potlatch: The dynamics of giving and being given to. *Current Anthropology*, 26, 247-257.
- Goodlad, J. I. (1994). *Educational renewal: Better teachers, better schools*. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.
- Graen, G. B. (1976). Role-making processes within complex organizations. In M. D. Dunnette (Ed.), *Handbook of industrial and organizational psychology* (pp. 1202-1245). Chicago: Rand McNally.
- Graen, G. B., & Cashman, J. F. (1975). A role-making model of leadership in formal organizations: A developmental approach. In J. G. Hunt & L. L. Larson (Eds.), *Leadership frontiers* (pp. 143-166). Kent, OH: Kent State University Press.

- Graen, G. B., & Uhl-Bien, M. (1995). Relationship-based approach to leadership: Development of leader-member exchange (LMX) theory of leadership over 25 years: Applying a multi-level, multi-domain perspective. *Leadership Quarterly*, 6(2), 219-247.
- Graen, G. B., & Scandura, T. (1987). Toward a psychology of dyadic organizing. In B. M. Straw & L. L. Cummings (Eds.), *Research in organizational behavior* (pp. 125-208). Greenwich, CT: JAI Press.
- Graham, J. W. (1991). Servant leadership in organizations: Inspirational and moral. *Leadership Quarterly*, 2(2), 105-119.
- Green, R. L. (2009). *Practicing the art of leadership: A problem-based approach to implementing the ISLLC standards* (3<sup>rd</sup> ed.). Boston: Allyn & Bacon.
- Greenfield, T. B. (1986). Leaders and schools: Willfulness and nonnatural order in organization. In T. J. Sergiovanni and J. E. Corbally (Eds.), *Leadership and organizational culture: New perspectives on administrative theory and practice*. Urbana, IL: University of Illinois Press.
- Greenleaf, R. K. (1977). *Servant leadership: A journey into the nature of legitimate power and greatness*. Mahwah, NJ: Paulist Press.
- Greenleaf, R. K. (2002). *Servant leadership: A journey into the nature of legitimate power and greatness* (25<sup>th</sup> anniversary ed.). Mahwah, NJ: Paulist Press.
- Guo, Z. C. (2005, March 15). 善获恶报：不仅是道德被辱没 [Goodness receives bad returns: bringing disgrace to morality]. *Chongqing Morning News*. Retrieved August 24, 2008, from [http://news.xinhuanet.com/comments/2005-03/15/content\\_2698729.htm](http://news.xinhuanet.com/comments/2005-03/15/content_2698729.htm)

- Han, X. (2005, December). 全球化背景下的儒学与中国文化整合 [The integration of Confucianism and Chinese culture within the context of globalization]. *Chinese Confucian Forum*. Retrieved March 4, 2008 from <http://www.confuchina.com/08%20xiandaihua/zhongguowenhuazhenghe.htm>
- Heifetz, R. (1994). *Leadership without easy answers*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Hellriegel, D., Slocum, J., & Woodman, R. (2001). *Organizational behavior* (9<sup>th</sup> ed.). Cincinnati, OH: South Western.
- Hicks, D. A. (2002). Spiritual and religious diversity in the workplace: Implications for leadership. *Leadership Quarterly*, 13, 379-396.
- Hill, J. (2006). Confucianism and the art of Chinese management. *Journal of Asia Business Studies*, 1(1), 1-17.
- Hodgkinson, C. (1991). *Educational leadership: The moral art*. Albany, NY: State University of New York Press.
- Hodgkinson, C. (1996). *Administrative philosophy: Values and motivations in administrative life*. Oxford: Pergamon Press.
- Hofstede, G. (1983). National cultures in four dimensions: A research-based theory of cultural differences among nations. *International Studies of Management and Organization*, 13, 46-74.
- Hollander, E. P. (1993). Legitimacy, power, and influence: A perspective on relational features of leadership. In M. M. Chemers & R. Ayman (Eds.), *Leadership theory and research: Perspectives and directions* (pp. 29-47). San Diego: Academic Press.

- Hong, B. (2007, September 5). *Belief*. Retrieved May 30, 2009, from <http://traderpsychology.blogspot.com/2007/09/belief.html>
- House, R. J. (1976). A 1976 theory of charismatic leadership. In J. G. Hunt & L. L. Larson (Eds.), *Leadership: The cutting edge* (pp. 189-207). Carbondale, IL: Southern Illinois University Press.
- House, R. J., Woytke, J., & Fodor, E. M. (1988). Charismatic and noncharismatic leaders: Differences in behavior and effectiveness. In J. A. Conger and R. N. Kanungo (Eds.), *Charismatic leadership: The elusive factor in organizational effectiveness*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- House, R. J., Wright, N. S., & Aditya, R. N. (1997). Cross-cultural research on organizational leadership: A critical analysis and a proposed theory. In P. C. Earley & M. Erez (Eds.), *New perspectives on international/organizational psychology* (pp. 535-625). San Francisco: New Lexington Press.
- Howell, J. M., & Avolio, B. J. (1992). The ethics of charismatic leadership: Submission or liberation? *Academy of Management Executive*, 6(2), 43-54.
- Hoy, W. K., & Miskel, C. G. (2005). *Educational research: Theory research and practice* (7<sup>th</sup> ed.). New York: McGraw Hill.
- Hsu, I. C. Y. (1995). *The rise of modern China* (5<sup>th</sup> ed.). New York: Oxford University Press.
- Hu, H. N. (2007, January). 走出信仰的低谷 [Walking out of the moral crisis]. *Mianfei Lunwen Network*. Retrieved January 20, 2008, from [http://www.mianfeilunwen.com/Education\\_Papers/Education/Education\\_Topic/2007-1/14/00193375.html](http://www.mianfeilunwen.com/Education_Papers/Education/Education_Topic/2007-1/14/00193375.html)
- Interstate School Leaders Licensure Consortium (ISLLC): Standards for school leaders*. (1996). Washington, DC: The Council of Chief State School Officers.

- Javidan, M., Dorfman, P. W., Sullyde Luque, M. S., & House, R. J. (2006). In the eye of the beholder: Cross-cultural lessons in leadership from Project GLOBE. *Academy of Management Perspectives*, 20, 67-90.
- Jaworski, J. (1997). Destiny and the leader. In L. C. Spears (Ed.), *Insights on servant leadership: Service, stewardship, spirit, and servant leadership*. New York: Wiley & Sons.
- Jiang, X. (2004, June 14). 透视: 应对 ‘毒字号’ 食品 [Perspective: Reply ‘poisonous’ food]. *BBC Online Network*. Retrieved December 7, 2008, from [http://news.bbc.co.uk/chinese/simp/hi/newsid\\_3800000/newsid\\_3804700/3804733.stm](http://news.bbc.co.uk/chinese/simp/hi/newsid_3800000/newsid_3804700/3804733.stm)
- Jin, G., & Liu, Q. (1992). *Prosperity and crisis: On the ultra stable structure of Chinese feudal society*. Hong Kong: Chinese University Press.
- Jing, D. (2005, December 4). 桌达杯 2005 感到河北年度候选人 11: 白芳礼 [Zhuoda Cup 2005 Moved Hebei Candidate No. 11: Bai Fangli]. *Yanzhao Dushi Bao*. Retrieved March 21, 2009, from <http://yzdsb.hebnews.cn/20051205/ca558841.htm>
- Jing, X. M. (1999). *社会转型与信仰重建 [Social transformation and belief reconstruction]*. Taiyuan: Shanxi Education Publishing House.
- Jing, X. M. (2007, January). 道德信仰及其当代意义 [Moral belief and its contemporary significance]. *Seeking Truth*, 34(1), 38-45.
- Johnson, S. M. (1990). *Teachers at work: Achieving success in our schools*. New York: Basic Books.



- Jung, D. I., & Avolio, B. J. (2000). Opening the black box: An experimental investigation of the mediating effects of trust and value congruence on transformational and transactional leadership. *Journal of Organizational Behavior*, 21(8), 949-964.
- Justice. (2006). *WorldNet 3.0*. Princeton University. Retrieved March 4, 2009, from <http://wordnetweb.princeton.edu/perl/webwn?s=justice>
- Kanter, R. M. (1977). *Men and women of the corporation*. New York: Basic Books.
- Kanungo, R. N., & Mendonca, M. (1996). *Ethical dimensions of leadership*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Koehn, D. (2001). Confucian trustworthiness and the practice of business in China. *Business Ethics Quarterly*, 11(3), 415-429.
- Kouzes, J. M. & Posner, B. Z. (1993). *Credibility: How leaders gain and lose it, why people demand it*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Kouzes, J. M. & Posner, B. Z. (1995). *The leadership challenge*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Kunes, M. V. (1991). *How the workplace affects the self-esteem of the psychiatric nurse*. Unpublished proposal, University of Nebraska-Lincoln.
- Kurth, K. (2003). Spiritually renewing ourselves at work: Finding meaning through serving. In R. A. Giacalone & C. L. Jurkiewicz (Eds.), *Handbook of workplace spirituality and organizational performance*. New York: M. E. Sharp.
- Kwong, C. W. (1999). Confucianism, Taoism, Buddhism, and Christianity, and the restructuring of their public roles in Hong Kong (1984-1998). *Dissertation Abstracts International*, 60 (07), 2531A. (UMI No. 9938958)

- Lashway, L. (2006). The landscape of school leadership. In S.C. Smith and P. K. Piele (Eds.), *School leadership: Handbook for excellence in student learning*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Lau, D. C. (1970). *Mencius*. New York: Penguin Books.
- Lau, D. C. (1992). *Confucius: The Analects*. Sha Tin, N. T. Hong Kong: The Chinese University Press.
- Lau, D. C., Liu, J., & Fu, P. P. (2007). Feeling trusted by business leaders in China: Antecedents and the mediating role of value congruence. *Asia Pacific Journal of Management*, 24, 321-340.
- Laub, J. A. (1999). *Assessing the servant organization: Development of the servant organizational leadership assessment*. Unpublished doctoral dissertation. Florida Atlantic University.
- Lee, C. & Zemke, R. (1995). The search for spirit in the workplace. In L. C. Spears (Ed.), *Reflections on leadership: How Robert K. Greenleaf's theory of servant leadership influenced today's top management thinkers* (pp. 99-112). New York: John Wiley & Sons.
- Lee, T. Y. A. (2006). Substandard milk powder and "big headed" babies. *The Internet Journal of Pediatrics and Neonatology*, 6(1).
- Lee, Y. T., Han, A. G., Byron, T. K., & Fan, H. X. (2008). Daoist leadership: Theory and application. In C. C. Chen & Y. T. Lee (Eds.), *Leadership and management in China: Philosophies, theories, and practices* (pp. 83-107). New York: Cambridge University Press.

- Leithwood, K., & Duke, D. L. (1999). A century's quest to understand school leadership. In J. Murphy & K. Seashore-Louis (Eds.), *Handbook of research on educational administration* (2<sup>nd</sup> ed.) (pp. 45-72). San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Lemieux, W. (2005). Moral leadership in the Lincoln presidency and implications for educational leaders. *Dissertation Abstracts International*, 66 (05), 1581A. (UMI No. 3174249)
- Levy, R. (2002). Corruption in popular culture. In P. Link, R. P. Madsen, & P. G. Pickowicz (Eds.), *Popular China: Unofficial culture in a globalizing society*. Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers.
- Lewis, H. A. (1990). *Question of values*. New York: HarperCollins.
- Li, J. (2006, March 6). 政协委员提出将“仁义礼智信”纳入教学 [CPPCC National Committee member proposed to bring *ren, yi, li, zhi, and xin* into education]. *China Youth Daily*. Retrieved August 25, 2008, from <http://pd.xjtu.edu.cn/newwww/allnews.php?tt=1533&kind=4>
- Li, K., & Dong, X. Q. (2004, October 11). 中国聚焦：孔子思想在中国重新受到重视 [China focus: Confucius' thought has been retaken into account in China]. *Xinhua Net*. Retrieved September 29, 2007, from [http://news.xinhuanet.com/newscenter/2004-10/11/content\\_2076756.htm](http://news.xinhuanet.com/newscenter/2004-10/11/content_2076756.htm)
- Li, Z. G. (1997, January). 当代中国道德困境与出路 [Moral dilemma and its solutions in modern China]. *Journal of People's University of China*, 32-94.
- Li, Z. H. (1990). *Zhongguo Gudai Sixiang Shi Lun (On the history of Chinese ancient thought)*. Taipei: Feng Yun Shi Dai Press.

- Liden, R. C., Wayne, S. J., & Stilwell, D. (1993). A longitudinal study on the early development of leader-member exchange. *Journal of Applied Psychology, 78*, 662-674.
- Lin, C. C. (2008, May). Demystifying the chameleonic nature of Chinese leadership. *Journal of Leadership & Organizational Studies, 14*(4), 303-321.
- Lincoln, Y. S., & Guba, E. G. (1985). *Naturalistic inquiry*. Beverly Hills, CA: Sage.
- Link, P. (1993, Spring). China's core problem. *Daedalus, 122*(2), 189-206.
- Littrell, R. F. (2002). Desirable leadership behaviors of multicultural managers in China. *Journal of Management Development, 21*, 5-74.
- Liu, H. D. (2005). 谈“八荣八耻”与儒家“八德” [Discussing “Eight Honors and Eight Disgraces” and Confucian “Eight Virtues”]. 《孔子文化》 [*Confucian Culture*]. Retrieved August 6, 2008, from [http://www.pinghesy.com/data/2008/0331/article\\_2320.htm](http://www.pinghesy.com/data/2008/0331/article_2320.htm)
- Lo, S. K. (1996). *A debate with thought* (in Chinese). Taiwan: Tung Dai Press.
- Lortie, D. C. (1975). *Schoolteacher: A sociological study*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Ma, D. H. (2004, April). 人文道德教育与心理素质教育：中国高等教育的缺失 [Humanistic moral education and psychological education: the depletion of higher education in China]. *Peace & Order*. Retrieved August 23, 2008, from <http://bwc.hutc.zj.cn/stucont.asp?ID=233>

- Ma, Y. M. (2008, July 26). 好人白芳礼感动湖北大学生：祁先雄千里单骑宣传支教精神 [Bai Fangli moved a college student at Hubei Province: Qi Xianxiong rode his bicycle in thousand miles to promote Bai's spirit]. *Cangzhou Evening News*. Retrieved February 6, 2009, from [http://www.czwbnews.com/News\\_View.asp?NewsID=3569](http://www.czwbnews.com/News_View.asp?NewsID=3569)
- Mackerras, C. (2000). Administration and rebellion in East Asia. In C. Mackerras (Ed.), *East Asia* (pp. 73-81). Longman: Pearson Education Australia.
- McCracken, G. (1998). *The long interview*. Newbury Park, CA: Sage.
- Merriam, S. B. (1988). *Case study research in education: A qualitative research*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Merriam, S. B. (1998). *Qualitative research and case study applications in education: Revised and expanded from case study research in education*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Meyer, J. F. (1990). Moral education in the People's Republic of China. *Moral Education Forum*, 15(2), 3-26.
- Miles, M. B., & Huberman, A. M. (1994). *Qualitative data analysis: A sourcebook of new methods* (2<sup>nd</sup> ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Mintzberg, H. (1983). *Power in and around organizations*. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice Hall.
- Mintzberg, H. (1987). Crafting strategy. *Harvard Business Review*, 87(4), 66-75.
- Monroe, K. R. (1994). A fat lady in a corset: Altruism and social theory. *American Journal of Political Science*, 38(4), 861-893.

- Moral. (2006). *WorldNet 3.0*. Princeton University. Retrieved March 4, 2009, from <http://wordnetweb.princeton.edu/perl/webwn?s=moral>
- Mumford, M. D. (2006). *Pathways to outstanding leadership: A comparative analysis of charismatic, ideological, and pragmatic leaders*. Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum.
- Murphy, J. (2002). Reculturing the profession of educational leadership: New blueprints. *Education Administration Quarterly*, 38(2), 171-191.
- Muzaffar, C. (1999). From human rights to human dignity. In Peter Van Ness (ed.), *Debating human rights: Critical essays on the United States and Asia*. London: Routledge.
- Nahavandi, A. (2003). *The art and science of leadership* (3<sup>rd</sup> ed.). Upper Saddle River, NJ: Prentice Hall.
- Nair, K. (1994). *A higher standard of leadership: Lessons from the life of Gandhi*. San Francisco: Berrett-Koehler.
- Nanus, B. (1989). *The leader's edge*. Chicago: Contemporary Books.
- Ngo, T. W. (2008). Rent-seeking and economic governance in the structural nexus of corruption in China. *Crime Law Soc Change*, 49, 27-44.
- Ni, P. M. (2004, January). Revive the lost scholarship for the sake of world harmony. *East-West Connections*, 4(1), 71-83.
- Nie, H. P. (2005). The dilemma of the moral education curriculum in a Chinese secondary school. *Dissertation Abstracts International*, 67 (01). (UMI No. 3202632)
- Nigosian, S. A. (1990). *World faiths*. New York: St. Martin's Press.

- Northhouse, P. G. (1997). *Leadership: Theory and practice*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Northhouse, P. G. (2007). *Leadership: Theory and practice* (4<sup>th</sup> ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Oldstone-Moore, J. (1998). Chinese traditions. In M. D. Coogan (Ed.), *World religions* (pp. 200-235). New York: Oxford University Press.
- Oldstone-Moore, J. (2005). Confucianism. In M. D. Coogan (Ed.), *Eastern religions* (pp. 314-415). New York: Oxford University Press.
- Ozmon, H. A., & Craver, S. M. (2008). *Philosophical foundations of education* (8<sup>th</sup> ed.). Upper Saddle River, NJ: Merrill and Prentice Hall.
- Padavic, L., & Earnest, W. R. (1994). Paternalism as a component of managerial strategy. *Social Science Journal*, 31(4), 389-405.
- Parry, K. W., & Proctor-Thomson, S. B. (2002). Perceived integrity of transformational leaders in organizational settings. *Journal of Business*, 35, 75-96.
- Patterson, K. A. (2003) Servant leadership: A theoretical model. *Dissertation Abstracts International*, 64 (02), 570A. (UMI No. 3082719)
- Patton, M. (1980). *Qualitative evaluation*. Beverly Hills, CA: Sage.
- Pellegrini, E. K., & Scandura, T. A. (2008, June). Paternalistic leadership: A review and agenda for future research. *Journal of Management*, 34(3), 566-592.
- Pescosolido, A. T. (2001, February). In formal leaders and the development of group efficacy. *Small Group Research*, 32(1), 74-93.
- Pfeffer, J. (1981). *Power in organizations*. Marshfield, MA: Pittman.
- Pfeffer, J. (1992). *Managing with power: Politics and influence in organizations*. Boston, MA: Harvard Business School Press.

