

All Theses and Dissertations

2018-06-01

Mark Twain and Eliza R. Snow: The Innocents Abroad

Kathryn Marie Meeks Brigham Young University

Follow this and additional works at: https://scholarsarchive.byu.edu/etd



Part of the English Language and Literature Commons

BYU ScholarsArchive Citation

Meeks, Kathryn Marie, "Mark Twain and Eliza R. Snow: The Innocents Abroad" (2018). All Theses and Dissertations. 6893. https://scholarsarchive.byu.edu/etd/6893

This Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by BYU ScholarsArchive. It has been accepted for inclusion in All Theses and Dissertations by an authorized administrator of BYU ScholarsArchive. For more information, please contact scholarsarchive@byu.edu, ellen amatangelo@byu.edu.

Kathryn Marie Meeks

A thesis submitted to the faculty of
Brigham Young University
in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of

Master of Arts

Dennis R. Cutchins, Chair Frank Quinn Christianson Dennis Ralph Perry

Department of English

Brigham Young University

Copyright © 2018 Kathryn Marie Meeks

All Rights Reserved

ABSTRACT

Mark Twain and Eliza R. Snow: The Innocents Abroad

Kathryn Marie Meeks Department of English, BYU Master of Arts

This thesis will examine the surprising and delightful similarities between Mark Twain's *The Innocents Abroad* (1869) and Eliza R. Snow's letters to the *Woman's Exponent* published in a book titled *Correspondence of Palestine Tourists* (1875). Snow traveled abroad from 1872-1873, five years after Twain went abroad in 1867 and three years after *The Innocents Abroad* was published. She clearly states in her early letters that she was reading Twain and his influence is apparent in her letters. A careful look at her letters will also show that they are not merely an imitation of Twain. Snow takes on a Twainian style to write for her audience, the Latter-day Saint women readers of the *Woman's Exponent* in Salt Lake City.

Reading Snow's letters alongside Twain's *The Innocents Abroad* is beneficial in understanding the power and influence a popular text can have not only on other texts, but also on how writers describe their personal experiences. Marielle Macé states: "Works take their place in ordinary life, leaving their marks and exerting a lasting power" ("Ways of Reading, Modes of Being," 213). The lasting power of Twain's work is clearly shown here in Snow's letters.

Keywords: Mark Twain, Eliza R. Snow, *The Innocents Abroad, Correspondence of Palestine Tourists*, Travel writing, Adaptation, Influence, Latter-day Saints, *Woman's Exponent*

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

As Mark Twain penned, "Travel is fatal to prejudice, bigotry and narrow-mindedness." This thesis was made possible due to the tireless and adventurous efforts of my parents taking me abroad. Thank you David Rolph Seely and Jo Ann H. Seely for endless hours preparing me and encouraging me, discussing with me and revising with me. Thank you for planting the seed for this project when you handed me *The Innocents Abroad* for reading material while we lived in the Holy Land and traveled across Europe. This thesis was also read countless times by my wonderful sister Rachel Ann Grover. Thank you for putting aside the time to edit and give feedback and express excitement over my project. Love you!

This thesis was also made possible by Andrew, my husband, who listened to me chatter about all the details of my thesis as I researched and wrote and who supported me every step of the way with no complaints. Thank you, luv. This thesis was also supported by Jesse and Ann Meeks (my in-laws) who believed in me, encouraged me, and facilitated my time so that I could write, research, and defend.

I also owe gratitude and appreciation to Dr. Dennis Ralph Perry and Dr. Frank Quinn Christianson for their thoughtful feedback and their kind guidance. Most of all, I owe a great deal of gratitude, appreciation, and admiration to my thesis advisor and chair Dr. Dennis R. Cutchins who mentored me and coached me through the research and writing process. Dr. Cutchins' confidence, optimism, and reassurance pushed me through the most difficult parts of this project. I will always consider Dr. Cutchins a mentor and a friend.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

TITLE PAGE	i
ABSTRACT	ii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	iii
TABLE OF CONTENTS	iv
Introduction	1
CONTEXT	8
AUDIENCE INFLUENCE	10
TEXTUAL EVIDENCE	14
DISGUST WITH EXCESS AND CHRISTIAN STRIFE	15
ON OBSERVING AND BEING OBSERVED IN CAIRO	22
REVERENCE	24
THE END OF THE JOURNEY	
Conclusion	35
WORKS CITED	37

Mark Twain and Eliza R. Snow: The Innocents Abroad

INTRODUCTION

"Travel is fatal to prejudice, bigotry and narrow-mindedness," Mark Twain writes.

Furthermore, "Broad wholesome, charitable views of men and things can not [sic] be acquired by vegetating in one little corner of the earth all one's lifetime" (*The Innocents Abroad*, 427). Twain penned this at the conclusion of his popular text, *The Innocents Abroad*. Travel certainly gave Twain the opportunity to expand his understanding of his fellow human beings, and his writings also solidified the ever-growing popularity of American travel writing in the late nineteenth century. Twain's *Innocents* sold just over 70,000 copies in the first year of its publication, and within three years *Innocents* sold over 100,000 copies (Melton 1). Twain's travel writing was not a brand-new commodity as there were other Americans who were writing before him such as Bayard Taylor, James Fenimore Cooper, Washington Irving, William Cowper Prime, and Nathaniel Hawthorne, to name just a few. Herman Melville traveled abroad just following Twain and created his own form of travel writing in his epically long poem "Clarel." Jeffrey Alan Melton writes,

By the mid-nineteenth century, the passion for traveling as both tourist and reader touched most sectors of American life. Published by canonical and minor writers, travel books provided a crucial income for many of the century's authors. At one point or another in their careers, almost all of the era's prominent literary figures availed themselves of the freedoms and benefits of travel writing. (16)

Twain captivated his American audience with his humor and descriptions and forever changed how Americans travel abroad. In particular, Twain interested Eliza R. Snow, a prominent Latterday Saint (Mormon) leader and prolific literary figure in her own right.¹

Travel provided a world-expanding opportunity for Snow when she went abroad from 1872-1873. This was five years after Twain went abroad in 1867 and three years after *The Innocents Abroad* was published in 1869. Snow accompanied her brother, Lorenzo Snow, as well as George Albert Smith who were called by Latter-day Saint President Brigham Young to dedicate European and Middle Eastern countries for Latter-day Saint missionary work. Snow's writings are a fascinating insight into their trip, as well as a more personal insight into the experiences and attitudes of American Christians traveling abroad. Snow's experiences abroad have been mostly overlooked by scholars. Chad Emmett, one of the few scholars to write about Snow's work, comments on Snow's visit to the Holy Land and her letters saying that she is "one of few women pilgrims to leave a record of her visit to Nazareth" (28). This is the only reference to Snow in Emmett's book, and Emmett happens to mention her just after he mentions Twain, both on the same page. Emmett's references to Snow and Twain are natural, considering the similarities in the travel writings Snow and Twain produced.

Upon close examination of Snow's letters, a delightful relationship between Snow's travel writing and Twain's becomes apparent. Snow was a Twain reader, and her familiarity with his writing shows through in her descriptions and experiences. Tracing Twain's influence in

¹ Karen Lynn Davidson and Jill Mulvay Derr write in their book, *Eliza: The Life and Faith of Eliza R. Snow* that along with over 500 poems Snow wrote "funeral tributes, reflections on home and family, rhymed sermons, nature poems, tributes to her many close friends, playful songs, and complicated epics" (viii). Davidson and Derr's account of Snow's work does not, however, include her letters to the *Woman's Exponent*. Snow was well known in her community for her many literary, as well as civic and religious, contributions.

Snow's letters is significant because it dramatizes how a reader is profoundly impacted by a reading experience with a well-loved text. Snow describes many encounters with sites and people abroad and Twain's influence is present in her writing, playing a noticeable role in the way Snow describes her experiences. Snow's letters offer a valuable exploration of the reader's experience with a popular text, and the lasting effects of that text.