- Piantanida, M., & Garman, N. (1999). *The qualitative dissertation*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Pielstick, C. D. (2000). Formal and informal leading: A comparative analysis. *The Journal of Leadership Studies*, 7(3), 99-114.
- Plummer, K. (1983). *Documents of life: An introduction to the problems and literature of a humanistic method*. London: George Allen and Unwin.
- Price, R. F. (1992). Moral-political education and modernization. In R. Hayhoe (Ed.), *Education and modernization: The Chinese experience* (pp. 211-238). New York: Pergamon.
- Primary, secondary, and tertiary sources. (2008). *University of Maryland Libraries*. Retrieved May 30, 2009, from <http://www.lib.umd.edu/UES/primary-sources.html>
- Pye, L. W. (1988). *The mandarin and the cadre: China's political cultures*. Ann Arbor: Center for Chinese Studies, The University of Michigan.
- Qiang, M., & Fairbrother, G. P. (2006, March/April). Action plan for the development of civic morality [Gongmin daode jianshe shishi gangyao]. *Chinese Education and Society*, 39(2), 56-68.
- Redding, S. G. (1990). *The spirit of Chinese Capitalism*. Berlin: Walter de Gruyter.
- Ren, J. (1999). *Ethocratic study: From the perspective of early Confucianism*. Guangzhou: Zhongshan University Press.
- Ren, J. M., & Du, Z. Z. (2008). Institutionalized corruption: Power overconcentration of the First-in-Command in China. *Crime Law Soc Change*, 49, 205-223.



- Ren, Y. (2005, September 26). 灵车环城让白爷爷再看一眼家乡 [The hearse around the city and let Grandpa Bai see his home again]. *Meirixin Bao*. Retrieved April 21, 2009, from <http://news.sohu.com/20050926/n227062300.shtml>
- Renard, J. (2002). *101 questions and answers on Confucianism, Daoism, and Shinto*. Mahwah, New Jersey: Paulist Press.
- Romar, E. J. (2002). Virtue is good business: Confucianism as a practical business ethic. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 38, 119-131.
- Romar, E. J. (2004). Globalization, ethics, and opportunism: A Confucian view of business relationships. *Business Ethics Quarterly*, 14(4), 663-678.
- Rost, J. C. (1991, 1993). *Leadership for the twenty-first century*. Westport, CT: Praeger.
- Russel, R. F. (2001). The role of values in servant leadership. *Leadership & Organizational Development Journal*. 22(2), 76-83.
- Russel, R. F., & Stone, G. A. (2002). A review of servant leadership attributes: Developing a practical model. *Leadership & Organization Development Journal*, 23(3), 145-157.
- Salvaggio, K. C. (2003). Perceptions of formal and informal school leaders regarding cultural proficiency in high-achieving, highly diverse elementary schools. *Dissertation Abstracts International*, 64 (07), 2390A. (UMI No. 3098900)
- Sarros, J. C., & Santora, J. C. (2001). Leaders and values: A cross-cultural study. *Leadership and Organization Development Journal*, 22(5/6), 243-248.
- Saso, M. (1997). Chinese religions. In J. R. Hinnells (ed.), *Living religions* (pp. 445-478). New York: Penguin Putnam.

- Scarpari, M. (2003, July). The debate on human nature in early Confucian literature. *Philosophy East & West*, 53(3), 323-339.
- Scharmer, C. O. (2007). Addressing the blind spot of our time: An executive summary of the new book by Otto Scharmer Theory U: Leading from the future as it emerges. *Executive Summary: Theory U*. Retrieved March 17, from [http://www.theoryu.com/documents/Theory\\_U\\_Exec\\_Summary.pdf](http://www.theoryu.com/documents/Theory_U_Exec_Summary.pdf)
- Scharmer, C. O. (2008, winter). Executive forum: Uncovering the blind spot of leadership. *Leader to Leader*, 52-59.
- Schneier, C. E., & Goktepe, J. R. (1983). Issues in emergent leadership: The contingency model of leadership, leader sex, and leader behavior. In Blumber, Hare, Kent, & Davies (Eds.), *Small groups and social interaction* (vol. 1). Chichester, UK: Wiley.
- Schwandt, T. (1997). *Qualitative inquiry: A dictionary of terms*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Schwartz, B. I. (1985). *The world of thought in ancient China*. Cambridge, MA: The Belknap Press.
- Schwartz, S. H. (1994). Beyond individualism-collectivism: New cultural dimensions of values. In U. Kim, H. C. Triandis, & G. Yoon (Eds.), *Individualism and collectivism* (pp. 85-117). London: Sage.
- Selmer, J. (2000). Adjustment of Western business expatriates in Hong Kong versus the Chinese Mainland. *Asia Pacific Journal of Management*, 17(3), 519-538.

- Sendjaya, S., & Sarros, J. C. (2002). Servant leadership: Its origin, development, and application in organizations. *Journal of Leadership and Organization Studies*, 9(2), 57-64.
- Senge, P. M. (1990). *The fifth discipline*. New York: Doubleday-Currency.
- Senge, P. M. (1995). Robert Greenleaf's legacy: A new foundation for twenty-first century institutions. In L. C. Spears (Ed.), *Reflections on leadership: How Robert K. Greenleaf's theory of servant-leadership influenced today's top management thinkers*. New York: John Wiley & Sons.
- Sergiovanni, T. J. (1992). *Moral leadership: Getting to the heart of school improvement* (1<sup>st</sup> ed.). San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Sergiovanni, T. J. (1995). *The principalship: A reflective practice perspective* (3<sup>rd</sup> ed.). Needham Heights, MA: Allyn & Bacon.
- Sergiovanni, T. J. (1996). *Leadership for the schoolhouse*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Sergiovanni, T. J. (2000). *Leadership as stewardship: Who's serving who*. In the Jossey-Bass reader on educational leadership (Ed.), *Educational leadership* (pp. 269-286). San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Sergiovanni, T. J. (2009). *The principalship: A reflective practice perspective* (6th ed.). Boston: Pearson Education.
- Shao, D. S. (1996). 中国社会的困境 [*The plight of the Chinese society*]. Beijing, China: Social Science and Literature Publishing House.
- Shi, W. (2006, Fall). Cultural perplexity in intellectual property: Is stealing a book an elegant offense? *North Carolina Journal of International Law and Commercial Regulation*, 32(1), 1-38.

- Shun, K. L. (1993, July). Jen and Li in the Analects. *Philosophy East and West*, 457-480.
- Shun, K. L. (1997). *Mencius and early Chinese thought*. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press.
- Silin, R. F. (1976). *Leadership and values*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Sim, M. (2007). *Remastering morals with Aristotle and Confucius*. New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Sinha, J. B. P. (1990). *Work culture in Indian context*. New Delhi, India: Sage.
- Smart, M. (2005, March). The role of informal leaders in organizations: The hidden organizational asset. *Dissertation Abstracts International*, 66 (06), 2296A. (UMI No. 3178876)
- Smith, D. H. (1973). *Confucius*. New York: Charles Scriber's Sons.
- Smith, H. (1998). *The world's religions*. San Francisco: HarperCollins.
- Smith, H. D. (2004). The significance of Confucius for religion. *Classical and Medieval Literature Criticism*, 65, 242-255.
- Smith, P. B., & Schwartz, S. H. (1997). Values. *Handbook of Cross-cultural Psychology*, 3, 77-119.
- Snyder, N. H., Dowd, J. J., Jr., & Houghton, D. M. (1994). *Vision, value, and courage*. New York: The Free Press.
- Song, Y. B. (2002). Crisis of cultural identity in East Asia: On the meaning of Confucian ethics in the age of globalization. *Asian Philosophy*, 12(2), 109-125.

- Spears, L. C. (1995). *Servant Leadership and the Greenleaf Legacy*. In L. C. Spears (Ed.), *Reflections on leadership: How Robert K. Greenleaf's theory of servant-leadership influenced today's top management thinkers*. New York: John Wiley & Sons.
- Starratt, R. J. (1994). Afterword. In L. Beck & J. Murphy (Ed.), *Ethics in educational leadership programs: An expanding role* (pp. 100-103). Thousand Oaks, CA: Corwin Press.
- Strike, K. A., Haller, J., & Soltis, J. F. (2005). *The ethics of school administration*. New York: Teachers College Press, Columbia University.
- Su, J. (2006, November 6). *My memory of old man, Bai Fangli*. *China Youth Net*. Retrieved March 31, 2009, from <http://news.southcn.com/community/shzt/pcs/warmth/200509290246.htm>
- Tang, D. X. (2006, December 20). 反思当代中国道德信仰危机的多元参照系 [Reflections on multiple frames of reference of Contemporary moral belief crisis in China]. *Tecn*. Retrieved September 8, 2008, from <http://www.tecn.cn/data/detail.php?id=12297>
- Tarling, N. (2001). *Southeast Asia: A modern history*. Victoria, Australia: Oxford University Press.
- Tong, Y. K. (1995, March 15). *Zai Guoji Rudao Xueshu Ji Gu Fuxi Nanwa Wenhua Yantao Hui Shang Jianghua* [Speech for the International Conference on Confucianism and Culture of Fu His Nu Wa]. HK: The Confucian Academy.

- Tsui, A. S., Wang, H., Xin, K., Zhang, L., & Fu, P. P. (2004). Let a thousand flowers bloom: Variation of leadership styles among Chinese CEOs. *Organizational Dynamics*, 33, 5-20.
- Tu, W. M. (1985). *Confucian thought—Selfhood as creative transformation*. Albany, NY: State University of New York Press.
- Tu, W. M. (1985). Selfhood and otherness in Confucian thought. In A. J. Marsella, G. DeVos, & F. K. Hsu (Eds.), *Culture and self* (pp. 231-251). New York: Tavistock.
- Tu, W. M. (1996). *The living tree: The changing meaning of being Chinese today*. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press.
- Tucker, B. A., & Russell, R. F. (2004). The influence of the transformational leader. *Journal of Leadership and Organizational Studies*, 10(4), 103-111.
- Turner, N., Barling, J., Epitropaki, O., Butcher, V., & Milner, C. (2002). Transformational leadership and moral reasoning. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 87(2), 304-11.
- Wang, H. X. (2004, September). 试论当前社会转型中的信仰危机与重建 [Discussing current belief crisis and reconstruction during social transformation]. *Journal of Urumqi Vocational University*, 13(3), 29-31.
- Wang, J. C. F. (1995). *Contemporary Chinese politics*. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice Hall.
- Wang, Y. T. (2006, March 7). 人民日报：“八荣八耻”是非明 [People’s Daily: “Eight Honors & Eight Disgraces” clear distinction between right & wrong]. Retrieved January 30, 2009, from [http://news.xinhuanet.com/misc/2006-03/07/content\\_4267285.htm](http://news.xinhuanet.com/misc/2006-03/07/content_4267285.htm)

- Wart, V. M. (2003). Public-sector leadership theory: An assessment. *Public Administration Review*, 63, 214-228.
- Watts, J. (2004, May 1). Manufacturers face jail after baby milk kills 50 in China. *The Lancet*, 363, 1448.
- Weber, M. (1947). *The theory of social and economic organizations* (T. Parsons, Trans.). New York: Free Press.
- Wedeman, A. (2008) Win, lose, or draw? China's quarter century war on corruption. *Crime Law Soc Change*, 49, 7-26.
- Wei, C. L. (2004). 道德信仰危机的表现、社会根源及其扭转 [On the main reflects, social origin, and turning measures of moral belief crisis]. *Journal of Henan Normal University* (Philosophy and Social Sciences), 1.
- Westwood, R. I. (1997). Harmony and patriarchy: The cultural basis for "paternalistic headship" among the overseas Chinese. *Organization Studies*, 18, 445-480.
- Wheelan, S. A., & Johnston, F. (1996, February). The role of informal member leaders in a system containing formal leaders. *Small Group Research*, 27(1), 33-55.
- Winston, B. E. (2002). *Be a leader for God's sake*. Virginia Beach, VA: Regent University-School of Leadership Studies.
- Wong, K. C. (1998). Leading schools in a global era: A cultural perspective. *Peabody Journal of Education*, 73(2), 106-125.
- Wong, K. C. (2001). Chinese culture and leadership. *International Journal of Leadership in Education*, 4(4), 309-319.

- Wright, A. F. (1962). Values, roles, and personalities. In A. Wright and D. Twitchett (Eds.), *Confucian personalities* (pp. 3-23). Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press.
- Wruck, B. (2008, January 28). Puts the horse before the cart. *Customer Reviews: Virtuous Leadership: An agenda for personal excellence*. Retrieved May 28, 2009, from <http://www.amazon.com/Virtuous-Leadership-Agenda-Personal-Excellence/product-reviews/1594170592>
- Xin, G. J. (1994). Foreword. In X. Q. Cai, B. Lai, & Y. H. Xia (Eds.), *Lun Yu* (pp. 4-7). Beijing: Beijing Foreign Languages Printing House.
- Xu, K. Q. (2007). *An introduction to Confucius Institute, and Confucianism in modern China*. NCTAN Workshop Presentation. Raleigh, NC: North Carolina State University.
- Xu, Y. Y. (2000, July 27). 我们的道义支撑点在哪里 [Where is our moral supporting point]? *Southern Weekend News*.
- Yan, J., & Sorenson, R. L. (2004). The influence of Confucian ideology on conflict in Chinese family business. *International Journal of Cross Cultural Management*, 4(1), 5-17.
- Yang, K. S. (1993). Chinese social orientation: An integrative analysis. In L. Y. Cheng, F. M. C. Cheung, & C. N. Chen (Eds.), *Psychotherapy for the Chinese: Selected papers from the first international conference* (pp. 19-56). Hong Kong: The Chinese University of Hong Kong.
- Yang, X. H., Peng, Y. Q., & Lee, Y. T. (2008) The Confucian and Mencian philosophy of benevolent leadership. In C. C. Chen & Y. T. Lee (Eds.), *Leadership and management in China: Philosophies, theories, and practices* (pp. 31-50). New York: Cambridge University Press.



- Yu, B. Y., & Lu, Z. L. (2000, Fall). Confucianism and modernity—Insights from an interview with Tu Wei-ming. *China Review International*, 7(2), 377-387.
- Yuan, L. J. (2002, Winter). Ethics of care and concepts of ren: A reply to Chenyang Li. *Hypatia*, 17(1), 107-129.
- Yukl, G. A. (2002). *Leadership in organizations* (5<sup>th</sup> ed.). Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice Hall.
- Yukl, G. A. (2006). *Leadership in organizations* (6<sup>th</sup> ed.). Upper Saddle River, NJ: Prentice Hall.
- Zhang, M. Q. (2005, September 24). 怀念支教模范白芳礼：长留芬芳在人间 [Thinking of Bai Fangli, a role model to support education: Leaving his love to the world]. *Tianjin Daily*. Retrieved April 21, 2009, from <http://news.sohu.com/20050924/n227046178.shtml>
- Zhang, Y. P., & Li, J. (2005, September 29). 古稀之年忆爱心神话：忆白芳礼老人与300 贫困学生 [Seventy years of age recalls love fairy tale: Recall Bai Fangli and 300 impoverished students]. Retrieved March 31, 2009, from <http://news.southcn.com/community/shzt/pcs/warmth/200509290246.htm>
- Zhang, Y. W. (2006, June 25). 国学再“热”中国 [Confucianism “heated” again in China]. *Impact Magazine*. Retrieved August 27, 2008, from [http://paper.yunnan.cn/html/20060625/news\\_89\\_296982.html](http://paper.yunnan.cn/html/20060625/news_89_296982.html)
- Zhu, Q. W. (2008). Reorientation and prospect of China’s combat against corruption. *Crime Law Soc Change*, 49, 81-95.

## Appendices

Appendix A: Consent Form

## SUBJECT INFORMATION AND CONSENT FORM

**PROJECT TITLE:** A moral monument carried on the wheels of a pedicab: An interpretive biography of Bai Fangli

**PROJECT DIRECTOR:**

Jin Zhou  
Department of Educational  
Leadership & Counseling  
School of Education, Room 207  
Missoula, MT 59812-6356  
E-mail: jin.zhou@umontana.edu

Dr. William P. McCaw  
Department of Educational  
Leadership & Counseling  
School of Education, Room 207  
Missoula, MT 59812-6356  
E-mail: bill.mccaw@mso.umt.edu

*This consent form may contain words that are new to you. If you read any words that are not clear to you, please ask the person who gave you this form to explain them to you.*

**Purpose of the Project:** The purpose of this interpretive biographical study is to enhance our understanding of leadership by exploring the life of Bai Fangli by collecting data from archival documents and personal interviews. This study will follow Denzin's (1989a, 1989b) qualitative design of interpretive biography and ask participants to reflect upon their knowledge and personal experiences regarding Bai Fangli. This participant reflection will be guided by a series of semistructured interview prompts.

**Procedures:** If you agree to take part in this research study, you will be given a series of open-ended questions about the meaning of Bai Fangli's life and leadership from your perspectives (see interview protocol for the content of the questions to be asked). You will interact with the researcher in Chinese using an internet based video system or telephone at a pre arranged location in China. The interview process will be audio-taped. The interview session will last for approximately 90 minutes.

**Risk/Discomfort:** Recalling memories of lived experiences with Bai Fangli that may have been less than pleasurable may bring about some emotional discomfort. You may stop the interview at any time, as it is not the intent of this project to cause undue stress or emotional pain for any subject.

Although there is little or no risk involved in this project, the following liability statement is required to all University of Montana Consent Forms:

*In the event that you are injured as a result of this research you should individually seek appropriate medical treatment. If the injury is caused by the negligence of the University or any of its employees, you may be entitled to reimbursement or compensation pursuant to the Comprehensive State Insurance Plan established by the Department of Administration under the authority of M.C.A., Title 2, Chapter 9. In the event of a claim for such injury, further information may be obtained from the University's Claims representative or University Legal Counsel.*

**Benefits:** There is no expectation that you will directly benefit from participating in this study.

**Confidentiality:** At the conclusion of this consent, you will be asked if (a) you agree to participate in this study and (b) if you agree to participate, do you prefer to be noted in the study by your real name or by a fictitious name? If you choose to be noted by a fictitious name, your personal information will be kept confidential and will not be released without your consent except as required by United States law. Only the researcher and her faculty supervisor will have access to the files. Information that links you to the interview data will be removed after the interview has been transcribed by the researcher. Any information identifying you will be stored in a locked file cabinet and then destroyed at the conclusion of the study. If the results of this study are written in any scientific journals or presented at any scientific meetings, your name will not be used.

**Voluntary Participation/Withdrawal:** Your decision to participate in this study is strictly voluntary. You may withdraw at any time by informing the interviewer that you want to stop the interview. You may be asked to leave the study for any of the following reasons: 1. Failure to follow the Project Director's instructions; 2. A serious adverse reaction which may require evaluation; 3. The Project Director thinks it is in the best interest of your health and welfare; or 4. The study is terminated.

**Questions:** Should any questions regarding this study arise before, during, or after the initiation of the study, please call the research director at any time at any of the numbers listed previously in this document. If you have any questions with regard to your rights as a research subject, please contact the Chair of the IRB through The University of Montana Research Office at 406-243-6670 or judy.fredenberg@mso.umt.edu

**Statement of Consent:** I have read the above description of this research study. I have been informed of the risks and benefits involved and all my questions have been answered to my satisfaction. Furthermore, I have been assured that any future questions I may have will also be answered by a member of the research team. I voluntarily agree to take part in this study. I understand that I am giving you my consent to participate in this study by agreeing to participate in this interview.