The Innocents Abroad would have been at the forefront of discussion in travel and writing in 1872. Adaptation theorist, James Naremore suggests that Twain is a highly adaptable author because he has contributed so widely to the American national mythology. He specifically mentions Twain when he is discussing André Bazin and Antonio Gramsci's ideas about a national or cultural mythology. Naremore says, "The most highly 'adaptable' authors—Twain and Shakespeare are preeminent examples in the Anglo-American world—have been especially important to the formation of national myths" (4). With that sort of prominence and as contributor to "national myths," Twain is impossible to avoid, particularly in travel writing where questions of national and cultural mythology are principal themes.

Snow was not the only member of the party to read Twain's travel accounts and partake of the Twainian travel and cultural mythology. George Albert Smith clearly said that Mark Twain was on his mind as he traveled. Smith mentioned Twain twice in his letters, and Smith specifically referred to *The Innocents Abroad*. Smith writes to Elder Robert L. Campbell on February 26th, 1873 while he was in Jerusalem: "I do not wonder at Mark Twain burlesquing the ancient sites" (199). The second time Smith writes about Twain is in a letter to his family on April 11th, 1873. In that letter Smith writes, "This evening, I have arranged to visit the Acropolis by moonlight. I do not intend to imitate Mark Twain in stealing anybody's grapes, and consequently have no fear of being overtaken by the police" (323). Twain's anecdote of eating

grapes in Athens on the way to the Acropolis is very brief. He writes "we had a score of bunches of large, white, delicious grapes, and were reaching down for more when a dark shape rose mysteriously up out of the shadows beside us" (220). Of course, Smith's comment about visiting the Acropolis is shared tongue-in-cheek, because he would likely never intentionally steal someone's grapes, but in mentioning his planned visit to the Acropolis in Athens, he could not help but mention Twain's dramatic moment. Smith separates himself from the mischievous image by referring to Twain with a literary smile, but Smith makes it clear that he will not follow Twain's example. Smith's note to his family indicates his familiarity with *The Innocents Abroad*, but also suggests that his family understood the joke. It's possible that Smith's family may have even read the book together as Smith prepared for his trip because Smith makes the effort to share the joke about Twain and the grapes in Greece with his family. Twain may have been a topic of conversation among these Latter-day Saint travelers and he was certainly present in their thoughts as they were site-seeing, as we see from their writing. It is worth noting that this letter to Smith's family is actually written in Snow's hand, Smith must have dictated his letter to her.² Snow was very aware of Smith's comments on Twain, again suggesting that Twain was very present among the travel companions.

Smith's references to Twain are not just incidental. The inside joke Smith shares with his family relating to Twain indicates that Twain was deeply infused within American, and Mormon culture. He was not simply a fleeting literary or travel star. Comparing himself to Twain shows

² Smith's letter to his family, written in Snow's hand, may be located in the George A. Smith Papers at the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints Church History Library in Salt Lake City. The letter may be found here: George A. Smith papers 1834-1877, Family Correspondence and papers, Letters to Bathsheba W. Smith from George A. Smith, 1872-1873, 1866, George A. Smith, Athens, 1873 April 11, Church History Library, dcms.lds.org/delivery/DeliveryManagerServlet?dps_pid=IE704205.

that Smith had a deep engagement with *Innocents*. Just as Naremore suggested, Twain became an integral part of American cultural mythology with an ingrained presence among American readers. Twain was a central creator and influencer on the informing mythology about travel and the world abroad for the American audience.

Snow very plainly states that she was reading Twain. On November 15th, 1872 Snow wrote about the grandeur and awe she felt at Niagara Falls (a stop on the way to sail to Europe). Snow described the falls and surrounding area using words like "magnificent" and "power and delicacy." After her awestruck descriptions, Snow followed with, "But after so many able pens have descanted upon this subject, it seems like folly for mine to attempt it" (*Correspondence of Palestine Tourists* 10). Snow was acquainted with the many accounts of Niagara Falls,³ and she continued, "I leave it, after drawing the conclusion that Mark Twain was induced to speak indifferently respecting this celebrated curiosity, lest he should be suspected of doing or thinking for once like somebody-else" (10). Explicitly stating she was familiar with Twain's travel writing, Snow also acknowledges Twain's grand personality and witty tone. Snow seems to grasp Twain's willful rejection of the status quo and his desire to rupture conventional knowledge. Yet the elements of Twain's style still color the way Snow perceives the many sites she visits abroad. And here lies the heart of my claim; Twain not only influences what Snow writes, but he also seems to influence Snow's experiences as they are described in her letters.

_

³ The *Niagara Book*, a compilation of accounts about Niagara Falls, co-authored by William Dean Howells, Mark Twain, Nathaniel Shaler, and others, was not published until 1893, 21 years after Snow's trip abroad. The publication of this book however, indicates the interest the American audience had in reading and writing about Niagara Falls.

⁴ Twain's reference to Niagara Falls could stem from two pieces he wrote, one titled "A Day at Niagara" and the other, "English Festivities. And Minor Matters, Fishing." He published both pieces in 1869 in the *Buffalo Express*, a paper published in Buffalo, New York. Ed Piacentino examines these two pieces in his article "Two View of Niagara: Doesticks and Mark Twain" 345-57.

Perhaps what stands out the most is not that Twain influenced Snow, as Twain was a highly influential figure, but rather where Snow deviated from Twain's model, or adapted Twain's tone, for a new purpose and audience. Snow's engagement with *The Innocents Abroad* is somewhat surprising since Twain's *The Innocents Abroad* is part satire, part entertainment, and part description of the sites he visits abroad, all directed at a mainstream, middle-class American audience. On the other hand, Snow's letters are meant to enlighten her readers, to confirm their beliefs of LDS doctrine, and to assert the positive position they hold in their communities.

Reading Snow's letters is like reading a palimpsest. Beneath Snow's words Twain's text is visible. Linda Hutcheon, a theorist interested in postmodernism, discusses the powerful influence a palimpsest has on a reader's experience. Hutcheon forms a theory about adaptation and storytelling across mediums. She explains that the "double pleasure of the palimpsest" occurs when "more than one text is experienced—and knowingly so" (116). The palimpsest metaphor is useful because Snow's travel letters become a "double pleasure" since the reading experience of Snow's letters is layered, even leaving the reader to wonder if the very travel experience itself was influenced by Twain's writings. In Snow's letters we find satisfaction in our familiarity and love of Twain, but we are also intrigued by and attentive to Snow's own additions and adaptations. Her unique perspective as an LDS woman traveling abroad stands out. Hutcheon explains why the intertextuality of two texts is so enjoyable. Our reading experience "comes simply from repetition with variation, from comfort of ritual combined with the piquancy of surprise. Recognition and remembrance are part of the pleasure (and risk) of experiencing an adaptation; so too is change" (4). Snow was writing to share her experiences in many of the same places that Twain visited, but not necessarily for the same purpose, so her letters are both the

same and different. Reading passages from *The Innocents Abroad* alongside Snow's letters illustrates how Snow's letters function as palimpsests and an adaptation of Twain's work.

The study of Snow's letters in the context of Twain's work is an attempt to recognize that even describing and writing about personal experience is influenced by popular texts. A profound experience with a text has the power to remain forever in the memory of the reader. A writer's work may show traces of their other textual experiences. In the introduction of her article "Ways of Reading, Modes of Being," Marielle Macé states: "Works take their place in ordinary life, leaving their marks and exerting a lasting power" (213). It makes sense that such a prominent text as Twain's The Innocents Abroad would be a substantial intertextual voice for Snow and her travel companions. They were, in a way, literally following in his footsteps. Macé suggests that "reading is not a separate activity, functioning in competition with life, but one of the daily means by which we give our existence form, flavor, and even style" (213). Thus, I argue that Twain's letters are a key component that give Snow's travel experiences "form, flavor, and even style." This case study is a demonstration of how quickly a popular writer, Twain, became ingrained in culture. Twain's writings may have even shaped the way Snow and her companions understood the places they visited. With the benefit of hindsight, Twain's literary mastery in his writings is clear, but Snow's letters show that significant texts play a role in shaping the expression of individual experience as well as the forming of public identities.