- Do you grant permission for Jin Zhou to use your real name in the reporting of this study?                      Yes                      No
- Do you grant permission for Jin Zhou to utilize quotations by you in the publication of her research study on Bai Fangli and in any subsequent publications resulting from this study?                      Yes                      No

---

(Name of subject)

---

Date

## 采访许可协议

**采访项目：耸立在三轮车上的道德丰碑—白芳礼传记**

**项目主任：**

周谨

蒙大拿大学教育学院

教育领导学系 207 室

蒙大拿州密苏拉市 59812-6356

电话：(406) 243-5395

E-mail: jin.zhou@umontana.edu

博士生导师：Dr. William P. McCaw

蒙大拿大学教育学院

教育领导学系 207 室

蒙大拿州密苏拉市 59812-6356

电话：(406) 243-5395

E-mail: bill.mccaw@mso.umt.edu

**项目目的：**此传记的目的是通过收集档案资料和个人采访的方式来探究白老先生的人生，并进一步了解道德对社会的影响力和领导力。此研究将用 Denzin 的传记研究方案并让被采访者回忆他们与白芳礼的个人经历。研究人员采访中一系列的提示有助于被采访者更好地回忆他们与白芳礼的经历。

**采访程序：**如果您愿意接受采访，研究人员会给您一系列有关白先生的问题。请您根据您的想法去回答这些问题。您可以通过英特网影像系统或电话接受研究人员的采访。您的采访会被录音，整个采访大约 90 分钟。

**风险/不适：**如果回忆您与白老先生的经历会给您精神上带来一些压力，任何时候您都可以拒绝接受采访。

虽然此采访几乎没有任何风险，但蒙大拿大学也必须作如下责任声明：

*如果此采访让您精神上受伤，您最好立即去寻求治疗。如果因为此大学或其员工的疏忽而让您精神受伤，您可能有权依照蒙大拿州保险计划获得补偿。此保险计划由蒙大拿州政府设立并受其法律 M.C.A., Title 2, Chapter 9 保护。如果因精神受伤而要求索赔，您可以从索赔代表或大学法律顾问处获得更多信息。*

**受益：**您不会因为接受采访而直接受益。

**保密：**您将回答研究人员如下问题：(a) 您愿意被采访吗？(b) 如果您愿意被采访，此项研究您愿用您的真名还是化名。如果您选择用化名，您的个人信息将是高度保密的。只有研究人员和她的博士生导师知道您的个人信息。只要研究人员抄写并翻译了采访记录，任何与您采访资料相关的信息将会被清除。等到此研究结束后，锁在文件箱内与您身份有关的信息也将会被清除。如果此研究的结果出现在任何学术杂志或在学术会议上发表，没有您的授权，您的名字将不会出现。



## Appendix B: Interview Protocol



**Interview Form:** A moral monument carried on the wheels of a pedicab: An interpretive biography of Bai Fangli

Date: \_\_\_\_\_, 2009 Time: \_\_\_\_\_ (am/ pm) Male: \_\_\_\_\_ Female: \_\_\_\_\_

Subject Code: \_\_\_\_\_ Interview: 1 FU # \_\_\_\_\_

Relationship with Bai Fangli: \_\_\_\_\_ Longevity: organization  
\_\_\_\_\_

Position \_\_\_\_\_

Setting:

---

Opening Statements:

Thank you for agreeing to take time from your busy schedule to participate in this research study. There are a few things that I would like to make sure you understand before we get started.

- I will be asking you some general questions and writing notes as we proceed.
- Can you hear me ok? Can you see me ok? Do you have any technological problem? How is your day? How is the weather in Tianjin? Is it a sunny day? Are you ready to be interviewed?

Please be assured that there are no correct answers to the questions that I will be asking. What is important are your thoughts, feelings, and experiences. The intent of this interview is to gather your thoughts, feelings, and experiences, not to make judgments on your responses.

## BAI FANGLI INTERVIEW QUESTIONS

Interview Questions for Individuals Close to Bai Fangli (37 questions)

Sub-question #1

How did Bai Fangli blend his life and leadership?

1. Describe your relationship with Bai Fangli.
2. What can you tell me about Bai Fangli?
3. What was your experience with Bai Fangli?
4. Describe your general perception of Bai Fangli's life.
5. What can you tell me about Bai Fangli's daily life?
6. When you think of Bai Fangli, what story comes to mind?
  - a. Are there other stories?
7. Can you recall a story where Bai Fangli influenced other people?
  - a. If so, what is the story?
  - b. What other stories involving Mr. Bai can you recall?
8. What stories do you know that involve Bai Fangli and Chinese society?
9. Describe Bai Fangli's childhood, family background, and the relationships with his parents.
10. How did Bai Fangli's childhood experience influence his actions as an adult?
11. Has your perception of Mr. Bai changed since his death?
  - a. Tell me the differences?
12. What can you tell me about Mr. Bai's life and his leadership?

Sub-question #2

How did Bai Fangli's leadership impact the lives of other individuals?

1. Can you give specific examples of Bai Fangli's leadership (influence)?
2. In your opinion, what roles did Bai Fangli have in his life?
3. Is your life different as a result of Bai Fangli?
  - a. If your life is different, how so?
  - b. How would you compare Bai Fangli with a Confucian Sage?

Sub-question #3

How did Bai Fangli's epiphanies influence his actions?

1. What were some other events in Mr. Bai's life that you think were important?
  - a. Why were these events important?
2. Did Mr. Bai ever discuss these events with you?
  - a. If so, what did he share?
3. Were these events important to him?
  - a. Why/Why not?
4. Were these events important to others?
  - a. Why/Why not?
  - b. Who were these other people?
5. Why do you think that Bai Fangli decided to pedal again when he was 74 years old?
6. What did Mr. Bai say to you regarding this decision?

Sub-question #4

Where did Bai Fangli's influence come from?

1. Why do you think Mr. Bai had this drive to assist students in need of support?
2. How would you describe Mr. Bai's influence?
3. What was Bai Fangli's vision?
4. What did Bai Fangli do to demonstrate his influence?
5. Have you been influenced by Bai Fangli?
  - a. How?
  - b. Can you give me specific examples?
6. What can you tell me about the legacy of Bai Fangli?
7. From your perspective, where did Bai Fangli's influence come from?

Sub-question #5

What was Bai Fangli's belief structure?

1. What type of the traditional Confucian moral values do you think Bai Fangli demonstrated during his life?
2. How do you think these traditional Confucian moral values influenced his actions?
3. From your perspective, how did Bai Fangli regard Chinese traditional values?
4. For example, do you think Confucian values are Bai Fangli's noted belief structure?
  - a. Why? Why not?
5. How were these beliefs exhibited through his actions?

6. Share with me the characteristics of Bai Fangli that you admire.
7. From your perspective, what was Bai Fangli's belief structure?
8. How do you think Bai Fangli's belief structure assisted him in his journeys?

Can you give me one or two specific examples?

- Thank you for your time. Do you have any questions for me?
  - Is there anything else that you would like to share with me?
- Can you provide me with contact information of other individuals who can provide information concerning Bai Fangli?

## Interview Questions for Individuals Not Close to Bai Fangli (33 questions)

### Sub-question #1

How did Bai Fangli blend his life and leadership?

1. How did you learn about Mr. Bai?
2. Describe your relationship with Bai Fangli.
3. What can you tell me about Bai Fangli?
4. What was your experience with Bai Fangli?
5. Describe your perception of Bai Fangli's life.
6. When you think of Bai Fangli, what story comes to mind?
  - a. Are there other stories?
7. Can you recall a story where Bai Fangli influenced other people?
  - a. If so, what is the story?
  - b. What other stories involving Mr. Bai can you recall?
8. What stories do you know that involve Bai Fangli and Chinese society?
9. Has your perception of Mr. Bai changed since his death?
  - a. Tell me the differences?
10. What can you tell me about Mr. Bai's life and his leadership?

### Sub-question #2

How did Bai Fangli's leadership impact the lives of other individuals?

1. Can you give specific examples of Bai Fangli's leadership (influence)?
2. Is your life different as a result of Bai Fangli?
  - a. If your life is different, how so?
3. How would you compare Bai Fangli with a Confucian Sage?
4. How did Bai Fangli's leadership impact you?

Sub-question #3

How did Bai Fangli's epiphanies influence his actions?

1. What were some other events in Mr. Bai's life that you think were important?
  - a. Why were these events important?
2. Were these events important to him?
  - a. Why/Why not?
3. Were these events important to others?
  - a. Why/Why not?
  - b. Who were these other people?
4. Why do you think that Bai Fangli decided to pedal again when he was 74 years old?

Sub-question #4

Where did Bai Fangli's influence come from?

1. Why do you think Mr. Bai had this drive to assist students in need of support?
2. How would you describe Mr. Bai's influence?
3. What was Bai Fangli's vision?
4. What did Bai Fangli do to demonstrate his influence?
5. Have you been influenced by Bai Fangli?
  - a. How?
  - b. Can you give me specific examples?
6. What can you tell me about the legacy of Bai Fangli?
7. From your perspective, where did Bai Fangli's influence come from?

Sub-question #5

What was Bai Fangli's belief structure?

1. What type of the traditional Confucian moral values do you think Bai Fangli demonstrated during his life?
  2. How do you think these traditional Confucian moral values influenced his actions?
  3. From your perspective, how did Bai Fangli regard Chinese traditional values?
  4. For example, do you think Confucian values are Bai Fangli's noted belief structure?
    - a. Why? Why not?
  5. How were these beliefs exhibited through his actions?
  6. Share with me the characteristics of Bai Fangli that you admire.
  7. From your perspective, what was Bai Fangli's belief structure?
  8. How do you think Bai Fangli's belief structure assisted him in his journeys?

Can you give me one or two specific examples?
- Thank you for your time. Do you have any questions for me?
    - Is there anything else that you would like to share with me?
  - Can you provide me with contact information of other individuals who can provide information concerning Bai Fangli?



## Documents Analysis (18 questions)

### Sub-question #1

How did Bai Fangli blend his life and leadership?

1. How has Bai Fangli been portrayed in the media?
2. How has Bai Fangli's deeds been portrayed in the media?
3. How has Bai Fangli's influences been portrayed in the media?
4. How did the media portray Mr. Bai's formal/informal leadership?
5. What quotes exist that address Bai Fangli's blending of life and leadership?

### Sub-question #2

How did Bai Fangli's leadership impact the lives of other individuals?

1. How did the media portray Bai Fangli's influences on other individuals?
2. What quotes exist that address the impact of Bai Fangli's leadership on the lives of other individuals?

### Sub-question #3

How did Bai Fangli's epiphanies influence his actions?

1. How have Bai Fangli's epiphanies been portrayed in the media?
2. How has Bai Fangli's decision to pedal again when he was 74 in order to collect money to support students been portrayed in the media?
3. What quotes exist that address Bai Fangli's epiphanies?

### Sub-question #4

Where did Bai Fangli's influence come from?

1. How has Bai Fangli's moral force been portrayed by the media?
2. How has Bai Fangli's material assets and spiritual assets been portrayed in the media?
3. What honors have been given to Bai Fangli?

4. How has Bai Fangli's honors been portrayed in the media?
5. What quotes exist that address Bai Fangli's leadership?

Sub-question #5

What was Bai Fangli's belief structure?

1. How has Bai Fangli's belief structure been portrayed in the media?
2. How has Bai Fangli's moral values been portrayed in the media?
3. What quotes exist that address Bai Fangli's belief structure?

Since all the participants of this study were native Chinese speakers, they either had close relationships with Bai Fangli such as his son and daughter or they did not have close relationships with Bai Fangli such as his friends. To ensure the accuracy and trustworthiness of this study, these interview questions were translated into Chinese. Therefore, the interviews with all the participants of this study were in Chinese/Mandarin. Therefore, these interview questions were provided by Mandarin in the following pages.

## 白芳礼研究采访问题

采访问题针对白芳礼的至亲好友

### 采访问题一

白芳礼的生活和他的影响力是怎样融合在一起的？

1. 请谈一下您与白先生的关系。
2. 您是怎样看白先生的？
3. 谈谈您与白先生共同生活或交往的经历。
4. 请谈一下您对白先生的总体评价。
5. 请你描述一下白先生的日常生活。
6. 当您想到白先生时，他的哪些故事仍让您至今难忘？请详诉这些故事。
7. 您能回忆一下几个白先生影响他人的故事吗？请详诉这些故事。
8. 描述一下白先生的孩童时期、家庭背景、以及与其父母共同生活的经历。
9. 请谈一下白先生孩童时期的经历对他成人后行为的影响。
10. 您对白先生去世前后的看法有什么不同？请说出不同处。
11. 您认为白先生在中国社会具有影响力吗？
12. 如果有，作为一个生活在社会最底层的人，他为什么会有这种影响力？

## 采访问题二

白先生的领导力是怎样影响其他人生活的？

1. 以你来看，白先生在生活中扮演哪些角色？
2. 白先生改变了您的人生观、价值观吗？
  - a. 如果有，是怎样改变的？
3. 如果白先生与儒家圣人相比较，您是怎样看的？

## 采访问题三

详述白先生的人生转折点以及对他人人生价值取向的影响。

1. 在白先生一生中，您认为哪些事件对他特别重要？
  - a. 为什么这些事件对他特别重要？
2. 白先生与您谈到过这些他人生的重要事件吗？
  - a. 如果有的话，他说了些什么？
3. 这些事件对他很重要吗？
  - a. 为什么？
4. 这些事件对其他人很重要吗？
  - a. 为什么？
  - b. 这些其他人是谁？
5. 白先生 74 岁时决定重操旧业，你知道他为什么这样做吗？
6. 关于他的决定，白先生是怎样跟您说的？

## 采访问题四

白芳礼的影响力表现在哪些方面？

1. 对于白先生为什么会有帮助学生的动力这个问题，您是怎么看的？

2. 您是怎样看白先生的影响力的？
3. 白先生的愿景是什么？
4. 白先生做了什么来证明他的影响力？
5. 您受白先生影响吗？
  - a. 如何受他影响？
  - b. 能举些例子吗？
6. 您认为白先生留下的遗产是什么？
7. 以你来看，白先生的影响力表现在哪些方面？

#### 采访问题五

白芳礼的信仰是什么？

1. 您认为白先生的行为表现了哪些中国传统儒家价值观？
2. 您认为这些传统儒家价值观是怎样影响他行为的？
3. 您认为白先生是怎样看中国传统儒家价值观的？
4. 您认为儒家价值观是白先生的信仰吗？
  - a. 为什么？
5. 儒家价值观作为白先生的信仰，它是怎样从他行为中表现出来的？
6. 请告诉我您最仰慕白先生品行中哪些。
7. 以你来看，白先生的信仰是什么？
8. 白先生的信仰是如何伴随他生命之旅的？
  - a. 能举一到两个例子吗？

- 谢谢您宝贵的时间。
  - 还有没有其他关于白先生的事情您想要补充的.
- 您能提供一些对白先生也有了解的其他人的联系方式吗?

采访问题针对与白芳礼有各种社会关系的人

#### 采访问题一

白芳礼的生活和他的影响力是怎样融合在一起的？

1. 您是怎样知道白先生的？
2. 请谈一下您与白先生的关系。
3. 您是怎样看白先生的？
4. 谈谈您与白先生交往的经历。
5. 请谈一下您对白先生的总体评价。
6. 当您想到白先生时，他的哪些故事仍让您至今难忘？请详诉这些故事。
7. 您能回忆一下几个白先生影响他人的故事吗？请详诉这些故事。
8. 您对白先生去世前后的看法有什么不同？请说出不同处。
9. 您认为白先生在中国社会具有影响力吗？
10. 如果有，作为一个生活在社会最底层的人，他为什么会有这种影响力？

#### 采访问题二

白先生的领导力是怎样影响其他人生活的？

1. 白先生改变了您的人生观、价值观吗？
  - a. 如果有，是怎样改变的？
2. 如果白先生与儒家圣人相比较，您是怎样看的？

### 采访问题三

详述白先生的人生转折点以及对他人人生价值取向的影响。

1. 在白先生一生中，您认为哪些事件对他特别重要？
  - a. 为什么这些事件对他特别重要？
2. 这些事件对他很重要吗？
  - a. 为什么？
3. 这些事件对其他人很重要吗？
  - a. 为什么？
  - b. 这些其他人是谁？
4. 白先生 74 岁时决定重操旧业，你知道他为什么这样做吗？

### 采访问题四

白芳礼的影响力表现在哪些方面？

1. 对于白先生为什么会有帮助学生的动力这个问题，您是怎么看的？
2. 您是怎样看白先生的影响力的？
3. 白先生的愿景是什么？
4. 白先生做了什么来证明他的影响力？
5. 您受白先生影响吗？
  - a. 如何受他影响？
  - b. 能举些例子吗？
6. 您认为白先生留下的遗产是什么？
7. 以你来看，白先生的影响力表现在哪些方面？



## 采访问题五

白芳礼的信仰是什么？

1. 您认为白先生的行为表现了哪些中国传统儒家价值观？
  2. 您认为这些传统儒家价值观是怎样影响他行为的？
  3. 您认为白先生是怎样看中国传统儒家价值观的？
  4. 您认为儒家价值观是白先生的信仰吗？
    - a. 为什么？
  5. 儒家价值观作为白先生的信仰，它是怎样从他行为中表现出来的？
  6. 请告诉我您最仰慕白先生品行中哪些。
  7. 以你来看，白先生的信仰是什么？
  8. 白先生的信仰是如何伴随他生命之旅的？
    - a. 能举一到两个例子吗？
- 谢谢您宝贵的时间。
    - 还有没有其他关于白先生的事情您想要补充的.
  - 您能提供一些对白先生也有了解的其他人的联系方式吗？

## 资料分析

### 采访问题一

白芳礼的生活和他的影响力是怎样融合在一起的？

1. 媒体是怎样描述白先生的？
2. 媒体是怎样描述白先生事迹的？
3. 媒体是怎样描述白先生影响力的？
4. 媒体是怎样描述白先生领导力的？
5. 哪些现有资料对白芳礼一生和其影响力作出过综合评价？请列举这些综合评价。

### 采访问题二

白先生的领导力是怎样影响其他人生活的？

1. 媒体是怎样描述白先生对其他人的影响力的？
2. 哪些现有资料对白芳礼的领导力影响他人生活作出过综合评价？请列举这些综合评价。

### 采访问题三

详述白先生的人生转折点以及对他人人生价值取向的影响。

1. 媒体是怎样描述白芳礼人生转折点的？
2. 媒体是怎样描述白芳礼 74 岁时为了筹钱帮助学生决定重操旧业的？
3. 哪些现有资料对白芳礼人生转折点作出过综合评价？请列举这些综合评价。

#### 采访问题四

白芳礼的影响力表现在哪些方面？

1. 媒体是怎样描述白先生道德力量的？
2. 媒体是怎样描述白先生留下的物质和精神遗产的？
3. 白先生获得过哪些荣誉？
4. 媒体是怎样描述白先生所获得的荣誉的？
5. 哪些现有资料对白芳礼领导力作出过综合评价？请列举这些综合评价。

#### 采访问题五

白芳礼的信仰是什么？

1. 媒体是怎样描述白先生信仰的？
2. 媒体是怎样描述白先生价值观的？
3. 哪些资料对白芳礼信仰作出过综合评价？请列举这些综合评价。



## Appendix C: Field Memo

## Field Memo

**DATE:** (Date of Reflective Notes)

### REFERENCE

Interview Date: (Date of Interview – if Applicable)  
Subject Code: (Reference to Specific Research Subject – if Applicable)  
Interview Number: (Reference to Specific Interview – if Applicable)

### CATEGORY

Emerging  
Categories

### NOTES

Reflective Notes

## Appendix D: Interview Codes

INTERVIEW CODING  
Bai Fangli

**CONFIDENTIAL**

CODE                      FICTITIOUS NAME                      Organization

**CODING EXPLANATIONS**

QL	Indicates Qualitative Design
BFLS	Indicates Bai Fangli Study
09	Year of the Study
01	Subject Number
	01-50      Adult Descendants
	51-100    Friends
	101-150   Others
D	Adult Descendants
F	Friends
O	Others



## Appendix E: Chronology of Bai Fangli

### Chronology of Bai Fangli

Year/Date	Events
06/17/1913	Bai Fangli was born at Bai Jia Village, Hebei Province in China.
1920-1926	Bai's family was poor, and he had never studied at school. He worked in the field and took care of his younger brother and younger sister.
1926-1944	Bai did several part-time jobs in his hometown. His family became poorer and poorer, and they often starved.
1944-1949	Bai moved to Tianjin and became a pedicab driver.
1949-1974	Bai had been a pedicab driver at a state enterprise—a transportation company at Hebei District, Tianjin for 26 years.
1974	Bai retired from the same transportation company.
1974-1982	Bai did a part-time job at a paint factory in Tianjin.
1982-1987	Bai became a self-employed pedicab driver.
1987-1995	Bai sent his pedicab earnings to students in need of support.
1995-1998	Bai Fangli sold two old houses in his hometown and established the first and only educational company translated as “Bai Fangli Education Support Company” in Tianjin, China. He sent his company's profit to poor students. Bai asked his employees to take care of the company and he continued working as a pedicab driver to send money to students in need of support.
1998-2001	In order to maintain the image of Tianjin city, the city government of Tianjin decided to do some renovation in the city. Bai Fangli's company was forced to close. Bai did not stop working to collect his pedicab earnings to give to students in need of support until he could not pedal anymore in 2001 due to his health problem. From his age of 74 to 88, Bai donated about \$50,000 to students in need of support.
2001-2002	Bai worked at Tianjin railway station to help people look after bicycles. He collected these earnings to send to students in need of support.
2002-2005	Bai passed away due to lung cancer on September 23, 2005.

Appendix F: Document References Pertaining to Bai Fangli

- 看了令人心酸:中国, 你需要什么样的感动? [We felt sad: What type of affection did China need?] (2008, March 9). *Net Interest Rates in China*. Retrieved March 15, 2008, from <http://www.51rates.cn/News/7/9845/1/Index.Html>
- Cong, W. (2006). 感动中国的老人白芳礼 [An old man, Bai Fangli moved China]. *Guangxi Education*, 4c, 4-6.
- Guo, J. H. (2006, April 18). 新长城白芳礼助学基金管理辦法 [Bai Fangli New Great Wall Scholarship Fund management approach]. *North News*. Retrieved March 13, 2008, from <http://news.big5.enorth.com.cn/system/2006/04/19/001284990.shtml>
- Hong, X. H., & Zhang, J. H. (2007). 艰苦支教——大爱无言的白芳礼 [Supporting education arduously: Great love of Bai Fangli]. *China Torch*, 3, 5-6.
- Huang, Y. H. (2005, November 14). 白芳礼纪念碑 13 日落成: 孙媳妇深情回忆白爷爷 [Bai Fangli's monument completed on the 13<sup>th</sup>: Granddaughter in law recalled Grandpa Bai affectionately]. *North News*. Retrieved March 3, 2008, from <http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/11/14/001163714.shtml>
- Jia, J. S. (2005, October 19). 《把爱洒向人间--白芳礼》雕塑基本完工 [Bai Fangli's sculpture has almost been completed]. *Tianjin Daily*. Retrieved February 9, 2008, from <http://past.tianjindaily.com.cn/docroot/200510/19/rb01/19020110.htm>
- Jiao, X. Y. (2005, September 24). Old man who touched China's heart dies at 93. *China Daily*. Retrieved March 10, 2008, from [http://www.chinadaily.com.cn/english/doc/2005-09/24/content\\_480529.htm](http://www.chinadaily.com.cn/english/doc/2005-09/24/content_480529.htm)

- Li, J., & Zhang, Y. Y. (2005, September 23). 蹬车积攒 35 万元资助贫困学生的白芳礼老人去世 [An old man who moved China passed away: Pedaled his pedicab to gather RMB 350,000 for low-economic students]. *Xinhua Net*. Retrieved March 8, 2008, from [http://news.xinhuanet.com/politics/2005-09/23/content\\_3531337.htm](http://news.xinhuanet.com/politics/2005-09/23/content_3531337.htm)
- Liang, H. F. (2006, April 22). 白芳礼爱心三轮车在济南展出 [Bai Fangli's "love tricycle" displayed at Jinan] *North News*. Retrieved March 5, 2008, from <http://news.big5.enorth.com.cn/system/2006/04/22/001287701.shtml>
- Ma, X. (2007, January 15). 让孩子从小懂得帮助他人：白爷爷被写进教材 [Let children know help others when they are little: Grandpa Bai is incorporated into the teaching material]. *North News*. Retrieved March 15, 2008, from <http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2004/04/20/000771706.shtml>
- Wang, G. L., & Li, H. L. (2006). *Philanthropy in China*. Beijing: China Intercontinental Press.
- Wu, H. (2006, November 13). 白方礼老人纪念碑落成一周年：社会各界追忆缅怀 [The 1st anniversary of the completion of Bai Fangli's monument: All members of the society memorize him]. *North News*. Retrieved March 11, 2008, from <http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2006/11/13/001460497.shtml>
- Yao, G. J. (2005, November 23). 天津教育界为白芳礼博爱奖学金捐款超 5 万 [Tianjin educational circles donated RMB 50,000 to Bai Fangli's philanthropic scholarship]. *North News*. Retrieved March 1, 2008, from <http://news.big5.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/12/07/001182253.shtml>

- Zhang, Y. P., & Li, J. (2005, September 28). 一位老人与 300 名贫困学生——退休三轮车工人白芳礼资助 300 名贫困学生的故事 [A story of an old man and 300 low-economic students]. *North News*. Retrieved March 15, 2008, from <http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2004/04/20/000771706.shtml>
- Zhang, Z. Y. (2005, December 7). 白芳礼博爱奖学金 20 多天捐款逾 20 万 [Bai Fangli's philanthropic scholarship raised donations more than RMB 200,000 over 20 days]. *North News*. Retrieved March 3, 2008, from <http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/12/07/001182253.shtml>
- Zhang, Z. Y. (2005, December 16). 传承白方礼精神 博爱奖学金募到三十万 [Inheriting Bai Fangli's spirituality: Philanthropic scholarship raised donations to RMB 300,000. *North News*. Retrieved March 3, 2008, from <http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/12/16/001190001.shtml>
- Zhang, Z. Y. (2005, December 5). 继承白芳礼精神：大学生志愿者义卖献爱心 [Inheriting Bai Fangli's spirituality: College student volunteers' charity sales dedicate love]. *North News*. Retrieved March 12, 2008, from <http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/12/05/001180500.shtml>
- Zhang, Z. Y. (2005, October 5). 平凡人生因爱崇高——白芳礼老人留下的财富 [Ordinary and noble life because of love: Assets that an old man, Bai Fangli left]. *North News*. Retrieved March 15, 2008 from <http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2004/04/20/000771706.shtml>

- Zhang, Z. Y. (2006, December 22). 白芳礼支教事迹明年搬上银幕：人物多由原型出演 [Bai Fangli's deeds teaching at the big screen next year and more characters from the prototype star]. *North News*. Retrieved March 15, 2008, from <http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2004/04/20/000771706.shtml>
- Zhang, Z. Y. (2006, March 30). 全国巡展即将开始白爷爷的三轮车将行遍中国 [National tour is about to start: Grandpa Bai's pedicab will tour over China]. *North News*. Retrieved March 14, 2008, from <http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2006/03/30/001269075.shtml>
- Zhang, Z. Y. (2006, May 8). 白芳礼博爱奖学金昨发放：180名学生领到救助款 [Bai Fangli's philanthropic scholarship ceremony released yesterday: 180 students received scholarship]. *North News*. Retrieved March 15, 2008, from <http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2004/04/20/000771706.shtml>
- Zhang, Z. Y. (2006, October 18). 白爷爷博得热烈掌声 [Grandpa Bai won warm applause]. *North News*. Retrieved March 15, 2008, from <http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2004/04/20/000771706.shtml>
- Zhu, H. R. (2006, April 19). 三轮车全国巡展启程 白方礼助学基金启动 [Pedicab's national tour starts: Activation of Bai Fangli's educational fund]. *North News*. Retrieved March 15, 2008, from <http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2004/04/20/000771706.shtml>
- Zhu, H. R. (2006, December 10). 白芳礼依然感动津门 [Bai Fangli is still touching Tianjin]. *North News*. Retrieved March 15, 2008, from <http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2004/04/20/000771706.shtml>

Zhu, H. R. (2006, October 15). 老人走了精神永存：白芳礼获消除贫困“奉献奖”

[The old man left but his spirit perpetuates: Bai Fangli won “dedication award”].

*North News*. Retrieved March 15, 2008, from

<http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2004/04/20/000771706.shtml>

Zhu, H. R. (2006, September 24). 人虽离去精神延续：白爷爷事迹编进幼儿园教材

[The old man left but his spirit continues: Grandpa Bai’s deeds incorporate into

kindergarten’s teaching material]. *North News*. Retrieved March 11, 2008, from

<http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2006/09/24/001418696.shtml>



## Appendix G: Data Analysis Tables

Table 4-1 The Beginning Codes for the Document Analysis

BLENDING LIFE AND LEADERSHIP	BLL	1
BLL: MR. BAI	BLL: MB	1.1
BLL: MR. BAI'S DEEDS	BLL: MBDS	1.2
BLL: MR. BAI'S INFLUENCE	BLL: MBINF	1.3
BLL: MR. BAI'S LEADERSHIP	BLL: MBLEAD	1.4
BLL: QUOTES OF BLENDING LIFE AND LEADERSHIP	BLL: QUOBLL	1.5
LEADERSHIP IMPACTING LIVES OF OTHER INDIVIDUALS	LILOI	2
LILOI:MR. BAI'S INFLUENCE	LILOI: MBINF	2.1
LILOI:QUOTES OF LEADERSHIP IMPACTING LIVES OF OTHER INDIVIDUALS	LILOI: QUOLEADIMPOTHIND	2.2
EPIPHANIES INFLUENCE MR. BAI'S ACTIONS	EIMBA	3
EIMBA: MR BAI'S EPIPHANIES	EIMBA:MBEPI	3.1
EIMBA:MR BAI'S DECISION TO PEDAL AGAIN WHEN HE WAS 74	EIMBA: MBDECPED74	3.2
EIMBA: QUOTES OF MR. BAI'S EPIPHANIES	EIMBA: QUOMBEPI	3.3
MR. BAI'S INFLUENCE COMING FROM	MBICF	4
MBICF: MR. BAI'S MORAL FORCE	MBICF: MBMF	4.1
MBICF: MR. BAI'S MATERIAL AND SPIRITUAL ASSETS	MBICF: MBASSETS	4.2
MBICF: WHAT HONORS HAVE BEEN GIVEN TO MR. BAI	MBICF: HONGIVMB	4.3
MBICF: MR. BAI'S HONORS	MBICF: MBHON	4.4
MBICF: QUOTES OF MR. BAI'S LEADERSHIP	MBICF: QUOMBLEAD	4.5
MR. BAI'S BELIEF STRUCTURE	MBBS	5
MBBS: MR. BAI'S BELIEF STRUCTURE	MBBS: MBBELIEF	5.1
MBBS: MR. BAI'S MORAL VALUES	MBBS: MBMVAL	5.2
MBBS: QUOTES OF MR. BAI'S BELIEF STRUCTURE	MBBS: QUOMBBELIEF	5.3

Table 4-2 A Synthesis of Data from 91 Online Newspaper Articles

Document protocol	Source	Author or media name	Subquestions	Emerging Themes	Confucian Virtues	Date and Website
1	Primary Secondary	Zhang Mingqi <i>Tianjin Daily</i>	1.1, 3.1, 3.2, 5.2	1. Bai's virtues 3. Moral example 4. Material and spiritual asset-pedicab	1. Ren ai 2. Dayi 3. Yong 4. Jian 5. Xin 6. Zhi 7. Li	Retrieved March 6, 2009, from <a href="http://news.sohu.com/20050924/n227046178.shtml">http://news.sohu.com/20050924/n227046178.shtml</a>
2	Secondary	<i>Yan Zhao Metro News Week</i> , Jin Dong	1.3, 4.1, 5.1	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence 3. Moral example 4. Material and spiritual asset-pedicab	1. Ren ai 2. Dayi 3. Yong 4. Jian 5. Xin 6. Zhi 7. Li	Retrieved February 25, 2009, from <a href="http://yzdsb.hebnews.cn/20051205/ca558797htm">http://yzdsb.hebnews.cn/20051205/ca558797htm</a>
3	Primary Secondary	<i>Metro Express</i>	1.1, 1.2, 1.3, 1.4, 3.1, 5.2	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence 3. Moral example 4. Material and spiritual asset-pedicab	1. Ren ai 2. Dayi 3. Yong 4. Jian 5. Xin 6. Zhi	Retrieved March 10, 2009, from <a href="http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055847.shtml">http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055847.shtml</a>
4	Secondary	<i>Metro Express</i>	1.3, 4.2	2. Bai's influence 3. moral example 4. Material and spiritual asset-pedicab		Retrieved March 12, 2009, from <a href="http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/07/07/001062622.shtml">http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/07/07/001062622.shtml</a>
5	Secondary	<i>Tianjin TV News Point</i>	1.3, 1.4, 2.1, 4.1, 4.2, 5.1, 5.2, 5.3	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence 3. moral example 4. Material and spiritual asset-pedicab	1. Ren ai 2. Dayi 3. Yong 4. Jian 5. Xin 6. Zhi 7. Li	Retrieved February 22, 2009 from <a href="http://www.baifangli.cn/baifangli.asp?clause=2&amp;id=40&amp;NoDown_typeId=1">http://www.baifangli.cn/baifangli.asp?clause=2&amp;id=40&amp;NoDown_typeId=1</a>
6	Secondary	<i>Sohu</i>	1.3, 1.4, 2.1, 5.2	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence 4. Material and spiritual asset-pedicab	1. Ren ai 2. Dayi 3. Yong 5. Xin 6. Zhi	Retrieved March 3, 2009, from <a href="http://news.sohu.com/20051229/n241184801.shtml">http://news.sohu.com/20051229/n241184801.shtml</a>
7	Tertiary	<i>Meririxin Bao</i>	1.1, 1.2, 1.3, 4.1, 4.2, 5.2	1. Bai's virtues 3. moral example 4. Material and spiritual asset-pedicab	1. Ren ai 2. Dayi 3. Yong 4. Jian 5. Xin 6. Zhi 7. Li	Retrieved March 23, 2009, from <a href="http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2006/03/24/001263673.shtml">http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2006/03/24/001263673.shtml</a>
8	Primary Secondary	<i>Metro Express</i>	1.1, 1.2, 4.1, 5.2	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence 3. moral example	1. Ren ai 3. Yong 4. Jian 5. Xin	Retrieved March 23, 2009, from <a href="http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055565.shtml">http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055565.shtml</a>
9	Secondary	Zhang Yanyan, <i>Xinhua Net</i>	1.1	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence 4. Material and spiritual asset-pedicab	1. Ren ai 2. Dayi 3. Yong 4. Jian 5. Xin 6. Zhi 7. Li	Retrieved March 3, 2009, from <a href="http://www.tj.xinhuanet.com/news/2005-09/24/content_5209271.htm">http://www.tj.xinhuanet.com/news/2005-09/24/content_5209271.htm</a>

Document protocol	Source	Author or media name	Subquestions	Emerging Themes	Confucian Virtues	Date and Website
10	Secondary	Ren Yue, <i>Xinhua Net—Tianjin Channel</i>	1.3	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence	1. Ren ai 4. Jian	Retrieved January 27, 2009, from <a href="http://www.tj.xinhuanet.com/news/2005-09/25/content_5211746.htm">http://www.tj.xinhuanet.com/news/2005-09/25/content_5211746.htm</a>
11	Tertiary	<i>Metro Express</i>	1.3	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence 3. Moral example	1. Ren ai	Retrieved March 4, 2009, from <a href="http://news.sohu.com/20050926/n227062410.shtml">http://news.sohu.com/20050926/n227062410.shtml</a>
12	Secondary	<i>Tonight Evening News</i>	1.2, 1.3, 2.1	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence	1. Ren ai 2. Dayi 3. Yong 5. Xin	Retrieved March 3, 2009, from <a href="http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/11/17/001166968.shtml">http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/11/17/001166968.shtml</a>
13	Secondary	Sohu	1.1, 1.3, 2.2, 3.1, 4.2, 5.1, 5.2	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence 3. Moral example 4. Material and spiritual asset-pedicab	1. Ren ai 2. Dayi 3. Yong 4. Jian 5. Xin 6. Zhi 7. Li	Retrieved March 10, 2009, from <a href="http://news.sohu.com/20051228/n241174358.shtml">http://news.sohu.com/20051228/n241174358.shtml</a>
14	Tertiary	<i>New Express - Jin Yang Net</i>	1.3	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence	1. Ren ai 2. Dayi 3. Yong 4. Jian 5. Xin	Retrieved February 11, 2009, from <a href="http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2006/03/09/001251978.shtml">http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2006/03/09/001251978.shtml</a>
15	Primary	Bai Fangli Elementary School	1.3, 2.1, 4.2, 5.2	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence	1. Ren ai 3. Yong 4. Jian	Retrieved March 21, 2009, from <a href="http://www.bflxx.com">http://www.bflxx.com</a>
16	Secondary	Ma Yumei, <i>Cangzhou Evening News</i>	2.1, 4.2, 5.2	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence	1. Ren ai 3. Yong 5. Xin	Retrieved February 6, 2009, from <a href="http://www.czwbnews.com/News_View.asp?NewsID=3569">http://www.czwbnews.com/News_View.asp?NewsID=3569</a>
17	Secondary	Bai Fangli Elementary School	1.3, 2.1	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence	1. Ren ai	Retrieved March 21, 2009, from <a href="http://www.bflxx.com">http://www.bflxx.com</a>
18	Secondary	Tan Renwei, <i>Nandu Daily</i>	1.3, 2.1	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence	1. Ren ai 2. Dayi 3. Yong 4. Jian 5. Xin 6. Zhi	Retrieved March 20, 2009, from <a href="http://epaper.nddaily.com/A/html/2008-03/14/content_413861.htm">http://epaper.nddaily.com/A/html/2008-03/14/content_413861.htm</a>
19	Secondary	<i>Baidu Tieba</i>	1.1, 3.1, 4.1, 5.2	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence: 3. Moral example	1. Ren ai 2. Dayi 3. Yong 4. Jian 5. Xin 6. Zhi	Retrieved March 26, 2009, from <a href="http://tieba.baidu.com/f?kw=%B0%D7%B7%BC%C0%F1">http://tieba.baidu.com/f?kw=%B0%D7%B7%BC%C0%F1</a>