Snow also takes on Twainian features for her own purposes and audience. Just as Twain used satire to highlight strife and unchristian behavior, Snow uses some snide comments and humor to expose other Christians and peoples who do not possess her truth and worldview. Snow occasionally veers away from Twain in content when she describes specific details she believes

will be of interest to her audience, but even then, her diction and imagery are still similar to Twain's. ⁵

CONTEXT

In the middle of January of 1867, Twain cabled his editors in San Francisco, "Send me \$1,200 at once. I want to go abroad" (10). Roy Morris, Jr. explains that Twain's editors in California wired him a deposit for the first ever prepackaged "five-month-long pleasure cruise" from the United States to Europe and the Holy Land (11). Morris details, "In return for the advance, Twain contracted to send the newspaper fifty travel letters at twenty dollars apiece" (12). Twain went abroad on the *Quaker City* with an eclectic group of passengers (or pilgrims as they are often called) who played a distinctive role in Twain's descriptions and amusing scenes. As Twain traveled aboard the steamship *Quaker City* in 1872, he sent his accounts about his experiences to the *Alta California* newspaper in San Francisco. Just after Twain returned home, he began discussing the possibility of turning his letters into a book with his publisher Elisha Bliss. Twain's accounts were compiled, revised, and published as *The Innocents Abroad* in 1869, and, as mentioned above, became wildly popular. The book is divided in chapters and

_

⁵ Snow had been uniquely prepared to read and appreciate Twain by her Mormon faith. Both Joseph Smith, and Brigham Young, leaders of the LDS faith whom Snow knew on a very personal level, were known for their colorful and interesting speaking, and even at times, humor. Orson Hyde, a close associate of Brigham Young once commented on Young's impressive ability to mimic others, often humorously. Hyde said, "it may be said that President Young is a complete mimic, and can mimic anybody" (Hyde). Young was apt to mimic, and again we see a form of mimicking in Snow's work. Snow spent time in the households of both Joseph Smith and Brigham Young, as her position as a leader in the Latter-day Saint church dictated, and she would have heard Joseph Smith and Brigham Young speak countless times. Snow would have recognized satire and humor when applied to religion, which is often what Twain does in his travel writing in Europe and the Holy Land.

⁶ See Mark Twain's Letters, 141-142.

reads just as if one were following Twain and made privy to his thoughts on each of his excursions.

Although Snow also sent back regular letters for publication, her reasons for traveling abroad were quite different from Twain's. Brigham Young, then President of The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, instructed George Albert Smith, his first counselor, to go abroad. The Mormon Church was growing and Young was intent on spreading their message. President Young gave President Smith two purposes for travel abroad and they are recorded in a letter to Smith on October 15th, 1872 which is published in Correspondence of Palestine Tourists. These two purposes were to look for missionary opportunities abroad and to dedicate and consecrate the land of Palestine "to the Lord, that it may be blessed with fruitfulness, preparatory to the return of the Jews in fulfilment [sic] of prophecy, and the accomplishment of the purposes of our Heavenly Father" (1-2). Smith was to lead a delegation of LDS Church dignitaries and notables, with Paul Augustus accompanying him as a translator. The others traveling with him included: Eliza R. Snow, her brother Lorenzo Snow, George Dunford, Thomas Jennings, Feramorz Little and his daughter Clara (who was just eighteen years old at the time and who was to be Snow's companion and roommate on the journey). They would meet several other friends and acquaintances and members of the Church along the way.

Many of Snow's letters were published in the *Woman's Exponent*, a periodical published in Salt Lake City, Utah for and in defense of Mormon women. The first edition declared that the intent of the *Woman's Exponent* periodical was "that women may help each other by the diffusion of knowledge and information...to discuss every subject interesting and valuable to women" (*Woman's Exponent*, vol. 1, no. 1, 8). Snow's letters fulfilled this purpose. Snow even makes a point of observing and commenting on the condition of women in the various places she

visited. Snow's letters feel somewhat personal; she writes intimately about her travel companions and other well-known Latter-day Saint figures she encounters. The content of her letters is a mixture of text and poetry made up of descriptions and commentary on her travels and site-seeing. As with Twain's letters, Snow's letters (along with the letters of those she traveled with) were eventually compiled into a book, *Correspondence of Palestine Tourists: A Series of Letters by George A. Smith, Lorenzo Snow, Paul A. Schettler, and Eliza R. Snow of Utah*, and published in 1875.

AUDIENCE INFLUENCE

Twain affirms an American worldview and writes for the masses. He uses travel writing to destabilize the informing mythology that travel and tourism is about authentic experiences and discovery. As Melton points out, Twain openly admits while visiting Rome that travel and tourism are not about "discovery," at least in the traditional sense. Twain exclaims, "What is there in Rome for me to see that others have not touched? What is there for me to feel, to learn, to hear, to know, that shall thrill me before it pass to others? What can I discover?—Nothing. Nothing whatsoever" (170). In contrast, Snow affirms an LDS worldview, particularly for women. She also works to destabilize an informing mythology about Mormon women.

Twain was originally writing to be published in the *Alta California* for a West Coast audience. However, Twain comments to Bliss that his letters would need to be adjusted in order to be printed for a larger audience than just the West Coast. Twain says, "I could weed them of their chief faults of construction and inelegancies of expression and make a volume that would be more acceptable in many respects" (*Letters*, 141). Even after Twain's revising, particularly in reference to religious peoples and places, *Innocents* is still full of descriptions that are replete with disregard and censure. Twain's personal feelings on religion as well as Twain's attempt to

write to a generally protestant American audience probably account for Twain's writing and revising decisions. ⁷ Leon Dickinson comments that the *Alta* letters (or the text used in *Innocents*) are considerably more temperate than the newspaper version, "the publishers may not have succeeded in getting Clemens to water down his text as much as they liked. But it is clear that in revising the letters Clemens was governed to some extent by a concern for orthodox opinion" (100). Although stubborn, Twain was very conscious of his audience and his appeals to their humor and American attitudes attracted a readership all across the United States. Twain himself stated in a letter to Andrew Lang that he did not intend to write for a narrow American audience, rather that he "hunted for bigger game—the masses" (quoted in Melton, 2).

In the full title of Twain's travel narrative, *The Innocents Abroad or The New Pilgrim's Progress*, he refers to John Bunyan's *The Pilgrim's Progress*, an allegory about Christian, a pilgrim on a journey seeking salvation. Twain's *Innocents* appears to be somewhat of a parody of Bunyan's allegory. He tells us that the program he was traveling with provided a travel list that recommended clothing for "pilgrimizing" in the Holy Land, as well as a suggestion to bring reading material, particularly a Bible since "the Holy Land was part of the excursion and seemed to be its main feature" (22). Twain even refers to his tourist group aboard the Quaker City ship as "pilgrims" (31). The characters he traveled with, their faith seeking endeavors and the exotic sites they would encounter, provided the perfect setting for Twain to write a satire of American Christians. Twain was a sharp observer and one of his greatest gifts in his sarcastic writing is observing and commenting on hypocrisy. He had plenty of material to work with in the company

⁷ Leon Dickinson takes a detailed look at the changes Twain made between his letters to the *Alta California* and the published text of *The Innocents Abroad* including Twain's comments on making his text reader-friendly for an Eastern audience. Twain's publishers felt he had to significantly tone down his sharp and negative tone toward religion. Twain also made revisions for clarification, variety, and humor. Please see, Dickinson's dissertation for further details.

of pilgrims visiting many religious sites abroad. Amid the humor and keen observations, Twain provides a means for the American people to examine their own lives in search of the same discord he describes. He leaves a lot of the learning and introspection up to his readers.

Snow was recording a pilgrimage instead of satirizing a pilgrimage. Snow takes the irony out of the pilgrim's journey. Even the difference in form, poems versus letters, speaks to Snow's more religious approach. Poems are a versatile medium for open expression of belief and thought. Snow takes her similar judgments about the sites abroad and transforms them into a message of faith particularly aimed at her readers. Snow responds to the constraints of her situation, those of the beliefs and customs of her audience. This may have been based partly on the way Snow's trip was funded. The travel expenses for Snow's trip were paid for by the donations of Latter-day Saint women in the Salt Lake community. Snow wrote a poem in recognition of their generosity that was published in the *Women's Exponent* on November 1, 1872, it was titled "To My Magnanimous Friends" (*Woman's Exponent*, vol. 1, no. 11, 83). In return for their generosity Snow would write for the *Woman's Exponent* to share her experiences. The situation called for Snow to respond directly to the Latter-day Saint women, and that is what she did.

In Cairo, for instance, Snow writes a serious observation of the religious practices of the Egyptians, which is lacking in Twain's description of Cairo. Snow begins by describing the custom of the veiling of Muslim women. She writes that it "appears to be very inconvenient." Snow follows with a simple description of the various ways of veiling and how it is done: she comments that "some with white veils and dressed in white; others with black and dressed in black, and also in various colors; some very richly clad…and frequently parting in front, exposes to advantage a beautiful, rich underdress" (178). Not only is the description of the veils clearly

Mormon women have in being exempt from this veiling tradition. Snow writes with her Western bias of the time but is still respectful of the religious expression, perhaps in acknowledgement of her own very prominent expression of faith with her words, but at the same time substantiating her superior opinion of Mormon women. Snow is more sympathetic than Twain to the religious aspect of the Muslim people she was observing. Further down in the same letter about Cairo referenced above, Snow writes, "Many, both men and women, dress in white, and *really* white; their religion enjoins cleanliness...We frequently see them washing themselves beside the street, probably preparatory to praying...We have seen several, where we were passing, bowing their heads to the ground while their lips moved as in silent devotion" (178). Not only is she more respectful of the dress of the Muslims in Cairo, but she also admires their concern with cleanliness and their prayerful devotion.

Twain remains basically satirical in his remarks about Muslims. When discussing the gates of the Old City of Jerusalem, Twain writes, "The Moslems watch the Gold Gate with a jealous eye, and an anxious one, for they have an honored tradition that when it falls, Islamism will fall and with it the Ottoman Empire. It did not grieve me any to notice that the old gate was getting a little shaky" (380). Twain lacks the courteous tone about the Muslim beliefs.

After returning home Snow wrote her final letter that looks back on her trip fondly, but she ends by saying that her home and her community are superior. The last letter Snow wrote is addressed to her "Beloved Sisters in the Faith of the Gospel of the Son of God" (384), wherein

⁸ Snow evokes a tradition of comparing Mormons to Muslims which perhaps stems from Sir Richard Francis Burton's piece about his visit to Utah in 1860, *The City of the Saints And Across the Rocky Mountains to California* published in 1862. Basing his comments on his observations from his travels in Islamic nations, Burton makes several connections between what he saw in Mormon traditions and what he saw in Muslim traditions.

she thanks the women of her community for their support. Snow's conclusion does not sum up her travels, as Twain's did, but expresses her beliefs that her community and their faith is far superior to anything she had seen in her travels. She especially emphasizes that the women of her community have a unique and powerful position—contrary to popular belief about the position of Mormon women. Snow said, "While abroad, I often encountered the absurd idea, which many seem unwilling to relinquish, that here, woman is held in a state of vassalage—'down-trodden,' etc., etc., to which I invariably opposed, from the fact that nowhere on earth has women as large responsibilities, and wields as much influence as with the Latter-day Saints" (386). After having witnessed diverse circumstances of people in her travels, Snow wrote, "I still think, as I have hitherto invariably thought, that home, with the Latter-day Saints, is the place of the highest happiness attainable on earth" (365). Despite Snow's accommodations for a very narrow audience of Mormon women, her overall aim may not be so different from Twain's. Travel writing for Twain and Snow was a means of affirming a worldview and a public identity, one for the American public at large, and the other for a small community in the Salt Lake Valley.

TEXTUAL EVIDENCE

Twain writes satire and entertainment for his American audience. Snow writes to open up the world and to validate the beliefs and position of her readers at home. Despite the difference in purpose and audience, Twain and Snow have many similar responses to the sites they visit.

Twain and Snow are both disgusted by the excess and strife they find in Florence and Milan and Twain and Snow each write about an inversion of display in Egypt. While they were there to see the ancient Egyptian sites and the exotic new city, the astonishing behavior of their own fellow travelers actually becomes the spectacle in Cairo. Both Twain and Snow feel reverence in the Holy Land at the Sea of Galilee and in the Church of the Holy Sepulchre. Overall, Twain's and

Snow's responses are similar, but in the details of their descriptions and discussions the reader will recognize that Twain and Snow are different in their conclusions.

DISGUST WITH EXCESS AND CHRISTIAN STRIFE

Twain's experience at the Duomo in Florence is an example of his cynical, but humorous writing. Not only is Twain disgusted with the ornateness of the structure of the church, but also with the history that surrounds it. In a rather derisive way Twain writes, "As far as I can see, Italy...has turned all her energies, all her finances, and all her industry to the building up of a vast array of wonderful church edifices, and starving half her citizens to accomplish it. She is today one vast museum of magnificence and misery" (164). He criticizes structures and history, and although he uses the word "wonderful," it is clear he is being satirical because he asserts that the majesty and opulence comes at a high cost to the citizens of Italy. Twain continues by claiming that the "jeweled frippery" of the cathedrals in Florence far out shine the churches in an ordinary American city, or all of them put together. He also claims that Italy is so full of beggars and "rags and vermin to match" that it is the "wretchedest, princeliest land on earth" (164).

Twain makes it a point to call attention to the hypocrisy of the grandeur he sees:

Look at the grand Duomo of Florence – a vast pile that has been sapping the purses of her citizens for five hundred years, and is not nearly finished yet. Like all other men, I fell down and worshipped it, but when the filthy beggars swarmed around me the contrast was too striking, too suggestive, and I said, "O, sons of classic Italy, is the spirit of enterprise, of self-reliance, of noble endeavor, utterly dead within ye? Curse your indolent worthlessness, why don't you rob your church?" (164)

Twain cleverly acknowledges the conflict he sees, which is a hallmark of his style.

Twain knew what would satisfy a nineteenth century American audience just recovering from the Civil War. Twain's letters were being published in the Alta California in 1867, but Twain re-wrote his letters and compiled them for the book, *The Innocents Abroad*, which was published just four years after the end of the Civil War. Twain responds to an exigency to entertain and heal a broken and barely recovering nation. Lloyd Bitzer, in his seminal piece on the rhetorical situation, stated that the situation "calls the discourse into existence" (2) and in this case Twain's travel writing offered a formula that Americans needed to form, or reform, an American identity through the Reconstruction period. Twain was an embodiment of American attitudes and sensibilities which becomes apparent in the tone he takes when describing Europeans or other foreigners. Twain provided a sense of identity as he set himself apart from the peoples and cultures he encountered on his journey. The Innocents Abroad may have invited Americans to feel connected and unified as just that, Americans, and in particular Protestant Americans. Melton attentively addresses Twain's anti-Catholic bias and points out that Twain emphasizes his identification with American Protestants, "Twain makes his most obvious connection to the assumed religious fervor of his readers. In recognizing the good works of Dominican friars, he points out that their unselfishness would certainly 'save their souls though they were bankrupt in the true religion—which is ours" (51). Melton points out Twain's careful stress on "true religion" being "ours," Twain even uses a dash to make that comment stand out. It may have been difficult for his readers to know when to take Twain seriously, but he clearly asks them to see his commentary in the context of Catholic/Protestant debates.

Snow wrote a poem about Florence with a message similar to Twain's, using very similar imagery. In her letter from Rome, Italy, dated January 24th, 1873 to the *Woman's Exponent*,

Snow included a descriptive poem about Florence. She also points out the bounty and luxury, but she includes a warning for Florence.

FLORENCE

Beneath high, villa-dotted hills,

That in succession rise

Like rich gemm'd parapets around,

The lovely Florence lies.

The Arno, broad and gentle stream,

That flows meand'ring through,

Divides, but in unequal parts,

The city plat in two.

I've seen its princely palaces

Where wealth and ease reside,

Where independence fills her sales

With luxury and pride.

I see you, Florence, all the while,

So beautiful and gay;

I ask, Is this your common dress,

Or, this your holiday?