Document protocol	Source	Author or media name	Subquestions	Emerging Themes	Confucian Virtues	Date and Website
20	Primary Secondary	<i>An Yin, Metro Express</i>	4.1, 5.2	1. Bai's virtues	1. Ren ai 2. Dayi 3. Yong 5. Xin 6. Zhi	Retrieved January 17, 2009, from <a href="http://news.sohu.com/20050926/n227062422.shtml">http://news.sohu.com/20050926/n227062422.shtml</a>
21	Secondary	<i>Metro Express</i>	5.2	1. Bai's virtues	1. Ren ai 2. Dayi 3. Yong 4. Jian 5. Xin 6. Zhi	Retrieved March 24, 2009, from <a href="http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055730.shtml">http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055730.shtml</a>
22	Secondary	<i>Metro Express</i>	1.2	1. Bai's virtues	1. Ren ai	Retrieved March 20, 2009, from <a href="http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055696.shtml">http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055696.shtml</a>
23	Secondary	<i>Metro Express</i>	4.3, 4.4	1. Bai's virtues 3. Moral example	1. Ren ai 4. Jian	Retrieved March 7, 2009, from <a href="http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055675.shtml">http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055675.shtml</a>
24	Primary Secondary	<i>Meirixin Bao</i>	1.1, 4.2, 5.2	1. Bai's virtues 4. Material and spiritual asset-pedicab	1. Ren ai 2. Dayi 3. Yong 4. Jian 5. Xin 6. Zhi	Retrieved March 22, 2009, from <a href="http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227056112.shtml">http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227056112.shtml</a>
25	Primary Secondary	<i>Meirixin Bao</i>	4.1, 4.2, 5.2	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence	1. Ren ai 2. Dayi 3. Yong 5. Xin 6. Zhi 7. Li	Retrieved March 20, 2009, from <a href="http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055632.shtml">http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055632.shtml</a>
26	Secondary	<i>An Yin, Metro Express</i>	1.3, 4.2	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence 4. Material and spiritual asset-pedicab	1. Ren ai	Retrieved March 24, 2009, from <a href="http://news.sohu.com/20060330/n242555047.shtml">http://news.sohu.com/20060330/n242555047.shtml</a>
27	Tertiary	<i>Li Jing, Zhang Yanyan Xinhua Net</i>	1.1, 3.2, 5.2	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence	1. Ren ai 2. Dayi 3. Yong 4. Jian, 5. Xin 6. Zhi 7. Li	Retrieved March 20, 2009, from <a href="http://news.xinhuanet.com/politics/2005-09/23/content_3531337.htm">http://news.xinhuanet.com/politics/2005-09/23/content_3531337.htm</a>
28	Secondary	<i>Zhang Mingqi, Tianjin Daily</i>	1.1, 1.2, 3.1, 3.2, 5.2	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence	1. Ren ai 2. Dayi 3. Yong 4. Jian 5. Xin 6. Zhi 7. Li	Retrieved February 22, 2009, from <a href="http://www.tj.xinhuanet.com/news/2005-07/13/content_4629825.htm">http://www.tj.xinhuanet.com/news/2005-07/13/content_4629825.htm</a>
29	Secondary	<i>Meirixin Bao</i>	1.3, 2.1, 5.2	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence	1. Ren ai 2. Dayi 3. Yong 4. Jian 5. Xin 6. Zhi	Retrieved February 8, 2009, from <a href="http://www.tj.xinhuanet.com/news/2005-06/19/content_4468549.htm">http://www.tj.xinhuanet.com/news/2005-06/19/content_4468549.htm</a>
30	Secondary	Ren Yue, Duan Yigang, <i>Meirixin Bao</i>	1.1, 1.3, 4.4, 5.2	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence	1. Ren ai 2. Dayi 3. Yong 4. Jian 5. Xin 6. Zhi	Retrieved January 11, 2009, from <a href="http://www.tj.xinhuanet.com/news/2004-12/03/content_3329663_1.htm">http://www.tj.xinhuanet.com/news/2004-12/03/content_3329663_1.htm</a>

Document protocol	Source	Author or media name	Subquestions	Emerging Themes	Confucian Virtues	Date and Website
31	Secondary	<i>Enorth</i>	2.1	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence 3. Moral example	1. Ren ai 2. Dayi	Retrieved March 14, 2009, from <a href="http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2004/04/20/000771447.shtml">http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2004/04/20/000771447.shtml</a>
32	Secondary	Wang Qiang, Chan Xuexi, Yin Jie, Liu Xiaoyan, Dong Daxi, and Yao Shiji <i>Metro Express</i>	1.3, 5.2	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence 3. Moral example	1. Ren ai 2. Dayi 3. Yong 5. Xin 6. Zhi 7. Li	Retrieved March 5, 2009, from <a href="http://past.tianjindaily.com/docroot/200404/20/kb01/20020203.htm">http://past.tianjindaily.com/docroot/200404/20/kb01/20020203.htm</a>
33	Tertiary	Wu Hong, <i>Enorth</i>	1.3, 2.1, 4.2	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence: 3. Moral example	1. Ren ai 2. Dayi 3. Yong 4. Jian 5. Xin 6. Zhi 7. Li	Retrieved March 21, 2009, from <a href="http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2006/11/13/001460497.shtml">http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2006/11/13/001460497.shtml</a>
34	Tertiary	Meirixin Bao	4.4	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence 3. Moral example	1. Ren ai 2. Dayi 3. Yong, 5.Xin 6. Zhi	Retrieved March 8, 2009, from <a href="http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2006/10/14/001433371.shtml">http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2006/10/14/001433371.shtml</a>
35	Tertiary	<i>Meirixin Bao</i>	1.3, 2.1	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence 3. Moral example	1. Ren ai 3. Yong 4. Jian	Retrieved February 27, 2009, from <a href="http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2006/09/24/001418696.shtml">http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2006/09/24/001418696.shtml</a>
36	Secondary	<i>Meirixin Bao</i>	1.3	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence	1. Ren ai	Retrieved March 27, 2009, from <a href="http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/09/25/001127055.shtml">http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/09/25/001127055.shtml</a>
37	Tertiary	<i>Enorth</i>	1.3, 2.1, 5.2	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence	1. Ren ai 7. Li	Retrieved February 27, 2009, from <a href="http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2004/04/21/000772295.shtml">http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2004/04/21/000772295.shtml</a>
38	Primary Secondary	<i>Meirixin Bao</i>	1.1, 5.2	1. Bai's virtues	1. Ren ai 2. Dayi 4. Jian	Retrieved March 3, 2009, from <a href="http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/09/24/001126801.shtml">http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/09/24/001126801.shtml</a>
39	Primary	<i>Metro Express</i>	1.2, 1.3, 5.2	1. Bai's virtues	1. Ren ai 2. Dayi	Retrieved February 6, 2009, from <a href="http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/06/09/001041919.shtml">http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/06/09/001041919.shtml</a>
40	Primary Secondary	<i>Tianjin Daily</i>	1.1, 1.2, 1.3, 2.1, 4.1, 4.2, 4.4, 5.2	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence 3. moral example	1. Ren ai 2. Dayi 3. Yong 4. Jian 5. Xin 6. Zhi	Retrieved February 16, 2009, from <a href="http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/10/05/001132853.shtml">http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/10/05/001132853.shtml</a>

Document protocol	Source	Author or media name	Subquestions	Emerging Themes	Confucian Virtues	Date and Website
41	Secondary	<i>Meirixin Bao</i>	1.2, 1.3, 2.1, 4.1, 4.2, 5.2	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence 3. moral example	1. Ren ai 2. Dayi 4. Jian	Retrieved March 22, 2009, from <a href="http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/09/27/001128226.shtml">http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/09/27/001128226.shtml</a>
42	Secondary	<i>Tianjin Daily</i> , Zhang Mingqi	2.1, 4.2, 5.2	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence 3. Moral example	1. Ren ai 7. Li	Retrieved January 27, 2009, from <a href="http://www.tj.xinhuanet.com/news/2005-09/25/content_5211703.htm">http://www.tj.xinhuanet.com/news/2005-09/25/content_5211703.htm</a>
43	Tertiary	<i>Enorth</i>	1.3, 5.2	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence 3. Moral example	1. Ren ai 7. Li	Retrieved March 2, 2009, from <a href="http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2004/04/21/000772324.shtml">http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2004/04/21/000772324.shtml</a>
44	Secondary Tertiary	<i>Tonight Evening News</i>	1.3, 2.1, 4.1, 4.2, 5.2	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence 3. Moral example	1. Ren ai 2. Dayi 4. Jian	Retrieved February 16, 2009, from <a href="http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/09/24/001126963.shtml">http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/09/24/001126963.shtml</a>
45	Tertiary	<i>Metro Express</i> Wang Qiang	1.3, 2.1, 4.1, 5.2,	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence: Bai's spirit 3. Moral example	1. Ren ai	Retrieved March 18, 2009, from <a href="http://past.tianjindaily.com.cn/docroot/200404/21/kb01/21020203.htm">http://past.tianjindaily.com.cn/docroot/200404/21/kb01/21020203.htm</a>
46	Tertiary	<i>Tonight Evening News</i>	1.3, 4.1, 5.2	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence	7. Li	Retrieved March 19, 2009, from <a href="http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/05/18/001026207.shtml">http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/05/18/001026207.shtml</a>
47	Secondary Tertiary	<i>Metro Express</i>	1.3, 4.2, 5.2	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence	1. Ren ai	Retrieved March 16, 2009, from <a href="http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/07/17/001070333.shtml">http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/07/17/001070333.shtml</a>
48	Secondary Tertiary	<i>Metro Express</i>	1.3, 4.2, 5.2	1. Bai's virtues 4. Material and spiritual asset-pedicab	1. Ren ai 2. Dayi 3. Yong 5. Xin	Retrieved February 11, 2009, from <a href="http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2006/01/11/001208473.shtml">http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2006/01/11/001208473.shtml</a>
49	Tertiary	<i>Tianjin Daily</i>	1.3, 4.2, 5.2	1. Bai's virtues 4. Material and spiritual asset-pedicab	1. Ren ai	Retrieved February 27, 2009, from <a href="http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2006/04/29/001293382.shtml">http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2006/04/29/001293382.shtml</a>
50	Secondary	<i>Enorth</i>	1.1, 1.2, 1.3, 2.1, 4.1, 4.2, 5.2	1. Bai's virtues 3. Moral example 5. Material and spiritual asset-pedicab	1. Ren ai 2. Dayi, 3. Yong 4. Jian 5. Xin 6. Zhi 7. Li	Retrieved March 20, 2009, from <a href="http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2004/04/21/000772192.shtml">http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2004/04/21/000772192.shtml</a>
51	Tertiary	<i>Tonight Evening News</i>	1.3, 2.1	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence	1. Ren ai	Retrieved February 11, 2009, from <a href="http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/12/21/001193435.shtml">http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/12/21/001193435.shtml</a>

Document protocol	Source	Author or media name	Subquestions	Emerging Themes	Confucian Virtues	Date and Website
52	Tertiary	<i>Tonight Evening News</i>	1.3, 2.1	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence	1. Ren ai	Retrieved January 29, 2009, from <a href="http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/11/23/001171645.shtml">http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/11/23/001171645.shtml</a>
53	Tertiary	<i>Enorth</i>	1.1, 1.3	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence	1. Ren ai	Retrieved January 14, 2009, from <a href="http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2004/04/20/000771453.shtml">http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2004/04/20/000771453.shtml</a>
54	Secondary	<i>Metro Express</i>	1.3, 2.1	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence	1. Ren ai	Retrieved March 25, 2009, from <a href="http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/06/27/001054177.shtml">http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/06/27/001054177.shtml</a>
55	Tertiary	Huang Xing, <i>Metro Express</i>	3.1, 5.2	1. Bai's virtues	1. Ren ai 2. Dayi	Retrieved March 4, 2009, from <a href="http://past.tianjindaily.com.cn/docroot/200404/22/kb01/22020202.htm">http://past.tianjindaily.com.cn/docroot/200404/22/kb01/22020202.htm</a>
56	Primary	<i>Metro Express</i>	1.1, 3.1, 5.2	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence to Tibetan students	1. Ren ai 2. Dayi 3. Yong 4. Jian 5. Xin 6. Zhi	Retrieved February 10, 2009, from <a href="http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/05/17/001024897.shtml">http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/05/17/001024897.shtml</a>
57	Secondary	<i>Metro Express</i>	1.3, 5.2	1. Bai's virtues	1. Ren ai 2. Dayi 3. Yong 5. Xin 7. Li	Retrieved January 30, 2009, from <a href="http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/05/16/001024042.shtml">http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/05/16/001024042.shtml</a>
58	Secondary	<i>Meirixin Bao</i>	1.1, 4.4, 5.2	1. Bai's virtues	1. Ren ai 2. Dayi 3. Yong 4. Jian 5. Xin 7. Li	Retrieved February 7, 2009, from <a href="http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/05/15/001023557.shtml">http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/05/15/001023557.shtml</a>
59	Secondary	Meirixin Bao	1.3, 4.2	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence: 3. Moral example 4. Material and spiritual asset-pedicab	1. Ren ai 2. Dayi 3. Yong 5. Xin 7. Li	Retrieved February 11, 2009, from <a href="http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/12/28/001198912.shtml">http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/12/28/001198912.shtml</a>
60	Primary Secondary	<i>Metro Express</i>	1.1, 2.1, 4.1, 5.2, 5.3	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence	1. Ren ai 2. Dayi 3. Yong 4. Jian 5. Xin	Retrieved March 9, 2009, from <a href="http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2006/10/18/001436631.shtml">http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2006/10/18/001436631.shtml</a>
61	Primary Secondary	Liu Xiaoyan and Wang Qiang, <i>Metro Express</i>	5.2	1. Bai's virtues 4. Bai's deeds for support education	1. Ren ai	Retrieved March 3, 2009, from <a href="http://past.tianjindaily.com.cn/docroot/200404/23/kb01/23020203.htm">http://past.tianjindaily.com.cn/docroot/200404/23/kb01/23020203.htm</a>
62	Tertiary	<i>Metro Express</i>	1.1, 5.2	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence	1. Ren ai	Retrieved March 7, 2009, from <a href="http://www.news.china001.com/s/how_hdr.php?xname=4T1P621&amp;dname=27SLD21&amp;xpos=36">http://www.news.china001.com/s/how_hdr.php?xname=4T1P621&amp;dname=27SLD21&amp;xpos=36</a>



Document protocol	Source	Author or media name	Subquestions	Emerging Themes	Confucian Virtues	Date and Website
63	Tertiary	<i>Enorth</i>	2.1, 4.1	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence	7. Li	Retrieved March 22, 2009, from <a href="http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2004/04/20/000771527.shtml">http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2004/04/20/000771527.shtml</a>
64	Tertiary	<i>Meirixin Bao</i>	4.2	1. Bai's virtues 4. Material and spiritual asset-pedicab	1. Ren ai 2. Dayi 4. Jian 7. Li	Retrieved January 25, 2009, from <a href="http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/09/24/001126803.shtml">http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/09/24/001126803.shtml</a>
65	Secondary	An Yin, <i>Metro Express</i>	2.1, 5.2	1. Bai's virtues	1. Ren ai 2. Dayi 5. Xin 6. Zhi	Retrieved February 24, 2009, from <a href="http://past.tianjindaily.com.cn/docroot/200505/25/kb01/25030304.htm">http://past.tianjindaily.com.cn/docroot/200505/25/kb01/25030304.htm</a>
66	Primary Tertiary	<i>Tonight Evening News</i>	2.1, 5.2	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence 3. Moral example	4. Jian	Retrieved February 16, 2009, from <a href="http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/09/24/001126969.shtml">http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/09/24/001126969.shtml</a>
67	Tertiary	<i>Metro Express</i>	2.1, 4.1, 5.2	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence	1. Ren ai 2. Dayi 3. Yong 5. Xin 6. Zhi	Retrieved March 3, 2009, from <a href="http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2007/04/01/001593113.shtml">http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2007/04/01/001593113.shtml</a>
68	Secondary	<i>Meirixin Bao</i>	4.1, 4.2, 5.2	1. Bai's virtues 3. Moral example 4. Material and spiritual asset-pedicab	1. Ren ai 2. Dayi 3. Yong 4. Jian 5. Xin 6. Zhi 7. Li	Retrieved March 25, 2009, from <a href="http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2006/01/11/001208355.shtml">http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2006/01/11/001208355.shtml</a>
69	Tertiary	<i>Tonight Evening News</i>	2.1, 5.2	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence	1. Ren ai 2. Dayi 7. Li	Retrieved January 30, 2009, from <a href="http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/05/19/001027144.shtml">http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/05/19/001027144.shtml</a>
70	Tertiary	Hou Yan, <i>Metro Express</i>	2.1, 5.2	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence	1. Ren ai 7. Li	Retrieved March 9, 2009, from <a href="http://past.tianjindaily.com.cn/docroot/200404/23/kb01/23020208.htm">http://past.tianjindaily.com.cn/docroot/200404/23/kb01/23020208.htm</a>
71	Tertiary	<i>Enorth</i>	2.1, 5.2	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence 3. Moral example	1. Ren ai 2. Dayi 3. Yong 5. Xin 6. Zhi 7. Li	Retrieved March 4, 2009, from <a href="http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2004/04/20/000771456.shtml">http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2004/04/20/000771456.shtml</a>
72	Secondary	<i>Enorth</i>	2.1, 4.1, 5.2	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence 3. Moral example	1. Ren ai 7. Li	Retrieved March 12, 2009, from <a href="http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2004/04/21/000772299.shtml">http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2004/04/21/000772299.shtml</a>
73	Primary	Yu Hao, <i>Enorth</i>	1.2, 1.3, 5.2	1. Bai's virtues	1. Ren ai 2. Dayi 3. Yong 4. Jian 5. Xin 6. Zhi	Retrieved February 11, 2009, from <a href="http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/09/23/001126658.shtml">http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/09/23/001126658.shtml</a>