Be wise, and while their golden sho'rs

The bounteous heav'ns distil;

Avoid debasing luxury,

Prolific source of ill.

The crown of peace is on your head,

Its wreath around your brow;

The royal carpet, newly spread,

Adorns your threshold now. (150)

One can infer that Snow is not only somewhat disgusted with the opulence, as was Twain, but she is also interested in warning her readers at home of the dangers of vanity and concern for wealth and status. The language Snow chooses to describe the opulence of Florence is very similar to Twain's. Twain uses the words: "magnificence and misery," "jeweled frippery" and "princeliest land on earth." Snow says "luxury and pride," "rich gemm'd parapets" and "princely palaces." Snow also very plainly points out the trouble that the opulence has caused Florence with several warnings: "luxury and pride," "Is this your common dress? Or, this your holiday?" and "Avoid debasing luxury,/Prolific source of ill." Twain is more specific, in that he mentions the priests who are comfortably employed by the Cathedral, even though they are surrounded by poverty. Snow does not go as far to make a contrast, but the warnings in her poem are apparent, although indirect.

Both writers share Puritan-inflected sensibilities in their responses to the pretense of the Cathedral, a tone that may be traced through both Twain's book and Snow's letters and perhaps reflecting an American-Puritan heritage. Jeffrey Steinbrink describes the post-war American

traditions...tended to place his confidence in himself, in his country, and in the sufficiency of the present rather than the sanctity of the past; he was curious, active, and acquisitive; he was simultaneously skeptical and deferential, and quite unabashedly—and identifiably—American" (279). Snow's emphasis is placed more on affirming the LDS worldview, but as seen in her description of the Cathedral in Milan, she displays some of this post-war American attitude that Steinbrink asserts. While Twain's work may have more nuance than Steinbrink implies, the "skeptical" and unabashed Americanness is present in Twain's work, and perhaps why *Innocents* was so well loved.

Many years after Snow's trip, in 1882, President Brigham Young defined the purpose of "The Young Ladies Retrenchment Society" (a program for young Latter-day Saint women) in the *Woman's Exponent* as an organization to encourage the young women to "spend more time in moral, mental and spiritual cultivation, and less upon fashion and the vanities of the world" (*Woman's Exponent*, vol. 11, no. 8, 59). The purpose for the Young Ladies Retrenchment Society may have been defined much later than when Snow was writing, but the *Woman's Exponent* may have already been attempting to meet that demand in 1872. Snow's poem about Florence and her description of the Cathedral of Milan that will be seen below are demonstrations of her advocating this behavior of abstaining from vanity.

The cathedral in Milan is described by Twain as "the first thing you look for when you rise in the morning, and the last your lingering gaze rests upon at night" (109). He says, "when it is visible, no other object can chain your whole attention," even going as far as saying "we would recognise [sic] it even in the desert of the great Sahara" (109). Twain continues with his extensive description of the cathedral in Milan, and it is rather extensive, spanning several pages.

Of the tour Twain's group takes of the cathedral, Twain goes to great effort to create vivid images of the cathedral and all its majesty, but the excessive descriptions are just that, excessive. It is clear Twain is disgusted with all the extravagance. Where St. Charles Borromeo, Bishop of Milan was buried Twain comments satirically that the "people idolized him; princes lavished uncounted treasures upon him" (113). Especially sarcastic are Twain's words about the silent sermon that this deceased Bishop gives: "Dead Bartolomeo preached his pregnant sermon, and its burden was: You that worship the vanities of earth—you that long for worldly honor, worldly wealth, worldly fame—behold their worth!" (113). The Bishop's sermon is about vanity and worldly wealth and yet his burial site is surrounded by the garish tomb housed in the exorbitant and grandiose cathedral. Twain highlights the tomb of the bishop to show that real Christian worship and values such as humility, service, and charity are foreign principles to the Cathedral of Milan.

Snow also addresses Christian worship in the Cathedral of Milan, but through her Latter-day Saint lens. Snow attends a high mass service in the Cathedral of Milan and says of the service, "much of it was senseless form and unmeaning, though dazzling, display" (106). She comments on the enormous nature of the building and also the "profuse" incense (106).

Although her descriptions of the cathedral and worshippers are not as extensive as Twain's descriptions, Snow's descriptions imply a similar tone of sarcasm. Snow's tone is dated and offers a glimpse in to the attitudes between different religious denominations at the time. The services Snow observed were carried out in Latin, and Snow says "it is presumable, [that it] was as little comprehended by the majority of the church members as by us. I readily understood that many of the people present were, like ourselves, spectators" (106). Snow is pointing out an irony of the great numbers of people in the grand cathedral who seem, according to Snow and Twain,

to be missing the point of Christianity—that of humility and charity. Snow assumes the worshippers are insincere, she describes "some crossing themselves, some reverently kneeling, and others bowing first to a golden crucifix, then to the Archbishop" and then writes, "How long, O Lord, shall these thy children be bound in the dwarfing chains of traditional superstition and ignorance?" (106-107). She continues by commenting on beliefs particular to the Latter-day Saint faith and refers to the Catholic worshippers with harsh words. Twain points out the conflict of the deceased Bishop and his silent sermon in the extravagant cathedral. Snow observes the irony that the worshippers, although going through the motions, seem to be "spectators" and according to Snow are far from the truth of the gospel.

In terms of their descriptions of the cathedral, Snow and Twain describe the enormity of the building. Snow writes, "I remained a spectator in the midst of a great multitude in the stately and superb Cathedral of Milan, which is described as being four hundred and eighty-six feet in length, and its total breadth three hundred and fifty feet" (107). Twain and Snow's very specific descriptions may have been in order to provide a visual for their readers back home. However, in the context of Twain's and Snow's experiences the reader is certainly set up to read their careful descriptions of the Italian cathedrals with a biased attitude. Twain and Snow reflect the larger American attitude toward Catholicism, associating Catholic practices and structures with Old World political traditions, along with most other American tourists and travel writers, "The overwhelming majority of American tourists were Protestants, and in an age of ignorance and distrust, attacks upon Catholicism run rampant in their narratives" (Melton, 49). While a disdainful attitude toward Catholicism was the norm among the greater American public, Snow may have felt particular disdain toward other Christian denominations after enduring significant persecution along with the Mormons in Missouri under Governor Lilburn Boggs and the

Missouri Executive Order 44 (also known as the "Extermination Order"). Negative attitudes toward other religions is now quite uncharacteristic of LDS writers and scholars. Snow is unique because she displays the American Protestant sensibilities of her time period while remaining true to her LDS beliefs and culture.⁹

ON OBSERVING AND BEING OBSERVED IN CAIRO

In Egypt, both Twain and Snow acknowledge they are observers as they visit the ancient sites and they are the observed in the scenes their respective travel companies create. Snow, however, takes her observing one step further and turns it inward to her own travel companions, with whom her readers would have been familiar. As Twain and his fellow "pilgrims" enter Egypt, Twain makes a point that exotic Cairo is a sight to see because it is so different from Europe. He begins by saying, "Alexandria was too much like a European city to be novel, and we soon tired of it" (401). Once in Cairo Twain emphasizes that there is much to observe because it is such a different city. He describes "[s]tately camels and dromedaries, swarthy Egyptians, and likewise Turks and black Ethiopians, turbaned, sashed, and blazing in a rich variety of Oriental costumes of all shades of flashy colours" (401). Aside from pointing out the different costumes, Twain discusses the donkeys he sees in Cairo. He begins chapter 58 of Innocents describing what the Egyptian donkeys look like and how they are groomed. His group is picking donkeys to ride to see the sites around Cairo, when Twain says, "The donkey-boys were lively young Egyptian rascals who could follow a donkey and keep him in a canter...We had plenty of spectators when we mounted...We were not a very large party, but as we charged through the streets of the great metropolis, we made noise for five hundred, and displayed

⁹ For more discussion on Latter-day Saint history and American Protestantism, please see Daniel Walker Howe's chapter "Emergent Mormonism in Context" in *The Oxford Handbook of Mormonism*.

activity and created excitement in proportion" (404). He goes on to describe the "startling exhibitions of Oriental simplicity" that he sees while riding around Cairo. Here we see an interesting inversion, Twain first points out that his group makes quite the scene, even garnering spectators as they mount their rides, but then as they begin their ride, Twain and his fellow travelers return to being the spectators of sites (people and buildings), both ancient and contemporary. Who or what is on display is ambiguous.

Snow's version of visiting Cairo carries many of the same elements as Twain's. She writes to the *Woman's Exponent* on February 14th, 1873, "From our balcony and windows which opened at full length, we had an excellent opportunity for studying national peculiarities. The sight was at once intensely amusing and interesting" (176). Snow calls the sites and people "national peculiarities" similar to Twain's "startling exhibitions of Oriental simplicity" (405). Her word choice is interesting. She uses the word "peculiar" and "intensely amusing and interesting." She becomes a tourist here, instead of a pious pilgrim and that seems to follow suit with Twain's description as he used "Oriental simplicity" which sounds like the words of a Western tourist. Snow is out to see the sights and she is seeking entertainment, much as Twain had done. Snow also comments on the costumes of the people as well as the donkeys, just like Twain. She writes, "The most comically amusing practice, and one constant exhibition, is a person, either Turk or Christian, on a donkey, with a man or boy in gown or turban, running in the rear, and with a stick punching or striking the animal to quicken its speed" (177).

Twain points out that his group made so much noise that they became an exhibition by themselves. In contrast Snow makes it a point that she and her companions are doing the observing. Snow recounts a small disappointment when their "respected cashier and interpreter, Brother P.A. Schettler" dresses up in the local costume, but "much to the regret of Miss Little".

and myself, he disappointed us of the gratification we anticipated in witnessing the interesting and undignified exhibition, by performing it clandestinely" (177). Snow writes as if she is the spectator of the foreign exhibitions around them, but also in this moment she hopes for a display from her own group. Snow has inverted the scene, focusing within her group, as opposed to writing about how her group making a scene for the local people, as Twain's group had done. Snow encourages an exhibit from her group. She says, "I had tried to persuade some of the gentlemen of our party that this costume might become them, but, up to date, they have only donned the cap, the gown is only yet in prospect" (178). Because this statement is written just after her disappointment in the proper behavior of a dressed-up Schettler, we can assume that Snow wants the gentlemen to dress up purely out of amusement and not out of respect to local custom. Even as Snow looks inward to her group (as opposed to the ancient sites and foreign features around her) Twain's touristy attitude and sarcasm again shine through. Snow writes about the people she travelled with and her writing has an entertaining quality, just like Twain, but her details are directed at her specific audience.

REVERENCE

In the Holy Land, at the sites significant to the life of Jesus Christ, both Twain and Snow respond with a feeling of reverence. Although Twain articulates the reverence and awe he feels at the sacred sites in Jerusalem and in Galilee, he does not identify them with a specific expression of belief. Snow expresses boldly and clearly her belief in Jesus Christ. The chapters dedicated to the Holy Land in *The Innocents Abroad* include Twain's harsh examination and reaction to earlier descriptions of the sites.

Melton argues that Twain went abroad to show readers "that the Old World, especially Europe, if viewed honestly through definitively American eyes, falls far short of common, overblown expectations." However, Twain was doing more than simply promoting "national braggadocio or stubborn Yankee self-reliance," Twain was commenting on disappointment in touristic expectations (59). Melton adds that Twain's travel texts, *The Innocents Abroad* and *A Tramp Abroad* are "well-crated cultural documents that showcase, first, a new way of seeing the world, and second, a new way of participating in that world as the tide of tourism enveloped the globe" (59). Twain enters a conversation with previous travel writers in order to show that his own travel experiences are more authentic because of his recognition of the differences between expectations and realities. Melton writes, "Twain's dilemma—balancing the needs of his skepticism and honesty in his role as a travel writer with his needs for authenticity as a tourist—becomes evident as he juxtaposes attacks on the humbugs of previous romantic travel writers (and the disingenuous reactions of other tourists) against his own willingness to imagine and then create a more favorable touristic experience" (60). While most of *Innocents* lies between realistic experience and disappointment and "a more favorable touristic experience" (with more emphasis on realistic disappointment, particularly in Europe) moments of genuine amazement appear.

Twain is disappointed with the Sea of Galilee and the surrounding landscape. He discusses his disappointment in conjunction with the descriptions he had read previously; he expected the scenery to be beautiful and his expectations were dashed once he arrived in the Galilee area. Twain writes, "[A] careful analysis of these descriptions will show that the materials of which they are formed are not individually beautiful and can not be wrought into combinations that are beautiful" (328). Twain is critical of his travel-writing predecessors, particularly William Cowper Prime, who wrote *Tent Life in the Holy Land*, even referring to Prime as "Mr. Grimes." Instead of seeking a transcendent experience as Prime seems to do,

of Galilee: "God made the Sea of Galilee and its surroundings as they are. Is it the province of Mr. Grimes to improve upon the work?" (329). The reader may be deceived into believing that Twain has no reverence for the sacred landscape he is seeing and touching, but a few lines later Twain does indeed expresses a sense of reverence. Melton explains that Twain "keeps the Holy Land holy. Accomplishing this task, though, requires substantive imaginative leaps and a will to see—despite the prevalence of contrary images—what he came to see" (72). Melton terms Twain's effort to keep the Holy Land holy as a "touristic faith" (76). Melton explains that "touristic faith" is simply an illusion of authenticity in the travel experiences of tourists (12). Twain's words are rich and deep and indicate more than an illusion of sacredness, rather Twain describes feeling the revered nature of the Galilee.

Later in the evening upon their arrival in the Galilee, Twain takes a moment and describes the reverence he felt next to the Sea of Galilee. He writes an elegant description of the Sea of Galilee under the stars. He reflects upon the historical importance of the place for Christians and their religion. His writing is smooth as he moves between physical description and thought. He refers to the Sea of Galilee as Genessaret, another name for the lake: "Genessaret with the glittering reflections of the constellations flecking its surface, almost makes me regret that I ever saw the rude glare of the day upon it" (330). Twain writes in respect and awe of the events that occurred along the lake, displaying his capacity to show reverence: "In the starlight, Galilee has no boundaries but the broad compass of the heavens, and is a theatre meet for great events; meet for the birth of a religion able to save a world; and meet for the stately Figure appointed to stand upon its stage and proclaim its high decrees" (330). He turns to the greatness of the events that transpired in the area and on the Sea and how it was easy to dwell upon it once it was dark and quiet: "Its history and its associations are its chiefest [sic] charm, in

any eyes, and the spells they weave are feeble in the searching light of the sun. Then we scarcely feel the fetters. Our thoughts wander constantly to the practical concerns of life" (330). Twain goes on for several more lines about how the "old traditions of the place steal upon his memory and haunt his reveries" and that Galilee was a great theatre for great events (330). He closes his chapter with this statement: "One can comprehend it only when night has hidden all incongruities and created a theatre proper for so grand a drama" (330). Here Twain is sensitive to not only the physical locale and its beauty, but also to the great history and significance of events that were performed there for Christians around the world. He even respectfully refers to Jesus Christ as the "stately Figure" (330). Twain clearly has reverence for the Sea of Galilee as a sacred spot, at least at night.

Twain is thus realistic in his descriptions, and perhaps even cynical in contrast to previous writers like Prime, and yet he retained his moments of reverence in his revisions to publish *Innocents*. Twain's realism, again, sets him up as a more "authentic" observer, and invites a widespread identification with his Protestant American readers. Melton may be accurate in contending that Twain was on a mission to explore the Touristic Age and write authentically of expectations and disappointments, however, Twain still retains reverent moments that appeal to his faithful readers. For the most part Twain removes himself from religious expressions, but clearly he knew how to appeal to his audience, as indicated by Leon Dickinson's dissertation on Twain's revisions from his original letters to the *Alta California* and the published book, *The Innocents Abroad*.