Document protocol	Source	Author or media name	Subquestions	Emerging Themes	Confucian Virtues	Date and Website
74	Secondary	<i>Metro Express</i>	2.1, 4.1, 5.2	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence 3. Moral example	1. Ren ai	Retrieved March 9, 2009, from <a href="http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/10/09/001134821.shtml">http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/10/09/001134821.shtml</a>
75	Tertiary	<i>Metro Express</i>	1.1, 5.2	1. Bai's virtues	1. Ren ai 4. Jian 7. Li	Retrieved March 13, 2009, from <a href="http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/09/24/001126817.shtml">http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/09/24/001126817.shtml</a>
76	Secondary	<i>Meirixin Bao</i>	1.3, 2.1, 5.2	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence 3. Moral example	1. Ren ai 2. Dayi 7. Li	Retrieved March 10, 2009, from <a href="http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/09/25/001127049.shtml">http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/09/25/001127049.shtml</a>
77	Tertiary	Gao Bo, <i>Enorth</i>	1.3, 2.1, 4.2	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence	1. Ren ai	Retrieved March 13, 2009, from <a href="http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/11/13/001163382.shtml">http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/11/13/001163382.shtml</a>
78	Tertiary	<i>Meirixin Bao</i>	1.3, 4.2, 5.2	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence: 3. Moral example	1. Ren ai	Retrieved March 10, 2009, from <a href="http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/11/13/001163253.shtml">http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/11/13/001163253.shtml</a>
79	Secondary	<i>Metro Express</i>	1.3			Retrieved March 16, 2009, from <a href="http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/07/18/001070692.shtml">http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/07/18/001070692.shtml</a>
80	Secondary	<i>Metro Express</i>	1.1, 1.2, 5.2	1. Bai's virtues	1. Ren ai	Retrieved January 26, 2009, from <a href="http://news.big5.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/06/10/001043198.shtml">http://news.big5.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/06/10/001043198.shtml</a>
81	Tertiary	<i>Metro Express</i>	1.3, 5.2	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence	1. Ren ai	Retrieved March 9, 2009, from <a href="http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/06/08/001040873.shtml">http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/06/08/001040873.shtml</a>
82	Secondary	<i>Metro Express</i>	1.1, 1.2, 5.2	1. Bai's virtues epiphany	1. Ren ai 2. Dayi 3. Yong 4. Jian	Retrieved March 6, 2009, from <a href="http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/05/20/001027504.shtml">http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/05/20/001027504.shtml</a>
83	Primary Secondary	<i>Tonight Evening News</i>	1.3, 5.2	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence 3. Moral example	4. Jian	Retrieved March 24, 2009, from <a href="http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/02/05/000960180.shtml">http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/02/05/000960180.shtml</a>
84	Tertiary	<i>Enorth</i>	1.3, 2.1, 5.2	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence	1. Ren ai 7. Li	Retrieved March 14, 2009, from <a href="http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2004/04/19/000770840.shtml">http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2004/04/19/000770840.shtml</a>
85	Tertiary	<i>Enorth</i>	1.2, 1.3, 5.2	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence: 3. Moral example	1. Ren ai 2. Dayi 3. Yong 4. Jian 7. Li	Retrieved March 16, 2009, from <a href="http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2004/04/19/000770866.shtml">http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2004/04/19/000770866.shtml</a>

Document protocol	Source	Author or media name	Subquestions	Emerging Themes	Confucian Virtues	Date and Website
86	Tertiary	<i>Tianjin Daily</i>	1.1, 1.3, 4.2, 5.2	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence	1. Ren ai 2. Dayi 3. Yong 4. Jian 5. Xin 6. Zhi	Retrieved February 19, 2009, from <a href="http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/07/10/001064967.shtml">http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/07/10/001064967.shtml</a>
87	Secondary	<i>Metro Express</i>	1.3, 5.2	1. Bai's virtues	1. Ren ai	Retrieved February 27, 2009, from <a href="http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/06/22/001051039.shtml">http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/06/22/001051039.shtml</a>
88	Secondary	Lei Fengyu and Wang Yongze, <i>Tonight Evening News</i>	1.3, 4.1, 5.2	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence	7. Li	Retrieved March 2, 2009, from <a href="http://news.sina.com.cn/c/2005-06-19/13226212698s.shtml">http://news.sina.com.cn/c/2005-06-19/13226212698s.shtml</a>
89	Primary	<i>Metro Express</i>	1.1, 5.2	1. Bai's virtues	1. Ren ai 4. Jian	Retrieved February 23, 2009, from <a href="http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/06/17/001047643.shtml">http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/06/17/001047643.shtml</a>
90	Primary Secondary	<i>Metro Express</i>	4.3, 4.4	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence	1. Ren ai 2. Dayi 3. Yong 4. Jian 5. Xin 6. Zhi	Retrieved February 11, 2009, from <a href="http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2006/10/17/001435552.shtml">http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2006/10/17/001435552.shtml</a>
91	Primary	Bai Guofu's Document		1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence	1. Ren ai 2. Dayi 3. Yong 4. Jian 5. Xin 6. Zhi 7. Li	

Table 4-3 A Synthesis of Data from 43 Photographs

Photo #	Caption of the photograph	Questions asked	Virtues	Subversive reading or Theme	Subquestions and date of analyzing	Source
1	Summer is coming. Bai Fangli is still wearing a long sleeve shirt and pant. His vision is to earn more money for these students in need of support.	How did the photo describe Mr. Bai? What Confucian moral values did you see in the photo? Why did Mr. Bai pedal again when he was the age of 74?	1. Ren ai 2. Dayi 3. Jian 4. Xin 5. Yong 6. Zhi	A monument carried on the wheels of a pedicab 1. Bai's virtues 4. moral example	1.1, 3.4, 5.2 09/24/2005 Tianjin Daily Analyzed 03/25/09	To memorize Bai Fangli Retrieved March 20, 2009, from <a href="http://news.sohu.com/20050924/n227046178.shtml">http://news.sohu.com/20050924/n227046178.shtml</a>
2	Bai Fangli, a national moral example endures all kinds of hardships and work diligently to assist students in need of support and his educational career.	How did the photo describe Mr. Bai? What did the photo mean to you? What Confucian moral values did you see in the photo?	1. Ren ai 3. Jian 4. Xin 5. Yong	Bai Fangli showed his benevolence and great love to the people and the Chinese society. 1. Bai's virtues	1.1, 1.2, 1.3, 2.1, 4.2, 4.3, 4.4, 5.2  Analyzed 03/25/09	Bai Fangli Support Education Retrieved March 20, 2009, from <a href="http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055861.shtml">http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055861.shtml</a>
3	There was a red flag in front of Bai Fangli's pedicab. The red flag noted: the old and weak are privileged and the families of martyr are half price	Why did Mr. Bai point to the red flag? What did the red flag write?	1. Ren ai 2. Dayi 4. Xin 6. Zhi 7. Li	This photo showed that Bai Fangli contained virtues such as Li, yi, zhi, renai, and xin. 1. Bai's virtues	4.2, 5.2  Analyzed 03/25/09	Bai Fangli Support Education Tonight Evening news Retrieved March 20, 2009, from <a href="http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055861.shtml">http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055861.shtml</a>
4	Regardless of hot summer and cold winter, Bai Fangli and his pedicab is always on the road.	What did the photo show? What did the photo mean to you? What Confucian moral values did you see in the photo?	2. Dayi 4. Xin 5. Yong	This photo showed that Bai Fangli contained virtues such as dayi, and xin. 1. Bai's virtues	4.2, 5.2  Analyzed 03/25/09	Bai Fangli Support Education Tonight Evening News Retrieved March 20, 2009, from <a href="http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055873.shtml">http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055873.shtml</a>
5	Teachers and students at 78 Middle School made dumplings to celebrate together with Bai during the Chinese New Year	What did the photo show? What did the photo mean to you? What Confucian moral values did you see in the photo?	1. Ren ai	The photo showed that Bai Fangli contained virtues such as benevolence and great love  1. Bai's virtues	1.3, 4.1, 4.2, 5.2 Analyzed 03/25/09	Bai Fangli Support Education Tonight Evening News Retrieved March 20, 2009, from <a href="http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055873.shtml">http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055873.shtml</a>

Photo #	Caption of the photograph	Questions asked	Virtues	Subversive reading or Theme	Subquestions and date of analyzing	Source
6	Children at Hua Xia Future Children Arts Center celebrated a special birthday for Mr. Bai.	What did the photo show? What did the photo mean to you? What Confucian moral values did you see in the photo?	1. Ren ai	Mr. Bai celebrated his birthday for several times in his life. This was the one of the special birthday celebrations for him. 1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence	1.1, 1.3, 2.1, 4.1, 4.2, 5.2  Analyzed 03/25/09	Bai Fangli Support Education Tonight Evening News  Retrieved March 20, 2009, from <a href="http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055874.shtml">http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055874.shtml</a>
7	When Bai Fangli was tired, he took a nap. Let his pedicab take a break.	What did the photo show? What did the photo mean to you? What Confucian moral values did you see in the photo?	3. Jian 4. Xin 5. Yong	As a battle companion, His pedicab accompanied him at all times in the rain and wind. 1. Bai's virtues 4. Material and spiritual asset-pedicab	1.1, 4.2, 5.2  Analyzed 03/25/09	Bai Fangli Support Education Tonight Evening News  Retrieved March 20, 2009, from <a href="http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055874.shtml">http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055874.shtml</a>
8	Bai Fangli counted every penny and calculated how much he earned today for the children.	What did the photo show? What did the photo mean to you? What Confucian moral values did you see in the photo?	1. Ren ai 3. Jian 4. Xin 6. Zhi	Bai Fangli counted money and thought when he would be able to give to schools 1. Bai's virtues	5.2  Analyzed 03/25/09	Bai Fangli Support Education Tonight Evening New Retrieved March 20, 2009, from <a href="http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055875.shtml">http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055875.shtml</a>
9	Bai Fangli was looking at the bird.	What did the photo show? What did the photo mean to you? What Confucian moral values did you see in the photo?	1. Ren ai 3. Jian	1. Bai's virtues Bai Fangli left three 4. Material asset: a pedicab, a radio, and a singing bird.	4.2, 5.2 <i>Metro Express</i> Analyzed 03/25/09	Bai Fangli: His great love supported 300 students Retrieved March 20, 2009, from <a href="http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055853.shtml">http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055853.shtml</a>
10	Students came to visit old Bai when he was ill.	What did the photo show? What did the photo mean to you? What Confucian moral values did you see in the photo?	1. Ren ai	Bai Fangli's great love cannot express by the words. He supported 300 students. 1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence	1.3, 2.1, 5.2  Analyzed 03/25/09	Bai Fangli: His great love supported 300 students Retrieved March 20, 2009, from <a href="http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055853.shtml">http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055853.shtml</a>

Photo #	Caption of the photograph	Questions asked	Virtues	Subversive reading or Theme	Subquestions and date of analyzing	Source
11	Bai Fangli's life: his main dish was dabing wrapped with guozi, side dish was green onion dipped with sauce, and finally a bowl of wonton.	What did the photo show? What did the photo mean to you? What Confucian moral values did you see in the photo?	1. Ren ai 2. Dayi 3. Jian	Bai had never been the restaurant and had never bought a new clothe in his lifetime. He contributed his benevolence and great love to others selflessly. 1. Bai's virtues	1.1, 4.1, 5.2  Analyzed 03/25/09	Remembrance of Bai Fangli: Hardship and great love Retrieved March 20, 2009, from <a href="http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055847.shtml">http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055847.shtml</a> <i>Metro Express</i>
12	People at Da Guan Ting Country, Cang County gave Bai Fangli a plaque "a moral model for supporting education."	What did the photo show? What did the photo mean to you? What Confucian moral values did you see in the photo?	1. Ren ai 2. Dayi	Helping kids in my hometown to realize their schooling is my happiness. 1. Bai's virtues 3. Moral example	4.1, 4.4, 5.2  Analyzed 03/25/09	Remembrance of Bai Fangli: Hardship and great love Retrieved March 20, 2009, from <a href="http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055847.shtml">http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055847.shtml</a> <i>Metro Express</i>
13	When Bai Fangli sent money to Hongguang Middle School every time, students did not want him to leave.	What did the photo show? What did the photo mean to you? What Confucian moral values did you see in the photo?	1. Ren ai	Bai Fangli's selfless dedication moved students. 1. Bai's virtues	1.1, 1.2, 5.2  Analyzed 03/25/09	Remembrance of Bai Fangli: Hardship and great love Retrieved March 20, 2009, from <a href="http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055847.shtml">http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055847.shtml</a> <i>Metro Express</i>
14	Bai Fangli's deeds exhibit attracted many students to visit	What did the photo show? What did the photo mean to you? What Confucian moral values did you see in the photo?	1. Ren ai	1. Bai's virtues	1.2, 1.3  Analyzed 03/25/09	Remembrance of Bai Fangli: Hardship and great love Retrieved March 20, 2009, from <a href="http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055847.shtml">http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055847.shtml</a> <i>Metro Express</i>
15	A moral example, Bai Fangli passed away.	What did the photo show? What did the photo mean to you? What Confucian moral values did you see in the photo?	1. Ren ai 2. Dayi 3. Jian 4. Xin 5. Yong 6. Zhi	This picture showed Bai's virtues such as Ren ai. He left a lot of spiritual assets 1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence 3. Moral example	4.2, 5.2  <i>Metro Express</i> Analyzed 03/26/09	Bai has not been rest and he needs to take a rest now Retrieved March 20, 2009, from <a href="http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055814.shtml">http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055814.shtml</a>

Photo #	Caption of the photograph	Questions asked	Virtues	Subversive reading or Theme	Subquestions and date of analyzing	Source
16	Tianjin Daily-Daily News reported Bai's deeds by using two special editions of photographs on both Oct 21st and Oct 28 <sup>th</sup> in 2003.	What did the photo show? What did the photo mean to you? What Confucian moral values did you see in the photo?	1. Ren ai 2. Dayi 3. Jian 4. Xin 5. Yong 7. Li	1. Bai's virtues 3. Bai's deeds for support education led to the close attention in the Chinese society.	1.2, 4.2, 5.2 <i>Metro Express</i> Analyzed 03/26/09	Bai has not been rest and he needs to take a rest now Retrieved March 20, 2009, from <a href="http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055814.shtml">http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055814.shtml</a>
17	Bai Fangli rode his pedicab to pay the last visit of the reconstructed Yueya riverside in 2003.	What did the photo show? What did the photo mean to you? What Confucian moral values did you see in the photo?	1. Ren ai	Bai Fangli felt sad that his career was end because this was his last time to ride his pedicab. 1. Bai's virtues	5.2 <i>Metro Express</i> <i>Analyzed</i> 03/26/09	Bai has not been rest and he needs to take a rest now Retrieved March 20, 2009, from <a href="http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055814.shtml">http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055814.shtml</a>
18	Tianjin Daily-Daily News reported Bai Fangli's deeds by using two special editions of photographs on both editions Oct 21st and Oct 28 <sup>th</sup> in 2003.	What did the photo show? What did the photo mean to you? What Confucian moral values did you see in the photo?	1. Ren ai	Bai Fangli's Ren ai illuminated people around him. He has a great spirit. As a remnant candle, he will still flame til he is completely died out. 1. Bai's virtues	1.2, 5.2 <i>Meirixin Bao</i> <i>Analyzed</i> 03/26/09	Bai has not been rest and he needs to take a rest now Retrieved March 20, 2009, from <a href="http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055814.shtml">http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055814.shtml</a>
19	Family photo of Bai Fangli in 1961	What did the photo show? What did the photo mean to you? What Confucian moral values did you see in the photo?	8. Li	Bai Fangli was 48 in 1961. He had pedaled his pedicab for 17 years. 1. Bai's virtues	1.1, 1.3, 2.1, 5.2 <i>Meirixin Bao</i> <i>Analyzed</i> 03/26/09	Bai has not been rest and he needs to take a rest now Retrieved March 20, 2009, from <a href="http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055814.shtml">http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055814.shtml</a>
20	Bai Fangli sent his son to join the army in 1971.	What did the photo show? What did the photo mean to you? What Confucian moral values did you see in the photo?	1. Ren 2. Dayi	When he was 58, Bai Fangli sent his son to join the army. It showed his dayi to his country, and his ren ai in the late years of his life. 1. Bai's virtues	1.1, 5.2 <i>Meirixin Bao</i> <i>Analyzed</i> 03/26/09	Bai has not been rest and he needs to take a rest now Retrieved March 20, 2009, from <a href="http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055814.shtml">http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055814.shtml</a>

Photo #	Caption of the photograph	Questions asked	Virtues	Subversive reading or Theme	Subquestions and date of analyzing	Source
21	Bai Fangli at old house in Hebei District in 1978.	What did the photo show? What did the photo mean to you? What Confucian moral values did you see in the photo?	3. Jian	Bai Fangli had pedaled his pedicab for 34 years in 1978. This photo showed his virtue of Jian. 1. Bai's virtues 4. Material and spiritual asset-pedicab	1.1, 5.2 <i>Meirixin Bao Analyzed</i> 03/26/09	Bai has not been rest and he needs to take a rest now Retrieved March 20, 2009, from <a href="http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055814.shtml">http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055814.shtml</a>
22	Bai Fangli attended National Rolemodel for Supporting Education Conference in Beijing.	What did the photo show? What did the photo mean to you? What Confucian moral values did you see in the photo?	1. Ren ai 2. Dayi	Bai Fangli was honored to attend national role model for Support Education Conference in Beijing. 1. Bai's virtues 3. Moral example	1.1, 4.4, 5.2 <i>Meirixin Bao Analyzed</i> 03/26/09	Bai has not been rest and he needs to take a rest now Retrieved March 20, 2009, from <a href="http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055814.shtml">http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055814.shtml</a>
23	His son and daughter looked at Bai Fangli's portrait and recalled their fathers' selfless dedication to others and the society.	What did the photo show? What did the photo mean to you? What Confucian moral values did you see in the photo?	1. Ren ai 2. Dayi	Bai contributed himself to others with benevolence and great love. His children looked at his father's portrait and recalled him 1. Bai's virtues	1.3, 4.2, 5.2 <i>Meirixin Bao Analyzed</i> 03/26/09	Bai has not been rest and he needs to take a rest now Retrieved March 20, 2009, from <a href="http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055814.shtml">http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055814.shtml</a>
24	Crowds all circles had deep feelings of grief for Mr. Bai at his memorial meeting.	What did the photo show? What did the photo mean to you? What Confucian moral values did you see in the photo?	1. Ren ai 2. Dayi 3. Jian 4. Xin 5. Yong	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence	1.3, 4.1, 5.2 <i>Meirixin Bao Analyzed</i> 03/26/09	Say good-bye to Bai Fangli Retrieved March 20, 2009, from <a href="http://news.sohu.com/20050926/n227062355.shtml">http://news.sohu.com/20050926/n227062355.shtml</a>
25	Crowds all circles had deep feelings of grief for Mr. Bai at his memorial meeting.	What did the photo show? What did the photo mean to you? What Confucian moral values did you see in the photo?	1. Ren ai	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence	1.3, 4.1, 5.2 <i>Meirixin Bao Analyzed</i> 03/26/09	Say good-bye to Bai Fangli Retrieved March 20, 2009, from <a href="http://news.sohu.com/20050926/n227062355.shtml">http://news.sohu.com/20050926/n227062355.shtml</a>