Snow also shows great reverence at the peaceful place that is Galilee. The poem she writes about the Sea of Galilee demonstrates that she has a very similar experience to Twain's evening experience. Both experience a sensation of the greatness because of the events that

occurred at that place. They both use cosmic language to describe the place and their thoughts, and both write about Galilee in the evening or at night. Snow writes that she stood on the shore of the Sea of Galilee "When t'was wrapp'd in repose at eventide" (285). Twain had even distinctly said, "Night is the time to see Galilee" (330), and he describes the beautiful reflections of the stars and the scenery by starlight. The second stanza of Snow's poem describes the serenity of the scene. It is quiet: "No sound was astir—not a murmuring wave," with only the sound of the "gentle heave of the water's crest" (286). Using the words "silent" and "silence" and "There's a depth in the soul, that's beyond the reach/Of all earthly sound" (286), she follows saying that her thoughts were turned to the events of that place: "I thought of the present—the past" (286). She emphasizes that her reflection was made possible because of the stillness of the moment, paralleling Twain's experience.

Snow takes her Galilee experience a step further. Although similar to Twain's experience, she focused on Jesus Christ and her ardent belief in Him as a Savior. She talks of the next morning as she walked around the lake contemplating the actions of "our Redeemer" and the story of Peter walking on the Sea. The last few stanzas are Snow again bearing testimony of the "Prince of Life" and His ministry, death and resurrection. Snow follows Twain, and then turns her piece to make it her own. Even though Twain does seem to have a reverent moment, he does not so explicitly express a belief in Jesus Christ or the Bible as Snow does. For Snow's reader, this is a brilliant moment; Snow lets her own words and beliefs shine, but the discerning reader would remember that Twain also had a significant, hallowed experience in Galilee—thus illuminating Twain's text behind Snow's.

One of the most intriguing sites that Twain and Snow write about is the Church of the Holy Sepulchre in Jerusalem. The Church of the Holy Sepulchre is overly ornate, dark, and full

of tourists and pilgrims moving this way and that. It is divided up among many different Christian sects, who all claim a piece of the traditional site of the crucifixion and resurrection of Christ. Local police must remain close because the different Christian priests can become quite violent when disputing about what belongs to whom. Twain refers to the irony about the Church of the Holy Sepulchre when he is writing about the Church of the Nativity in Bethlehem. He says, "As in the Church of the Holy Sepulchre, envy and uncharitableness were apparent here. The priests and the members of the Greek and Latin churches cannot come by the same corridor to kneel in the sacred birthplace of the Redeemer, but are compelled to approach and retire by different avenues, lest they quarrel and fight on this holiest ground on earth" (392). And so even the "holiest ground on earth," that of the birthplace in the Church of the Nativity and tomb of the Redeemer in the Church of the Holy Sepulchre, are not exempt from some form of hypocrisy.

Twain writes about his visit to the Church of the Holy Sepulchre in a fairly satiric tone, expressing his skepticism of the exact locations of the final events of the life of Christ. He points out how outrageous it is for pilgrims to kneel and worship in these spots that feel less than holy. Near the end of the chapter, however, Twain's tone changes. He writes that he "looked upon the place where the true cross once stood, with a far more absorbing interest than I had ever felt in any thing earthly before" (371). Perhaps Twain's feeling can be described as awe. He describes an awareness of what he is witnessing, a place in the sepulchre that has been held sacred by so many for hundreds of years. The passage continues: "I could not believe that the three holes in the top of the rock were the actual ones the crosses stood in, but I felt satisfied that those crosses had stood so near the place now occupied by them, that the few feet of possible difference were a matter of no consequence" (371). The most important part of this moment of reverence is Twain's recognition that the exact location is unimportant in matters of faith.

Furthermore, Twain describes that the sepulchre is made extraordinary because it has been revered by so many for so long. His word choice here appears to be slightly more sarcastic; nonetheless, he observes the significance of its history. He calls the Church of the Holy Sepulchre "the most sacred locality on earth to millions and millions of men, and women, and children, the noble and the humble, bond and free" (372). Even those Christians who have not made pilgrimage to Jerusalem have esteemed that place as a holy place. Twain continues and highlights what people have done because they regard the church as hallowed ground: "it is still grand, reverend, venerable—for a god died there, for fifteen hundred years its shrines have been wet with the tears of pilgrims from the earth's remotest confines." After this sentence Twain inserts some of his quintessential cynicism, talking of men who "wasted" their lives to defend the church and keep it clean from "infidel pollution." He contrasts these men who wasted their lives with his last sentence that features the Man who represents the exact opposite: "history is full of this old Church of the Holy Sepulchre—veneration in which men held the last resting-place of the meek and lowly, the mild and gentle, Prince of Peace!" (372). Despite Twain taunting in the midst of his reverent moment, he is still conscious of the weight of the events that transpired on that hill covered by the enormous church. Twain appropriately points out strife and gross grandeur, but he also discreetly articulates respect and awe.

Like Twain, the first thing that Snow mentions about the Church of the Holy Sepulchre, the "most sacred place on earth" (259), is the incredibly ironic matter of the quarrels between the Christian sects. In her letter to the *Woman's Exponent* on March 9th, 1873, she says,

Within its idolized precincts, a Turkish guard is constantly stationed to prevent quarrels between the different sects of Christians—Roman Catholics, Greek Catholics, Armenians, etc., who have separate chapels in this extensive building,

where they each perform their respective modes of worship. But, notwithstanding this precautionary measure on the part of the government, serious and bloody fights sometimes occur, which the Mussulman very reasonably considers uncomplimentary to the Christian religion. (259)

The tension between the priests is hardly something a visitor would overlook. Just like Twain,

Despite the sacred nature of the site, Snow writes frankly about the "uncomplimentary" actions
of her fellow Christians.

Snow also writes about the many places that are claimed to be the exact sites of a particular event in Christian history. Like Twain, she too is skeptical of the emphasis on the "exact" places. Snow questions the claims by the guide about the authenticity of the site, she writes, "on several occasions I took the liberty to question our guide respecting his own faith in some items which he seemed anxious to impress us with as 'identical,' and, to our great amusement, he shook his head with an expressive smile which he tried in vain to suppress" (260). However, Snow does not let the guide's insistence on the "exact locations" bother her. Whether it is because of her devout dedication to Jesus Christ, or because she had read and gleaned from Twain, or perhaps both, Snow does not allow the frustration with the Christians and guides insisting on the exact location of an event to get in the way of her experience or faith. Snow writes,

And although our credulity as to specific localities failed of being whetted to a point, we knew and felt that we were really where the ancient Jerusalem once stood, and consequently in the vicinity where those scenes transpired, and it did not matter...We knew by incontrovertible testimony, that here Jesus was crucified

for the redemption of man, was resurrected, ascended, and, at no very distant day, "will in like manner descend." (260)

Snow recognizes that there is a larger importance to the events of the life of Christ than their locations.

These few lines are all Snow writes about the "most sacred place on earth" (259). Snow's response is a lot less cynical than Twain's. She writes with sincere awe, because she so unabashedly believes, and she often says so. From Jerusalem, Snow writes to the editor of the Woman's Exponent on March 4th, 1873, about her thoughts on arriving in the port at Jaffa, her first view of the Holy Land: "With me, the reflection that we really were in Palestine, the land rendered dear to the Saints of God by some of the most interesting associations of mortal life the history of the past in connection with the anticipations of the future, which no other people than Latter-day Saints can so fully appreciate—was the all absorbing thought' (227). Snow makes it very apparent that her Latter-day Saint worldview and understanding of the history of the Holy Land, which was generally shared by her Latter-day Saint readers, made her experiences and thoughts in the Holy Land especially valuable. Twain makes no such claim. Snow's intimate audience allowed her to be more open about her belief. Snow's version comes from a fellow sister and beloved leader, whose purpose is the strengthening of faith. Twain may not be writing to strengthen faith, but his appeal to satire is not purely entertainment: satire is meant to teach and correct, so in that sense Twain and Snow may not be so different in their overall messages.