Photo #	Caption of the photograph	Questions asked	Virtues	Subversive reading or Theme	Subquestions and date of analyzing	Source
26	A man organized Bai Fangli's deeds from newspapers into 10 meters length of newspaper clipping.	What did the photo show? What did the photo mean to you? What Confucian moral values did you see in the photo?	1. Ren ai	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence	1.2, 1.3, 4.1, 5.2 <i>Meirixin Bao Analyzed</i> 03/26/09	Let Grandpa Bai look at his home again Retrieved March 20, 2009, from <a href="http://news.sohu.com/20050926/n227062300.shtml">http://news.sohu.com/20050926/n227062300.shtml</a>
27	Tianjin citizens had deep feelings of grief for Mr. Bai.	What did the photo show? What did the photo mean to you? What Confucian moral values did you see in the photo?	1. Ren ai	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence	1.3, 4.1, 5.2 <i>Meirixin Bao Analyzed</i> 03/26/09	Let Grandpa Bai look at his home again Retrieved March 20, 2009, from <a href="http://news.sohu.com/20050926/n227062300.shtml">http://news.sohu.com/20050926/n227062300.shtml</a>
28	Tibetan students whom Bai Fangli supported at Hongguang Middle School also said goodbye to Mr. Bai.	What did the photo show? What did the photo mean to you? What Confucian moral values did you see in the photo?	1. Ren ai	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence	1.3, 4.1, 5.2 <i>Meirixin Bao Analyzed</i> 03/26/09	Let Grandpa Bai look at his home again Retrieved March 20, 2009, from <a href="http://news.sohu.com/20050926/n227062300.shtml">http://news.sohu.com/20050926/n227062300.shtml</a>
29	Millions of people said good bye to Mr. Bai.	What did the photo show? What did the photo mean to you? What Confucian moral values did you see in the photo?	1. Ren ai	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence	1.3, 4.1, 5.2 <i>Meirixin Bao Analyzed</i> 03/26/09	Thousands of people said good-bye to Bai Retrieved March 20, 2009, from <a href="http://news.sohu.com/20050926/n227062268.shtml">http://news.sohu.com/20050926/n227062268.shtml</a>
30	Public bus and taxi drivers sent citizen to say good bye to Mr. Bai for free.	What did the photo show? What did the photo mean to you? What Confucian moral values did you see in the photo?	1. Ren ai	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence	1.3, 4.1, 5.2 <i>Meirixin Bao Analyzed</i> 03/26/09	Public bus send citizens to Bai funeral for free Retrieved March 20, 2009, from <a href="http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055586.shtml">http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055586.shtml</a>
31	Grandpa Bai, love us, don't go!	What did the photo show? What did the photo mean to you? What Confucian moral values did you see in the photo?	1. Ren ai	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence	1.3, 4.1, 5.2 <i>Meirixin Bao Analyzed</i> 03/26/09	Grandpa Bai, love us, don't go! Retrieved March 20, 2009, from <a href="http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055565.shtml">http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055565.shtml</a>

Photo #	Caption of the photograph	Questions asked	Virtues	Subversive reading or Theme	Subquestions and date of analyzing	Source
32	A little boy touched the portrait of Grandpa Bai and cried. His mother cried as well.	What did the photo show? What did the photo mean to you? What Confucian moral values did you see in the photo?	1. Ren ai	If one has read about Bai's deeds, she would have moved by his benevolence and great love. 1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence	1.3, 4.1. 5.2 <i>Enorth Analyzed</i> 03/26/09	Remembrance of Bai Fangli Retrieved March 20, 2009, from <a href="http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055550.shtml">http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055550.shtml</a>
33	The representatives of students said good byes to deceased Mr. Bai's body.	What did the photo show? What did the photo mean to you? What Confucian moral values did you see in the photo?	1. Ren ai	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence	1.3, 4.1. 5.2 <i>Enorth Analyzed</i> 03/26/09	Remembrance of Bai Fangli Retrieved March 20, 2009, from <a href="http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055550.shtml">http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227055550.shtml</a>
34	Students at Yaohua Middle School showed their grief to Mr. Bai	What did the photo show? What did the photo mean to you? What Confucian moral values did you see in the photo?	1. Ren ai	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence	1.3, 4.1. 5.2 <i>Enorth Analyzed</i> 03/26/09	Tianjin people were saddened about Bai's death Retrieved February 26, 2009, from <a href="http://big5.xinhuanet.com/gate/big5/news.xinhuanet.com/photo/2005-09/25/content_3540687.htm">http://big5.xinhuanet.com/gate/big5/news.xinhuanet.com/photo/2005-09/25/content_3540687.htm</a>
35	An old man, Bai Fangli	What did the photo show? What did the photo mean to you? What Confucian moral values did you see in the photo?	1. Ren ai 2. Dayi 4. Xin	1. Bai's virtues	1.3, 4.2, 5.2 <i>Xinhua Net Analyzed</i> 03/26/09	Deceased Bai supported more than 300 students in need of support Retrieved March 14, 2009, from <a href="http://big5.xinhuanet.com/gate/big5/news.xinhuanet.com/politics/2005-09/23/content_3531337.htm">http://big5.xinhuanet.com/gate/big5/news.xinhuanet.com/politics/2005-09/23/content_3531337.htm</a>
36	A handicapped person Gong Yingjie showed his condolence to Mr. Bai.	What did the photo show? What did the photo mean to you? What Confucian moral values did you see in the photo?	1. Ren ai	A handicapped person Gong Yingjie has been influenced by Mr. Bai and done good deeds for the society. 1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence	2.1, 4.2, 5.2 <i>Enorth Analyzed</i> 03/26/09	Bai Fangli's funeral Retrieved March 20, 2009, from <a href="http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227051853.shtml">http://news.sohu.com/20050925/n227051853.shtml</a>

Photo #	Caption of the photograph	Questions asked	Virtues	Subversive reading or Theme	Subquestions and date of analyzing	Source
37	People showed respect to Bai Fangli's monument	What did the photo show? What did the photo mean to you? What Confucian moral values did you see in the photo?	1. Ren ai	People want to remember Mr. Bai. Thus, the Chinese built a monument for him to pay visit every year. 1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence 3. Moral example	1.2, 4.1, 5.2 <i>Enorth Analyzed</i> 03/28/09	Bai Fangli's monument was completed for a year Retrieved March 21, 2009 from <a href="http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2006/11/13/001460497.shtml">http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2006/11/13/001460497.shtml</a>
38	Bai Fangli's son sent flowers to his father's monument.	What did the photo show? What did the photo mean to you? What Confucian moral values did you see in the photo?	1. Ren ai 8. Li	Bai Guofu showed respect to his father's monument. 1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence	1.3 <i>Enorth Analyzed</i> 03/28/09	Bai Fangli's monument was completed for a year Retrieved March 21, 2009 from <a href="http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2006/11/13/001460497.shtml">http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2006/11/13/001460497.shtml</a>
39	Bai Fangli's monument surrounded with flowers.	What did the photo show? What did the photo mean to you? What Confucian moral values did you see in the photo?	1. Ren ai	Bai Fangli's monument is a symbol to show his benevolence and great love. 1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence	1.3, 4.2, 5.2 <i>Enorth Analyzed</i> 03/28/09	Bai Fangli's monument was completed for a year Retrieved March 21, 2009 from <a href="http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2006/11/13/001460497.shtml">http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2006/11/13/001460497.shtml</a>
40	Bai Fangli's memorial activity site	What did the photo show? What did the photo mean to you? What Confucian moral values did you see in the photo?	1. Ren ai	Bai Fangli's benevolence and great love attracted strangers to visit his monument. 1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence	1.3, 4.1, 5.2 <i>Enorth Analyzed</i> 03/28/09	Bai Fangli's monument was completed for a year Retrieved March 21, 2009 from <a href="http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2006/11/13/001460497.shtml">http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2006/11/13/001460497.shtml</a>
41	A teacher and a student at Nankai University visited Grandpa Bai.	What did the photo show? What did the photo mean to you? What Confucian moral values did you see in the photo?	1. Ren ai	A Nankai doctoral candidate whom Mr. Bai supported felt that helping others is his happiness. 1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence	1.3, 2.1, 4.1, 5.2 <i>Enorth Analyzed</i> 03/26/09	Aixin carried Bai's virtues and leadership Retrieved March 14, 2009, from <a href="http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2004/04/20/000771447.shtml">http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2004/04/20/000771447.shtml</a>

Photo #	Caption of the photograph	Questions asked	Virtues	Subversive reading or Theme	Subquestions and date of analyzing	Source
42	Medical expert in Tianjin is checking Mr. Bai's health.	What did the photo show? What did the photo mean to you? What Confucian moral values did you see in the photo?	1. Ren ai	Bai Fangli's benevolence and great love moved China. 1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence	1.3, 5.2 <i>Enorth Analyzed</i> 03/26/09	Aixin carried Bai's virtues and leadership Retrieved March 14, 2009, from <a href="http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2004/04/20/000771447.shtml">http://news.enorth.com.cn/system/2004/04/20/000771447.shtml</a>
43	Mr. Bai took a photo with six students whom he supported at Yaohua Middle School	What did the photo mean to you? What Confucian moral values did you see in the photo?	1. Ren ai	Mr. Bai looked happy and kind. He showed fatherly love to these students. 1. Bai's virtues	4.3, 4.4 <i>Metro Express</i>  Analyzed 04/01/09	The picture recorded Bai to support education Retrieved January 26, 2009, from <a href="http://news.big5.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/06/10/001043198.shtml">http://news.big5.enorth.com.cn/system/2005/06/10/001043198.shtml</a>

Table 4-4 A Synthesis of Data from Eight Videoclips

Videoclip #	Name or Description of the Video	Questions Asked	Virtues	Subversive Reading or Theme	Important quotes or contents	Subquestions and date of analyzing	Source
1	Selfless dedication of Bai Fangli: A monument carried on the wheels of a pedicab	What honors did the video show? What his records for supporting education did the video show? What photographs did you see in the video?	1. Ren ai 2. Jian 4. Yong	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence 3. Moral Example	Bai Fangli's honors and his records to support education	1.1, 1.2, 1.3, 4.1, 4.2, 4.3, 5.2  Analyzed 03/29/09	<a href="http://v.youku.com/v_show/id_cb00XMTI30DY5ODA.html">http://v.youku.com/v_show/id_cb00XMTI30DY5ODA.html</a>
2	Bai Fangli: An old man deserve respect Bai Fangli was nominated for Who moved China annual award in 2004.	What direct quotes from Bai Fangli did you see in the video? What direct quotes from Bai jinfeng did you see in the video? What direct quotes from Bai Guofu did you see in the video?	1. Ren ai 2. Jian 3. Dayi 4. Yong 5. Zhi 6. Xin 7. Li	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence: 3. Moral Example	"I ask them to work for the country, and contribute themselves to the country. Without eating and drinking, I have to support education."	1.1, 3.1, 3.2, 4.1, 4.2, 5.2  Analyzed 03/29/09	Retrieved March 23, 2009, from <a href="http://v.youku.com/v_show/id_ca00XMTI3NjQ5MDQ=.html">http://v.youku.com/v_show/id_ca00XMTI3NjQ5MDQ=.html</a>
3	Great love: Commemoration of Grandpa Bai Fangli	What quotations from Bai did you see in the video? What Confucian virtues did you see in the video?	1. Ren ai 2. Jian 3 Zhi 4. Yong 6 Dayi 7. Xin	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence:	"If there is an eternity, I will pedal my pedicab to contribute my love for the youth."	1.1, 1.3, 3.1, 4.1, 5.2  Analyzed 03/29/09	<a href="http://tag.tudou.com/%E7%99%BD%E8%8A%B3%E7%A4%BC">http://tag.tudou.com/%E7%99%BD%E8%8A%B3%E7%A4%BC</a>

Videoclip #	Name or Description of the Video	Questions Asked	Virtues	Subversive Reading or Theme	Important quotes or contents	Subquestions and date of analyzing	Source
4	The Movie of Bai Fangli	What quotations from Li Jialun did you see in the video? What is the main idea in the video? What quotes from Bai Guofu did you see in the video?	1. Ren ai	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence	Li Jialun said, "The reason to make this movie is that Bai Fangli's spirit moves me. To make this movie is to refine my spirit and enrich my life."	1.3, 2.1, 4.2, 5.2  Analyzed 03/29/09  Metro Report 60 minutes	<a href="http://video.gougou.com/search?s=%E7%99%BD%E8%8A%B3%E7%A4%BC&amp;id=1000002">http://video.gougou.com/search?s=%E7%99%BD%E8%8A%B3%E7%A4%BC&amp;id=1000002</a>
5	The Movie of Bai Fangli	What quotations from Li Jialun did you see in the video? What is the main idea in the video? What quotes from Bai Guofu did you see in the video?	1. Ren ai	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence	Tianjin News 12:00 Report The third anniversary after Bai's death	1.3, 4.2, 5.2  Analyzed 03/29/09	<a href="http://you.video.sina.com.cn/b/1642002-1291279920.html">http://you.video.sina.com.cn/b/1642002-1291279920.html</a>
6	Bai Fangli's life	What photographs or words did you see in the video? What is the main idea in the video? What Confucian virtues did you see in the video?	1. Ren ai 2. Jian	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence: 3. Moral example 4. pedicab	"I am no longer pedaling. This is my last contribution."	1.1, 1.2, 1.3, 4.2, 5.2  Analyzed 03/29/09	<a href="http://v.youku.com/v_show/id_XmjIzNjQ4MjA=.html">http://v.youku.com/v_show/id_XmjIzNjQ4MjA=.html</a>
7	Bai Fangli Primary School was established at Bai Fangli's hometown	What is the main idea in the video? What Confucian virtues did you see in the video?	1. Ren ai 3. Dayi	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence	Bai Xiqian said, "Bai Fangli sent his first contribution to our school. 5,000 RMB was a huge amount of money at that time. I felt that its significance is more than the money itself."	1.1, 1.2, 1.3, 3.1, 5.2  Analyzed 03/29/09	<a href="http://you.video.sina.com.cn/b/17264418-1291279920.html">http://you.video.sina.com.cn/b/17264418-1291279920.html</a>
8	Bai Fangli	What is the main idea in the video? What epiphanies did you see in the video? What Confucian virtues did you see in the video?	1. Ren ai	Bai Fangli was more extraordinary than others. 1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's influence	"I was no longer pedaling. This is my last contribution."	1.1, 1.2, 1.3, 3.1, 5.2  Analyzed 03/29/09	<a href="http://www.tudou.com/programs/view/GGMuyYBWFMA/">http://www.tudou.com/programs/view/GGMuyYBWFMA/</a>

Table 4-5 An Illustration of Interview Codes for Individuals Not Close to Bai Fangli

INTERVIEW QUESTION CODE	SUB CODE	INTERVIEW QUESTION #
BLENDING LIFE AND LEADERSHIP	BLL	1
BLL: LEARN ABOUT MR. BAI	BLL: LENMB	1.1
BLL: YOUR RELATIONSHIP WITH MR. BAI	BLL: YOURELWMB	1.2
BLL: TELL ME ABOUT MR. BAI	BLL: TELMEMB	1.3
BLL: YOUR EXPERIENCE WITH MR. BAI	BLL: YOUEXPWMB	1.4
BLL: YOUR PERCEPTION OF MR. BAI	BLL: YOUPECMB	1.5
BLL: MR. BAI'S STORIES	BLL: MBSTY	1.6
BLL: OTHER STORIES	BLL: OTHSTY	1.6.1
BLL: STORY INVOLVING MR. BAI INFLUENCED OTHERS	BLL: STYMBINFOTHR	1.7
BLL: WHAT IS THE STORY	BLL: WHSTY	1.7.1
BLL: WHAT OTHER STORIES INVOLVING MR. BAI	BLL: OTHSTYINVMB	1.7.2
BLL: YOUR PERCEPTION OF MR. BAI HAS CHANGED SINCE HIS DEATH	BLL: YOUPECMBCHGSINDETH	1.8
BLL: TELL ME MR. BAI'S LEADERSHIP TO THE CHINESE SOCIETY	BLL: MBLEADCHNSOCTY	1.9
BLL: WHY MR. BAI HAS LEADERSHIP	BLL: WHYMBHASLEAD	1.10
LEADERSHIP IMPACTING LIVES OF OTHER INDIVIDUALS	LILOI	2
LILOI: MR BAI CHANGED YOUR PHILOSOPHIES OF LIFE AND VALUE	LILOI: MBCHGYOUPHILLIFVAL	2.1
LILOI: IF MR. BAI HAD, HOW	LILOI: IFMBHADHOW	2.1.1
LILOI:IF MR BAI COMPARE TO CONFUCIAN SAGE	LILOI: IFMBCOMPCONFUSAGE	2.2

<b>INTERVIEW QUESTION CODE</b>	<b>SUB CODE</b>	<b>INTERVIEW QUESTION #</b>
EPIPHANIES INFLUENCE MR. BAI'S ACTIONS	EIMBA	3
EIMBA: EVENTS ARE IMPORTANT IN MR. BAI'S LIFE	EIMBA:EVIMPMBLIF	3.1
EIMBA:WHY THESE EVENTS ARE IMPORTANT	EIMBA: WHYEVIMP	3.1.1
EIMBA: THESE EVENTS ARE IMPORTANT TO OTHERS	EIMBA: EVIMPOTHR	3.2
EIMBA: WHY	EIMBA: WHY	3.2.1
EIMBA: WHO ARE OTHERS	EIMBA: WHOOTHR	3.2.2
EIMBA:WHY DID MR. BAI DECIDE TO PEDAL AGAIN WHEN HE WAS 74	EIMBA: WHYMBPEDAGN74	3.3
MR. BAI'S INFLUENCE COMING FROM	MBICF	4
MBICF: WHY DO YOU THINK MR. BAI HAD THIS DRIVE TO ASSIST STUDENTS	MBICF: WHYMBHADDRIASSSTD	4.1
MBICF: HOW WOULD YOU DESCRIBE MR. BAI'S INFLUENCE	MBICF: HOWYOUDSBMBINF	4.2
MBICF: MR. BAI'S VISION	MBICF: MBVISN	4.3
MBICF: WHAT DID MR. BAI DO TO PROVE HIS INFLUENCE	MBICF: MBPRVHISINF	4.4
MBICF: DID MR. BAI INFLUENCE YOU	MBICF: MBINFYOU	4.5
MSICF: HOW	MSICF: HOW	4.5.1
MSICF: GIVE EXAMPLES	MSICF: GIVEXAMP	4.5.2
MSICF: LEGACY	MSICF: LEGCY	4.6
MSICF: WHERE DID MR. BAI'S INFLUENCE COME FROM	MSICF: WHRMBINFCOMFRM	4.7
MR. BAI'S BELIEF STRUCTURE	MBBS	5
MBBS: TRADITIONAL CONFUCIAN MORAL VALUES MR. BAI DEMONSTRATED	MBBS: CONFVALMBDEM	5.1
MBBS: TRADITIONAL CONFUCIAN MORAL VALUES INFLUENCED MR. BAI'S ACTIONS	MBBS: CONFVALINFMBACT	5.2

<b>INTERVIEW QUESTION CODE</b>	<b>SUB CODE</b>	<b>INTERVIEW QUESTION #</b>
MBBS: CONFUCIAN MORAL VALUES IS MR. BAI'S BELIEF STRUCTURE	MBBS: CONFVALMBBELFSTR	5.3
MBBS: WHY	MBBS: WHY	5.3.1
MBBS: THE CHARACTERISTICS OF MR. BAI YOU ADMIRE	MBBS: CHAMBYOADM	5.4
MBBS: YOUR PERSPECTIVE OF MR. BAI'S BELIEF STRUCTURE	MBBS: YOUESPCTVMBBELFSTR	5.5
MBBS: MR. BAI'S BELIEF STRUCTURE ASSISTED HIS LIFE JOURNEY	MBBS: MBBELFSTRASTHISLJFNY	5.6
MBBS: ONE OR TWO EXAMPLES	MBBS: EXAMP	5.6.1