Twain's farewell to Jerusalem is brief and positive: "We paused on the summit of a distant hill and took a final look and made farewell to Jerusalem the venerable city which had been such a good home to us" (394). Snow's farewell to Jerusalem is only a bit longer:

"Although I felt satisfied with my visit to that world-renowned city of sacredly interesting histories of the past...my feelings during our stay had become so pleasantly associated with the scenic view of the surroundings of this ancient site of time-honored memories, that I realized a feeling of reluctance at bidding a final adieu" (261). Both farewells are short and sweet. Each express that Jerusalem found a way into their hearts, Twain even called it a "home" to him and his traveling companions. Despite the hustle and bustle of the pilgrims and the ridiculous behavior of the Christian priests, both Twain and Snow felt endeared to Jerusalem and all its history.

THE END OF THE JOURNEY

The last letter Twain wrote for the *Alta California* is a simple summary. Upon sailing into New York, Twain sent an article to the New York *Herald* which he includes in *The Innocents Abroad* as chapter 61. He wrote an "exhaustive summing up of the cruise of the ship" (420) which consisted mainly of Twain listing off fond memories of the places he visited and the humorous behavior of pilgrims on the *Quaker City*, "Such was our daily life on board the ship—solemnity, decorum, dinner, dominoes, devotions, slander. It was not lively enough for a pleasure trip; but if we had only had a corpse it would have made a noble funeral excursion" (420). Twain writes of the highlights of the trip and the peculiar behavior of both the foreigners he saw and the pilgrims he traveled with. His final note to the *Herald* is a satisfying finish to his letters.

A year later, Twain added a lovely conclusion to be published with *The Innocents Abroad* (published after chapter 61). He wrote of his grand memories of his trip and says, "I am moved to confess that day by day the mass of my memories of the excursion have grown more and more

pleasant as the disagreeable incidents of travel which encumbered them flitted one by one out of my mind" (426).

In what Snow thought was her final letter before arriving home (she was delayed in St. Louis and two letters follow her "final" letter), she wrote of her excitement to return to work with the *Woman's Exponent*. On June 5th, 1873 from the steamer the *Wisconsin* Snow wrote, "[The] *Woman's Exponent*, of which I have received a few numbers, is to me the best representative of Utah, for in that I see...the continued energies and steadfastness of many of the mothers and daughters of Zion...I shall be most happy to rejoice with them, and reunite my weak efforts in the great common, glorious cause" (378). Snow clearly expressed her joy in the Latterday Saint faith and her work to strengthen her fellow Latter-day Saint women. She finished her letter with a poem, and these three stanzas from her poem illustrate again Snow's efforts to legitimize the faith and beliefs of the Latter-day Saints:

Seen many mosques and churches,

And witness'd service there;

And how unlike the Gospel

Their modes of worship are

How long shall superstition,

Priestcraft and ign'rance bind

In chains our fellow beings,

And dwarf their powers of mind'

By undisputed tokens,

His favor'd people know

That God again has spoken,

From heav'n, to man below. (378)

Twain's final words in his conclusion are honest and nostalgic, Snow's words are honest and bold. Both travelers however, comment on the behavior of the Christians they witnessed. Again, Twain and Snow are both the same and different, and each in their own way encouraging the introspection of their readers.

CONCLUSION

Twain's letters may have enabled Snow's letters; his influence enhanced not only how she perceived her experiences, but also how she wrote about her experiences. Snow could not escape Twain as she wrote about her travels, and instead of completely separating herself, she adapts Twain. Her letters become an intriguing study of intertextuality. Several texts are at play here: Twain's text, Snow's life text, the text of her religion, and the culture text of her audience and community. The interest level among her audience may have been higher after the popularity of Twain's *The Innocents Abroad*. Christa Albrecht-Crane and Dennis Cutchins, scholars of adaptation studies, say "[t]he truth is that all adaptations are complex analogies. More importantly, adaptations, rather than being handicapped by their movements away from the earlier text, are often enabled by those differences" (16). Snow benefitted from Twain's text and as Albrecht-Crane and Cutchins say, was enabled by her differences from and similarities to Twain's *The Innocents Abroad*.

The case study of Snow's letters is a valuable in exploring *how* Twain was profoundly influential on other writers. Examining the palimpsest of Snow's letters helps us to realize just how influential popular texts are on our descriptions and expressions of our perceptions and

experiences. Once an experience is put into words, it has been mediated through the writer and is no longer *exactly* what it was originally. The mediation of processing a personal experience not only includes putting feelings and sensations into words, but also includes our experiences being filtered through all the other texts that are lingering in our memory, or the memory of the writer. Mediation and intertextual interplay shine through in Snow's letters. Travel writing happens to hold a prominent influential position that shapes how we perceive and experience the world around us and how we identify with other readers and writers. Whether one has read his works or not, once Twain went abroad, traveling for an American has never been the same.

Works Cited

- Albrecht-Crane, Christa and Dennis Cutchins. *Adaptation Studies: New Approaches*. Rosemont Publishing & Printing Corp, 2010.
- Bitzer, Lloyd F. "The Rhetorical Situation." *Philosophy & Rhetoric*, vol. 1, no. 1, 1968, pp. 1-14. <u>jstor.org/stable/40236733</u> Accessed 5 Sept. 2016.
- Davidson, Karen Lynn and Jill Mulvay Derr. *Eliza: The Life and Faith of Eliza R. Snow*. Deseret Book, 2013.
- Dickinson, Leon. *Mark Twain's* Innocents Abroad: *Its Origins, Composition, and Popularity*.

 Dissertation, University of Chicago, 1945.
- Emmett, Chad F. *Beyond the Basilica: Christians and Muslims in Nazareth*. University of Chicago Press, 1995.
- Hutcheon, Linda and Siobhan O'Flynn. A Theory of Adaptation. Routledge, 2013.
- Hyde, Orson. "Remarks by Elder Orson Hyde, Delivered in the New Tabernacle, Salt Lake City, October 6, 1869." *Journal of Discourses 13*, Horace S. Eldredge, (1871), 181.
- Macé, Marielle. "Ways of Reading, Modes of Being." *New Literary History*, vol. 44, no. 2, 2013, pp. 213-229. muse.jhu.edu/article/516859/pdf Accessed 12 Mar. 2018.
- Melton, Jeffrey Alan. Mark Twain, Travel Books, and Tourism: The Tide of a Great Popular Movement. The University of Alabama Press, 2002.
- Morris Jr., Roy. American Vandal: Mark Twain Abroad. Harvard University Press, 2015.
- Naremore, James, ed. Film Adaptation. Rutgers University Press, 2000.
- Piacentino, Ed. "Two Views of Niagara: Doesticks and Mark Twain." *The Journal of American Culture*, vol. 35, no. 4, 2012, pp. 345-57. search-proquest-
- com.erl.lib.byu.edu/docview/1285120223?accountid=4488 11 Dec. 2015.

- Smith, George Albert. Correspondence of Palestine Tourists. Deseret News, 1875.
- Smith, Joseph. "The Sermon in The Grove." *History of the Church, Volume 6*, Deseret Book Company, 1950, 473-479. byustudies.byu.edu/content/volume-6-chapter-23 Accessed 11 June 2018.
- Speake, Jennifer, ed. Literature of Travel and Exploration: An Encyclopedia. Routledge, 2013.
- Steinbrink, Jeffrey. "Why the Innocents Went Abroad: Mark Twain and American Tourism in the Late Nineteenth Century." *American Literary Realism, 1870-1910*, vol. 16, no. 2, 1983, pp. 278-286.
 - jstor.org.erl.lib.byu.edu/stable/pdf/27746104.pdf?refreqid=search:8f5db98cdea30f7762fc 497778914d73 Accessed 25 Apr. 2018.
- Twain, Mark. The Innocents Abroad. Wordsworth Editions Limited, 2010.
- Twain, Mark. "To Elisha Bliss, Jr., in Hartford." *Mark Twain's Letters vol. I*, edited by Albert Bigelow Paine, 1917, 141-142.
- "Woman's Exponent: A Utah Ladies' Journal." *Woman's Exponent*, edited by Lula Greene Richards, vol. 1, no. 1, 1872, Salt Lake City, 8.
- "Woman's Exponent: A Utah Ladies' Journal." *Woman's Exponent*, edited by Lula Greene Richards, vol. 11 no. 8 1882, Salt Lake City, 59.