Table 4-6 An Illustration of Interview Codes for Individuals Close to Bai Fangli

<b>INTERVIEW QUESTION CODE</b>	<b>SUB CODE</b>	<b>INTERVIEW QUESTION #</b>
BLENDING LIFE AND LEADERSHIP	BLL	1
BLL: YOUR RELATIONSHIP WITH MR. BAI	BLL: YOURELWMB	1.1
BLL: TELL ME ABOUT MR. BAI	BLL: TELMEMB	1.2
BLL: YOUR EXPERIENCE WITH MR. BAI	BLL: YOUEXPWMB	1.3
BLL: YOUR PERCEPTION OF MR. BAI	BLL: YOUPECMB	1.4
BLL: DESCRIBE MR. BAI'S DAILY LIFE	BLL: MBDALYLIF	1.5
BLL: MR. BAI'S STORIES	BLL: MBSTY	1.6
BLL: OTHER STORIES	BLL: OTHSTY	1.6.1
BLL: STORY INVOLVING MR. BAI INFLUENCED OTHERS	BLL: STYMBINFOTHR	1.7
BLL: WHAT IS THE STORY	BLL: WHSTY	1.7.1
BLL: WHAT OTHER STORIES INVOLVING MR. BAI	BLL: OTHSTYINVMB	1.7.2
BLL: MR. BAI'S CHILDHOOD, FAMILY BACKGROUND, AND RELATIONSHIPS WITH HIS PARENTS	BLL: MBCHLDHOOD	1.8



<b>INTERVIEW QUESTION CODE</b>	<b>SUB CODE</b>	<b>INTERVIEW QUESTION #</b>
BLL: CHILD EXPERIENCE INFLUENCED MR. BAI ACTIONS AS AN ADULT	BLL: CHDEXPINFMBACTADLT	1.9
BLL: YOUR PERCEPTION OF MR. BAI HAS CHANGED SINCE HIS DEATH	BLL: YOUPECMBCHGSINDETH	1.10
BLL: TELL ME THE DIFFERENCES	BLL: TELMEDIF	1.10.1
BLL: TELL ME MR. BAI'S LEADERSHIP TO THE CHINESE SOCIETY	BLL: MBLEADCHNSOCTY	1.11
BLL: WHY MR. BAI HAS LEADERSHIP	BLL: WHYMBHASLEAD	1.12
LEADERSHIP IMPACTING LIVES OF OTHER INDIVIDUALS	LILOI	2
LILOI: ROLES MR. BAI PLAY IN HIS LIFE	LILOI: ROLMBPLYHISLIF	2.1
LILOI: MR BAI CHANGED YOUR PHILOSOPHIES OF LIFE AND VALUE	LILOI: MBCHGYOUPHILLIFVAL	2.2
LILOI: IF MR. BAI HAD, HOW	LILOI: IFMBHADHOW	2.2.1
LILOI:IF MR BAI COMPARE TO SAGE	LILOI: MBCOMPSAGE	2.3
EIPHANIES INFLUENCE MR. BAI'S ACTIONS	EIMBA	3
EIMBA: EVENTS ARE IMPORTANT IN MR. BAI'S LIFE	EIMBA:EVIMPMBLIF	3.1
EIMBA:WHY THESE EVENTS ARE IMPORTANT	EIMBA: WHYEVIMP	3.1.1
EIMBA: MR. BAI TALKING ABOUT HIS LIFE EVENTS TO YOU	EIMBA: MBTKLIFEVTYOU	3.2
EIMBA: IF HE HAD, WHAT DID HE SAY	EIMBA: WHTHESAIID	3.2.1
EIMBA: THESE EVENTS ARE IMPORTANT TO HIM	EIMBA: EVTIMPHIM	3.3
EIMBA: WHY	EIMBA: WHY	3.3.1
EIMBA: THESE EVENTS ARE IMPORTANT TO OTHERS	EIMBA: EVIMPOTH	3.4
EIMBA: WHY	EIMBA: WHY	3.4.1
EIMBA: WHO ARE OTHERS	EIMBA: WHOOTH	3.4.2

<b>INTERVIEW QUESTION CODE</b>	<b>SUB CODE</b>	<b>INTERVIEW QUESTION #</b>
EIMBA:WHY DID MR. BAI DECIDE TO PEDAL AGAIN WHEN HE WAS 74	EIMBA: WHYMBPEDAGA74	3.5
EIMBA: REGARDING HIS DECISION, WHAT DID HE SAY?	EIMBA: WHTHESAIDABTHISDECSN	3.6
MR. BAI'S INFLUENCE COMING FROM	MBICF	4
MBICF: WHY DO YOU THINK MR. BAI HAD THIS DRIVE TO ASSIST STUDENTS	MBICF: WHYMBHADDRIASSSTD	4.1
MBICF: HOW WOULD YOU DESCRIBE MR. BAI'S INFLUENCE	MBICF: HOWYOUDSBMBINF	4.2
MBICF: MR. BAI'S VISION	MBICF: MBVISN	4.3
MBICF: WHAT DID MR. BAI DO TO PROVE HIS INFLUENCE	MBICF: MBPRVHISINF	4.4
MBICF: DID MR. BAI INFLUENCE YOU	MBICF: MBINFYOU	4.5
MSICF: HOW	MSICF: HOW	4.5.1
MSICF: GIVE EXAMPLES	MSICF: GIVEXAMP	4.5.2
MSICF: LEGACY	MSICF: LEGCY	4.6
MSICF: WHERE DID MR. BAI'S INFLUENCE COME FROM	MSICF: WHRMBINFCOMFRM	4.7
MR. BAI'S BELIEF STRUCTURE	MBBS	5
MBBS: TRADITIONAL CONFUCIAN MORAL VALUES MR. BAI DEMONSTRATED	MBBS: CONFVALMBDEM	5.1
MBBS: TRADITIONAL CONFUCIAN MORAL VALUES INFLUENCED MR. BAI'S ACTIONS	MBBS: CONFVALINFMBACT	5.2
MBBS: CONFUCIAN MORAL VALUES IS MR. BAI'S BELIEF STRUCTURE	MBBS: CONFVALMBBELFSTR	5.3
MBBS: WHY	MBBS: WHY	5.3.1
MBBS: THE CHARACTERISTICS OF MR. BAI YOU ADMIRE	MBBS: CHAMBYOADM	5.4
MBBS: YOUR PERSPECTIVE OF MR. BAI'S BELIEF STRUCTURE	MBBS: YOUPEPCTVMBBELFSTR	5.5
MBBS: MR. BAI'S BELIEF STRUCTURE ASSISTED HIS LIFE JOURNEY	MBBS: MBBELFSTRASTHISLFJNY	5.6

INTERVIEW QUESTION CODE	SUB CODE	INTERVIEW QUESTION #
MBBS: ONE OR TWO EXAMPLES	MBBS: EXAMP	5.6.1

Table 4-11 Emerging Interview Themes and Sub Virtue Themes from Each Participant

Subject Code	Subject Name	Themes	Virtues
QLBFLS0901D	Bai Guofu	Support education, benevolent father, Bai's influence, material assets	Ren ai, Qin, xin, zhi, Jian, Li
QLBFLS0902D	Bai Jinfeng	Do good deeds and collect virtues, Bai's influence	Ren ai, Jian, Qin
QLBFLS0903D	Bai Huanyi	Helping others is my happiness, Strict father, benevolent father, Support education	Jian, Zhi, Ren, Li, Qin
QLBFLS0904D	Bai Guoran	Hardship in Bai's childhood, Bai's influence	Dayi, Jian, Ren, xin, zhi
QLBFLS0905D	Xu Xiuqin	material assets—pedicab,	Jian, xin, zhi, Li
QLBFLS0906D	Bai Song	Bai's influence, Support education	Jian, Qin
QLBFLS0907D	Bai Xiqian	Charisma, Helping others is my happiness, Bai's influence to others, moral example	Ren ai, Qin, Jian, zhi
QLBFLS0951F	Sun Yuying	moral example, Bai's influence to others, Do good deeds, Carry on Bai's spirit, Bai's influence to Sun	Dayi, xin, zhi, Ren ai, Li, Jian
QLBFLS0952F	Xu Qiming	Bai's deeds, moral example, Support education, patriot, Simple and noble worker, Bai's influence, Spiritual assets	Jian, Li, Ren ai, Dayi, xin, zhi, Qin, yong, harmony
QLBFLS09101O	Li Jialun	Bai's deeds, Support education, moral example, Bai's influence, Helping others is my happiness, Education can reduce poverty and make country stronger, Spiritual assets	Ren ai, Jian, Dayi
QLBFLS09102O	Li Li	moral example, Charisma, Bai's influence, Material asset—pedicab, Bai's deeds, Virtues	Ren ai
QLBFLS09103O	Chen Zhaoxiang	Bai's influence, moral example, charisma, carry on Bai's spirit	Ren ai, Jian

Table 4-12 Emerging Interview Themes and Sub Virtue Themes from Each Interview

Question

Interview Question Sub Code	Emerging Themes for 12 Participants	Emerging Virtues for 12 Participants
BLL: LENMB	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's deeds for support education 3. Bai's influence 4. Moral example	1. Ren ai 2. Zhi 3. Jian 4. Dayi 5. Xin 6. Li
BLL: YOURELWMB	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's deeds for support education 3. Bai's influence	6. Li
BLL: TELMEMB	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's deeds for support education 3. Bai's influence 4. Moral example 5. Patriot 7. Helping others is my happiness	1. Ren ai 2. Zhi 3. Jian 4. Dayi 5. Xin 6. Li
BLL: YOUEXPWMB	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's deeds for support education 3. Bai's influence 4. Moral example	1. Ren ai 2. Zhi 3. Jian 5. Xin 6. Li
BLL: YOUPECMB	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's deeds for support education 3. Bai's influence 4. Moral example 5. Patriot 7. Helping others is my happiness	1. Ren ai 2. Zhi 3. Jian 4. Dayi 5. Xin 6. Li
BLL: MBDALYLIF	1. Bai's virtues	3. Jian
BLL: MBSTY	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's deeds for support education 3. Bai's influence 4. Moral example 5. Patriot 7. Helping others is my happiness	1. Ren ai 2. Zhi 3. Jian 5. Xin 7. Yong
BLL: OTHSTY	1. Bai's virtues 3. Bai's influence 4. Moral example 6. Material and spiritual asset-pedicab	1. Ren 3. Jian
BLL: STYMBINFOTHR	1. Bai's virtues 3. Bai's influence 4. Moral example	1. Ren 3. Jian
BLL: WHSTY	1. Bai's virtues 3. Bai's influence 4. Moral example 6. Material and spiritual asset-pedicab	1. Ren ai
BLL: OTHSTYINVMB	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's deeds for support education 3. Bai's influence 6. Material and spiritual asset-pedicab	1. Ren ai 2. Zhi 5. Xin
BLL: CHDEXPINFMBACTADLT	1. Bai's virtues 7. Helping others is my happiness	1. Ren

Interview Question Sub Code	Emerging Themes for 12 Participants	Emerging Virtues for 12 Participants
BLL: YOUPECMBCHGSINDETH	1. Bai's virtues 4. Moral example	1. Ren ai 7. Yong
BLL: MBLEADCHNSOCTY	1. Bai's virtues 3. Bai's influence 4. Moral example	1. Ren ai
BLL: WHYMBHASLEAD	3. Bai's influence 4. Moral example	
LILOI: ROLMBPLYHISLIF	1. Bai's virtues	1. Ren 6. Li
LILOI: MBCHGYOUPHILLIFVAL	1. Bai's virtues 3. Bai's influence	2. Zhi
LILOI: IFMBHADHOW	1. Bai's virtues 3. Bai's influence 4. Moral example	1. Ren ai 3. Jian 4. Dayi
LILOI: IFMBCOMPRCONFUSAGE	1. Bai's virtues 3. Bai's influence 5. Patriot	1. Ren ai
EIMBA: EVIMPMBLIF	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's deeds for support education	1. Ren ai 2. Zhi
EIMBA: WHYEVIMP	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's deeds for support education	1. Ren ai
EIMBA: WHATDIDHESAY	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's deeds for support education	1. Ren ai 6. Li
EIMBA: WHY	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's deeds for support education	1. Ren ai
EIMBA: WHOOTHR	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's deeds for support education	1. Ren ai
EIMBA: WHYMBPEDAGN74	1. Bai's virtues	1. Ren ai 2. Zhi 5. Xin
EIMBA: WHATDIDHESAYTU	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's deeds for support education	2. Zhi
MBICF: WHYMBHADDRIASSSTD	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's deeds for support education	2. Zhi 4. Dayi
MBICF: HOWYOUSBMBINF	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's deeds for support education 4. Moral example	1. Ren ai
MBICF: MBVISN	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's deeds for support education	1. Ren ai
MBICF: MBPROVHISINF	1. Bai's virtues 3. Bai's influence	1. Ren ai
MBICF: MBINFYOU	1. Bai's virtues 3. Bai's influence	1. Ren ai 2. Zhi 3. Jian 4. Dayi 5. Xin

Interview Question Sub Code	Emerging Themes for 12 Participants	Emerging Virtues for 12 Participants
MBICF: HOW	2. Bai's deeds for support education 3. Bai's influence	
MBICF: GIVEXAMP	3. Bai's influence	
MBICF: LEGCY	6. Material and spiritual asset- pedicab	
MBICF: WHRMBINFCOMFRM	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's deeds for support education 4. Moral example	1. Ren ai
MBBS: CONFVALMBDEM	1. Bai's virtues	1. Ren ai 2. Zhi 4. Dayi 7. Yong
MBBS: CONFVALINFMBACT	1. Bai's virtues	1. Ren ai 4. Dayi
MBBS: WHY	1. Bai's virtues 5. Patriot	1. Ren ai 4. Dayi
MBBS: CHAMBYOADM	1. Bai's virtues	1. Ren ai 2. Zhi 3. Jian 5. Xin
MBBS: YOUPESPCTVMBBELFSTR	1. Bai's virtues 2. Bai's deeds for support education	1. Ren Ai
MBBS: MBBELFSTRASTHISLFJNY	1. Bai's virtues 5. Patriot	2. Zhi 4. Dayi

Table 4-13 Four Emerging Interview Themes from Interviews with 12 Subjects

Interview Questions Sub Code	Emerging Themes from 12 Participants
LENMB, YOURELWMB, TELMEMB, YOUEXPWMB, MBDAILYLIF, MBSTY, OTHSTY, STYMBINFOTHR, WHSTY, OTHSTYINVMB, CHDEXPINFMBACTADLT, YOUPECMBCHGSINDETH, MBLEADCHNSOCTY, ROLMBPLYHISLIF, MBCHGYOUPHILLIFVAL, IFMBHADHOW, IFMBCOMPRCONFUSAGE, EVIMPMBLIF, WHYEVIMP, WHATDIDHESAY, WHY, WHOOTHR, WHYMBPEDAGN74, WHATDIDHESAYTU, WHYMBHADDRIASSSTD, HOWYOUDSBMBINF, MBVISN, MBPROVHISINF, MBINFYOU, WHRMBINFCOMFRM, CONFVALMBDEM, CONFVALINFMBACT, WHY, CHAMBYOADM, YOUESPCTVMBBELFSTR, MBBELFSTRASTHISLJNY	1. Bai's virtues
LENMB, YOURELWMB, TELMEMB, YOUEXPWMB, YOUPECMB, MBSTY, OTHSTY, STYMBINFOTHR, WHSTY, OTHSTYINVMB, MBLEADCHNSOCTY, WHYMBHASLEAD, MBCHGYOUPHILLIFVAL, IFMBHADHOW, IFMBCOMPRCONFUSAGE, MBPROVHISINF, MBINFYOU, HOW, GIVEXAMP	2. Bai's influence
LENMB, TELMEMB, YOUEXPWMB, YOUPECMB, MBSTY, OTHSTY, STYMBINFOTHR, WHSTY, YOUPECMBCHGSINDETH, MBLEADCHNSOCTY, WHYMBHASLEAD, IFMBHADHOW, HOWYOUDSBMBINF, WHRMBINFCOMFRM	3. Moral example
OTHSTY, WHSTY, OTHSTYINVMB, LEGCY	4. Material and spiritual asset-pedicab

Table 4-14 Seven Emerging Sub Virtue Themes from Interviews with 12 Subjects

Interview Question Sub Code	Emerging Virtues from 12 Participants
LENMB, TELMEMB, YOUEXPWMB, YOUPECMB, MBSTY, OTHSTY, STYMBINFOTHR, WHSTY, OTHSTYINVMB, CHDEXPINFMBACTADLT, YOUPECMBCHGSINDETH, MBLEADCHNSOCTY, ROLMBPLYHILIF, IFMBHADHOW, IFMBCOMPRCONFUSAGE, EVIMPMBLIF, WHYEVIMP, WHATDIDHESAY, WHY, WHOOTHR, WHYMBPEDAGN74, HOWYOUDSMBINF, MBVISN, MBPROVHISINF, MBINFYOU, WHRMBINFCOMFRM, CONFVALMBDEM, CONFVALINFMBACT, MBBS: WHY, CHAMBYOADM, MBBELFSTRASTHISLJNY	1. Ren ai
LENMB, TELMEMB, YOUEXPWMB, YOUPECMB, MBSTY, OTHSTYINVMB, MBCHGYOUPHILLIFVAL, EVIMPMBLIF, WHYMBPEDAGN74, WHATDIDHESAYTU, WHYMBHADDRIASSSTD, MBINFYOU, CONFVALMBDEM, CHAMBYOADM, MBBELFSTRASTHISLJNY	2. Zhi
LENMB, TELMEMB, YOUEXPWMB, YOUPECMB, MBDALYLIF, MBSTY, OTHSTY, STYMBINFOTHR, IFMBHADHOW, MBINFYOU, CHAMBYOADM	3. Jian
LENMB, TELMEMB, YOUPECMB, IFMBHADHOW, MBINFYOU, CONFVALMBDEM, CONFVALINFMBACT, MBBS: WHY, MBBELFSTRASTHISLJNY	4. Dayi
LENMB, TELMEMB, YOUEXPWMB, YOUPECMB, MBSTY, OTHSTYINVMB, WHYMBPEDAGN74, MBINFYOU, CHAMBHYOADM	5. Xin
LENMB, YOURELWMB, TELMEMB, YOUEXPWMB, YOUPECMB, ROLMBPLYHISLIF, WHATDIDHESAY	6. Li
MBSTY, YOUPECMBCHGSINDETH, CONFVALMBDEM	7. Yong



Appendix H: Document and Audiovisual Material Protocols

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

Version 1 2 3 4 5

Bai Fangli Interpretive Biographical Study Document Protocol

Name or description of the document

Author or media name:

Date and year of the document:

Website:

Subquestions # \_\_\_\_\_

Events, people, or situations were involved in the document:

Significance or importance of the document:

Brief summary of contents:

Emerging themes or categories:

Confucian virtues in the document:

Important quotes:

Source Primary Secondary Tertiary

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

Version 1 2 3 4 5

Bai Fangli Interpretive Biographical Study Audiovisual Material Protocol

Name or description of the document

Subquestions # \_\_\_\_\_

Significance or importance of the document:

Subversive Reading:

Emerging themes or categories:

Confucian virtues in the document:

Important quotes:

Source:

Source Primary Secondary Tertiary